





THE

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

VOLUME LIV.

1872.

---

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of profiting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world and, were they but as the dust and cinders of our feet, so long as in that notion they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armoury of truth, even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away.—MILTON.*

---

CALCUTTA :

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12 BENTINCK STREET.

BOMBAY MESSRS. THACKER, VINING & CO.

MADRAS: MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & CO.

LONDON: MESSRS. TRÜBNER & CO., 8 AND 60 PATERNOSTER ROW.

AND TO BE HAD OF ALL BOOKSELLERS IN CALCUTTA.





# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

No. CVII.

## CONTENTS.

ART.		PAGE.
I.	NOTES ON THE ARABIC LANGUAGE ...	1
II.	ARCHITECTURE OF KASHMIR ...	15
III.	THE REVISION OF THE N.W.P. SETTLEMENTS ...	35
IV.	ELEMENTARY EDUCATION IN MADRAS ...	54
V.	BENOUDHA.—	
	1.—A Historical sketch of Fyzabad Tehsil, including the former Capitals of Ajudhia and Fyzabad. By P. Carnegy, Officiating Commissioner and Settlement Officer, 1870.	
	2.—Notes on the Races, Tribes and Castes, inhabiting the Province of Oudh. By P. Carnegy, Deputy Commissioner and Settlement Officer of Fyzabad, 1868.	
	3.—Fyzabad Settlement Reports—Historical. By P. Carnegy, Settlement Officer ...	66
VI.	THE INCOME-TAX IN INDIA ...	92
VII.	REMINISCENCES OF AVA ...	118
VIII.	THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.—PART I. ...	144
IX.	TOPICS OF THE QUARTER.—	
	Indian Land Revenue ...	159
	Education in Bengal ...	162

## CRITICAL NOTICES.—

## 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

S'rimadbhāgavata. Part I. Translated into Bengali by Kālī Prasanna Sarkār. Calcutta : Bharata Press. B.E. 1278	...	...	...	i
Prubandha-Kusumāvalī. By Y'sāna Chandra Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. B.E. 1278	...	...	...	ib.
Pramodakāminī Kāvya. By Asutosh Mukhopādhyaya. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. B.E. 1278	...	...	...	ii
A'yurveda Sārasaṅgraham. Part I. Edited and translated by Gopal Chandra Senagupta. Calcutta : Columbian Press. B.E. 1278	...	...	...	ib.
Hektar-badha. (From the Greek.) By Michael Madhusūdana Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. 1871	...	...	...	iv
Ushā Nāṭaka. By Śrīmatī Kāminī Sundarī Devī. Calcutta : J. G. Chatterjea and Co.'s Press. 1871	...	...	...	v
Suradhunī Kāvya. Part I. By Dina Bandhu Mitra. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press. Sakābdā 1793	...	...	...	ib.
Rasa-Kādamvinī. Calcutta : Girisa-Vidyaratna Press. 1871	...	...	...	vi
Prabodha-Chandrodaya Nāṭaka. By the late Visvanātha Nayaratna. Calcutta : G. P. Roy & Co's Press. Sakābdā 1793	...	...	...	vii
Jambālinī. By Yādavendra Bandyopādhyāya. Calcutta : Vidyaratna Press. 1871	...	...	...	ib.
Gāyatrī-Prakaranam. By Tārānāth Tarkavāchaspati. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press. Samvat, 1928	...	...	...	ib.

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE :—

A Report on the Family History of the Chief Clans of the Roy Bareilly District. By W. C. Benett, c.s. Oudh Secretariat Press, Lucknow	...	...	...	ix
Classical Studies in India. By Max Müller, M.A., Fellow of All Souls' College, and Professor of Modern European Languages in the University of Oxford. From the <i>Contemporary Review</i> . 1871	...	...	...	xiv
A Report on the District of Jessore ; its Antiquities, its History, and its Commerce. By James Westland, Esq., c.s. ; late Magistrate and Collector of Jessore. Calcutta. 1871	...	...	...	xvii
An Historical and Statistical Memoir of the Ghazeepeer District, Part I. By Mr. W. Oldham, B.C.S., LL.D. Printed at the Government Press, Allahabad, 1870	...	...	...	xx
Nugæ Indicæ : On Leave in my Compound. Allahabad. 1871	...	...	...	xxv
The Folk-Songs of Southern India. By Charles E. Gover. Madras : Higginbotham & Co. 1871	...	...	...	xxvii
A Classical Dictionary of India ; illustrative of the Mythology, Philosophy, Literature, Antiquities, Arts, Manners, Customs, &c., of the Hindūs. By John Garrett, Director of Public Instruction in Mysore. Madras : Higginbotham and Co. 1871	...	...	...	xxx

<b>Dúrgá Pújá.</b> By Pratāpa Chandra Ghosha, B.A. Calcutta : Hindoo Patriot Press. 1871 ... ..	xxxii
<b>Public Works Organisation in Madras.</b> 1871 ... ..	xxxiii
<b>Dr. Day's Report on Indian Fisheries</b> ... ..	xxxiv
<b>Review of Baroda Affairs, 1871.</b> By Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan ... ..	xxxv
<b>History of the Rise, Decline and Present State of the Shastree Family.</b> Education Society's Press. Bykul- la. Bombay ... ..	xxxvi
<b>The Rational Practice of Medicine.</b> A Lecture delivered at the School of Arts. By L. Salzer, M.D. Jeypore ...	xl
<b>Sanitary and Vaccine Reports for the Province of Oudh, 1870</b> ... ..	xli
<b>Report of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Govern- ment of India, for 1870.</b> Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	xliv
<b>A Brief History of Bengal Commerce, from the year 1614 to 1870 ; with a short sketch of Indian Finance.</b> By Kissen Mohun Mullick. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	lii
<b>A Compendium of the Law on Mortgages, as contained in the compilation of Mr. Macpherson ; with the necessary amendments consequent on the passing of Acts VIII and IX of 1871.</b> Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	liv
<b>The Indian Limitation Act (Act IX. of 1871), with Notes. Edited by Rajendro Missry, Vakeel, High Court. Thacker, Spink and Co. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..</b>	ib.



## CRITICAL NOTICES.—

## 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

S'rimadbhāgavata. Part I. Translated into Bengali by Kālī Prasanna Sarkār. Calcutta : Bharata Press, B.E. 1278	...	...	...	...
Prubandha-Kusumāvalī. By I's'ana Chandra Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press, B.E. 1278	...	...	...	ib.
Pramodakāminī Kāvya. By Asutoshā Mukhopādhyaya. Calcutta : Stanhope Press, B.E. 1278	...	...	...	...
A'yurveda Sārasamgraham. Part I. Edited and translated by Gopal Chandra Senagupta. Calcutta : Columbian Press, B.E. 1278	...	...	...	ib.
Hektar-badha. (From the Greek.) By Michael Madhusūdana Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press, 1871	...	...	...	iv
Ushā Nāṭaka. By Śrīmatī Kaminī Sundarī Devī. Calcutta : J. G. Chatterjea and Co.'s Press, 1871	...	...	...	v
Suradhunī Kāvya. Part I. By Dina Bandhu Mitra. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press, Sakābdā 1793	...	...	...	ib.
Rasa-Kādamvinī. Calcutta : Girisa-Vidyaratna Press, 1871	...	...	...	vi
Prabodha-Chandrodaya Nāṭaka. By the late Visvanātha Nayaratna. Calcutta : G. P. Roy & Co's Press, Sakābdā 1793	...	...	...	vii
Jambūnī. By Yādavendra Bandyopādhyāya. Calcutta : Vidyaratna Press, 1871	...	...	...	ib.
Gāyatrī-Prakaranam. By Tārānāth Tarkavāchaspati. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press, Samvat, 1928	...	...	...	ib.

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE :—

A Report on the Family History of the Chief Clans of the Roy Bareilly District. By W. C. Benett, c.s. Oudh Secretariat Press, Lucknow	...	...	...	ix
Classical Studies in India. By Max Müller, M.A., Fellow of All Souls' College, and Professor of Modern European Languages in the University of Oxford, From the <i>Contemporary Review</i> . 1871	...	...	...	xiv
A Report on the District of Jessore ; its Antiquities, its History, and its Commerce. By James Westland, Esq., c.s. ; late Magistrate and Collector of Jessore. Calcutta, 1871	...	...	...	xvii
An Historical and Statistical Memoir of the Ghazee poor District, Part I. By Mr. W. Oldham, B.C.S., LL.D. Printed at the Government Press, Allahabad, 1870	...	...	...	xx
Nugre Indicæ : On Leave in my Compound. Allahabad, 1871	...	...	...	xxv
The Folk-Songs of Southern India. By Charles E. Gover. Madras : Higginbotham & Co. 1871	...	...	...	xxvii
A Classical Dictionary of India ; illustrative of the Mythology, Philosophy, Literature, Antiquities, Arts, Manners, Customs, &c., of the Hindūs. By John Garrett, Director of Public Instruction in Mysore. Madras : Higginbotham and Co. 1871	...	...	...	xxx

	PAGE.
Dúrgá Pújá. By Pratápa Chandra Ghosha, B.A. Calcutta : Hindoo Patriot Press. 1871 ... ..	xxxii
Public Works Organisation in Madras. 1871 ... ..	xxxiii
Dr. Day's Report on Indian Fisheries ... ..	xxxiv
Review of Baroda Affairs, 1871. By Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan ... ..	xxxv
History of the Rise, Decline and Present State of the Shastree Family. Education Society's Press. Bykul- la. Bombay ... ..	xxxvi
The Rational Practice of Medicine. A Lecture delivered at the School of Arts. By L. Salzer, M.D. Jeypore ...	xl
Sanitary and Vaccine Reports for the Province of Oudh, 1870 ... ..	xli
Report of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Govern- ment of India, for 1870. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	xliv
A Brief History of Bengal Commerce, from the year 1814 to 1870 ; with a short sketch of Indian Finance. By Kissen Mohun Mullick. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	lii
A Compendium of the Law on Mortgages, as contained in the compilation of Mr. Macpherson ; with the necessary amendments consequent on the passing of Acts VIII and IX of 1871. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	liv
The Indian Limitation Act (Act IX. of 1871), with Notes. Edited by Rajendro Missry, Vakeel, High Court. Thacker, Spink and Co. Calcutta. 1871 ... ..	ib.

---



## EDITORIAL NOTICE.

---

IN the April number of the *Calcutta Review* will be commenced a series of papers on *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal*. Each paper will contain a history of one or more of the great land-owning families of the province, derived from all accessible, published or unpublished, sources ; together with, in some cases, an account of the past or present territorial possessions of the family. The series when complete will be republished in a suitable shape ; and will form, it is hoped, a reliable and useful book of reference on every subject connected with the nobility and landed gentry of Bengal—somewhat similar in general design to the works of Sir Bernard Burke, which attempt to fulfil the same functions for the United Kingdom. The papers will be written by native and European scholars of high antiquarian and statistical acquirements ; and will be edited by the Editor of this *Review*, who will thankfully receive any contributions or suggestions with which he may be favoured.

•  
12, Bentinck Street : }  
January 1st, 1872. }





# THE CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

NO. CVII.

---

## ART. I.—NOTES ON THE ARABIC LANGUAGE.

THE Arabic belongs to the Semitic family of languages, distinguished by the triliteral root. The chief cognate languages are the Hebrew, the Syriac, the Chaldaic, the Ethiopic, and the Phœnician. Of this family, the Arabic may fairly be considered the head; it is, in a way, the type and ground-form of all the Semitic languages. Its grammar is philosophically digested and well methodised. Its literature is highly cultivated and vastly developed. But the main points to which we wish to direct attention in this place are, (1) the copiousness of its vocabulary, perhaps unrivalled amongst the languages of the world; (2) the extent to which other languages—and we shall especially note the English—are indebted to its expressive forms. In this enquiry we hope to be able to indicate many points which have, we believe, eluded the observation of the received writers on Arabic philology.

In one direction, the exceeding richness of the Arabic language becomes so exuberant as to approach redundancy. It possesses multitudes of words to express the same thing; which point may be best illustrated by the fact that it offers a choice of a thousand words for 'camel,' about the same number for 'horse,' and about five hundred words each for 'sword' and 'tiger.' But the most valuable result of its copiousness is to be looked for in the fact that it possesses words expressive of the most minute differences of shades of meaning, in many cases where these distinctions do not admit of being indicated in any other language except by a long and obscure periphrasis. There is an admirable work by Tha'âlabi, entitled *Fighat Lughat* or *The Philosophy of the Lexicon*, otherwise called *Asrârul 'Arabîa* or *the Mysteries of the Arabic*, which contains many illustrations of this assertion, and from which we will cull a few examples. The learned writer points out a curi-

ous series of nouns which indicate the *beginning* or the *first part* of various things. Thus:—

تباشير	( <i>Tabáshír</i> )	means	the beginning or dawn of morning.
غسق	( <i>Ghasaq</i> )	„	first part of the night.
وسمي	( <i>Wasmí</i> )	„	first droppings of a shower of rain.
لباء	( <i>Laba</i> )	„	the milk milked first.
سلاف	( <i>Suláf</i> )	„	the wine got from the first squeeze of the grapes.
باكورة	( <i>Bákura</i> )	„	first fruit of a tree or garden.
بكر	( <i>Bikr</i> )	„	the first child of a man.
نهل	( <i>Nahl</i> )	„	the first drink of water.
نشوة	( <i>Nashwa</i> )	„	the first state of intoxication.*
وخط	( <i>Wakht</i> )	„	the first state of growing grey or becoming hoary-headed.
نعاس	( <i>Nu'ás</i> )	„	the first attack of sleep.
استهلال	( <i>Istihlál</i> )	„	the sound uttered by a new-born child.
طليعه	( <i>Talí'ah</i> )	„	the first portion of an army or the van.
عنفوان	( <i>Unfuván</i> )	} „	the first state of youth or blooming
ربعان	( <i>Rai'án</i> )		
غلواء	( <i>Ghulawá</i> )		
روق	( <i>Rauq</i> )		
مبغة	( <i>Mai'ah</i> )		

Again there is to be found a class of nouns implying the same thing in its different conditions. For instance when the saliva is in the mouth it is called رضاب *Rudháb*; but when it is ejected, it is called بزاق *Buzáq*. When fuel is burning it is called وقود *Waqúd*; otherwise حطب *Hatab*. The sun when rising is called غزالة *Ghazála*; at other times شمس *Shams*. Again, there may be found a large number of *pairs* of words, one member of each pair being applied to an object when *large*, the other member to the same object when *small*. For instance:—

A large tree	is called	(شجر) <i>Shajar</i> ;	a small one	فصيل <i>Fasíl</i> .
A „ date-tree	„	(نخل) <i>Nakhl</i> ;	„	اشاء <i>Ashá</i> .
A „ bird	„	(طير) <i>Tair</i> ;	„	دخل <i>Dukhkhál</i> .
A „ ant	„	(نمل) <i>Naml</i> ;	„	ذر <i>Dzarr</i> .
A „ feather	„	(ريش) <i>Rish</i> ;	„	زغب <i>Zughb</i> .
A „ rivulet	„	(نهر) <i>Nahr</i> ;	„	جدول <i>Judwál</i> .
A „ hillock	„	(جبل) <i>Jabal</i> ;	„	قرن <i>Qarn</i> .
A „ boat	„	(سفينة) <i>Safína</i> ;	„	قارب <i>Qárib</i> .

\* The writer remembers to have seen, in a Slang Dictionary or some similar work, a series of English slang words expressing the various stages of intoxication. Possibly this Arabic word may be found amongst them.

Again there are many words signifying various degrees of fatness in women ; for instance, when a woman is moderately bulky with a fair proportion in her limbs, or delicacy, she is called رَحْلَة *Rahla* ; when she is increased in bulk, but not to the degree of ugliness, she is called سَبَحْلَة *Sabaha* ; but if the bulkiness has rendered her ugly or awkward, she is called مُفْضِلَة *Mufidha* ; and when she is stupendously huge, with protuberant and pendant fat, she is then عَفْضَاج *'Ifduhaj*. So there are words indicating degrees of fatness in men also ; a man is first لَحِيم *Lahim*, then شَحِيم *Shahim*, then بَلَدَح *Balandah*, and then عَكُوك *'Akkuk*.

There are again various words signifying various degrees of height and shortness in the size of man. For instance, when a man is moderately tall, he is called طَوِيل *Tawil*, and then طَوَال *Tawal* ; but when he becomes too tall, he is then called شَوَذِب *Shaw-izab*, or شَوَقَب *Shaw-qab*. Again when he exceeds the latter degree also, he is called عَشَنَق *'Ashannat* or عَشَنَق *'Ashannaq* ; and lastly, when the tallness in a man reaches the highest degree, he is then called عَظِظ *'Azzut*. And so in the degree of shortness, a dwarfish man is called دَحْدَاح *Dahdah*, then حَبِيل *Hanbal*, then حَزَنَبَل *Hazanbal*, then حَزَنَاب *Hinzab* or كَهْمَس *Kahmas*, then بَحْتَر *Baktar* or حَبْتَر *Haktar*. But when a man is so dwarfish that when he sits among his companions he is almost invisible, he is then جَيْتَر *Jaitar* or حَدَل *Handal*. Finally when he is so short that his standing up does not increase his height, he is then حَزَقْرَة *Hinzira*.

There are multitudes of words showing the different degrees of bravery and timidity. For instance a timid man in the lowest degree is called جَبَان *Jaban* ; then هَيَّابَة *Hayyaba* ; then مَفْؤَد *Mafud* ; then وَرَع or ضَرَع *Wara'* or *Dhara'*, then هَاعِلَاع *Hailal*. So a brave man is called شَجَاع *Shujaa* ; then بَطَل *Batal* ; then مِمَة *Qimma* ; then ذِمَر *Dzimmar* ; then نَكَل *Nakal* ; then نَهْدِك *Nahik* ; then مَحْرَب *Mihrab* ; then حَلْبَس *Halbas* ; then أَحْيَس *Ahyas*, or أَلْيَس *Algas* ; and lastly غَشَمَشَم *Ghashamsham* or أَهَم *Aham*.

There are different names for different kinds of wealth or property. An inherited property is called تِلَاد *Tihad*, تَالِد *Talid* or تَلِيد *Talid* ; an acquired one is called مُسْتَطَرَف *Mustatraf*, طَارِف *Tarif*, طَرِيف *Tarif*, or مَطَرَف *Matarraf* ; wealth buried under the ground is رَكَاز *Rikaz* ; and when the same is not expected to be recovered, it is then ضَمَار *Dhimar*. When it is in gold or silver, it is called صَامِت *Qamit* or "mute ;" and when it is in cattle, sheep, camels, &c., it is then نَاطِق *Natig*, or "speaking." When the same is immovable, yielding hire or rent, it is called عَقَار *Aqar*.

There are words implying different degrees of poverty as well as of riches. A man is مفلس *Muflis*; then معدم *Mu'dim*; then مملق *Mumliq*; then مدقع *Mudqi*; then مسكين *Miskin*; and lastly فقير *Faqir*. On the other hand, the lowest degree of richness is indicated by كفاف *Kafáf*; then غنى *Ghiná*; then ثروة *Tharwat*; then اكثار *Ikthár*; then اقرب *Itráb*; and lastly قنطرة *Qantara*.

There are distinct words implying a human being in his different stages of age. For instance, a child when in the womb is called جنين *Janín*; when he is born, he is then called وليد *Walíd*; when sucking, he is called رضيع *Radhí'*; when weaned, he is فطيم *Fatím*; when he is able to walk, he is called دارج *Dárij*; when he is in length about five spans, he is then خماسي *Khumasí*. Again, when his first teeth are shed, he is called مثغر *Muthghúr*; and when again his new teeth have appeared, he is مثغر *Muththaghúr*. When he is above 10 years, he is منزعزع *Mutawá'ir* or ناشئ *Náshí*; and when he is approaching the age of puberty, he is مراعى *Muráhiq* or يافع *Yáfí'*. But during all these conditions, he is called by the general denomination غلام *Ghulám* or boy. Again when he is a perfectly developed young man, he is called فتى *Fatá* or شارخ *Shárikh*; but when he reaches the highest degree of blooming youth, he is then مجتمع *Mujtami'*; afterwards, when his age is between 30 and 40, he is called شاب *Shább*. Then from that age up to 60 he is كهل *Kahal*. Then he is شيخ *Shaikh*; then كبير *Kabir*; then هرم *Harim*; and finally خرف *Kharif*, which is Shakspeare's—

. . . Second childishness and mere oblivion,

Sans teeth, sans eyes, sans taste, sans everything.

On the other hand, the female is at first طفلة *Tafla*, when she is an infant; and then وليدة *Walida*; then كاعب *Ka'ib*; then ناهد *Náhid*; then عانس *'Afnis*; then خود *Khawd*, when she has reached the middle of her youth; she is مسلف *mustif* when she is above forty; and then شهلة *Shahlat*, or كهلة *Kahlat*; then شهيرة *Shahbara*, or حيزبون *Haizabún*; and lastly قلعم *Qa'am*.

Again there are words indicating different degrees of beauty in woman. For instance, a beautiful woman is called جميلة *Jamíla* or وضيفة *Wadhíá*; but when she is so beautiful that she is independent of ornament on account of her natural beauty, she is called غانية *Ghánia*. Again, when she, being extremely handsome, is very indifferent about dress and other artificial decorations, then she is معطال *Me'tál*; when her beauty is constant, she is وسيمة *Wasíma*; and again, when she is blessed with abundance of beauty, she is قسيمة

*Qaséma* ; and lastly, when her beauty is absolutely transcendent, she is called رواء *Raw'áu*. Moreover, there are distinct or separate words for the beauties in different members of the human body, which would have delighted Homer as epithets for his deities and heroes.

Again there are different words for the sewing of different things. For instance, خات *Kháta* denotes sewing of clothes ; while خرز *Kharazu* implies sewing of stockings ; خصف *Khaçafu* denotes sewing of shoes ; كتب *Katuba* that of water-skins ; and حاص *Haça* sewing leather or the eyes of the hawk.

We have now said enough to prove the extraordinary delicacy of the Arabic language, and the singularly minute differences of meaning which can be indicated therein by the change of a single word. To the student who wishes to pursue the subject, we would recommend the perusal of the work mentioned above ; and also of the *Fihruk Lughat* by Ibní Fáris Abul Husain Ahmadul Qazwíní (d. 395 A. H.)

A most striking proof of the copiousness of the Arabic language is to be found in the fact, that most words of this most philosophical language are such that all words formed therefrom by *permutation* (i. e., all possible arrangements of the radical letters) are significant. For instance the word قلب *qalb* meaning *heart* has three radical letters. By *permutation* there can be formed other five words each of them being significant, viz.

بقل *Baqal*, "herb."

بلق *Balaq*, "of a black and white colour."

لقب *Laqab* "appellation."

قبل *Qabl*, "before."

لبق *Labaq*, "talkativeness."

In clearness and simplicity of construction, the Arabic compares favourably with most other languages ; it clearly excels, we believe, most languages of the Aryan stock in these respects. One thing that conduces much to this end, is its possession of certain fixed models called *Bábs* : by which multitudes of verbs of various roots are moulded into the same general form. The conjugation of the Arabic verb is highly inflectional ; differing herein from the Persian, and from the modern form of the English and of most of the other Aryan tongues. Pronouns too are often implied in the verbs ; hence a sentence may be formed simply by a verb ; thus *qatala* (قتل) is equivalent to *huwa qatala* (هو قتل) he killed. Besides a complete sentence may be formed simply with two nouns, one being the subject and the other the predicate, without the intervention of the copula. These peculiarities of construction give the Arabic

that clearness coupled with conciseness, which is observable (though not, we think, to the same extent) in the classical languages of the Aryan family.

Further in this language peculiar forms are fixed for different classes of nouns and adjectives indicating peculiar meanings. For instance, the nouns of the form *maṣ'alam* (مفعَل) signify place or time of action; these of the forms *miṣ'alun* (مفعَل), *miṣ'alatan* (مفعلة), *miṣ'ālun* (مفعال), and *fi'ālun* (فعال), indicate the instrument or medium of action. So the nouns of the form *fi'ālun* (فعال) generally imply disease, sickness, or ailment; while those of the form *fi'ūlun* (فِعُول) signify medicines. Again nouns of the form *fa'ilun* (فَعِيل), and *fa'lūn* (فعال), imply different sounds.

Similarly, one of the most striking peculiarities of Arabic is the possession of numerous forms of derivative verbs. When a primitive verb assumes one of these forms, it assumes also a definite additional meaning.

One of these *formal* peculiarities is this, that sometimes a verb is formed out of a sentence by way of abbreviation; as *hullala* (هَلَل) he uttered out of a sentence by way of abbreviation; as *hullala* (هَلَل) he uttered *istarja'a* (استرجع) "there is no god but God;" *istarja'a* (استرجع) he uttered *ināllahu wāna ilāhu rājiعون* "verily we are of God and verily we are to return to Him;" *hauḥuqa* (حَوَاق) he uttered *ballo al-ʿalī al-ʿaẓīm* "there is no strength or power but with God, the most High and Great;" *dam'aza* (دَمَعَن) he uttered *ad am allahu ʿaziz* "may God preserve thy honour," &c. Through these *formal* peculiarities, long sentiments are expressed in very few words. For instance *اخرفت الشاة* "the sheep brought forth young ones at the season of autumn." Besides these, many other advantages can be drawn from the peculiar forms of verbs.

The intimate radical connexion of the Sanskrit with the other Aryan languages is of course an obvious one; and every scholar is well acquainted with the wonders which have been wrought in modern philology by the labours of European and Oriental Sanskritists. But the careful and critical study of comparative philology, in the modern scientific spirit, has been hitherto almost confined to the elaboration of the comparative philology of the Indo-European family of languages alone; little has been done in the elucidation of the wider generalisations that may be established by a scientific investigation of the analogies between the Semitic and the Aryan tongues. We propose to devote the remainder of this paper to some introductory suggestions and examples, which may at any rate serve the purpose of inducing other orientalists to take up a subject which we believe to be of the highest scientific importance, and which possesses much of the charm of novelty. Our attempt is necessarily, in the present state of the science, merely a tentative

one; and the examples which we proffer—the jottings of many years of careful attention to the subject—are put forward with much diffidence, and in the hope of evoking criticism and discussion amongst scholars, rather than with any wish to dogmatize.

Weber, in his *Indische Skizzen*, has casually drawn attention to the many striking similarities between the mythology of the Semitic races and that of the Aryans. He instances the conception of a *Manu*,\* a primeval man and common ancestor; and of a great flood which destroyed and swallowed up all things, and from which this one man alone was saved. But he does not pursue the subject further. He adds—“these are, with other “proofs *mainly etymological*, grounds for considering that at a very “early period the Semites were united with the Indo-European “races, though they must have separated before the common “language attained any marked character.” Weber, however, does not give any of the etymological proofs to which he refers; and we are not aware that any other orientalist has attempted a careful investigation of the subject. That the radical analogies between the Aryan and Semitic languages are much more numerous and striking than they are generally supposed to be—or, at any rate, than they have hitherto been shewn to be by writers on comparative philology—we shall endeavour to prove by a comparison of the Arabic and English.

Donaldson says,† with regard to the study of the comparative philology of the Aryan languages;—“This reproduction of the common mother of our family of languages, by a comparison of the features of all her children, is the great general object to which the efforts of the philologist should be directed; and this, and not a mere derivation of words in the same language from one another, constitutes the etymology that is alone worthy of the name.” How much worthier and nobler will that etymology be, which seeks to evolve the primeval common mother of *all* languages, by a comparison of the radical analogies between the various families!

The compilation of the list given below has not been the work of a day; and yet, even now, it is hardly safe to attempt to distinguish the analogies which are the proofs of a common primeval language from those which have been produced by scientific and commercial intercourse in comparatively modern times. The

\* The story of *Nûh* (نوح) and the Deluge is substantially the same in the *Qoran* and in the Pentateuch of Moses. For a discussion of the stories of *Manu* and the *Bishis*, and of *Deukalion* and *Pyrrha*, see Cox on the *Mythology of the Aryan Nations*, Vol. I., p. 414, and Vol. II., pp. 87 and 210. Mr. Cox also devotes a curious chapter to a comparison of the Aryan and the Semitic notions of the Devil.

† *New Cratylus*, Preface.



Arabic, being a language which attained an early development, and one which was long written in and spoken by races of an intellectual cultivation and an enterprising spirit far in advance of their age, has undoubtedly supplied multitudes of words to the languages of the West by the direct method of adoption and naturalisation. It has done the same more obviously and openly, as every one knows, for many oriental languages, such as the Persian, the Hindustáni, the Turkish, the Malay; and the technical terminology of some branches of science, and of some branches of commerce, is mainly drawn from Arabic in most of the well-known languages of Europe and Asia. Many of the analogies set forth in the following list may doubtless be proved to have originated in this way; and many more are due to the fact that this borrowing from the copious and expressive vocabulary of the Arabic has been carried on for centuries in the languages of the West—in the Spanish especially, which partly grew up under the shadow of the Arab rule in Spain—to a large extent in the Italian, French, and other languages of the Mediterranean shore—perhaps even in the classical languages themselves of Greece and Rome.

*List of words common to the Arabic and the English, having absolutely or very nearly the same meaning in both languages.*

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
ايد <i>aid</i>	.. Aid. <sup>1</sup>
الزريق or الزريق	} <i>azzirnák, azzirnák,</i> Arsenic. <sup>2</sup>
امير البحر	.. Admiral (Spanish <i>Almirante</i> ).
القاضى or القائد	} <i>alqádhí or alqáid,</i> .. Alcaid. <sup>3</sup>
شرب	.. Absorb. <sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Aid* is of course the French *aider*; and this appears to have been derived from the Latin *adjutare* (*adjurare*, *adjutum*) through the Provençal forms *alpujar*, *ajudar*, *aider*. If the similarity between the Arabic and the western forms be an accidental coincidence, it is a very remarkable one.

<sup>2</sup> *Arsenic* is the Greek *ἀρσενικόν*, used in this sense by Galen. Whoever first used this word, undoubtedly regarded it as a derivative of *ἄρσεν*; from the root *ar*—(the Sanscrit *ari*)—found in *ἄρσς*, *ἥρως*, *ῥως*, *ῥωλε*, *ῥι*, *ῥιτς*, and many other words in the Indo-European languages, and indicating “strength” or “protection.” It appears, however, highly probable (considering how much Arabic has every where entered into chemical terminology) that *ἀρσενικόν* was in reality merely a corruption of the Arabic.

<sup>3</sup> This is of course a Spanish word, like the preceding; and doubtless dates from the Moorish occupation of Spain.

<sup>4</sup> From the Latin *sorbeo*. Probably both the Arabic and Latin were formed by onomatopœia; compare the German *schlürfen*, and the Greek *ροφέω*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
also شراب <i>sharáb</i> ,	Syrup.
أمين <i>ámin</i> ,	Amen ( <i>Hebrew</i> ).
الكيمياء <i>alkímíyá</i> ,	Alchemy. <sup>1</sup>
القبعة <i>alqubba</i> ,	Alcove. <sup>2</sup>
الانبيق <i>alimbíq</i> ,	Alembic. <sup>3</sup>
عنبر <i>'ambar</i> ,	Ambor. <sup>4</sup>
الكحل <i>alkuhl</i> ,	Alcohol.
اطلس <i>atlas</i> ,	Atlas.
دارالصناعة <i>dárussiná'a</i> ,	Arsenal. <sup>5</sup>
الجبرة <i>aljabra</i> ,	Algebra. <sup>6</sup>
ياقوت <i>yáqút</i> ,	Agate. <sup>7</sup>
دراية or دراية <i>diráyat, addirayát,*</i>	Adroit. <sup>8</sup>
عليل <i>'alíl</i> ,	Ail. <sup>9</sup>
القلي <i>alqalí</i> ,	Alkali.
عاجل <i>ájl</i> ,	Agile. <sup>10</sup>
أنا <i>ánan</i> ,	Anon. <sup>11</sup>
بيع <i>bai' or bai'un</i> .	Buy. <sup>12</sup>
بوضة or بز <i>baz</i> ,	Baize.
بق <i>baq,†</i>	Bug. <sup>13</sup>
ميمون <i>máimín</i> ,	Buboon. <sup>14</sup>
بلسان <i>balasán</i> ,	Balsam. <sup>15</sup>
بئيس <i>bais</i> ,	Baso. <sup>16</sup>

\* It means in Arabic *intelligence*, which is akin to the meaning of the English word.

† It means *mosquito* as generally known, but it also means a *bug*.

<sup>1</sup> The late Greek *ἀρχήματα*.

<sup>2</sup> The Spanish *alcoba*.

<sup>3</sup> The Spanish *alambique*.

<sup>4</sup> Wedgwood well notes on this word, that "it is singular that a substance coming from so small a number of places should have had so many different names." It is still more curious that the Greek and Latin roots (*ἡλεκτρον, succinum*) should have entirely given place to the Arabic in most of the languages of modern Europe. Compare the French *ambre*, the Italian *ambra*, the Spanish and Portuguese *ambar, alambiar, alambre*.

<sup>5</sup> The Spanish is *atarazana, atarazanal*; the Italian *arzana, tarzana, darsena*.

<sup>6</sup> The Spanish *algebra* is also used in the sense of putting together or setting broken or dislocated limbs.

<sup>7</sup> The Latin *achates*, the Greek *ἀχάτης*.

<sup>8</sup> The French *adroit*, from *droit* (*dester*).

<sup>9</sup> The Anglo-Saxon *eglian*, from *egle* troublesome; Gothic *aylo*, affliction.

<sup>10</sup> Latin *cyllis* from *ago* *ἔγω*.

<sup>11</sup> Usually derived from the Anglo-Saxon *on an, in one, in a moment*.

<sup>12</sup> Apparently the Anglo-Saxon *byrgan*.

<sup>13</sup> Compare the Welsh *bwaai*, either a maggot or a "bug bear;" and the Russian *buka*, with a similar meaning.

<sup>14</sup> The French *babouin*, the Italian *babuino*; usually derived from *ba*, the sound made by the collision of the lips, which is somewhat far-fetched.

<sup>15</sup> The Latin *balsamum*, the Greek *βάλσαμον*.

<sup>16</sup> The Latin *basis*, Greek *βάσις* (*Baíw*). Compare French *bas*, Italian *basso*, Spanish *bajo*, Welsh *bas*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
بريق <i>barîq</i> ,	.. Bright. <sup>1</sup>
بابوس <i>bâbûs</i> ,	.. Babe.
بينانى <i>bayâzun</i> ,	.. Bason.
بورق <i>bauraq</i> ,*	.. Borax.
قابل <i>qâbil</i> ,	.. Capable.
كافور <i>kâfûr</i> ,	.. Camphor.
قندیل <i>qindîl</i> ,	.. Candle.
كفن <i>kafan</i> ,	.. Coffin.
كيس <i>kîs</i>	.. Case.
قال <i>qâla</i> ,	.. Call.
قنا <i>qanâ</i> ,	.. Cane.
قوب or كوب <i>kûb or qa'b</i> ,	.. Cup.
غفر <i>ghafîr</i> ,	.. Cover.
كهف <i>kahaf</i> ,	.. Cavo (Latin <i>carus</i> ).
كعب <i>ka'b</i> ,	.. Cubo (Greek <i>κύβος</i> ).
قشع or قط <i>qat</i> , or <i>qat'</i> ,	.. Cut (Welsh <i>cwtl</i> ).
جمال <i>jamal</i> (Heb. <i>gamel</i> )	.. Camel.
قط <i>qit</i> ,	.. Cat (German <i>katze</i> , Gaelic <i>cat</i> )
صفر <i>ṣifr</i> ,	.. Cypher. <sup>2</sup>
قطن <i>qutun</i> ,	.. Cotton. <sup>3</sup>
قلم <i>qalam</i> ,†	.. Calamus <sup>4</sup> (Latin).
قدرات <i>qirât</i> ,	.. Carat. <sup>5</sup>
قرناس <i>qurnâs</i> ,	.. Cornice, <sup>6</sup>
قند <i>qand</i> ,	.. Candy.
خليفة <i>khalîfa</i> ,	.. Khalif or Caliph.
قام <i>qâma</i> ,‡	.. Come (Anglo-Saxon <i>cuman</i> ).

\* An Arabicism of the Persian word *bora*.

† A reed-pen.

‡ It means to stand, but used with the preposition *ilâ* it means to proceed.

<sup>1</sup> For an exhaustive discussion of the etymology of this word, see Wedgwood's *Dictionary of English Etymology*. We may notice that the root is *brîq*, or *brag*, imitating a sudden noise; words expressing attributes of light are commonly derived from those of sound. Compare the Anglo-Saxon *beorht*, the Gothic *bairhts*, &c.

<sup>2</sup> Through the Italian *ciſra*, and the French *chiffre*.

<sup>3</sup> Through the Spanish *algodon*, which has retained the article.

<sup>4</sup> The Modern Greek has *καλαμάρτι*, an inkstand.

<sup>5</sup> The Greek form of this word was *κεράτιον*; which was formed as if it were a diminutive of *κέρας*, analogous to *κάρα*. The Greek *κέρας* has its analogue in the Hebrew קֶרֶן; on which Donaldson says: "The Hebrew language often preserves the truest and fullest forms of certain important roots, or quasi-roots, which it has in common with Indo-Germanic idioms:"—*New Cratylus*, para. 209. It seems probable that *κεράτιον* in its meaning of *carat* had really no connexion with *κέρας*. The Venetian *carate* meant the seed of the carob-tree; the Spanish is *quilato*.

<sup>6</sup> Usually derived from the Greek *κορνίς*, through the Italian *cornice*, and the French *corniche*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
خندق <i>khandaq</i> ,	.. Conduit, (Latin <i>duco</i> ).
دلفين <i>dulfin</i> ,	.. Dolphin. <sup>1</sup>
دمشق <i>dimisq</i> or دمشق <i>dim-</i> <i>qás</i> .	.. Damask. <sup>2</sup>
دون <i>dún</i> ,	.. Down. <sup>3</sup>
ترجمان <i>tarjuman</i> ,	.. Dragoman. (Sp. <i>trujaman</i> ).
درهم <i>dirham</i> ,	.. Drachm, dram, (Greek δραχμή).
الفيلة <i>alfilat</i> ,	.. Elephant. <sup>4</sup>
ارض <i>ardh</i> ,	.. Earth (Anglo-Saxon <i>eorth</i> ).
عين or عين <i>'ain</i> or <i>a'yun</i> ,	.. Eye, pl. <i>oyne</i> .
الاكسير <i>aliksir</i> ,	.. Elixir.
فيض <i>faith</i> ,	.. Fuse (Latin <i>fundo</i> , <i>fusum</i> ).
فلک or فلک <i>falk</i> or <i>falka</i> ,	.. Felucca. <sup>5</sup>
فلط <i>balnat</i> or <i>balant</i> ,	.. Flint. <sup>6</sup>
فلاة <i>fulát</i> ,	.. Flat, plate. <sup>7</sup>
غربال <i>ghirbál</i> ,	} .. Garble. <sup>8</sup>
غربة <i>gharbalá</i> ,	
غلط <i>ghalat</i> ,	.. Guilt.
جليد <i>jalíd</i> ,	.. Gelid (Latin <i>gelidus</i> ).
خف <i>khuf</i> ,	.. Hoof. <sup>9</sup>
حاد <i>hál</i> ,	} .. Hot, heat.
حار <i>hár</i> ,	
حرم <i>haram</i> .	.. Harem.
غزال <i>ghazál</i> ,	.. Gazelle.
غول <i>ghúil</i> ,	.. Ghoul.
جنس <i>jins</i> ,	.. Genus (Latin).
زنجبيل <i>zanjabíl</i> ,	.. Ginger. <sup>10</sup> [ <i>girafa</i> ].
زرافة <i>zuráfa</i> ,	.. Giraffe (French and Spanish,
غرغرة <i>gharghara</i> ,	.. Gargle. <sup>11</sup>

The Greek *δελφίς* is found in Homer.

<sup>2</sup> The English word is derived immediately from the Italian *da naseo*; which has always been supposed to mean "cloth of Damascus."

<sup>3</sup> Compare the Dutch *duyne*, and French *dunes*, sand-hills by the sea side; the Frisic *dúh*, a hillock of sand; the Anglo-Saxon *dean*, a hill; and the Gaelic *dán*, a heap, hill, or fortified place.

<sup>4</sup> The Greek *ἐλέφας*; compare the Hebrew *aleph*.

<sup>5</sup> Italian *feluca*, French *felouque*.

<sup>6</sup> German *flus*.

<sup>7</sup> An onomatopœia, from the sound of the fall of a flat substance. Compare the French *plat*, the Italian *piatto*, the German *platt*, the Latin *latus*, the Greek *πλατύς*.

<sup>8</sup> The Spanish *garbillare*.

<sup>9</sup> Through the Dutch *huf*.

<sup>10</sup> The Greek *ζγγίβερις*, connected (according to Pott, Et. Forsch. 2. 36) with the Sanskrit *gumjavera*. We got it through the Latin *zinziber* and the old English *gingiber*.

<sup>11</sup> This is doubtless an onomatopœia. Compare the Greek *γργαρίζω*, the Latin *gurgulio*, the German *gurgel*, the Italian *gargagliare*, the French *gargouiller*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
هاله <i>hála</i> ,	.. Halo (Greek ἅλως).
حمد <i>hamd</i> ,	.. Hymn (Greek ὕμνος).
اسماعيل <i>asá'il</i> ,	.. History (Greek ἱστορία, ἵστωρ).
ياسمين <i>yásmín</i> ,	.. Jasmine.
ايضا <i>aiṭhan</i> ,	.. Identity (Latin <i>idem</i> ),
علي <i>'illa</i> ,	.. Ill. <sup>1</sup>
الكابوس <i>alkáwbús</i> ,	.. Incubus.
جلاب <i>julláb</i> ,	.. Julep.
كرشوف <i>kursuf</i> ,	.. Kerchief. <sup>2</sup>
لحد <i>lahd</i>	.. Lid. <sup>3</sup>
لامع <i>lámí'un</i> ,	.. Lumine.
ولد <i>walad</i> ,	.. Lad (Welsh <i>llawd</i> ).
العقار <i>al'qár</i> ,	.. Liquor (Latin).
ليمون <i>límán</i> ,	.. Lemon (French <i>limon</i> ).
لوزنج <i>lúzínaj</i> ,	.. Lozenge. <sup>4</sup>
لغت or لغو <i>lughat or lughu</i> ,	.. Logic (Greek λόγος).
لينت <i>linat</i> ,	.. Lenity (Latin <i>lenis</i> ).
لعق <i>la'q</i> ,	.. Lick. <sup>5</sup>
مسك <i>misk</i> ,	.. Musk. <sup>6</sup>
ميل <i>míl</i> ,	.. Mile. <sup>7</sup>
مصيطر <i>musaitar</i> ,	.. Master.
ميدان <i>mídán</i> ,	.. Meadow.
مخزن <i>makhzan</i> ,	.. Magazine. <sup>8</sup>
مرآة <i>mirát</i> ,	.. Mirror. <sup>9</sup>
موسم <i>mausim</i> ,	.. Monsoon.
موميائي <i>mumiyái</i> ,	.. Mummy.
مجنبيق or مجانيق from Per- sian مجنيك	.. } <i>minjiniq or majániq</i> , Mechanic. <sup>10</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Generally understood to be a contraction of *evil* (Anglo-Saxon *ýfel*, Dutch *evel*, German *übel*). Compare the Icelandic *illr*.

<sup>2</sup> Apparently a contraction of the French *courrechef*.

<sup>3</sup> Compare the Anglo-Saxon and Icelandic *hlid*, with the Latin *claudo*, connected with the Greek *κλειω*.

<sup>4</sup> The French *lozenge*, usually derived from the Spanish *losa*, a flat stone for paving.

<sup>5</sup> An onomatopœia. Compare the Greek *λείω*, the Italian *leccare*, the Gothic *laigon*, the German *lecken*, the Finnish *lakkia*, the Lithuanian *lakti*, the Russian *lokut*.

<sup>6</sup> Compare the Greek *μόσχος* (= *μογ-σχος*, according to Donaldson, *New Cratylus*, para. 219), the Latin *muskus*, the French *musc*, the Sanscrit *muskha*.

<sup>7</sup> The Anglo-Saxon *míl*, supposed to be identical with the French *mille*, the Latin *mille passuum*.

<sup>8</sup> Through the Spanish *almacen*, *magacen*; and the French *magasin*.

<sup>9</sup> Apparently from the Latin *mirror*, through the French *mirroir*.

<sup>10</sup> From the Greek *μηχανή*, *mēchos*, akin to *mēdos*, *mētis*, &c. Compare the Latin *machina*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
مطران <i>matrân,</i>	.. Metropolitan (Greek <i>μήτηρ</i> ).
مر <i>murr,</i>	.. Myrrh, myrtle. <sup>1</sup>
منارة <i>manârat,</i>	.. Minaret.
املاج (ملج) <i>imlâj, malj,</i>	.. Milch. <sup>2</sup>
مرح <i>marah,</i>	.. Mirth, merry. <sup>3</sup>
مطر <i>mitv,</i>	.. Mate. <sup>4</sup>
معني <i>ma'nû,</i>	.. Mean <sup>5</sup>
مثله <i>muthla,</i>	.. Mutilate (Latin <i>mutilo</i> ). <sup>6</sup>
من <i>man,</i>	.. Manna (Hebrew).
عنق <i>'unug,</i>	.. Neck. <sup>7</sup>
نفرت <i>nafrat</i>	.. Nefarious (Latin <i>nefas, fus, for</i> ).
نبيل و نبل <i>nabîl or nubul,</i>	.. Noble (Latin <i>nobilis</i> ). <sup>8</sup>
نظر <i>nazar,</i>	.. Nadir.
نفت <i>naft.</i>	.. Naptha (Greek <i>νάφθα</i> ).
نارنج <i>nâranj,</i>	.. Orange. <sup>9</sup>
فردوس <i>firdaus,</i>	.. Paradiso.
فرد <i>fuhd,</i>	.. Pard. <sup>10</sup>
بلبل يا بلبل <i>bulbul or balâbil,</i>	.. Philomela (Greek).
فستق <i>fustaq, (Pers. pista),</i>	.. Pistachio.
قنطار <i>qintâr,</i>	.. Quintal. <sup>11</sup>
رائض <i>râidh,</i>	.. Ride. <sup>12</sup>
رفض <i>rafz,</i>	.. Refuse (Latin <i>refundo, refusum</i> ).
سكر <i>sukkar,</i>	.. Sugar. <sup>13</sup>
اسفنج <i>isfanj,</i>	.. Sponge. <sup>14</sup>
استورة <i>ustûra,</i>	.. Story (see History).
شكال <i>shikâl,</i>	.. Shacklo.
سقمونيا <i>saqmûniâ,</i>	.. Scamony (Greek <i>σκαμονία</i> ).
زعفران <i>za'fanân,</i>	.. Saffron. <sup>15</sup>

<sup>1</sup> The Greek *μόρρα* meant the balsamic juico of the Arabian *μόρτος* or myrtle.

<sup>2</sup> Compare the Latin *mulgeo*, the German *melken*, the Greek *ἀμέλγω*. The peculiarity of the vowel prefixed to the Greek root is noticed by Donaldson, *New Cratylus* para. 212.

<sup>3</sup> Compare the Gaelic *nîre*, *nîreadh*.

<sup>4</sup> The Icelandic *mati*.

<sup>5</sup> Compare the German *meinen*, the Latin *meminisse*, the Icelandic *mund*.

<sup>6</sup> The Greek *μήτιλος* or *μήτυλος*.

<sup>7</sup> From the Anglo-Saxon *hnecca*, Danish *nakke*. Compare the Dutch *nak*, and the French *nuque*.

<sup>8</sup> *Nobilis* is doubtless *gnobilis*, from the Greek *γνώω*.

<sup>9</sup> Through the Venetian *naranja*, and the Spanish *naranja*. Compare the Italian *arancio* and the French *orange*.

<sup>10</sup> The Greek *πάρδος*; Homer has *πάρδαλις*.

<sup>11</sup> Usually derived from Latin *centum*.

<sup>12</sup> From the Anglo-Saxon *riden*. Compare the Icelandic *reida*, and the German *reiten*.

<sup>13</sup> Latin *saccharum*.

<sup>14</sup> Latin *spongia*, *fungus*; Greek *σπόγγος*.

<sup>15</sup> French *safran*; Italian *zafferano*.

ARABIC.	ENGLISH.
إستابل <i>istabl</i> ,	.. Stable (Latin <i>stabulum</i> , <i>sto</i> ).
سنا <i>sanâ</i> ,	.. Sun.
سقراط <i>sagharât</i> ,	.. Scarlet. <sup>1</sup>
سلو <i>sulur</i> ,	.. Solace (Latin <i>solatium</i> , <i>solor</i> )
* جدول <i>jadûal</i> ,	.. Schedule. <sup>2</sup>
صندل <i>sandal</i> ,	.. Sandal.
سلك <i>silk</i> ,	.. Silk. <sup>3</sup>
شرقيين <i>sharqîin</i> ,	.. Saracen.
سلاطن <i>sullân</i> ,	.. Sultan.
سنا <i>sanâ</i> ,	.. Senna.
سماق <i>sumâq</i> ,	.. Smack.
صلب <i>sulb</i> ,	.. Slab (Welsh <i>yslab</i> ).
ساق <i>sâq</i> ,	.. Shank (Anglo-Saxon <i>seanc</i> ).
صلوة <i>salât</i> ,	.. Salute (Latin <i>salus</i> )
شمرخ <i>skimrah</i> ,	.. Shamrock (Irish <i>seamrog</i> .)
عصفور <i>'uṣṣūr</i> ,	.. Sparrow. <sup>4</sup>
وشل <i>washal</i> ,	.. Shallow, shoal.
طلاسم <i>tilismun</i> ,	.. Talisman.
طعنة <i>tu'nat</i> ,	.. Taunt.
طوفان <i>tufân</i> ,	.. Typhoon.
طسق <i>tasâq</i> ,	.. Tax, task (Latin <i>taxo</i> ).
طال <i>tâla</i> ,	.. Tall (Welsh <i>tal</i> ).
طلق <i>talaq</i> ,	.. Tale.
طرس <i>turs</i> ,	.. Tress. <sup>5</sup>
إستبرق <i>istabraq</i> ,	.. Tabric.
بيطا <i>baitâr</i> ,	.. Veterinary. <sup>6</sup>
عود <i>'ūd</i> ,	.. Wood. <sup>7</sup>
وسط <i>wast</i> ,	.. Waist (Welsh <i>gwasy</i> ).
وهم <i>wahm</i> ,	.. Whim.
زير <i>zir</i> ,	.. Zero (Spanish and Italian).
زينة <i>zinât</i> ,	.. Zenith (Spanish <i>zenit</i> ).

\* as used in Arithmetical works.

<sup>1</sup> Italian *scarlato*, French *écarlate*, German *scharlach*. The Italian *scarlatino* (flesh-coloured, from Latin *caro*) became in Venetian *scarlatina*; which suggests a Latin origin for the word.

<sup>2</sup> Latin *schedula*, diminutive of *scheda*, *scindo*; Greek *σχέδη*, *σχίζω*; German *scheiden*.

<sup>3</sup> Anglo-Saxon *seole*; usually derived from Latin *sericum*, Greek *σηρικὸς*, *Σήρ*.

<sup>4</sup> Anglo-Saxon *spearra*, Icelandic *sporr*, German *sperrling*.

<sup>5</sup> Italian *treccia*, French *trousse*, Spanish *trecia*; by some derived from Greek *τρίπλα* *threefold*, by others from Latin *trice*, Greek *τρίξ*, *hair*.

<sup>6</sup> Latin *veterinus*; usually derived from *veho*.

<sup>7</sup> Anglo-Saxon *wudu*; Welsh *gwydd*.

## ART. II.—THE ARCHITECTURE OF KASHMÍR.

THE ancient temples of Kashmír form a small but complete series of exceeding interest. The date of their erection and the names of their founders have in some cases been recorded by contemporary annalists ; and by reference to these authenticated examples all the remainder can be accurately referred to their proper chronological order, if only attention be directed to some slight but obvious differences of constructural detail. The ruins, though not absolutely numerous, are sufficiently so to show the rise and development of the style with its ultimate debasement ; while they are so far complete, or rather complementary to one another, that a restoration of such parts as time or fanaticism has destroyed can be mentally effected with almost absolute certainty. And further, not only is the style of architecture positively unique and of special historic significance, facts which appeal chiefly to the student, but its actual intrinsic beauty cannot fail to strike the most cursory observer. The scenery too, in which these ancient buildings are situated, is the most lovely in the world—now some lofty crag, as at Mártand, from which may be descried the whole extent of the Happy Valley ; now some grassy glade sloping down to the edge of a broad and rapid mountain stream, as at Páyachh ; or again, as at Wángat, a savage glen, far from all human habitation, where the dense forests and towering precipices lend a more than religious gloom to the crumbling fanes, and the mighty river that rushes at their base only betrays its presence by the roar of its turbulent waters. In all, excepting perhaps the last named instance, these interesting buildings have the further advantage of accessibility ; for, as of old, the Jhelam with its vast connected system of lakes and canals forms the principal thoroughfare of the country, and has seen arise upon its banks each of the many capitals founded by successive lines of Hindú dynasties. There, too, as a natural consequence, the most imposing temples were erected ; and their ruins may still be inspected by the summer tourist, if he merely stay the boat for a few moments as it lazily floats down with the current.

However, in spite of these many concurrent causes, which might be expected to popularise the study of Kashmír antiquities, scarcely one of the 500 visitors who yearly flock across the Himalayas to avoid the summer heats of Hindústán, ever thinks of giving them a glance. And this in spite of the *ennui* which the most enthusiastic sportsman, the most listless of lotus-eaters, or the most fond admirer of beauty and the picturesque seldom fails to experience. ~~On his~~ his term of residence extends to the full



period of six months. The cause of this neglect is not hard to discover. An ancient building, like a painting by one of the old masters, requires an educated taste for its appreciation; without some slight smattering of technical knowledge the points of special interest are left unnoted and the mind receives only a confused impression, in which the accidents of time and decay predominate over the essentials of constructive art and original design. In Europe the sight-seer accepts with unhesitating and generally well-placed confidence the art-criticisms of the familiar Murray: in Kashmír the only attempt at a guide-book is a little manual compiled by Dr. Ince, who was for two years stationed at Srinagar\* as Medical Officer. It is an unpretending (though very high-priced) little book, and gives a variety of useful information with regard to prices and distances and such practical matters. It is especially characterized by the number and accuracy of the measurements which it contains; the exact height and area of a bungalow chabutara, the precise depth and width of the water-courses in a pleasure-garden, are all carefully chronicled; while more striking features in the landscape are left to speak for themselves. The remarks on the architecture of the country are curiously pre-scientific; the relative antiquity of Hindú and Muhammadan buildings is ordinarily reversed, while the temples of which it would be interesting to state the exact dimensions are, from some obliquity of judgment, invariably left unmeasured, and are dismissed with the summary remark that nothing is known about them.

To this dictum of the Kashmír Murray may no doubt be attributed much of the absurdity, which frequently colours the impressions of a tourist on his return from the ruins of Mártand. These he has visited, attracted by their greater local celebrity, or in consequence of his having seen in the plains the admirable photographic views of which they form the subject. But as they are the one solitary specimen of that style of architecture which has ever come under his observation, and as his only literary guide, backed probably by the ignorant cicerones on the spot, assures him that their origin is an utter mystery, he confidently ventures on the wildest theories as to their date and object. One, struck by the familiar outline of the columns in the peristyle, ascribes their construction to European artists in the employ of the great Muhammadan Emperors during the 16th and 17th centuries; another, having learnt that Mártand in some language or another, means 'the sun' assumes as an unquestionable fact that the architects were Fireworshippers; while a third, with a general impression of an

---

\* The writer would protest against 'Sirinugger,' which literally means the way in which the name of 'Silly town,' this town is vulgarly mis-spelt

Israelitish cast of face in the present inhabitants of the country and a vague reminiscence that there is a Takht-i-Sulaimán or 'Solomon's throne' somewhere in the neighbourhood, declares it to be the original temple of the Jews.\* All are unanimous in protesting that Hindús cannot possibly have had any hand in its erection.

It is obvious that theories so grotesquely remote from the truth could not be seriously propounded by persons of ordinary intelligence, if there did not exist some marked difference between Kashmiri and ordinary Hindú architecture. The difference is mainly attributable to Greek influence exercised by the long succession of Indo-Bactrian dynasties. A learned native member of the Asiatic Society has recently maintained that the invasion of Alexander had no more permanent effect upon Indian civilisation than Lord Napier's temporary occupation of Abyssinia upon the arts of that country. A journey from Calcutta to Srinagar is a costly specific to prescribe for the expulsion of an erroneous idea, but it would unquestionably prove efficacious. The colonnaded quadrangles that enclose the temples at Bhaniyár, Mártand and Avantipur find no parallel in any purely Indian edifice, but correspond precisely with the Grecian peristyle and are undoubtedly copied from it. The columns are all of uniform design, most nearly resembling the Doric order, with clearly defined base, shaft and capital, each proportioned with reference to the diameter. A group of ordinary Hindú columns presents a very different appearance; there it is rare to find even two alike; simplicity is eschewed in favour of the eccentric; and the more dissimilar any two pillars may be, the more suitable are they judged to stand in juxta-position. The principle is extended to the component parts of the same column; these also bear no definite proportion to one another; in some cases a giant base supports a puny shaft and equally insignificant capital, in others a base is altogether wanting, while a companion pillar is constructed of two halves of utterly diverse design, each forming a perfect column by itself, and mounted the one upon the other. This last arrangement appears such an inexplicable vagary, that in one place where it occurs, *viz.*, the Hindú colonnade near the Kutb Minár at Delhi, architects are unable to decide whether the building, as we now see it, was so originally designed, or whether it is only a congeries of incongruous fragments taken from various temples and roughly put together by the Muhammadan despoiler, just as they first came to hand. The truth would appear to lie between

---

\* However incredible it may appear, it is a fact that the present writer when in Kashmir heard each of the above views energetically defended.

these two extreme views : the colonnade has been reconstructed by the Muhammadans, but probably in close, though not always exact, accordance with the original design. This opinion is derived from the examination of an ancient but little-known Hindú building at Mahában in the Mathurá district, where the pillars in the front row are each one shaft of uniform character ; while in the interior, which consists of four parallel aisles, the same height is obtained by the combination of two smaller columns, one surmounting the other.\*

It is certain that most, and probable that all of the existing Kashmír temples were dedicated to the worship of Siva, and enshrined merely a conical stone, the popular symbol of that divinity. Hence the smallness of their dimensions. The interior of the cella, or sanctuary, is seldom more than 10 or 12 feet square ; space ample enough for the simple form of adoration which alone is required by Mahádeva from his devotees, *viz.*, that they sprinkle water on the sacred symbol, pace round it with measured steps, and finally crown it with a garland of flowers. The drain for the purpose of carrying off the waste water still exists in most of the temples, and is clearly part of the original structure, being a projecting corner from some one of the few enormous blocks of which the building is composed. In the Vaishnava shrines on the contrary there is a kind of public service, attended with music and chanting and necessitating a much wider space for the accommodation of the worshippers ; as may be seen in the stately fanes at Mathurá and Brindában, which are quite on the scale of Christian churches.

Owing to the great thickness of the walls and the massiveness of the plinth upon which the temples are raised, their exterior proportions are much more imposing than would be expected from the recital of so insignificant an interior area. Though less suggestive of Greek influence than the detached pillars of the colonnades, the pilasters with their definitely proportioned base, shaft and capital, the square architraves of the doorways and the triangular pediments that surmount them, but still more the chastened simplicity of outline, and the just subordination of merely decorative details are at a glance seen to be classic rather than oriental. Beyond the points above enumerated, the resemblance ceases ; the porches are curved into a bold trefoiled arch of similar

---

\* Some five or six years ago an Archæological Abstract of the antiquities of every district was compiled by orders of Government ; and in the course of the present year a sumptuous work has appeared, which professes to illustrate the architectural antiquities of Mathurá and its neighbourhood, prepared by the Su-

perintendent of the Archæological Survey. In neither of these reports is there any mention of the Mahában building, though it would be difficult to find, not only in that district, but in the whole of Upper India, any ancient remain of more singular interest.

character with English Gothic of the First Pointed period, and the roof instead of being flat and out of sight is a high-pitched pyramid, broken, however, into two compartments by a horizontal band carved with dentils and triglyphs. In short the adaptation of classic forms was complete just so far as the differences of climate and the conventionalities of religion allowed. In the sunny land of Greece, a roof was felt to be a useless encumbrance and therefore kept out of sight; on the snowy hills of Kashmīr a substantial covering over head was above all things to be desired; hence the roof became a prominent feature in the design. In sculpture the influence of Greek art was unfelt, since the archaic representations of the deity were too sacred to admit of modification and were reproduced in all their primitive rudeness in niches and on panels moulded with the most artistic grace. Nor is this discordance in design any matter for surprise: the very same feeling may be seen at work in the present day. On the bank of the Ganges at Mīrzāpur, a most exquisite ghāt has been for some years past in course of erection. The architect with the true assimilating genius of the great mediæval builders, has blended into one harmonious composition, details that he has borrowed both from Saracenic and Gothic art, and so incorporated them in a basis of Hindū design that the gradation from the one style to the other is absolutely imperceptible, and the effect uniform and eminently beautiful. Yet the divinities enthroned in this artistic shrine, being copied from the indigenous models at Jagannāth, are as coarse and barbarous as the fetiches of the most degraded South Sea islanders.

In all the Kashmīr temples, except Mārtand, the cella forms the entire building. In some examples there is an open doorway on each of the four sides, in others only one, facing east or west, such a position enabling the rays either of the rising or setting sun to fall full upon the idol. In both cases the exterior effect is the same; when there is only a single entrance, the porch above it may be made slightly more prominent, but on each of the other faces is a similar erection, though the doorway within it is closed. At the larger of the two Pathan temples the projection of these pseudo-porches is so considerable that they form deep niches or rather shallow chambers, in each of which was once a lingam.

As the country population of Kashmīr is almost exclusively Muhammadan,\* the visitor in reply to any enquiries on the spot will

\* The modern language of Kashmīr would be a most interesting study for the philologist; as beyond what may be learnt from a few very imperfect vocabularies which have appeared in the journal of the Asiatic Society, it is absolutely unknown beyond the

borders of its own native home. In its origin it is a Prākṛit dialect of the Sanskrit, and the number of directly Sanskrit words still in common use have a very odd sound coming from the mouth of Muhammadans. In retaliation for the corruption of

probably be told that the building is only an old *bhút-khána*, or idol-house, and therefore, as is implied, quite unworthy of any notice on the part of a true follower of the prophet. If the guide is of somewhat higher intelligence, he will say it was the work of giants of old, the Pándus,\* meaning the heroes of the Mahábhárata; but beyond this it is impossible to advance. Fortunately we are not left in this matter at the mercy of local tradition or baseless speculation. The only historical work that exists in the whole vast range of Sanskrit literature is, by a wonderful chance, a chronicle of Kashmír, entitled the Rájá Tarangini. In this the principal temples erected by many of the kings are briefly noted and may with tolerable certainty be identified with existing remains.

This identification was first made by General (then Captain) Cunningham, in an article contributed to the journal of the Asiatic Society in 1848, wherein he gives full descriptions and sketches of the temples at the Takht-i-Sulaiman, Bhaumajo, Páyachh, Mártand, Avantipur, Pathan, and Pandrathan. A supplementary notice by the Rev. W. G. Cowie appeared in the same journal in 1866. To both these scholars the present writer is largely indebted, though he has himself also personally examined all the temples and places which he now proceeds to describe.

The earliest of all the temples is said to be that crowning the Takht-i-Sulaimán. This hill rises to the height of 1,000 feet above the plain and overlooks the town of Srinagar which spreads away to the foot of the opposite but somewhat lower eminence called the Hari Parbat.† The first religious edifice on this commanding site was built by Jaloka, the son of the great Buddhist convert Asoka, about 200 B.C. In all probability there is not a fragment of this now remaining. The temple was subsequently rebuilt and dedicated to Jyeshthesvara, a title of Mahádeva, by Rájá Gopaditya, who reigned from 238 to 253 A.D. To this date may be ascribed the low enclosing wall and the plinth of the existing temple, but all the superstructure is evidently modern or greatly modernized.

Persian words by Hindús in India who pronounce the letter *z* as a *j*, the Muhamamadans in Kashmír convert all the Sanskrit palatals into sibilants and *vice versé*; thus *guchh* Sanskrit for 'go,' becomes *gazzh*, and 'sti' for 'asti' 'he is' becomes 'chhi.'

\* The Mahábhárata represents the five sons of Pándu as reared in the neighbourhood of the Himálayas, and subsequently brought thence to their ancestral capital of Hastinapura or Delhi (Adi Parva II. 64). So

too Ptolemy in his Geography fixes the country of the Pándus in the vicinity of the Vitasta, i.e., the Jhelam.

† The Hari Parbat, as is obvious, derives its name from the Hindú God Hari or Vishnu, of whom there is a rock-cut sculpture on one side of the hill. Bernier, who, whatever his merits as a writer, was certainly no philologist, thought it denoted 'the green mountain.' So modern visitors to Srinagar convert Hari-sinh-Bágh into Harrison Bágh.

Of more interest and in much more perfect preservation is the small cave-temple at Bhaunajo. It stands at the far end of a natural but artificially enlarged fissure in the limestone cliff, which rises from the bank of the Lidar at the mouth of the valley, bearing the same name, about half a mile from the village of Bhavan. The entrance to the cavern, which is more than 60 feet above the level of the river, is carved into an architectural doorway and a gloomy passage 50 feet in length, leads from it to the door of the temple. It is a simple cella, 10 feet square, exterior dimensions, raised on a boldly moulded plinth and approached by a short flight of steps. The square doorway is flanked by two round-headed niches despoiled of their statues, and is surmounted by a high triangular pediment reaching to the apex of the roof, with a trefoiled tympanum. There is no record nor tradition as to the time of erection; but from the absence of all ornamentation and the simple character of the roof, which appears to be a rudimentary copy in stone of the ordinary sloping timber roof of the country, it may with great probability be inferred that this is the earliest perfect specimen of a Kashmir temple and dates from the first or second century of the Christian era.

Close by is another cave of still greater extent, but with no architectural accessories; and about half a mile further up the valley at the foot of the cliff are two temples, the larger of which has been converted into a Muhammadan tomb. Both are to a considerable extent copies of the cave-temple, but may be of much later date.

The little shrine at Páyachh comes next in point of antiquity and in intrinsic beauty and elegance of outline is far superior to all the existing remains of similar dimensions. The traveller, Vigne, regarded it as the most modern of all, but apparently from no more solid reason than its excellent preservation. This however may be explained by its retired situation, at the foot of a high table-land which separates it by an interval of 5 or 6 miles from the bank of the Jhelam, and by the marvellous solidity of its construction. The cella, which is only 8 feet square and has an open doorway on each of the four sides, is composed of only ten stones: the four corners being each a single stone, the sculptured tympanums over the doorways four others, while two more compose the pyramidal roof, the lower of these being an enormous mass, 8 feet square by 4 feet in height. It has been ascribed by General Cunningham, on grounds, which, in the absence of any positive authority either way, may be taken as adequate to King Narendraditya, who reigned from 483 to 490 A.D. The sculptures over the doorways are coarsely executed, in comparison with the artistic finish of the purely architectural details, and are much defaced, but apparently

represent Brahma, Vishnu, Siva and the goddess Durgá. The interior is still occupied by a large stone lingam, and from the water-drain and the bulls carved on the smaller pilasters of the doorways, it is evident that this was the original intention.

Of somewhat later date are the temples at Wángat. These are in two groups, situated at the distance of a few hundred yards from each other, and consisting respectively of six and eleven distinct buildings. In close proximity is a sacred spring called Nág-bal,\* and by it the footpath leads up the heights of Hara-mukh to the mountain-lake of Gangá-bal, a celebrated place of pilgrimage. It is probable that the temples were erected at different times by returning pilgrims, as votive offerings after successful accomplishment of the hazardous ascent. They stand at the head of a narrow glen, traversed by the rapid stream of the Kanknai, high up on the precipitous mountain-side, in the midst of dense jungle and towering pine-trees, with no abode of man nearer than the little hamlet of Wángat, which is at a distance of three miles. The luxuriant forest-growth has overthrown and buried almost completely several of the smaller temples; on the summit of the largest a tall pine has taken root and rises straight from the centre in rivalry of the original finial. The architecture is of a slightly more advanced type than at Páyachh, the most striking feature being the bold projection and lofty trefoiled arches of the lateral porches.

Of very similar character, but in more perfect preservation, is the temple at Bhaniyár. This is much better known, since it stands on the very edge of the high-road leading from Murree to Srinagar, about a mile and a half from the village of Naushahra. The actual shrine is a cella of larger dimensions than usual, being  $13\frac{1}{2}$  feet square in the interior, with walls  $6\frac{1}{2}$  feet thick, supported on a basement 4 feet square of singularly noble proportions. It is the earliest example that still retains its original enclosure, a cloistered quadrangle measuring 145 by 120 feet. Though the finer touches of the chisel have been effaced by time, the colonnade is in other respects almost perfect. The wall is pierced by a series of pedimented and trefoiled arches, forming shallow recesses for the accommodation of priests and pilgrims, and in front of each pier is a circular column attached to the intabature by a short transverse architrave. The central gateway is of similar character with the temple-porches, and has a pair of lofty detached

---

\* *Nág* being originally a 'serpent' 'water' or a direct formation from or 'water-god' has come in Kashmīr the root *val*, 'to hasten.' Taking to denote simply a 'spring,' as in *bal* in its common sense of 'strength,' the name of the place Var-nág, it finds a curious parallel in the English north-country use of 'force' for This too is the significance of *bal*, which is either a corruption of *Vári*, a water-fall.

columns on either face, and in the centre a cross-wall closed by a wooden door. This plan of having the door not flush with either wall, but at an equal distance from both, under the centre of the gateway, is to be observed also at Mártand and Avantipur. It has an obvious advantage in affording shelter to persons claiming either admission or exit, and the artistic effect is excellent.

A few miles further on the road is another temple of similar character, but originally, as it would seem, of more elaborate design. Here, however, the surrounding colonnade, if it ever existed, has entirely disappeared, and only the blank wall remains.

The celebrated temple of Mártand is the next to claim attention, and is of far more imposing dimensions than any other existing example. It alone possesses in addition to the cella, or sanctuary, a choir and nave, or to give them their Sanskrit terms, *antardīa* and *arddha-mandapa*. The nave is 18 feet square, and the total length of the building 63 feet. The sanctuary alone is left entirely bare; the two other compartments are lined with rich panelling and sculptured niches. The roof has been completely removed, and lies in vast masses round the walls of the building; it is calculated that the height cannot have been less than 75 feet. The western entrance, approached by a wide flight of steps now encumbered with ruins, is surmounted by a magnificent trefoiled arch and flanked by two side-chapels, once connected with the nave by the extension of their roof over the narrow intervening passage. On the other sides of the temple are similar lofty arches, with closed doorways below. The pillared quadrangle, which is 220 by 142 feet in dimensions, varies in no essential point from that at Bhanīyār, but the carving is rather more elaborate. There are in all 84 columns, a singularly appropriate number in a temple of the sun; if, as is supposed, the number 84 is accounted sacred by the Hindús in consequence of its being the multiple of the number of days in the week with the number of signs in the Zodiac. The colonnade is distinctly recorded in the Rájá Tarangini as the work of the famous king Lalitáditya, who reigned from 693 to 729 A.D. From the same authority we gather, though the interpretation of the verses is considerably disputed, that the temple itself was built by Ranáditya, and the side-chapels, or at least one of them, by his queen Amrita-prabhá. The date of Ranáditya's reign is involved in some obscurity, but the safest conclusion is that he died in the first half of the 5th century after Christ.

On the right bank of the Jhelam, about half-way between the towns of Srinagar and Islámábád, stood the capital of the famous king Avanti-varmma, which he called after his own name Avantipur. Here he founded two temples: one before his accession to the throne, the other and larger one subsequently. Both were dedicated to Mahádeva, the former under the title of *Avanti-swámi*



the latter under that of Avantiswara. His reign extended from the year 854 to 883 A.D. The two temples are now shapeless masses of ruins, but the gateways of both are standing and the colonnade of the smaller temple, which had been completely buried under ground, has recently been partially excavated. The style corresponds with that of the Mártand quadrangle; but the semi-attached pillars of the arched recesses are enriched with elaborate carving of very varied character, while the large detached columns are somewhat less elegantly proportioned.

It is recorded in the Rájá Tarangini that Sankara Varmma, who succeeded Avanti Varmma and reigned from 883 to 901 A.D. in conjunction with his queen Sugandhá, dedicated to Mahádeva under the titles of Sankara Gauresa and Sugandhesvara—two temples at his new capital of Sankara-pura. This town is identified with the modern Pathan, where beside the highway leading from Srínagar to Bárahmúla, two stately temples are still standing. Each is a simple cella; but in the larger one, as already noted, the side porches are so deep as to constitute separate chambers. In both the architecture is of the same character as at Mártand, and of equal excellence. Here and there the carving is as sharp and fresh as if executed yesterday, but there are many ominous cracks in the walls, and if the forest trees which have taken root in these crevices are allowed to remain and spread, the total destruction of both buildings is imminent.

Such a fate has already overtaken a most interesting temple, situated on a diminutive island called the Lanka at the entrance of the Walúr lake. It was constructed on a plan entirely different from that of any other existing example, being a square (34 feet in dimension) with a single porch or narthex on the south side, projecting 6 feet beyond the walls of the cella. The exterior was ornamented with arcades of trefoiled niches in two tiers. These are so Gothic in character that they might be transferred without incongruity to the walls of an English cathedral. The island is a dense mass of jungle; and the forest trees, which have already displaced great part of the massive masonry, threaten soon to bring down all the remainder. There appears once to have been a surrounding colonnade, as a large number of fluted pillars are lying about, but none *in situ*.

The temple of Pádrathan, the last in the main series, is, next to Mártand, the best known of all, in consequence of its close proximity to the capital. It stands in the centre of a small pond, in ordinary seasons about 4 feet deep in the water. Access to the interior is therefore a matter of some difficulty, which is unfortunate, since the domed roof is well worth inspection, being covered with sculpture of such purely classic design, that any uninitiated person who saw a copy of it on paper would at once take it for a

sketch from a Greek or Roman original. The temple is 18 feet square, with a projecting portico on each side, and displays in a confused exuberance of decoration, more especially the repetition of pediment within pediment and trefoil within trefoil, clear indications of later date. It was erected, during the reign of King Pārtha, who governed Kashmír from 913 to 921 A.D., by his Prime Minister Meru, who dedicated it to Mahádeva under the title of Meru-varddhana-swamí. The ground about it was then occupied by the original city of Srinagar; the modern name Pándrathau being a corruption of the Sanskrit Puránadhish-thána, i.e., 'the old capital.' The seat of Government had been transferred to the present site by King Pravarasena II. nearly 500 years before the foundation of the temple; but the old city was not entirely deserted till its destruction by fire in the reign of Abhimanyu, about the year 960 A.D. The conflagration was so violent that, excepting the temple, which was protected by the water about it, no other building escaped. There are in the neighbourhood some few fragmentary remains, which General Cunningham, more than 20 years ago, amused himself by piecing together and reconstructing with a wildness of imagination which his present mature judgment would be far from endorsing. The remains are simply as follows:—First, two large lingams, one 6 feet high, erect and entire; the other broken into three pieces, the lower part polygonal, the upper round with conical top, which together made up a height of 16 feet. Near these, which are separated from each other by a short interval, is a huge mass of stone, being the feet and legs, as high as the knees, of a colossal seated figure, probably a Buddhist image. At some little distance beyond this, an isolated crag has been cut as it stood into some sculptured form, apparently a *chaumukhi*, i.e., a square pillar with a figure on each face. But the rock has been overthrown, broken into three pieces and so defaced by the action of fire that it is impossible to speak positively as to the original design. Of the three fragments one, the base, is still attached to and forms part of the natural rock. These four perfectly distinct objects, viz., the two lingams, the seated Buddha, and the rock-cut *chaumukhi* were combined by Captain Cunningham into a gigantic phallic pillar, with the heads and feet of four figures showing at the base and centre of the column, while their bodies were made to disappear into the polygonal shaft of the larger lingam.

On the margin of the beautiful lake of Mánas-bal is another small temple, about 6 feet square, sunk like that at Pándrathau to some depth in the water. Strange, as it may appear, there is good reason to suppose that all the Kashmír temples, not even excepting Mártand, were originally surrounded by artificial lakes. This alone can explain the silting up of the Avantipur

quadrangle. The water was probably conveyed from an exterior reservoir into the courtyard, which was flooded to the depth of two or three feet, partially covering the plinth of the temple while a stone footway was carried on masonry supports over the water round the margin of the colonnade, and from the temple-door to the entrance gateway. The object of this curious arrangement was to propitiate the *nāgas*, or water-spirits, the primitive divinities of the country. In proof of the prevalent ophiolatriy may be adduced the ancient slabs sculptured with figures of snakes which are still occasionally to be seen worked up into the walls of modern buildings. There is one at the temple-ghāt of Bijbihāra ; but perhaps the most curious of all is at the village of Changas on the Bhimbar route into Kashmír, where among a number of small lingams under a pipal tree is a rudely carved slab representing a serpent with its long coils spreading over the whole length of the stone, and a devotee with clasped hands standing below. Abul Fazl speaks of nearly 700 figures of *nāgas*, or serpent gods, existing in his time in Kashmír.

One peculiarity of temple architecture yet remains to be noticed ; and that is the occurrence here and there throughout the country of miniature models of temples, constructed in each case out of a single stone. The visitor to Kashmír by the Pír-Panchál road passes one half-way between Shapiyun and Rámu ; there is another at Kohil near Páyachh ; a third built up into the embankment of the canal called the Nali Mar, and two more in the City Lake, often completely under water and hence much worn and defaced. In all these examples, though the interior area can scarcely be so much as a foot square, the similitude to an actual temple is carried out in every architectural detail. But near the village of Pathan, beside the great highway from Bárahmúla to Srínagar, are two such models, which are not hollowed out in the interior at all ; the place of the open doorway being occupied by a sculptured panel.

Though a Hindú dynasty continued to reign in Kashmír till the beginning of the 14th century ; and temples, as there is every reason to suppose, were erected by the later princes of the line, no less than by their predecessors ; still the most modern example extant of the true Kashmír style is, as we have already mentioned, the temple at Pándrathan, founded so far back as the year 920 A.D. The fact may be thus explained. From the year 960 A.D., the site of the capital was fixed permanently at Srínagar, and as a natural consequence the great majority of the more modern temples would be erected in that neighbourhood. Thus they were the first to fall victims to the intolerant zeal of the Muhammadan conquerors, by whom Srínagar was maintained as the principal seat of Government. The destruction was mainly

accomplished during the first few years of the 15th century by Sikandar, the fifth in succession of the new line of sovereigns, who himself adopted and is uniformly known to posterity by the distinctive title of *Bhut-shikan*, i.e., the Iconoclast. It was his boast to have demolished every temple in Kashmír; a boast which the still-existing remains clearly convict of falsehood, if by Kashmír is intended the whole country of that name; but possibly true enough if applied only to the city of Srinagar, or Kashmír Khás, as it is frequently designated. The stone embankments, which line the river on either side in its course through the city, are very largely composed of sculptured masses, plinths, cornices, pediments and friezes; the tomb of Sikandar's queen is constructed on a base, and with materials, of Hindú architecture; and in the suburb of Naushahra are some gracefully designed columns, and the walls of one square temple partially standing. But beyond these mere fragments there is not a vestige of any ancient building within the city bounds. The subsequent conversion of the great mass of the people to the faith of Islám was so rapid, and the repression of the miserable remnant who still adhered to their ancestral superstitions so determined, excepting only the one tolerant reign of the good king Zain-ul-abd-dín,\* that thenceforth no Hindú temples were either built or restored, and the ancient art soon fell into absolute desuetude and oblivion. Judging from the many fragments that remain built up into walls and bridges, we may conclude that the style had greatly deteriorated prior to its violent extinction; a profusion of coarse sculpture having superseded the chastened architectural forms of an earlier period.

As may have been gathered from the preceding sketch, the kings of Kashmír, like most oriental potentates, delighted to transfer the seat of Government to some spot of their own selection, and to commemorate the fact by the designation imposed upon the new city. Of these ephemeral capitals little now remains beyond the name; and that in many cases so distorted by corrupt pronunciation, that it is difficult to recognise its identity. It is probable that private dwellings were always, as they still are, mainly constructed of wood, and therefore subject to periodic destruction by fire; the massive temples may have resisted the flames, but only to be demolished some centuries later by the Muham-

\* It was in honour of this king that the third section of the Sanskrit Chronicle of Kashmír, written in the reign of Zaina's grandson Fath Khán, received from its author, Srí Vara Pandita, this name of Srí Jaina Rájá Taranjini. This name has often led

to a misconception of the work, and to its insertion among the religious literature of the Jaini sect. The Muhammadan Sovereign's title is disguised by its Nágari dress almost beyond recognition into Srí Jainoll-abha dín

madan. The two great Indo-Scythian princes and brothers, Huvishka and Kanishka, are among the earliest whose foundations can be traced. The site of Huvishka-pura is perpetuated by the tiny hamlet of Ushkara on the left bank of the Jhelam, immediately opposite Bárahmúla; and the remains of a Buddhist *stupa*, erected at a much later period by King Lalitaditya, may still be seen there. A few miles higher up the stream was the companion city of Kanishka-pura, which is still a considerable village. On the modern maps it appears as Kanisapoor, but in ordinary parlance the name is shortened to Kánipur, and on the spot itself to Kánpoor. General Cunningham in his *Ancient Geography of India* has identified Kanishka-pura with Kánpur (or Khánpur) Saráe at the other end of the valley. But in this he is unquestionably mistaken.\* Without a single exception—unless the present be one—all the ancient capitals were built in the close vicinity of water; whereas Khánpur Saráe stands on a high and comparatively barren plateau at a considerable distance from any spring or stream. As it formed one of the stages on the old imperial road from Bhimbar to Srínagar, a saráe was built there for the reception of the royal *cortège*, and outside its walls a few miserable huts may still be seen to cluster; but there is no local tradition nor anything in the neighbourhood to indicate greater importance in times past. Until its identification with the capital of Kanishka, the name was invariably, and it would seem correctly, written Khánpur; probably it dates only from the erection of the saráe, which first rendered it necessary to attach a distinctive appellation to so remote and unattractive a locality.

The only important town on the bank of the Jhelam between Bárahmúla and Srínagar is Súpur, the ancient Surapura, built in the reign of Avanti Varmma by his minister Sura, on the site of the still more ancient Kámbuva. To avoid the necessity of crossing the dangerous Walúr Lake, through which flows the main stream of the Jhelam, a navigable canal was constructed in very early times to connect Súpur with Srínagar. In the neighbourhood of this canal two ancient cities were founded. The first, Pariháspura, was built in the reign of Lalitaditya, but would seem to have been merely an occasional royal residence, and in the next generation was altogether deserted. The second city, Jayapura, founded by Lalitaditya's grandson Jayapida, is identified by the name of its citadel, which survives, though all traces of the

\* The present writer is so largely indebted to General Cunningham's previous researches in the field of Kashmir archæology, that he trusts the occasional expression of a difference of opinion will be rightly inter-

preted as simply the necessary result of independent research, and not as implying any captious wish to impugn the general accuracy of the observations, or soundness of the conclusions, formed by that eminent scholar.

city have disappeared. It is recorded in the Rájá Tarangini that immediately after the transfer of the capital, the god Krishna appeared in a dream to the king and admonished him to raise in the lake, near the town, a fort, which should bear the name of Sridwáravati, in remembrance of the place where Krishna himself had once reigned on earth. The fort was built and the name given; but in this case the *vox populi* was stronger than the *vox dei*. The chronicler notes that in his time every one called it the Inner Fort, '*abhyantara kotta*;' and strangely enough, to this very day after the lapse of 1,100 years, the village which marks the site bears the name of Antar-kot. The town had not been in existence a single century when it was destroyed by Sankara Varmma (883-901 A.D.), who employed the materials in the construction of his new capital Sankarapura, better known as Pathan, or the Pass. This latter name it acquired either from being the centre of the thoroughfare which connects the two ends of the valley, or as standing at the head of a small canal which led straight into the upper stream of the Jhelam.\* It is now only during a very few weeks in the year, when the rivers are flooded by the sudden melting of the snows, that this passage is navigable; and no doubt the uncertainty of communication was the cause that contributed most to the rapid abandonment of Sankara Varmma's foundation.

The present city of Srinagar, as already mentioned, was built by king Pravara-Sena II. in the beginning of the 6th century; but at the time of the visit of the famous Chinese pilgrim Hwen Thsang in 631, and indeed nearly three centuries later, the ancient capital of the same name was also standing on the spot now known as Pándrathan, and may have extended as far as Pánthasok, two miles higher up the stream, where are the remains of a stone-bridge.

Between Srinagar and Avantipur, where the royal founder is commemorated by the ruins of his two magnificent temples, stood the town of Padmapura, now corrupted to Pámpur, built during the reign of Vrihaspati (804 to 816 A.D.), by the king's uncle Padma. At the same time a shrine was dedicated to Mahádeva under the title of Padmaswámi, of which there remain two fluted pillars from the colonnade and the basement of the central edifice.

A few miles above Pámpur on the opposite bank of the river, is the small village of Kákapur; a name which possibly may be a corruption of Khagendrapura. If so, this would be the oldest

\* As a parallel instance, the same name of Páthan is ordinarily used in the neighbourhood to denote the village of Kohála on the Murree route, where a bridge across the Jhelam connects Kashmir with the Panjáb.

historical site in Kashmír, as king Khagendra flourished in the 5th century before Christ. There are some ruins on the spot, but so deeply buried in the ground that without an excavation it is impossible to ascertain their character or antiquity.

Before reaching the modern town of Islámábád, where the river ceases to be navigable, one other village is passed which claims a word of notice, *viz.*, Latápur, the representative of the ancient Lalitá-pura, founded by king Lalitaditya (693 to 729 A.D.). There is nothing actually on the spot beyond its name to indicate its history, but at the neighbouring village of Lidar are two temples, one surrounded by water, which probably date from the 7th or 8th century.\*

For more than 250 years, that is to say, from 1326 to 1587, Kashmír was an independent Muhammadan State; but the architectural history of this lengthened period is almost an absolute blank. It appears to have been in a special manner an age of wooden construction. The change of religion necessitated the hasty erection of buildings for public worship on a much larger scale than had been required by Hindú ritual; wood was abundant and easily worked; hence its substitution for stone; and the fashion, having once set in, continued to spread after the occasion for it had ceased. To this period may be ascribed the original foundation of the two largest ecclesiastical edifices in Kashmír, *viz.*, the Jama Masjid and the Idgah; though undoubtedly both were extensively repaired, if not actually rebuilt, in later times. The Jama Masjid is a cloistered quadrangle about 360 feet square, with a low tower and spire in the centre of each face. Only the exterior wall is of masonry; the cloisters are divided into several aisles by slender circular pillars, each of which, even under the higher central compartments, is a single deodár tree. The effect of this winter forest of tall bare pines is unquestionably striking; but whatever beauty it possesses is due not to art, but to the natural grandeur of the forest, which has been simply trimmed and transplanted from the mountain side to its present position. The Idgah is a building of precisely similar character, being a vast oblong hall, divided into five aisles by tall rows of deodárs supported on small stone bases.

It was in the reign of Shaháb-ud-dín (1360 to 1386 A.D.) that the famous Saiyid Alf Hamadani fled into Kashmír and founded an ascetic order of monks, who so rapidly increased in numbers.

---

\* This village site would appear to be of the most remote antiquity; since it is recorded in the Rájá Tarangini I. 87 that king Lava the 36th in descent from Gonarda II, the contemporary of Krishna, found-

ed at Lidari a large *agrahára* or Bráhmanical establishment, and in its neighbourhood a town called Lolora, in which were a kror minus 16 lakhs (that is, 84,00,000) stone houses.

that after the lapse of a century their solitary cells were to be found scattered over every part of the country. From the time of the annexation by the Mughal Emperors they began to diminish, and gradually became extinct; but Abul Fazl estimated them as amounting in his day to 2,000. On the spots, where the most famous of these holy men had taught and died, shrines were erected to preserve both their memory and their mortal remains; and to this day there is scarcely a village in Kashmir which has not one of these *ziyarat*s, as they are called. Ordinarily each *ziyarat* is the tomb of the saint whose name it bears; but in some cases of special sanctity several buildings in different localities commemorate the same personage, and so correspond precisely with Christian chapels. In ground plan they are identical with the *chhatras*, or Hindú monumental pavilions, of Upper India; the only difference is in the material, the *chhatras* being of masonry, while the *ziyarat*s are invariably of wood. The cella is a *barah-duri*, or square building with three arches on each side, twelve in all, enclosed in an open cloister. The arches of the cella, excepting the one reserved for a doorway, are filled in with reticulated tracery; while the cloister shows a profusion of rich and often elegant carving in its rounded pillars, the spandrels of its Saracenic arches, and the quaint brackets that support the wide-spreading eaves. Strangely enough, considering ordinary Muhammadan prejudices on the subject, it is not uncommon to find rude figures of birds and other animals intermingled with conventional foliage and arabesques. The carving is generally flat and shallow; but in some of the earlier examples, and notably in an old ruined *ziyarat* near the village of Chakoti on the Murree route, the cusps of the arches and other parts of the design are as deeply moulded as in the best period of English Gothic. From the centre of the sloping roof, in place of Hindú *kulus* or finial, rises a slender gabled spire surmounted by a gilded vane. This gleaming among the trees on the mountain-side often imparts a special grace and touch as it were of civilisation to an otherwise savage landscape. The most famous *ziyarat*s are those of Hamadani at Srinagar, of Báábá Pám Rishi below Gulmarg, of Núr-ud-dín\* at the village of Chrar, and of Shukrud-din on a hill overlooking the Walúr Lake. All must have been originally erected soon after the death of the personages they commemorate, that is to say, in or about the 15th century. Owing to the comparatively perishable nature of the material employed, it is

\* Núr-ud-dín was the author of a history of Kashmir written in the language of the country and called the *Mír-náma*. It is not now in existence, but the narrative appears to

have been of very fabulous character, judging from the extraordinary extracts made from it by Badia-ud-dín in his *Gohari Alam Tohfát us Sháhi*, the last of the Muhammadan chronicles.



probable that in no case is there much, if any, of the original fabric remaining; but there can be no doubt that all repairs were conducted with close adherence to the first design. Many of the houses erected in Srinagar at the present day have the window frames and arches of the verandahs filled in with graceful reticulated tracery; but over this it is the universal custom to paste broad sheets of old English newspapers. A subdued light is thus obtained for the interior, but the effect outside is hideously ragged.

The picturesque wooden bridges, which span the Jhelam, are traditionally ascribed to this same period of independent Muhammadan rule. One of them is still called the Zaina-kadal in memory of king Zainulabddin, in whose reign it was first constructed. The piers are formed by layers of closely placed deodár trunks, resting on a foundation of uncemented stones enclosed in a triangular wooden frame. The layers are put alternately length and cross ways, and each projects slightly beyond the one immediately beneath it. Thus the interval between the piers narrows as they ascend, till other deodár trunks can be laid across from one to the other, forming the roadway.

With the absorption of Kashmír into the Mughal Empire, the age of masonry returned, but now in the form of brick rather than of stone. The new buildings were intended exclusively for the use of the sovereign, who made the country an occasional summer residence, and are all characterized by a vastness of dimensions and a roughness of finish, which place them in singular contrast with the minutely elaborated creations of Hindú art. They fall under the three heads of saráes, garden palaces and mosques. The saráes occur at intervals along the old imperial road which leads through the Himálayas from Hindústán to Kashmír across the heights of the Pir Panchál. They are strong fort-like buildings, with high gateways and battlemented walls enclosing one or more open courts with a series of vaulted chambers and one row of apartments of greater pretensions facing the principal entrance. The surrounding scenery, which is often exceedingly wild and solitary, invests them with an air of grandeur; but they are utilitarian rather than artistic edifices.

The sites of the summer-palaces on the margin of the City Lake and at Varnág and Achhi-bal, are some of the most lovely spots in all Kashmír, and attest an exquisite appreciation of the picturesque combined with admirable skill in landscape gardening on the part of those by whom the selection was made. In the pavilion at the Sháhlímár garden are some magnificent columns of polished marble; but judging from the comparative meanness of the building to which they are attached, it may be inferred that they were the spoils of some Hindú temple. It is indeed

distinctly so stated by the traveller Bernier writing in the reign of Aurangzeb. Either they were brought from the neighbouring city of Srinagar, or, it may be, were floated down the Jhelam from Avantipur, where not a single pillar now remains *in situ* of the magnificent colonnade erected by king Avantivarmma in connection with his great temple. Many of these beautiful pillars have been greatly disfigured within the last few years by the inscriptions of certain gentlemen of Her Majesty's Services, who have chosen this easy but barbarous mode of immortalising their names. They could scarcely deny their own handwork, and it would surely be merely an act of justice to account them responsible for the wilful damage they have committed.

Three mosques of hewn and polished stone were erected at Srinagar in the time of the Emperors. Of these one, that at Hasanábád, has been completely demolished, and the materials employed in the construction of the Basant Ghât; the second is standing in ruins within the outer precincts of the fort on the Hari Parbat, but is now regarded chiefly as a stone quarry; the third only, called the Patthar Masjid, is still remaining entire, and is the most massive and substantial building in the city. It was founded in the reign of Jahángir by his famous queen Núrjahán, and consists of three aisles, about 180 feet long, divided by piers of the simplest possible design. Beyond a little shallow panelling on the walls, and the foliations of the Saracenic arches, there is a total absence of decoration. In consequence of a prejudice against the sex of the founder, it has always been appropriated to secular purposes, and is now used as a barn.

The restoration of a Hindú dynasty to the throne of Kashmir has not been attended by a parallel revival of Kashmir architecture. Temples, it is true, are once more built and dedicated as of old to the worship of Mahádeva; but they bear no resemblance to the graceful fanes which won for the earlier inhabitants of the country the Sanskrit title of *sástra-silpina*, or the pre-eminent architects. The only recognized form is a small square cella of the plainest masonry, surmounted by a pyramidal tower, or *sikhara*, which in the city-examples is covered with plates of tin and crowned with vanes of gilded copper. The temple attached to the Maharájá's palace is of the same coarse and tasteless design; while the golden plates, with which the tower is overlaid, only render its ugly outlines the more conspicuous, and publish in blazing characters the sorry confession of material wealth and intellectual impotency. It may be considered a matter of congratulation and a hopeful augury that these clumsy edifices are in no sense of indigenous origin, but mere copies of debased Hindústání models constructed by foreign workmen imported for the purpose from the Panjáb. If in other branches of the fine

arts Kashmír can compete with any country of the East, it is clear that the æsthetic faculty still survives, and it can only be from want of encouragement that architecture, in which its first triumphs were achieved, has now lapsed into a state of such utter degradation. The present century has witnessed in England a complete return to the long-forgotten principles of Gothic design ; a similar revival in Kashmír is not beyond hope. The ruins of the past still remain in adequate preservation to serve as a guide to the architect of the future ; and were the occupant of the throne to inaugurate the movement, a national style might yet be developed from their study, which would mark his reign as an era in the modern history of Kashmír.

F. S. GROWSE.

---

### ART. III.—THE REVISION OF THE N.W.P. SETTLEMENTS.

THE question of the adequacy, or rather inadequacy, of the N.W.P. Settlements, now in course of revision, and of the altered percentage at which these revisions are being made, was first mooted in the debates in Council on the Local Rates Bills of Oudh and the N.W.P. We propose to review the whole question as it stands at present, and as it has been commented upon by the Press, and attacked and defended by the partisans of both sides. The speeches impugning the adequacy of the revised settlements as well as the necessity or advisability of the reduced rate of assessment (50 in lieu of 66 per cent.) were made by the Hon'ble George Campbell, Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, and the Hon'ble John Strachey, and commanded especial attention. And the more particularly so, coming as they did from such high authorities and able men; men, moreover, who were known to have spent all the early years of their service in the Upper Provinces of Bengal, and who were therefore naturally supposed to be behind the scenes and thoroughly conversant with the ins and outs of the subject. What wonder then that the general public was inclined to accept the statements of these gentlemen as infallible and conclusive on this question?

The Lieutenant-Governor of the North-Western Provinces, however, took the earliest opportunity of denying and replying to these statements, and Sir William Muir's speech at the meeting of Council held at Allahabad on the 6th of April last, was earnest, lucid, and concise. Sir William said most truly in broaching this subject that "considerable misconception prevails as to the adequacy of the assessment in the settlements now being revised. "It is not a subject that can be discussed desultorily in a debate "like the present, but" . . . .

We do not however purpose following the Lieutenant-Governor through his speech, but prefer to take as our basis the note prepared by Mr. Colvin, the Secretary to the Board of Revenue, at Sir William's request. Mr. Colvin's note bears on the face of it, as stated by Sir William Muir in his speech, the stamp of having "been hastily drawn up for the occasion;" and, as the *Observer* remarks in an article entitled "The Rack-renting Party," it "is wanting in methodical arrangement and conciseness." There are several passages and sentences, which would doubtless on maturer consideration, have been altered; and probably the expression, "the entire cost of living," would have been so put as to save the *Economist* from a "*disingenuous*" explosion. Nevertheless the facts and statistics and inferences contained in the paper are none the

## 36 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

less forcible or reliable, and it is with the facts and figures and deductions therefrom with which we have to deal; and "the argument of it (the memorandum) to any one really desirous of seeing it, is plain enough." Mr. Colvin has quoted at length the remarks made by Mr. Campbell and Mr. Strachey, but it is not necessary to reproduce them here. It is sufficient to give the substance of them. Mr. Campbell threw doubts on the adequacy of the new assessments, merely by stating that the revenue of the settlement of 1841 was four crores of rupees, or four millions sterling, and that the result of the present revision would be a revenue of only four-and-a-half at the outside; that, therefore, with regard to the great improvements and advancements of the country, the money spent in canals, railways, &c., the increase is very small. Mr. Strachey attacked immediately the reduction of rate of assessment from sixty-six to fifty per cent. of the assets, saying "why this change was made I cannot say. So far as I have ever been able to discover, it was made in 1854 by the Lieutenant-Governor of the N.W.P. on his own authority and without any serious discussion." He proceeded to quote the instance of the Bolundshuhur district (saying that the case was a strong one and perhaps an extreme one), to prove that "in reality we do not get fifty per cent., because the annual value of landed property goes on constantly and rapidly increasing." And both Mr. Campbell and Mr. Strachey infer most pointedly that the present revision of assessment is made almost, if not entirely, on existing rentals, concealed and kept low by the landlords until revision, but raised immediately after the new assessments are declared and the revision is effected. Therefore the utmost that is taken is 50 per cent. of a low and insufficient rental which can be immediately enhanced by the landlord when it suits his convenience, against 66 per cent. of assumed rental taken at settlement, the assumed amount having been rather in excess of the actual or attainable rental. Mr. Campbell thought "that the want of exactitude told rather against the landholders, and not in their favour." He also believed, that "the settlement that had now been made had proceeded on more exact data with respect to existing rents, which was telling against the State and in favour of landlords."

"These remarks, carrying the stamp of high authority and the weight of the official utterances of the members of the Government of India must," as Mr. Colvin says, "necessarily arrest attention." He then proceeds to show "that the remarks, both of Mr. Campbell and Mr. Strachey, are founded on a misapprehension of facts," and that "Mr. Campbell's remarks derive most of their strength from an unintentional misstatement of facts." He shows most clearly that "the majority of the Benares division of this province, with the Jounpore district, is permanently settled," and that Mr. Campbell's comparison

"should have been made between the revenue of the temporarily "settled districts only." Of these the old revenue is £3,400,000 whilst the estimated new revenue is £3,900,000, being an increase of £500,000 or nearly 15 per cent.; instead of barely half a million on four millions. He also exposes Mr. Campbell's implied inference, that the period of settlement in 1841 was unfavourable to Government owing to recent famine; but that at the present revisions there were no such unfavourable circumstances. The very districts, however, excepting Goruckpore, in which revision of settlement has been completed, "were situated in the very heart of the mutiny and famine tract. "So that of the causes enumerated by Mr. Campbell as existing "in 1837, famine existed in 1860, civil war was added to it; "railroads in neither case existed."

In commenting on Mr. Strachey's illustration, Bolundshuhur, he let slip a grand opportunity, as did also Sir William Muir, in not pointing out Mr. Strachey's error in arithmetic, in making out that the revenue, which only five years ago was equal to fifty per cent. of the rental, "is now equal to only about *thirty-five per cent.* "In other words the annual rental of the private proprietors has "increased fifteen per cent. in five years." This error was mentioned at the time in one or more of the Calcutta papers, and exposed in the *Pioneer* in a letter headed "Arithmetic in high places." That it is not a mere clerical error, or slip of the tongue, is evident from the same error having been repeated in the Government of India's despatch on the Bolundshuhur settlement. It is scarcely necessary, we think, to add that if the rental has increased fifteen per cent., the revenue which was fifty per cent. cannot have fallen to only thirty-five per cent. of the new rental, but will be just forty-three and-a-half ( $43\frac{1}{2}$ ) per cent. From the figures given in the Bolundshuhur settlement despatch, Mr. Strachey was correct in saying that the rental had increased fifteen per cent,\* and consequently

---

\* The figures given in the Despatch show that the estimated present rental is 14·6 per cent in excess of the rental on which the assessment was made. "The fact remains "that at the time of settlement the "rent-rolls were ascertained and believed to be 24·6 lakhs, and five years later they are estimated to "be 28·2 lakhs."

Now  $28\cdot2 - 24\cdot6 = 3\cdot6$  lakhs the amount of increase, and  $3\cdot6$  lakhs is 14·6 per cent. increase on 24·6 lakhs. Again, the revenue is 1·23 lakh,

and the estimated present rental is 28·2 lakhs, of which rental the revenue is said by Mr. Strachey to be only 35 per cent., but it is 43·6 per cent.

The Despatch quotes Sir William Muir "that if a settlement were now to be made in reference to 'present rentals, and the evidence 'now available as to assets, there 'would, in all probability, be an increase of about a lakh and three 'quarters of rupees more or less, i.e., 'about 1·4 per cent. on the revised

### 38 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

wrong in the startling announcement that the revenue which had undoubtedly been fifty per cent. of the *then* rental at the time of revision was *now*, only five years afterwards, only thirty-five per cent. of the *present* rental. Mr. Strachey has also committed another error which, to bring it correct, requires toning down by twelve years. He says—"If a new settlement were *now* to be made we should get, under the present system, £141,000 instead of £123,000 a year; and if the rates of the old settlement were in force, we should get £188,000. Under the latter supposition we are losing £65,000 a year, and the total result of the new settlement for thirty years will be that, by the time it expires, we shall have given away to private parties, in this single district, *no less than* £1,950,000, which under former rulers would have been received by the State." He acknowledges the assessment was correct *when it was made*, and the antithesis is *now*; and then he proceeds to multiply £65,000 by 30 forgetting that *now* 18, and not 30, years remain of the thirty years' term of settlement which ends on 30th June 1889. It only makes a difference of rather more, than one-third, that is all. *Indian Public Opinion*, however, quite eclipsed Mr. Strachey's error, when, (taking for granted that the thirty-five per cent. mentioned by him was right) it proceeded to correct Mr. Strachey's figures and to show that "we are losing £111,000 a year, and the total result of the new settlement for thirty years will be that by the time it expires, we shall have given away to private parties, in this single district, *no less than* £3,330,000, which under former rulers would have been received by the State, &c. &c. So much for mere attention to figures which we wonder should have been paraded before our Chancellor of the Exchequer with entire impunity."... "In other words the annual rental of the private proprietors has increased *eighty-five* per cent. in five years, or from £123,000 to £228,000." Not only is the thirty-year mistake repeated, but the writer also confuses *rental* with *proprietors' profits*, or possibly *rental* with *revenue*, as only with either supposition is the increased percentage about 85, instead of what the increase of rental should be, nearly 43 per cent. (supposing still the 35 per cent. to be correct, which it is not).

To return to the point, however. What becomes of Mr. Strachey's argument and illustration when, in this "*strong*" and "*extreme*" case of a district assessed immediately after the mutiny and utter disorganization, succeeded by sickness and famine,—the revision itself being followed by large extensions

---

jumma." And this is quite right, what Mr. Strachey said, which we but it is a very different thing from have shown to be wrong.

of canal works and of the extension of the railway through the district to Delhi, as well as by an unprecedented continuous run of high prices, the assessment, moreover having been declared permanent and the people believing them to be so—it turns out that, after five years' time, the proportion of the Government revenue had fallen from fifty to rather less than forty-four (44) per cent. of the rental.\* What cause for wonder is there that this should be the case? Is it not on the contrary rather surprising that under all these exceptional circumstances the proportion of the revenue to the present rental is not lower than it is—is not in fact nearer 35 per cent. than 44 per cent.? We have very little hesitation in asserting that, if Mr. Strachey had made out the account correctly, he would never have laid such stress on the palpable inadequacy of the assessments, *and our not getting even fifty per cent.*; and would not have used the Bolundshuhur district as an illustration. It is quite possible too that, but for this unfortunate mistake in figures, which has proved a perfect *pons asinorum* to the Government of India and the *Indian Public Opinion*, Mr. Strachey might have held less extreme views on the enormous sacrifice of income by our existing system of settlements. Mr. Colvin then, having cleared the ground by correcting the misstatements, proceeds to examine the *bond fide* objections. And as regards the first “that whereas under the settlements of 1841 “we took 66 per cent. of the rental, we now take 50 per cent. “only,” he shows that the question is not accurately stated. “The point at issue is whether the margin of rental left to the landlord is sufficient to enable him to subsist in independence.” And he shows that inclusive of cesses, the demand on the landlord is sixty (60) per cent. “When therefore Mr. Campbell says that “we now give the landlords *one-half of the rents* as their share, “and when Mr. Strachey adds that we take 50 instead of 66 per “cent., they fail to represent the fact correctly. It is not a half- “but two-fifths only, of the rental that is left to the landlord.”

\* For the sake of argument we have accepted the estimated rental put down at 28·2 lakhs as correct; but it must be borne in mind that it is only an *estimate* and not the actual present existing rental of the district. We could easily demonstrate that it is a very high estimate made by an officer specially deputed to ascertain and show that the assessment of the district was inadequate; and also that his estimate was made entirely on the rental of one year, an

excessively and exceptionally good year, and to a great extent on rents in kind. Not only was it an extremely plentiful harvest in that year 1275 Fussily, but also prices were excessively high, the harvest prices averaging from 25 to 27 seers for the rupee for wheat against an average of 37 seers for the rupee, the prevailing average according to the printed Bolundshuhur Report, and an actual of over 30 seers this last harvest.



We will pass on now to the second objection and return hereafter to "whether 40 per cent. of the net rental is too large a share to leave to the landlord." The second objection then is, as stated by Mr. Colvin, "that the assessment is based on the old rates "fixed at the former settlement;" but as exception may be taken to this, we prefer to say *on the existing rates and rentals at the end of the expiring settlement.* Mr. Colvin, by numerous quotations from published rent-rate reports of various settlement officers, shows clearly the utter fallacy of this statement. It is shown beyond a doubt that average rates are carefully deduced from accurate and reliable rates and rentals, and that the assumed average rates used in assessment are in excess of the real and actual deduced averages, so as to meet all immediate enhancements which are inseparable from revision of settlement. We cannot refrain from quoting Sir William Muir's own words:—"No doubt rentals have a tendency to increase after settlement; but this tendency is not overlooked by settlement officers. Their instructions are, while not discounting mere probabilities or theoretical prospects of enhanced rentals, yet to assess on the widest induction of facts and the broadest estimates of value." The very next sentence might be studied with advantage by those who clamour for a large and sudden increase in revenue, because prices and the value of land are rising, and are now considerably in advance of what they were eight and ten years ago. "It must also be remembered that the rise of "rent is not in immediate proportion to rise of prices; it is "shackled by custom, as well as impeded by law, of which the "policy is to maintain a class of beneficial occupants of the soil. "Settlement officers must take things as they find them; they "must deal with facts and not with theories."

Thus far we believe no attempt even has been made by any of the writers in the Press of India to show that Mr. Colvin's facts and figures are wrong, or to upset his corrections of the inaccuracies and unintentional misrepresentations of Messrs. Campbell and Strachey. All the attacks have been made on that portion of Mr. Colvin's note which we have as yet omitted to comment upon—those at least which have confined themselves to the question at issue, and have not flown off at a tangent and abused the whole system as wrong and faulty from the very roots. We believe, therefore, that we may say with safety that the reply of the N.W.P. Government to Messrs. Campbell's and Strachey's strictures, that the increase in revenue is insignificant, that assessments are made simply on old rates, or on existing rates and rentals which are inadequate, and that we take only fifty per cent. of the rental, and in reality not even that, is unanswerable and has been accepted as full and conclusive. We at least have seen no argument against,

or attempted refutation of, the reply of the N.W.P. Government up to this point, although the following which appeared in the *Daily Examiner* is doubtless an attack upon it:—

“To show that two and two do not make five, is not demonstrating that a quantity or magnitude which ought to be six ought to continue to be only four. And yet that is the style of contention of the late Memorandum of the Board of Revenue, N.W.P., in endeavouring to establish that the Hon’ble Mr. Strachey erred when, in Council at Allahabad, he in substance said that the Government demand and receive from the landowners of those provinces nearly one-third less rent or revenue than they ought. But were the North-West Board, and every official of those provinces, to keep writing for the next half-a-dozen years, they would fail to clear the local Government and the majority of the settlement officers of the imputation now well-established against them, that notwithstanding that a marked rise in the prices of produce set in in 1855,\* and has continued since, they failed to appreciate the significance of that rise with relation to the land revenue, until within the last three or four years, and then only through having had that significance forced upon their official consciousness by several Indian journals.”

There is, however, no argument in this, nor any attempted refutation beyond the simple declaration of what the writer assumes to be a foregone conclusion. But is it a foregone conclusion? In order to try the accuracy of the above-quoted assertion, as well as for our own satisfaction, and also to prove by another test the adequacy of the N.W.P. earlier revisions of assessment, we have had prepared a comparative statement of cultivated area, assumed rent-rates, and percentages of soil on cultivated area, for the contiguous pergunnahs in the Bolundshuhur and Allygurh districts. The full figured statements will be found in an appendix, and to them we invite careful attention. For the purpose of comparison, the denominations of soil of the Allygurh district had to be reduced, so as to agree with the fewer divisions of soil used in the Bolundshuhur district. The returns are taken from the rent-rate reports of the Allygurh district published in the Revenue Reporter, N.W.P., and from the printed report of the Bolundshuhur settlement. The reports from which we have derived our information show that the pergunnahs of Allygurh in 1870, though in many ways similar to those of Bolundshuhur in 1860 and 1861, are somewhat superior to them, and more especially in the extent of irrigation. Nevertheless, the rates assumed as average-rates and basis of assessment in the adjacent pergunnahs of the Bolundshuhur district, nine and ten

---

\* The marked rise did not set in fully until 1859-60. until at least 3 years later, and not

## 42 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

years ago, were very similar to those *now* proposed for the pergunnahs, continuations of the same tracts of country, in the Allypore district. The resulting incidence per cultivated acre of the revised assessment is, of course, higher in Allypore than in Bolundshuhur, because the percentages of soils paying the higher rates are larger. But this in no way affects the question in point, which is whether or not the settlement officers of Bolundshuhur (Messrs. Freeling and Lowe, as the report informs us, for Mr. R. Currie was in these cases only the assistant at first and revising officer afterwards to introduce the permanent settlement) merely took rates as they found them, or ascertaining actual rates made a proportionate increase upon them partly for error or unnecessary depression and partly for anticipated rise in rates consequent on rise in prices. We would gladly have made similar comparisons on the other side of Bolundshuhur with the Meerut district, if any statistics from Meerut had been procurable, or of any other districts besides Bolundshuhur; but no reports have been published. We have been obliged to content ourselves with what we could get, and we think that the comparison tells favourably for Bolundshuhur, and against the foregone conclusion of the *Daily Examiner*. Any one looking at Mr. Smith's Rent-rate Reports of Tehsils Atrowlee and Koel, can see that he has ascertained most carefully what the actual existing genuine rent-rates are and has pitched his assumed average rates above them. The only inference therefore is, that the settlement officers of Bolundshuhur did the same, and this is well borne out by the fact that now, nine, ten, and eleven years after the revised assessments were made (for we see pergunnah Agotah was assessed as far back as 1859 A.D. by Mr. Charles Currie) the proportion of the revenue to the present rental is nearly forty-four (44) per cent., and it never professed to be more than fifty per cent. We cannot help thinking that in so exceptional a case as this is shown to have been, the assessment must have been a very full fifty per cent., in fact fifty per cent. anticipating increase.

And now we come to the "Debateable Land," to the question "whether 40 per cent. of the net rental is too large a share to leave to the landlord." The only argument brought against this is that we left the landlord less than 40 per cent. before, and he rather seemed to like it, in fact preferred it, and grew fat upon it, and the country prospered, and the value of property rose; and all because we were taking 66, and sometimes even 70 per cent. of the net rental, and for no other reason on earth.

Doubtless when boiled down to this, it does sound very absurd; but listen to what Mr. Strachey says—"If it was not," (i.e., the taking 66 per cent.) "in accordance with ancient custom and with the feelings of the people, I believe that the main divergence was really this, that never had any Government at any previous

"time taken so little. The proof that the demand was not excessive seems to me to be absolutely complete. The best proof that can be given consists in the fact of the vast progress in wealth and prosperity which the North-Western Provinces have made during the last thirty years, and in the growth of private property in the land of immense value." But what is the fair, and indeed only, deduction from this, but what we have already stated above? And what is in reality the cause of "this vast progress in wealth and prosperity" and "in the growth of private property in the land of immense value?" Why, undoubtedly, a firm Government keeping the general peace and preventing murder and rapine, increase of population and a long thirty years' lease giving the certainty of large ultimate profit to those who would only avail themselves of the very large margin which remained for improvements. *Not a thirty years' assessment at 66 per cent.*; for as Mr. Colvin says most truly, and proves most clearly, no such thing has ever been known. "Before many years had expired from the conclusion of the former settlement, the extension of the cultivation and of irrigation had reduced the Government share of the assets to 50 per cent. In course of time it fell in many districts as low as 40 per cent., as will be clearly seen when it is remembered that, in order to raise the Government demand to 50 per cent. of the rental, an addition of 25 per cent. has, in many cases, had to be made to the existing demand." . . . "Read by the light of the information thus given us, the lesson to be learnt from the last settlement would seem to be this. At its commencement while it fell at 66 per cent., it was unendurable. Reduction followed on its heels, and a dangerous and startling transfer of landed property. By-and-bye cultivation extended, and the rates of the Government demand fell. The settlement succeeded not because it was moderate at the outset, but because circumstances eventually brought it to moderation." . . . . "The vast progress was *post hoc* and not *propter hoc*. It owed its existence to the margin of cultivable land, not to the tender mercies of a 66 per cent. settlement." We give an extract from the article of the *Indian Observer* of July 22nd entitled "The Rack-renting Party" to show how that writer puts it. "If the settlements just expiring were made at the ratio of sixty-six per cent. of the rental, and if they still retained that ratio, as these people seem to think, then where is that increase of revenue, so much desired by them, to come from? If, on the other hand, the revenue does not bear that ratio, and has not for years borne it, what becomes of that 'absolutely complete proof that the demand at sixty-six per cent. was not excessive,' so vaunted by Mr. Strachey? To what is the prosperity of the North-West to be attributed? To the fact we

#### 44 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

"suppose that too much was not taken under the old settlement. But sixty-six per cent. was taken. Therefore sixty-six per cent. is not too much. But unfortunately if sixty-six per cent. has all along been taken, and it is necessary for their argument that they should suppose so, then where is the great increase of revenue that we ought to have, where is that mass of wealth belonging to the State, but abandoned by infatuated officials, to landlords of our own creation?"

The same subject is ably treated in an article in the *Pioneer* of July 5th, entitled "The Land Question," but we refrain from giving quotations for fear of becoming wearisome.

The argument used by Mr. Colvin against the 66 per cent. assessment is that it broke down, where it really was 66 per cent., and could not be speedily reduced by extended cultivation; that in reality the assessment was only pitched at 66 per cent. because it was well-known that the 66 per cent. would quickly fall to 60 and lower, and a long lease of 30 years was being given, whereas up to that time the settlements had been for much shorter periods. "The conditions under which it was resolved to take 66 per cent. of the rental had disappeared, when in 1854 the N.W. Government resolved to reduce the proportion of the Government demand." . . . . . The conditions, therefore, under which it was possible for the landlord in 1840 to accept a demand at 66 per cent. had disappeared, and, so far as could then be seen, no compensating conditions had taken their place."

The writer of the "Rack-renting Party" says, "we are not justified in keeping to the former standard unless we can show that there is a margin left for improvement as great as there was then; unless, in fact, we can prove that the average incidence of the revenue over the coming 30 years will be as light as it was during the last 30 years, in proportion to the profits of the land."

We agree with Sir William Muir in his "conviction that, under the existing condition of property, and with the present advanced state of agriculture, the assessments now being made are, as a rule, not lower or not materially lower, than is required for the well-being of the people. In short the standard introduced by Mr. J. R. Colvin in 1854 well became the broad statesmanship and far-seeing views of that great man." But unfortunately Sir William's conviction goes for nothing, at least so says the *Economist*—"To begin with, Sir William Muir does not come into court with clean hands. He is almost as much answerable for the settlements made in the Central Provinces, as Sir Richard Temple himself, since it was to his review the proceedings were submitted by the Supreme Government. This question of unduly lowering the assessment is, therefore, we may reasonably believe, a sore subject with him."

Mr. Colvin, in order to show that *all* landlords are not rolling in wealth and able to pay with ease an assessment above fifty per cent., entered into an explanation of the proprietary tenures, and proceeded to show how large is the number of petty proprietors who can scarcely manage to subsist in any comfort as proprietors on the margin of profits now left to them. He said "unless we are to take "from the wealthy according to their wealth, and from the needy "according to their need, it is evident that we must fix our standard "by the measure of the wants of the less wealthy section of land-holders. The chain is no stronger than its weakest link." This has been a good deal criticised, especially by the *Englishman* and the *Economist*; the *Englishman's* criticism being that "the net "income of the individual landholder is not a proper criterion of the "amount justly claimable by the Government as land-revenue." In a second article the *Englishman* enters into detail in explanation of the above, and the logical conclusion arrived at is that the Board of Revenue should, if it means to be consistent, "go a little further, and, instead of basing the assessment "on the *average* net income of each proprietor in these per-gunnabs, select the smallest proprietor they can find, and reduce "the assessment, so as to leave him an income of Rs. 6 per mensem." We think that the *Englishman* quite overlooked the fact that this illustration of the small proprietary incomes of many petty landholders was, as the *Pioneer* said "immaterial to the vital issue," and was only one of several arguments used, and not the only one. Mr. Colvin says "the less wealthy *section* of landholders," not the poorest individual shareholder whom you can find. His argument clearly is, our landlords in the N.W.P. are not like they are in lower Bengal, wealthy men with ample means; but a large section of them consists of peasant proprietors whose means and condition must be recognized and taken into consideration, and it is not the policy of Government to oust this class in favour of bankers and money-lenders. It was not Mr. Colvin who said that the net income of the individual landholder is a proper criterion of the amount justly claimable by Government as land revenue, nor do we see that he ever implied it. It was the *Englishman* who stated it was "*not a proper criterion*," and then proceeded to demonstrate the correctness of the proposition by the "*ad absurdum*" line of argument.

The *Economist* in the June number in an article entitled "Who is right, Mr. Strachey or Sir William Muir?"—makes a furious attack on this particular part of Mr. Colvin's memorandum, selecting it "as a crucial illustration of its value." This attack has been the subject of several letters and articles, and in quoting parts of them we shall sufficiently show the line of attack taken up by the *Economist*. But we cannot refrain from first express-

ing our regret that a paper so ably conducted as the *Economist* is, and professing to be a statistical and logical compilation, should have sought refuge in such special pleading and contortions of facts and statistics as are exhibited in the use of such phrases and assumptions as the following:—"The farming profits of 6 "acres of irrigated land of fine quality in these provinces would "far exceed the (farming) profits of 60 acres of ordinary land in "our own country." The constant harping upon the expressions—"the entire cost of living"—"sugar-cane alternated with rice"—"Mr. Halsey of Amritsur points out that the farming profits "upon certain crops in the neighbourhood of large towns in the "North-West is nearly £27 per acre after paying the Government "assessment and all expenses of cultivation"—the fallacy of all of these has been shown, chiefly in the *Pioneer* and *Observer*, and the impression left upon the mind when coming across any assertion or fact in the *Economist*, which seems at all doubtful, now is, that it must be taken "*cum grano*," for the "aim is at the stars." All implicit reliance upon the infallibility of the *Economist* is, for the present at least, dispelled.

But we must return from our regret and give the quotations already promised. As regards the tone and style of the *Economist's* attack the writer of a letter in the *Pioneer* of the 19th of July, signed N.W.P., says:—

"The last number of the *Economist* contains a most acrimonious and, it must be added, unjust criticism on the Board of Revenue's memorandum on the revised settlements of these provinces. The *Economist* calls this memorandum 'sophistical,' 'misleading,' and 'disingenuous;' insinuates that the statistics quoted are incorrect, and accuses the North-West Government of 'throwing dust into men's eyes to defeat inquiry.' He declares that it 'would be wholly unprofitable to follow the memorandum through its numerous windings,' and prefers to give what he calls a 'crucial illustration of its value.' I think the writer ought to have supported the very serious charges which he has advanced, by refuting the conclusions at which the Board has arrived, not by selecting one of his arguments for criticism; but I hope to show that even on the point chosen by himself for attack, the assailant is hopelessly in the wrong."

The *Observer* says, "this article is a very rabid attack on Mr. Colvin for the memorandum. . ."

As regards the question of "disingenuousness" and the statistics of proprietors' holdings, N.W.P. (who writes as one thoroughly acquainted with the district which contains Atrawlee) says:—

"The memorandum, in showing the usual size of the homestead, quoted the statistics of eleven pergunnahs recently re-settled, in which the land actually in cultivation of the proprietors aver-

aged six (6) acres. The *Economist* charges the Board with 'disingenuousness' and with garbling the statistics, because they did not also quote *Atrowlee* in which the average homestead is 23 acres. He adds 'that the Mynpoory and Bareilly holdings instanced by Mr. Colvin are exceptionally small, there can be little doubt. . . So much for the proprietor's own farm. Instead of an average of six acres each, we find it 20 or 23 at all events in *Atrowlee*.

I can assure the *Economist* that the eleven pergunnahs instanced afford fair examples of the amount of land usually in the actual cultivation of proprietors, and that the case of *Atrowlee* is altogether exceptional. It is owned chiefly by talukdars who in many of their villages set apart a portion of land as a home farm. This farm is cultivated by the proprietors' servants, and the produce goes partly to the support of the farm establishment, and partly to his granary for the support of the household and the (grain) wages of his retainers. Sometimes the home farm is cultivated by ryots, entirely dependent on the talukdar, and unable to obtain occupancy rights, so that the latter can at any time take the farm into his own hands. Thus an unusually large amount of land is known in *Atrowlee* as 'zemindar's seer;' but I believe that the extent actually cultivated by the proprietors and their families is exceptionally small, as will be seen by any one who reads Mr. Smith's account of the distribution of property and the economical condition of the pergunnah. The social state of *Atrowlee* is exceptional even in the Allygurh district, and very exceptional as regards the whole province; and nothing would be more misleading than to regard the farms, which its great proprietors keep under their own management, as illustrations of the actual homesteads of the 'peasant landlords' of the North-West. It may be added that if *Atrowlee* was omitted, *Saharunpur* was also omitted. Now the average size of the homestead in the *Saharunpur* district is shown to be *five* acres only."

The *Observer* puts it in these words :—

"Misapprehension also, of a less pardonable nature, is displayed by the writer of the article. To show that the landlord's home farms are larger than Mr. Colvin would allow, he quotes from Mr. Smith's report on *Atrowlee* in Allygurh. But is he not aware that *Atrowlee* is in the hands of two or three large land-owners, and that these homestead farms in *Atrowlee* are only lands so entered at nominal rates, simply to conceal the true rentals and avoid the growth of occupancy rights?"

On turning to the Bolundshuhur Settlement Report we see that the number of separate holdings cultivated by proprietors in the whole district, is 14,206, the area 166,541 acres, and the average per holding 11·72 acres. But we also see that there are



## 48 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

a great many large landowners in the district, and apprehend that much of this land is merely nominal "zemindar's seer" cultivated by tenants.

On the question of mixing up *farming profits* with *rent*, and that the homestead is the best land in the village, we extract the following quotations—

From the *Observer* :—

" But now we come to Mr. Colvin's great sin—his exceedingly disingenuous statement, that many of the petty proprietors in the North-West have only five rupees a month to meet the 'entire cost of living.' The memorandum is called misleading, because it has no application to the lands held by single or by few owners; but only to lands held by communities of village proprietors. The writer of it is called 'disingenuous,' because in making the calculation of the petty proprietors' profits, he has taken no account of his farming profits, but only of his receipts as rent. . . . . As to the farming profits, let us inform the *Economist* that hitherto the assessment has not been made on the *farming profits*, but on the *rent*; hence Mr. Colvin omitted to take the farming profits into account. He might as well have taken into account the proceeds of money-lending, or highway robbery, a course of livelihood likely to meet with many professors, if the rack-renters have their way. If the *Economist* wishes the land revenue to be based on farming profits as well as rents, let him say so."

From N.W. P.'s letter :—

" In calculating the income of the proprietor, the Board assumes that the homestead 'can be let at a rack-rent of double the rent paid by ordinary tenants.' They thus calculate the 'landowner's profits' at a little more than Rs. 5 per month to 'meet the cost of living of a family.' Now, any one who has read the memorandum with ordinary care, and without a 'foregone conclusion' to condemn it, must have seen that it only discusses the landowner's profits *quoad landowner*, that it assumes in the calculation that all the land is let, and that in its anxiety not to under-estimate the profit, it has valued the seer land at a rate higher in proportion to the tenant's 'land' than it has ever been valued before. Yet the *Economist* says that this is an 'exceedingly disingenuous' statement . . . . . that 'no account is taken of the fact that a six acres' homestead, consisting as it does of the best land in the village, will of itself *meet the entire cost of a man's living*.' . . . . . 'But I ask whether the *Economist* was not aware that the Board discussed the amount of the *net* profit of the land, not the *farming* profit; that their inquiry was simply as to the amount of this *net* profit which the State left to the landowner; and that the State has no more concern with the *farming* profits of the latter than

with his profits as an indigo-planter or a money-lender. Is he not aware that the State shares not in the gross amount which the land produces, but on the amount for which it can be let, and that we have no right to take into account the fact that a man cultivates a part of his land instead of letting it all to tenants?"

From the article, "The Land Question," in the *Pioneer* of July 5th:—

"But the most serious charge brought against the calculation is that it is disingenuous, because no account is taken of the fact that the homestead, consisting of the best land in the village, will of itself meet the entire cost of a man's living. If the writer means that the landholder can live upon the profits of his homestead, defraying from it the land-revenue chargeable thereon, and pocketing the net rental accruing on the rest of his holding, we recommend him to reconsider his position. But that a man often lives solely on the proceeds of his homestead is perfectly true, and perfectly compatible with the figures given by the Board. The profits of the homestead are retained by the landholder for his own consumption. The rental of his other lands is assigned to the payment of the gross Government revenue. But how does this affect the illustration? Similarly, it must be denied that the homestead is composed necessarily of the best lands. It is inaccurate to say that there are no lands so good as those of the homestead: though it may be allowed that they are usually of the better class. It is absurd too to suppose that sugar alternating with rice is the ordinary crop of the homestead. Sugar, it may be pointed out by the way, is not usually grown upon rice lands."

The question, however, is now no longer whether the North-West system has been and is being fairly and correctly worked, but whether the system itself is a right and proper one; or rather it is called on to show cause why it should not be summarily condemned as faulty and rotten to the core. Not only is this the cry of a portion of the Press, but it is directly mentioned in the Government Despatch on the Bolundshuhur Settlement in these words—Para. 7—"Whether the conditions under which settlements are now being made for a term of 30 years in the North-Western Provinces, give sufficient security for maintaining the just rights of the State, and for preventing the sacrifice of any portion of that share of the rental of the land which the State is entitled to receive, is a general question of a very serious character. It can hardly be denied that such instances as the present throw grave doubts upon the sufficiency of the existing system. . . . As regards this particular district, I am to state that, while the Governor-General in Council accepts the Lieutenant-Governor's conclusion, that the confirmation of the settlement is necessary,

## 50 *The Revision of the N.W.P. Settlements.*

"he does so with extreme reluctance, and only because he feels that the loss of revenue is, in this case, a less serious evil than that which would follow from the long delay which would attend any attempt to revise *the principles on which the settlement has been made.*" Para. 26—"The Governor-General in Council would ask His Honor whether it does not follow that there is *something essentially faulty in the existing system of assessment.*" We have put italics to draw attention to the important expressions in the quotations.

The whole subject is now reduced to a mere question of *£. s. d.* Money, say they, we *must* have, and never mind how we get it. This is very happily put in the Land Question article from which we have already quoted:—"It is the boast of the Village Community that it has outlived Empires. Is the boast to be once more put to the test? There is, however, one striking similarity in all these projects. Whatever is done to the land, one thing must never be lost sight of. You may take up the landholder, or you may take up the tenant, but you must before all things trowser the dollars."

The concluding paragraphs from two different articles in the *Observer* are well worthy of reproduction in full, and we think that the Supreme Government will do well not to turn a deaf ear to the good advice there given:—

"If we had space we would say more of the danger of yielding to the rack-renting party. One word we will say to the *Economist*. Let him read the effusions of his own followers in the *Indian Public Opinion* and elsewhere. Do the writers know what they mean when, speaking of the proprietors in the North-West, they talk of 'sweeping away these middlemen,' and of assessing the land-revenue by native agency working by contract? We are not afraid that men who hold such opinions will ever get power, or having got it, will keep it long. But to have such things written in respectable papers, and disseminated by the Native Press, does infinite mischief. If the Editor of the *Economist* would take the trouble to learn and understand the land system of the North-West, he would be the first to condemn such pernicious nonsense."

"We must, however, raise our voice against any countenance being given, by person in authority, to that cry for the demolition of the North-Western Provinces zemindars that has been led by the *Indian Economist*. The question whether those zemindars and their rights are of our own creation or existed before our rule, may have an historical or antiquarian interest. But we deny that, except to a madman, it can be of any political importance. The mere discussion of it, or allusion to it by the Government of India, will do incalculable mischief. There are some expressions in the

Bolundshuhur letter, that might be interpreted to show a tendency towards Mr. Knight's theories. We hope earnestly that Lord Mayo will see that no such dangerous and foolish speculations are suffered to appear in public correspondence. On the low ground of expediency, the events in Oudh and the North-West in 1857 are sufficient to show what would be the result of any such tampering with the tenure of property. The standard of assessment, the share to be taken by the State, the period of the settlement, are all questions that may be legitimately, and, by competent persons, usefully discussed. The question with whom the settlement is to be made is one that never ought to be opened; and, unless it is desired to destroy all confidence in British honesty and stability of purpose, it never will be opened by the Government of India."

It gives us great pleasure to find from the August number of the *Indian Economist* that that paper now disclaims "leading the cry for the demolition of the North-West Provinces zemindars," and that "were the zemindaree rights of the North-West in the least danger, the *Indian Economist* would perhaps not be last in the field for their defence."

There is however no denying the fact that the would-be disciples of the *Indian Economist* continue to take up the cry, which they believe was opened by the *Indian Economist*; the "*Mad Rack Renter*" to wit, who styles himself one of "the body of thinkers in India who adopt the views of Mr. R. Knight," and "whose utopia is the absence of landlords."

After such great and widespread misapprehension on the part of friends and foes as to the views held by the *Indian Economist* regarding the landlords of the North-Western Provinces, might not similar misapprehension be found to exist regarding the meaning of the passages from the Government Despatch quoted above as to the "something essentially faulty in the existing system of assessment?" Or as the basis of the accusations, and the Bolundshuhur illustration used, have been shown to be erroneous, is it not within the bounds of possibility that the Supreme Government may, in proper time, acknowledge that the conclusions as to the "*something essentially faulty*" are themselves the most faulty part of the whole subject? We live in hopes of seeing this misconception cleared up as satisfactorily as that about the views of the *Indian Economist*.

APPENDIX TO REVIEW OF N.W.P. SETTLEMENTS (*vide page 41*).

*Details of cultivated area and rent-rates used in the assessment of the contiguous Pergunnahs of the Allypore and Bolundshuhur Districts of the N.W.P.*

DENOMINATION.		TUSSEEL ATROWLEE, ZILLAH ALLYPORE, 1870 A.D.				PERGUNNAH DIRAIE, ZILLAH BOLUNDSHUHUR, 1861, A.D.			
		Area in acres.	Rent-rate.	THE SAME AMALGAMATED FOR COMPARISON.		Area in acres.	Rent-rate.	Percentage of soil on total cultivated area.	
				Area.	Percentage.				
BAGGER OR UPLANDS.	Irrigated Baruh ...	6,113	12 4 8	4-06	13,320	10 6 7	8 85	4,437	11 0 0
	Do. Munjha ...	7,217	8 12 6	4-79					
	Unirrigated Baruh ...	554	5 4 3	0-36	1,461	4 3 6	0-96	349	7 0 0
	Do. Munjha...	907	3 8 2	0-60					
	Irrigated Outlying...	59,847	4 6 3	39-76	59,847	4 6 3	39 76	26,581	4 0 0
	Unirrigated do. 1st	20,820	2 10 2	13-83	69,654	1 15 0	46-27	45,073	2 0 0
	Do. do. 2nd	48,834	1 10 4	32-44					
	Baruh and Munjha ...	727	5 4 3	0-48	.....	.....	.....	None	None
	Outlying 1st ...	2,056	7 14 5	1-36	.....	.....	.....	961	9 4 0
	Do. 2nd ...	3,269	2 10 2	2-16	.....	.....	.....	1,769	3 12 0
KADIROR ALDUAL LANDS.									
Incidence of 50 per cent. revenue per cultivated acre		1 14 5.		Ditto		1 9 6.			

TUHSEEL KOEL, ZILLAH ALLYGHUR, 1870 A.D.		ZILLAH BOLUNDSHUHUR. PERGUNNAH PURASOO, " PERGUNNAH KHORMA, A.D. 1860.							
DENOMINATION.	Area in acres.	Rent-rate.	Percentage.	THE SAME AMALGAMATED FOR COM- PARISON.			Area in acres.	Rent-rate.	Percentage.
				Area.	Rate.	Percentage.			
Irrigated Baruh ...	7,768	11 8 0	5-10	17,093	9 12 0	11-23	2,764	11 0 0	5-07
Irrigated Munjha ...	9,325	8 4 0	6-13						
Unirrigated Baruh ...	124	5 4 0	0-08	338	4 2 0	0 22	...	.....	...
Do. Munjha ...	214	3 8 0	0-14						
Irrigated Outlying ...	102,303	4 9 0	67-28	102,303	4 9 0	67-28	20,859	4 0 0	38-29
Unirrigated do. 1st ...	16,365	2 12 0	10-76	32,300	2 4 0	21-24	30,840	2 0 0	56-64
Do. do. 2nd ...	15,935	1 12 0	10-48						
Incidence of 50 per cent. revenue per cultivated acre 2 5 2.							Ditto 1 8 9.		Ditto 1 10 6.

#### ART. IV.—ELEMENTARY EDUCATION IN MADRAS.

*Act IV. of 1871.—An Act to provide funds for expenditure on objects of local public utility and improvement, and to constitute Local Boards for the due administration of such funds.*

THE legislation embodied in Act IV. of 1871, is the most important that Madras has originated for many years ; but it is with only one branch of that legislation that we can now deal. Among the objects of local public utility, which the Act endeavours to promote, education is specially designated ; and it may be well to consider by what means, and in what direction, education will be influenced by the provisions of the Act.

And at the outset it must be remarked that as the improvements which the Act seeks to promote, are expressly stated to be “local and public,” so, in the matter of education, its aim is to meet a similar need ; that is, to provide *elementary* education for the masses. Although it may not be easy to define the limits within which elementary education must be confined ; since that education which teaches the rudiments of any branch of knowledge is no less truly elementary education than the first lessons in the alphabet ; still those who are seeking to popularise and spread education in India, will readily agree that the true elementary education required by this country’s needs, may be safely confined to instruction in the local vernaculars, with reasonable facilities of learning English, held out to those who desire it, but not forced upon those classes who neither need nor demand it. In order to realise the scope of this new educational measure, our readers must be reminded of the system, (if it deserves the name) which existed down to the present year. So far as Government, represented by the Educational Department, has in the rural districts of the Madras Presidency endeavoured to supply education at all ; it has acted in three different directions.

First, directly by founding schools under Madras Act VI. of 1863 ; secondly, by aiding with money-grants Anglo-vernacular schools founded by private effort, and supported mainly by private subscription ; thirdly, by subsidising those elementary village schools of which the masters submitted to official inspection. Schools founded under Act VI. of 1863 or the Godavery Act,—its name is derived from the district in which it was introduced and chiefly worked,—were known as ‘rate schools’ from the rate or cess of  $\frac{1}{2}$  anna per rupee on the land assessment by which they were supported. The Act was worked somewhat after this manner. A certain number of local officials in the tahsildars’ and other

cutcheries—men with sons to educate and too poor as a rule to send them to live at the head-quarters of the district, and to attend the zillah school, putting their heads together, prepared a memorial, to which the headmen and principal shopkeepers of the neighbourhood were induced to append their signatures.

In this the Collector was informed that the ryots and other inhabitants of Golkondapuram had long felt the need of a sound education, and now prayed the Collector to urge the Government to mulct them of an additional 3 per cent land tax, and to free them from the ignorance in which they too long had lain. It mattered little that the ryots in whose name the petition was made, knew nothing of its existence and cared less for the education for which it prayed. The application was sent on to Government, and shortly a notification appeared in the Gazette declaring that the villagers undermentioned were to pay  $\frac{1}{2}$  anna per rupee additional land assessment, and were to have a school, of which the talúk officials and a few other Bráhmans were made managers.

It is conceivable that in a community really desirous for education, such a system might have been worked without much hardship; but in India, and still more in Southern India, where there is no more general demand for education than there is for beaver hats, the rate school was little more nor less than a swindle; for it was paid for by those who had not asked for it and did not want it; and used by those who did want it and did not pay for it. It was supported by distant villagers who could not possibly have used it if they would; and lastly it was devoted mainly to the instruction of the sons of Bráhman officials in the English language, while the mass of the people were excluded by social prejudice, and repelled by a language which they had no wish to teach their children. And so it came about that this Act instead of spreading elementary education throughout Southern India, became every year more dying and inoperative. Even where the memorial had been written, the Act introduced, and the cess collected, the school remained unfounded; partly because there were no boys to fill it, and partly because the general apathy in matters educational resisted all efforts to dispel it.

Of the second class of schools, known as grant-in-aid schools, less need be said. They depended on local subscriptions more or less voluntary, according to the position of the subscriber, and the position and character of the official who made it his business, or found it his interest to set up the school. So far as public money was given to the support of such schools, it was thoroughly well spent, as it supplemented local and independent effort on the part of those who felt, or professed to feel, an interest in education; and



it saddled no back with other people's burdens. But as an instrument of popular education, these schools have been sadly defective. Official changes, by removing from the school its most influential and zealous patrons, would hasten its decay; while its semi-independent character deprived the masters of the position which attaches to Government employes, at the same time that it removed them from official control. These schools were thus often ephemeral, and always liable to alternations of efficiency and feebleness. Schools of the two classes first described do not technically, although they do in fact, correspond to the definition of elementary schools; that title being reserved for schools in which no English, however elementary, is taught. Of this third description of school we have now to speak; and if we do so with some detail, it is because the subject seems hitherto not to have attracted the notice to which both its importance and its interest entitle it.

In these days the schoolmaster is abroad all over India; the truth is being recognised with some distinctness that legislation can do little to raise an uneducated nation; that we shall make little of the ryot until we teach him to read and write. If we, English, could write the nation's songs, we might cease to care to write their laws; but we are strangers, and cannot write their songs, if we would; and as for laws, we seem to have written too many already. If the present generation of Indian administrators busy themselves with the humbler duties of the village schoolmaster, it may be that the fruit of their labour, when time shall have ripened it, will be richer and sounder than any grown by the husbandmen that came before.

The village school of Southern India, commonly bears the name of the "pial" or raised platform outside of a dwelling-house, chutrum or temple, upon which the schoolmaster and his pupils sit to read and write. Few villages are without a school of this sort; but as their existence depends on a variety of accidents, it can never be predicated with certainty of a village that it has its village school, unless it is seen at work. These accidents arise partly out of the demand at any given time for education, and partly out of the fortuitous existence of a certain number of poor members of the Bráhman or other semi-religious castes, who for want of lucrative employment find themselves driven to teach for their bread.

Hindús are so ruled by custom that it may be going too far to say that the schoolmasters' trade is not hereditary; but it is certainly looked upon as by no means an honorable occupation—a contempt which is due as much to the slight value set upon education, as to the poor return that rewards the teachers' toil. And here we must guard against a misconception that often meets the critic of the 'pial' school. With a not unnatural and

even praiseworthy attachment to the associations and memories of their youth, educated Hindús look back not without gratitude to the 'pial' school as their first "alma mater" who guided them through the crooked paths of alphabet and primer; and they fancy that any disparagement of the 'pial' school is necessarily an adverse criticism of the education which trained their young minds; and that in criticism of the methods, is involved condemnation of the results. But apart from the fact that boys can (if any one can) gather grapes of intelligence from the brambles of pedantry, it is not in fact true that the educated Hindú, even if he began his education in a 'pial' school, owes in any real sense his mature knowledge and intelligence to the crude teaching of the village schoolmaster. Hindús are taught all that is worth knowing of their education, except the 'beggary elements' of reading and writing, in their own homes by their fathers and uncles and brothers. It is therefore not only possible, but just to condemn the methods of the village school without in any way extending that condemnation to the results as we see them in the educated Hindú of average intelligence and attainments. With this apology we may resume our description of the 'pial' school as it is, and as it has been probably any time these last 1500 years.

If we were to search for a type of this institution in English classical literature, we should probably find it most clearly delineated in "Great Expectations," where Dickens tells us that "Mr. Wopsle's "great aunt kept an evening school; that is to say, she was a "ridiculous old woman of limited means and unlimited infirmity, "who used to go to sleep in the company of youth who paid two "pence per week each, for the improving opportunity of seeing "her do it." Now if we generalise freely from this idea, changing the sex of the teacher, but preserving her characteristics, and only raising slightly the price paid for the commodity supplied in the shape of instruction, we shall have a rough and ready model of the village or 'pial' school of Southern India. The schoolmaster, as we before hinted, is generally one of those bad bargains who failing in every respectable calling, sinks into pedagogy as a *dernier ressort*; and while he consents to teach the village youth by day, ekes out his livelihood with the precarious receipts derived from petition-writing and horoscope-drawing. As is the instructor so is the instruction—meagre in quantity, of poor quality, and conveyed by methods so crude and defective as to narrow instead of fertilising the intellect. It is of course impossible for boys, especially for boys so sharp as young Hindús, to sit together for months and years, repeating after the master by rote (for this is the invariable and unique method of teaching) their alphabet and simple arithmetic tables, without acquiring some knowledge of reading and writing, and the most elementary numeration.

But we do not hesitate to affirm that the teaching is so scanty, and the method in which it is conveyed so thoroughly bad, that any youths who pass from one of those schools to one in which competent instruction is given after sensible methods, have wholly to unlearn their early lessons before they can profit by sound teaching. We are not now speaking or thinking of English education, or of any thing but a sound and thorough instruction in the vernacular languages and literature ; and it is notorious that Hindú scholars so far from owing their education to 'pial' schools, obtain that education in spite of the obstacles that ignorance and incompleteness of professional teachers cast in their path by independent study in their own homes, and from the experience of their own relations.

It would be a long and tedious story to tell all that might be told of the village school and schoolmaster ; to describe the tumult and confusion amid which the teaching is carried on, and which, in the words of a native critic, " renders the 'pial' more like a busy bazaar than a school-house." We might dwell upon the extortion that, under the pretext of religious ceremony, forces clothes and gifts of grain, &c., from every scholar at almost every fresh stage of his studies ; while the master at certain festivals turns his scholars into a company of young players, who travel round the village acting and reciting, winning by their performances a few extra rupees for the pedagogue's pocket.

These points are only important as they illustrate the falsity of the popular notion that this indigenous education is cheaper than the education offered by Government institutions. For in the first place, the fees paid for this miserable farce of education are very nearly, if not quite, as high as those charged in Government schools for a really sound vernacular education. The lowest fee per month in the 'pial' school is two annas ; and as the rates range according to the wealth of the parents combined with the supposed attainments of the pupil, from two annas to one rupee per month, it is probable that the average payment in hard cash is from 6 to 8 annas per month, or about 5 rupees a year. Add to this periodical gifts of grain and clothes, presents at feasts, and meals to the masters and fellow pupils ; and the total annual cost of this worthless education will probably exceed that of a thoroughly sound education under competent teachers.

Having stated this much (and though we have stated the facts strongly, we believe that we have given nothing but facts), there would seem to be little left for discussion. If the ordinary education offered to the mass of the rural population is thus worthless, surely, it will be said, Government have only to meet the want by a full supply of competent village schools, and scholars will flock to them forthwith. But it is just because the future of popular education is not so plain and easy, that we wish to point

out where the difficulties lie, and to see whether the recent legislation promises to face and overcome them. And first comes the great difficulty that the ground is not clear for a new building. Such as they are, these 'pial' schools are in possession; and are from that mere fact an obstacle in the path of educational reform. It is an ungracious task to be for ever harping on the conservatism or the prejudice of the mass of Hindús; but it is a stern fact which presents itself, and must be faced at the outset of every undertaking in India. And in this matter of popular education, although the educated Hindú knows and feels and acknowledges the utter worthlessness of the 'pial' school, the mass of the people see no such thing. If they think of it at all, it appears to them a very excellent and time-honoured institution; eminently calculated to keep the sons of Bráhmans and traders out of mischief, and to supply them with that small modicum of education which has satisfied ordinary folk hitherto. To the lower class of cultivators and labourers it is a mere abstraction, with which they and their sons have no more concern than with the village accounts which are written for the *Sirkar*.

Here is the rub. We wish to instruct these good people. We want to see every ryot able to read and write; but they—*fortunatissimi*—will not come to learn; and so throwing up our hands, we say "What are we to do?" while some strong-minded people more ready to cut than to disentangle the knot, prepare the panacea—Compulsory Education.

Now, although we cannot think it wise thus to force education on a nation, there is one line of argument which is used to oppose this policy which seems quite delusive; and that is the argument drawn from the present backward condition of India. The country is not ready, it is said, for compulsory education; wait twenty, fifty, or any other arbitrarily fixed number of years, and then we shall be able to insist on every boy and girl coming to school and learning to read and write. This assertion, for it is a mere assertion, appears utterly without foundation, and arises more from the wish on the part of the opponents of compulsory education to stave off the policy of which they disapprove, than from any real faith in the wisdom of their own prophecy. For it is sufficiently obvious that every day of delay increases the difficulties of introducing compulsory education, since every day slowly but surely will increase the self-reliance and independence of the mass of Hindús. Signs are not wanting of a very wholesome quickening of the people's life—an awakening brought about by the more strenuous habits of thought and action forced upon India by railways, and telegraphs, and roads. And upon a nation that has learned to think and act for itself, it will be impossible to impose the burden of compulsory education; while it might even

now be feasible to do so in the more unsophisticated parts of the country. Not that we look upon compulsory methods with any favour, or think them indispensable or even expedient. Education is a tree of slowest growth, but it thrives best when left to fight its battle with nature under the free sky, and only sickens in the artificial atmosphere of the forcing house. If also it be true that India is slowly awaking from her long sleep, and is learning to feel and know her wants, popular education will be one of her first demands, and the time will have gone by when authority need be called in to support the schoolmaster. If those who clamour and groan at the ignorance of the ryot, were to read with more philosophy and patience the lessons taught us by the history of education in England and elsewhere in Europe, they would cease to wonder at the backwardness of education in this country. If it has remained to the Parliament of 1870, (of 33 and 34 Vict. Cap. 75, an Act to provide elementary education in England and Wales) to secure elementary education to the lower classes in England, India may well be pardoned for lagging some few years behind a country which has gained a start in civilisation of at least five centuries.

And if this principle be recognised and acted upon, we shall be less liable to despair at the apathy of Indian parents; less anxious to force education upon unwilling recipients, and thus less liable to present failure, and more certain of future success.

Still the facts remain, which we noticed above; first, that the existing means and methods of education are lamentably inadequate and inefficient; secondly, that the mass of the people care little or nothing for their increase or improvement. How then is this stagnation to be stirred, and how is the gulf to be bridged? The system proposed by the Madras Government, and sanctioned by the Act of this year, meets these questions in the following manner. The Local Funds Act constitutes a district, or such subdivision of a district as is considered to require separate administration, a Circle; and provides that the funds raised within that area shall be spent, on the several purposes designated, within that area only. Thus each Circle has its own Road Fund, its own Union Fund, and its own Endowment Fund. The term Road Fund explains itself; the Endowment Fund is almost equally intelligible, and is derived from the endowments of charitable institutions, such as hospitals, dispensaries, and the like.

Union Funds are those from which Educational expenditure is met, unless provided for from Imperial, or as they are called since the decentralising order, Provincial Funds. The name "Union" denotes the area of the village or villages which are provided for in our central school; or as the rules promulgated by Government (Rule IX) explain it, "villages, groups of villages

"or townships in which from time to time the Government may "under the provisions of Section 36 direct the imposition of the "House-tax for the support of a Local Fund school or schools "situated therein, shall be denominated Unions." Similarly the schedule of Forster's Education Act defines a 'school district' to be a 'borough or parish,' and provides that each of such school-districts shall be provided with sufficient schools for all the children resident within such district—(Sec. 5, 33 and 34 Vict. Cap. 75.) Again in the instructions directly communicated to the Local Funds Boards, the Madras Government has ordered that these school-unions shall be arranged on the principle that  $2\frac{1}{2}$  miles are the utmost distance that admits of the daily attendance of children. Thus the country is divided among these small circles, having a diameter of five miles, and the school as the centre of the circle. Of course these areas will not be arranged with mathematical precision, since it is impossible to cover a given area by a number of contiguous circles, without leaving a considerable area non-included; and physical conditions will tend constantly and rigorously in this country to render the circles more or less irregular, in order to place the schools within easy access of the local population. It seems to us to be very doubtful whether the extreme distance of  $2\frac{1}{2}$  miles is not too great for such stay-at-home people as Hindú rustics, but this will be a matter for subsequent treatment after the system has been some time at work. Each circle then is theoretically provided with a central school, and the expenses of this village school are to be defrayed from the Union Funds, which (cf. Rule X) consist of "the proceeds of the House-tax levied under Sec. 36 of the Act, "together with school fees, donations, contributions and other money "accruing to the schools, or for Union purposes." For the purposes of the levying of House-tax, Schedule A. provides for the classification of houses under six classes paying different rates from a maximum of Rs. 5 to a minimum of 4 annas. Such is the machinery entrusted to the Local Fund Boards, which they have to set in motion if they would support existing, or found additional schools. Into the constitution of these Boards, we need not enter, suffice it to say that they consist of equal numbers of official and non-official residents of the Circle. This new system of spreading popular education has for its objects to systematize education by securing to every locality its own school, supported by local rates; and to improve education by providing for the proper inspection of schools by competent inspecting officers, whose influence will tend to introduce into all lower schools, an uniform and superior type of elementary instruction.

Nor is the supply of teachers in these schools left, as hitherto, to blind chance; for no Circle will be considered educationally

complete without a Training School, from which qualified schoolmasters will be scattered over the country in the union schools.

But although the Act provides for most of the primary requirements of a system of elementary education ; it does not, nor indeed was it required to meet all the questions that will inevitably occur as the working of the system spreads. Important questions will present themselves for disposal, and will depend for a wise solution upon the care and intelligence of the Local Boards—questions, that is, such as the payment of school-fees by the scholars, and whether the master is, as he now depends, to depend on this source of income for his livelihood ; or whether he is to receive a fixed salary ; or again, whether the payment-by-results system is to be adopted, the master receiving payments proportionate to the number of pupils whom he educates up to a prescribed standard—a system which we venture to think better applicable to schools for higher education, than to village schools, whose *curriculum* is bounded by the three ‘Rs.’

Again the question will present itself for speedy decision, whether the existing staff of village schoolmasters, (whom we may classify as the Wopsle-type), are to be left in possession and entrusted with the custody of elementary education ; whether, that is, their schools are to be accepted as the basis of the union schools, and gradually developed by inspection and criticism into efficient village schools ; or whether they are to be left out in the cold, while an opposition school is started under a competent teacher. There can, we conceive, be no question that the conciliatory will be more successful than the high-handed method of dealing with this problem. Statesmanship is a succession of compromises, because men, and especially ignorant and prejudiced men, are more easily led than driven ; and so in this matter of education, if the inferior schoolmasters are disgusted by summary changes, instead of being conciliated by fair promises and positive gains, they will be driven into active opposition, where they will carry against the new schools all the blind prejudice, which religious bigotry and hatred of change wield with such power in India. If, however, existing schools and their masters be taken as they are with all their faults and failings, and by systematic management and inspection drilled into something better ; while by more sure and steady salary payments, their self-interest is awakened and the post of village schoolmaster is rendered at once more lucrative and respectable, it will be possible by slow but sure degrees to turn the present ‘pial school’ into a fairly efficient union school, without injury to individuals, and in furtherance of the general good.

And if the intentions of the Madras Government be gathered from the text of the Act and the instructions issued by them, it is plain not only that they do not advocate any violent action in

the introduction of educational reform, but that they took special pains to secure deliberation in the establishment of new schools, that the action of Local Fund Boards might neither outrun necessity, nor press hardly on rural communities. This intention is evident in the proviso attached to Sec. 36, which runs—"provided that the tax on houses shall not be imposed, "except in villages in which a school already exists that is in "receipt of a grant-in-aid from Government, or in villages the "inhabitants of which desire to establish a school, or in villages "in which Government determines to establish a school."

The imposition of the House-tax is thus restricted to villages, in which schools already exist and are aided by Government ; the number of which in the year 1869-70, was only 1,065 for the whole Presidency ; or to those exceptional cases in which the villagers express a desire for a Government school—cases which will, we believe, be so rare that they may be left out of the account altogether ; or lastly to cases in which Government directly interferes to establish a school. How this *deus ex machina* of Government is to be brought upon the scene, we scarcely comprehend ; and if the words are taken in their ordinary sense, that a distinct order of Government will be indispensable to the establishment of each and every village school, the proviso cannot but be a most injurious restriction of the action of the Local Fund Boards, who are ultimately responsible under the Act for the progress of education. Such, however, may not be the real intention of the Legislature ; and if these words which require the intervention of Government, be somewhat freely interpreted, they may be taken to mean that the Local Fund Boards are authorised to prepare a scheme of elementary education for their several divisions, by which union schools will be provided for every union with its  $2\frac{1}{2}$  mile radius ; and that this complete scheme must be submitted for approval and sanction by Government, before the House-tax can be levied for the support of the schools. If this be the intention of Government ; and it would appear from their 'instructions' that they contemplate some such method of setting the elementary education scheme afloat ; it would have been far better to avoid imposing the restrictions contained in the proviso quoted above, which seem to confine the action of Local Fund Boards within very narrow limits, if not to fetter them wholly. There is, we are aware, a prevalent opinion that the Local Fund Boards are little better than a farce ; that it is idle to expect independence of action or public spirit on the part of non-official members of the Boards ; that all efficient action will depend on the *ipse dixit* of the President. Whether this will be so or not, it is foreign to our subject to discuss ; in the matter of education we are free to confess that we hope progress will not



depend on the modest aspirations of native members. If we wait till every village asks for a good school, we shall wait so long that the passing of Act IV. of 1871 will be rendered futile ; but it will be comparatively easy—by multiplying the staff of the Educational Department, and by employing inspecting officers of a low grade to visit villages and, if we may so speak, to *tout* for schools—to spread elementary education slowly but surely through the country. What is *not* wanted is a force of Madras B.A.'s, fresh from college triumphs, and full of crude opinions about the advantages of education, with a firm persuasion of their own value as illustrations of those advantages. Such agents will not only repel and disgust where we must conciliate and attract ; but they will think themselves above their inspecting work, and do it slovenly and ill. The rural population would feel that if these are specimens of the results of Government education, their own sons can gain nothing and will lose much in fitness for their station by education of this sort ; and the first care of those who endeavour to spread elementary education, must be to convince the country people that the education offered to them is purely elementary, and so far from unfitting them for the ordinary business of life, will prove a real and solid gain to every youth who reads in the school. But it is unnecessary to consider further the details of the scheme. Only let the fact be realised that this Act is rather a skeleton than a perfect body ; a rough-hewn block and not a finished statue ; and that its elaboration will be successfully carried on so far only as the Local Fund Boards work with zeal and discretion. We cannot but think that elementary education has from one cause and another been too much lost sight of hitherto. From the highest to the lowest grades, educational officers have been wholly bent on spreading English education in the Madras Presidency ; and it is not uncommon for an Inspector of schools to be quite unpractised in visiting and examining schools in which only vernacular languages are taught. Another obstacle to the spread of education in the mofussil has been the entire absence of any co-operation by revenue district officers with the Educational Department. This has now been changed by a recent order of the Madras Government, recognising Collectors as generally responsible for the state of education within their districts ; and empowering those officers to take measures to supply deficiencies in education. And although a Collector, if he honestly does his work, is probably the hardest-worked official under the sun ; and it may therefore seem cruel to make him responsible for education too ; the real work added to his present labour by this order will be infinitesimal. Ten minutes spent in a village school here and there about his district, or one hour spent in distributing prizes to the zillah school, will suffice to show his interest in the por-

gress of education, and will contribute not a little to that progress. And so we will take leave of this subject, with a sincere hope and belief that Act IV. of 1871 will not fail to produce valuable results.

Not in months nor in years will the fruit of this good work appear. A generation must grow up to manhood, strengthened for the struggle of life by good teaching, before any general increase of popular education can make itself felt, and even then the leaven of intelligence will be working but slowly through the lump of ignorance and prejudice. Those who have wisely effected the change will not be able to watch its influence ; but none the less gratitude is due to them for attempting at least to lift the cloud that has too long darkened Southern India.

---

#### ART. V.—BENOUDHA.

- 1.—*A Historical sketch of Fyzabad Tehsil, including the former Capitals of Ajudhiá and Fyzabad.* By P. Carnegy, Officiating Commissioner and Settlement Officer, 1870.
- 2.—*Notes on the Races, Tribes and Castes, inhabiting the Province of Oudh.* By P. Carnegy, Deputy Commissioner and Settlement Officer of Fyzabad, 1868.
- 3.—*Fyzabad Settlement Reports—Historical.* By P. Carnegy, Settlement Officer.

**E**MULOUS, it would almost seem of keeping pace with the brilliant results astronomers have of late years achieved in the solution of many hitherto dimly-comprehended mysteries of solar physics ; historians, antiquarians, and annalists—‘other systems circling other suns’—have, during the same interval devoted no small amount of energy and patience to the study of the solar kingdom of history and fable. As the former have, to some extent, succeeded in resolving into the photosphere and other constituent portions of its splendour, what was formerly but ‘one unclouded blaze of living light,’ and in defining where the actual luciferous orb fades into unsubstantial zones which, though enhancing its offulgence, shine only with borrowed and reflected lustre, so have the latter made great progress towards the determination of the limits, where the real events of history become merged in the misty and illusive fables by which they are surrounded and embellished ; and, as the scientific observations of the former have been materially assisted by the transit of the eclipsing moon across the sun’s disc, so have the researches of the latter received no inconsiderable aid from the passage of certain planetary luminaries of the Celestial Empire\* across the Solar kingdom during the dark ages of its history.

It is probably almost superfluous to explain that, on the historic side of the above parallel, we allude to Ayodhyá, or Oudh ; in claiming so much importance for which province we must not be understood to assert that it has altogether monopolised the attention of historical enquirers. The general historian, indeed, cannot but regard it as a fraction only of the unit he adopts, but from him, too, it demands that tribute of respect which is due, if not to its present worth, at least to its departed greatness ;

\* The pilgrimage of this Chinese priest (Hwen Tshang) forms an epoch of as much interest for the Ancient History and Geography of

India, as the expedition of Alexander the Great. *Gen. Cunningham’s Anct. Geog., preface, p. vii.*

while it constitutes the sole theme of another class of writers, who may be identified with that section of historical literature, which owes its origin to the increased knowledge of the province which has resulted from its annexation ; the first fruits of which appeared in Mr. Elliott's valuable work, the *Chronicles of Unáo* (Oonao) ; while, with seemingly ever-increasing fecundity, it has continued to yield abundant harvests up to the present time, the last of them being represented by an interesting sketch of the history of the 'Ancient Capitals' of Oudh.

To review collectively the whole of the literature which falls within the second category, would be a task worthy of a literary Titan ; we confine ourselves more humbly to a single branch of it, in the selection of which we are guided by more than one consideration ; for the historical sketch, which has been the present means of bringing the subject under our notice, is but one of several similar works from the same pen, the author of which has by his position (local and official) had access to sources of information, which remain sealed to those less fortunately circumstanced ; and the whole series refers almost exclusively to a portion of the province, which unaffected by the numerous 'rectifications' of frontier which have from time to time taken place, has throughout all history formed part of Oudh ; and which, from having been the sub-division of which Ayodhyá was more especially the capital, Srávasti having whilom shared that honour in the northern districts, may be adjudged to possess in a peculiar degree, the right to be associated with Ráma's celebrated city.

The tract thus particularised has, it may be surmised, a name sufficiently appropriate ; we mean Benoudha. If it is vague, it is to us a recommendation ; it leaves room for greater latitude of treatment. If, in modern times, its meaning has been narrowed by treaties involving territorial cessions, we avail ourselves with satisfaction of a reason for not transgressing the present boundaries of Oudh. What, according to our notion, the name in its full sense implied, we shall state hereafter ; but an exact definition of its meaning is beyond our present purpose. It fulfils its object if it indicates with moderate clearness, that our concern lies with a particular region, not with the whole of Oudh ; with the past, rather than the present ; with the Hindú, rather than the Muslim.

The merits and demerits of the works before us from a purely literary point of view, we do not intend to discuss at any length ; indeed, criticism in this direction is disarmed by the frank avowal of the author, in his prefatory remarks, that he has not attempted to present us with elaborate and highly-finished literary compositions ; and that we must only look for such more or less complete descriptions of particulars of historical or ethnological value, as he has become acquainted with in the course of, and in some

measure in connection with, his official labours, and found leisure to commit to writing in that very scanty *otium* that goes hand in hand with the *dignitate* of official life in India; his object being, not so much to claim for them, in their present shape, a permanent place in literature, as to place on record the results of his researches, in order that they may be available to any aspirant after fame, who, undaunted by the formidable literary training he is cautioned he must undergo, shall feel him equal to the undertaking of compiling a perfect and comprehensive history of Ayodhyá, the blessed. Hence, we presume, springs that want of perspicuity of arrangement and that blending of the general with the particular which occasionally force themselves upon our notice, and to which we might otherwise object. In them we find the leading defects, perhaps, to which we need advert, and we may point out instances as we encounter them in the course of our remarks. But these and any other minor faults we willingly condone, when, to counterbalance them, we obtain so much varied and valuable information. Nor must we omit to notice an unusual, we believe a perfectly novel, feature in such publications, which is to be observed in the Faizabad Report, which leads us to recur to the simile with which we started; for, as astronomers have pressed photography among other auxiliaries into their service, so also do we find that the same process has been resorted to for the illustration of the glories of the solar capital. The experiment has been made on no unworthy objects, and Ayodhyá's magnificence is proved to be a thing not altogether of the past; mosque and pagoda alike contribute to its decoration; and it still possesses architectural monuments which few Indian cities can surpass. Less stately in appearance, but more historically interesting, the Maniparbat and other structures of a like kind have appropriately found places among the illustrations. The subjects have all, indeed, been judiciously selected, and the artist—an amateur it seems—has well performed his portion of the task.

With these preliminary remarks, we pass on to the more congenial labour of tracing the history of Benoudha, by the light that the works under review shed upon it; in doing which, we may as well mention at the outset, that when, as will now and then occur, we find it further capable of elucidation by reference to other authors, we shall not scruple to consult them as freely as may suit our purpose. General Sleeman's "Tour," and Dr. Butler's "Southern Oudh" at once suggest themselves as likely to assist us, while we may possibly show ourselves not oblivious of more recently published accounts of the southern districts of the province.

To what particular race or tribe are we to attribute the earliest occupation of Benoudha? What were its ethnological affinities? In what relation did it stand to those who reduced it to subjection?

Did it succumb to an alien race nobler and worthier than itself, or did it differ from its successor only as one sept of a mighty clan differs from another? Was the indigenous plant uprooted to make way for the exotic? Or were they offshoots of the same parent-stem, the one degenerated under unsuitable conditions, the other developed in a corresponding degree under the influence of a superior climate and more careful nurture. Neither of these theories regarding the aborigines, and those who 'improved them off the face of the earth,' has been without its advocates. That which postulates a community of origin for the immigrants, and the autochthones is not unknown, Mr. Carnegie tells us, to the traditions of the natives, with whom it finds expression in a curious story. Beni, or Veni, son of Ang, ruler of Ayodhyá, one of many 'unfortunates of the same kind, fell a victim to the anger of the Bráhmans. He died childless, but his corpse, after the fashion of the ashes of the Phoenix, gave birth to two sons, destined to become leading characters in the cosmogonic portion of Hindú mythology. For one, Nekhad, sprung from his foot, is reputed to have been the ancestor of the aborigines; the other Pirthu, spring from his arm, attained no less a dignity than that of the first Solar Rájá of Ayodhyá. This strange origin of the Solar race reminds us forcibly of one of Hamlet's queerest ravings, in which he builds conclusions on the creative power of the sun under similar conditions—a god kissing carrion; making mention of another sun-born family of a perfectly different description. We imagine, few will envy those who can boast of an ancestry reaching back through countless generations to the sun, when it is coupled with such a blot on the escutcheon on the maternal side. We are inclined, much to our surprise, to feel grateful to Mr. Darwin's school, for giving mankind in general the option of claiming descent from the more obscure but less repulsive mollusc! We are glad to know, however, that accounts are not unanimous in making Veni's sons posthumous \* (which is after all a secondary point); the same leading idea pervades them all, and accords with that of the legend, in showing that the Aryans of the East did not lack authority for sharing with their brethren of the West, and with the Semitic races from whom the latter derived it, a belief in the descent of all mankind from 'one primitive great sire.'

Abstaining from a discussion of this theory, Mr. Carnegie proceeds to describe the various races into which, according to native ways of thinking, the human species was in the earliest times

\* Vena himself, however, was the son of Smritha, the first-born of *Mrityu* (Death); and this taint is said to have led to his being born corrupt. Skt. Texts, I. 299.

divided ; experiencing probably, in common with the generality of writers, the impossibility of investigating the history of the aborigines of any one province, without glancing at the distribution of their contemporaries, over other portions of the country. These primitive races are said to have been fourteen in number, which were classified as follows :—

Prach (East).——Pundarik ; Kirát ; Khas ; Kamboh ; Udar.  
 Dachhat (South).——Darwar ; Haihai.  
 Audichh (North).——Chinas.  
 Paschhat (West).——Sak ; Pahlav ; Párad ; Darad ; Tál-jaghá ; Barbar.

The first eight of these were indigenous, and the remainder foreigners. As this arrangement professes to be based partly on the Sástras, it may be expected that it coincides pretty closely with what we find in Manu ; which, premising that localities are completely undefined, we transcribe *in extenso*\*:—

Paundrakas, Odras, Dráviras ; Kambojas,† Yavanas, Sakas ; Páradas, Pahlavas, Chinas,‡ Kirátas, Daradas, and Chasas.

Our principal object in giving this list is, to show that the Haihais, the only ones who appear to have belonged to Benoudha, are not in Manu's list. The identifications which have been made of many of the others have our general concurrence ; and with regard to the remainder, we may offer the following remarks :—The Mahábhárata reckons Paundra among the kingdoms of the East, and the Pundariks (whom we take to be the Paundrakas of Manu) may therefore, both from locality and name, be assigned to that kingdom which, if the same as Paundra Varddhau, is the modern Pabua. The Darads § to judge not only from their name, but also from their proximity in various lists to the Kashmiras, cannot be other than those who are said to have been 'once a powerful race, and to have given their name to Dárel, erst the capital of Swát or Udyána.' And the Páradas may in all likelihood be traced by verbal similarity to Pardene of the ancient atlases, a conjecture which is supported by the proximity of Pardene to the country of the Pahlavas, with whom the Páradas seem to be associated. Regarding the incidental observation, that from Prach is derived the Prasii of the Greeks, we note that General Cunningham, who recognises

\* Institutes, ch. x., p. 44.

† Kamboh, of Kamboj or Cochin ("Notes on Races," p. 1). Elsewhere (Ancient Geography, p. 6) they are classed among nations of the south-west, and (Lassen on Coins, p. 89) among the nations of the west. Those of the east were a colony from the west (*Calcutta Review*, No. cii., p.

306) and one only of many instances of the same kind.

‡ "A name that Sinologues say "is not older than two centuries before Christ."—Prinsep, l. 223.

§ Ancient Geography. p. 62 ; see also Baber's Memoirs (Erskine) *Introduction*, xiii., and Fa-Hian (Beale) *Introduction*, p. lxix.

this as the hitherto universally accepted belief,\* prefers to attribute the origin of the Greek word to Palása, or Parása,† which he says was a well-known name, in ancient times, of Magadha; well-known, also, it may be added, in modern times,‡ in connection with Clive's famous victory.

But are the pandits correct in asserting any of these fourteen races to be aboriginal? In Manu, in the Mahābhārata, and elsewhere, the Kshatriya origin of some at least, where not of all, is clearly indicated; which suggests an answer in the negative, to be avoided only by the hypothesis that the Kshatriyas themselves were autochthonic. We might indeed argue, and not without fair grounds, that the term Kshatriya is misapplied, on account of the strong improbability there is that some of the clans named were ever subject to the laws of the Brāhmaṇic hierarchy; but, if such be the case, it is also capable of explanation on the supposition that they were foreigners, and we can thence deduce no certain argument as to whether they were aborigines or not. Again, the Yavanas and Pahlavas were unquestionably Aryans, and either strangers to the caste-system and so foreigners, 'or errant Kshatriyas who had lost their caste,' which brings us round again to the point from which we started, inasmuch as, if they were indigenous, so must the Kshatriyas generally have been.

Fortifying ourselves, therefore, with the authority of Wilson for doubting whether the Institutes were 'put together' before the 2nd century B.C., and taking into account the rapid spread of the doctrines of Sākya Muni over the south and west of India, we incline to the view that we have in Manu nothing but an enumeration of the most warlike or best known races of his day, who were, indeed, excommunicated so far as Hindú society was concerned, but whose "omission of holy rites and seeing no Brāhmaṇs" was simply an euphemistic form of expressing their adhesion to Buddhism, or other rival creeds; and the mention of whom as Kshatriyas is but an intimation of the rank in the Hindú social scale to which they would have been welcome,—if only they had cared to take it; just as in later times, Hodgson says the Kochs availed themselves of the convenient elasticity of the Kshatriya's cord, which was unhesitatingly extended to receive them.

Who then were the aborigines of Benoudha? For our part, we readily confess our ignorance. It depends upon the broader question of who were the aborigines of the whole of Hindústán, on which, even among those who agree they were non-Aryan, opi-

\* See Fa-Hian, p. 103; note Prasi  
= Vrijjis?

† Ancient Geography, p. 454.

‡ Drury. *Useful plants*; s. v.  
Butea frondosa.



nions are at present hopelessly at variance. Even those who were till lately left undisturbed in that not much coveted position, have again to face the invader. The Kols and others have each their own antagonist; Mr. Carnegy fearlessly challenges the title of the Bhars! We bid fair ultimately to prepare a *tabula rasa*, which may hereafter receive speculations less open to attack than those which have preceded them. In the present transition state of knowledge on the subject, the most prudent course is to restrict ourselves to saying that the earliest records of the Aryans lead us to believe that those whom they found here were squat, dark-complexioned races, morally and physically inferior to their Aryan conquerors; who scorned to make themselves acquainted with, or at all events to allude to, them by their distinctive designations, or to take cognizance of their tribal individuality; finding it sufficient, for the limited intercourse they kept up with them, to group them under such collective terms as Asuras, Daityas, or Rákshasas. These names may, as usually believed, have been borrowed from the visionary world; or may, as Wheeler suggests, have been perhaps originally applied to particular tribes of aborigines. They may, indeed, have been the appellations by which they were familiarly known among themselves, and have gradually fallen into their present degraded signification as the breach between them and the invaders widened; and have become on the lips of the Aryans synonymous with those of evil spirits, only when in their minds they imagined an assimilation of nature to have already taken place; being, in either case, expressive of contempt, hatred or abuse, and exemplifications of a method of exhibiting such feelings by no means confined to ancient days or eastern countries. The modern orthography of the word Tartar is due to such a mental parallel by St. Louis, on his hearing of the devastations of the hordes of Chinghiz Khán;\* and a similar idea would almost seem to underlie the qualified praise bestowed by Gregory the Great on the fair-haired Saxon slaves. Butler again, jokingly it is true, directly attributes to the great Florentine statesman an addition to the already numerous cognomina of the arch-enemy:

Old Machiavel had ne'er a trick  
Yet gave his name to our Old Nick;

and a more serious example of the same sort is to be found in the well-known passage "How art thou fallen from heaven, Lucifer, son of the Morning!"—the name employed in which, indicative in the first instance of the king of Babylon, was transferred to its

---

\* *Erigat nos, mater, coeleste solatium, quia si proveniant ipsi, vel nos ipsos quos vocamus Tartaros ad suas Tartareas sedes unde exierunt retrudemus, vel ipsi nos cælum advehant.*—*Gibbon*, vol. iii., p. 295.

present owner, only when the empire of the former, becoming an object of universal hatred, had come to be considered as fitly typical of the empire of the latter.\*

To complete the ethnic system of the pandits, of which the fourteen primitive races formed the greater part, a fifteenth—a 'last best work of heaven'—was necessary to crown, as it were, the edifice of creation. To fulfil this lofty object it was that the Aryans, the good and great, *καλοὶ κάγαθοι*, were called into existence. Whether they are to be identified with the children of the soil of Brahmāvartta, or whether they were the prototypes of the many invaders of that sacred territory; whether their cradle lay on the banks of the Saraswati or whether, one of many branches of a race which penetrated to the furthest confines of the ancient world, they crossed the Himālayas before they reached the holy stream, are questions raised in the books before us, but left (we think rightly) undiscussed. The enquiry which originates in them

\* Is Patal but another exemplification of the same process of thought? Did it derive its name from the famous Pátaliputra? The verbal resemblance, it may be objected at the outset, is imperfect; but General Cunningham reduces the latter word to an original form of Patali, and the remaining difficulty of the one word having a dental, and the other a cerebral *t*, is any thing but insuperable, for many words are spelt with either indiscriminately. And the analogy does not end here. Patal is not mentioned among the numerous regions of the Pandemonium described by Manu; and "in India alone, perhaps only in Northern India, the notion of an infernal serpent-kingdom had taken root, and there alone the new religions adopted it;\*" which would indicate that any name applied to it must

\* *Calcutta Review*,  
October 1870, p. 332.

be of Indian origin and bestowed on it at a more recent date than the idea assumed shape. It is at least unlikely that the idea of Patal, in accordance with the present notions of the Hindús, should have first found birth in their minds, and that a city should subsequently be discovered on earth to reproduce exactly the phenomena said to exist in a visionary world. The serpentine denizens of the one tally closely with

the Scšnága dynasty, founders and monarchs of the other; the language of the one, Nágbbhāshā, is a Prakrit, and a well-known Prakrit dialect owes its name of Páli apparently to an abbreviated form of the latter seen in Palibothra, and an alternative name of Makata Pasa, or Magadha Bhāshā to the kingdom of which Palibothra is the capital. The subterranean locality of the one may not improbably be ascribed to the semitroglydotic habits said to be generally prevalent in Scythian countries,\* which the in-

\* Latham I, 351. vaders may have attempted to keep up until they discovered the unsuitability of the style of architecture to the tropics; the inaccessibility of the one to the light of day, and its illumination by the lustre of its own unnumerable genus—

Let one admire  
That riches grow in hell; that  
soil may best  
Deserve the precious bane—

may be traceable, in the first place to its alleged position, and in the next to the splendour of Chandragupta's capital; and the lake which contained the water of life would, in a Brāhman's mind, be no unfit metaphor for a spot near the confluence of the Ganges and many of its principal tributary streams.

loses itself in ethnic problems of world-wide concern ; and when we have traced the "great Asiatic branch to two foci not far " apart and situated east and west of the Indus,"\* we may be confident that, by starting from the former, and following the historic lines, which radiate from it eastward, we shall omit nothing of Benoudha's spécial history.

"That country," says Manu " which lies between Himavat and Vindhya, to the east of Vinasana, and to the west of Prayág, is celebrated by the title of Madhyadesa, or the Central Region." Whence it follows, that it was not until their third great onward movement, after they had already colonized Brahmávarṭta and Brahmarshi, that the Aryans reached Benoudha.† And in what character did they make their first appearance ? Were, Mr. Carnegie asks, proselytizing Bráhmans urged by zeal for the propagation of the Vaidik faith the first wave of a flood-tide of immigration, followed closely by a second composed of those who were actuated by still peaceful but less noble motives,—the *auri sacra fames* ? This view is not without support. In the tradition on which it is based (which has, however, been garbled by the pandits) it is said, as pointed out, that it was in compliance with the solicitations of oppressed Bráhmans that the Solar race first approached Ayodhyá ; and, in the Mahábhárata, we find that it was with Bráhmaṇas (and no other caste is mentioned as being with them) that the Pándavas so-journed during their visits to Váranávata and Ekachakrá‡ ; in the latter of which places at least, an Asura not a Kshatriya king was reigning ; and Wheeler confidently broaches the theory, that, at that period, there were no Aryan principalities so far east even as the former.

But whatever was the order of their coming ; whether there came at once a colony or army, numbering in its ranks all the social elements which composed the community of which it was an offshoot ; or whether, as just suggested, the main body was preceded by the analogue of the Jesuit or settler ; here, in Benoudha, in common with other portions of the Middle-Land, it was that, in after days, the Bráhmanic system was to reach its full development — and it seems impossible to believe otherwise than that this end was, in no slight measure, furthered by the efforts of an hierarchy at Ayodhyá. "In the Middle-Land," says Dr. Hunter "the simple faith of the singers was first adorned "with stately rites, and then extinguished beneath them. It beheld the race progress from a loose confederacy of patriarchal "communities into several well-knit nations, each secured by a "strong central force, but disfigured by distinctions of caste destined

\* Notes on Races, p. 5.

but this can scarcely be accurate.

† Elphinstone places Oudh not in the Middle-Land, but in Brahmarshi ;

‡ Allahabad and Arrah.

"in the end to be the ruin of the Sanskrit people. The compilers of the land-law recorded in the Book of Manu, if not actual residents of the Middle-Land, were so closely identified with it as to look upon it as the focus of their race;" and, says the same author, "the civilisation which is popularly supposed to have been the civilisation of ancient India, which is represented by the Bráhmans and the Book of Manu, was in its integrity confined to the northern country termed by Manu the Middle-Land."

But did this civilisation effect so radical a change in the character of this portion of the Aryan race as Dr. Hunter proceeds to delineate? Did the discussion of metaphysical puzzles usurp the attention of all classes of the Aryan community? If in the Madhyadesa peaceful pursuits alone obtained, and necessity no longer existed for exertion, should not the same state of things be expected *à fortiori* in the regions previously colonised? And yet in Brahmarshi, say the Institutes, are to be found the most suitable recruits for the vanguard of the army; and in the Middle-Land, as we have just seen, there was a wider gulf than elsewhere between the Bráhmaṇ and the Kshatriya. That from the comparative repose which ensued on the subjection of the Middle-Land, philosophy and literature received a mighty impetus we entertain no doubt; the same result has followed the same cause so frequently in history, as to have become almost a law of social progress. But we would confine to one—the priestly—caste, separated widely by its own legislation from the rest, what is predicated of the entire society; and conjecture that while the scholar's tongue was ready to discourse, with an eloquence proportioned to the abstruseness of his thesis, the soldier's sword was not allowed to hang rusting in its sheath. Following the boundaries assigned by Manu to the Middle-Land, and bearing in mind the vigorous growth to which Bráhmaṇism there attained, we argue that almost coincident with the present eastern boundary of that portion of Benoudha, which still retains the name of Oudh, with Prayág and Ayodhyá as border cities, there long existed an ethnic frontier as sharply defined as that which Dr. Hunter so graphically describes as having subsequently formed the utmost limit of Aryan encroachment in Bengal. In one respect indeed, and that one of the greatest moment, there lay a greater difference between the two contiguous but antagonistic races in the former case than in the latter; for, in proportion, we may assume, to the degree of development of Bráhmaṇism was the bitterness of hatred bestowed on its opponents; and, so far as the formation of national character is to be sought in historical events, to the 'fierce shock of jarring contrasts,' which the Aryans of Benoudha of the eastern border of the Middle-Land then had to sustain, may, we

conceive, be in part attributed that warlike disposition by which their descendants still continue to be characterised.

To what epoch is to be assigned the advent of the Aryan race into Benoudha? It was, there is every reason to suppose, though there is no absolute proof, identical with that of the building of the city of Ayodhyá, and with that also of the foundation of the so-called Solar dynasty; so that whatever data we have for the determination of the one will be serviceable with respect to the others also. For the honour of founding the illustrious line above alluded to, there are two candidates in the field—Pirthu, of mysterious birth, and Ikshváku, son of the Sun himself! Pirthu's claims, however, rest entirely on the testimony of the pandits; who, confounding his being the first of men who was installed as a king\* with his having been the first King of Ayodhyá, are guilty simultaneously of a chronological, a geographical, and a genealogical blunder. Pirthu and his two immediate predecessors, Vena-Adharmmarájá (the Rájá Ben of north-west traditions?) and his father Anga find places in the dynastic list† of Brahmávarṭta; they belonged to a mythical age long anterior to Manu Vaivaswata (the sun‡); and consequently the Solar race, descendants of the latter, must have in their time been among generations yet unborn. The wish has evidently been father to the thought; and, in the attempt to connect Pirthu with Ayodhyá, the pandits have been actuated by a desire to appropriate to their own city a monarch who, in their estimation, was a model of consummate piety. To him, says Mr. Carnegy, is given the credit—or discredit—of introducing the caste system; and to “prevent the “confusion of caste” § is certainly among the rules of religious conduct he meekly received from the Bráhmans, and as meekly pledged himself to carry out. It was by ‘his submissiveness’ that he attained kingly power,|| and he also gained some distinction by his hymnic compositions—being, we may remark *en passant*, at the same time first of kings, and first also of royal authors. He was, indeed, according to the point of view from which his character is regarded, either the quintessence of righteousness, or the most priest-ridden wretch that ever occupied a throne. But his throne was not that of Ayodhyá.

Ikshváku ¶ it is who, as stated in the Faizabad Report, is said to have been the first prince of the Solar race\*\* and is first mentioned as King of Ayodhyá; though not, perhaps, of such transcendent holiness as Ikshváku, he was deemed worthy of becoming, in his generation, the depository of a “most excellent mystery,”

\* Skt. Texts, I., 268.

† Prinsep, T. N., p. 232.

‡ Skt. Texts, I., 298.

§ Skt. Texts, I., 304.

|| Skt. Texts, I., 297.

¶ Skt. Texts, I., 337.

\*\* Skt. Texts, I., 115.

a distinction which his father Manu had enjoyed before him ; and to the good terms on which he and his father may be thus judged to have stood with the divine being from whom it emanated, may be due the highly sacred and highly eligible building-site which he secured for his capital :—"Not on the Earth "for that is transitory, but on the chariot-wheel of the great "Creator, which will endure for ever." This story of the foundation of the capital may be compared to the shape which (we proceed to read) it is at present said to bear, being 'like a fish ; fishy.'

In accordance with the chronology which Cust adopts in his "Life of Ráma," Ikshváku is represented to be a contemporary of Abraham ; which leads us, in the interests of those who look for the hero of the Rámáyana in the Rama of the Scriptures,\* to notice the strong resemblance that Ikshváku, a name as uncommon as euphonious, bears to that of one of the children of the patriarch ; for was not Ishbak among the sons of Keturah?† This, however, is not the highest antiquity which has been allowed him ; one authority would place him in the days of Canaan ; another tells us it is the general belief that his descendant in the thirty-sixth generation flourished before the compilation of the Vedas ; others again invite us to believe that they are extravagant fables which talk of Aryan monarchs so far east as Ayodhyá at the time of the Great War, and that the commencement of the colonisation of the

\* Hindoo Pantheon, p. 115, and Prinsep U. T., 215.

† Those to whom we allude may further ask what great difference there is between the names of the son of Keturah and the son of Sarah ? And, having thus brogth Isaac and Ikshvaku together, they may observe the general similarity, which pervades the accounts of one of the principal events in the life of the former and of one which is narrated, though not of Ikshváku himself, yet of one who is identified in no other way than as being of Ikshváku's family. On the one hand, Abraham complained that he was without an heir and Isaac was born to him ; he was afterwards tempted to offer him for a burnt-offering ; he laid him on the altar upon the wood, and took the knife to slay him ; but he did not complete the human sacrifice, taking a ram, and offering it instead of his son. On the other hand King Haris Chandra, of the family of Ikshváku, being childless,

promised to Varuna, that if a son should be born to him, he would sacrifice him, to that god. A son, Rohita, having been born, Haris Chandra consented to fulfil his promise (and—the story is here amplified—the son himself not fancying his share in the performance, a vicarious human victim was obtained and stepped into his place). But the human sacrifice again remained incomplete. Haris Chandra finished his share of the transaction by a liberal gift of kine to a Bráhma, the father of Rohita's substitute, a distinction being drawn between those given to him for binding his son to the stake, and those given to him for agreeing to slaughter him (points noted in detail in the parallel story)—this gift being at once the equivalent of the sacrifice of the ram, and of the approval shown of Abraham's readiness to sacrifice "his son, his only son Isaac."—For this story of Haris Chandra, see Sauskrit Texts, I., 355.

Middle-Land was coeval with the termination of the Vaidik period. For our own part, as "there is nothing to shock probability in "supposing that the Hindú dynasties and their ramifications were "spread through an interval of about twelve centuries anterior to "the great war,"\* we find no such inherent difficulty in the theory that such a dynasty existed at Ayodhyá about two thousand years before Christ as to cause it to be relinquished as antiquated or untenable; and pending the acquisition of more conclusive data, we continue to yield it a qualified belief.

With the foundation of a dynasty, a kingdom and a capital, Ikshváku's connection with history, as a record of political events, is at an end. Respecting the extent of his dominion, we may hazard a conjecture. His capital lay on the extreme east of the Middle-Land, and, as we have said, was probably a border city; his western frontier touched Brahmarshi, in which Kanauj was included; whence we infer that in that direction he reigned as far as the left bank of the Ganges, which, as Prayág was in the Middle-Land, may also have formed his southern boundary; and, on the north, for reasons which will explain themselves in the sequel, we doubt whether he ever crossed the Ghaghrá. But we know nothing of the neighbouring kingdoms,—except Brahmarshi—of his relations with them. We might indeed conclude they were of a peaceful nature; we read of no wars; the erection of his capital on such unusual foundations probably presented many architectural and engineering difficulties; and, as he was a Rájarsi of no mean renown, religious questions must have occupied a fair portion of his time. Incidentally we may remark that, if he ever arrived at a thorough comprehension of the 'ancient system, the excellent mystery' which was entrusted to him, it is to be regretted he did not transmit the knowledge to a much-perplexed posterity.

The eighth generation from Ikshváku saw a further increase of the Aryan occupation; such, at least, is the significance we attach to the circumstance that† Rájá Srávasta, the then king of Ayodhyá, built what subsequently became the mighty city of Srávasti; which, as already stated, obtained temporarily almost the same pre-eminence in Northern Oudh, or Uttar-Kosala, as Ayodhyá in the southern portion of the kingdom or Benoudha. From his time, for many generations, there reigned apparently a line of *fainéants*; who have remained in a deserved obscurity, or emerged from it only to perform sacrifices of an interminable length and miraculous character with objects equally astonishing. Trisanku, for example, a wild young scamp in early life, subsequently seeing the error of his ways, became of a religious turn of mind, and could content himself

\* Wilson quoted by Prinsep, N. T.

† Ancient Geography, p. 411.

with no meaner ambition than that of ascending bodily, Elijah-like to heaven! A second instance, already mentioned, need only be again referred to, to note that the Aryan account overlays the story with details of almost endless gifts of kine to Bráhmans; which suggests that the donor and others of his stamp have been preserved to history by the grateful Bráhmans as furnishing 'examples of life and instruction in manners.' To this style of king, however, there were happily some few exceptions; who rendered themselves conspicuous by the accomplishment of works of public utility, the magnitude of which has never been surpassed. Shall we assign the palm to Sagara, who, aided only by his sons—there were only sixty thousand of them—dug up and, with pardonable egotism, bestowed his own name on the ocean! or to Bhagirathia, who rivalling Prometheus with his fire, brought the Ganges down from heaven!

As we draw near to the time of Ráma, and not till then, we meet with names familiar to us, not in connection with deeds of high emprise, or superlative religious zeal, but from causes hitherto inactive, from being those of the founders or the eponymous heroes of district clans of the Solar race. And this prompts the question whether it is pure accident that this phenomenon should appear immediately before the stirring times of Ráma. It may be that Dírghabáhu and Raghu were merely imaginary beings; but the case is susceptible of other explanations. It is not unreasonable to suppose that there was at this time a crisis in the fortunes of the Solar race, similar to that which two or three centuries earlier their Lunar brethren had had to meet; that the prolonged contest, which sprung from the evenly-balanced power of the two antagonistic branches of the latter, was obviated with the former by the speedy subjection and expulsion of the weaker branch represented by Dírghabáhu and Raghu, by the stronger represented by the ancestors of Ráma; that the warlike spirit, which was engendered in the domestic struggle, and which, with the latter, played such havoc with both the conquerors and the conquered, finding with the former no scope for its exercise at home, started the victors on a career of conquest, which reached its climax in the time of Ráma. Or, rejecting this theory of domestic feud, and accepting as correct the pedigree which makes Dírghabáhu and Raghu immediate ancestors of Ráma,\* we may adopt the alternative hypothesis, that in Dírghabáhu and Raghu we detect the revival of the spirit of Ikshváku† the warrior, after it had slumbered through so many generations of descendants of Ikshváku the prophet; and that it was they who inaugu-

\* Dírghabáhu, Raghu, Aja, Dasaratha, Ráma.

† Ikshváku, like Ráma, seems to

have "enjoyed the two-fold office of king and prophet."—See *Ain-i-Akbari*.



rated that aggressive policy which ultimately led to Rāma's distant expeditions.

But let Ikshváku and others be as mythical as saintly ; let Dīrghabāhu and Raghu be numbered with Romulus and Hellen ; in Rāma—Dasaratha only lives in history as Rāma's father—in Rāma, at least, we have a character, who, it is universally agreed, deserves a place in history ; who actually once existed in the flesh, which (say his worshippers) was an incarnation of the deity ; who was, beyond a doubt, the most powerful sovereign of the age in which he lived ; who first led an Aryan army into southern India and Ceylon ; and, more important than all these together from the point of view of local history, raised Ayodhyā to that pitch of splendour for which it has ever since been famous.

The kingdom over which King Dasaratha reigned stretched from the heights of the snow-clad Himālayas on the north to the broad valley of the Ganges on the south ; while by a curious coincidence, the frontiers on east and west presented to each other a contrast as great in a religious aspect, as that which existed between the physical features of the north and south. For was it not at Nimbkar,\* that the manifestation of the beneficent boar-god, the restorer of the Vedas, is said to have occurred ?—and was it not at the *debouchure* of the Gandak, that the errors disseminated by a later malignant incarnation of the same deity flourished in their greatest vigour ? The capital had grown in the course of ages into a city worthy of its site ; and about this time, we learn with surprise, received a great addition to its splendour from a far-famed local divine,† Vasishttha Muni who, throwing into the shade all the paltry gifts of fountains with which modern capitals have been adorned, presented it with no less munificent a gift than the river Sarayú itself!—the value of the gift being much enhanced, no doubt, in the eyes of the recipients by its sacred source, springing, as it did, from tears of joy shed on a former occasion by Brahma or the Supreme Being, and preserved in the Mānsarwar lake !

The heir to so much magnificence and to such a brilliant destiny could hardly be expected to make his appearance in the world without some assistance to the ordinary laws of nature. King Dasaratha, in strong contrast, says Mr. Carnegie, to his son who afterwards evinced a decided preselection for monogamy, had (*proh pudor !*) no less than three hundred and sixty-three wives ; of whom we by no means regret that we know the names of no more than three, Kausalyā, Kaikeyī, Sumitrā. Can it be believed that with

\* See Faizabad Report, p. 10, where this is said to be the western boundary, the eastern being undefined ; hence we have followed, as regards

the latter, the *Calcutta Review*, vol. xxiii., p. 173.

† Faizabad Report, p. 9.

all this 'prodigality of connubial happiness,' King Dasaratha was yet without an heir! Such, however, was the case; a *deus ex machina* was necessary to remove the difficulty, and appropriately enough found in a hermit imbued with an extraordinary quantity of ascetic acid, who had found his way into existence independently of any daughter of Eve, and had as yet been undisturbed in his devotions by the allurements of any of her sex. But how was he to be enticed away from his cell? Like cures like; a (semi)-homœopathic treatment was adopted; and a bevy of fair damsels, disguised as anchorites, were sent to invade the holy man's solitude; he fell a victim to the artifice, was brought to Ayodhyá; with his assistance a hitherto vainly-attempted sacrifice was successfully completed; and Dasaratha's three wives were all blessed with progeny, Kausalyá being the fortunate one who became the mother of Ráma.

The exploits, of which Ráma was the hero, are generally allowed to rest on a historic basis, however imaginary the superstructure which has been erected on it; to him is awarded the distinction of having been the first to lead an army across the Vindhya range, and his name is inseparably connected with the conquest of Ceylon; but the importance of these achievements arises mainly from the evidence they carry in them of the extension of the Aryan occupation, and from him who performed them having been the "typical Chhatri subjugator of the South;" they belong rather to the history of the countries which were subdued and colonized; they happened far away from Benoudha; they neither added to its territory, nor diminished aught from it; they produced no immediate effect that we can trace on the condition of its people; they exercised no influence on its after-history; we accordingly pass over them in silence; an account of them must be sought elsewhere.

The glory of the reign of Ráma was but as the flood of light in which the sun is bathed before he sets. His sons, Kusa and Lava, '*par nobile fratrum*,' are like Dasaratha, but subordinate characters in the drama of which the interest centres in their father; and there is reason for doubt with regard to their alleged duality. It may, indeed, be contended that to the one is assigned a kingdom to the north, and to the other the foundation of a town to the south of the river Ghaghrá;\* which would point to a division of their father's kingdom by which Lava got Uttar-Kosala, and Kusa got Benoudha. Rájput tribes, too, are proud of including them in their genealogies. On the other hand, if local legends be believed, their memory is perpetuated in the names of forts and towns in the Panjáb, in the Vindhya† range, and in Bihár;

and when we read that their united names have passed into a term for rhapsodists,\* we wonder whether they should ever have existed in any other than a combined form Kusa-Lava; and whether the same meaning might not be attributed thereto, as to Kausalyá, the name of Ráma's mother.†

"After Ráma," says Elphinstone, "as we hear no more of "Ayodhyá (Oudh) it is possible that the kingdom which at one time "was called Kosala may have merged in another," and this seems highly probable; but we venture to doubt whether "the capital was transferred from Oudh to Kanauj." It is with regard to such dark ages of history that we most appreciate the value of the legendary and locally-acquired information with which Mr. Carnegy furnishes us; grant that it has not the full weight of written history, it still indicates the direction in which research is likely to be rewarded; it is, as it were, the sign-post on the road of historical enquiry. Mr. Carnegy tells us that in a mound in Ayodhyá, known as the Mani-Parbat, there has been found within the present century an inscription attributing its erection to R. Nanda Barddhan of the Magadha dynasty, who once held sway there; and, as he points out, General Cunningham has, on perfectly independent grounds, ascribed the commencement of the mound to the earlier ages of Buddhism, and its completion to Asoka. Irrespective, therefore, of the conclusion warranted by what we otherwise know of the magnitude of Nanda's and Asoka's empire, we have almost proof positive that it was Kuságarapura‡ and not Kanauj to which the transfer of the capital took place.

\* *Calcutta Review*, vol. xxiii., p. 165, quoting Schlegel.

† *Ibid.*, p. 173. Dasaratha had three wives—one apparently of his own race and country, and thence called Kausalyá.

‡ We use this name instead of the better known one of Pátaliputra, in deference to the opinion of General Cunningham, who says "Kuságarapura was the original capital of "Magadha" (Ancient Geography, p. 462). Rájagriha and Pataliputra being of later date. (Ancient Geography, p. 467.) He concludes that the building of the latter was not begun before the reign of Ajátasatru and finished about B.C. 450 (Ancient Geography, p. 453); but he also notes that "Diodorus attributes the foundation of the city to Hercules, by whom he may perhaps mean Bala Ráma." Now, Ajátasatru, here said to be the founder of Palibothra, and Bimbi-

sára, the founder of Rájagriha, were both Seshnágs; and, curious as it may seem, there are some grounds for thinking that Balaráma was sometimes confounded with the first of that dynasty.—The Seshnágs are distinctly enumerated among the Kshatriya rulers of Magadha—inasmuch as they precede Nanda the first Súdra—and like the Yádavas they were of the Lunar race; the Seshnágs were the principal patrons of the Buddhist, while all the Lunar races (Yádavas included, we suppose) are said to have been Buddhists. (Marshman, p. 11.) Again, the contests of the Yádavas and the pre-Seshnág kings of Magadha are more than once mentioned in the Mahábhárata, where Krishna—who like Balaráma has been identified with Herakles—is said to have seventeen times defeated his adversary (Wheeler, vol. ii., p. 476); and in that *avatár* of Vishnu, Bala-

The Nandivarddhana\* here mentioned, Mr. Carnegie considers to be 'Nandivarddhana, or Takshak, according to Tod' of the Sanaka dynasty; if so, Ayodhyá must have fallen into the power of the stranger, about the time of the accession of the Seshnág dynasty; and such though not on these grounds entirely, we believe to have been the case. For under Seshnág we know there occurred a Scythian invasion on a larger scale than had yet taken place; and as he overran the northern provinces of India before he reached his future capital, it must be supposed that he traversed Benoudha as well as other provinces; and since, as we have just seen, it was afterwards subject to his dynasty, it is no more than a reasonable conclusion that it was at the period of his invasion, and by him himself that it was deprived of its autonomy.

And what effect had this event on the fortunes of the Solar race? Were they dethroned and banished; or did they continue to reign as tributary and dependent kings? We venture not to be dogmatic.

We imagine ourselves at the invitation of Spence Hardy,† in the seventh century B. C., "in an appanage of Rájagriha, the capital of Magadha. It is an era of great importance in the history of the East; and men are waiting for some event that will decide whether future ages are to be ruled by a Chakra-

râma was a terrestrial incarnation of Sesa (Hindu Pantheon, p. 20); the full name of the Magadha capital also was Pátaliputrâpura or city of the children of Pátali, which may mean (of Gangâputra) that the Seshnâgs, its founders were connected with Pátali or Pattalene, which lies nigh unto, if not actually in, the country of the Yâdavas. Without presuming to challenge the correctness of General Cunningham's conclusions, we offer the above remarks as showing causes which may have led to Balarâma's being credited with the building of Palibothra.

\* If, however, he be the same as the R. Nanda of the Serpent race ("Notes on Races," p. 19) who 'overwhelmed and suppressed the Kshatriyas,' he may be the 'son of Mahâ-nandin or Nanda, named Mahâpadma' of the prophecy—"he will be avaricious and like another Parasurâma will end the Kshatriya Race, as from him forwards the kings will be all Sûdras. He, Mahâpadma, will bring the whole earth under one umbrella." (Hindu Theatre, II, 137):—and of the Vrihat Kathâ—

"As they were wholly unable to raise the sum, they proposed applying for it to the king, and requested me to accompany them to his camp, which was at that time at Ayodhyâ. . . . When we arrived at the encampment we found everybody in distress, Nanda being just dead." This would indicate, by-the-bye, that Nanda, the Sûdra, died at Ayodhyâ, and gives rise to the conjecture, whether the stupa was not erected in memory of him.

It might almost be doubted whether the two Nandas were other than the same, or were at all events more than one succession apart; as while he of the Sanaka line comes immediately before Seshnág, we find that "in the Dipawanso, the Nandas" (i. e., those of the serpent dynasty) "are made brothers of Seshnág, who is elsewhere called Mahânanda." (Fahian, Introduction, p. LXIII.); and if nine successions are thus capable of being huddled up together, one more would not greatly inconvenience them.

† Legends of Buddhists. Introduction, p. xiv.

"vartti, an universal monarch, or guided by a Buddha, an all-wise sage. The most successful candidate for supremacy who then arose was a prince of the race of Sákya . . . . He received the name of Siddhárta. He was also called Gautama, Sákya Singha, and Sákya Muni." His father was 'Sudodhana Rájá,' and the names of both are shown in the dynastic list of the Kings of Ayodhyá; and "there can be no doubt of the individuals here intended; Sákya is the name of the author or revivor of Buddhism."\* It is, therefore, open to us to argue that up to the time of Sákya Muni, Ayodhyá was still governed by its own kings; and that, as no change of dynasty is indicated, they were of the line of Ráma.

Like all things, however, the question has another side. It is a moot point whether the name of Sákya is not expressive of nationality, rather than individuality; and Sákya himself is known to have been a personal friend of one of the earliest† of the Seshnág kings of Magadha. About this time, moreover, at least before ‡ the Rámáyana was written, Ayodhyá received yet another of its many names, Sáketa, which from the above considerations, we need scarcely hesitate to refer to the Sakas—an offshoot of the race of that name, so much better known on the west of India—and to a Scythian origin. Shortly before the time of Sákya's father, also, we meet with the first royal 'emigration' from Ayodhyá. The inference to be hence deduced is the same that we have already drawn from other sources, viz., that Scythian chiefs connected with the Seshnág line usurped the throne, and that the line of Ráma was expelled simultaneously with the establishment of the Seshnág dynasty in Magadha.

From the time of that event, the history of Benoudha is wrapped up in that of the empire of which it became part; and the tradition that after the expulsion of the solar race and the death of Nanda, Vindusar (the disciple of Sákya or Gautama Baudh), Asoka and others of his line held sway, errs but in the trivial particular of giving Vindusara, Asoka's immediate predecessor, for Vidmisára, king of Magadha, the king to whom we have alluded as Buddha's personal friend, who "was converted to the faith of his former friend" when he "became Buddha."

During this period, say the local chronicles, Ayodhyá became a wilderness;§ but even then no meaner plant than the sweet-scented keorah could find birth in its sacred soil. Even this, however, is a gloomy picture, and we are glad to find occasion for

\* We shall recur again to the connection of Ayodhya with Buddhism and other religions.

† Legends of Buddhists. *Introduction*, p. xix.

‡ See *Ancient Geography*, p. 405, which quotes from the Rámáyana a passage in which Dasaratha's capital is called Sáketa.

§ Faizabad Report, p. 6.

questioning its accuracy. To say nothing of the inscription of Nāndivarddhana, was it a wilderness in which Buddha preached for sixteen years?—was it a desert which the noble maiden Visākha and her father, a rich *merchant*, selected for their residence, when they migrated from the capital of Magadha?—was it a jungle of which the Buddhist priests were lords; in which the Buddhist kings fixed their capital? \* “In less ancient times† when waste “began to yield to cultivation, it took} the name of Benoudha, “or the jungle of Oudh. With this period the name of Vikra- “māditya is traditionally and intimately associated, when Bud- “dhism again began to give place to Brāhmanism;” and,‡ else- where, we read, that “Ajudhva was again traditionally restored “and brāhminically re-peopled, through the exertions of Vikra- “māditya of Ujjain.” In these two quotations we have, we believe, the key to the whole mystery. The Brāhmins, we are told,§ having invited Buddhists to their aid against the Kshatriyas did not fail to experience the effect of their suicidal policy in the utter prostration of their influence; and it is not difficult to understand the feeling which would make them ignore the existence of the capital, or at all events preserve a discreet silence about its history, at the time when the religion which superseded theirs prevailed.

If she be not fair for me,  
What care I how fair she be?

Ayodhyā probably existed as Sāketa or Visākha, and was inhabited as it had been before; or, if deserted, it was only in the sense that Ayodhyā is now, with Faizabad in its immediate neighbourhood; but *Brāhmanism* was at its lowest ebb; it was *Brāhmanically* desolate.

But Ban-Oudha—is not the name itself conclusive? *Aut ex re nomen, aut ex vocabulo fabula narratur*. Is it not to seek a Persian construction in an Indian word when we make the ‘Jungle of Oudh’ a translation of Ban-Oudha? If Ban or Ben in composition necessarily have the signification here given to it, it must be so in the word Benares; which on the contrary we know to be a corruption of Varānasi, formed by the combination of the names of two streams the Varna and the Asi.|| We have then a precedent for reading Barn-Oudha for Ban-Oudha,¶ or at least for regarding it as the more correct form of the name; and if we do so, it is to bring it more into accordance with its actual meaning, which we take to be

\* As, however, Sākya Muni, son of Sudhodhana, Rajā of Ayodhya was born at Kapila, the capital may have been transferred to the latter place.

† Faizabad Report, p. 6.

‡ Faizabad Report, p. 2.

§ “Notes on Races,” p. 7.  
|| Ancient Geography, s.v. Varāna-  
si.

¶ Would not the former indeed be the ordinary Pāli form of the name?

the united provinces of Benares and Oudh. Tradition makes Benoudha to consist of the States of twelve rājās, which says Sir H. Elliot would make it include the whole of *Benares* and *Eastern Oudh*; General Cunningham,\* by dividing it into Pachim-rath and Purab-rath, gives it much the same dimensions; while we find from Prinsep† that this is not the only form in which the names of the two provinces appear in combination, for, factor for factor, we have Benoudha reproduced in Kási-Kosala.—“The kingdom of “Kausala or Kosala is well-known from the Buddhist authors to be “modern *Oudh* (Ayodhyá) or *Benares*, the ‘Kási-kosala of Wilford.’” Hence we regard the term Benoudha as descriptive rather of territorial extent than of the physical characteristics of a capital or province.

Whatever the nature of the change effected in Ayodhyá, material adornment or Bráhmanical regeneration, it is universally allowed that it was in the time of Vikramáditya, and through his instrumentality, that it was brought about. It is also generally believed, though a contrary opinion‡ is not wanting, that Vikramáditya of Ujjain is the one referred to; and in this view, the date of the event can be approximately settled; for, in strong relief to the fabulous particulars which form the bulk of his history, stands out the indisputable fact, that he established an era, and that its initial year was B.C. 57.

Now, Mr. Carnegy§ tells us that, six or seven years ago, there was dug up, in Ayodhyá, a vessel containing an immense number of old copper coins of the Indo-Scythic Kings, Kadphises and Kanishka; and Mr. Benett|| acquaints us with a similar fact regarding the neighbouring district of Sultánpur. About Kanishka more hereafter; at present we confine our attention to Kadphises. His date is variously stated, but we have good authority for saying that the Yuchi dynasty, that to which he belonged, were very powerful in the west of India in the middle of the first Century B.C. It flows from this that Vikramáditya and some member of the Yuchi line who, unless Vikramáditya's reign commenced only in B.C. 57, was very possibly Kadphises himself, were contemporaries.—Who, then, was this King whose coins, bearing his image and superscription, passed freely current in the time of Vikramáditya, and in the very province the restoration of which has so greatly contributed to the perpetuation of his name? In what relation to each other did they stand? Were they foes, and did the Yuchi expel his adversary from Ayodhyá rediviva? Or were they friends? Were they close allies? Was the one but an *alter ego* of the other? Was Vikramáditya Kadphises?

\* Ancient Geography, p. 407.

† Prinsep, I. 236.

‡ As. Soc. Journ., Part. I. No. IV., 1865, p. 242.

§ Faizabad Report, p. 27.

|| Family History of the Chief Clans

of the Rái Bareli District, p. I.

Prinsep at least "hazards the question whether Kanak Sen, "(the founder of the Vallabhi dynasty) Kanerki and Kanishka\* are "not all one and the same;" we may add that the propounder of that theory asked also whether Yuvanasha of Kanauj was not one with the Greek Azo of the coins;† and, when we attempt to establish a third identity, we have, we believe, stronger grounds than have hitherto been urged in respect of either of the other two. The identity of dates has been already noticed; how stands the matter as regards dominion? That of Kadphises must be ascertained from the localities in which his coins have been found. We have just stated that they have been found at two places in Benoudha, and from other sources we learn that they have been dug up even at Bonares.‡—And Vikramáditya? We need not repeat what we have said above regarding his connection with Ayodhyá; we quote Prinsep, when we say that "remains of the palace of this Vikrama are "shewn in Gujarát, Ujjain and even at Benares!§" In the East then, they both had the same frontier. In the West, the passage we have quoted shows that, according to tradition, Vikramáditya's power extended to Gujarát and Ujjain, the latter we know having been his capital. And did Kadphises include these two places in his kingdom? As to the first, we can, at least, say on the authority of Lassen, that the Yutchi rule reached thus far;|| as to the second, we consider the greatest proved antiquity of the name of Ujjain, and the actual or possible meaning of it. Under the pen of Hwen Thsang, Ujjain became O-she-yan-na; but the nearly similar word Ujjanta is, with respect to its initial letters, differently treated, and assumes the form *yeu-chen-ta*, whence we may directly argue that Ujjain might have found an equally appropriate transliteration in *yeu-che-yan-na*; and, as there is nothing to prove that it existed *eo nomine* before the first century B.C., its existence then being established only by the accounts which make it Vikramáditya's capital, we know of nothing to bar the conjecture that it was founded by and received its name from the invading Yu-chis. Hence we have dominion co-extensive as well as dates identical.

But Vikramáditya's family and clan, it may be said, are well known. Precisely so; and the fact is one which materially helps our argument. Vikramáditya's father, Jayanta, was one of the Gandharvas, or celestial choristers, who, says Wheeler, were origi-

\* Faizabad Report, p. 27.

† Prinsep U. T., 220.

‡ Lassen, *Coins*, p. 144.

§ Prinsep I. 341.

|| Lassen's *Coins*, 181:—"The Yutchis, whose kingdom Ptolemy describes as still (soon after the commencement of our era)—extending on the

"Indus to Gujarát."

We may be asked why we do not refer to the more recently published works of Lassen; and it may be as well to explain. We have not, unfortunately, the means of doing so.

¶ Ancient Geography, p. 325.



nally an ordinary Hill-tribe, and received their apotheosis only when their actual history became lost in mythical tradition. Another more highly embellished edition † of the same story is that Jayanta, the Gandharva, was for his sins converted into an ass—was expelled from the celestial choir and sent to bray among the asses—a “laureate of the long-eared kind”—on earth. Wilford finds in this, says Prinsep, the Persian fable of the amours of Bahram-Gor with an Indian princess and the origin of the Gardabhinā dynasty, because the word *gor*, an ass, finds its equivalent in Sanskrit in the word *gardabha*, which, with an object to be presently made manifest, we may observe would in the language of the coins become *gadabha*.‡ Vikramāditya, then, was by descent a *gandharva*, a mountaineer; by birth a *gardabhin* or *gadabha*—an ass. The nationality of Kadphises, on the other hand, is also undisputed. He was, as we have seen, a Yuchi; but it by no means follows that he would be so described on his coins. The name by which he is generally known, that exhibited in his Greek inscriptions, is nothing more than a ‘geographical determination.’ It is Lassen who says this; and he mentions in the same place, as a singular fact, that the ancient Scythian empire of Gándhára was situated in Kiapiche (Capissa); whence it seems no forced inference that Gándhára and Kapisa were, so far at all events as Gándhára was concerned, convertible expressions without any difference of meaning. Again, on the analogy of a common colloquial corruption, we may consider that Gandharva§ is equivalent to Gándhára, and so again to Kapisa. In other words, Kadphises was just as much a man of Gándhára, as he was of Kapisa; and to cap the account we have given of the locality of the Gandharvas, reference may be made to the borders of Gándharva (Gándhára)—on the north the *Hills* of Swát and Bunir, on the south, the *Hills* of Kalábágh.

Now Gándhára || was, numismatologists tell us, an acquired province of Kadphises—he took it from Hermœus. Let us imagine, then, which is not improbable, that the acquisition led to the issue of a new type of coin. The legend would, as before, be duplicate; but ‘Kadphises’ and ‘Kushanga’ would be replaced by a name identifying the conqueror with his new province, Gándhára

\* Wheeler, Vol. I., p. 228.

† Prinsep, I., 341.

‡ The fact that the present form is Gadhá argues rather in favour of than against the existence of an intermediate form Gadabha.

§ Gandharva is named in the Mahábhárata as one of the nine divisions of India, but no clue is given to the identification of the name (Ancient

Geography, p. 7; may we (considering the power of the Scythian Empire of Gándhára at the time the Mahábhárata was written) conjecture whether the one gave its name to the other? It is, perhaps, against this view that Gándhára is separately mentioned, but it is not conclusive.

|| See Prinsep, II., 176,

or Gándharva. The preparation of the obverse would be entrusted to a Greek die-sinker. Adding the genitive termination of his own language, would he not make the closest possible approximation\* to the barbarous name in ΓΟΝΔΟΡΦΟΥ? would not the harshness of the sound induce him, perhaps unconsciously, to make such a transposition of letters as would modify it, and would there not thence result ΓΟΝΔΟΦΑΡΟΥ?† On the other hand, the preparation of the reverse would be committed to a native; with him too the word Gándharva would necessarily require trimming. His alphabet would demand the ex-section of the n,‡ the r would be first assimilated, and then, reduplications not being to his fancy, ultimately omitted § and he would engrave the word in the mangled form of Gadapha;|| or first transposing the r and v, he would preserve them both and frame the word Gadaphara. Now, these are just the names observable on the reverse of the coins of Gondophares; and, as there is no question that there exists some sort of connection between Gondophares and Kadphises, we may ask whether, both by direct argument derived from the ordinary literal changes made in the language of the coins, and also by indirect argument founded on the legends on the coins of Gondophares, Gadapha may not be considered a name applicable to Kadphises?¶ If so, we cannot stop there; we must further ask, whether Vikramáditya the Gardabha or Gadabha, the Gandharva of the hilly country, was a different individual from Kadphises, the Gadapha of Gándharva, a hill-surrounded kingdom—whether they did not sit upon the same \*\* throne and ride upon the same ass?

But had not Vikramáditya coins of his own? do not the Gadhiaka-paisa take their name from him? They, too, corroborate our theory. "None but a professed studier of coins," says Prinsep, "could possibly have discovered on them the profile of a face

\* At the same time, Strabo and Ptolemy gives Gaudaritis and Gandaros respectively (Ancient Geography, p. 47); but to judge from modern practice either δ or α might easily be rendered by ομικρον.

† Lassen's *Coins*, p. 31,—see also Prinsep, II., 162.

‡ See Lassen's *Coins*, p. 34, and Prinsep, II., 157-8.

§ See Lassen's *Coins*, p. 31.

|| The substitution of *ph* for *v* has still to be accounted for; but see Prinsep, II., 130, where the character for *pha* or *fa* is said in some few cases to usurp the place of *v*.

¶ Regarding the exact nature of this connexion, or the extent to which it amounted to identity, we do not

stop to enquire. To what is said in the text, however, we may add that the seat of government of Gondophares was the same as that of Kadphises (Lassen's *Coins*, p. 145); and that Gondophares, or one of the chiefs of that name, if there were more than one, lived shortly before the commencement of our era (Prinsep, II., 214, Editor's note), and was thus very possibly the contemporary of Kadphises.

\*\* The Scythian origin of the Kanauj princes above suggested, makes us enquire if the *five Gandharvas* who protected the daughter of the king of Kanauj, (Wheeler, I., 208) are in any way connected with the *five* well-known tribes of Yuchia of Gándharva.

after the Persian model, and the actual Sassanian fire-altar on the other; yet such is indubitably the case." And the following is the response of the same oracle as regards Kadphises:—that we have evidence of Indo-Sassanian rule in the Bactrian provinces, in that, "among the coins of the Kadphises" group, are two gold ones of very inferior fabrication thin like the "Sassanian coins and differing in many respects from the class of "coins to which they are otherwise allied."\* We have yet another link to weld on to our chain, and the coins are again the anvil on which we have to forge it, the material being the legends which lie on them ready for manipulation. But our labor will be lightened, if we first examine some of the links already perfected. We select those which "intimately connect" Vikramāditya with the period when the name of Benoudha is said to have originated, which couple him with the restoration of Benoudha, which render Benoudha inseparable from Kási-kosala. In brief, allowing ourselves the assumption that the latter name may be at will inverted, we find Vikramāditya connected with the restoration of Kosala-kási. The material for the new link may now be examined: the legends are two; that on the obverse in Greek ΚΟΡΑΝΑΟ ΚΟΖΟΥΛΟ ΚΑΔΦΙΣΟΥ which if (as has been conjectured the first word is a synonym of ΣΩΤΗΡΟΣ † may be interpreted "Kadphises, saviour of Kozoula"; that on "the reverse being Dhama Phidasa Kujula Kasasa Kushan "Ayatugasa, which may be approximately rendered *coin of the king of the Kushang Kugala Kasa*."‡ Let us now place the old and the new links in juxtaposition:—

1. Kadphises } (a) is saviour of Kozoula (or Kozala).  
                  } (b) is King of the Khushang Kujala-kasa.
2. Vikramāditya is restorer of Kosala-Kási.

We now feel prompted to claim for Kadphises a share in the restoration of Ayodhyá.

We might obtain further support, we believe, from the symbols and devices on the coins; nor do we think that we should even then have exhausted the arguments in favour of our theory; § but for the present we content ourselves with giving a brief *résumé* of

\* According to our theory, these facts would connect one *place*, not two *persons* (who lived about the commencement of the Christian era) with the Sassanian dynasty.

† Lassen's *Coins*, pp. 59-64. But see *Ancient Geography*, p. 40; Korano = kushan = (*ibid.*, p. 27) Kapisa. This makes no difference in our argument, as Kozoulo the principal word still remains, and whatever Kadphises was of Kashan he was of

Kozoulo.

‡ We are indebted to General Cunningham for this translation of which the exact original is "Kush-anga Yathaasa, Kujala Kaphsasa "Sachha Dharmapidesa," (See *Prinsep*, II, 203, note by the Editor.)

§ For example, Vikramāditya is said to have founded his era on the occasion of a victory over the Saces, who are also said to have suffered at the hands of the Yuchis.

the various points we have yet attempted to establish. The inauguration of the Samvat, Vikramáditya's era, occurred during the time of the Kadphises dynasty,—probably Kadphises himself was Vikramáditya's contemporary; their dominions appear to have been co-extensive. The capital of the one probably derived its name from the tribe to which the other is known to have belonged. The one was descended from the Gandharvas, who dwelt upon the hills, but, according to the fable, was a Gardabha, of which we take Gadabha to be a colloquial form; the other ruled the kingdom of Gándharva, a hilly region, the name of which would in the language of the coins become Gadapha. They both bear on their coins indications of connection with the Sassanian rule. The one is intimately associated with Benoudha, of which a synonym is Kási-Kosala, as perhaps also, the inverted form of Kosala-kasi; the other is shown by his coins to have been king of Kushang Kujala Kasa. The one is reputed to have been the restorer of Ayodhyá; the coins of the other were freely current in that city, at the time that restoration is stated to have taken place; which implies that if it had ever been reduced to desolation, it had been reclaimed from that condition, and become a busy mart of commerce, and that the coins which were in use in it were those of its restorer. These are our arguments: and the conclusion we venture to base on a combination of them is that Kadphises and Vikramáditya were one; that the great unknown of the coins—*æs*—is identical with the great unknown of Indian fable,—the *monumentum ære perennius*.

(To be continued.)

If Vikramáditya drove the Saces out of India, did he come in contact with the Yuchis? Lassen (*Coins*, 181) implies he did, and lost his kingdom to them; but it seems as possible that he was, as we contend, the Yuchi, and that the successors who eclipsed him were Kanishka or Kanerki, and Havishka or Oerki.—With reference to the following passage (Lassen's *Coins*, p. 53) "Basilus Basileôn Sôtér megas oohmo

" (*Ookmo*) Kadphises.—The evident-ly barbarian word *oohmo* probably "is the first part of the royal name or a title." If *Ookmo* be a possible reading, we shall ask where it stood in the Greek alphabet; or put the question in another form, and ask what a Greek would make of Vikramáditya? Especially if he followed the spoken form of the name?

## ART. VI.—THE INCOME-TAX IN INDIA.

THE first Indian income-tax was introduced in Council on March 24th, 1860. Its author, Mr. Wilson, had been sent out from England to deal with a state of things which cannot be better described than in his own words quoted from his Financial Statement delivered on the 18th of the previous month :—

“ Our deficiency for the present year up to the 30th of April, as nearly as it can be estimated, is £9,290,129 ;—our deficiency in the year ending the 30th of April last was £13,393,137 ; and for the year preceding, ending the 30th of April 1858, it was £7,864,222. Thus in three years, since the commencement of the Mutiny, the net deficiency of income, as compared with expenditure, amounts to no less a sum than £30,547,488. And what is our prospect for the next year ? After the way in which we have been deceived by estimates, you will understand with how much diffidence I must regard any estimate that can be made. But we can only, in looking into the future, take the best means within our reach. I have a special dislike to prospective budgets ; they baffle and deceive the ablest Financier. However correct calculations may be, a change of circumstances often upsets them all. Well, but availing myself of the best information at my command as things now stand, allowing for a reduction of £1,000,000, which will appear in the accounts of the present year as compensation for losses, allowing for a decrease in the Military Charges of £1,740,000, for which arrangements have up to this time been made, and allowing, too, for an increase of income from Salt duties for which the necessary sanction has been obtained of £410,000, I cannot, even with all these allowances, reduce the real deficit of next year below £6,500,000, which would swell the deficiency for the four years into a sum of £37,000,000. \* \* \*

“ I hold in my hand a statement showing the amount of the debt due by the Government of India, in India and in England, in every year since 1834. Well, Sir, on the 30th of April 1857, just before the Mutiny commenced, the capital of the Public Debt in India was £53,546,652, and in England it was £3,894,400, and the interest payable on the whole was £2,525,375. Sir, I need not trouble you by quoting the intermediate years, but on the 30th of April this year—indeed at the present moment—the debt in India has been increased to a sum of £71,202,807, and in London to a sum of £26,649,000, making together £97,851,807, and the annual charge on both

"is now £4,461,029. Thus, in three years, the debt of India "has increased by no less a sum than £38,410,755, involving "an annual increase of interest to the amount of £1,935,654. \* \* \* \* \* This then is our present condition. We have "a deficit in the last three years of £30,547,488—we have a "prospective deficit in the next year of £6,500,000—we have "already added to our debt £38,410,755; and with these facts "before us, it is for us to taken a fair—I will say a bold—view, "but tempered with caution and prudence, of our position; to rise "to the magnitude of our difficulties, and with firm resolve, "determine to leave nothing undone which lies within our reach "to remedy so crying an evil."

The state of affairs was such as might well have appalled the stoutest-hearted Financier. The only part of the public which took any interest in politics, was angry and excited. Lord Caning and his advisers confessedly could not satisfy themselves as to the actual financial position of the country, and were afraid to take what they looked upon as the only true way out of the existing difficulties by imposing heavy general taxation. Public credit was so low and money so scarce, that 5 per cents. had only just risen from 92 to 95, and 4 per cents. were quoted at 78; and the huge deficits of the past seemed likely to repeat themselves in the future if no heroic remedy should be discovered. But Mr. Wilson was not the man to despair. "Shall it be said," he asked in council, "that the prowess and heroism of English "soldiers and English civilians—I may even add of English ladies—"were sufficient, even in their disproportionate numbers, to quell "the fiercest mutiny that is recorded in history, and that English "administrative capacity failed in governing a country so kept, "I had almost said, so recovered." The existence of the empire seemed to be at stake. We find the newspapers of the day, seriously discussing the question whether our outlying provinces should not be boldly sacrificed as the only means of restoring a permanent equilibrium. Even Mr. Wilson himself seemed to doubt whether the task laid upon him was a possible one. "I am "sure, Sir," he added in the speech from which we have quoted above, "if it lies within the power of the members of the Supreme Government of India, if it lies within the means of action of this Council, if the European population in India can assist, if the millions of well-disposed natives can aid in preventing so disgraceful a catastrophe, one and all will render their best assistance in the work." His tone in fact was hopeful and determined, but far from confident.

Such were the circumstances under which Mr. Wilson was sent out as the first Financial Member of Council; and the wisdom of his appointment very soon became manifest. During his brief

term of office, he introduced little that was new into our revenue system, and one of the few new taxes which was imposed under his advice proved eminently mischievous. We mean of course the export duty on saltpetre, which quickly killed what had been a flourishing trade. But he introduced an intelligible system of estimates and accounts which enabled Government to pronounce with confidence on the financial position of the country. Above all, he restored confidence to the public both in India and at home. It would have been idle to accuse of blundering the first financier of England, possibly of Europe. The Bristol hatter whose industry and genius had alone raised him to high position—the great authority on mercantile matters, whose whole life had been given up to the service of commerce—such a man as this could not be suspected of acting in the interest of a civilian *clique*, or of failing to sympathize with the independent European community. As soon as he spoke, the bitter opposition which had met Mr. Harington, was changed into cordial support. The License Bill previously introduced was in fact an income-tax on a part of the community. In its original form, the servants of Government were exempted from its operation, and this alone in the temper of those times was a sufficient reason why it should be hateful to the outside world. Even as ultimately amended it spared all fund-holders and the whole landed interest. Why, it was not unreasonably asked, should industry alone be burdened to pay the cost of disasters which it had no share in causing? Why should Europeans be disproportionately taxed to meet the losses of a civil war in which they had certainly not been the aggressors, and from which they had barely escaped—bereaved perhaps of son or daughter or dearly loved friend—with their lives? Mr. Wilson's income-tax did not do all that was expected of it. From the first its yield was far less than had been hoped for; and, independently of relaxations subsequently introduced, it became less productive year by year so long as it lasted. The Tobacco duty and License-tax on trades and professions, which were to have supplemented it, were allowed to drop. The financial danger ultimately proved less permanent than was expected. An equilibrium was restored more by the natural effects of returning peace and prosperity, than by any special exercise of statesmanship. But at the time when it was introduced, the first income-tax bill—pressing fairly, as it aimed at doing, on all classes of the community—at once disarmed opposition, and seemed to be the best, if not the only, possible way of increasing the revenue without interfering with trade or exciting the opposition of a powerful class. The Europeans felt their pockets touched, but they knew that the times were such as to demand some sacrifice from every loyal citizen. The finances were in the hands of a man in whose

knowledge and intelligence they implicitly trusted ; and above all they saw that their opposition to Mr. Hariington had been successful, and that no class of the people was to be exempted from taxation. The bill did not, however, pass without opposition. Numerous petitions against it were addressed to the Legislative Council ; but they were chiefly in the interest of the zamindárs of Lower Bengal, who somewhat absurdly pleaded Lord Cornwallis' Permanent Settlement, under which the rent or land-tax which they pay to the State was fixed in perpetuity, as a bar, in their case, to direct taxation of any kind. No other class of natives in Bengal, and no class whatever in other presidencies, is so capable of making itself heard ; and at the same time, no class is more narrow in its views, or so constantly persists in putting forward untenable claims in its own behalf instead of considering the general interest. As it was in the case of Mr. Wilson's income-tax, so it has been with the iniquitous Cess Bill recently passed in the Provincial legislature. They defeat their own object by uselessly reiterating objections certain to be overruled, instead of aiding in serious discussion by representing, as they are well capable of doing, the general practical results to be expected. The great mass of the people of course know nothing about the matter ; and at all events, whatever their opinion might have been, there were no means of expressing it. Officials here and there murmured about the difficulty of assessment, but they were put down as mere grumblers. And in those days Indian officials had lost faith in themselves. With the outside public, both in India and at home, everything English was good and everything Indian bad. The Company and the Company's rule had brought on the mutiny. The Company's officials were mere ignorant obstructives, who knew nothing of enlightened principles of administration. Every clever young barrister writing in a London newspaper, knew more of the people of India than the men whose hair had grown grey in faithful service among them. Of course the officials did not really believe all this ; but they felt that the tide was too strong for them. They were disheartened, and acquired a habit which has not yet quite disappeared from among them, of letting things slide, and devoting themselves mainly to saving money or to a modest little stable of racers, according to their several tastes. And what was the use of objecting, when they had nothing better to recommend than economy ? The example of Sir Charles Trevelyan, too, was not encouraging. As Governor of Madras his resistance was carried to the point at which it became insubordination, and he was at once removed from office. In fact the opinion of officials was neither asked nor wanted. At the close of the discussion which ended in the passing of Mr. Wilson's bill, he congratulated the Council on the



fact that, though every point had been carefully considered, there had not been a single division. It appears, however, from the published abstract of the proceedings, that the most important point of all was entirely omitted. The theoretical incidence of the tax on various classes of society was carefully and laboriously discussed; but nothing was said about the possibility or impossibility of bringing the actual assessment into harmony with the theory. This was the point where the advice of officials and intelligent natives would have been useful; but, as the question was never discussed, they were not consulted.

However, in the spring of 1860, Mr. Wilson's bill passed into law. Its operation was limited to five years; and when that term expired in 1865, Sir Charles Trevelyan, the recalled Governor of Madras, was Financial Member of Council, and, as might have been expected, he did not re-impose the tax. In the meantime several changes had been made in the law. At first, incomes over £50 a year had to pay 4 per cent., and incomes between £20 and £50 paid 2 per cent. In the beginning of 1862 the 2 per cent. tax was abolished, so that for three out of the five years during which the tax lasted, it affected only incomes over £50 a year. In the following year the rate was lowered from 4 to 3 per cent. Within its first twelve-month the pressure of the tax was greatly lessened by the enactment of a provision that any assessee who chose to do so might continue to pay during the whole five years on the income for which he had been already assessed. As Government had no similar privilege, it is evident that in the case of persons already assessed at that time, Government could reap no benefit from any increase of prosperity; while, in the event of a decrease, the assessment would have to be lowered. It also seems clear from the reports submitted by the revenue authorities, that, at all events in some provinces, the attempt to assess persons not at first taxed became more and more lax year by year. There was therefore little probability of complaints being generally made after the first year, and at that time they would not have been listened to. It was unlikely, moreover, that such a mere trifle as a more or less irksome tax should have seemed a great thing to people who had been in the habit of seeing suspected persons strung up by the dozen by British subalterns before breakfast, and who had recently witnessed the confiscation of the lands of a whole province by a simple fiat of the Governor-General. The tax was in fact looked upon as a penalty for the Mutiny. The people were even surprised that no worse thing had befallen them. If arbitrary forced contributions had been levied after the manner of our Musalmán and Mahratta predecessors it would have provoked no very violent resistance, at all events in Upper India. An intelligent and well-

known member of the Muhammaadan community of Calcutta\* actually recommended that this should be done.

From 1865 the income-tax was allowed to sleep till the spring of 1869, when it was re-imposed by Sir Richard Temple at the rate of 1 per cent. on incomes above £50 a year. In the year 1867-68 there had been a License-tax, which was succeeded in 1868-69 by what was called a Certificate-tax. This latter was, in fact, an income-tax on certain classes of property, but it did not, like an income-tax proper, include land-holders and fundholders. The income-tax at 1 per cent. was estimated to yield £900,000. But not long after the yearly budget had been presented to the Council, Sir Richard Temple left India for a few months on leave, Mr. John Strachey taking charge of the Financial portfolio during his absence. His back was hardly turned when the discovery was made, or supposed to be made, that the estimates were all wrong, and the country was going financially to the dogs. Alarming rumours at once began to fly about, and at the beginning of October it was publicly announced, that unless vigorous measures were at once taken, a deficit of £2,273,362 must be expected at the close of the year instead of the surplus of £243,550 at first hoped for. An additional Salt tax was therefore imposed in Madras and Bombay, and the Income-tax was raised for the second-half of the year from 1 to 2 per cent. For the whole year, therefore it stood at  $1\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. A good deal of astonishment was naturally expressed at the fact of Government being compelled to revise its estimates so shortly after they had been formed. A few cautious old officials in the financial department whispered that there was nothing much the matter after all. Ill-natured people declared that Mr. Strachey had not been sorry to trip up his colleague in his absence. The commercial world saw that the opium estimate had been fixed far too low. But on the whole the declaration of Government was accepted as substantially correct, and no serious objection was made to the additional burdens imposed. It must be remembered, however, that in India there is great delay in assessing and collecting the Income-tax, so that at this time a large majority of the persons ultimately taxed had not yet begun to feel the pressure even of the lighter tax originally imposed. In Council there was no opposition. The Mahārājā of Jaipur, it is true, openly declared that of all modes of direct taxation the Income-tax was the most ill-suited to this country, and the most opposed to the feelings of the people. The natives looked upon it, he said, as a very odious tax, and they would feel it the more bitterly when the rate of assessment was doubled; but at the same time he admitted that the exigencies of the State must out-

---

\* Māushī Amīr Alī Khān Bahādūr.

weigh every other consideration, and therefore refrained from opposing the bill. And he adopted this course the more readily because he confidently believed that when the finances were again, as he trusted would soon be the case, in a healthy condition, the Income-tax would be abolished. The late Sir Henry Durand followed in the same strain. He considered the tax to be unsuited to the country, but was reconciled to it in the present instance by the fact that our financiers seemed unable to suggest any other means of touching the classes most benefited by our rule, and he too trusted that it would be regarded as a temporary measure. The rest of the Council seem to have given silent votes, and so the bill passed.

Sir Richard Temple himself on this occasion, in a brief reply to the Mahārājā of Jaipur, brought out for the first time an argument which he and others have since very frequently used. He denied that the Income-tax was "odious to the people," and argued that it could not be so, because only a small proportion of the people,—one in a thousand, he said—is taxed. It has since been conclusively proved, and Sir Richard's Indian experience should have taught him, that a tax of this kind affects many others besides the actual assesses; and we mention Sir Richard's argument here, not because it seems to us to carry any very great weight, but merely as being one of the only two considerations having any claim to be called serious arguments which have been brought forward against recent opponents of direct taxation. An increase in the rate of the Income-tax was not the only thing done to meet the supposed financial crisis in the autumn of 1869. Savings to a large amount were effected by cutting down expenditure, though in the previous March it had been clearly stated that economy had already been carried as far as possible, or in other words; to quote Sir Richard's not very graceful language, that "retrenchment had been all" ready pushed to its reasonable extremity in order to cut the coat "of our expenditure according to the cloth of our income." But the Income-tax is the subject with which we are now dealing, and these other measures need not therefore be discussed.

In April 1870 Sir Richard Temple's second financial statement was made. In the first place an explanation was given of the errors in the estimates for the year 1868-9, which when discovered in his absence, led to the financial crisis or panic to which we have referred above. The deficit estimated at nearly a million, had turned out to be no less than two millions and three quarters. But the increased expenditure, which brought about this result was—as appears from Sir Richard's statement—of an exceptional character and unlikely to recur. It may be that it could have been foreseen. We have not sufficient information to say whether this is so or not. But at all events the unexpected deficit at the

close of the year 1868-9 arose from such causes as to afford no colorable excuse or justification for the unusual proceedings of Mr. Strachey and the Secretary Mr. Chapman, when it was discovered; and as we shall have to criticise Sir Richard Temple more or less unfavourably below, we the more readily express our opinion here, that in the matter of this so-called financial crisis he was unfairly treated. The Supreme Council cannot break itself up into parties like a parliament. It must act together as one man on the views accepted by it as a whole; but it is clear that though Sir Richard Temple's partiality for an Income-tax may be his own, yet the exaggerated views of our financial position which led to its sudden imposition at a high rate, was to some extent forced upon him. He may accept Mr. Strachey's view now, but he did not do so at first, and if the matter had rested with him, the sensational proceedings of the autumn of 1869 would never have occurred.

But we must return to his speech in March 1870. Having explained, as we have said, how the formidable deficit at the close of the year 1868-9 had arisen, he went on to say that in spite of the increased salt duty and Income-tax, in spite of the large reductions effected, the year 1869-70 too would end with a deficit of over £600,000. For the year then just beginning, the estimates showed a deficit of a million and a quarter if no extra taxation were imposed; and to meet this deficit the Income-tax was raised to six pies in the rupee, or  $3\frac{1}{2}$  per cent. At the same time the previous system of rough assessment in classes was abolished, and assessors were empowered to call upon each individual for a return of his income. Thus, while the rate of the tax was increased, its machinery was at the same time made more inquisitorial, and a powerful weapon of annoyance and extortion was placed in the hands of all assessing officers. For it must be remembered that almost any native of India would gladly pay a good round sum to avoid the necessity of furnishing returns about his income, the amount of which he in many cases does not clearly know, and in all cases is very loath to disclose. From this time dates that violent opposition to an Indian imperial Income-tax which has lasted up to the present day, and which will undoubtedly continue to embarrass Government till the obnoxious impost disappears from the statute-book.\* Not that

\* As an illustration of the spirit Bengali Song sent to the "Spectator" in which the Income-tax is regarded as a "tutor," by a correspondent signing himself Anglo-Indian:—  
the following translation of a popular

"The fruit of so much labour, the blood of the bodies of the people—

"Taking this to preserve their rule—what sort of greatness is this?

"This is killing a cow to supply a Brahmin with shoes;

"The cry of the Ryots is like that of a frog in the mouth of a snake.

the tax was popular before, but in 1860 it was simply regarded by natives as a punishment for the Mutiny ; and as we have said above, if they had objected no one would have listened. The European community too at that time saw that alarming financial embarrassment had to be met, and were ready to bear their fair share of the burden. Moreover the tax was looked upon in those days as a temporary one, and when its period of five years had expired, it accordingly ceased. In 1869 again, when Sir Richard Temple's first Income-tax was imposed its rate was low, and all or almost all the Europeans affected by it had previously come within the range of the certificate tax. There was no reason therefore why they should resist, and the outcry raised by the native papers fell dead and flat like most other purely native complaints. In the autumn of 1869, when the rate of the tax was raised, a pressing financial necessity was alleged ; and though, as we have said, the incredulous expressed doubt and talked about "hysteries in high places," the appeal which Government then made to the public was on the whole successful. But when the new budget was produced, and it became apparent that the financial administration was drifting without rudder or compass, without a policy or a definite aim, simply relying on the Income-tax to meet the deficit created by the reckless extravagance of the great spending departments under the direct control of the Supreme Government—when this was seen, and an Income-tax at a rate rising or falling as might be required to suit the fluctuations of the opium market, the ambition of a clever engineer, or the incapacity of a blundering financier—when such a tax as this was proposed as a permanent resource, and imposed at an oppressively heavy rate, the patience of the European public could last

- 
- "The assessors are their grandfathers' fathers. Instead of a handful,  
 "they fill their arms ;  
 "Coming on the poor, like the King of Death, they go from village to  
 "village.  
 "As a water-melon which may be held in the hand, contains seven hand-  
 "fuls of seeds,  
 "So these clever fellows get ten rupees, when the income-tax is one rupee  
 "only.  
 "The tax used to be on the land ; then it fell on water, and oh, mother !  
 "what will the end be ?  
 "Thus thinking the wind flew away in terror, saying, "By and by, they  
 "will seize me too by the hair of the head."  
 "If this be so in time of peace, when war comes our very lives will be  
 "taken ;  
 "If the watercourses are dry in winter, summer will bring death ;  
 "When the word is given our fortunes flow to the treasury,  
 "As a child might to its nurse's arms when she calls.  
 "Lord Lawrence's reign being over, we thought that trouble was past.  
 "Past is it ? or but coming ? Any one may see,  
 "The dark age is only beginning,—what will be our fate hereafter ?  
 "Lord Mayo's voice is heard. The soul trembles with fear."

no longer, and a violent outcry was raised in the English papers. The native press was encouraged by this support to speak out more loudly and boldly than before. Local Governments were driven, by the dangerous spirit everywhere visible, to enquire more closely than they had ever done before into the real working of the tax. District officers, finding themselves at last consulted, expressed their almost unanimous opinion regarding the impossibility of justly distributing direct taxation; and, consequently, the truth for the first time became fully known, and an absolutely overwhelming mass of evidence was collected to shew the grievous hardship and great political danger resulting from the attempt to remedy by direct taxation the financial blunders of Government.

The opposition began in Council. Mr. Chapman, the additional official member from Bombay, said that he considered the tax unsuited to the circumstances of the country, and recommended a policy of economy rather than one of additional taxation; not the cheese-paring in which the Financial Department delighted, or the extravagant folly of reducing public works expenditure while keeping up establishments almost on their former scale, but real, earnest economy. Mr. Bullen Smith\*—one of the ablest non-official member who has ever sat in Council, a member whose broad intelligence contrasts very strongly with the narrow doctrinaire notions of the present ruling clique—followed in the same strain; “In common,” he said, “with almost all who have troubled themselves to think about the matter at all, I have always considered the Income-tax unsuitable to this country; and the more I have heard of its working, the stronger has this opinion become. From the nature and habits of the people with whom we have to deal, it is a tax which never has brought, and I believe never will bring, into the coffers of Government anything like the amount it ought to bring, if fairly paid by all those who are supposed to come within its scope. It is therefore a tax which falls with peculiar severity on comparatively few, and it is a tax which is attended with much oppression in the rural districts, not only towards people who ought to pay, but to many whom the Government do not expect to contribute towards it.” Mr. Cowie, another non-official member, said “a tolerably long experience in this Council enables me to say, that what is by courtesy called a discussion on the budget, is no discussion at all, inasmuch as no amount of argument will alter the foregone conclusions which have been arrived at. All that

\* Mr. Bullen Smith, as a member of the firm to which the vast zemindaries of Watson & Co. now belong, is a better authority on matters affecting the native agricultural community than most non-official Europeans.

"honourable members can do, is to ventilate their individual opinions." He then went on to express astonishment at the poverty of invention which could devise no better means of increasing the revenue, than two or three turns of the screw of the Income-tax, and said that if it rested with him, the Finance Minister should be compelled to devise some other mode of taxation. Mr. Stephen, as a member of the executive Government, of course supported the tax. So did Mr. Strachey, who took the opportunity of prominently putting forward his favourite doctrine, that the imposition of new taxes is the great civilizing agency from which alone there is hope for the future. Sir Henry Dunsand, while again declaring his conviction that the income-tax was odious to the country, unsuited to the people, and poor in its return, was compelled to vote with his colleagues. Sir Richard Temple expressed the opinion which he has since frequently repeated, that the tax is an excellent one. He refrained, however, as he has consistently since refrained, from producing arguments in support of this view. We must, however, do him the justice of saying that he dissented from Mr. Strachey's singular notion, that an increase of taxation in a new form, which, though involving no control on the part of those who bear it, we are pleased to call 'local,' is an object to be striven for. And so the bill passed.

As might have been expected, a violent opposition at once began out of doors; and the outcry became louder and more angry when it was discovered a few weeks later, that the estimates on which the budget was framed were again all wrong, and that the year 1869-70 ended with a small surplus of £118,668 instead of the expected deficit of £625,594, thus removing one of the principal justifications which had been put forward for the heavy rate of tax imposed. The Calcutta Chamber of Commerce addressed Government as soon as this fact was known, and received in reply one of those illogical and uncourteous letters which the Financial Secretariat is peculiarly skilful in composing. The revenues and expenditure of one year, they were told, have nothing to do with those of another year, and consequently no remission could be made in the heavy rate of Income-tax. The notion of Sir Richard Temple and Mr. Chapman, men without the slightest special knowledge or experience, delivering themselves on the subject of estimates and accounts to Mr. Bullen Smith and his colleagues, whose whole life has been spent in commercial pursuits, is sufficiently ludicrous. The doctrine that new taxes should be imposed and remitted year by year to meet every fluctuation in the opium revenue, no account being taken of previous actual results, is too absurd one would think to be propounded with a grave face by any sensible man. But the gravity of the Government of India is immovable. They replied as we have said, and stuck to the tax at 3½ per cent. Liv-

ing as they were at Simla, out of reach of all personal sources of information, they stopped their ears to the complaints re-echoed throughout the country, and simply denied that the tax was specially burdensome. They made no reference to the district officers who alone could have told them of the facts. Their serene self-complacency was untroubled by a doubt. It is a mere selfish cry, they said, raised by the European interlopers and repeated in the native papers. As for the suffering of the poor—how can they suffer when incomes under £50 a year go free? So the Income-tax and the gaieties at Simla were alike undisturbed. The Government of the North-West Provinces gave ample warning that all was not going well. Here, in Bengal, Sir William Grey was equally outspoken as to the irritation created by the tax, and the impossibility of assessing it with any approach to justice. But local Governments, like non-official Europeans and native papers, and district officers, are objects too mean to be considered by Lord Mayo and his advisers. It was evident to them that the whole Indian world, from provincial Governors downwards, had conspired to bring railing accusations against their pet tax from mere malice and envy.

In March last the budget of the present year, 1871-72, was presented to the Council, and our Indian readers will remember the debate which followed when a renewed income-tax was proposed at the rate of one per cent on all incomes above £75 a year. The estimates of the previous year had again been at fault. Instead of a bare equilibrium, there had been a surplus of a million, so that half the amount realised from the Income-tax could have been spared. For the present year the estimated deficit, if the income-tax were remitted, was no more than £550,000, a sum which it did not require a very striking amount of ingenuity to raise or save in some other way. But Simla had its back up, and was not going to be beaten whatever the continent of India might say. Things had come to a pretty pass if Members of Council, fresh from the clear air of the hills, were to give way before the vulgar herd, official and non-official, of dwellers in the plains. Sir Richard Temple gave it to be understood that the Income-tax was in no way exceptionally burdensome; that in fact so far as he knew, only thirteen cases of oppression under it had occurred in all India;\* and re-imposed it, as we have said, at the rate of one per cent. Thereupon followed a debate such as no Indian Council had hitherto witnessed. Mr. Robinson, the official Member for Madras, after detailing the various taxes already borne by the agricultural population of his presidency, earnestly pleaded against the imposition of this further grievous burden.

\* His words were carefully guarded but they were evidently intended to convey this impression. In fact if this was not their meaning they had none.



"We had no instance," he said, "of the successful application of an Income-tax of this kind to a poor agricultural country like India. He was perfectly satisfied that this form of taxation was eminently unsuited to, and absolutely unfair in, this land of small peasant farmers and moderate proprietors; where agriculture was almost the only important industry, and employed eighty per cent. of an indigenous population; and where, probably, nearly one-half of the average profits of *all* agricultural toil, industry and capital was already swept away by crushing taxation, to pay military charges and the interest on old War Loans, and for the costly administration of the most expensive nation in the world. An Income-tax, was, he thought, utterly out of place, and inequitable amongst an agricultural population already placed relatively at great disadvantage as respects taxation. And the inequitableness of this additional tax on their profits was, at this moment, enhanced by the fact that it operated in further diminution of agricultural profits, at a time when these were already in course of serious additional narrowing under the revised settlements which were being carried out throughout the length and breadth of the land, and were likely to diminish seriously the value of all landed property as an investment and a means of livelihood.

"The Government of India had before them papers from Madras which shewed how utterly impossible it was to assess equitably landed incomes in this country—and in almost every income-tax assessment the land question was involved—without disturbing, far and wide, existing conditions, exciting deep agrarian discontent, and causing much confusion, oppression and corruption. The "rack-rent" of landed property could not be ascertained without inquisitorial measures, and a departure from the existing system of land administration, which would cause serious dissatisfaction. In short, he considered that the levy of an Income-tax on *agricultural* interests, as they now presented themselves in India, was impolitic and inequitable, and now, he believed, happily needless.

"He need scarcely add that the *modus operandi* of this measure of taxation furnished another most serious objection to its needless continuance. In England, there was some morality amongst income-tax assessors and assesses, feeble as this instinct was, even there, amongst the latter. In this country, he was sorry to say that, almost universally, only the worst instincts were roused and exercised on both sides under the operation of this measure. Any one practically acquainted with the working of the Income-tax knew that the whole thing, from one end of the country to the other, was an unseemly and demoralising wrangle between the lower orders of Government officials, and the people of *all* classes—for, from interested motives, the challenge was carried far below the classes intended to be taxed, and exemption-fees were levied by threats far and wide—a wrangle in which the superior orders of Government officials rarely found that they could act as umpires equitably or to their own satisfaction. Bewildering inability to reach the truth,) unfair charge and surcharge, and too often oppression, partiality and corruption, on the one side, were met by disingenuousness and cringing, and too often by lying and bribery, on

" the other. He was perfectly satisfied it was not worth the while of an honourable Government, which was deeply interested in the moral well-being of this people, and in the integrity of their public services, to endeavour to recoup a more or less illusory, adverse balance of £500,000, in a generous revenue of fifty millions, at that price, in the demoralisation of their subordinate public servants and ill-will amongst the people, which was now most unquestionably being paid.

He further went on to give his testimony in support of the opinion expressed by Mr. Norton the late able Advocate-General at Madras, that there exists at this moment a sullen feeling of discontent amongst natives from one end of the Empire to the other. "The vast body of observant and thoughtful men throughout the country"—Mr. Robinson continued—"had testified earnestly that this impost had produced a state of feeling amongst the native community such as had been evoked by no other measure of which we had had any experience."

Mr. Cowie, a non-official Member, would have wished to see the tax altogether removed, but contented himself with moving two amendments restricting its operation to a single year, and to incomes above £100 a year.

Mr. Inglis, the official Member for the North-West Provinces, made a short but telling speech, which is officially reported as follows :—He "would vote against the introduction of this Bill. He did so because his experience of the working of the income-tax during the years it had been in force in India convinced him that it was a tax altogether unsuited to the people of this country, and because he knew that its imposition was attended with very many serious evil consequences which ought not to be disregarded by any Government.

"There was probably no member of this Council who had had better opportunities than he had had for forming an opinion on this tax. He had had to assess it as Collector, to hear appeals against it as Commissioner, and latterly to look after the assessment of the whole of the North-Western Provinces as a Member of the Board of Revenue, and he had no hesitation in saying, in the words used by the Local Taxation Committee assembled last year in the North-West, when speaking of the income-tax 'that it was a tax odious to the people and odious to the officers who had to assess and collect it.' He believed that this opinion was held by every officer who had had to take an active part in assessing the tax. The causes of this were not far to seek. The people detested the tax in consequence of the inquisition, oppression and extortion, which everywhere accompanied its enforcement; the officers of Government hated it because they saw all these evil practices going on around them, while they were powerless to put a stop to them.

"The area of the districts was so large and the population so great that it was impossible for any Collector to make the assessments himself. He was consequently compelled to employ a lot of underpaid Natives to prepare lists of the persons liable to assessment, and

"had to rely on information which he well knew to be untrustworthy, when estimating the amount to be charged on each person. It frequently happened that a Collector had not been in charge of a district more than a few weeks, or even days, when he was called upon to assess it to the income-tax. He was consequently in total ignorance of the circumstances of the people he had to assess, and did not know where to turn to for information on which he could rely, to enable him to form an opinion on the returns sent in. He felt that he was working in the dark ; that with the best intentions, and with the most earnest desire to do right, he was probably every day committing the most frightful injustice. It was this groping about in the dark, this uncertainty, this impossibility of obtaining any reliable data on which to base the assessments, that made the tax so hateful to the officer who had to assess it, and to the people who had to pay it. It was just the same with the income-tax of 1860. The returns of that tax, published afterwards, shewed that no less than 93 per cent. of the assessments were surcharges, and a surcharge to the income-tax meant nothing more nor less than a guess made by an assessor on information which was worth nothing. The guess might be high, or it might be too low, but no one could tell which, and most assuredly it had no relation whatever to the real income of the person surcharged.

"The Hon'ble Sir R. Temple, in his speech on the budget, said it was noteworthy that, on a circular being addressed to the several Local Governments in India, enquiring whether there were any known cases of oppression or over-exaction, replies had been received from all of them (except the Government of Bengal), to the effect that no such cases were known, while the Government of Bengal did indeed transmit a resumé of some thirteen cases. The Hon'ble Gentleman remarked on this that the number was of course a matter for much regret, though relatively it was not large. Now, Mr. Inglis submitted that the statement hardly gave a correct impression of the purport of the replies sent in by the various Governments. He believed that the Government of Bengal replied that numerous cases of oppression had come to light ; and that thirteen cases were forwarded as samples for the information of the Government of India. The other Governments, he believed, replied that there was no doubt that extortion prevailed to a lamentable extent, but that no cases had been specially brought to notice, and it was not probable that they would be ; for a man who had paid to get his name left out of the lists, or who had paid to get off a threatened surcharge, was not likely to come forward afterwards and state publicly what he had done. Though the people suffered in silence, it was none the less true that bribery and extortion prevailed, nor was the disaffection and disloyalty engendered the less general, or the less worthy of the very serious consideration of the Government.

"The Hon'ble Sir R. Temple had said, on several occasions, that it was absurd to call a tax unpopular, which fell on only one in three hundred of the population. Now, Mr Inglis confessed he could not understand how any one who had given the slightest attention to the objections urged against an income-tax, could make use of such an argu-

"ment as this. It might be true that only one in three hundred of the  
"people paid income-tax to Government ; but it was equally true that,  
"of the two hundred and ninety-nine remaining, at least one-half were  
"subjected to the most vexatious and oppressive inquisition and extor-  
"tion when the preliminary lists were drawn up, and that a very large  
"number of these men had to pay to keep their names out of the lists.  
"All this went on, though the officers of Government did their best to  
"prevent it. This bribery and extortion seemed inherent in the very  
"nature of an income-tax in this country, where the population affected  
"was so large and the officers of Government so few. He did not believe  
"that a man could be found who, having assessed a district to the income-  
"tax, would say that he believed the tax to have been levied fairly, and  
"without a lamentable amount of bribery and corruption. No blame  
"could be imputed to the officers charged with the assessment and  
"collection of the tax for this. They everywhere did their utmost  
"to prevent these evil practices, and they protested against the tax,  
"because they knew from experience that these evil consequences  
"everywhere attended its enforcement, notwithstanding their most  
"strenuous and unceasing endeavours to put a stop to them. It  
"was, he believed, no exaggeration to say that, for every man who  
"paid income-tax to Government, twenty paid to get off ; and that for  
"every rupee paid into the treasury, another was paid to the subordinate  
"Native officials ; that is, the Natives of India paid last year upwards  
"of two millions as income-tax, and upwards of two millions more as  
"bribes.

"Everywhere, throughout the country, the tax was demoralizing to  
the people ; everywhere false returns were sent in ; everywhere the  
"trading classes were beginning to keep two sets of books, one set shew-  
"ing accurately their real transactions, the other set containing a care-  
"fully prepared garbled account to be shewn to the income-tax assessors.  
"How unsuited the tax was to the people of this country, and how  
"heartily it was detested by them, might be gathered from the fact, that  
"no Native Government had ventured to levy it, and these Governments  
"were by no means backward in devising new sources of taxation. It  
"was the British Government alone which had the power to force this  
"tax on its unwilling subjects, and the British Government even could  
"levy it only in times of profound peace.

"A tax, then, which was everywhere and always accompanied by the  
"corruption and extortion which attended the income-tax in India ; a  
"tax which demoralized the people to the extent this did ; a tax which  
"created such wide-spread and deep disaffection and dislike to our  
"Government as this had ; a tax which no Native Government had ever  
"ventured to impose, and which the British Government itself could  
"levy only in time of peace, was a tax which ought not to be imposed,  
"even if it produced millions ; but to put it on in order to obtain a paltry  
"fifty lakhs in a budget of over fifty million pounds sterling, was, he  
"maintained, most unwise and impolitic, especially when, as in the pre-  
"sent case, there seemed to be good reason to doubt whether there was  
"any deficit at all.

Mr. Cockerell, the Bengal official Member, followed to the same effect. Mr. Chapman, the Bombay official Member though he would have opposed the proposal to impose an income-tax for the first time, yet accepted the concession now made of reducing the rate to 1 per cent., and exempting incomes under £75 a year, and supported the Bill. Mr. Bullen Smith in a singularly able and temperate speech, said that he did not believe the tax to be necessary and remonstrated strongly against any attempt to place it among the permanent sources of revenue. At the same time he administered a rebuke as telling as it was well deserved to Sir Richard Temple's flippancy, by saying that he knew of no special hardship connected with the administration of the tax. "It might be asked," he said, "why he referred to these things? Simply because he felt that we could not afford to weaken, by one single thread, the slender cord of sympathy which existed between us and those for whom we legislate. However we might differ in opinion as to the financial measures adopted last April, we must all unite in deploring the lamentable want of cordiality between Governors and governed, by which the year now closing had been so strikingly marked, and it was because he feared the reference made to those reports\* would not tend in any degree to promote a better feeling that he would fain have seen it omitted 'sympathy.'"

altogether or couched in terms of broader and more hearty

Mr. Campbell, the new Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal declined to enter on the question whether an Income-tax ought or ought not to be imposed, but was quite ready to admit that there was a strong feeling of hostility to it on the part of the taxpayers, the officers in Bengal who had to administer it, and all the local governments, including that of Bombay. He further went on to throw out a suggestion of which, if we mistake not, more will be heard hereafter, that, however hateful to the people a rigidly administered imperial Income-tax might be, a local property-tax roughly and gradually assessed might be the best means of reaching the richer classes. In administering the Income-tax, assessments have to be completed within a limited time. It is physically impossible that the assessor should visit even for an hour all the villages where assessments are made. Everything rests on hearsay and is done in a hurry. The rigid provisions of the law in the matter of appeals, too, seem framed as if they had been with the express object of rendering equitable administration of the tax impossible, and turning district officers, much against their will, into instruments of torture. But if, as Mr. Campbell suggested, all direct

\* This refers to Sir Richard's statement that only 13 cases of oppression had been officially reported.

taxation were local, the well-to do people in each district might very well in the course of a few years be roughly appraised. Mistakes would of course still be made, but the errors of a good-natured Collector would often be corrected by a sterner Assessor, and in the end a tolerably correct guess would be made at the amount of each rich man's substance, especially if the administration were made not only provincial but local, so that each man might feel that in letting off his neighbour too easily he was increasing the burden on his own shoulders. Another strong point made by the Lieutenant-Governor was this. In England the great advantage of an Income-tax is its elasticity. It can be raised or lowered year by year as may be necessary. Here on the other hand the tax at a low rate brings in so little as to be hardly worth collecting, while at a high rate it is not worth the extreme opposition and ill-feeling which is engendered.

The other speakers in this now celebrated debate need not be specially noticed. Mr. Stephen, as usual, proved himself a clever advocate, and all the members of the Executive naturally supported the bill, though General Norman admitted that he did not approve of the tax. Mr. Strachey, whose sensational proceedings were the first beginning of trouble, denied the truth of Mr. Inglis's statements; and alleged from his own experience that if in any district the people were harassed and oppressed, it could only be from gross maladministration. At the same time he threatened Mr. Inglis with the displeasure of the local Government under which he served. Those who are not familiar with the manners and customs of the Government of India, will doubtless think such a threat to the last degree unseemly. Here in India we are accustomed to them and feel no surprise.

At the close of the debate, the President made a long and, in some respects, able speech, in which the following passage occurred :—

" I was much struck the other day by the very strong observations that were made by my hon'ble friend Mr. Inglis, who is intimately acquainted with the circumstances of the North Western Provinces. He presented to the Council his experience of the working of the tax. His account was alarming.

" It is impossible to overlook such a statement made by so eminent an official. We are about, therefore, to request the North-Western Government to furnish us with a catalogue of the cases which have directly or indirectly come to their knowledge showing either oppression or maladministration as connected with the levy of the income-tax. We are also about to ask that Government to supply us with the names of the individuals concerned, and the officers through whom this information had been conveyed. We shall ask who the subordinate officials are that were referred to, and what are the reasons why the Administration is unable to control or to prevent the abuses described. We shall further ask whether these alleged evils and demoralization are supposed to be

"confined to the assessment and collection of this branch of the revenue. We shall further ask whether, if these evils are found to exist with regard to the collection of this and other branches of revenue, any remedies can be suggested to prevent their recurrence. I can hardly conceive that a more important series of questions could be put to a Government, and I have no reason to doubt that the Lieutenant-Governor of the North-West will give his most earnest attention to them."

The reply from Sir W. Muir is now before the world; and we propose to conclude this article by reproducing from this reply and other trustworthy sources a few facts and opinions to show how the Income-tax really works.

"The sentiments of Mr. Inglis," Sir William Muir's Government replied, "are shared more or less by probably three-fourths of the officers in these provinces who have had an opportunity of forming an opinion; and His Honor has found with hardly an exception that those officers possessed of the most experience and judgment, coincide to a large extent in the views and impressions of Mr. Inglis. They do not indeed pretend to certify the degree or the amount of bribery and corruption, which they think was put incautiously by him into too definite a shape, and asserted with too universal and sweeping a condemnation. But taking these statements as figures-of-speech, and as expressive of a very general prevalence of oppression and corruption, they are speaking broadly at one with him." \* \* \* \* "It was not the superior agency of the tehseeldars from which the oppression chiefly proceeded. Where, indeed, they were inclined to be corrupt, they no doubt had large opportunities; and it would be surprising if, considering the venial character of bribery in the eyes of native society, they were everywhere and without exception proofs against the temptation. But we may hope that, as a rule, they were proof." "The real delinquents and oppressors of the country were, as the Lieutenant-Governor understands the complaint, the underlings through whom the tehseeldars or superior officers were, as a matter of necessity, obliged to work. How else could the tehseeldar proceed where there were hundreds of villages and thousands of persons, whose means were to be tested—a process necessarily involving local investigation and local knowledge. There was no other machinery to his hand; he was obliged to use it. And yet no one who knows anything of native character should doubt that putwarees and small officials having such a commission, would, in the execution of it, attend to their own interests." \* \* \* \* "Such, though susceptible of proof only in rare and exceptional cases, is the oppressive manner in which the tax is believed by our most experienced officers to

"have worked. It will perhaps be asked why this bribery and extortion has not more frequently come to light? The answer is—why should it? The people were only too glad to pay and be free; why should they complain of a benefit believed to have been cheaply purchased?" \* \* \* \* "How far the unpopularity of the tax is due to payment of this kind made to escape taxation, and how far to a sense of the liability to over-assessment owing to the arbitrary nature of the tax and hopelessness of redress and appeal, the Lieutenant-Governor is unable to say. But so much His Honour may say, without any hesitation, that in the course of a long service in India, he has never witnessed anything approaching the popular discontent created by the Income-tax during the last two years. In many places the Lieutenant-Governor's camp was besieged with complainants, and yet in taking up individual cases, it was almost impossible, from the nature of the case and the absence of data, to determine in any single instance that injustice had been done. The same may be said of the Commissioner, and the same of the Collector; when they amended the assessment, it was more by a sort of intuition that something was wrong, than from any distinct evidence of a specific overcharge."

Sir William Muir's reply enclosed letters from both the members of the Board of Revenue, in which reference was made to a previous demi-official communication, stating the Board's belief that great extortion was practised by the native officials to whom the assessment of the tax was necessarily entrusted, in the form of enforced payment of sums levied as black-mail by the assessing officer, and paid by the people with the view of securing the exclusion of their names from the Income-tax list, or for their inclusion in a lower grade. This confidential communication must apparently have escaped Sir Richard Temple's memory when he spoke of only 13 cases of oppressions having been officially reported; since it cannot be supposed that he intended to make a mere quibble on the word "officially." However that may be, these later letters from the members of the Board are thoroughly explicit. "I believe," Mr. Reid says, "that Mr. Inglis was quite within the mark when he stated that natives of India have paid as much in the form of bribes to escape payment of the tax, as they have paid into the Government treasury as Income-tax;" and again "I go entirely with Mr. Inglis, when he charges the Income-tax with demoralizing the people by the inducement which it holds out to the preparation of two sets of accounts,—one for the trader, and the other for the Government officer." Mr. Mayne, the junior member of the Board, writes in the same strain:—"It is idle," he says, "to call for a catalogue of cases showing oppression and maladministration."



"It is useless to ask the names of individuals concerned. A few cases of this kind may be counted, a few offenders handed over to justice; but in the nature of things very few of these cases are ever brought to notice." \* \* \* \* "But it is nevertheless true in my belief that cases of this kind are innumerable, and that they do cause and have caused an amount of irritation and dissatisfaction throughout the country, which is most deplorable, and may be not unattended with danger. It is easy to suggest to the Local Government to adopt remedies to prevent such things happening. There is no remedy save in the total abolition of the tax."

The Resolution recorded upon this by the Financial Department was of a character, which is very much to be regretted. Irritated, as it would seem, by finding that Sir William Muir supported Mr. Inglis, the Supreme Government assumed that the hardship proved to have been inflicted by the tax, was due to maladministration; and in a tone which should never be adopted in official correspondence—least of all in a communication addressed to the Lieutenant-Governor of a province—expressed the Governor General's surprise that such maladministration should have been allowed to exist. At the same time, strict orders were given, that no officer of lower position than a tehsildar should in future be allowed to make assessments. Reference was also made to reports giving a comparatively favourable account of the working of the tax, which were submitted in the beginning of the year 1861 by Sir William Muir as a member of the Board of Revenue, and Sir George Elphinstone as Lieutenant-Governor, with the evident intention of casting a slur upon the present administration.

Sir William Muir's reply to this has not been published *in extenso*, but extracts from it which have appeared in one of the Calcutta papers\* seem to show that it was absolutely crushing. With respect to the employment of officers below the rank of tehsildars, it was sufficient to explain that no such officers ever had been employed in making assessments. It is in the enquiries which must precede assessment, and in the necessary reference to those possessing local and personal knowledge of the inhabitants, that abuses and corruptions are most liable to occur. With regard to the contrast drawn between the present state of things and that which existed in 1861, the Lieutenant-Governor wrote as follows:—  
 "The Governor General in Council has been pleased to contrast the administration of the Income-tax as reported in 1861, with the state of things now existing, and to attribute the deterioration to laxity of control under the present Government. His Honour submits that it would have been reasonable, perhaps

---

\* The *Indian Observer*.

"only just, to have considered whether causes may not have been  
"at work other than want of effective supervision, before assuming  
"and publishing to the whole of India, the imputation against  
"this Government of a lax control." And again "An implied  
"contrast is drawn in your despatch between the administration  
"of Sir G. Elphinstone in respect of the Income-tax, and that of  
"Sir William Muir. His Honour would not venture to place his  
"administration in competition with the Government of that  
"most eminent and lamented Statesman. Fortunately, however,  
"no such necessity exists. For, as remarked by His Excellency  
"in Council, the present Lieutenant-Governor was then member  
"of the Board, through whose agency alone Sir G. Elphinstone  
"worked the Income-tax, and in whose labours he reposed a gener-  
"ous and implicit confidence. The present Lieutenant-Governor,  
"as Member of the Board of Revenue, not only had occasion then  
"in conjunction with his colleague the late Mr. Rowland Money,  
"to carry out the instructions of the Government, both as to the  
"agency and the *modus operandi* of assessment; but also in his  
"circuits had the opportunity of closely watching the results.  
"He has had similar opportunities, in his annual tours as  
"Lieutenant-Governor (which have reached to every district  
"in these provinces excepting Bundlekund and the Jhansie  
"Division), of watching the present system; and he is able from  
"personal knowledge to say, that there were no precautions  
"enjoined in 1861 which are not now enjoined; and that there  
"is not any lower agency now made use of that was not then  
"employed." We have said enough already to show what a wide  
"difference there is between the circumstances under which Mr.  
"Wilson's Income-tax was imposed, and those of the present  
"day; and the following passage from Sir William Muir's rejoinder  
"throws further light upon the point:—"It is also certain that as the  
"people became familiar with the working of the tax, they learned  
"the comparative helplessness of Government in the ascertainment  
"of real income and the checking of evasion; an antagonism has  
"thus grown up between the people and the Government assessors,  
"which has not tended to the popularity of the measure. For  
"the same reason, their experience of the vagueness of the grounds  
"we have to go upon, has no doubt emboldened those through  
"whom the assessors are obliged to make their investigations, to  
"profit by our ignorance. It is not surprising that people so venal  
"in their habits should rapidly become more practised adepts in  
"corruption, and should be able year by year to turn the oppor-  
"tunity to better account." In spite, too, of the total absence of  
"earnest enquiry into its working and the meagre reports sent in  
"from all provinces on Mr. Wilson's tax, there is quite enough evi-  
"dence on record to show that the state of things was really not much

better than than in later years. Thus in the North-West Provinces the number of cases in which the returns furnished by assesses were accepted as correct, was only 3·3 per cent. In the remaining 96·7 per cent. of cases, therefore, assessments were made by guess-work. The report from the same provinces for that year says "the returns were if possible more useless in 1861-62 than they were in 1860-61. In the first year of the tax there seems "to have been a hope that if a plausible return were made out, "it might be accepted; there was, too, some fear of the severe "penalties contained in the Act. The people also had not in "1860-61 recovered from the abnormal dread of offending caused "by the Penal Code, and the events out of which the tax originated. "But it seems to have been felt in 1861-62 that the safest course "was to enter incomes at the lowest amount possible." Again we find that in the year 1860-61 the tax was so "unduly pressed" in the district of Goruckpore, that a falling off of 24·3 per cent. in the following year could not be wondered at. This hardly seems to imply that the tax in those days worked well.

The opinions of various local officers which are quoted in an appendix to the N. W. Provinces Income-tax report for the year 1870-71 show very clearly some of the indirect evils, which it produces. Thus the Collector of Saharunpore says:—"It is not only a mistake "financially, but it is a mistake politically: it raises up discontent "and irritation among the people; it is demoralising to the subord- "inate officials who assist us in assessing it; worst perhaps of all "it weakens our administration and lessens our power of doing good, "by undermining and destroying the influence of our district "officers. The same people who many years ago, used to crowd "round and delight to talk to a district officer when he visited "their villages, now distrust him and fly from him because he "is a tax-collector. A district officer can hardly ask a ques- "tion from a native now without exciting the suspicion that he is "trying to worm out some information about his or his neighbour's "income. It is our duty, unfortunately, as servants of Government, "to assess this tax. But still it is also our duty to protest as "loudly as we can against it—to point out the evils attending "it—in the hope that some day the Supreme Government may "listen to us, and may be convinced that the tax is not one which "is suited to India." Other testimony is given to the same effect which we have not space to quote.

No one who has read what we have said above will hesitate to accept as substantially correct Mr. Inglis's account of the *Income-tax* in the North-West Provinces. But it may be said, and doubtless will be said, that the case is exceptional; that in other provinces there are not the same difficulties of administration. So far, however, as Bengal proper is concerned, this notion is

entirely refuted by the Board's Income-tax report for the year 1870-71 ; and the evidence of this report is the more valuable as coming from Mr. Alonzo Money, one of the very few officers of experience and ability who regard the Income-tax with a modified approval. Indeed, the circumstances of Bengal proper are in some respects specially unfavourable. It is true that the province contains a large number of tolerably wealthy persons of the middle class from whom an ideal Income-tax might very justly be levied. But the practical difficulties in the way of correct assessment are probably greater than in any other part of the country. Elsewhere some sort of subordinate executive establishment connects Government with the people. In Bengal there is nothing of the kind ; and its forty millions of inhabitants have to be assessed by some hundred and fifty officers, the majority of whom are already overburdened with other work. Sir Richard Temple will doubtless point out that though the people are many, the assesseees are comparatively few ; but this does not much affect the case. Assesseees do not live in a special part of each town or district, nor can they be collected together by whistling for them. They have to be searched out in every village. It was doubtless slow work collecting gold from the bed of Pactolus, though compared with the sands in which they lay hidden the precious grains were few. The Government resolution on Mr. Money's report gives an excellent account of the way in which assessments are made, and as it seems to us alone can be made, in Bengal.

" Mr. Campbell's own inquiries," it says, " tally with those of the Member in charge. In Bengal it may be said that while there are no permanent local establishments, the assessors are rarely selected for local knowledge of the country and people. They come as strangers. As strangers it is almost impossible that they should have, or that, during the few days they remain in each part of the district, they should acquire, any sufficient knowledge of the position and resources of the people. His Honour has in vain pressed assessor after assessor for an explanation of the way in which his assessments are made, but they have uniformly failed to give any clear account of their proceedings. An assessor, it seems, asks the neighbours or the ' respectable people ' ; he looks at the houses : he takes the profit of the land at Rs. 10 per beegah, if he can discover the quantity, and puts on something for the cultivator's house ; he makes a shot, and he hears objections. This is all that they can tell. The explanations given in Mr. Money's 25th paragraph do not go much farther. Baboo Jadoo Nauth Chowdry well depicts the difficulties which have to be met, and shows how his typical ' respectable man ' turns out a rascal ; but as regards his mode of surmounting his difficulties, it appears that he merely summons neighbours or the ' respectable men ' from different parts

“ of the pergunnah and gets his information from them. The two next assessors quoted consult the headmen or make contending parties estimate one another, but they both seem to rely greatly on the *chowkeedar*. In other provinces tehsildars and mamlutdars have been accused of corruption ; and especially it has been said that when they trust to subordinate writers, peons, and putwarees, corruption must be expected. But chowkeedars are a long step below any of these. Notoriously the most needy, ill-paid men in the country, it can hardly be supposed that they are very reliable. His Honour is impressed with the belief that if an attempt is to be made at getting assessments in any degree approaching similarity, not to say equality of incidence, it will be necessary to adopt much more systematic measures than have been yet attempted, and to persevere in them for a series of years.”

Again, the position of the zemindars in Bengal puts an almost impassable bar in the way of anything like a just distribution of direct taxation. For it has been clearly established that at all events in some parts of the province, they levy illegal cesses of various kinds almost at their discretion ; and among these cesses is one to meet the burden thrown on them by the Income-tax. The sum collected far exceeds the amount of the tax which it is nominally intended to meet, so that even if all mere cultivators are exempted, as may perhaps be the case hereafter, from direct assessment, they will still find the Income-tax a very heavy burden. It will be said that the levy of illegal cesses should be prevented ; and no one could feel this more acutely or is likely to strive more earnestly for their suppression than the present Lieutenant-Governor. But these things cannot be done in a day or a year or a generation ; and till the relations of the landlords and tenants have been brought more into the light of day, or—and this seems to us a more hopeful prospect—till the gradual spread of intelligence and wealth has put the ryots in a position to hold their own better than at present, an Income-tax, or a road cess, or any other impost which the zemindar can shift on to the shoulders of his tenants, is sure to throw a grievous burden on those least able to bear it.

There is much more to be said. We might quote opinions without number in support of our view. We might tell of cases by the score in which men, having been assessed and prosecuted and fined, when the few brass pots which were their only wealth had been sold, were found to be paupers. We could tell of others driven across the frontier into Nepal to avoid the hated tax-gatherer. But it is not our object to appeal to the feeling which such cases of grievous hardship, however isolated they might be, would be sure to excite. We simply desire to lay the plain broad facts before our readers. The subject will be forced upon their

attention, when next year's budget is declared ; and it is well to consider it now. Whether Lord Mayo's Government will give the tax up altogether, or hand it over to Local Governments, or stick to it in its present form, there are no means of saying ; but we cannot but hope that they will determine on getting rid of this most obvious and not least efficient cause of the rancour and distrust which pervade the country. A tax at one per cent. continued from a previous year is of course a light thing compared with one imposed for the first time at a heavy rate ; and year by year, if fresh assessments are not pressed, it will be less and less felt. But the fact that direct taxation in India only ceases to be grievously oppressive by becoming at the same time unproductive, is in itself sufficient to condemn it. Assuming for the sake of argument that the advocates of an Income-tax are in the right, it is nevertheless undeniable that the whole country is bitterly opposed to them. There is no distinction in this matter between native and European, official and non-official. The *Bengalee* is at one with the *Patriot*, and the *Englishman* with the *Amrita Bazar Patrika*. Surely then, some sacrifice might well be made in order to remove such a constant source of hostility and distrust between Governors and governed. In India above all other countries it is necessary that Government should be conducted by statesmen, not by arithmeticians ; and we cannot but hope that even at this eleventh hour Lord Mayo's Government will decide on making a concession which, if not granted now, will one day be forced on them or their successors ; and will either extinguish the tax altogether or at least hand it over to Local Governments to deal with as they please.

---

## ART. VII.—REMINISCENCES OF AVA.

**F**EW nations in the world have such interminable histories and profess such a refined pleasure in reading them, as the subjects of our interesting ally, the King of Ava ; and yet there is considerable reason to doubt if any large number of persons outside of Ava have any clear apprehension of the sequence of events in the annals of that once famous empire. Unfortunately the so-called Burmese chronicles, which have been compiled by Burmese scribes, are of little value to European readers ; and it may be inferred that not even a Gibbon or a Macaulay could place a select stock of facts in a form which should be at once readable and philosophical. Accordingly, it seems desirable to disclaim at starting all intention of writing an historical essay ; and simply to confess that the only object of the present paper is to attempt to embody such reminiscences of Ava during the last generation or two, as may be gathered from old travellers and personal experiences.

Here some preliminary explanation is necessary. Of Burmah and its people something has been already written in a previous review. In the present article nothing is intended beyond a little gossip about old Ava politics, and the reproduction of half-forgotten anecdotes of Burmah and its court and capital, such as Horace Walpole might have dearly loved, and such as perhaps no one, with inferior powers, could ever hope to preserve from oblivion. Fortunately for ourselves, and perchance for our readers, we are in a position to incorporate in our gossip the reminiscences of a gentleman, who has perhaps seen more of the old Courts of Ava and Amarapoora than any living man ; and by his kind permission we are enabled to string our little facts and observations in the form of a personal sketch, which at any rate will serve to give life and reality to our small details.

Mr. R. S. Edwards, late Collector of Customs at Rangoon, has recently retired from the service of the British Government after an official career of more than fifty years ; and he still retains a vivid recollection of old times and old scenes which have long since passed away from India and Burmah. He was born at Madras in 1802, just three years after the overthrow of Tippú Sultan and the capture of Seringapatam ; in the days when there was no club and no cathedral, when the Nilgiri Hills were as little known as the mountains of Thibet, when Lord William Bentinck was Governor of Madras, and when the glorious little man, the far-seeing Marquis of Wellesley, was engaged in the all-important task of delivering India from the oppression of Mahratta supre-

macy. In those days Calcutta was already becoming a City of Palaces. The old Government House where Warren Hastings and Philip Francis quarrelled and fought, and which until a late period formed the public treasury, was being transferred to the spacious building which was then rapidly rising amidst the jungle of Chowringhee. Madras, however, was little more than a group of villages, with Fort St. George and Black Town on the strand, facing the sea; and was fast losing the importance which it had enjoyed in the days when Haidar and Tippú dominated over the south, and the French were in the ascendant in the Deccan. Anglo-Indian Society was altogether different from what it is now. Communication with England was about once a year. Houses were small, and *puukahs* far from universal; life, though occasionally short, was generally genial and convivial; whilst there was a far higher tone in general society than existed in the days when English nabobs maintained Indian *zanânas*.

Our object, however, is not to revive recollections of old India, but of old Burmah; and the times when Mr. Edwards was a boy at Madras, may be sufficiently indicated by saying that he remembers the mutiny at Vellor, the arrival of Sir George Barlow at Madras in supersession of Lord William Bentinck, the completion of St. George's Church on the Choultry plain, the construction of the stone-bridge across the Madras river at Chintradapettah. He can also recollect the battle of Waterloo, and the settlement of the Emperor Napoleon at St. Helena.

Mr. Edwards was educated at Madras; and was sent in 1819, at the age of seventeen, to the Straits Settlement to be a clerk in the office of Mr. Maingay, the Superintendent of Wellesley, which had been ceded to the British Government about the commencement of the century by the King of Quedah. This once notorious potentate is now utterly forgotten; and in order to revive his memory, and call up some picture of Wellesley and its surroundings, it will be necessary to glance at the history of the Straits Settlements in the days of yore.

Quedah is a small territory on the western coast of Malacca, some distance to the south of Burmah, and almost immediately opposite the northern portion of the Island of Sumatra. The King of Quedah was a tributary of the King of Siam; but he was often virtually independent. He was a coarse and barbarous Malay chief, half Musalmán and half Pagan, whose chief pleasures consisted in adding new inmates to his Malay haram. Captain Hamilton, who visited the place about the beginning of the last century, says that the country produced tin, pepper, elephant's teeth, canes and a gum that was used for making tar and pitch; and that the King was poor, proud and beggarly, exacting presents on all occasions from merchant strangers.



In 1785 Captain Light, the Commander of a country vessel touched at Quedah ; and under circumstances which are now altogether forgotten, he married the daughter of the so-called King, and received the Island of Penang as the dowry of his Malay bride, subject to a yearly tribute to her father. This island is situated off the coast of Quedah, and was known for some time as Prince of Wales's Island. Captain Light offered it to the late East India Company, and as it was covered with an immense forest of ship-building timber, the Directors gladly accepted it with the view of making the settlement a great ship-building depôt and arsenal. Of course, under such circumstances, Captain Light was the first Governor of Penang ; but whether he obtained the post as one of the conditions of the transfer, or whether it was given to him out of gratitude, is somewhat problematical. It will suffice to say that his pay as Governor was Rs. 2,500 per mensem ; and that he had three members of council on Rs. 1,300 per mensem each, and a regular staff of Secretary and Assistant Secretary. It would thus appear that the worthy Captain made a very fair capital out of his dusky lady ; and His Majesty the King of Quedah did not do amiss, as the East India Company was induced to give him six thousand dollars yearly as an equivalent for all claims on the revenue of Penang.

Financially the settlement did not for some years turn out a success. The expenses were enormous, and had to be defrayed by Bengal. In those halcyon times there were no competition-wallahs educated for their posts ; but posts were created as a provision for such gentleman failures as sons-in-law, helpless cousins, and " ne'er do weels." Penang was thus a god-send to the Directors ; whilst Bengal was the milch cow that supported it. The administration of the island could not therefore be expected to yield any profit ; and thus whilst the timber was good, the expence of building a ship was three times at Penang what it would have been at Rangoon or Bassein. The climate was at the same time most unhealthy. Captain Light managed to live until 1794 ; but Mrs. Light, who always went by the name of the Queen of Quedah, was still living in 1819, when Mr. Edwards saw her. By this time the old lady, like ancient Malay beauties in general, had lost those youthful attractions by which she had won the heart of her sea-faring admirer. Her daughters, however, were fair to look upon, and one of them married a young English officer who died a General only a few years ago.

At the end of the last century the malaria of the Penang jungle was deadly. The successors of Captain Light, and the European officials generally, died off almost as rapidly as if they had been posted on the western coast of Africa. It was to obviate

this mortality and to provide a sanatorium, that the cession of a tract of land on the main coast was obtained from the King of Quedah in 1800, and dignified with the name of Wellesley after the name of the reigning Governor-General.

Wellesley, however, proved to be at that time as unhealthy as the island of Penang. When Mr. Edwards landed there in 1819, this unhealthiness still continued, and Europeans were carried off by fever and dysentery in a manner sufficient to inspire their survivors with the deepest melancholy. The Chinese were already settling in Penang; but they do not so much fear death; and indeed, familiarise themselves with it by ordering their coffins on their wedding-day, and keeping the decorated boxes ready for the melancholy occasion. An Englishman takes a practical view and will readily go to an unhealthy climate, provided the pay is increased, especially as the frequency of casualties facilitates promotion. Thus it was found necessary at Penang and Wellesley to double the salaries of all the European officials by substituting dollars for rupees; by which process the pay of the Governor of Penang was increased to Rs. 5,000 per mensem. No one in those remote times and regions ever dreamed of taking out a European wife to these settlements; or if he did dream of such a thing he never realised it. Connubial felicity, such as it was, was invariably shared with a Malay partner; and the unions were to all intents and purposes real marriages. The Malacca ladies were at that period said to have been very docile and obedient; a circumstance which scandal attributed to the goodness of the Malacca canes, especially those which are known as Penang lawyers. What Malacca ladies are in the present day nobody seems to know.

Few people out of the tropics can realise the quiet jog-trot of an office establishment of clerks in India or Burmah. Mr. Edwards was head of the Wellesley office on a salary of Rs. 200 per mensem; and in those days such a salary went a long way. It appeared, however, that whilst the King of Quedah was very regular in his demands upon the British Government, he was very irregular in the payment of his tribute to Siam; and in 1822 he withheld it altogether. The non-payment of tribute has been the cause of almost every Asiatic war since the days of Chedorlaomer. The result in the present case was that the Siamese invaded Quedah, and the King took refuge in Wellesley, but was promptly sent over to the Island of Penang. For some time the poor King lived in sackcloth and ashes at Penang; but after a little while the English interceded, and Siam found it convenient to restore His Majesty to his Quedah dominions.

But whilst these small matters were going on in the southern quarter of Malacca, far more important events were transpiring in the northern region of the peninsula. The first Burmese war broke

out in 1824. Tenasserim was ceded to the English, and Arakán was annexed. Seeing that the English army was really in possession of all Pegu, and indeed of all the territory on the Irawádi river up to the neighbourhood of Ava, it does seem a grave political error not to have taken Pegu, which was far richer than Tenasserim and Arakán put together. The omission to do so only rendered a second war inevitable. Instructions were indeed sent off to Sir Archibald Campbell to annex Pegu ; and thus arises the question of why this annexation was not duly carried out at the close of the first war.

Pegu was not annexed because of a basket of potatoes. The despatches from Bengal ordering the occupation of Pegu arrived at Rangoon all right, but were detained in order to get some potatoes out of the ship which were much wanted at Head Quarters ; and thus when the potatoes and the despatches reached Sir Archibald Campbell, the treaty had been already concluded at Yandabú, under which Pegu was to remain in the possession of the King of Ava. The result is to be especially deplored because the Taline population detested the Burmese administration ; and no sooner had the English evacuated Pegu than they all rose in insurrection from Prom to Rangoon, and attacked the stockade which surrounded the latter city. But the forces of the King of Ava, although defeated by the British, were still superior to the Talines. An immense Burmese army entered Pegu from Ava ; and then commenced those hideous scenes of cruelty for which the Burmese have been notorious from time immemorial. Villages were set on fire and utterly destroyed. The head of a village with all his family and all the leading families of the township, were often thrust alive into a pit and blown up with gunpowder. The ring-leaders in the insurrection were staked, disembowelled, quartered, or sawn asunder. But it is too horrible to run over the detail of such atrocities. It will suffice to say that the Talines were so utterly terrified by their barbarous conquerors, that many fled to Tenasserim and Arakán ; and in the present day the Taline population of Pegu is comparatively small.

In 1825, Mr. Maingay, the Superintendent of Wellesley, was appointed Commissioner of Tenasserim, and he took Mr. Edwards with him as his head clerk. For four years nothing could be more satisfactory than the condition of the people of Tenasserim and Arakán under British rule. They were protected, and they were happy and prosperous. Moreover, they were cared for by the British Government to an extent which is rarely known amongst Asiatics. In 1827 Captain Burney was sent by Lord William Bentinck to conclude a commercial treaty with the King of Siam ; and he not only conducted the negotiations to a successful close, but procured the release of two hundred Burmese families who had been carried

away from Tenasserim in the old wars between Ava and Siam. For his services on this occasion Captain Burney was appointed Deputy Commissioner of Tavoy under Commissioner Maingay. But all this time the Tenasserim and Arakán provinces could not be made to pay ; and the annexation entailed a heavy yearly charge on the Bengal revenues. This was felt all the more deeply as the Burmese war had been very expensive, and had followed so shortly after the Nepál and Pindári wars, which proved so heavy a drain upon the Bengal revenue. So in 1829, the Bengal system of taxation was introduced into Tenasserim ; and disaffection was the result, which as usual found us unprepared.

The row began at Tavoy, a place on the Tenasserim coast, about half way between Mulmein and Mergui. Tavoy is seated some miles up a river of the same name ; and under Burmese rule was important as the last naval station in Burmese territory towards Siam. In those days an official named Moung-dah was admiral of the Ava fleet at Tavoy, and is said to have had more than one brush with Siam. Prior to the first Burmese war this man had a quarrel with the Burmese Governor or Woon of Tenasserim. Accordingly when a small British force under Colonel Mile proceeded during the war against Tavoy, Moung-dah placed the Woon in confinement, opened the gates of Tavoy to Colonel Mile, and then took upon himself to cede the whole of Tenasserim to the British. This transaction was carried out with the utmost tranquillity, and far more easily than by deed of sale ; and Moung-dah, as a reward, received the munificent pension of Rs. 200 per mensem from the British Government, and of course continued to reside at Tavoy.

The town of Tavoy was at that time surrounded by a wall some twenty feet high, with wooden gates. The walls were defended with a few old guns, and garrisoned with three hundred sepoy under the command of Captain Cuxton. The sepoy carried six guns, which were only six-pounders. Outside the town was the wharf on the bank of the river. On or about the 1st August 1829, Tavoy was as quiet as usual. Mr. Maingay, the Commissioner of Tenasserim, was absent at Calcutta. Captain Burney, the Deputy Commissioner, was officiating as Commissioner in his absence ; but whilst his wife and children were residing in Tavoy, he himself had gone to Mulmein. There were not twelve Europeans in Tavoy, including men, women and children ; but still there was not the slightest idea of danger. On that day Moung-dah asked Mr. Edwards for his pension for the previous month, which was duly made over to him according to rule. He had also asked Mr. Edwards whether rumours had been heard of any disturbances on account of the additional taxation. Mr. Edwards replied in the negative, and at the time thought no more of the matter.

The monsoon was now at its height, and there was a very heavy downfall of rain. At midnight the whole town was suddenly roused by uproarious shouting and rapid firing. The few Europeans hastened to the arsenal, but there was brief time for discussion, for it was reported that six thousand men under Moungh-dah were advancing to surround their houses and murder them all. Captain Cuxton, who commanded the sepoy, was prostrate with fever; and perhaps the most courageous spirit in the arsenal was Mrs. Burney, the wife of the Officiating Commissioner. This lady had her children with her; but notwithstanding her feelings as a woman and a mother, she comprehended the position like a heroine of old. Her counsel was brief but firm—to abandon their houses, and retreat to the wharf under cover of the sepoy garrison, and there to get the six guns into position and wait till morning. This prompt movement was duly carried out amidst rain and darkness, tumultuous howling and loud discharges of musketry. Moungh-dah was really at the head of six thousand men, and endeavoured to cut off the retreat of the Europeans; but in the first instance his force was driven back by the sepoy. However, Moungh-dah soon rallied his men, and killed one or two of our sepoy; but all the Europeans escaped to the wharf, accompanied by all the Chinamen of Tavoy and their families; and the guns were soon placed in position and fired at the advancing enemy. Amongst those who distinguished themselves most on this occasion was an apothecary named Bedford. This man had run a strange career. He was a European of good family, who had been educated as a gentleman, and graduated as a doctor, and was subsequently appointed surgeon in the frigate under the command of Lord Cochrane in South America. Unfortunately there was a drunken row, followed by a duel, in which Bedford shot his antagonist dead; and was forced to run for his own life. He then enlisted in the artillery of the late East India Company, where his specialities were soon discovered, and he was appointed an apothecary and sent to Tavoy. Here, as already stated, he gained great credit for his bravery and skill in placing and firing the six guns against the Tavoy rebels until they deemed it expedient to retire within their walls.

On the morning after the outbreak, the gates of Tavoy were closed, and the rebels commenced firing from the walls about a hundred yards off; whilst the Europeans and sepoy responded with the six-pounders. Meantime the Chinamen, to the number of two or three hundred, embarked in their boats and junks, but did not leave the neighbourhood of the wharf. Next night the rebels made a rush from the town, but were received with such a murderous fire from the six guns, that they were compelled to retire, leaving eighty men dead upon the wharf. This repulse utterly

cowed the Burmese ; and from that night they never attempted to renew the charge, but remained encamped after the fashion of Asiatics within the town walls. The third night, there was a rumour that the Chinamen were about to attack the wharf, and orders were actually issued for turning the guns upon them. Fortunately this disaster was averted by Mrs. Burney and Mrs. Edwards, who from their long residence in Penang knew that Chinamen, under such circumstances, are always firm friends to the English. Had there been no interference, all the Chinese boats would have been sunk, and a painful distrust would have been established which time alone could have removed.

For seven days the English with their little band of sepoy were entrenched in the wharf. Fortunately it was protected by a plank roof from the wind and rain ; but all this time there was literally nothing to eat but rice, whilst the heavy rains poured down continuously in torrents. There was no meat, no fowls, no milk or bread for the children, and nothing to drink but water. But there were no further attacks from the Burmese, who patiently waited in the town, in the hope that the English would ultimately embark in the Chinese junks and go away and return no more. Captain Cuxton on his part was so weak and ill, that he could see no possible way of attempting the recovery of the town.

At this juncture, and by the merest accident, Captain Burney suddenly arrived with the steamer "Diana" from Mulmein. The sudden advent of the Officiating Commissioner filled the rebels with the utmost consternation ; but it is scarcely necessary to add that Captain Burney on his part was equally taken aback by what he saw and heard. Immediate action, however, was evidently necessary. So Burney placed his wife and children on board the "Diana," and then ordered Captain Cuxton to attack the town. Captain Cuxton, although almost prostrate with fever, and averse to action without a reinforcement of European soldiers, at once obeyed the instructions of the Officiating Commissioner. The great gate of Tavoy, which faced the wharf, was blown open, and the sepoy rushed in ; but every rebel had already rushed out with the greatest trepidation. The town was recovered almost without a blow. Forty ringleaders were tried by drum-head court-martial, and hanged the same night ; and amongst them was the ex-admiral of the fleet, Moungh-dah. Before this man was turned off, he admitted that he had acted foolishly, but said that the people were irritated at the new taxes, and that he felt bound to join them. Hence the rising. Poor Captain Cuxton died the next day. Meantime Captain Burney proceeded to Mulmein, and brought away a hundred European soldiers to Tavoy. He then steamed away to Mergui to ascertain the progress of affairs there.

But by this time the news of the outbreak at Tavoy had reached Mergui, and the Burmese inhabitants had already begun to show signs of disaffection. Unfortunately there was no Mrs. Burney to meet the emergency. The European officials were seized with a panic, and fairly took to their heels without even waiting for the expected rising. Captain Beasley, the Master-Attendant, was anxious to save the treasure, and therefore placed it on board his own boat, together with his wife and family, and then left Mergui. Nothing was ever heard of the party for a long time afterwards, when it transpired that they had all been murdered by the Malay crew for the sake of the treasure. The other Mergui officials would have followed, but they had nothing but country boats which could not put out to sea on account of the force of the monsoon. However, they had about two hundred sepoys, who could not well be abandoned to their fate. Accordingly Europeans and sepoys crossed to a small island opposite Mergui. Here they were compelled to remain with nothing whatever to eat beyond a little rice; whilst the Burmese remained in possession of the town without any rising at all.

Such was the state of affairs on Captain Burney's arrival. The town was in the hands of the Burmese; the starving British were on the little island opposite. Having picked up the British, and heard their story, he proceeded to Mergui. There he heard another version of what had transpired. The Burmese population declared that they never had any intention of rising against the English; and Asiatic-like expressed their extreme surprise that the Europeans should have abandoned the town. The evidence, however, as regards the contemplated insurrection was too strong; and seven of the ringleaders were hanged as an example. But after the noble example at Tavoy, it was impossible to pass over the pusillanimous conduct of the Europeans at Mergui; and two of the officers, who had taken refuge in the island, were accordingly tried by court-martial and cashiered.

Captain Beasley, who met with such a melancholy fate from the Malays, had previously led a strange career in Ava, and his adventures are thus deserving of a passing notice. He was originally commander of a merchant vessel from Europe, which traded at different ports in the Bay of Bengal. At this period he always appeared to be a gentleman of good education and family; but he seems to have got into some unexplained row at Rangoon, probably respecting one of the fair daughters of the land. Be this as it may, he left his ship at Rangoon and bolted to Ava, where he assumed the Burmese costume and entered the service of a prince named Tharawadi, as a follower or page. Tharawadi became a famous character in after years, and there will be something to say about him hereafter. At this time

he was very partial to Europeans, and treated Captain Beasley with great consideration and favour; and Beasley married a young Burmese lady, and lived at Ava after the manner of Burmese pages. Strangely enough another local celebrity, a Mr. Anthony Camaratta, who is still living at Mandalay, was also taken into the service of Tharawadi. Mr. Camaratta was a Portuguese from Goa, and his experience of Ava extends over half a century.

But to return to our story. In 1824, when the first Burmese war broke out, Tharawadi proceeded down the Irawádi with a large army to oppose the English. His ignorance and arrogance were extreme. Although partial to Europeans, he declared he would sweep the English devils from the face of the earth; but his valour rapidly cooled as he proceeded further down the river. He saw that the Burmese were utterly beaten. General after General, who had hoped to obtain rank and wealth by driving out the Kullahs, were routed with ignominy by mere handfuls of English. Tharawadi accordingly returned to Ava, cursing and abusing his countrymen; and he made no secret of his opinion that no Burmese army whatever could stand against fifty of the English devils.

Captain Beasley had accompanied Tharawadi in this expedition, but instead of returning with him to Ava, he escaped to Rangoon with his Burmese wife, and astonished his former friends by appearing in his Burmese jacket and putsoe. However, he soon resumed his European costume and proceeded to Mergui, and ultimately was made Master-Attendant. But the result was not altogether pleasant. He not only threw off his Burmese costume, but abandoned his Burmese wife, and in a moment of dubious piety married a Christian lady from Calcutta. It was this lady and her children who shared his fate in being murdered by the Malays.

But to return to the general progress of affairs. Tidings of the outbreaks at Tavoy and Mergui naturally excited considerable alarm at Calcutta; and in the cold weather of 1829-30, Captain and Mrs. Burney proceeded to the City of Palaces, accompanied by Mr. Edwards, to place their local experience at the service of the British Government. At that time Lord William Bentinck was Governor-General. This much-belauded statesman was one of the most peaceful and philanthropic of Indian rulers; but his genius displayed itself more in the promotion of steam communication and tea cultivation, and in flattering educated Bengális, than in the successful conduct of political affairs. His Secretary in the Political or Foreign Department was Mr. George Swinton, an officer of a fair reputation in his day, but who has since dropped into that respectable oblivion, which was the fate of most Indian politicals of the past generation.



Captain and Mrs. Burney were received with great favour by the Indian Government. The question then, as it has been ever since, was how to keep things quiet in Burmah. It was strongly suspected that the Court of Ava was at the bottom of the intrigues at Tavoy and Mergui; and Lord William Bentinck resolved on sending Captain Burney as British Resident at Ava. The prospect was not altogether a pleasant one. After the first Burmese war Mr. Crawford had been sent on a commercial mission to Ava, but it did not prove a success. The Burmese officials hated as well as feared us; and they had a happy knack of mingling the most aggravating insolence with still more exasperating politeness, which would have excited hostile feelings in the bosom of a Quaker, without furnishing him with any tangible ground of complaint. In a word Mr. Crawford did nothing at Ava, and was exceedingly glad to get away.

Such were the circumstances under which Captain Burney proceeded to Ava with his family *via* Rangoon, accompanied by Mr. Edwards as clerk. Mr. Bedford, the apothecary who had done such good service at Tavoy, was promoted to the rank of civil surgeon, and proceeded with the party as surgeon to the residency.

The only halt of any importance was at Rangoon. In those days, January 1830, the inhabitants of Rangoon did not exceed ten thousand in number, or about one-tenth of the present population. Instead of forty or fifty large ships, which are now always to be seen in the river during the cold season, there were only some four or five country vessels; whilst a visit from a European ship was a comparatively rare occurrence. In the place of the present range of public offices on the strand, and the streets, the squares, and the pleasant green-fields and lanes, which make up Rangoon and its suburbs, there was nothing but a dense jungle surrounded by a marsh, through which a few villages of bamboo huts were alone visible. The place, however, taken collectively resembled a town; and was surrounded by a stockade after Burmese fashion, with great wooden gates turning on wheels and guarded by Burmese soldiers.

The most imposing house in all Rangoon was that of the Governor, known as the Myo Woon, who was Viceroy over the whole province of Pegu as far as Prom. His residence was built of planks, and was situated in a large compound with a well in it, and occupied a site somewhere in Sparks' Street, near where Mr. Dickmann's house now stands. The Woon's compound was surrounded by a stockade with wooden gates like those of the town, at which guards of Burmese soldiers were always standing. But thirty or forty Burmese soldiers in green jackets, and queer brass helmets shaped like dragons, were always to be seen standing about the house and compound with muskets in their hands.

The only decent road in Rangoon was made of brick, and ran from the Myo Woon's house to the great Shwé Dagon Pagoda. There the Woon was often to be seen in great state going to and from the Pagoda. Sometimes he would be riding on a horse, but on occasions of festival or ceremony he would ride on an elephant, or be carried in an ornamented litter covered with gilding ; and at all times he was accompanied by his wife, who was exceedingly handsome and clever, and very well known in those days. In these processions the lictors walked before the happy pair, carrying the well known rods ; whilst some two or three hundred soldiers marched all round with their swords and muskets. Every Burmese who met the procession, and every European who could not get out of the way, was compelled to fall down in the mud until the great people had passed. In that golden age of Burmese rule there were only four or five European residents in all Rangoon ; most of whom were old ship-captains, who had taken to themselves Burmese wives, and settled down in the land of their adoption.

These captains are all dead now, but their memories still live in local tradition. There were Captain Roy, Captain Spears, Captain Trill, and Captain Crisp. Stories are still told of Crisp, who was a very irascible old chap, always quarrelling with the Myo Woon about doing skekhs in the streets ; an act of prostration which the independent old sailor could never be made to perform except by force, and he was more than once thrown into the native prison for his omission. Besides these captains there was a certain Mr. S. who is said to have been a Scotchman ; but he never associated with any Europeans in Rangoon ; and according to the scandal of the day entertained several Burmese ladies after the manner of a Mormon prophet. Dr. Judson, the Missionary, had left Rangoon and was dwelling at Mulmein. Dr. Kincaid, also an American, had succeeded him at Rangoon, but shortly afterwards removed to Ava.

The Myo Woon was in every respect the sovereign of Pegu, excepting that he had to send a yearly tribute to Ava, and to make handsome presents to the King and favourite Queens. Any want of liberality in the latter direction was punished by a summons to Ava, and the appointment of a successor who was likely to prove more amenable to reason. Indeed throughout the net-work of officialism which covered Pegu, and which still covers the whole of Upper Burmah, the great principle was "squeeze." The court at Ava squeezed the Myo Woon at Pegu ; the Myo Woon in his turn squeezed his subordinates ; and so the squeezing process went on lower and lower until the people were the real sufferers. The Myo Woon had the power of life and death, and very often ordered the most cruel executions. He could also confiscate and fine at will, although to some extent he was bound by the Burmese laws of Manu. Presents to officials of money rice

milk, butter, eggs, gold-mounted dabs or swords, a fair slave or a fair daughter, was the rule throughout Burmah, and was the rule in Pegu until the introduction of British laws.

But whilst the Myo Woon squeezed his subordinates, and was squeezed in his turn by the palace officials at Ava, he was not perhaps so happy as he might have been in his domestic relations. The grand state and ceremonial in which he moved, doubtless afforded him much satisfaction ; but still he was ever in fear of being recalled to Ava, where the screw would be put on in addition to the squeeze. Again the Myo Woon who ruled Pegu in 1830, was in his turn ruled by his wife ; a lady who was a Burmese by birth, but a terrible Tartar in disposition. If possible she exercised even a greater influence in Rangoon than her husband. She was virtually the Queen of Pegu, as well as mistress of the house. She was not, however, the first or principal wife of the Myo Woon. The first wife was kept at Ava, according to Ava fashion, as a hostage for the loyalty of her husband ; and she is said to have been so extremely plain, as to be of little use as a hostage. In other words the Myo Woon left the plain wife to lead a solitary existence at Ava, and then proceeded to Rangoon and married the handsome Rangoon lady. But his connubial felicity went no farther. The Rangoon wife allowed no rivals near her throne. The Myo Woon is said to have sometimes sighed for a change after the manner of Burman Woons ; but if so, he sighed in vain ; for no stern matron in Europe could be more severe in keeping out followers than was the Rangoon lady in keeping out hand-maids. It may be added, however, that when the Myo Woon died, some three or four years afterwards, his distracted wife proceeded to Ava and found consolation in the society of one of the pages of the palace. Forty years have passed away, and the old widow is still living at Mandalay ; but whether the page is alive or not is at present unknown in Rangoon.

Here it may be remarked that the leading domestic institution which existed in Pegu prior to the introduction of British rule, was that of domestic slavery ; and the fact is of some importance, as the institution still flourishes in Ava territory in all its patriarchal simplicity. The slaves, male and female, were either prisoners taken in war from the Shan country, or they were debtors who had no other way of meeting their liabilities than by serving as slaves. They were, however, really menial servants, and were generally treated very kindly, being in fact articles of property. A slave of either sex used to cost about a hundred rupees ; and by paying up that amount a slave might generally obtain freedom. If the master of a house, or any of the sons of the house, chose to make a female slave his mistress, the step was equivalent to emancipation. Any children that were born under such circumstances,

were born of mothers who had been made free, and not of mothers who continued to be slaves, as was formerly the case in the West Indies and Southern States of America. If a woman desired her freedom, she had only to win favour in the eyes of one of the male members of the family; whereas in the Southern States, if she won the favour of her master she often found herself in worse bondage than ever. The saddest feature of slavery in Burmah was connected with the Pagoda. Slaves were often given to the Pagoda to serve the priests or phoongyees as an act of merit. In the old days of persecution Christians were occasionally sent by the Burmese officials to be slaves of the Pagoda, and under Burmese rule there was no escape from their unhappy fate. It is melancholy to add that this slavery was hereditary, and the children continued to be slaves to the priests for generations. Under British rule this state of things has been abolished. Many slaves have left the Pagodas and returned to secular life; and those who remain in the monasteries do so of their own free-will—either from force of habit, such as that which rendered certain old prisoners reluctant to leave the Bastille, or because they imagine that they are obtaining religious merit by their pious servitude.

In one respect the Burmese and Europeans in Rangoon were apparently better off in 1830 than they are at the present day. A Burman could support his family on two or three rupees per mensem; whilst a Christian family indulging in flesh-meat, could live easily on thirty rupees per mensem. Rice varied from four to eight annas a basket containing fifty-six pounds. In the present day a similar basket costs two rupees eight annas, and three rupees. Capital fowls and ducks could be purchased at the rate of ten to the rupee. In the present day one moderately good fowl costs from twelve annas to a rupee; whilst a duck costs nearly the same. Labour was equally cheap, coolies could be procured for four annas a day; whilst at the present time the cost for coolies is from eight to twelve annas per diem, or double and treble what it is in India; and during the shipping season a labouring man in Rangoon can earn from twenty to thirty rupees per mensem. It should be observed, however, that under Burmese rule there were no coined rupees and annas; and lumps of silver or lead were employed as equivalent values. It is only within the last few years that the King of Ava has adopted the English custom of coining rupees.

Whilst Captain Burney was staying at Rangoon in the beginning of 1830, he naturally endeavoured to collect all the information he could respecting the people of Burmah; and in doing so he came in contact with an extraordinary individual who is forgotten now, but who was famous in his day under the name of Lanciango. This man was Collector of Sea Customs at Rangoon

for the King of Ava. He was of Spanish extraction, and was popularly said to have been a pirate in the old days; and not improbably he was one of those half-pirates, half-privateers who had rendered themselves notorious in the wars of the French Revolution and the first Empire; and who had deemed it expedient, after the battle of Waterloo, to pass the remainder of their lives in a remote territory like that of Burmah. Be this as it may, Lanciogo made his appearance at Rangoon about 1820; and found his way to Ava, where he rose in the favour of the King, and obtained the appointment of Collector of Customs at Rangoon. This post under native rule was deemed to be one of the first class. The greatest man in Rangoon was the Myo Woon; the second in importance was the Yey Woon, or Admiral of the Fleet; whilst immediately next the Admiral was the Sea Collector. It is curious to remark that even under native rule this post was usually held by a European. Thus at the beginning of the century, an Englishman, named Captain Rodgers, was Collector at Rangoon. Rodgers was one of those eccentric individuals who threw off their religion and nationality, and became thoroughly oriental. He is forgotten now, but in 1830 he was remembered by very many. He wore the Burmese costume. He spoke nothing but Burmese. He embraced the three gems,—Buddha, the Law, and the Assembly; and went as regularly to the Shwé Dagon Pagoda to say his prayers, and offer flowers and wax-candles to Gotama, as the great Myo Woon himself. He married a first wife, and had several inferior wives, after the manner of a Burmese official of high rank; and as ladies in Burmah are not confined in a *zanána*, the girls might be seen squatting about in the old man's compound, eating, smoking or chewing betel, without the slightest idea that either he or they were departing from the strictest rules of propriety. Lanciogo was a man of a somewhat different stamp. His domestic arrangements were much the same as those of Rodgers, and if possible he was even more partial to the fair sex; but nothing could induce him to abandon his European costume, or to leave the Roman Catholic Church to worship in the temple of Rimmon.

Lanciogo's opinion of the people amongst whom he had cast his lot was not very flattering, but it was uncommonly near the truth. "The Burmese," he said, "are like monkeys. Keep a rattan in your hand, and they will crouch obediently before you. Lay aside the rattan, and they will begin to grin, and very soon will begin to scratch and bite." This observation, however, is only of partial application. The people in general are a kind and courteous race, provided they are treated with consideration and civility.

Three or four years after Captain Burney's visit to Rangoon in 1830, Lanciogo lost his appointment, and was recalled to

Ava ; whilst Mr. Camaratta was appointed Collector of Sea Customs in his room. Lanciango was terribly cut up at being deprived of his post ; and is said to have died shortly afterwards of the disappointment and loss of income and position.

From Rangoon to Ava is about seven hundred miles up the river Irawádi. The details of the old voyage made by Captain Burney to Ava are forgotten now, but they can easily be imagined. The people lining the banks at every station, to see the Kullahs, and gaze with wondering eyes on the steamer and its paddle-wheels. Pompous officials with a nondescript following, carrying betel boxes and cheroots. At Prom the steamer was compelled to return ; and Captain Burney and party were thus obliged to proceed in boats to Ava.

The capital of the old Burman empire was built in much the same style as the modern capital at Mandalay. A huge palace of wood and brick painted white and red, with halls and pillars covered with carving and gilding. Another large wooden building in the same area, which forms both a Senate House and High Court. A number of separate offices constructed of bamboo and matting, —arsenals, magazines, and royal treasury. All these structures were contained in a large area, nearly a mile square, peopled with soldiers and slaves, and officials with their followers. Round the whole was an immense wall and gates. Outside the palace-wall was the city with its own walls, gates and drawbridges ; and it in its turn was surrounded with rude suburbs. The roads were simply rough broad pathways, with such fearfully deep ruts that no carriages could drive along them except bullock carts. Along these so-called roads, princes and officials proceeded on elephants and ponies, or in gilded litters ; whilst on the river Irawádi which flows past Ava, was to be seen a fleet of large Burmese war boats, covered with rich gilding and decorated with pretty carvings.

Captain Burney was provided with a brick house in the suburbs ; while smaller buildings in the same compound were made over for the use of Mr. Edwards, the head clerk, and Dr. Bedford, the doctor. Provisions of all kinds were supplied to Captain Burney and his suite by the King ; and nobody in Ava was allowed to take any money from the resident and his officers. But before dwelling further upon these particulars, it will be necessary to take a brief glance at the palace and court of the reigning sovereign.

Phagyu-dau was at that time King of Ava, and had reigned ever since 1819. His immediate predecessor was Bhodra-pra who had ascended the throne in 1781. Bhodra-pra is the most celebrated of all the Kings of Ava, and perhaps a few stories which have been preserved respecting him may not be out of place.

He was a conqueror and a tyrant ; and at the same time a monster of cruelty, sensuality and pride. His accession to the throne had been followed by conspiracies and rebellions ; and he revenged himself by wholesale executions. In one village in particular, he caused the whole of the inhabitants, including priests and women, children and old people, to be burnt alive in one vast holocaust upon an immense pile of wood. Subsequently he conquered Arakán and Assam, and exercised suzerainty over Manipur and the Shan States. His zanána was crowded with young women from all parts of the empire. Every governor and feudatory prince was expected to send his fairest daughter or sister to serve as an attendant at the palace, with the chance of attracting the eyes of the King and being promoted to the rank of an inferior Queen. This rule was duly observed by the Shan Chiefs and the Rájás of Manipur and Assam ; but the relatives of these high personages were not expected to serve as attendants, but were at once promoted to the rank of Queens. Again if any subject heard that the rumours of the beauty of his daughter had reached the ears of royalty, he was at once puffed out with pride, and gladly sent the girl as an offering to the Golden Foot.

The zanána of an oriental sovereign is always a subject of interest to European readers from its being altogether foreign to European ideas ; but it is only by the most sedulous enquiry, that it is possible to obtain any real and authentic details respecting the zanána of the Kings of Ava. The royal zanána may be generally divided into three ranks or classes, namely :—

- (1) The four Queens.
- (2) The inferior Queens.
- (3) The Apyoo-dau, or Royal Virgins.

On ascending the throne Bhodra-pra married one of his half-sisters, according to the old fashion of Buddhist sovereigns. This is a strange custom amongst Buddhist Kings. The sister-wife is treated as the first and principal Queen. She must be a sister by the father only, but not by the mother. The origin of this custom is obscure. Glimpses of it appear in old Persian history and especially in the annals of the later Kings of Egypt known as the Ptolemies. The Buddhists themselves refer it to an old tradition which may be related here. In ancient times there was a King in Hindústán, who sought to please a young and favourite Queen by expelling all his elder children from the kingdom, and by nominating a son by his favourite to succeed him on the throne. Accordingly the elder children, including four brothers and five sisters, went away into the jungle ; and being fearful of degrading themselves by an alliance with an inferior family, determined to marry each other. With this view they appointed the elder sister to be queen-mother, doomed to lead a life of celibacy ; and then

each of the four brothers took a sister-wife who was not born of his own mother, and by these means they were supposed to preserve the purity of their race. This arrangement subsequently met with the warmest approval; and consequently has been followed by the royal race of Sákya down to the present day. Every King of Ava marries a half-sister as his first wife; and she is known as the middle queen, because her apartments are in the centre of the palace.

But every King of Ava has four queens who are called, from some old Vaidik idea, after the four points of the compass. The first or middle queen is more or less identified as the queen of the east. The three others are the queens of the north, the south, and the west. These collectively are the four Queens.

The class of inferior Queens is recruited from that of the Royal Virgins. It has already been explained how maiden sisters and daughters are sent to the palace to serve the queens. The King can raise any of these virgins to the rank of an inferior queen, and there is no one to say him nay. From the moment this is done, the fortunate damsel ceases to be an attendant; and is placed in a separate apartment, with female attendants of her own. The Royal Virgins and the inferior queens thus present a remarkable resemblance to the institution known as the Virgins of the Sun, which formerly existed amongst the Incas or old kings of Peru. It should be added that in certain respects the vices of oriental monarchs were never to be found in the Court of Ava. No wife was taken from her husband against her will. No girl was taken into the *zanána* before she had attained maturity. None of those criminal outrages which but too often disgrace Musalmán Courts, were to be found in the palace of a Buddhist sovereign.

At every change in the succession, a revolution naturally takes place in the royal *zanána*. In the first instance the new King appoints separate apartments for his own mother, who is henceforth treated with great respect as the Queen-mother, and is supposed to lead a life of celibacy. He then marries a half-sister as the principal Queen, and selects such other ladies of the *zanána* of his predecessor as please his taste; and the remainder are then turned out of the palace and permitted to go wherever they please. They generally retire to their respective families; but they are at full liberty to marry again after the genial fashion which prevails amongst Burmese.

Bhodra-pa, son of Alomptra the hunter, ascended the throne after a fearful series of massacres, which is horrible to contemplate. He deposed his predecessor, and put him to death after what is called the royal fashion; that is, his neck was broken, and his body was then thrust into a red sack and cast in the



river Irawádi. Bhodra-pra then ordered all the queens of the dead man to be burnt alive with their children in their arms. Having so done, he filled his zanána in the manner already described. Bñodra-pra reigned from 1781 to 1819. His career on the throne thus extended over nearly forty years.

There was one strange event in the life of Bhodra-pra which is curiously illustrative of Burmese ideas. In his later years he was so puffed up with arrogance and pride, that he aspired to the rank of deity, and announced himself to be another Buddha. To carry out this idea he abandoned his palace and zanána, and took up his abode in a Buddhist monastery. The priests, however, would not accept his pretensions; and after a while he grew tired of a life of celibacy, and ultimately returned to his palace, and resumed the reins of power, and plunged again into sensual indulgences over which it is as well to draw a veil.

Bhodra-pra died in 1819. He left behind him the reputation of a great sovereign according to Burmese ideas, but a terrible legacy of arrogance and presumption to his successor. Bhodra-pra had on more than one occasion shown his contempt for the British Government, and had not only committed aggressions on British territory, but threatened to invade Bengal.

Phagye-dau, grandson of Bhodra-pra, succeeded to the throne of Ava, and reigned from 1817 to 1839. The arrogance of the Burmese officials, and aggressions on British territory, culminated in the first Burmese war of 1824, which terminated in the annexation of Arakán and Tenasserim by the British Government, and led to the missions of Mr. Crawford and Captain Burney. Phagye-dau was henceforth a morose and melancholy man. He never ceased to mourn the loss of territory; and treated the English with that mixture of insolence and politeness which used to be the leading characteristic of Burmese diplomacy. Captain Burney and suite, as already stated, were duly provided with houses. They were also daily supplied gratis with mutton, fish, fowls, ducks and game; but beef as usual was never sent, and indeed the slaughter of a bullock is as criminal in Ava as in Rájputána. Milk, butter, bread and rice were furnished *ad libitum*. Conveyances were also provided, such as a couple of elephants and three or four ponies. Captain Burney could not help this state of things, for every man in the bazaar was under strict orders not to sell anything to the Resident, or to his servants; and if any one had disobeyed this order he would probably have been put to death, and all his property confiscated. But when Lord William Bentinck heard of these supplies of provisions by the palace to the Resident, he was aghast at the enormity. In 1834 Captain and Major Burney was ordered to refuse all such favours for the future, and the King was requested to refrain from sending them any more to the Residency.



Major Burney did his best to obey these orders, and no doubt Lord William Bentinck thought that his instructions were strictly attended to; and so they were, as far as fish, flesh and fowl were concerned; but there was a difficulty respecting the butter and milk, and Major Burney settled the matter by a compromise. Henceforth these articles were daily supplied from the palace, and indeed were indispensable for the children; and as the matter was never officially reported to the Government of India, it was probably never suspected by Lord William Bentinck that the little Burneys buttered their bread at the expense of the Golden Foot.

In one important respect Phagye-dau proved a very different man to Bhodra-pa. He had no polygamous tendencies. His affections were centered on one lady, who fascinated him so completely that she went by the name of "the Sorceress." This Queen had risen through the usual stages. She was the daughter of a Jailor; and being exceedingly beautiful, her father had taken her to the palace to be one of the Royal Virgins, in the hope that she might attract the attention of the King, and use her influence to promote the interests of her family. These expectations were soon realised. The Royal Virgin was promoted to the couch of her sovereign, and rapidly gained a complete mastery over him, and obtained the post of Minister for her brother. Meantime Phagye-dau grew more and more melancholy; and the Sorceress and her brother undertook the entire administration of the empire, and for a long while there was no one to oppose them.

The elevation of the Sorceress may have been positively beneficial to the State, for she was one of those keen far-seeing women who are born to rule. But it had an unhappy effect upon the zanána. The other Queens and the Royal Virgins also, being neglected by the King, naturally thought a good deal about the Royal pages. The zanána was strictly guarded by eunuchs; and so long as the King remained at his capital, it was next to impossible that any one should go astray. But bolts and bars are not always proof against bribes; and intrigues were occasionally carried on that were highly reprehensible. Then again, until a very late period, it was the custom of the King to make occasional progresses through his dominions, accompanied by his Queens and their attendants; and under such circumstances there is a laxity of zanána discipline, which is often attended with dangerous consequences. When such an affair was discovered there was no mercy. The offending lover was promptly taken outside the palace and decapitated. His head was spiked to the ground for three days, during which the body lay exposed; and then the remains were quietly buried. Mr. Edwards has seen the heads of several unfortunate lovers in this condition. What became of the frail beauty was not always certain. Women are not decapitated in

Burmah, but are beaten on the neck with clubs until they are dead. This work is generally performed in secrecy within the zanána walls. Sometimes, however, the guilty women are simply marked in the face and turned out of the palace, on which they almost invariably take refuge in a monastery. It was also whispered that some of the eunuchs were regular impostors ; but sufficient has been said to indicate the state of the zanána in Phagye-dau's time.

Perhaps no one was so disgusted at the aspect of affairs as Tharawadi, the brother of Phagye-dau, who has already been mentioned. Tharawadi was furious at the influence exercised by the Sorceress, and made no secret of his dissatisfaction. As regards the zanána of the King he was sublimely contemptuous. He remarked in the presence of Mr. Edwards, that a thousand infants had been buried beneath the palace, without the knowledge of Phagye-dau. He was headstrong and imperious, and as arrogant as Bhodra-pra ; and both Phagye-dau and the Sorceress had good reason to fear him. It was at this juncture that Phagye-dau began to take Major Burney into his confidence, and to look to the English Resident for advice. Indeed during the last few years of the reign, Major Burney exercised a very considerable influence at the Court of Ava ; and by his counsel, which was implicitly followed, succeeded in maintaining the public tranquillity.

At length in 1837 matters reached a climax. Tharawadi was so-called after the district of Tharawadi in Pegu, and here he maintained a band of dangerous dacoits, who were the terror of all the country round. A few years after the death of Tharawadi, the district which gave him his name passed into the hands of the British Government, together with the remaining portions of Pegu ; and it was not until some years after the annexation that the British authorities finally put an end to these gangs of cruel robbers. However, to return to the Prince. In 1837 Tharawadi fled from the capital out of fear of the machinations of the Sorceress and her brother ; and it was soon reported that he had broken out into open rebellion, and had commenced marching a large army of insurgents towards the city of Ava.

Meantime the capital was in the greatest possible commotion. The sister of Tharawadi was put in irons and placed in the palace jail by the order of the Sorceress and her brother ; but Major Burney procured an order for her release, and Mr. Edwards was sent to carry it out. The poor lady was accordingly freed from her chains ; but she thought it was for the purpose of being executed, and she burst into loud shrieks and screams, and implored Mr. Edwards to save her. She was, however, soon re-assured ; and conducted, trembling with emotion, to her own house in the city. All this while Tharawadi was advancing ; and both the city and palace

were filled with alarm. All the Armenian and Mughul traders in Ava, to the number of fifty families, took refuge in the compound of the British Residency, which was surrounded by a stockade.

Six Missionaries, who resided at Ava, and who all belonged to the American Baptist persuasion, also took refuge with their families in the same compound. Major Burney and Mr. Edwards went out to meet Tharawadi, as the Resident was anxious to bring about some mediation ; but the task was hopeless. Tharawadi received them in a friendly manner, and assured Major Burney that not a soul in the Residency should be injured ; but he was resolutely bent on the capture and sack of Ava. At last a compromise was effected. Tharawadi solemnly pledged himself not to plunder the capital, and not to put to death either the King, or any of his Ministers, provided the city were surrendered to him. Major Burney accepted their assurances, and on the strength of them induced the Burmese Government to surrender.

Tharawadi then entered Ava and spared the capital according to his promise. He placed the half-insane Phagye-dau into confinement, and shortly afterwards announced that the King had abdicated the throne in his favour. The Sorceress was placed in the common jail and strangled. The Ministers, whose lives Tharawadi had engaged to spare, were compelled to work in chains like criminals upon the public roads. Such are the not unfrequent vicissitudes of Asiatic statesmen. Yesterday worshipped as the sovereign deity, to-day reduced to the condition of the meanest slave. The British Government has never acted thus. Princes who have lost their thrones from their vile oppressions or utter incapacity, have only been deprived of their power of working mischief ; but have otherwise been treated with the utmost consideration, and provided for by liberal pensions.

About this time, namely in 1837, an incident occurred which illustrates the disorderly state of affairs. Shortly before the disturbances broke out, Dr. Bayfield, who had been appointed Assistant to the Resident at Ava, had proceeded to Bhamo, in company with the Rev. Mr. Kincaid, an American Missionary, to settle some frontier disputes which had broken out with the chiefs of the Kakhyen Hills. Mr. Kincaid, however, returned to Ava by himself ; and on the way fell into the hands of a band of robbers, who plundered him of everything he possessed, stripped him to his nethermost garment, and then favoured him with a round dozen, and finally dismissed him with the comforting assurance that if they ever caught him again they would most certainly cut off his head. The unfortunate Missionary hurried off into the jungle, and found refuge in the neighbourhood of a Buddhist monastery ; where he obtained a little rice every day from the priests, and moreover procured one of their yellow garments to cover him.

In this wretched plight, half-starved and unshaven, he made his appearance some days afterwards in the Residency compound at Ava; but unfortunately, when he explained who he was, and naturally expected a little sympathy, he was hailed with a roar of laughter. Indeed, his woe-begone countenance and Phoongyee garb are said to have been so intensely ludicrous that a brother Missionary, and even his own wife, joined in the merriment. His exasperation, whilst still in the monkish yellow gown, must have been still more amusing. However, the unfortunate man was said to have laughed most unbecomingly some years previously, at hearing that poor Mrs. Judson had been compelled to wear a Burmese petticoat at Ava,—a garment which, to say the least of it, is somewhat peculiar in style; so perhaps the reception he met with in the yellow gown was a just retribution for his own ill-timed mirth in former days. Of course he carried his complaint to Tharawadi, who declined to investigate the matter, but made him a present of six thousand rupees.

Shortly after the accession of Tharawadi, Major Burney discovered that the solemn pledge which had been given, that the lives of the Ministers would be spared, was being deliberately broken. The unhappy officials were being taken to the palace by one or two at a time, and quietly put to death. As they had been induced to surrender by the promise of Major Burney that their lives would not be taken, the Resident was naturally most angry, and warmly remonstrated with Tharawadi. The King, however, had grown touchy at any interference, and turned a deaf ear to all representations. He was willing that Major Burney should continue to reside at Ava as a friend, but he would not stoop to his dictations as a British Resident. Major Burney accordingly found himself in a false position, and deemed it due to the national honour to retire from his post. He therefore left Ava with his family and suite in native boats; and at length arrived at Rangoon, whence he ultimately made his way to Calcutta.

Whether Major Burney was right or not in thus abandoning his post is a question which was much discussed in the past generation. It seems to have been a political mistake, from having been carried out without a sufficient consideration of what might be the exigencies of imperial policy in other parts of the empire. The Burmese war of 1824 had been most unpopular in England; and it was the obvious duty of a Political Officer to avoid any measure which was at all calculated to precipitate collision. Again the very secrecy adopted by Tharawadi in putting the deposed Ministers to death, showed that he was anxious to keep on good terms with the British Government; and possibly Major Burney might have at least waited for instructions from the Government of India before taking such a decisive course as that of leaving Ava.

Moreover, the measure not only failed to have a good effect upon Tharawadi, but caused a breach between the two Governments. Tharawadi became more arrogant than ever. He publicly put all the surviving Ministers to death; and from that moment treated the English with disdain and contumely.

But whether the step taken by Major Burney was right or wrong, he certainly returned to Calcutta at a most unfortunate crisis. Lord Auckland was Governor-General and Sir William Mac-Naghten was Foreign Secretary. The expressed policy of the British Government was peace. There had been profound peace during the administration of Lord William Bentinck. His successor Lord Auckland had pledged himself to the Court of Directors before leaving England, that he would do his best to maintain peace. It is true that dark clouds were already looming beyond the north-western frontier; which were to culminate in the Afghán war, and might bring the Cossack and the Sepoy into collision on the banks of the Oxus. But this only made matters worse. The war which threatened would be at the greatest possible distance from Ava; and it was of the highest importance that the Government of India should concentrate all its energies in the direction of the Indus. Such was the state of affairs when Major Burney reported at Calcutta that he had withdrawn from the Ava Residency. Lord Auckland was naturally very angry. The British Government had been compromised with a petty power for a mere point of honour, which concerned Tharawadi alone, and could scarcely be converted into a *casus belli*. Major Burney, however, seems to have been somewhat harshly treated. He was removed from his post; and it is painful to add that he never recovered the blow. He served a few years longer, but like Major Todd, who was sent back to his regiment for having prematurely abandoned Herat, he appeared half broken hearted; ultimately he died on his way to England.

After the departure of Major Burney, King Tharawadi became more puffed up than ever with pride and arrogance. The Government of India endeavoured to renew political relations with Ava by sending Colonel Benson as British representative to his court; but the Mission turned out a total failure. No well-built dwelling house was furnished for a Residency, but only a temporary structure of bamboos and matting. Colonel Benson was simply isolated and harassed, until at last he was attacked with sickness, and in 1839 compelled to leave the Residency in charge of Captain McLeod.

Mr. Edwards accompanied both officers, and was the principal medium of communication between the Residency and the palace. His reminiscences of this period are not very pleasing, for Tharawadi was a cruel sovereign, and Mr. Edwards has seen

officials put to an agonising death for the most trivial offences. Captain McLeod retired in 1840. The principal event which occurred during the incumbency of this officer was the great earthquake which shook the capital to ruins and killed some ten thousand people in the city alone. Captain McLeod and Mr. Edwards were saved by the mere fact that they were sleeping in a shed of bamboo matting. The shock occurred in the middle of the night. The sepoy guards were in a fearful state of alarm; some were kneeling and praying, whilst others were falling in and preparing to fight for their lives. The sight of the destruction in the city next morning is described as something very horrible. The wounded, the dying, and the dead were lying about in all directions, and there were neither doctors nor nurses to see after them. Some were crying and moaning; whilst those who had escaped unhurt were weeping and wailing over those who had fallen.

After the return of Captain McLeod in 1840, no further efforts were made to establish a Resident at the Court of Ava. The attention of the Government of India was sufficiently absorbed by the course of events in Afghánistán, far away beyond the dominions of Ranjit Singh; and Sir William Mac Naghten, the Foreign Secretary, had for some time filled the post of Resident at Kábul. So Burmah was left to drift. About 1841, when affairs were becoming serious in Afghánistán, Tharawadi marched an army to Rangoon, announcing in his pompous way that he was about to drive the English out of Arakán and Tenasserim; but it proved to be all bounce. He remembered too well the lesson he had learnt from the first Burmese war; and he confined his operations to casting one of the big bells in the Shwé Dagon Pagoda.

Meantime, whilst Tharawadi treated all foreigners with imperious disdain, his manners and bearing were regal and dignified in public; and to this day it is still said by those who remember him that he was every inch a King. He indulged in wine and spirits, but only in the strictest privacy. He filled his zanána with all the beauties of the kingdom; but his word was law, and there were few amours between the pages and the ladies of the palace during his reign. The King's own sister, a genial but somewhat elderly lady of fifty-five, was discovered in an intrigue with an official; but her paramour was promptly put to death, and nothing more was heard of the matter. She died some two or three years afterwards.

Tharawadi's passion for the fair sex was notorious, and the different Woons or Governors were ever ready to win his favour through the medium of some attractive damsel. In those days there was a well-known Armenian gentleman residing at Rangoon, who was one of the leading merchants of the place. He had three charming daughters; and the Myo Woon got a hint

from the Court that he would do well to send one of these young ladies to serve in the palace as a Royal Virgin, with a very early prospect of promotion to a higher grade. The suggestion was accordingly whispered to the father, and it seems to have been expected that he would at once have complied with so flattering an offer. Strange to say he thought differently and promptly sent his daughters to Calcutta, on the plea of having them educated. Of course there was not the slightest expression of disappointment on the part of the Myo Woon, as the honour which would have been conferred on the family was so great, as to render it impossible that anything but accident should have led to its being declined. One of the ladies subsequently married a Bengal civilian, who survived her, and only died a few years ago.

A few years afterwards King Tharawadi degenerated into a drunkard and lunatic; and he would occasionally shoot or stab a Minister or favourite with his own hands in one of his paroxysms of rage. At last in 1845 the palace officials were so thoroughly frightened at his violent attacks upon themselves, and his wholesale executions, that they were driven by the instinct of self-preservation to put him to death. As an illustration of the domestic felicity of the Kings of Ava, it may be added that one of his favourite Queens was living until a comparatively recent period in the closest intimacy with a Chinaman at Rangoon.

Here the reminiscences must end. Mr. Edwards accompanied the Missions of 1855, 1862, 1866 and 1867; but these events are too recent to be made the subject of personal gossip. Tharawadi was succeeded by Pagan-men who brought on the second Burmese war of 1852; and Pagan-men, was in his turn succeeded by his present Majesty, Meng-lon, who has entered into friendly alliance with the British Government. Long may he reign!

Mr. Edwards has now retired on the pension which he has justly earned by his long and meritorious services; and we trust that he may live to enjoy it for many years to come. There is not a man under whom he has served during the lengthy period of fifty years, who has not had a good word to say for this most intelligent, assiduous, and unassuming official.

J. TALBOYS WHEELER.



## ART. VIII.—THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.

### PART I.

THE supply of food and transport to troops in time of peace and war—or, in a word, of all the material requisites comprised in the modern phrase ‘Commissariat’—presents so important a subject for inquiry, that the writer of the present article has often felt surprise that it should have engaged so little public attention. It is equally important, whether viewed from an economic point, or considered as having ever been intimately associated with the content or discontent, with the success or failure in the field, of all armies; from the days when the Hebrew host demanded quail in the desert, and sighed after the flesh-pots of Egypt, to the present time when in the recent campaign, the failure of the French in this great essential early proved disastrous to their cause. In fine, whatever of apology this article may need in other respects, the writer feels assured that in the task before him, he has consulted the primary object of all writing, in selecting a subject of at least considerable public utility.

The Bengal Commissariat is deservedly considered second to none in the world and superior to most; but it should be remembered that it has enjoyed special advantages, in having had for upwards of a century a constant field for its labours in a country, which may be described as a vast military camp, or *congeries* of camps. Did time and space permit, a profitable comparison might be made between the system of the Bengal Commissariat, and those of other countries; but it is proposed to reserve this for a future article, and to restrict the present investigation to that of the Bengal system itself.

The subject fitly divides itself into two main heads—*Personnel* and *Matériel*. Under the head *Personnel* will be considered all that relates to the administrative and executive establishments of the department, their *morale* and efficiency; while under the head *Matériel*, the different services and economy of supply, will be briefly reviewed. In conclusion a prospective view will be taken of departmental duties in connexion with the new order of things, and the altered conditions of service certain to arise from the extension of railroads and the consequent re-distribution of garrisons.

**PERSONNEL.**—The establishment of superior officers of the Commissariat Department consists of—

1	Commissary General.				
3	Deputies Commissary General.				
4	Assistants	do.	do.	...	1st class.
4	do.	do.	do.	...	2nd do.
6	Deputy Assistants Commissary General...				1st do.
6	do.	do.	do.	...	2nd do.
12	Sub Assistants Commissary General			...	1st do.
8	do.	do.	do.	...	2nd do.
8	do.	do.	do.	...	3rd do.

Total, 52 Officers.

A thing that must at once strike attention in perusing the above list is the verbose and cumbrous, if not indeed ridiculous, denominations given to the officers of the different grades. The functions of the Commissary General and of his three deputies are distinct and *quasi*-administrative, whilst those of the other officers are purely executive. This fact itself may suggest a suitable change in appellatives. But this merely *par parenthèse*. To proceed to more important matters.

*The Commissary General.*—As the administrative head of one of the largest disbursing Departments of the State, the Commissary General has duties sufficiently onerous and responsible in time of peace; whilst in time of war his anxieties are great, and his prudence and forethought are severely taxed. Such being the case, the officer filling this important post should have special qualifications; and, to be really efficient, must enjoy in a special degree the confidence of Government, whose delegate he really is. His selection for office, his position, and remuneration should be relatively fixed. Let these points be separately considered.

*Appointment of Commissary General.*—One of the greatest evils of any seniority system of promotion is, that the senior on the list may often not be the fittest man for promotion; whilst the self-evident remedy for this, namely, free selection, opens the door to jobbery, &c. These arguments sound plausible, but do not bear careful investigation. In the first place, if the general mediocrity of talent amongst all educated persons be considered, the necessity for selection will rarely occur except for the higher and more important posts. For these last, free selection should be insisted on, however ruthlessly individual interests may be thereby affected. In order to guard against jobbery as far as possible, the selection should never rest with an individual, but with a council of at least three or more disinterested electors. These remarks have peculiar significance in reference to the selection of an officer to fill the post of Commissary General. It has often been canvassed whether it is not expedient that the appointment of Commissary General should be bestowed on an officer, who has had no previous connection with the Department; and doubtless there are advantages in such a proposal. Departmental officers

who have worked for years in the same groove are apt to be difficult to move from that groove; and less readily comprehend the necessity for change, albeit circumstances may imperatively call for it. Again, a Commissary General, who has worked his way up through the different grades, may have associations in the Department, which on occasion may render him purblind to Government interest. For this very reason, though perhaps disliking the idea of supersession, most officers of the Department would prefer to work under an outsider. On the other hand, it is to be said that the appointment of an outsider involves the supersession of many deserving officers of the Department, whose promotion is already too tardy. But let the arguments *pro* and *con* be what they may, the broad principle should be closely followed, that the fittest man should hold office, whether he be found in or out of the Department. Moreover, neither should the senior officer of the Department be appointed, simply because he happens to be senior, nor should all the officers of the Department be superseded by an outsider, merely because the senior officer is not competent. It is suggested that when a vacancy occurs, the names of the first five senior officers should be submitted as candidates for appointment, and failing selection from these, and only failing selection from these, should an outsider be nominated.

*Position of Commissary General.*—The Commissary General in the Indian as well as in the British Service, holds the relative rank of Major-General. Why should he not be permitted to wear and use the rank? In other words, in the Indian service being a military officer, why should he not be entitled to style himself, and be styled a Major-General? The rank might be made local, and *ex-officio* merely, in the same manner that local rank is accorded to officers holding brigade commands in India. The rank would unquestionably strengthen the Commissary General's position, and would give him greater weight and respect with others as well as with his own officers. At present there are many junior officers of the department holding superior military rank to the Commissary General. This is an anomaly existing, it is believed, in no other military service in the world. Again, the Commissary General is forced to vacate his appointment on attaining the rank of Major-General in the army. The object is not quite apparent. If it be deemed necessary that such opportunity should be afforded of compelling an officer to retire from an onerous position before becoming effete and superannuated, this aim would be better reached by limiting the tenure of office to five years, with the option reserved to Government of re-election for a further term in very special cases. As it stands, many able officers who have attained the rank of Major-General, and are waiting hopelessly for divisional commands, are debarred.

from holding the office. This should not be—and it may be added that this remark has equal pertinence in reference to the appointments of Adjutant General and Quarter-Master General.

But the authority of the Commissary General received its rudest shock through the officious interference with his functions by the the so-called Military Finance Department of 1859. Armed with full power, and with all the wish to use the shears unsparingly, this Commission might have initiated great and radical changes of a really salutary character in the department. Unfortunately, whether from ignorance, or from lack of real administrative capacity, or from both causes, it effected no permanent good whatever. On the contrary, actuated apparently by the desire of retaining office, and drawing their very high salaries for as long a period as possible, its members adopted the expedient of goading every official they were brought into contact with into an irritating and voluminous correspondence, having no higher aim than a huckstering penny-wise and pound-foolish economy, which nearly ruined the efficiency of the Commissariat Department, and which has had since to be heavily paid for. On the other hand, the Head of the Department has been left so trammelled and bound over hand-and-foot to the Control Department, as to render him powerless for good or evil. Responsible for the economical as well as the efficient working of his department, the Commissary General has at present so many obstacles in the path of his duties that no one but a man of genius could hope to succeed in the Sisyphean-like task of removing them. No wonder, then, if the post is now deemed best fitted to an officer of limited capacity and due obsequiousness.

“Controlled” and hampered as the Commissary General assuredly is in many respects, there is still one point in which he exercises a prerogative quite unlimited, *viz.*, in the transfer and posting of executive Commissariat officers. It is absolutely necessary that he should have the power of making transfers and postings as the exigencies of the service may demand; but he should be compelled to shew the necessity in each case in an immediate report to Government. Indeed, whenever time admits, the sanction of Government should be obtained prior to the transfers being made. As matters at present stand, it is to be feared that it may often happen that officers are moved about in the most capricious manner to gratify the petty malice and spite of some unconscionable jack-in-office of a Commissary General; and this sometimes at considerable needless expense to Government. It can readily be imagined, too, how much of heart-burning to officers, and mischief to the public service, may be caused through postings being made according to the partiality and favouritism of an, in this respect, irresponsible Commissary General, rather than according to the standing, experience, and merit of the officers themselves. A glance at the present disposi-

tion of the officers of the Department will serve to verify these observations. But more of this, and the remedy for it, in the proper place.

*Remuneration of Commissary General.*—The salary of the Commissary General is now Rs. 2,500 a month, consolidated. Formerly it was Rs. 3,000. This is another debt of gratitude the Department owe to the Military Finance Department aforesaid; and like most other reductions made by that Department, it is injudicious if not indeed unjust. Injudicious, as the difference in salary deters many from accepting office, and because it lowers the position of the Commissary General, especially in this country, where the importance of the office is judged of by the fatness of the salary attached to it. Unjust—because, judged by the importance of the duties and responsibilities, the larger salary was not excessive. The Adjutant-General, with responsibility merely reflected from the Commander-in-Chief, and with duties certainly less laborious, draws Rs. 3,000 a month. Unjust, as it dwarfs the high prize which the officers of the Department have been looking forward to through long years of toil. After all, what guarantee have they that the salary will not be further reduced at the whim of some other like Department or Commission?

*Deputies Commissary General.*—There are three Deputies Commissary General, each drawing a staff salary of Rs. 1,000 a month, in addition to the Staff Corps pay of their rank, besides an allowance of Rs. 90 a month for office rent. Their office establishments cost Rs. 2,164 per mensem. These officers are supposed to exercise a general supervision and control over the circle of executives committed to their charge. They have the power of sanctioning expenditure extraordinary within a limit of Rs. 500. Each executive under their supervision is inspected once annually, and a report sent to the Commissary General. These duties to the uninitiated would appear sufficiently onerous and responsible; but in reality are merely perfunctory or supererogatory. The Deputies Commissary General have no accounts to keep, nor are they responsible for the efficiency of the executives under their control. The office was erected with the view of relieving the Commissary General of some portion of the work, but in reality it is one of obstructiveness and circumlocution. All important questions have still to find their way to the Commissary General's office; and the consequence of employing the Deputy Commissary General's office as a medium of communication is, that all documents have to be furnished in duplicate and triplicate, so as to provide records for that office which, as far as the public service benefits, are valuable as curl-papers—nothing more. The fact is, no channel of communication is needed between Executive

Commissariat Officers and the Head of the Department. A good deal might be said, too, against the system which permits a Deputy Commissary General to authorise expenditure extraordinary not exceeding in each transaction Rs. 500 ; and one can readily suppose that some pretty heavy bills might be run up with accumulated items, none exceeding Rs. 500 ; but the tax-paying public need feel no alarm, for, in effect, the Deputies Commissary General have far too befitting notions of *otium cum dig.* to ever dream of passing any charge but for the most ordinary expenditure, wisely preferring to submit all extraordinary items, whether they exceed Rs. 500 or not, for decision of the Commissary General. The annual inspection of executive officers by the Deputies Commissary General is calculated to be very beneficial ; but through the perfunctory manner in which this duty is carried out, it becomes little better than a farce. A long and set list of questions is propounded to be answered at leisure in writing by the Executive Commissariat Officer—the godowns and ration stands are visited—a few calls on the station military authorities are paid. The Deputy Commissary General declares himself satisfied after two days' stay ; the usual report is made to the Head of the Department, and there is an end of the matter. Obviously, the opportunity might be turned to better account, and closer and more searching investigation made. In short there is no need of three Deputies ; one would give all the assistance required by the Commissary General. He should receive a salary of Rs. 1200 staff, in addition to his military pay as of old ; and should be attached to the Commissary General's own office. A great saving would thus be effected ; and there would be much less friction in the work than at present.

*Executive Commissariat Officers.*—As a good Commissariat system must ever be considered the very backbone of an army, more especially of an English one, so in like manner may Executive Commissariat Officers be deemed its very marrow and life. Certain it is that the Government of India owes a deep debt of gratitude to its Executive Commissariat Officers, whose untiring energy, zeal and integrity have achieved so much for its armies in all situations ; while at the same time they have conscientiously protected the public purse through the many temptations besetting them. That there are great temptations in the position is to state that there is the greater honour and praise in the fact that so very few have ignobly yielded to them. Government, in the matter of its dealings with officers of the Commissariat Department, has hitherto sown liberally and wisely, and has reaped accordingly. By appointing Commissioned Officers of recognised position, by paying them liberally, and by rewarding their efforts consistently, it has induced that *morale* and devotion to its interests, which have made the Department all that it is—*viz.*, the best and least venal in the world.

But let it take warning. Much has been done since the mutiny to weaken that *morale* and devotion, both by curtailment of position and by reduction of pay, as also by taking away from the departmental officers the distinctive dress of the staff. The last appears a small matter, but is not so in reality ; half the enthusiasm displayed in England for the Volunteer service may be ascribed to a not unnatural vanity panting to appear in "war-paint." True it is that the officers of the Commissariat Department cannot have any lustre reflected on them by wearing the dress of the general staff ; but they would be content, nevertheless, to have a distinctive dress of their own.

*Appointments.*—The appointment of Executive Officers rests with Government nominally ; but in effect nominations are made on the sole recommendation of the Commissary General. A former wise chief of the Department took care to recommend for appointment none but officers who had served as Interpreters and Quarter-masters of their regiments, (or as Adjutants). Men of some experience and qualifications were thus at once secured to the Department. The Department was then the best paid in the military service, and candidates of the best promise were numerous accordingly. Recruited thus from, as it were, the flower of the Indian army, it is not to be wondered at that the Department in old days ever proved efficient. It is to be regretted that the good system then inaugurated should have been departed from, and that through reduction of salaries the allurements to the best qualified candidates should have been withdrawn. Regimental Officers have now infinitely better prospects than those in the Commissariat Department. This should not be. Again, formerly the greatest *esprit de corps* existed. This has been much impaired, as well as the general efficiency of the Department, by the introduction into its ranks of old, and in some cases, effete Officers, whom the so-called amalgamation and staff corps schemes threw out of employ. These officers can never expect to rise through the grades ; and have merely made a convenience of the department by entering it for a season, in order to obtain an addition to their pay while eking out the time for retirement. It takes at least five years to make a good Commissariat Officer ; and these officers will have gained such length of experience merely to leave when it has been gained. Selfish and grievance-mongers, their presence in the department is a cancer to efficiency and *esprit de corps*, whilst they hold place to the exclusion of younger and more promising officers. The Government will suffer severely yet from having permitted this incubus on the department, in order to relieve itself of the necessity of decently providing for such valetudinarians. Of course these remarks cannot apply in their full force to the many excellent senior officers who have joined the Department since the mutiny ; but only to those whom the cap may fit,—men who are drawing the pay, though

perfectly conscious of being quite unfit, mentally and physically, for the work.

*Examination of Candidates, and their preparation for the duties.*

—Candidates for appointment to the Commissariat Department are required, besides the usual linguistic tests, to pass an entrance examination, which is supposed to prove their knowledge of book-keeping, arithmetic, and mensuration. They are appointed on probation for one year. Half of the time must be passed in an executive office, and the remainder in the office of the Examiner of Commissariat Accounts. They then appear for final examination as to their knowledge of departmental rules and accounts. The value of these examinations as tests of qualification may be gathered from the fact that there is not a single instance on record of an officer having been "spun" for either examination. The year of probation may be said to be one wasted; during which, too, be it observed, Government pays the young Officer for learning his work. If he did learn it, the money might be well spent; but as the work cannot be so learnt, but by experience alone, both time and money are, it is repeated, quite thrown away. There should be only one examination (an entrance one) which should be competitive; and the subjects given should embrace in addition to those already named:—"Chemistry as applied to detection of adulteration of food;" "the principles of steam and the steam-engine," and "the breeding and treatment of cattle." The elements of these subjects can as readily be acquired out of the department as in it, and might be studied during the many leisure hours at the disposal of the young officer, while serving the three years which must be passed in this country before he can hold any staff appointment of any kind. Having passed the entrance examination, the candidate should be considered as on probation for three years; during which period his aptitude for departmental employ should be frequently reported on by the senior officers under whom he may serve; and it need hardly be added that the more active and varied the service he sees during this probationary period the better.

*Postings and Transfers of Executive Officers.*—These are made entirely at the will, and it may also be said, often at the caprice of the Commissary General. There is no system followed whatever. The evils resulting have already been touched upon above; but enough can hardly be said in condemnation of such unlimited power over the prospects and happiness (nay, even, in some instances over the very lives) of Executive Officers being placed in the hands of an individual to exercise according to his partiality, favour and affection. The wonder only is, that the power has not been more abused. That this evil has been permitted to exist so long unchecked is the less excusable, seeing that the remedy is easy. All transfers and postings should be notified to Government; and further care should be had that officers are ap-



pointed to charges according to their standing in the Department.

In a Department like the Commissariat, experience is the one great requisite. As has already been remarked, it takes at least five years to make a good Commissariat Officer. Care should be had that the young officer does not gain his experience, as he now too frequently does, at heavy loss and expense to Government. No officer under three years' service in the Department should be placed in an independent charge. There are at present ten first-class, eleven second-class, and five third-class executive charges. A re-classification is desirable. There should be eight first-class, eight second-class and ten third-class charges. To these classes respectively, officers should be appointed strictly according to seniority, except in the rare instances of misconduct, when supersession should take place—but under the direct order of Government itself, and not of the Commissary General. The duty in each executive charge respectively being equally onerous, the salary of officers of each class should be alike. Rupees 700 a month, with Rs. 60 office-rent, should be paid to the first-class; Rs. 500 staff, with Rs. 50 office-rent, should be paid to the second-class; and Rs. 400, with Rs. 40 office-rent, to the third-class. All junior officers in charge of outposts should receive Rs. 200 staff salary, with Rs. 20 office-rent. Those not in charge of outposts should receive Rs. 150 staff. This classification and scale of remuneration would commend themselves to the officers of the Department generally, but more particularly to the juniors, as also to intending candidates. A comparative scale is subjoined:—

<i>Present Scale.</i>		<i>Proposed Scale.</i>	
	Rs.		Rs.
1 Commissary General ...	2,500	1 Commissary General ...	3,000
3 Deputies ditto @ 1,000 each ...	3,000	1 Deputy Commissary General ...	1,200
4 Assistants Commissary General, 1st class, @ 800 each ...	3,200	8 Executive Officers, 1st class, @ 700 each ...	5,600
4 do. do. do. 2nd class, @ 600 ...	2,400	8 do. do. 2nd class, @ 500 each... ..	4,000
6 Deputy Assistants Commissary General 1st class, @ 500 ...	3,000	10 do. do. 3rd class, @ 400 each... ..	4,000
6 do. do. do. 2nd class, @ 400 ...	2,400	20 Assistant Executive Officers, @ 200 each ...	4,000
12 Sub-Assistants Commissary General, 1st class, @ 300 ...	3,600	10 do. do., @ 150 each ...	1,500
8 do. do. do. 2nd class, @ 200 ...	1,600		
8 do. do. do. 3rd class, @ 150 ...	1,200	5 Officers, costing ...	23,300
52 Officers, costing ...	22,900		per mensem.
	per mensem.		

It will thus be seen that by the proposed classification, the Department would gain an increase of *six* officers, and in reality an increase of *eight Executive Officers*; at an extra cost of Rs. 400 a month. Now an extra number of Executive Officers is just what the Department most stands in need of,—more particularly to take charge of outposts. This increase of officers would be found a really economical measure *per se*; while the extra Rs. 400 a month would be covered over and over again by the saving caused by the reduction of the office establishments of two of the three Deputies Commissary General above advised.

*Warrant and Non-Commissioned Officers.*—Amongst this class of public servants will be found many most respectable, honest, hard-working and thoroughly efficient men; but on the other hand, it is to be said that quite a moiety of the number employed is perfectly worthless, and a source of trouble rather than an aid, to Executive Commissariat Officers. The fault lies mainly in the want of system in selection and subsequent training of candidates. Officers commanding regiments are naturally averse to part with really good men, and can hold out superior inducements to such to remain with their regiments. The consequence is that only inferior men, or even men whom it is deemed desirable to get rid of, are permitted to apply for Commissariat employ. The evil is further augmented by the fact that no evidence as to special qualifications is demanded; while a most superficial and trifling educational test in the three R's. is all that is exacted preliminary to employment. Once in the Department the man, whether good, bad, or indifferent, becomes a fixture; and can only be remanded to his regiment for grave misconduct at the recommendation of the Commissary General, or by sentence of a Court Martial. He is appointed most generally, in the first instance, to the post of Victualling Sergeant of a regiment; the duties of which in cantonments may occupy his time for about one hour each morning, after which he may employ the rest of the day pretty much as he likes,—to some a pleasant life doubtless, but scarcely a profitable one. Suddenly removed from the wholesome restraint of regimental discipline, with leisure fully at command, and surrounded by the influence of inferior though wily native subordinates, is it surprising that the non-commissioned Officer newly appointed to the Department finds it difficult to resist the temptation to drink and dishonesty so besetting him? Before suggesting the remedies for this unsatisfactory state of things, it may be well to take a brief and intelligent glance at the nature of duties required of the European subordinate grades of the department. These consist of charge of Outposts, Godown, Victualling, Bakery, Butchery and Cattle duties. What is required for the three last-named is the close and special supervision of workmen skilled in each

of these trades respectively. These men should be employed on no other duty ; and should be engaged and discharged by Executive Commissariat Officers themselves,—in short, should be under their sole and whole control. Nor should soldiers alone be employed ; but the best men should be sought out, whether soldiers, pensioners, or civilians. The pay of each should be Rs. 60 a month, increasing to Rs. 100 with quarters. This is an increase on the salary now given ; but the pay is not too much to secure the services of really good men ; while the extra cost would be more than compensated by the general efficiency and economy resulting in these branches of service.

The other duties are important according to the order in which they are named, *viz.*, "Outpost," "Godown," and "Victualling." These require permanent and trained *employés*. Candidates should be required to pass an entrance examination as to their ability to read and write English, with correctness of orthography and diction, at least, if not with elegance. Further, they should have a thorough knowledge of weights and measures, and of mensuration of surfaces and solids, besides a fair colloquial knowledge of Urdu. None but really smart and physically fit soldiers of good character, of over five years' service, should be permitted to seek employment. Soldiers possessing the requisite qualifications should be encouraged to register their names freely as candidates in the Brigade Major's Office ; and should be examined by the Garrison instructors, who have been appointed under a recent order of the Commander-in-Chief for each considerable station. During the first three years subsequent to appointment, Executive Commissariat Officers should have full power to remand a soldier to his regiment either for misconduct, or for inattention to duty ; or for general inaptness for Commissariat employ. It is advisable that the European subordinate department should be divided into four grades. The first grade should have the pay and relative rank of a Lieutenant ; the second should have the pay and relative rank of an Ensign ; the third grade should have a fixed salary of Rs. 80 a month, with quarters, and should rank as warrant officers. The fourth grade should have pay, increasing from Rs. 35 a month, with quarters, to Rs. 60 a month, with quarters. These last should rank as regimental Staff Sergeants. Outposts should be classified into 1st, 2nd, and 3rd class. The officer in charge of a first class outpost should receive Rs. 200 a month in addition to his pay proper ; Rs. 100 a month for a 2nd class, and Rs. 50 a month for a 3rd class outpost. The charge of large godowns at sudder stations should confer extra pay of Rs. 60 a month. Rs. 50 a month extra should also be paid to any subordinate sent in Commissariat-charge of a detachment of strength over 100 men ; and Rs. 30 a month extra for the charge of any detachment of strength from 30 to 100 men. All permanent European subordinates of

the warrant and non-commissioned grades should receive Rs. 10 a month pony allowance ;—without a pony to ride, their *efficiency* is curtailed one-half. The above scale of emoluments may be a trifle higher in some cases than what is now paid, but it is far from extravagant ; and barely sufficient to secure the services of really good men, and to keep them from temptation.

It is believed that the services of at least a moiety of those employed in the non-commissioned grades of the Department might be dispensed with. At present a Victualling Sergeant is employed for each ration stand. As already said, these men have one hour's work of a morning,—no more. One intelligent man could readily and efficiently give all the aid required by the Executive Commissariat Officer at ration stands, where three or more are now often employed. Nothing could be easier than for a smart non-commissioned Officer to ride round all the ration stands at a station daily, and having satisfied himself that the rations were properly tendered for issue, make his report to his officer. Indeed, it is not clear why the presence of a Victualling Sergeant at each ration stand is now considered necessary. It cannot be that he is supposed to control the regimental authorities receiving the rations ; nor, probably having half the wit and experience of the native agent, is he likely to act as a check upon that, ordinarily speaking, astute functionary. What does he do then ? Nothing, or next to nothing. The fault is not his own : it lies in the want of system.

There is, at present, no training whatever for the European subordinates of the Department ; who are permitted to pick up only such knowledge of the duties as may suit their own fancy, and this in the most haphazard manner. On nomination to the department, the non-commissioned Officer should not be appointed in the first instance to any special duty ; but should attend office regularly, and be ready to perform any duty the Executive Officer may entrust to him. He would thus gain a competent knowledge of the work of the Department generally ; and would after a few months become really useful, whilst his time would be fully and profitably occupied, as well to his own benefit as to that of the Government.

*Gomashtas, or native agents.*—There are three classes of Gomashtas. Those of the 1st class receive Rs. 50 a month ; 2nd class, Rs. 40 ; and 3rd class, Rs. 30. It need hardly be remarked that the pay received bears no proportion to the perquisites expected, and often surreptitiously enjoyed. Some of these agents render bills amounting monthly to from Rs. 15,000 to Rs. 20,000, and even more. Is it reasonable to suppose that men conducting transactions of such magnitude as these figures import, will be satisfied with the, to them, paltry pay of Rs. 50 a month ? Certainly not. The salary may be considered merely as a licence too frequently covering speculation. Let there be no

misunderstanding, however; speculation is rather the exception than the rule, but speculation is rendered easier through legitimate, though unrecognised, gains being mixed up with it in one general obscurity. The fact is that Gomashtas of all classes—Godown Gomashtas, Victualling Gomashtas, and Cattle Gomashtas—should each and severally be restricted to their own proper duties; and should not be permitted to supply any article whatever by direct purchase. Supplies should be obtained as far as practicable by contract; but when contracts are not obtainable, some respectable local firm should be employed to act as Purveyors. They should be regularly appointed under authority, but should receive no salaries. Supplies should be taken from these purveyors in fixed and wholesale quantities, at the rates ruling in the market for the time being. There is not the slightest doubt that respectable and wealthy merchants on the spot would be found not only willing but eager to undertake a supply, assuring them regular payments, and the usual profit on the capital employed. These purveyors should not be debarred from competing for contracts as well. Of course under such a system there would be no necessity for retaining the services of the class styled “Station Gomash-tas;” and the anomaly above referred to, of an agent presenting monthly bills of from Rs. 15,000 to Rs. 20,000, receiving a salary of Rs. 50 a month, would be happily done away with.

*Office establishments and Officers.*—So long as red-tapeism is allowed to continue rampant in this country, and so long as official circumlocution is at a premium, involving all transactions, however simple, in a perfect cataclysm of reports, returns, statements, prices, and all the chaotic correspondence fitly destined for the waste-basket—so long will it be impossible to make any material reduction in the heavy cost of office establishments. Greater efficiency might, however, be readily secured in those of the Commissariat Department by employing half the number of writers, but taking care that those employed are really fairly educated and intelligent men. This aim can only be reached by giving better salaries to the fewer number. All the writers of the department should be carefully classified, and should receive regular promotion. At present they look forward to receiving it through sycophancy or corruption.

*Accounts, Auditor, &c.*—The accounts of the Department have been greatly simplified of late years; and indeed but little improvement in this direction is now required. Each Executive Officer submits monthly to the Examiner a cash account current, accompanied by a disbursement statement with vouchers, and with an abstract of items remaining inefficient, showing progress in adjustment. Further a monthly store-return is submitted, showing receipt and expenditure

of stores. It is suggested that, in place of the cash account current, a copy of the daily cash book itself should be submitted. All information desired by the Examiner for the preparation of the general accounts of the department could, as readily be obtained from the cash book as from the cash account current, whilst a most salutary check would be established through each item of the cash book coming under scrutiny. The cash book sometimes would tell strange tales. Further, a half-yearly statement of "stock" issues and receipts should be submitted. Of "stock" taken in contradistinction to "stores" there is no account kept at present except in Executive Offices. A superior check is advisable.

The general accounts of the Department are compiled after audit by the examiner under appropriate heads showing the different services, &c., and are submitted to Government through the Military Controller. The Examiner is entirely independent of the Department, and is subject only to the Military Controller. It would be far better that the Examiner's Office should be attached to that of the Commissary General. In fine, the Examiner should hold the office of General Accountant for the Department; but the accounts should bear the signature and receive the scrutiny of the Commissary General before being passed on to the Military Accountant. With the Military Accountant would then lie the responsibility of seeing that the sums estimated for in the Budget for different services were not exceeded, and that no unauthorised expenditure was made. The advantages of the change here advocated are too numerous for detail, but some more important points may be at once stated. The Commissary General is responsible for the economical working of the Department; but, under the present system, never sees the accounts till finally passed. By the system proposed he would be enabled to exercise as close a scrutiny as he pleased, without undue interference with the functions of the Examiner. Secondly, a great deal of correspondence would be saved by the Examiner having it in his power to make direct reference on the spot to the Commissary General. Thirdly, it must be remembered that the Commissary General, though authorising expenditure, actually makes none himself; and without seeing the accounts of his Executive Officers, how can he possibly judge whether an Executive charge is economically worked or not? It follows that great injustice is done to Executive Officers, who get no credit for any efforts they may make, in the direction of economy. Can anything be more mischievous than such a system?—and can it be thought wonderful that Executive Officers should leave economies to look after themselves, while they direct their best energies to other portions of their work, wherein their efforts are likely to

manifest themselves, and are therefore more likely to receive substantial appreciation?

Thus may be brought to a close the remarks under the first head of this article, *viz.*, the *Personnel*. The endeavour has been to submit briefly to inspection what may be styled the machinery by which the Commissariat Department is worked. The sketch is confessedly an imperfect one, rendered the more so perhaps from an over-anxiety not to weary with details, which, though of much importance to the Government and to the Commissariat Department, can have but little interest for the general reader. The next head, as dealing more directly with economies, will, it is hoped, be more appreciated, at any rate by the tax-paying portion of the public.

---

## ART. IX.—TOPICS OF THE QUARTER.

### *Indian Land Revenue.*

OUR article on this subject has attracted, as we anticipated, considerable criticism. We have no intention of making our *Topics of the Quarter* a means for carrying on a controversy with any critic who, during the past three months, in noticing our articles, has ventured to differ from any of our opinions; but the importance of the Land Question is so great, we are all so vitally interested in obtaining clear and correct views on it, that we propose to notice briefly the most important of the comments of those whom we fear we must call our opponents.

The foremost of these is the *Indian Economist*, whose issue of November 21st contains a review of our article. The tone of this review is so moderate that we cannot help feeling that its author, if he has not already considerably modified his former views, has at least no objection to listen to the arguments of the opposite side. We will therefore explain as briefly as possible our reasons for certain statements which he calls in question.

Our first fault of being "too discursive and theoretical to be of any practical value" is scarcely a fault of ours; we never proposed to write a "manual for Settlement Officers," but if our article consists mainly of an examination of various "theories," it is because our opponents have forced their theories on our notice with such boldness and pertinacity. Our own views were stated so briefly that we can hardly be said to have advanced any "theory" at all.

We do not desire to speculate further on the effect of our article on Mr. Mill, but we must take exception to the inference to be drawn from the *Economist's* remarks. It argues thus,—your reflections are so obvious that they must have occurred to any man of ordinary ability, therefore they must have occurred to Mr. Mill; but Mr. Mill has taken no notice of them; this shows that he did not consider them worth an answer; therefore they were *not* worth one. Now it is just these 'obvious' reflections that do *not* occur to some very clever men; and we refuse for one moment to admit that if our reflections have occurred to a great man and been cast aside silently and contemptuously, we are bound instantly to abandon them. A great portion of the religious world refuses to acknowledge the infallibility of a single Pope; in the literary world we are to bow down not to one Pope, but to fifty. A controversy will in future be conducted in the following manner: if any man ventures to put forward any views on any subject, he will be asked by his critic if they are in accordance with the views



of some great man who has written on that subject; if the answer is 'no,' the author will be asked if he pretends to be cleverer than the great man; if again he says 'no,' he will be told that his remarks are obviously worthless. It may be that the reasons advanced by us for thinking that land is much the same as other property were shallow, but we still believe that those who think otherwise have paid little heed to the "signs of the times." Does any one believe that those who are now ready to lead the working classes into possession of our "common inheritance" will be able, if they succeed, to restrain their followers from attacking other property? Will they even attempt to do so? Are not Mr. Mill's schemes for *purchasing* land, and selling or letting it to peasant-proprietors, already scorned as conservative and inadequate? Is it not avowed that the attack is on capital itself, and that it is directed first against land, because the purchase of land is one of the modes of investing capital, and not because land and capital are themselves distinct?

The *Economist* has never met with the statement that "the State is the sole landlord," but it has often been made by Mr. Mill, if not in so many words, at least by implication. We will quote only a single passage, which occurs in his *Political Economy*, Book II, Chapter X., § 3, where he says "in India the Government being itself the landlord can fix the rent according to its judgment." Mr. Knight himself has been almost furious in his crusade against "malguzars" and "middlemen" and those who would call them proprietors; and we much regret to see that since our article was written the Government of India has taken the opportunity afforded by the passing a Revenue Law for the Pánjab, of declaring that the sole limit on the Government demand is the Government caprice. It makes little difference whether the advocates of such a "State" call it the "sole landlord," or a "landlord whose share of the produce of the soil may be extended to the whole." We thought that our own views were expressed with no uncertain sound, and that there was no necessity to "dig them out." We do not hesitate to say that the Land Revenue is a tax on agriculture, but we must point out that we have fully stated why we consider it a defensible tax. Can it be denied that it is a contribution paid from the profits of agriculture, and that if there were no Government, the whole of these profits would justly belong to the agriculturists? If it is not a tax, if it is a rent-charge belonging to the sovereign of the day, as truly as the rents of Lord Mayo's estates belong to him, it follows that it is the personal property of the Queen, that she would have a right to it even if it amounted to 100 millions a year, and that we should praise her benevolence if she expended half of this for the ordinary purposes of Government.

We are next charged with, in our remarks on Joseph's policy, travestying both the Scripture narrative and Mr. Knight's comments on it. We ventured to doubt the inspiration of the idea which fixed the demand at  $\frac{1}{3}$ th of the gross produce. An examiner of the Calcutta University might direct the examinees to "state briefly but clearly the fiscal policy of Joseph, pointing out what "part of it was of divine and what of human origin;" but as we are neither Theological Professors nor Bengali undergraduates, we decline to attempt an answer. We speak diffidently, and can only give our 'impressions' on the subject. The reason for our impression that the tax was an old one is the account given in Genesis xli. Joseph is there said to have advised Pharaoh to provide against the impending famine by taking up  $\frac{1}{3}$ th of the land and storing its produce, but no mention is made of any payment. Therefore, unless the tax was an old one, Joseph was advising an act of downright plunder. It may be urged that though no mention was made of payment, yet it is to be understood. If so, why is any particular share of the produce recommended to be taken? Why did not Joseph simply tell Pharaoh to buy as much corn as he could during the years of plenty? We are blamed for saying that the money was taken 'to be squandered on the pleasures of a corrupt court.' Whatever may have been Joseph's intention, this result certainly did follow, and if he was inspired he must have foreseen it. Genesis xlvii, 26 tells us that the  $\frac{1}{3}$ th became, not 'the share of the common-wealth,' but Pharaoh's; it will hardly be denied that the Pharaohs spent their revenues on their own pleasures, or that their courts were corrupt. Really it is Mr. Knight, and not ourselves, who is guilty of travestying Scripture; let the narrative speak for itself, and we have a natural picture of Joseph's character. He is represented as the "faithful steward of Pharaoh's house," expending Pharaoh's money in such a manner as to benefit *Pharaoh's* people, and Pharaoh himself. If we attempt to take him as a model for a Chancellor of the Exchequer, addressing the House of Commons, we place him in a false and ridiculous position. Let us suppose that Ireland, 30 years ago, was owned in feesimple by peasant-proprietors, that during the height of the famine the Chancellor of the Exchequer informed the House of Commons that he had taken advantage of *the desperate condition* of the people to invest the savings of Her Majesty's privy purse in such a manner as to secure the Royal Family  $\frac{1}{3}$ th of the gross produce of Ireland for ever, and that owing to the severity of distress he had secured this advantage for a mere trifle. Let us suppose him in his peroration to quote the present condition of Egypt and the oriental countries where such a fiscal policy has been in force as a convincing proof that this policy is the wisest a nation can adopt. We should soon see if the greatest statesmen of the day agreed with him.

We are represented as holding that "the criticisms to which "recent settlement operations have been subjected by the *Economist* and others are worthless, because it is only the settlement officers themselves who can decide whether the assessment is "right or wrong." We need scarcely say that we never made any such statement. We *did* hold the criticisms to be worthless; we did so because they were based on a radically wrong principle. Instead of carefully reviewing settlement reports, they condemned the new assessments solely because they fell short of an arithmetical portion of an imaginary gross produce. We should be the last to maintain that settlement officers are infallible and above criticism. Our present state of agricultural knowledge is so imperfect that it is absolutely impossible for the most careful officer to avoid occasional mistakes; to criticise their work to any purpose, we must carefully review it as a whole, and, if we discover errors, we must see whether they are fairly attributable to negligence on the part of the settlement officer, or arise from causes he could not reasonably foresee. A letter is given from a settlement officer, and we are asked what we have to say to it. Simply nothing, for it contains no real data for criticism. We are merely told that the revising officer found 400 estates, where the Government demand was not 40 per cent. of the net assets; this does not prove that the demand was wrong when it was originally fixed; the fact that the proprietors would submit to an increase of 10 per cent. rather than endure the wrong and annoyance necessarily caused by a revision of settlement is very natural; and that the Income-tax excites deep and general discontent is denied by no one but the Supreme Government.

A correspondent of the *Indian Observer* has informed us what is the theory of the Land Revenue in a native State; we think it more important to see what is the actual practice. There is little doubt on this point, and if this practice were fully adopted by our Government, the result would be simply this: every District Officer would screw as much out of his district as he possibly could, and remit to the Commissioner as little as he dare, putting the balance into his own pocket; the same rule would be observed by each superior officer up to the Viceroy, who would not only wrangle in like manner with the Queen, but would openly throw off his allegiance the instant he felt strong enough to do so. We invited our critic to give us some information on the commercial policy of a native State, but neither he nor any one else has been able or willing to do so.

Other critics have stigmatized our policy as 'retrograde,' but surely they cannot have done so seriously. To maintain that only such revenue shall be raised as is actually required, and that it shall be raised in the manner least oppressive to the people, cannot

excite the opposition of the most advanced thinker. If any school deserves the epithet retrograde, it is the one which talks about "*Mughul* shares," and urges us to imitate the fiscal policy of oriental despots.

---

*Education in Bengal.*

WE would call the special attention of our readers to what must be reckoned as by far the most important event of the past quarter; we refer to the measures that have been set on foot by the University of Calcutta to establish Examinations in the Vernacular, after the fashion of the Oxford and Cambridge Middle-Class Examinations. The scheme has grown out of a minute of the Lieutenant-Governor of the N.W. Provinces, in which he expressed his desire that greater encouragement should be given to purely Oriental studies, both classical and vernacular. To effect this object, he put forward a proposal that students, after passing the First Arts Examination, might be allowed the option of confining their studies entirely to Oriental literature for the B.A. Degree. This proposition was met by Mr. E. C. Bayley, the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University, with an amendment that candidates for entrance to the University should be allowed to pass that examination in their own vernaculars. These propositions were submitted to educational authorities in Bengal, the North-West, the Central Provinces, Oudh, and the Panjáb; and, from the discussion that followed, two points clearly emerged. First, that Sir W. Muir's proposition, while encouraging the study of the Oriental classics, would, directly at least, effect little for the vernaculars; secondly, that the Vice-Chancellor's alternative scheme, while it would give a great start to vernacular education, was rather beside the present University system: there would be an Entrance Examination, after which nothing was entered upon. The result of all was a suggestion, independently made by several of those who had been consulted, that an examination through the medium of the vernaculars should be instituted by the University; not in substitution of the ordinary Entrance Examination, but co-ordinate with it.

This scheme has been matured by the Syndicate, and has lately received the sanction of the Senate. As it now stands, the examination will include the following subjects:—

(1) A grammatical knowledge of the language in which the candidate desires to be examined, *viz.*—Bengali, Urdu, Hindi, or Uriya, to which the Syndicate may add any others.

(2) Outlines of the History of India, and Geography.

(3) Mathematics, including Arithmetic, Algebra, and Geometry.

(4) Certain optional subjects; *viz.*—a classical language,

Mensuration, Natural Philosophy, and Physical Geography ; of which a candidate may take up not more than two, but is not required to take up any in order to pass.

We have the fullest confidence that the institution of these examinations will mark an important era in Indian education. It has long been felt that, whatever opinion may be held about the success of the University system, its effect upon the masses of the people has been little or nothing. It was this feeling that inspired Mr. Howell's Note on Education two years ago ; and Mr. Campbell's more recent solicitude for the maintenance of the purity of the vernaculars. The problem was, how to encourage vernacular education without such a diversion of public money as would starve the higher education. Extend and support the *patshala* system as you would, it could only teach boys to read and write : what was wanted was an education higher than this ; and, at the same time, one more suited to the needs of the people than that given in English schools with the Entrance Examination for its goal. True, vernacular schools existed ; but the instruction given in them was neither definite nor uniform ; and they found no encouragement or stimulus beyond the hasty visit of an inspector, whose estimate of their merits was too often decided by accident. The present scheme will, it may fairly be predicted, go far to supply these defects. The examination will provide a searching test of the efficiency of vernacular schools throughout the provinces into which it may be introduced ; at the same time, it will effect an immediate improvement in the teaching of those schools which now exist ; and will, in all probability, lead to the establishment through private efforts of many more. When the scheme is in full working order, the number of those who present themselves for examination will probably be reckoned by thousands ; and the certificate given by the University to those who pass will become a coveted distinction, and will possess a practical value. As a healthy effect of competition, a tradition of high vernacular education cannot fail to spring up, no less important in its results, and much wider-reaching, than the English education which we have seen under development in the last quarter of a century.

The Registrar of the Calcutta University has issued a voluminous Report containing opinions of Educational officers and other gentlemen on the proposed scheme for introducing the study of Physical Science into the Colleges and Schools of India. On this scheme we commented at length in our last number\* ; and the objections therein maintained to the proposals of the Committee have been amply borne out by the opinions embodied in the Report.

---

\* See an Article "Physical Science in the Calcutta University," 1871. *Calcutta Review*, No. cvi., October,

The condemnation of the scheme as put forth by the Committee is practically unanimous. The Committee proposed to introduce the study of Physical Science, not merely into Colleges, but into Zillah and other schools. To this part of the scheme we find the following objections most repeatedly and most forcibly expressed. In Government schools, the expense of providing the requisite teachers and apparatus would be simply enormous. Independent and aided-schools, which have no extra funds to fall back upon, would be altogether debarred from sending up candidates for matriculation. It would most mischievously widen the area of the Entrance Course which, notwithstanding the Committee's facile belief that more might be introduced into it with advantage, is perhaps already too extensive. The suggestion that a sufficiency of dexterous experimentalists might be produced by bringing the Zillah school-masters for one month to Calcutta, seems to betray too sanguine an estimate of their receptive powers. In any case, as the examination must consist in writing answers to some out of a definite series of questions mostly known beforehand, the necessary result would be to encourage "cram."

On the other hand, there seems to be a real desire to give more prominence to Physical Science in the College Course. This is to be effected, not by thrusting Botany and Chemistry by force on unwilling students, but by making many subjects optional which are now compulsory, and thus giving Physical Science an equal chance with other subjects of study. The change might be confined to the B.A. Course; the First Arts Course being retained nearly in its present form, including English, a Classical language, History, Mathematics, and some branch of Mental Science. To us it seems clear that after the solid basis of a liberal education had been thus laid, concentration might advantageously take place. Reduce the six subjects now prescribed for the B.A. Course to three or, at most, four; English being always one, and the others to be selected at the option of the student. The two years which are now, in too many cases, frittered away in an attempt to gain a useless smattering of half-a-dozen subjects,—we speak merely of the 'shady' passman,—might be productive of real profit if he were allowed to confine his attention, say, to English, Mathematics and Physical Science; or to English, Sanskrit and Mental Science. In the English Universities the value of the optional principle is becoming every day more and more fully recognised. At Oxford, up to twenty years ago, all men of whatever intellectual tastes, were bound to pass through the mill of two schools, the classical and the mathematical. At that time two new schools were introduced, those of Law and Modern History and of Physical Science; either of which might be substituted for Mathematics at the option of the candidate. Five years ago, even the classical school of History and

Philosophy, hitherto the characteristic feature of Oxford study, was made optional like the rest ; and, by taking up an additional book at moderations, a man could escape the final Classical School altogether, provided he gave a sufficient guarantee of his being a genuine student by taking at least a third-class in one of the other schools. And it is only yesterday that Congregation decided that those who preferred Greek literature to Latin might have the option of abandoning the latter language, and taking up only Greek books for examination. Solidity in one subject is held to be higher than a superficial knowledge of many. If Oxford has been able, in the face of all her old traditions, to vindicate this principle with such complete success, the Calcutta University need not shrink from attempting a reform which would go far to relieve her of the imputation which is most commonly levelled against her teaching.

At the same time it must not be forgotten that there are serious difficulties to be met in reducing this scheme to practice. If every candidate takes up three subjects where he formerly took up six, he will be expected to know each subject twice as well as before, and therefore will require twice as much instruction in it ; in other words, either the work or the number of the Professors must be doubled. It is not easy to see how this difficulty can be met, except by giving to private study some of the hours now spent in hearing College lectures—a practise which of course prevails in European Universities, but which has not hitherto been largely followed by native students except on the eve of an examination. But the obstacles in the way of the reform are probably not insurmountable ; and meanwhile we should rejoice to see the University recognise, or at least discuss, the principle of narrowing the area and increasing the depth of the attainments of her students.

The Bengáli, as he is now turned out from the educational mill, was some time since the object of very severe and, as we conceive, unjust criticism at the hands of the *Indian Observer*. The high reputation which that paper justly enjoys makes us regret that the writer's estimate of the results of education on Bengális should be apparently coloured by prejudice or scorn. It is not to be denied that the young man who has just been admitted to the B.A. Degree amid the pomp and circumstance of the annual Convocation, does frequently manifest an instability, a flippancy, a conceitedness about his acquirements, which are in ludicrous contrast with the severe view of life which a young Englishman who has his way to make in the world adopts as soon as he puts on his gown. And when the Babu hastens to give prominence to these unpleasant features of his character by inflated speech and inaccurate writing, we are apt to get angry.

But let us at the same time be just. If modesty and reserve are not really notes of the Bengáli character, it seems rather too much to expect that they could be uniformly implanted by the merely intellectual education which is given in our colleges. We might, it is true, be led to hope that the effect of education would be to diminish vanity, to give solidity to the character and dignity to the bearing of those who received it ; and this is precisely what we do find. According to our own experience, modesty and dignity do grow, even among Bengális, in proportion to culture ; and the ungrammatical bombast which we, in common with the *Observer*, find so offensive, is pretty generally confined to the 'bad bargains' of University training ; to those shallow pretenders who have just managed to scrape through the examinations, and who, in other Universities as well as in Calcutta, unless they are the humblest, are then the most conceited men of their year. We have known, not one, but dozens of Bengáli B.A.'s so modest, unaffected, and frank in their bearing that, putting aside any inquiry into their attainments, they are pleasant testimonials to the University training that has done that much at least for them.

On the other hand, if the censure of the *Observer* is directed, not so much against the conceit of the College-trained Bengáli, as against the absence of any visible results of education in Bengáli society, we must still enter our protest against too sweeping a denunciation. It is true that the Bengáli B.A. is not nearly so well-informed, outside the range of his University studies, as the average educated Englishman. But consider the circumstances of his daily life. English education is a thing of yesterday ; and the young Babu who spends five hours of the day in College, passes the rest of the twenty-four among people who have not, in the majority of cases, received a tithe of the advantages that even he has. Unlike the Englishman, he has not the enormous advantage of conversing familiarly and constantly with men of wider culture than himself, and enlarging by that means the range of his intellectual activity. If self-conceit is truly to be ascribed to the educated Bengáli, it is here that we ought to look for its sufficient cause. It should not be forgotten, too, that the Bengáli marries young ; and that the cares and duties of a family shorten in an appreciable degree the leisure which he can devote to the cultivation of his mind.

Or again, is it the failure to produce a literary class that is condemned ? In answer to this we would ask—with a writer in a late number of the *Bengalee* newspaper who, notwithstanding the choice English and temperate tone which mark his letter, is evidently one of that class of educated natives against whom the *Observer* is so severe,—'What sort of works do they require



from our graduates? Do they want them to be Froudes and Gibbons, Arnolds and Grotes? Do they ever imagine the serious difficulties which lie in the way of producing a historical work equal in merit to any of those? Will they point out the library or the muniment-room in India where to look for those heaps of records in which a nation's glory and a nation's achievements lie buried? Nor must the effects of inherited temperament be ignored:—‘Where can we look for the patience, the strong constitution of a Scott, who could extract by mental labour quite inconceivable to us, out of dry manuscripts buried in the dust of ages, the richest materials for the brightest and happiest creations of genius? To a weak and enervated Bengáli the attempt to collate and verify one-tenth of the references with which Gibbon's pages are filled, seems to be attended with insurmountable difficulties.’ To us indeed it seems that English education has attained a degree of success which is really remarkable. We have sown the seed, and we may look forward to a time when the branches of the tree shall spread and cover the land; but we need not commit the error of expecting to enjoy the shade of the oak within a few months of planting the acorn.

It may be reasonably conjectured that the class against which the *Observer* launches his thunder is not the class from which his experience has been drawn. English education in this country means two totally different things:—*First*, elementary English education in language merely, such as is given under a native head-master in Zillah and other schools; *secondly*, the higher education in literature and science which is given in the colleges. The first turns out a numerous and useful body of men, who become shop-keepers; who furnish forth the whole class of *Keranís* in Government and private offices; who fill the lower posts in the Subordinate Executive service; but who otherwise have no pretensions to cultivation. The second sends forth every year a number of men who retire to their *Zemindaris*; who take to the professions of law and education; who show a more or less intelligent interest in the novel field of local and imperial politics; and from whom must arise, if it arises at all, that literary class which we desire to see. But the former outnumber the latter by twenty to one; and when the English-speaking Babu is discussed, the thoughtless or prejudiced observer is apt to confound the two classes. Whatever may be the faults of the educated Bengáli, we need not magnify them by a fallacy of confusion, nor need we credit them to the University training which does its best to eradicate them; and, unless the experience of all educators is to go for nothing, we might reasonably expect to find that the character of a man who has been for four years under the personal influence and sympathy of a cultivated Englishman, is set in a different mould from that of

one whose education has ceased, at sixteen years of age, with the Entrance Examination.

Mr. Lobb has contributed, during the past quarter, a number of letters on the subject of education to the *Bengalee* and the *Indian Observer*. Mr. Lobb's sympathies are so large, and his interest in the subject so keen, that anything that he writes is sure to command attention. His condemnation of the worship of the demon of competition is forcible and just; it is at best, but a clumsy expedient for determining the ablest men; and in many cases it seems studiously designed to keep the best men out. "Give me a man with courage, and perseverance, and foresight, with a good dose of pride and love of power, with a keen faculty of observation, and strong common-sense. Give me these qualities in my leader, and I shall be little careful about the accuracy of his spelling, or the extent of his proficiency in the Aryan languages; but these qualities can never be tested by our present competitive examinations." But the system has taken firm root in India as it has in England, and our efforts should be directed towards lessening its abuses, and developing it into something higher and better. Gradually and insensibly it has taken such a form as to encourage the belief that the end of education has been attained when an examination has been passed; and the consequence is that the University Course prescribes, and examiners set questions in, subjects which are too often chosen with little reference to their power of developing the intelligence of the students. But we cannot think that Mr. Lobb is particularly happy in the examples which he chooses to illustrate this perversity. He complains, and with much justice, of the common inability shown by educated natives to write decent English; and he attributes it in great part to the line which instruction is forced to take by the injudicious questions of examiners. Among the questions which he condemns are the following:—"Remark upon the vocabulary of Milton, comparing it with that employed by his contemporaries and by modern writers." It seems to us that this is just the sort of question which ought to be asked of students who read Milton. If they are to be taught English out of authors separated by an interval of two centuries, it is first of all desirable (since it is accuracy in writing English that Mr. Lobb insists on), that they should attain to a sort of grammatical perspective; that they should be able to discriminate modern forms and phrases from those which are farther off in time.

The same remark applies to questions upon the derivation and the different meanings of a word. Minute differences in meaning, to which derivation helps us, are exactly what the Bengáli, like any other foreigner, fails in. He does not know the circle, so to speak, in which a word moves; and he is constantly introducing it

to strangers of a different social scale ; with the most grotesque results. " Look mercifully upon my failings, and the Almighty will reward you tit for tat," is a good illustration of what we should try and teach the Bengáli to avoid. The only questions that Mr. Lobb seems to approve are those involving the argument of a poem or story, and paraphrase. It may be easily conjectured what sort of stuff is produced when a passage of Macaulay is given to be rendered into Bengáli English ; and we have always looked upon a ' paraphrase ' question as the offer of a premium for the use of bad language. In fact, so long as the University sets selections from particular authors, examiners must set critical and philological questions ; otherwise students might as well be taught English out of the newspapers, and examined in the current number of the *Saturday Review*. The real reason why students write bad English is that they have too much to do ; if the number of subjects that they have to learn is reduced, the standard of English will be raised like the rest.

We do not understand why Mr. Lobb censures questions about the Aryan languages ; there seems to be no sufficient reason why Bengáli students of English should not be taught that these languages are in origin identical ; and that the Greeks and Romans whose history they learn, as well as the French and Germans whose deeds they read of in the newspapers, are akin to their own Sanskrit-speaking predecessors. Mr. Lobb thinks that such questions encourage ' a wide-spread intellectual dishonesty,' because Bengális cannot know any Aryan languages except their own, Sanskrit and English. But results have a value quite independent of the processes by which they have been discovered ; and there would be just as much reason for refusing to teach students the laws of planetary motion, until they could deduce them mathematically from the law of central forces. The links which bind Humanity together are not so numerous or so strong that we can afford to despise such help as is given by the knowledge of a common language and a common origin.

---

## CRITICAL NOTICES.

---

### 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

---

*S'rimadbhágavata*. Part I. Translated into Bengáli by Káli Prasanna Sarkár. Calcutta : Bharata Press. B.E. 1278.

THE great Purána *S'rimadbhágavata* is one of those few books which have exercised a mighty influence on the people of India. It is the Vaishnava's Holy Bible ; he reads it by day and meditates on it by night. It produced that important religious revolution, which took place among the mass of the people of Bengal in the beginning of the sixteenth century, and the effects of which are still visible in the midst of us ; for it was from the *Bhágavata* that Chaitanya, the promoter of that revolution, chiefly drew his inspiration. It is, therefore, no wonder that attempts should be made to translate into the vulgar tongue so influential a book. Some years ago a translation was published by the enterprising proprietor of the Purnachandra Press in A'mratalá Street ; but the capital defect of that translation, however faithful, was that the Bengáli was scarcely intelligible and readable. The translation before us certainly avoids that defect, the language being easy and flowing ; but whether it is as faithful a transcript of the original as it is readable, we cannot say, as we have not compared the Bengáli with the Sanskrit. We trust Bábu Káli Prasanna Sarkár will meet with sufficient encouragement to enable him to carry on and complete a work which he has begun with so much spirit.

---

*Pravandha-Kusumávalí*. By I's'ána Chandra Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. B.E. 1278.

THIS is a collection of small poems, some of which first appeared in the columns of two Bengáli weekly newspapers. Some of the subjects on which the poet sings are as follows :—“ Time ; ” “ Nature ; ” “ Mercy ; ” “ The Slave's Lament ; ” “ Clouds ; ” “ Heaven and Hell ; ” “ Spiritual Knowledge ; ” “ Hope ; ” “ The Garden of Youth ; ” “ The Sinner's Soul ; ” “ The Moon ; ” “ Knowledge not Riches the root of Happiness.” Some of the pieces show that our author has considerable poetical sensibility.

*Pramodukāmint Kāvya.* By Asutosh Mukhopādhyāya. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. B.E. 1278.

WE are sorry we cannot speak so favourably of the poetical attempt before us as of the preceding one ; but perhaps the reason is that it provokes a comparison with the exquisite English poem of which it is an adaptation and an elaboration. There is hardly any one but must have admired the unaffected and touching simplicity of the ballad called "The Hermit," which Goldsmith has introduced into his *Vicar of Wakefield*. The adaptation into Bengali of that beautiful ballad is not a successful one. It is wanting in every one of those qualities which distinguish Goldsmith's compositions, whether prose or verse,—simplicity, quiet humour, delicacy of feeling.

---

*A'yurveda-Sārasamgraham.* Part I. Edited and translated by Gopāl Chandra Senagupta. Calcutta : Columbian Press. B.E. 1278.

IT appears from the Preface of this book that there is a "Society of Physicians" whose local habitation is in some house in Madan Mitra's Lane in Sukea's Street in Calcutta. This learned body, contemplating with infinite regret the ignorant contempt with which the ancient system of Hindú medicine is generally treated by both Europeans and educated Natives, resolved to publish a compendium of Hindú medicine in Sanskrit and to translate it into Bengali. The President of the Society fixed upon our author as the best qualified person for undertaking the important work just mentioned. How he set about the task will be best understood by his own words which we quote from his English Preface:—"In undertaking this task, which I very reluctantly did, knowing the thousand impediments that lie in the way, I have spared no pains in endeavouring to make the work as useful as possible, and have consulted various authors, chiefly, Tontro, Churruck, Soosrutto, Baghhaut Harit, Sarrun-godhar, &c. The result of my labour I publish under the name of AYURVEDA-SUNGRAHA." That our readers may have some idea of the contents of the elaborate work, the first part of which only has been just published, we subjoin the author's programme:—"It is to be divided into fourteen parts. The first to contain an account of the origin of the A'yurveda, the duties of practitioners, directions for feeling the pulse, and a few general remarks on the symptoms and treatment of fever ; in the 2nd, I mean to treat of the several varieties of fever with their causes, symptoms, and treatment ; the 3rd, 4th and 5th on various diseases, their causes, symptoms, and treatment. The 6th, general

discourse on medicines, their preparations and administration ; 7th, Anatomy ; 8th, Surgery ; 9th, Midwifery ; 10th, Chemistry ; 11th, Vegetables ; 12th, Bajicaran Tuntra ; 12th, Augod Tuntra ; 14th, Santi Tuntra." From the above syllabus it is evident that the work, if properly performed, will be a deeply interesting one. Though, owing to the daily advance of physical science, the European system of therapeutics must be vastly superior to that of the ancient Hindús, there is no doubt that the Hindú system is one of no ordinary merit ; and the superior local knowledge of the ancient Kavirájes may suggest to the European sons of *Æsculapius* some therapeutic agents with which they are at present unacquainted.

In the instalment of the work now before us, there are some things of curious interest. The origin of the A'yurveda was in this wise. At a time of universal sickness, when it became difficult for Bráhmans to prosecute their studies and to discharge their religious duties, and when the very existence of man was threatened,—though deponent sayeth not when that period occurred in the world's history—some of the holiest sages of antiquity, such as Angirá, Yámadagni, Vasistha, Kasyapa, Bhṛigu, Gotama, Visvámitra, and a host besides, repaired to some sacred spot on the Himálaya mountains, and held there a solemn council with a view to devise measures for checking the progress of disease. The holy sages perceived through the "eye of knowledge" that Indra, the king of Heaven, was alone acquainted with the true remedy of disease. They therefore determined to send to him a deputation begging him mercifully to reveal the important secrets. But what being, mortal or immortal, could venture into the presence of that thousand-eyed divinity whose effulgence was like that of a "living flame?" The devavarshi Bharadvája volunteered ; and by his pleasing manners so insinuated himself into his good graces, that Indra revealed to him all the secrets of recovery from disease. Thus the A'yurveda is divinely inspired. We give below a few curiosities from the A'yurveda. When a physician feels the pulse of a patient, he should feel it in the right hand of a man, the left hand of a woman, and in both the hands of a eunuch. Hence no Kaviráj in Bengal ever feels a woman's pulse in her right hand. Any person through whose right nostril the wind blows day and night, will die in the course of three years. He who sees blue rays round the moon, and imagines serpents everywhere, cannot live longer than three months from that date. A man who will soon die cannot see the star Arundhati ; nor can he see the Pole star. He who cannot perceive the taste either of sour things or of salt, will die in six months. He who cannot see in water the reflection of his own image or of his head, will die in six months. The above specimens will suffice.

*Hektar-badha.* (From the Greek). By Michael Madhusúdana Datta. Calcutta : Stanhope Press. 1871.

WHY the author of this abstract in Bengáli of a portion of the *Iliad* should have said on the title-page that he had rendered it from the Greek, we are at a loss to understand ; for the performance before us is neither a translation nor a paraphrase of the original *Iliad*. We have compared some portions of the version before us with the original, and have found that whole passages have been omitted and others freely tampered with, apparently for no intelligible reason ; at least the writer nowhere gives any reason for the omissions or the interpolations. In the dedication he says—it would have been very troublesome to have given a literal and faithful translation of the original. Very likely ; but the question is, what necessity was there for Mr. Datta to have come forward with a mere abstract of the *Iliad* instead of giving us a faithful translation of the whole ? But it seems we, poor wretches, deserve nothing, and ought to be thankful for small mercies ; for Mr. Datta gives us not merely an abstract of the *Iliad*, but he has the coolness—is not impudence the more accurate word ?—to tell us that while the book was being carried through the press some pages of the “copy” were lost through the negligence of the printer, which he has not had the leisure to re-write. So the fourth chapter of the book appears without a beginning ! When a man like Sir William Hamilton brings out a volume with the last sentence not finished, we hardly forgive the great metaphysician such cavalier treatment of the public ; what then shall we say of Mr. Datta, when he publishes a book one of the chapters of which has no beginning ? But whether the performance is lame or entire, our author, it seems, is sure of a passport to immortality. He dedicates his book to a native gentleman who has written one or two school-books in Bengáli, and to that gentleman he says—“Friend ! the rock out of which you are cutting the column of your fame, time itself will not be able to destroy.” If this be true of a gentleman who has written one or two successful school-books, the inference is, it is much more true of a person like our author who is certainly a more considerable and pretentious writer. But are these *kirtti-stambhas*, or *fame-pillars*, which the Bengáli writers of the day are raising for themselves, made of the everlasting rock ? We doubt it. The material seems to us to be more like the mud of the Hugli than the granite of the Himálaya, the white-stone of Jaipur, or even the rock-slate of Monghir ; and instead of standing for ever, we fear they will dissolve, like the baseless fabric of a vision, in the course of two lustrums. Mr. Datta’s ambition seems to have no limit. The capacity of the Bengáli language is too weak, and its range too limited, to give

expression to his profound thoughts. He must therefore re-construct the etymology of Bengali grammar. We doubt, however, whether the present Bengali etymology, however old-fashioned, will be abandoned to make room for a new-fangled etymology, however powerfully advocated.

---

*Ushá Nátaka.* By Srimatí Káminí Sundarí Deví. Calcutta : J. G. Chatterjea and Co's Press. 1871.

IF this drama has been written really by a Bengali lady, it is very creditable to her, and must be at the same time regarded as a gratifying proof of the great progress which some Bengali ladies have made in mastering their mother-tongue. But we suspect it is a mere hoax. We are inclined to believe that the author is of the masculine and not of the feminine gender ; and that the name of a lady has been put on the title-page of the book with a view to excite curiosity and to ensure a large sale. How far the sale has answered the expectations of the author we do not know ; but a joke of this sort (if it be, as we suspect, a joke) hardly takes now-a-days. The play itself is of no great merit, and does not call for any remarks.

---

*Suradhuní Kávyá.* Part I. By Dina Bandhu Mitra. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press. Sakábdá 1793.

BABU Dina Bandhu Mitra is the author of several overpraised dramatic compositions, such as the *Nil Darpana*, *Navin Tapasvī*, *Sadhabár Ekádasi*, and others. The *Nil Darpana* has become a rather notorious drama in consequence of its translation into English under the auspices of the Rev. Mr. Long, and of his subsequent imprisonment ; but the play itself is a poor performance. The other plays of our author are, in our opinion, cleverer ; but their great fault is their coarseness. The Babu is regarded as a sort of comical genius ; we confess, however, that his attempts at comicality oftener provoke our anger than our mirth. There is no refinement, no delicacy in our author's wit ; it is of the coarsest and broadest sort. It may excite the laughter of women, of children, of uncultivated boors, but a man of culture often turns away from it with disgust ; and if some of the plays, which we have named above, are popular to a certain extent, it only shows that the taste of the reading public in Bengal is uncultivated and rude. Babu Dina Bandhu Mitra, it appears, has left off courting the Muse of comedy and has begun wooing her more sedate sister of epic poetry ; but it would seem from the attempt before us that he is less favoured by Calliope than by Thalia. The *Suradhuní Kávyá* is a poem describing the descent of the river Ganges from its



source on the "secret top" of Himálaya, its course through the wide-extended plains of Hindústán, and its fall into the Bay of Bengal. In the first part, which is before us, the Ganges or rather the Bhágirathi has been brought down from the mountains to Triveni which is not far from Hugli; the rest of the course from Triveni to Gangá Ságara being reserved for the second and final part.

That there are merits in the book it would be unjust to deny. The descriptions of some of the places are good; while the conception of the tributaries of the Ganges as her sisters and brothers coming to meet her and giving an account of their travels is really fine. There are in it, however, faults of a very grave character. In the first place the whole poem is one huge anachronism from beginning to end. The subject of the poem is the descent of the Ganges,—an event which, according to Hindú mythology, must have occurred in the remotest ages of antiquity,—and yet our poet describes the towns near which the river passes just as they are in the year of grace 1871. In the second place, the descriptions of some of the towns are very childish. In the long description of Krishnagar we are, for instance, told the name of a Bengáli writer of no great reputation, and of a boy in the college who many years ago stood high in his examinations! In the third place, our poet has made a glaring mistake in geography—the Ganges is first brought down to Benares and then to Mirzapur, as if the former place were higher up the river than the latter. In the fourth place, the versification is incorrect in a great many passages—indeed in almost every page there are some lines in which the laws of Bengáli prosody are violated. We did not expect in Babu Dina Bandhu Mitra the majestic simplicity of a Homer, the consummate art of a Virgil, or the sublimity of a Milton; but we certainly expected that before ushering in to the world a volume of poetry, he would at least scan his lines and see whether they are verses or not. But this he does not seem to have done.

---

*Rasa-Kádamviní.* Calcutta: Girisa-Vidyáratna Press. 1871.

**T**HIS is a translation into Bengáli verse of the Sanskrit poem called *Amaru-Sataka*, or the hundred *śloka*s of Amaru.

It is not known when the poet Amaru lived, or in what part of India he lived; but there is no doubt that he had poetical powers of a high order. He may be justly called the Anacreon of India, as his poem treats chiefly of love and women though not of wine; and his verses like those of his Hellenic predecessor show considerable poetic sensibility. The Hindú poet, in our opinion, is superior to the Greek, from an ethical point of view. The Bengáli version is of considerable merit, though the peculiarly

rich exotic flavour of the original is somewhat dissipated in the translation ; but this can hardly be called a fault, as poetry we believe to be untranslatable.

---

*Prabodha-Chandrodaya Nataka.* By the late Visvanátha Nayáratna. Calcutta: G. P. Roy & Co's Press. Sakábdá 1793.

THE celebrated metaphysical play in Sanskrit entitled *Probodha Chandrodaya*, the "Moonlight of Intelligence," or the "Rise of Intellect," is known to the mere English reader through Dr. Taylor's translation. What Taylor did for the English reading public, Visvanátha Nayáratna has done for the Bengáli. The learned translator died before the book was sent to the press, and it is now published by his sons. The translation, so far as we have seen, seems to be very good.

---

*Jambúdní.* By Yádavendra Bandyopádhya. Calcutta: Vidyáratna Press. 1871.

THIS is a tale in Bengáli verse of no great interest. If the writer had related the story in honest prose, it might have been readable ; but as it is, it is quite unintelligible. The versification is throughout incorrect and inharmonious ; there is hardly a spark of genuine poetical fire in it, though the book is 137 pages long. If he ever had any poetic fire, it must have been put out by the cold and snows of Dárjiling where, it appears from the preface, the poet has taken up his abode.

*Gáyatrí-Prakaranam.* By Táránáth Tarkaváchaspati. Calcutta : New Sanskrit Press. Samvat 1928.

IT appears from this pamphlet that there is in Calcutta an association called the *Āryāvarttarūpīsamsthāpanīśabhā* that is to say, "The society for the establishment of formulæ worthy of being learnt by Aryans." It is a pure Bráhmanical association, Súdras being excluded from its membership. Its object is to diffuse the knowledge, and to promote the practice, amongst the Bráhmans of Bengal, of those Vaidik formulæ and usages which, owing to priestly ignorance and worldliness, are fast becoming obsolete. The President of the Association is Babu Trailakya Náth Mukhopádhya, and one of its leading members Pandit Táránáth Tarkaváchaspati. The *brochure* before us contains two discourses delivered at two meetings of the association by the latter gentleman. The object of those discourses is to give an exposition of the *Gáyatrí*, which is regarded as the holiest text and the very cream of the four Vedas. The learned Pandit accomplishes his

object by quoting from a variety of the sacred books of the Hindús authoritative expositions of the holy text. The exposition, as is to be expected, is both grammatical and mythical. We give an instance of the latter. On the authority of the Sage Yájnavalkya, the Pandit says that each of the twenty-four letters which go to make up the Gáyatrí represents a deity. The twenty-four letters are symbolical of the following deities :—

Tat represents the god Agni.			
Sa	...	...	Vāyu.
Vi	...	...	Sun.
Tuh	...	...	Vidyut.
Va	...	...	Yama.
Re	...	...	Varuna.
N	...	...	Vrihaspat.
Yam	...	...	Parjjanya.
Bh	...	...	Indra.
Rg	...	..	Gandharvva.
De	...	...	Púshá.
Va	...	...	Mitra Varuna.
Sya	...	...	Tashta.
Dhan...	...	...	Vasu.
Ma	...	...	Marut.
Hi	...	...	Moon.
Dhi	...	...	Angiras.
Yah	...	...	Visvadeva
Yah	...	...	Asviníkumára.
Nah	...	...	Prajápati.
Pra	...	...	Sarvadevatá.
Cho	...	...	Rudra.
Da	...	...	Brahmá.
Yát	...	...	Vishnu.

Any Bráhmaṇ who, while daily repeating the Gáyatrí, remembers the names of the above divinities, is, we are told, sure to become the object of their especial favour.

---

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE.

*A Report on the Family History of the Chief Clans of the Roy Bareilly District.* By W. C. Benett, C.S. Oudh Secretariat Press, Lucknow.

THIS valuable report is one of a class which we are glad to see becoming more numerous every year. Monographs on the history or antiquities of particular districts, written by resident officials of cultivation and experience, must always be of the highest scientific value; to no one else is the information so fully accessible, and no other writers can so satisfactorily weigh the evidence and sift the wheat from the chaff. Dr. Hunter in his delightful *Annals of Rural Bengal*, demonstrated how much might be done in the way of throwing light on a little-known district, by an ingenious and zealous district officer; and the success of that work, both here and at home, proved that literary ability, when backed by the special knowledge that may be attained by any mofussil resident, can awaken an interest in the history of rural India, not only amongst Anglo-Indians, but also amongst English and Continental readers. The lesson taught by Dr. Hunter's book has not been lost sight of. Mr. Westland in Jessor, Mr. Oldham in Gházipur, Mr. Carnegie in Oudh, Mr. Bruce in the Dera Gházi Khán district, and other officers elsewhere, each in his own way and for his own locality, have not unworthily followed the good example; and Mr. Benett's report before us is not the least valuable of these interesting memoirs.\*

The information thus presented to the public is derived partly from mofussil records, long stored away out of sight, and rapidly mouldering under the combined attacks of the climate, the white ants, and the neglect of ignorant and careless record-keepers; partly from local researches, the results of which when tabulated are seemingly but small, but which have often cost the enquirer years of patient and unremitting toil. We have no hesitation in affirming this of the labours of Mr. Benett; who has, whilst stationed in the Rái Bareli district, collected a vast mass of information, which he has wisely compressed into a small book of about seventy pages. Those who have genealogical tastes will here find an entirely new field for the indulgence of their taste; but Mr. Benett's book will,

\* Mr. Lepel Griffin's *Panjab Rájás* (reviewed in the *Calcutta Review* of October last), and the *Gazetteers* that have recently appeared, are splendid examples of the scientific results to be expected from extended researches of this kind. The series of *Imperial Gazetteers* which are pro-

mised us under the auspices of Dr. Hunter, will doubtless bring into a focus all the information that can be thus obtained; and will probably form a topographical and historical encyclopædia for India, of unrivalled interest and scientific value.

if we are not mistaken, be fully appreciated by future historians of Oudh ; and it will be of considerable value to Indian historians generally, on account of the evidence which is brought to bear on two or three points in the very unsettled chronology of India previous to the period of British ascendancy.

The most important conclusions Mr. Benett arrives at, at the end of his work, are thus summed up:—"The destruction of Jhansi occurred therefore in the middle of the 14th century ; the foundation of the Partábgarh raj is contemporaneous with the invasion of Tímúr [A.D. 1403] and the conversion of Muluk Singh with the establishment of the Jaunpur empire" [A.D. 1393]. Here, then, are three definite dates, authoritatively settled for future writers on the subject.

For the first fifty pages the reader wades through masses of facts in which he would fain take an intelligent interest ; but he feels himself rather at sea for want of some clue to the plot—some notion of what these facts may be leading him up to. It is then with considerable delight that he at last, though rather tardily, gets some enlightenment about the plan and arrangement of the work. The development of the history of the clans is naturally divided, we are told, into three periods:—"The first extending from the invasion of Shahabuddin Ghori to the downfall of Jaunpur ; the second beginning with the kingdom of Tilokchand and ending with the re-conquest by Saádat Khán ; and the last reaching down to the annexation, during which the whole social fabric was changed by the Lucknow Government. Throughout, the main fact has been the living growth of Hindúism, beside which the Muhammadan empires with their elaborate revenue systems and network of officials have been merely secondary causes, like artificial dams, temporarily impeding and distorting the course of a strong river."

With this partition of the subject to guide us we shall be better able to understand the earlier portion of the work. Rái Bareli is in the south-west of Oudh in Chakla Baiswarra ; and about forty-six miles S.S.E. from Lucknow. As might be expected, nothing of importance is known of the early history of the place ; but in the 13th and 14th centuries the district seems to have been overrun by the Bhars, whence the name Bareli. They had two famous chieftains, the brothers *Dal* and *Bal* ; who laid the foundation of the Bhar supremacy, but who in their turn succumbed to Ibráhím Sharki, the third\* of the Sharki or Jaunpur dynasty. This Emperor having established his power at Dalman, proceeded

---

\* Mr. Benett calls him the *second* of the Jaunpur dynasty ; but he forgets that the founder of the dynasty, Khwájah-i-Jahán, had an adopted son named Mubárak Sháh, who succeeded him in A.D. 1399. Ibráhím succeeded his father Mubárak in A.D. 1401.

next to take possession of Rái Bareli ; and brought the whole district nominally under the Musalmán rule. Only nominally, for the Musalmán power was centred in the chief fortified villages ; while a number of Hindú families, chiefly Rájputa, who had migrated eastward, had settled in different portions of Oudh ; and the chiefs of their families, extending their power over a number of small villages, reigned absolutely over their own districts, waged wars with one another, and resisted the Muhammadan supremacy at every opportunity. When the Sharki Dynasty was supplanted by the Lodís, in A.D. 1476, Tilockchand founded a dominion as independent of the Sultáns of Delli as that of the great Hindú Rájás of the west of Hindústán.

Tilokchand was the chief of the Bais tribe, the most important of the clans with which the author has to do. The main portion of the work is taken up with tracing the history and descent of several clans ; the chief of which are the Bais, the Kanhpurias, the Amethias, the Saibansis, and the Sombaneis. These clans though of great local importance will have little interest for the general reader. The author has drawn up with great pains at the end of the report a series of pedigrees of each of the leading families. Under Akbar's rule the clans lost ground considerably, but the chief result was only to make each more despotic within a reduced circle ; and under his successors they enlarged their territories and new branches or offshoots of the old clans spread out over other portions of the country. The Bais lost their leading position among the clans, and it seems to have been taken up alternately by the Kanhpuria and Amethia houses ; but none ever succeeded in entirely subduing the others ; and representatives of each family still remain among the Zemindars and Talukdars of Oudh.

A curious and suggestive feature in this history is the almost total extermination of the previous inhabitants, the Bhars—doubtless a non-Aryan tribe. They had two enemies to strive against, the Mughuls and the Hindús. Their peculiar customs, language and nationality prevented their uniting with either party ; and accordingly, whether Hindú or Musalmán prevailed, the Bhars were continually losing ground. Many were killed ; many fled to the north and east ; but a few, the author says, still remain in their old territory under modern names.

Mr. Benett gives a very clear and succinct account of the rights exercised by each Rájá in his own dominions ; the details of which strikingly resemble the rights that the greater Barons and Tenants-in-capite had under the Norman kings in England, and afford another illustration of the almost absolute identity of the Eastern and Western Feudal Systems which has often been observed by historians. We have already said that the Mughul power was little more than nominal. The author shows the con-

nexion between the two jurisdictions so clearly that we prefer giving it in his own words.

"Generally the Hindú chiefs seem to have held aloof, and looked on at a system of officials they were not strong enough to interfere with. Occasionally they contributed a quota of men to the Imperial Forces, and every now and then a troublesome chief was conciliated by *jágír* of territories already practically his own. The grants of *mansabs* became specially common in the period of weakness which succeeded the outbreak of the Mahratta Wars, when the Emperors were glad to attach to themselves powerful elements which they could not subdue. But we never find any great house taking a place in the regular ranks of local officials ; and the fact that the office of *Chaudhri* was never held by one of the leading clans of the district throws some light on their position. It was generally held by the respectable but thoroughly second-rate families, such as the Janwars of Khiron, Kathbais of Jagdispur, the Shekhs of Bhilwal, and the Kaiths of Roy Bareilly. The Baisu the Kanhpurias, Sonbaucis, and even the Amethias never contributed a single member to this order."

The information relative to the last of the three periods is very scanty. The different clans had been divided and subdivided so often that they had quite lost the strength which is inherent in every well-concentrated Government ; and there was very little power of opposition left, when Sa'ádat Khán, the famous "Persian Pedlar," established his strong rule in the country, in defiance of Muhammad Sháh of Dehli. Sa'ádat Khán seems to have made very good use of his acquisition ; and manifested an excellent policy in confirming the chiefs in their several holdings or parganas, at the same time entrusting to them the collection of the revenues. Nevertheless from the days of Sa'ádat Khán to those of Wájid Alí Sháh, who was deposed by Lord Dalhousie, the country knew neither peace nor prosperity. Eleven princes in all ruled. In 1819, the Nawáb, under the advice of Lord Hastings, assumed the title of King ; and threw off even his nominal dependence upon the Court of Dehli. But the Government went from bad to worse ; the revenues wrung from the people were squandered, and nothing done for the country, till at last there was no alternative, and in 1836 Oudh was annexed to the British dominions. The heads of the clans and of families, together with successful officials, king's servants and others, all became Talukdárs engaging with the Government for holding so many villages. Through all the changes that occurred, the native village-system maintained its ground. Occasionally the head of some wealthy family became the sole Zamíndár of the village ; but the common arrangement was "a society of labourers each in the possession of the lands in his immediate cultivation, and presided

over by a leading member who collected and apportioned the incidence of the Government revenue; for which services he was remunerated by a light assessment on his peculiar holding, and to a right called 'mukadami' which has perhaps survived in a number of forms to the present day."

The latter portion of Mr. Benett's work is by far the most interesting. Many people who would care nothing about the genealogy and statistics of families of whose very names they were formerly totally ignorant, might learn some useful lessons about the contrast between the Musalmán and Hindú Government. The former was essentially central, branching out in various directions and through numerous officials; but as it continued to spread it got weaker and weaker at the core, and under the later Emperors the Mughul Government was but a shadow—a Government merely in name. The Hindú system, on the contrary, of which the Rájás in Oudh may be taken as a sample, was a local one. One Rájá might fall; but it was only to be supplanted by another with the same powers, wielded with renewed vigour. While the Musalmán power decayed utterly, the Hindú only sank to rise again. This fact is urged very strongly by the author, one of whose concluding paragraphs we here transcribe:—

"The mistake which vitiates almost all our political theories in India, is that we are the successors of the Musalman Emperors: were we only that, we should not be here now. The vital fact is that we have, or at any rate think that we have, succeeded where the Muhammadans in their strongest days never attained complete success, in taking the places of the local princes, and in substituting our own for native law and organization. The Commissioner has supplanted not so much the Názim as the Rájá."

The Muhammadan chronicles of the Sultáns, and the Histories of India that have as yet been written, do not elucidate the history of the people themselves, any more than the accounts of the reigns and battles of our English Kings in older histories bring to light the important social movements of the various ages. Considerable credit is therefore due to Mr. Benett for the pains he has taken to add to our real knowledge of Indian history by his researches into the antiquity of the Oudh clans. The task is a difficult one; and all the more so as the subject is somewhat contracted. One or two small charts of the district, dotting off approximately the localities of the separate families at stated epochs, would have conducted materially to facilitate the reader's comprehension. The dryness of the subject to unscientific readers is relieved by the occasional recurrence of legends given in a brief, simple, and forcible style. The present representatives of the families near Rái Bareli ought to be deeply grateful to Mr. Benett for rescuing their ancestors from oblivion. The general style of the book is pleasing; and



the language clear and simple. The spelling of names is according to the method adopted by the Asiatic and other learned Societies and by the Government of India. Some readers might not at first sight recognize Cawnpore and the Gogra river under their present aspect *Kanhpur* and *Ghagra*; yet we are glad to note the adhesion of one more writer to the only system of spelling which has any chance of being at length generally used. There are no descriptions of the country itself; nor any accounts of the habits and members of the people, omissions which may be regretted.

But these are comparatively minor points. Mr. Benett has succeeded in infusing interest into a somewhat difficult subject; and we believe that the scientific world will discover in his book much that is of real and lasting value.

---

*Classical Studies in India.* By MAX MÜLLER, M.A., Fellow of All Souls' College, and Professor of Modern European Languages in the University of Oxford. From the *Contemporary Review*. 1871.

IN this paper Professor Max Müller puts forward a plea for the encouragement of the study of Sanskrit in India. The number of European scholars who pay attention to this subject must always be small; and the fact that in the University of Leipzig the classes of the Professor of Sanskrit are attended by no less than fifty pupils, is probably the greatest triumph that Sanskrit scholarship is likely to achieve in Europe. Those only who devote themselves to the critical study of the Science of Language, or to a comparative examination of the ancient philosophies and religions of mankind, will consent to give to Sanskrit the years of toil which the study of its literature requires. Their reward, it is true, will be great. We need not refer to the revolution in the study of language which began with Bopp's essay, little more than half a century ago, and to the development of which few have contributed more largely than Professor Müller himself. What chiefly attracts thinkers at the present day is the knowledge that Sanskrit literature is a rich treasury in which lie hidden systems of thought and theories of the universe bearing a startling relation to the results which modern European speculation has independently developed. It will not be denied that Spinoza and Schelling have exercised a far-reaching influence upon the thought, and even upon the practice, of Western nations; and the systems of Spinoza and Schelling find their counterparts, no less complete and profound, in Sanskrit philosophy. Here then is a tempting field for research; but, for want of early familiarity with the implements, the labourers must be few.

In India it is different. The Hindú learns Sanskrit in the Colleges, just as the European learns Latin: and at an age when

the Englishman or German who takes to Sanskrit is toiling painfully through the grammar of the language, the Hindú has mastered its rudiments, and can commence the fruitful study of its literature. He can commence it, that is, if opportunities are given him. The class of Paudits is fast dying out; the Bráhmans of the Nadiya Tois send their sons to English schools; and there is some ground for Sir Henry Maine's prediction that in fifty years the native study of Sanskrit will have disappeared. At the same time, no other literary class is springing up to take the place of that which is passing away. And yet if English education is to leave its mark upon the intellectual life of the nation, we should expect to find, as one of its most valuable and permanent results, the growth of a learned class turning with reverent affection to the literature which enshrines the monuments of their heroic past, and studying it with an intelligence cultivated and cleared by a sounder education than their predecessors enjoyed. In the growth of such a class we might hope to find an efficient safeguard against the negativism to which the educated native too commonly surrenders himself, and which threatens to produce a generation without reverence for the past, and without an aspiration for the future. This indifference cannot be attributed solely to English education; it is probable that missionary labours in India must be credited with a large part of the result. Rejecting, as missionaries have generally done, any attempt, such as that of Ballantyne, to approach the Hindús on the common ground of Hindúism and Christianity, they have laboured to destroy the old faith, in the hope of establishing the new in its place. The more learned among them have, for two generations, been unceasing in their assaults upon Brahmanical doctrine; and their blows have told. The Pandit may possibly have got the best of the argument, but the seeds of doubt have been left in his mind, and have ripened into scepticism. Yet there is no indication that either the leaders of thought among the Hindús, or the masses of the people, will ever accept Christianity. That they may accept or produce some form of Theism nearly related to Christianity is not impossible; nor should it cause surprise or sorrow to the most earnest Christian to find the fundamentals of his doctrine developed into a form such as it has never before assumed. The Hindús require a faith, not offered ready-made by an alien nation, but one which has its roots far back in the past, and which shall not rudely sever the future intellectual and spiritual life of the people from all that they revere in their earliest history. Only such a faith as this can give unity to their aspirations, and rouse them from the moral apathy which has settled upon them. One such effort has already been made in the *Brahma Samáj*, which, at least in its original form, was a return to the Theism of the Upanishads. That

movement has not been without its effects upon the spiritual life of the nation ; but when, in its later developments, its doctrines were made depend, less no longer upon a historical system, but upon each man's intuitive consciousness of the Divine presence, it at once lost the character which had recommended it to many earnest men. They were loth to admit the hopelessness of finding any grain of truth in those ancient speculations which, call them dreamy if you will, were yet no more dreamy than that Alexandrian mysticism which, to some greater or less extent, certainly coloured Christian doctrine. There will be many efforts, and many failures ; but we need not despair of a time when earnest study, fortified and illumined by accurate habits of thought, shall lead native students to the discovery in their ancient religious of the words of that Voice which has spoken at sundry times and in divers manners.

It is for this reason that we would urge upon Government the necessity of encouraging the native study of Sanskrit. How far it is possible for Government to encourage it, is a separate question. We may at any rate claim that no obstacles may be thrown in its way. Indications are not wanting of an impatience, shown by some in high authority, towards what are called 'useless studies.' The purity of the vernaculars is a desirable object ; but it cannot be thought higher than the possible regeneration of a nation's life. And even when Mr. Campbell condemns Sanskritised Bengálí, he seems not to have fully appreciated the effect which a highly developed language has in enriching a comparatively barbarous one. No doubt, for all the common purposes of life the Bengálí owes little to Sanskrit additions to his vocabulary. But if his language is ever to become the vehicle of communicating Western science and criticism, it can look to Sanskrit alone for its necessary expansion. And it should not be forgotten that it is only through native scholars that this result can be brought about. We would commend the attention of all who are inclined to look slightly upon Sanskrit study, to the following words of Max Müller. "No one can speak or write the vernaculars with effect who is ignorant of Sanskrit. No one can take a firm stand in handling the problems which occupy the native mind, who does not know the different strata which underlie the intellectual surface of India . . . . . If fostered with care and prudence, the study of Sanskrit in the schools and universities of India may still have a great and bright future before it, and we trust that it will re-awaken in the native mind a feeling without which no national character is perfect,—a loyal and loving affection for the past."

---

**A Report on the District of Jessore ; its Antiquities, its History, and its Commerce.** By James Westland, Esq., C.S. ; late. Magistrate and Collector of Jessore. Calcutta. 1871.

**T**HIS was one of the first of the series of historical, topographical, and statistical Reports, referred to in a former *Notice* ; and it is unquestionably the best and fullest of any that have yet appeared. It is brimful of the most valuable and the most interesting information—information all the more valuable from the fact that it has been largely derived from local official records which will doubtless, before many years are past, be lost to the world for ever.\* We hope shortly to be able to put before our readers an article containing an exhaustive review of the results of Mr. Westland's public-spirited labours ; so that in this place we shall only notice very briefly the general nature of the contents of his book.

\* The neglect, which is universal throughout India, of all modern means and appliances for ensuring the preservation and accessibility of the Public Records and State Papers, has been often deplored in these pages. The apathy of Indian Governments about the condition of the materials and sources of the history of the country, is unparalleled amongst the civilised nations of the world ; India whose records (from the nature of the climate and from other causes) daily encounter more perils than those of any other civilised country, stands alone in having absolutely no machinery for the safe custody of its literary and scientific treasures. Instances are continually cropping up of irretrievable losses to science, resulting from this neglect ; for which, we cannot doubt, posterity will hold the Indian Governments of the present day responsible. Whilst we are writing, we read the following most suggestive paragraph in the *Englishman* of January 5, 1872 : —

“A curious discovery of neglected and forgotten records has lately been made by the Commissioner of the Bardwán Division ; and, singularly enough, the treasure has been unearthed in a Collectorate, the records of which had already been searched by Dr. Hunter. While inspecting the Collector's office, Mr. Buckland found a number of old English ma-

nuscript books lying in an open rack in the clerks' room, where they had been exposed for an unknown period to the ravages of time and white-ants, and undisturbed by any previous explorer, having by some accident been left out of the treasury almirahs. Among these, the most neglected, have been found what are probably the oldest records of the Bírghúm District ; for Mr. Keating is mentioned in the “Rural Annals” as the first Collector of that district whose records survived, and here we have the correspondence of Messrs. Foley and Sherburne, the former of whom was Collector in November 1786, two years before Mr. Keating, and the latter in April 1787. Indeed, the correspondence contains a complete account of the eighteen months' administration of the latter officer, and furnishes a clue to the cause of his removal and subsequent trial. The letters of Mr. Foley's time are chiefly between that officer and the Board of Revenue. One of them is remarkable as presenting an early example of recourse to the sale of land for arrears of revenue, and showing that the step was most reluctantly taken. In 1787 wild elephants were so numerous in Bírghúm that the whole district was in danger of being overrun by them ; and shikáris were sent for from Sylhet and Chittagong to aid in their capture.”

The first part is geographical ; of which, the description of the river system and its changes during the past century, and of the progress of deltaic formation, is valuable both from a scientific and historical point of view, and also from the practical inferences which may be derived therefrom. Many other chapters also are of the highest practical utility ; particularly those on the agriculture and commerce of the district ; which contain, amongst many other things of importance, full accounts of the sugar-cultivation and manufacture, of the rice trade, and (above all) of the Sundarban reclamations, which are singularly interesting and curious. But the chapters which will chiefly engage the attention of the scientific world, are those on the antiquities of the district, and on its history during the first thirty years of British administration—A.D. 1781 to 1811. Rájá Pratápaditya, whose history is given under the former heading, was a contemporary of Akbar ; against whom he maintained his independence for a long time. He is an historical character of some importance ; and Mr. Westland's account helps to clear up many obscurities about his life. The history of another hero of the district, Rájá Sítárám Rái, and the collection of some scattered traditions about a third named Khán Jahán Alí or Khánjá Alí, evince Mr. Westland's constructive talent ; whilst the family history of the Rájás of Naldanga, of Jessor or Chanchra, and of Nattor, will attract every one who takes any interest in the local history of Bengal. The descriptions and identifications of the chief ruins in the district are both circumstantial and picturesque ; we fancy we recognise in some of these the original picture from which may have been derived Dr. Hunter's sketch of the Ruined Palace of the decayed Musalmán Nobleman in his *Indian Musalmáns*.

The history of the first thirty years of British administration in Jessor, which forms Mr. Westland's third part, and which is entirely derived from the mouldering local records, deserves a separate notice ; we shall therefore only touch upon it in this place. The transition period of the "double government," which followed the destruction of the actual power of the Nawábs, and was only terminated by the assumption of the whole work of administration by the Company, is as interesting as, and hardly less obscure than, any other period of Bengal history. The various transformations in the systems of revenue and police administration are well illustrated by Mr. Westland ; we will give one quotation which will, we believe, tempt our readers to peruse this part of the Report for themselves.

"The collection of the revenue had been in the hands of the Company for some years before they undertook the administration proper of the country ; and when our history of the administration opens, the Musalmán system of collection had already given way to a more

"regular one. We can, however, see a little of its nature from the accounts that have already been given of the old Zemindars. These Zemindars were a turbulent lot, much too independent, and not very punctual in the payment of their revenues. They might, however, fight among themselves and swallow up their smaller neighbours, much as they chose, so long as they paid their revenue; and to ensure their paying, the Nawábs kept a military governor with a small force in each of the districts. This officer, the Faujdár as he was called, retained on the part of the Nawáb sufficient appearance of power to make it the interest of each Zemindar to secure himself by continuing to pay his revenue, or as much of it as would satisfy the Nawáb. Beyond this point probably the Faujdárs did not care to go, as the system of the Nawábs was rather a military occupation of the country where the Zemindars, their tribute bearers, were the potentates, than the administration of the country as their own.† When the British undertook the collection of the revenues, however, the Faujdárs appear to have been charged with duties somewhat different to those they performed under the Muhammadan Government. The British idea of administration was not military occupation, and the Faujdárs became purely high officers of police. They formed part of a police system established by Warren Hastings, and had under them thánádárs, or officers in charge of smaller jurisdictions."

We have only space for one more extract, which puts in a very clear light a point which has lately been the subject of warm discussion. The publication of Dr. Hunter's *Indian Musalmáns* has attracted a great deal of public interest to the subject of the Government management of Muhammadan charitable endowments—and particularly to the *Saydpur Trust Estate* in connexion with the endowment of Hugli College. The Government management of this fund was characterised, somewhat hastily as we think, by Dr. Hunter as "misappropriation," and "malversation"; we venture to think that he would have hesitated to use these terms if he had perused the records from which Mr. Westland has derived a particularly clear history of the endowment. We will extract one or two paragraphs, leaving our readers to form their own conclusions as to the justice of the Government action in the matter.

"The possessor of the estate, Hájí Muhammad Mohsin, died in 1814; and having no heirs, he bequeathed his estate in this manner. It was to be kept in trust in the hands of two trustees, who were each to have one-ninth of the profits as their share; they were to spend

† Compare this passage, which we have printed in italics, with Mr. Benett's remarks relating to Oudh, quoted at page xiii; and with our criticism (*Calcutta Review*, October 1871)

on Sir H. S. Mayne's mistaken ideas about the origin of the Zamindárs of Bengal—ideas which are very widely prevalent.

"three-ninths upon religious observances at the Imámbara at Hugli, and the rest was to be employed in discharging the salaries of certain officers appointed at the Imámbara, and in keeping up the Imámbara, and the tomb of Sáláh-ud-dín which is also, I believe, at Hugli.

"The two trustees into whose hands the property came very soon quarrelled amongst themselves and the affairs of the estate got into dreadful confusion. So in 1816 the Collector took possession of the estate under a recent law (XIX. of 1810) devised to enable Government to prevent trustees of property devoted to religious and charitable purposes from appropriating it to their own use or abusing their trust. The two trustees were relieved of their functions, and the Board of Revenue (5-3-16) adopted the following method of regulating the estate. The Government, acting by the Collector of Jessore, was to be one trustee, who was to look after the management of the property; and for the second trustee a member of the Shiah sect of Musalmáns was to be appointed by Government, his functions being to see to the due expenditure of the funds at the Imámbara ..... The share *which, under the terms of the will, would belong to Government as trustee*, is granted by Government for the maintenance of the Hugli College; and the rest of the Rs. 70,000 goes to the trustee, Sayd Karámat Alí, in charge of the Imámbara; the endowment being, in fact, the chief source of its wealth."

These are the paragraphs which bear upon the point raised by Dr. Hunter; we have italicised the passages which seem to us to rebut the charges of misappropriation.

*An Historical and Statistical Memoir of the Ghazeeppoor District, Part I.* By Mr. W. Oldham, B.C.S., L.L.D. Printed at the Government Press, Allahabad. 1870.

A WELL educated official with a yearning for literary pursuits, relegated to a remote mofussil station, has a fair claim to sympathy when he rises above the depressing monotony around him, and attempts to solace those cravings for mental employment, which even the accurate preparation and punctual submission of tabular statements fail to satisfy.

We heartily congratulate the Lieutenant-Governor of the North-West Provinces on his attempt to compile a gazetteer of his own kingdom, and to induce his subordinates to attempt to pluck some of those laurels which fortune seems to have destined for the brow of Dr. Hunter. The idea of collecting historical and statistical accounts of each district in the North-West Provinces is not a new one; as long ago as 1844, Mr. Thomason, one of the best of many good Lieutenant-Governors, laid down a plan for the execution of this project, and his excellent minute on the subject forms the basis of that call from the present Government which has been answered in the case of the Gházipur district by Dr. Oldham.

With the great facilities which now exist for frequent and rapid

intercourse with England, we are fast coming to look upon our lives in India as long terms of imprisonment enlivened by short gleams of freedom; and there is no doubt that in these modern days the gulf between Europeans and Natives is widening, in spite even of young Bengal and his supporters; we are the more ready, therefore, to afford a warm welcome to the publication of such a history as the one before us, apart from a consideration of its intrinsic merit, for the compilation of it must of necessity lead its author to take a deep interest in the district to which he is attached; he becomes intimately acquainted with the features of the country around him, with the history, traditions, and prejudices of the many castes and tribes amongst whom he lives; he is led to the discovery and preservation of many monuments of the past which would otherwise lie buried or forgotten; the private histories of the principal families in his district are known to him, and he is led to the collection of a large mass of facts, interesting indeed to many, but of peculiar importance to his official successors.

The volume before us which, Dr. Oldham tells us in his preface, contains about a fourth part of the whole work, commences with an account of the physical characteristics of the district; and in giving an interesting note on the changes in the course of the Ganges through Gházipur, Dr. Oldham makes a passing allusion to what appears to be a pet scheme of his, being a plan to retain, for irrigation purposes, a large body of water in one of the many abandoned beds of the Ganges; the suggestion appears to have been favourably considered by a party of engineers deputed by Government to examine it, and should it be adopted, about twenty thousand acres or thirty-two square miles of country, would receive the immense benefits of irrigation. This scheme furnishes a good illustration of the benefit likely to accrue to a district from the administration of an officer who possesses that local knowledge which the preparation of these district memoirs is calculated to foster.

Dr. Oldham devotes an interesting chapter to the antiquities and ancient history of his district. In 1836 Lieutenant (now General) Cunningham brought to light the pillar, at Bhitri; and its valuable inscription which was translated by Dr. Mill throws considerable light upon the dynasty of the Gupta kings of Magadha, of whose kingdom Gházipur was a part, and introduces us to no less than three generations of them. This dynasty, according to General Cunningham, flourished from 319 A.D. to 600 A.D., when it was overthrown by Siladitya, the king of Ujjain.

In addition to the Bhitri *lath*, this district has also furnished many interesting Buddhist remains at Saidpur, Pahládpur, and Zamániá; and Dr. Oldham has himself had the honour of bringing to light some curious sculptures near Saidpur. Gházipur appears to have been honoured by visits from the Chinese travellers—Fa-



Hian, in the beginning of the fifth century, and Hiouen Thsang, in the early part of the seventh century.

Dr. Oldham sums up the general results of his investigations on the early history of Gházipur, in the following words :—

" In the time of Sákya Muni, five hundred and fifty years before Christ, the country along the Ganges from Saidpur to Baxar was inhabited, and was the scene of two incidents in the life of Sákya Muni. This country formed part of the Kingdom of Asoka, the grandson of Chandra-Gupta, or Sandracottus, a contemporary of Alexander the Great ; and Asoka erected one at least of his pillars, and two topes or *stupas*, within this area. Subsequently this country formed a separate kingdom under the name of the ' Kingdom of the Lord of Battles ;' but whether before or after the period of the Gupta dynasty, is uncertain. This kingdom was, from the beginning of the 4th to the end of the 7th century, included within the empire of the Gupta dynasty, the capital of which was in Magadha or Bibár, the city of Pátaliputra, or the modern Patna. The country, as appears from the travels of Hiouen Thsang, contained a mixed population of Hindús and Buddhists. The people were partly Aryans and partly aborigines ; there were Aryans—for Hiouen Thsang distinctly mentions the Bráhmans ; and there were aborigines, for a few centuries later we find them numerous and masters of the country. The country east of Baxar and north of the Ganges appears to have been a great forest ; no ancient remains are found there, and many old trees of immense size, generally banyans, still remain, which probably belong to the time when the country was to use the language of Hiouen Thsang ' a desert' or ' vast solitude.' The country between Saidpur and Baxar, on both sides of the Ganges, though possibly not all cleared, was inhabited by a cultivated and civilised people whose temples, columns, and sculptures still attest their former greatness."

Dr. Oldham has made a careful examination of the traditions of the people who are now the chief landowners in his district, in an attempt to bridge the dark period of the history of Gházipur from the extinction of the Gupta dynasty to the Muhammadan invasion of the district. His enquiries, though full of interest, do not appear to have yet reached a stage beyond the region of speculation. It is not until the end of the 12th century that the history of the district emerges from the mists of antiquity, when in the year 1193 Shaháb-ud-dín defeated the king of Kanauj and Benares near Etawah. This victory was shortly after followed by the reduction of the rest of Bihár and Bengal by Kutb-ud-dín.

Dr. Oldham's researches in the domestic archives of a family of Sayyids now living near Gházipur, have brought to light the

following romantic history in connection with the foundation of the city in 1330 A.D.:

Rájá Mándhāta, a descendant of Prithvi Rájá, the rájá of Ajmír, and the last Hindú king of Dehli, was miraculously cured of leprosy at Katol, a few miles from the present city of Gházipur, while on his way to the shrine of Jagannáth in Orissa, whither he was proceeding on a pilgrimage for relief from his malady. His own country was then in the hands of the Muhammadans; and instead of returning home, he built a fort at the scene of his cure, and proceeded to reduce the surrounding country. His nephew and heir chanced to become enamoured of a lovely Muhammadan girl who was passing through the country under the protection of her mother, and carried her off. The mother proceeded to Dehli for redress; and Fírúz Tughlak who was regent in the absence of his uncle king Muhammad Tughlak, made over her cause to forty warrior darweshes. These holy men undertook to redress the mother's wrongs, provided she could induce the distinguished Sayyid Mas'úd to lead them.

A miracle enabled her to identify Mas'úd, although previously unknown to her; a violent storm overthrew the tents of all the chiefs save that of Mas'úd, and she found him, as predicted, sitting within it, engaged in the study of the Kuráu. Mas'úd acceded to her prayer, headed the expedition, and attacking the rájá by surprise, killed him, and rescued the girl. The ravisher, who was absent at the time of his uncle's defeat, collected a force and marched against Mas'úd, but was defeated in two battles, in the last of which he lost his life. Muhammad Tughlak, in recognition of Mas'úd's services, conferred upon him the principality of Rájá Mándhāta with the title of Malik-us-Sayyidad Ghází. Mas'úd founded the city of Gházipur, and named it after his new title.

From the year 1394 to 1478 the district of Gházipur appears to have been attached to the kingdom of Jaunpur; but in the latter year the king of Jaunpur was defeated by Buhlol Lodí, prince of the Panjáb, who re-annexed Jaunpur, and with it the district of Gházipur, to the kingdom of Dehli. The death of Buhlol Lodí in 1488 was the signal for fresh troubles; Husain Sháh *Sharkí*, king of Jaunpur, overran Bihár, but was defeated by Buhlol Lodí's successor, Sikandar Lodí, in a pitched battle, 27 miles from Benares. Dr. Oldham believes he has identified the site of this battle in one of the parganas of the Gházipur district. There still exist in the district remains of mosques, tanks, a fort, and other works which tradition ascribes to Sikandar Lodí after the reduction of Jaunpur.

Sikandar was succeeded by his son Ibráhím, who, by his indiscre-

tions paved the way for the overthrow of his kingdom by Bábar in two campaigns in 1528, and the following year. Bábar appears to have spent two months in or near the Gházipur district during the last of these two campaigns; and Dr. Oldham has reproduced from Erskine's *Memoirs* a few interesting personal incidents recorded by Bábar which happened during his visit.

The Gházipur district was destined to be the scene of further struggles between the Afgháns and the Emperor of Dehli. In 1539 Sher Khán Súr of Sahsarám, who by his talents had raised himself to the position of chief of the Afgháns, and had overrun Bihár, intercepted the Emperor Humáyún at the junction of the Karmanásá and the Ganges in the Gházipur district, on his return from an expedition in Bengal. Humáyún was totally defeated, and narrowly escaped with life. Twenty years later the Afgháns were again driven out of Gházipur by the troops of the Emperor Akbar under Khán Zamán; who founded the town of Zamániá, a town not unknown to travellers on the East Indian Railway. Khán Zamán's name is also preserved in that of one of the parganas of Gházipur—Pargana Zamániá.

The district was now at last permanently attached to the Mughul Empire; it was transferred from the Súbah of Bihár to that of Allahabad, and Akbar's revenue system was extended to it; its parganas were tabulated, statistics of the extent and out-turn of its cultivated land were prepared, and a settlement at first annual, and subsequently decennial, was effected with the cultivators of the soil. Dr. Oldham estimates that in Akbar's time about one-sixth of the district was under cultivation, while at present not more than one-sixth of the area is uncultivated. The land revenue, however, has not increased in a corresponding degree; for even not taking into account the present diminished purchasing power of the rupee, the revenue at present should be five times greater than in Akbar's time, instead of being actually less than three-half times greater; while, if the diminished relative and intrinsic value of the rupee be considered, the land revenue should be twenty times as much as it was then. From Akbar's instructions to his collectors to collect the full revenue in plentiful years, and from other instructions which mark his anxiety that his system should be liberally carried out, it seems highly probable that the full revenue was not always realised.

Dr. Oldham points out amongst the causes for the existing diminution in the land revenue, the fact that in Akbar's time only the best land was under cultivation, while now the increase of population has forced the extension of cultivation to inferior soils, and also that while in Akbar's time the revenue was collected direct from the cultivators of the soil, in the present day an

immense number of middlemen intervene between Government and the rayats.

In the latter part of the present volume Dr. Oldham follows the history of his district from the time of Akbar to its transfer in the year 1761 A.D., to the Rájá of Benares, Balwant Singh, the father of Rájá Chait Singh whose intercourse with Warren Hastings is well known to every reader of Macaulay.

Dr. Oldham promises to give us in the forthcoming portions of his memoirs, accounts of the castes, religion, land tenures, trades, manufactures, agriculture, and other subjects connected with his district; and we sincerely trust that no long time will elapse before he is in a position to put us in possession of the remainder of his interesting work.

*Nugæ Indicæ: On Leave in my Compound.* Allahabad. 1871.

THIS little book is a collection of fugitive pieces—*pensées*, or reveries, or something equally sentimental, the author would probably call them—by a gentleman who writes under the *nom-de-plume* of *The Ronin*. The collection was published, the title-page informs us, “for private circulation”; but as we find the book placed on our table, we presume that we are expected to notice it in this place. We do so the more willingly, because the tone of these *Nugæ* is intensely refreshing in the midst of the severely earnest and serious reading which generally falls to the lot of an Anglo-Indian reviewer. *Dulce est desipere in loco*; with *The Ronin* one may experience the unwonted pleasure of doing absolutely nothing, in great perfection. The mental effort required for reading his pleasant babble is about as much as that which an Oxford undergraduate exercises when, lying on his back amidst the cushions of a punt moored under the shady banks of Cherwell, he gazes up into the willows overhead and muses on the curls of smoke that rise from the Baconian weed between his fingers.

The *Nugæ Indicæ* are something like an Anglo-Indian prose version of Blanche Amory’s *Mes Larmes*. We confess that, as we read them, we envy *The Ronin* the delightful state of mental inactivity which must be necessary, we should imagine, to enable a man to string together a lot of amusing twaddle about the mosquito that is humming about his ears, about the green-parrot that filches his mangoes, or about the jack-als that howl around his bungalow at night. What can be the serious avocations of *The Ronin*, that he can so entirely divest himself of all mental effort at will? Is it that his pen is like the trunk of the elephant, which is used with equal facility to pick up a pin and to dust the jacket of a tiger? But in speaking of *twaddle*, let us not be misunderstood. The writer of these trifles light as air, is evidently a scholar and a man of taste and observation

Were he writing *incognito* in England, we should spot him in a young curate of faultless coat and spotless gloves—a *quondam* Balliol “first,” whose brain has been affected by incessant croquet and tea-meetings. But seeing that he is an Anglo-Indian writing for Anglo-Indians, and evidently no griffin, all attempts at identifying his species, or even his genus, are futile.

The style of the *Nugæ* is a mixture of Charles Lamb on *Roast Pig*, A. K. H. B.’s *Recreations of a Country Parson*, Gilbert White’s *Selborne*, and the milk-and-water philosophy of *The Gentle Life*. The author is evidently a keen lover of nature and natural objects; and his philosophizing on the common natural objects that surround us all here in India, displays observing faculties of the highest order. His descriptions of the manners and customs of crows, *mainas*, green-parrots, and even mosquitoes, whilst they are sufficiently humorous, are worthy of Gilbert White himself in point of minute accuracy; and the best proof of this is that all must recognise these manners and habits as things they have *noticed*, whilst few will have *observed* them. Most who have lived in the Mofussil, especially in Upper India, will appreciate the truth of the following comparison of the characters of the crow and green-parrot:—

“Cervantes has recorded the fact that Theophrastus complained of “the long life given to crows. Now the argument of this complaint is “not so superficial as at first it seems, and really contains internal evidence of a knowledge of bird-nature. Theophrastus grumbled, not “simply because crows being naturally vicious would in a long life get “through more mischief than in a short one, but because if Atropos “were only more impartially nimble with her shears, crows would never “be able to get through any mischief at all. And in this lies a great point “of difference between the sombre crow and the dædal parrot. The crow “requires much time to develop and perfect his misdeemeanours, the “parrot brings his mischiefs to market in the green leaf. The first is “a crafty villain; the latter a headlong blackguard. While a crow will “spend a week with a view to the ultimate abstraction of a door-key, a “parrot will have scrambled and screeched through the whole cycle of “sin; and before the crow has finished reconnoitring the *maki*, the parrot has stripped the tree.”

Again, here is a sprightly picture of the engagements of the other denizens of the compound, whilst the green-parrot is stuffing himself with unripe mangoes:—

“Here a kite forbears to flutter, the curry-fowls whilst he squeals his “love-song to his mate; there a hawk is affording healthy excitement “to a score of crows, who keek at him as he flaps unconcerned on his “wide ragged wings through the air. The robin has found a bird “smaller than himself, and is accordingly pursuing it relentlessly “through bush and briar; the thinly-feathered babblers are telling “each other the secret of a mungoose being at that moment in the

"water-pipe ; while the squirrels, sticking head-downwards to their respective branches, are having a twopenny-halfpenny argument across the garden path. Meanwhile the green-parrots are gorging fruit. Like the Ettrick shepherd, they never can eat a few of any thing ; and their luncheons are really heavy dinners."

With pleasant chit-chat such as this does *The Ronin* beguile his reader's idlest hour ; and if we have ventured to call it twaddle, we will endeavour to make some amends by assuring the author that we have found it very readable twaddle.

*The Folk-Songs of Southern India.* By Charles E. Gover.  
Madras : Higginbotham & Co. 1871.

WE have derived so much real pleasure and so much valuable information from the perusal of this collection of ballads with their accompanying notes and illustrations, that we should be unwilling to notice it in this form (in which our review must necessarily be a hurried one), did we not hope to return to a further consideration of it in an early issue. It is from books of this kind, and from authors writing in the sympathetic spirit which is visible in every sentence of Mr. Gover's notes, that the English-reading public may hope to obtain a true knowledge of the *people* of India. Profound Orientalists, versed in all the erudition of the Vedas and the Dharmas'āstras, give us an insight into the literary traditions of the learned class, and possibly into the actual life of the Brāhmans and the higher castes. Missionaries, who have been the most voluminous of popular writers on Indian topics, have generally displayed a strong tendency to lay most stress on the grosser Paurānik superstitions or the sophistical subtleties of modern Hindúism. But for the real life of the people themselves, for those hidden springs which underlie the every-day thoughts and actions of the teeming millions of the country, we must look elsewhere ; to Dr. Hunter's *Annals of Rural Bengal*, of which much is really a poem written in prose, and most is derived from actual intercourse with the people ; to Miss Frere's *Old Deccan Days*, Mr. Long's *Bengali Proverbs*, and other books of folk-lore ; and to ballads such as those which Mr. Gover has now published, glowing with the rude eloquence of sincere and unpolished earnestness, and redolent of the village and the jungle rather than of the lamp and the cloister.

The appreciative enthusiasm with which Mr. Gover explains and illustrates his treasures, is really refreshing in these days, when Anglo-Indian writers, as a rule, can find nothing to be pleased with—still less to admire—in anything connected with the land of their adoption or its inhabitants. In the palmy days of John Company, things were very different. Then, the Government was still a paternal one ; and the dominant race could,

without feeling any loss of dignity, pet or punish the people of the land with the firm loving hand of a father. Before the Mutiny, commandants of Sepoy regiments would not only often speak of the men as their "boys," but would really think of and treat them accordingly—with Roman severity doubtless, but with more than Roman tenderness. *Nous avons changé tout cela.* Dark shades of suspicion and even dislike, relics perhaps of the miserable times of 1857, are now too often characteristic of the relations between the governing and the governed. Nor is this tone confined to the ignorant or the thoughtless amongst the English in India. The pages of one of the most ably-conducted weekly journals in Bengal—a paper, too, which (if report may be believed) aspires to the fulfilment of Captain Shandon's idea of "a paper written by gentlemen for gentlemen"—have of late been not unfrequently disfigured by sneers at native attempts at mental cultivation, which are none the less cruel and unjust, because they are at the same time safe and therefore ungenerous. We believe that much of this unkindly feeling will in time be dissipated; and nothing will conduce more to this happy consummation than the extended circulation of such books as the one under notice—books which, while they "exhibit irréfragable evidence of the real feelings of the mass of the people," linger lovingly over the many good points in the Hindú character, and are not over-hasty to mark what is amiss.

We think even Mr. Gover lays too much stress on the moral difference between the Bráhmans and the lower castes; in other words, that he himself is led astray by commonly-received generalisations about the character of the Bráhmans, similar to those about the mass of Hindús, the fallacy of which he exposes. What he asserts of the Súdras in the following quotation, we are sure is true also of many Bráhmans also. After noticing that the Súdra attends the Bráhmanic temples, and listens with conventional respect to the monstrous and sometimes disgusting stories about the Pauránik gods, whose lives are generally anything but models of goodness, our author continues:—"Meanwhile the Súdra lives, works, rules his house, performs his daily devotions. He sees wherever he goes, and in whatever he does, that truth and chastity, honesty and industry, and all those other virtues that the gods despise, are the keys of peace and happiness. . . . He soon learns that however it may be among the gods, industry and skill are better things than idleness and begging. He is as sure as he is of his life, that he cannot do business, cannot provide for his family, unless he keeps his promise and meets his bond. If such be the case, there can be no hesitation in his choice; the gods perhaps have a different rule of life, because they are gods; but that is their look-out. As for him he will listen to and applaud the amorous tricks of a Krishna

and the thefts of other divinities, but they must not shape his life."

Most of the ballads are pervaded with a sadness, a mournful sense of the worthlessness of human goods and the prevalence of ills in life, that is very striking. We will quote one of the **Kanarese** songs to illustrate this point.—

If thou should'st have a wife,  
 'Trouble is thine.

If none should bless thy life,  
 Trouble is thine.

If neither wise nor witty,  
Sorrow will come.

Still more if she be pretty,  
Sorrow will come.

For then all guarding vain,  
Sore trouble this.

She brings unmeasured pain,  
Sore trouble this

*Chorus.*—Never, oh my soul, can peace be thine,  
Until great Runga's grace be mine ;  
If angry he, all hope resign.

If children come to thee,  
Sorrow comes too.

But if no heir should be,  
Sorrow comes too.

With earning wealth and power,  
Pain fills the cup.

But when the wretched poor,  
Pain fills the cup.

Complains he has no rice,  
"Tis dolor sore.

Wherewith to sacrifice,  
              'Tis dolor sore.

No sorrow, pain, or care,  
E'en sorrow deep.

Can be so hard to bear,  
E'en sorrow deep.

*Chorus.*—Never, oh my soul, &c.

The ballads of Kúrg appear to form an exception to this rule. They for the most part breathe a happy, and sometimes even a merry, spirit; and show a strong love of, and pride in, the pleasant hills and valleys of that beautiful country. One of the children's rhymes, sung by mothers in Kúrg, we transcribe as a curiosity; reminding every English reader (as Mr. Gover suggests) of the familiar—



This pig went to market ;  
 This pig stayed at home, &c.

The Kúrgí mother tweaks each of the five little fingers of her baby as she sings the following lines :—

The little finger nail is small,  
 The finger for the ring is gold,  
 The middle finger loveth coins,  
 The fourth is called Kotera,  
 The thumb is Múrutika,  
 And both are gone for cheese.

Not the least interesting part of this collection are the extracts from the Cural of Tiruvalluva in Tamil ; the most venerated and popular book south of the Godávarí. We would fain quote some of the songs of the Badagas (a Nilgiri tribe very low in the social scale) ; the description of the funeral ceremonies amongst these primitive mountaineers is very impressive. The Malayálam songs, belonging to a people more thoroughly Bráhmañised than any others in Southern India, are interesting ; as showing the transition between the earnest simplicity of the Dravidian races proper (whom, by the way, Mr. Gover tries very hard to prove Aryans) and the more artificial cultivation of the Sanskrit-speaking races ; but in this place, we can only thus summarily direct our readers' attention to these points, heartily commending the whole book to their careful perusal.

---

*A Classical Dictionary of India ; illustrative of the Mythology, Philosophy, Literature, Antiquities, Arts, Manners, Customs, &c., of the Hindús.* By John Garrett, Director of Public Instruction in Mysore. Madras : Higginbotham and Co. 1871.

THIS highly-important work goes far to supply a want which has long been severely felt by every student, and indeed by every casual reader, of Hindú literature. Any Englishman who has dipped, however cursorily, into the stream of Eastern story, knows how puzzling are the frequent allusions to mythical or obscure personages, places, and objects whose names and attributes are utterly unknown to him. Even those who have drunk more deeply from the same source, continually meet with similar difficulties ; and in a field so vast as that of Hindú legend, the profoundest Orientalist can never be entirely emancipated from all necessity for reference. Tyro and *savant* will be alike indebted to Mr. Garrett for this, the first attempt at a collection in a compendious form of the information so much needed. Hitherto, when the young Orientalist has met with an obscure allusion, he has been generally compelled to put up with the still more obscure explanation of his Pandit or Múnshi ; or to engage in a weary search

through the volumes of the Asiatic Society's *Journals*, or of the *Calcutta Review*; or to leave his difficulty to solve itself. The last alternative is commonly preferred; the difficulty, *more Indico*, is left to drift. *Solvitur ambulando*; but the ambulatory process is frequently protracted over a long time; and to this cause may be attributed much of that want of precision and that haziness which often appear to be characteristic of oriental studies. The same capital defect is observable in every branch of Anglo-Indian science. The grand impediments in the way of progressive research are the lack of any transmissions of results from one student to another and the difficulty of co-operation. In every kind of historical and antiquarian science, these evils are felt most keenly. For co-operation, the Asiatic Society does what is possible, under the conditions of Anglo-Indian life; but this is necessarily limited, in a community so scattered and so shifting as the English in India. But the results of these and other scientific labours are almost absolutely buried\*; and this is strikingly the case with the almost inexhaustible mine of the Government Archives, which we might more aptly compare to a sepulchre rather than to a mine. The officials under the various Indian Governments have always been acknowledged to form one of the most highly-cultivated bodies of public servants in the world; and yet those Governments have been content to allow their literary productions—scientific, statistical, or political—to moulder in dusty presses unknown and unused. We may safely affirm that a scientific State-Paper, however valuable, when once deposited in a Government record-room, seldom issues thence except in the stomachs of white-ants; it is at any rate almost invariably lost to science.

What the lack of Government Calendars of State-Papers is to the Anglo-Indian historian and antiquarian, that the want of all books of reference has hitherto been to the student of Hindú literature and antiquities. To the task of supplying this want, Mr. Garrett has devoted his leisure during many years; and the result is eminently satisfactory in many ways. He has consulted every writer of note; and has extracted the pith of the information formerly scattered in numerous voluminous or inaccessible works. Of course the merit of such a compilation, depending mainly on its completeness and its accuracy in minute points, can only be thoroughly tested by long actual use; but the writer of this notice has already had occasion to test these points under a large number of headings, with success in most. Mr. Garrett is especially happy in his numerous

\* The *Analytical Index* to the old numbers of this *Review*, which is now in the press, will take away the reproach from Anglo-Indian literature, as far as we are individually concerned. We are glad to see promised another aid to scientific co-operation, in the *Indian Antiquary*, a Bombay journal which is to be devoted to this work.

extracts from Dr. Muir's *Original Sanskrit Texts*, from Mr. Talboys Wheeler's *History of India*, and from Mrs. Manning's *Ancient and Mediæval India*.

The articles on mythology, and those on manners and customs, display the most careful research. Thus, each one of the chief Vaidik and Paurānik deities is the subject of a carefully compiled notice ; and we may mention particularly, as good instances of our author's judicious method, the interesting articles on the Purānas, the *Purohita* or family priest, and the *Śrāddha*. In connexion with the last-mentioned article, we may notice that the explanation which Mr. Garrett always gives of the difference in meaning between words of very similar appearance—*c.g.*, between *Śrāddhā* (the religious ceremonies referring to deceased ancestors), *Śraddhā* (religious faith), and *Śraddhā* (the personification of the last, and daughter of Daksha)—will be of the highest value to young students, and to general readers unacquainted with Sanskrit.

The religious and philosophical Sanskrit literature is well and fully described by Mr. Garrett ; but about the general literature we have very little information. There are notices of Kālidāsa, Bhavabhūti, and Krishna Misra ; but we have been unable to find any mention of the well-known works of the two last named. Famous writers like Bhāravi (whose *Kirātārjunīyā*, however, is mentioned,) Māgha, Somadeva, Jayadeva, Bānabhatta, Subandhu, Dandī, we miss from their places in Mr. Garrett's list. We had expected to find, not only such well-known works as the *Prabodhachandrodaya*, the *Mālatī* and *Mādhava*, and the *Mrichchhakatī* under their respective headings ; but also their leading characters (as *Chārudatta* in the *Toy-Cart*) under separate headings ; we can find none of these. Mr. Garrett, however, very reasonably says in his preface,—“no doubt many names, some “probably of importance, have been omitted ; but this is only “what might be expected in the first edition of a book of this “nature.” It is only with a view to the second edition which is here tacitly promised by the author, that we have pointed out defects in what is on the whole an admirable performance. We would suggest, also, the advisability of inserting a number of articles under *generic* heading ; like those in Smith's *Classical Dictionaries* under the headings *Comedy*, *Tragedy*, *Lyric Poetry*, &c.

---

*Durgā Pūjā*. By Pratāpa Chandra Ghosha, B.A. Calcutta : Hindoo Patriot Press, 1871.

WE have read this most complete and minute account of the greatest festival of the Hindús in Bengal, with a great deal of pleasure. In common, doubtless, with many of our readers, we had previously seen and admired the essay of which this

volume is an amplification, which was first published in the *Hindoo Patriot* of October 23, 1871, and was copied into the *Weekly Englishman*, and many of the leading Anglo-Indian journals. The notes, however, which have been subsequently appended by the author—and, we will add, the very creditable cuts by Bábu Túlsidás Pál, a student of the Government School of Art at Calcutta, which illustrate these notes—increase very materially its value for English readers. We hope that the author will be able to introduce his book to the notice of the Orientalist public in England; we believe that it will be read with much attention not only by Anglo-Indian and educated native gentlemen out here, but also by that portion of the reading public at home which takes an interest in Indian matters.

Bábu Pratápa Chandra Ghosha is already favourably known in Bengal as an author; we remember a paper read before the Asiatic Society, we believe by him, on the early history of Bengal, which displayed very considerable antiquarian skill. The same historical and antiquarian knowledge is evinced in his scholarly explanations of the meaning and origin of every detail of the Dúrgá Pújá ceremonial. In minute description, and in laborious and apparently accurate explanation, his account and the accompanying notes compare not unfavourably with some of the best articles in our great encyclopædias. The Bábu's well-applied industry, scientific acquirements, and literary skill, afford one instance—and many others may be found by those who care to look for them—of the folly and injustice of those sweeping assertions which are so much in vogue, about the unproductive character of the present system of high education in Bengal.

---

*Public Works Organisation in Madras. 1871.*

IN January of last year a committee consisting of Messrs. Arbuthnot, Robinson, and Ramdigar, was appointed by the Government of Madras to consider the agency by which minor irrigation works should be carried out, and the source from which the requisite money or labour should be derived, as well as the agency by which district roads should be maintained and the organisation of the Department of Public Works.

We have received a copy of their very interesting report. It seems to be clearly shown that the irrigation works throughout the country have been more or less neglected to a great extent owing to the way in which the use of customary labour has been neglected. They therefore recommend that careful enquiry should be made in every district as to the work which has hitherto been customary, and that the customary labour so ascertained should be legalised by a distinct enactment. The proposal to commute customary labour into a money cess is weighed and rejected. At the

same time it is recommended that as neither the Public Works Department nor the Revenue Authorities have sufficient establishment for the management of minor irrigation works, these works should be handed over under definite arrangements to the zamindárs—larger and more important works being retained in the hands of Government managed through the Public Works Department.

With regard to district roads the proposal to hand them over to the Revenue Authorities is considered and condemned. We have not space to consider this point, and that regarding the organization of the Public Works Department. A somewhat similar question has recently been under discussion in Bengal, and in both cases we are convinced that no hard and fast line should be laid down. When there are important works requiring the supervision of a highly skilled professional engineer, his services should doubtless be also utilized in controlling the establishments employed on ordinary public works. It would evidently be wasteful to keep up two Public Works Establishments in the same place. But in those districts where there are no works requiring engineering skill, and the thing wanted is not professional knowledge, but merely honest financial control, we cannot but think that the employment of the Public Works Department on the repairs of roads and other works of a similar nature, must be unnecessarily expensive.

#### *Dr. Day's Report on Indian Fisheries.*

THE most interesting part of Dr. Day's "Report on the fish and fisheries of the fresh waters of India" is the fourth chapter in which he gives a short account of the peculiarities and habits of some of the principal orders. Everyone who reads the *Journal* of the Asiatic Society, knows that this is a subject to which he has long devoted his attention; and it may be hoped that the opportunities which he enjoys as Inspector-General of fisheries, will enable him some day to produce a complete monograph on the subject.

As to the more practical part of his work we are not very sanguine. The Report before us contains a large number of more or less interesting statements regarding the reckless manner in which fish are destroyed; but, unfortunately, these statements are not generally realised or expressed in such definite language as to make criticism possible, or to render any assistance in solving the question whether the fish supplies throughout the country are really falling off. Even if this should prove to be the case, it will remain for consideration, whether a reckless mode of fishing or some wider and more general cause is to blame; and even when this point is settled, the great difficulty of all will remain—to us it seems an impossibility—of discovering some way in which Govern-

ment can interfere for the protection of the fish without causing suffering and oppression far out weighing the advantage hoped for.

The general impression seems to be that the supply of fish has only been affected in those rivers where anicuts and dams have been constructed in connection with irrigation works. This has undoubtedly happened both in Orissa and Upper India; and it is probably the cause which has given rise to the notion of a fish-famine. To meet such cases, the introduction of suitable fish ladders will be the most important part of Dr. Day's work.

But our impression is that at all events in Lower Bengal there is another cause at work. For some reason or other the level of the delta is undoubtedly rising. The amount of area covered with 'bheel' perceptibly diminishes in ten or twenty years. At the same time as cultivation spreads, many swamps covered during the rain with deep water are brought under crops; and so the waters from which the supplies of fish are chiefly derived, gradually become less extensive. Any one who doubts that the level of the delta is actually rising, should read Mr. Westland's excellent book on Jessor, reviewed at page xvii.

*Review of Baroda Affairs, 1871.* By Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan.

THIS pamphlet is a violent attack upon the administration of that State, the British resident, and every one who can be considered in any degree responsible for the existing state of things. "The Guicowary administration," he says, "is a pure and palpable combination of the most uncertain, most ridiculous and farcical, most inhuman and immoral, treacherous and extortionate words; it is the rule of no ordinary creatures, but of flint-hearted, avaricious demons."

Abusive language of this kind naturally create a prejudice against the cause in support of which it is used; and a few distinctly stated facts would be of much more value than the vague declamation against the Gaikwár and his darbár of which the present pamphlet is chiefly made up.

It will be recollected that the present Gaikwár Malhár Ráo who succeeded to the *gadi* in 1867, had been for many years a political prisoner; and the principal complaint made against Colonel Barr and the Bombay Government is that they did not take the occasion of his accession to insist on a reformed system of administration. It would be easier to judge whether this should have been done if the various evils and abuses alleged to exist had been clearly specified. If it be true that the Gaikwár's land-revenue is exacted in such an oppressive manner as to drive his subjects across the border into British territory, there must undoubtedly be room for reform. The fact that the

Gaikwár has recently punished some of his servants for giving information to the press in Bombay, also suggests a suspicion that all is not quite as it should be. But most of the statements put forward in this pamphlet and elsewhere about the dismissal of ministers, suspected poisonings, rapes, and corrupt intrigues, are not in their present form of any value. The dismissed ministers may be the most admirable of men, but they may also be merely friends of the gentlemen who write in their praise. Nothing is easier to make, or less entitled to credit, than general accusation of debauchery and crime. As for intrigues they are a necessary part of every native administration, and in a less flagrant form they are not altogether unknown under British rule.

The Gaikwár's administration is doubtless very far from perfect. It is possible that there may be abuses under it which our Government should interfere to prevent; though the policy which would interfere with everything in Native States which does not come up to English ideas of law and justice, is one which we abhor. But whatever the truth may be, a clear statement of definite fact regarding it would be of much more value than the unsatisfactory kind of invective with which Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan's pamphlet is filled.

---

*History of the Rise, Decline and Present State of the Shastree Family.* Education Society's Press. Bykulla. Bombay.

THIS work has no author's name attached to it, but it is written by the Grandson of Gangádhar Shastrí; and a very characteristic portrait of this worthy in the old Syrian or Egyptian style, forms the frontispiece to the book. The author has chosen a very grand and euphonious title, evidently convinced in his own mind that the importance of the Shastrí family in the world's history is analogous to that of the Roman Empire. But the *history* is in reality nothing but a *darkwást* on a large scale to the Government of India. In 1815, during the Marhattá disturbances, the wily and treacherous Báji Ráo being at the time Peshwá, Gangádhar Shastrí was sent by the Court of Baroda to the Peshwá's Court at Púna to try and get a renewal of the lease by which the Gaikwár held his territory. The Shastrí was very unwilling to proceed on this embassy, which was at once difficult and dangerous; but he was induced to lay aside his fears and set out on obtaining the guarantee of the British Government for his personal safety. The Peshwá's minister at that time was Trimbakjí Danglia, a cunning and unscrupulous intriguer. The Peshwá and his minister received Shastrí with courtesy and treated him kindly; but instead of renewing the lease or ratifying a treaty which the Gaikwár wanted, they detained the envoy a long time about the Court on various pretexts; flattered his vanity by marrying his

son to the Peshwá's sister, and afterwards induced him to accompany the Court on a devotional journey to Pandharpur. Here, on the night of 14th July 1815, he was induced to go and pray at the temple, and on returning fell into an ambush that had been laid for him, five men rushing upon him and stabbing him to death on the spot. The actual murder is supposed to have been perpetrated by some enemies of his from Baroda who were trying to frustrate his endeavours at the Court of Púna. But there is not the slightest doubt that Trimbakjí was at the bottom of it, if it was not ordered by the Peshwá himself. The English Resident, Major Walker, in conformity with the guarantee given, insisted on the surrender of Trimbakjí, and though the Peshwá long evaded it, and no search was made after the assassins, they were obliged to give him up eventually, and he was imprisoned in the isle of Salsette.

Such was the fate of the only man of this family who was of the smallest historical importance. He was, for a Marhatta, exceptionally honest and truthful; and this black deed hurried on the overthrow of the Peshwá's supremacy, which was already rapidly on the decline. Thornton says that the murder of Shastrī "was the source and origin of some of the greatest political changes which the modern history of India presents to notice."

Gangádhār served for eleven years as Native Agent in the English Residency at Baroda, and was afterwards raised to the post of Mutálík Diwán, and seems to have rendered far better services to the Gaikwár and received less rewards than any of his contemporary nobles. He was granted a sanad of Rs. 60,000 a year with the right of Siwái Nemnúk\* besides a grant of three small villages sanctioned by the English Government. The author is justly proud of his ancestor, but it is a curious fact that he merely gives a passing notice of his murder, not so much as mentioning Trimbakjí's name; nor does he attempt to throw any light on the causes of it, or the intrigues of any of the parties concerned. This is a portion of history that needs clearing up, and we opened the present work in hopes of gaining new information on the subject; but we are obliged to confess ourselves disappointed with it, as it has no historical importance whatever, and far from being a family history is nothing but a compilation from various Government Records, Despatches and private letters bearing reference to the allowance and pension granted by the Gaikwár to the Shastrí's descendants.

We are also rather surprised at being informed that "the Government Records of the two presidencies of Bombay and

\* "Sewái Nemnúk is a contingent allowance such as a Palki Jilib, &c., always bestowed by Native Sovereigns to keep up the dignity of a title."—(*Author.*)



Bengal, with those of the India Office in London, and the Gaikwár's Daftar, *teem* with the testimonials of his magnificent services, closed *only* by his *untimely* death, which has *permanently* relieved the Gaikwár from the claims of the Peshwá to the amount of crores of rupees, added *miles* of territory to the British dominions and left his posterity *uncared for* to a degree that his utmost fears could never have conceived." And a little further on—"Such was the remarkable man whose praises we have sung. Praises which were sung before by a Walker, a Carnac, a Thornton, and such other far abler men than we, and which resounded once throughout the breadth and length of the British Empire."

Affixed to the book is a series of appendices numbered from A down to V, of various documents all bearing upon these two points—1st. The British guarantee to the Gaikwár allowances; 2nd. The claim to an hereditary pension from the British Government. The whole work resembles rather the words of a Vakil trying to prove a case before a High Court, than a history. Fathi Singh the Gaikwár immediately issued a sanad to Bhímsankar, Gangádhár's eldest son, confirming him in his father's rights and office, and applied to the English Government for their guarantee. The answer was conveyed in a letter to Captain Carnac, the Resident in the words—"You are authorised to extend the Hon'ble Company's *Bahandari* "to Bhímsankar Gangádhár *in the usual form*." The author writes a great deal to prove that the words in the usual form mean that the grant is hereditary, but we do not agree with the certain conclusion he forms on the point. A sanad was granted on the 6th June 1819 by Governor Elphinstone to the three sons of Gangádhár to enjoy a pension of Rs. 10,000 a year for one life only. This pension was never made hereditary. Some of the Bombay officials imagined that it was or ought to be hereditary; and the writer inveighs against Government repeatedly for not having made it so, and cites as precedents the hereditary pensions granted to the heirs of the Duke of Grafton, to the Duke of Wellington, Earl Nelson, Sir H. Havelock, the Duke of Marlborough and other dignitaries. Captain, afterwards Sir James, Carnac took up the Shastrí case with great warmth; Governor Elphinstone thought the Government guarantee insufficient to make the allowance hereditary. Sir John Malcolm stated that though the family had not the written guarantee of the British Government, they were perfectly right in their confidence of its being their guarantee. Lord Clive went farther, and declared that they had the guarantee, that it was binding on both the British and Gaikwár's Governments, and was of a hereditary character: Sir Robert Grant sent an ultimatum to the Gaikwár Syají Ráo, who had profited by the varying opinions of the former Governors, and reduced the allowance from 60,000 to 48,000 Rupees to the effect that if the full allow-

ance was not paid, it would be deducted from the tributes of the Kátiwár and Mahikanta tributes. After this a new sanad was granted by the Gaikwár to the Shastri family in 1840 of Rs. 60,000 a year with Sewái Nemnúk and villages *from generation to generation* ; and this sanad received the British guarantee during Carnac's Government in September of that year. Sir James Carnac tried before retiring to get an hereditary pension granted by Government to the Shastrís, but he did not succeed nor has there been at any time any promise from the British Government expressed or implied that they were to have one.

There were now two sanads, one of 1815 and one of 1840. The Gaikwár objected to the words "from generation to generation" as being more than was contemplated by the original sanad ; and the Court of Directors though harassed by appeals from the Shastrís confirmed this objection, and the sanad was resumed in 1845, the life-grant to the Shastri's sons being extended for another life at a moiety of the amount. This the Shastrís were constrained to accept under protest, and though there was considerable agitation on the matter subsequently, this was the last positive step taken.

We do not attempt to give a judicial decision in the matter, but still we cannot refrain from expressing our opinion that the writer has failed to prove his claim ; and at a period like the present when property held by the Church for ages is reappropriated by the State, and the allowances to members of the Royal Family are not allowed to pass unquestioned, we cannot reasonably entertain the belief that the descendant of the house of Shastri is likely to obtain a pension from Government, because his grandfather was murdered by Marhattás more than half a century ago.

We are glad to see natives contributing to Anglo-Indian literature in any form, and the present book will no doubt be interesting to a certain class of readers. But the object with which it is written will be sufficient to condemn it in the eyes of many. The writer tells us that he is engaged in an autobiography of his great ancestor at the present time ; and we sincerely hope that it will be done with a view of throwing light on the history of that period, instead of aiming at procuring a Government allowance for his descendants. The style of the opening chapter, a slight resumé of history, is very grandiloquent ; and the writer is too apt to run on into very long sentences, sometimes extending over a whole page, in which the thread of the narrative is with difficulty retained, and the construction occasionally exceedingly hard to understand. We can only hope that the forthcoming work will be free from the defects of the present one, and will bring new light to bear on the strangely complicated network of Marhattá history.

*The Rational Practice of Medicine.* A Lecture delivered at the School of Arts. By L. Salzer, M.D. Jeypore.

WE feel we have no need of apology in bringing Dr. Salzer's pamphlet to the notice of our readers. Addressed as it is to unprofessional readers in language free from technicalities, and in an easy readable style, we know no work of its size which contains more information on its subject, or which sets forth more fairly and fully the main principles of medical treatment. Nor is it what is generally understood by a *popular* scientific work, for the reasoning is singularly acute and logical.

The time has gone by for Medicine, as for Theology, when the patient was content to accept the Doctor unquestioned as the High Priest of Nature, whose act was a mystery into which the uninitiated eyes of the laity were forbidden to pry. Now, the public demands of its medical adviser the reason of the faith that is in him—no longer blindly trusting to his guidance; its confidence rests on the evidence of reason alone. No indulgences can be purchased now for sins against Nature's laws. No miraculous cures are performed by the intervention of the Priest of Nature. No assumption of curative power can now pass unchallenged—and, indeed, the whole character and duties of the "Doctor" have changed.

The tendency of modern thought has changed since the good old times when the Doctor performed cures. Scepticism about the power of medicine is fashionable. Dr. Salzer shows well how such feeling has arisen; and gives good hopes of a future rich in promise for the science of therapeutics, till lately sadly neglected.

Dr. Salzer starts with showing how the principle "*contraria contrariis curantur*" is naturally suggested to the mind by the symptoms of the disease itself. He then goes on to show that though, as an abstract proposition, it is self-evident, yet that our knowledge is not sufficient to admit of our applying it in practice. In the limited sense in which it has been used as a maxim of practice, *viz.*, "that a disease will be cured by a therapeutic agent which will produce in a healthy body symptoms directly contrary to those of the disease," it is undoubtedly false.

"The question as to how far drugs act alike on the healthy and the diseased body is ignored, and therefore the proposition is not a fair extension of "*contraria contrariis curantur*."

Another point well illustrated by Dr. Salzer is the recognition of morbid forces, which must be combated, if at all, by pharmacodynamic forces; medicinal agents are useless except by arousing, stimulating, controlling or diverting forces that are latent in the system. The organism might well succumb when it became the battlefield of opposite and contending forces; and therefore one should not in obedience to the maxim "*contraries are cured by contraries*,"

arouse a latent force which may prove wantonly destructive to the sick man, even if contrary to the supposed morbid one.

This maxim thus used, partially and unfairly, has done much mischief not only by causing practitioners to rely on therapeutic agents of no value, but also by directing enquiry into a false direction, and thus hindering the progress of true enquiry.

We would go farther even than Dr. Salzer and say, that not only is the "*contraria contrariis*" principle delusive, but that in the present state of medical knowledge, or rather ignorance, all principles deduced from theory must be also delusive. It is not until a science has past far further on its course than has medicine, that it can safely leave the safe path of observation, experiment, and deduction.

We think also that Dr. Salzer has laid too much stress perhaps on the importance of the principle "*contraria contrariis*" as influencing practice in the present day. There is no need of quotations, though many would be forthcoming if needed, to prove that at the present day on the Continent, as well as in England, the principle is no longer taught or recognised. Its opposite is indeed taught by one School of Medicine; but by far the greater number of the Professors of Therapeutics ignore any principle whatever, and say that pure Empiricism is the only guide at present; that long observation and experiment is needed before we can hope to form a theory of therapeutics. Most own to certain specifics discovered and warranted by experiment and experience; and for the rest treat their patients on the expectant or physiological principle, not attempting to cure the disease, but only to combat symptoms and put the patient in the best condition to enable him to wait for Nature's cure. This, with innumerable modification, is the real practice and theory of modern practitioners, with the exception of the School to which Dr. Salzer belongs.

It has been the reproach of medicine that it is the only science in which no theory is owned,—no law of cure allowed. But let us see what a late writer on Political Science says, and we shall find that it is not only in medicine that men have at last come to the conclusion that experience is better than theory as a guide to practice.

"Political maxims are not universally true, that is, not of universal application. In practical dealings with State affairs, empiricism may almost be said to be safer than science—than any science at least which is not profounder than statesmanship in these days ever reaches; that, in a word, in managing or speculating on the management of nations as of individuals, an acquaintance with the constitutional idiosyncracies of the patient is more essential than a theoretic mastery of the sciences of medicine and nutrition."

And again :—"In politics there are few or no axioms, few or no

abstract and general principles; on no subject is reasoning *à dicto secundum quid ad dictum simpliciter* so invariably mischievous and shallow."

We have not space to follow Dr. Salzer through the other subjects on which he has touched. Although the present pamphlet is mainly negative in character, it is not the less useful, as showing the public what they can expect, and reminding the profession of the danger of trusting to self-evident propositions as rules of practice. We only hope that on some future occasion, as he gives us reason to believe, Dr. Salzer will be able to settle a new and efficient principle on the ruins of the *effete* one which he has so ably exposed.

---

*Sanitary and Vaccine Reports for the Province of Oudh, 1870.*

THESE reports by the Officiating Sanitary Commissioner of the Province of Oudh, Surgeon J. C. Whishaw, contain, in short space, a great amount of valuable information regarding the progress of sanitary measures in this large and important province, contrasting most favourably with the ponderous and expensive volumes in which other members of the Sanitary Department gratify annually their "*cacoëthes scribendi*."

Cholera and small-pox, we regret to observe, are still very prevalent in the province, the former giving rise, in round numbers, to 16,000 deaths, and the latter to 11,000, out of a total of 200,000 deaths from all causes. These data can, however, only be regarded as approximations to the truth, and great difficulty still exists in arriving at anything approaching reliable registration, not only of the causes but of the number of deaths. As an instance of the former Dr. Whishaw quotes from Mr. William's Census Report of the Province of Oudh in which it is stated, that in the cold weather of 1864-65 an extraordinary number of deaths from cholera was reported from some villages; on investigation these were proved to have been all due to small-pox.—"*The chowkidār, however, had an idea that the Deputy Commissioner had a "shuk" for cholera, and he accordingly described cholera as the cause of all the deaths that occurred in several villages for several months.*"

Surgeon Whishaw also shows that under the head of cholera every death preceded by vomiting and purging is entered. Taking these causes of error into account and applying them to the whole Bengal Presidency, we may well view with suspicion the elaborate and costly maps of the annual spread of cholera planned by the Statistical Officer with the Imperial Sanitary Commissioner, when we know that every shade of colour thereon may be influenced by the registering chowkidār's knowledge of the particular "shuk" of the Deputy Commissioner!

A great improvement in the health of Lucknow and other stations is noticed ; in Lucknow the deaths decreased from 5,411 in 1869 to 4,664 in 1870, a circumstance naturally ascribed by the Officiating Sanitary Commissioner to the care taken in conservancy and other sanitary arrangements.

Owing partly to an improved system of registration commenced in the beginning of the second half of the year, the number of deaths nearly doubled those in the preceding half year. This leads us to believe that the death-rate, given as 17 per 1000, is considerably under the actual amount which is, most probably, over 20 per 1,000, or more than double the mortality of the inhabitants of the British Isles. The cause of this excessive mortality is almost altogether due to fevers which gave a death-rate of nearly 11 per 1,000 in 1870. Deducting deaths caused by fevers from those due to all causes—17 per 1000—we have only 6 per 1000 which, even allowing a wide margin for errors in registration, contrasts most favourably with the mortality of the United Kingdom. Dr. Whishaw ascribes these fevers principally to malaria emanating from jhils and undrained land, and recommends that the former be drained, and the supply of water necessary for agricultural purposes be confined to large tanks.

Looking at the result of the drainage of marshes in various parts of England and other countries, where the inhabitants of tracts formerly almost decimated by malarious fevers, now scarcely know the disease ; and remembering that the mortality of the people of Oudh is more than doubled by fevers, of which by far the greater number are undoubtedly due to malaria ; it is evidently very desirable that something should be done to limit the extent of these enormous marshes, not only in Oudh but throughout the Bengal Presidency ; but we fear that should even so great an undertaking be entered upon, the date of its completion is very far off. In the meantime the people of Oudh and other marshy parts of India must share the lot of their forefathers, but better off than they, living under the protection of a paternal Government which, to those suffering, promises relief in the shape of quinine obtainable at dispensaries throughout the province.\*

From the Vaccine Report we learn that vaccination has made but slow progress in Oudh, notwithstanding the good example afforded by some of the leading native gentlemen of the province who had themselves and all their families vaccinated. The introduction of vaccination into India must necessarily be a question of time which will alone overcome the prejudices of the natives, to quote Dr. Whishaw—"it is not surprising that the ignorant Hindús object to it when, even in the civilized countries of Europe, persons

---

\* See para. 14, Remarks of the para. 33, Officiating Sanitary Commissioner on Commissioner's Report.

are found who not only deny that it is a benefit, but consider it a great evil."

---

*Report of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India, for 1870. Calcutta. 1871.*

THE seventh annual volume of Indian State Medicine—that for the past year 1870—has just been published.

It is much to be regretted that so much delay should, almost invariably, occur in the issue of this and other kindred reports. If the object was simply to place on record, for reference, the sanitary history of the year, its appearance, 9 or 10 months after the completion of the year, would be a matter of little consequence. But, if public interest is to be kept up in, and public assistance is required to aid the sanitary efforts of Government, the sooner the annual volume appears the better.

At the time of going to press, only one of the reports of the local Sanitary Commissioners for 1870, (writes the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India,) had reached that officer. This delay may be due, in part, to the length of the local reports, and the question then naturally arises—"Is it necessary to make them so long"? Brevity, we take it, is as much the soul of a report as of a witty anecdote; and it might be well if some of our annual reporters—gifted, or rather shall we say cursed, with the *cacoethes scribendi*,—were to follow Sydney Smith's advice and strike out every second word!

The volume under review consists of over 107 pages of letter-press from the pen of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India, including a few extracts and tables from other reports, followed by three appendices; and the annual returns of the European and native armies, and of the jail population of the Bengal Presidency, from the pen of Dr. Bryden.

The Commissioner's Report is, as usual, divided into four sections:—section 1, consisting of 86 pages, being devoted to European troops; section 2, extending over only 5½ pages, being given to native troops; section 3, comprising 6½ pages, to the jail, and the remainder to the general population.

The ratio of daily sick throughout the whole army was higher than in any one year since 1862. Out of every 1,000 men there were 63·8 daily in hospital. But *five-sixths of the European troops were in the plains, only one-sixth being in the hills*. We read that 731 European soldiers—the best part of an entire regiment—died in the Bengal Presidency in 1870, giving a ratio of something over 2 per cent. But, we are told that, as compared with former years, this proportion is not high. During the past decade the minimum mortality has been (in 1866) about 2, and the maximum (in 1868) a little more than 4, per cent. In the sixth

portion of the army stationed in the hills, the death-rate was slightly over 1 per cent.

Thus, from the evidence of the Government record, we see that a large portion of the European army is annually immolated upon the plains of India, whilst her mountain ranges remain in some cases unexplored, and in others unoccupied! Humanity and finance to the rescue! It is well known to experienced Indian physicians that, although the hills do not deserve the reputation they once had, inasmuch as they fail to aid in the eradication of organic disease, yet they are valuable in maintaining health. To employ the hills therefore as cantonments should be the rule\* to use them as invalid depôts, the exception. We are encouraged in this view by the fact, as recorded in the volume before us, that, as regards sickness and mortality, *Dugshai*, the best of our hill stations, *shews for 1870, a smaller ratio than any English station.* After so much evidence has been accumulated in favour of the Himalayan ranges as possessing suitable sites for military stations, why are they not more explored and utilized as such? What has been already done in this direction is very limited; and we venture to say that, in many cases, it has not been well done. Look at Lohághát in Kumáon, for example. A pretty little spot, between 5,000 and 6,000 feet above the sea level, easily approached from the plains by Birm Deo, a good road only being required. Lohághát has been abandoned after an imperfect trial. A company (of the Rifle Brigade we believe) was quartered there a few years ago for one season only. If we remember right, the effects of a cold season were not tried. Inaccessible it undoubtedly was (one of the objections to it raised) from the plains *viâ* Naini-Tal (the road that was taken), the distance being 80 miles! But *viâ* Birm Deo this would be reduced to less than 30.

It is worthy of note that European and native troops suffer more from fever than from any other disease. We should like to feel that the result, as regards the diminution of fever and other malarious disorders, of double-storied barracks which were built with

---

\* Rinikhet, averaging some 6,000 feet above the sea level, about 20 miles to the north-west of Almora, has been added to the list of hill cantonments during the year. Excellent results are expected. Panchmari, in the Central Provinces, some 3,500 feet above the sea level, has been occupied by troops during the early part of the year; but, there being no better shelter than tents when the rainy season set in, the men were then sent down. This hill will doubt-

less prove a useful site for a cantonment.

The Cherat hill, 30 miles from Pesháwar, about 4,400 feet above the sea level, has as heretofore proved a valuable sanitarium for the troops at that cantonment. Whilst the mortality was 25 per cent at Pesháwar, it was only from 5 to 6 per cent at Cherat, and this amongst weakly men who had been sent up on account of sickness.



a view to protect the troops from malarious influences had been favourable. The troops ought to have suffered less since these lordly structures were erected ; whereas, says the record, they have suffered in 1870 more than in any year since 1858. It would thus seem that so far, *le jeu ne vaut pas la chandelle*\* ! We find that of the deaths from fever 62 were due to *typhoid fever*. There can be now no question that this disease, though met with less frequently than in European countries, is much more common in India than was formerly supposed. Venereal disease, as usual, occupies a prominent position amongst the causes of sickness. It stands next to fever. It has prevailed in much the same proportion as in previous years. This is very lamentable ; although the Commissioner adds that the result of preventive measures during the past six years shews a marked improvement on the previous six years. The improvement, he thinks, would be much greater if the rules were administered with more care, and in this we agree with him. We believe that, in some stations, the police are shamefully inefficient ; and, instead of punishing the prostitute who shirks registration, we would visit with the utmost rigour of the law the policeman who connives at the evasion. Did space permit, we could record several instances of police inefficiency. We cannot, however, refrain from mentioning one. At Dárjiling, until quite recently, only two women representing the prostitution of the place (!) were registered, and of course periodically examined. Whilst they were provided with a clean bill of health, venereal disease was rife in the European Dépôt. Whence did it come ? From unregistered prostitutes, of course. The worst, however, is yet to be told. Because the Lock-Hospital was so seldom occupied, the order went forth to close it, and to stop all further examination ! The object of the Contagious Diseases Act seems to be misunderstood by the Civil Authorities of Dárjiling, with whom the order originated.

It is satisfactory to know that the returns from Bengal do not compare unfavourably with those of stations in the United Kingdom which are under the Contagious Diseases Act.

The point seems to be clearly established from the records of the year, that the sickness and mortality are greatest in those regiments which are in their first year of residence ; and nearly *one-third* of all the invaliding of the past six years has been amongst men of less

\* It seems remarkable that more trouble has not been taken to ascertain exactly the preventive effect of double stories ; but Dr. Cunningham states somewhat complainingly that the returns intended to throw light

upon the subject have not been generally kept. He adds that a new form has been devised from which full information ought in time to be obtained. So, indeed, it ought.

than three years\* service. Bearing in mind, therefore, that the greatest sickness and mortality occurs in new regiments, the point that those regiments should consist of good material cannot be too strongly insisted upon. Extremes of age suffer most from climatic influences; very young men consequently should not be sent to a tropical climate. During the past six years, we learn from Dr. Bryden's tables appended to Dr. Cunningham's report, that 1,307 European soldiers have died, and 1,895 have been invalided—all under 24 years of age. The measures recently adopted to prevent very young lads from coming to India should have been enforced many years ago. The rate of invaliding has been high—52·50 per 1,000. The loss to the State from this cause has, it appears, been steadily increasing annually for some years past; but this is owing to a very large number of men being sent home for change of climate. The loss is thus, to some extent, only temporary† as many of the men return. As Dr. Cunningham observes, it would be important to know the ultimate end both of those invalided for discharge and of those sent home for change of climate. Where constitutional Syphilis‡ has been the cause, a poison, in the case of marriage, is circulated through the country intensifying the virulence of that which is already the bane of Great Britain and Ireland. The total loss, by invaliding and death, during 1870 was 74·40 per 1,000. This is very high; but a very large number of men are sent home annually owing to the hills being held in such ill-repute. As Dr. Cunningham says, it would be well if the climate of the hills were more tried in the cold weather.§ A very striking fact is noticed in the Report. *viz.*, that the great mass of the sickness of the year has been due to a very few diseases which are eminently of a preventible nature. Amongst these, fever and venereal stand prominently forward, and cholera is not included in the list. Comparing the sickness of the three presidencies, the number of men

\* Out of 10,000 men sent home as unfit for service in this country during the six years ending in 1870, over 3,000 had been less than three years in India. This is a strong argument in favour of locating young regiments on first arrival in India, in the hills.

† It is clearly established by Dr. Bryden's tables that, although the general invaliding has much increased during the past few years, the number actually discharged has considerably diminished.

‡ No man should be *discharged* for constitutional Syphilis if there be the remotest chance of his being cured in an English hospital,—as at Netley. The poison should, if possible, be eradicated from his system before turning him loose upon society.

§ It appears that in between  $\frac{1}{4}$  and  $\frac{1}{2}$  of the number of men who had been sent up to the hills during the year, on account of sickness, the change failed to produce the desired effect. Had these men remained during the cold weather, a different result might have been obtained. The experiment of establishing working parties in the hills has been eminently successful. But it would have been even more so had the hills been occupied during the cold months. Had this been done, the death-rate would not have been more than 74 per cent.

constantly sick in Bengal has been 67·1 per 1,000, in Madras 62·0, and in Bombay 59·8. The mortality has likewise been greatest in Bengal, the average death-rate for the preceding ten years being 29·98 per 1,000 against 21·46 in Bombay, and 20·27 in Madras. The higher death-rate in Bengal is due to cholera, fever, and heat-apoplexy.

It is gratifying to learn that the death rate amongst women and children has been—especially amongst the former—considerably under the average of the last ten years.

The average annual death-rate amongst officers, taking those of Her Majesty's British and Indian Army together, has been during the past ten years 17·52 per 1,000. Amongst officers, Her Majesty's British Army and Her Majesty's Indian Army separately, the average has been, for the same period, 16·84 for the former, and 18·20 for the latter. The year has been marked by a singular absence of cholera, amongst the troops, European and native, and generally in prisons; within a small area, in the eastern districts of the N.W. Provinces and adjoining portions of Oudh, the general population had suffered considerably. This disease is now receiving, we are told, an unusual amount of attention on account of the measures taken to institute a special enquiry into its nature and history, &c. Special medical officers have been deputed to investigate the truth of Pottenkofer's theory; the registers of sub-soil water, commenced in 1869, have been continued in 1870, and the labours of Dr. Douglas Cunningham and Dr. Lewis have received favourable notice. But they have as yet thrown no light upon the disease. A map intended "to illustrate the annual report of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India," is affixed to the report under notice. On it are represented the five different areas over which the troops in the plains have been distributed. The sixth area, corresponding to the hill stations, does not appear in detail. The map is still incomplete, inasmuch as *all India* is not included, and it is somewhat defective in clearness. We read that a new plan of map for illustrating cholera is now under consideration. The map suggested by Dr. Goodeve in 1868, approved by the Secretary of State for India, and prescribed by the Government, has been found impracticable, as being too complicated.

We venture to think that not only a cholera but a general disease map is much required for India. A map might be prepared annually, shewing the localities where tropical diseases have been more especially rife during the preceding year. Such a series, at the end of several years, would be in itself very instructive, and from the whole a single large map generalizing the subject might be constructed.

In order to test the effect of sanitary measures in checking

cholera within its endemic limits, steps have been taken to have a careful topographical survey made by a skilled Engineer in the neighbourhood of a particular jail, to be followed by a thorough system of drainage around it. Meetapur (Patna) jail has been selected. We would suggest that, in addition to good drainage, the number of inmates in the jail should be largely reduced. Overcrowding is a more prolific source of disease than it receives credit for.

We learn that the subject of the best means of obtaining a really complete and scientific account of the meteorology of India, to be studied in connection with the distribution of disease over the whole continent of India, is now under the consideration of Government. It is to be feared that at present, many of our meteorological records are very far from trustworthy.

The death-rate, in the Regular Native army, has been about 1·9 per cent., a ratio somewhat above the average of the previous nine years. The mortality has been due chiefly to fever and chest (respiratory) affections. *More than half the deaths* have been due to these causes, 4·93 representing fevers, and 1·23 being chest-affections, in a total of 10·85. The mortality has been greatest in the Panjáb, where two-thirds of the whole was due to fever and lung diseases. It has been lowest in Hazára, Kachár and Silhet, Cawnpur, Almora, Ambála, Dinapur and Gorakhpur. The average death-rate in the Panjáb was about 2 per cent. (In Miánmir it was more than 5!) No part of this was due to cholera. The lowest death-rate was in Hazára.

Amongst Irregular Native troops, those quartered in Central India suffered least. Excepting Deoli, where it was 6, the admission-rate never exceeded 4 per cent. In the Panjáb Frontier Irregular Force, the admission-rate averaged 6 per cent; at Mardán and Rájanpur, it was 10! Throughout the entire Native Army, the Panjáb Irregular Force has suffered most.

Nearly 60,000 prisoners have been daily in confinement throughout the Bengal Presidency in 1870—a number much above any year since 1858. The sickness appears to have been much less than in former years, excepting 1868, when the admission-rate was only 2·1 per cent. In the other 10 years it varied from 3 to 5 per cent. The death-rate in 1870 has been much under the average of the preceding 11 years, in some of which it rose to 10 per cent. It has been less favourable than in 1868 when it fell to 3 per cent. The causes of sickness were, as usual, fevers and bowel complaints. In a total of 982·4 admissions per 1,000, 468·3 were due to fever, 99·8 to dysentery, and 80·6 to diarrhoea. Of the total mortality—41·92 per 1,000; 16·67 was

due to dysentery and diarrhoea; 5·91 to fever; and 4·79 to respiratory affections; 3·17 were due to atrophy and anæmia; 1·77 to phthisis pulmonalis; and 3·52 to cholera. Thus we see that though fever is a common cause of sickness amongst prisoners, it is less fatal than bowel complaints. Where, however, the fever is of a virulent type, a different result is seen.

In comparing the admission and death-rate amongst the three classes—European troops, Native troops, and prisoners—we see a very striking result; and yet it is exactly what might be expected. Although the admission-rate amongst prisoners is less than that in the other classes, the death-rate is higher. The admission-rate, in European troops, being 1731·9 and in Native troops 1492·3 per 1,000, the death-rate in the former was 21·90, and in the latter 15·89 per 1,000. In jails, with an admission-rate of 982·4, the death-rate has been 41·92, or more than double the mortality amongst soldiers either European or Native.\*

The admission-rate was greatest during the year, in the jails in Bengal Proper and Assam, those in the Central Provinces (excluding Sagar and Jabalpur) and in the jails in the Panjáb; whilst the death-rate reach its maximum in the jails in Rohilkhand and Mirat.

The excessive sickness in the Láhore Female Jail is very striking. During the last seven years the death-rate amongst the female prisoners, has been nearly 8 per cent. The mortality amongst young children is also excessive in this jail. More than 62 per cent of them died during the year. It is said that a woman seldom retains her milk beyond the first month of her residence in prison. Urgent enquiry seems to be called for here.

In Section IV., the general population is considered; commencing—in the absence of the reports of local Sanitary Commissioners, one only of which had reached Dr. Cunningham in September 1871—with the results of mortuary registration. The uncertainty of these results is quite realised by the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India. Although the simplest forms have been adopted, and the fewest possible number of diseases have been specified, so as to make the subject as little confusing as may be, innumerable errors creep into the Mortuary Register which thus becomes a most untrustworthy record. As Dr. Cunningham justly says, registration in England is a comparatively easy matter, where as a rule each case of sickness has fallen under the observation of a medical practitioner; whereas here, in India, in many districts there “are hundreds of thousands of people of whom not one is capable of stating the cause of death with any accuracy.” \* \* The

---

\* The correct comparison would be little to be depended upon, that the with the general population; but, comparison cannot be made, the returns under this head are so

people, with rare exceptions, \* \* die without ever having been seen by a medical attendant who could diagnose their diseases." We have always thought that the Police are a bad medium through which to obtain mortuary statistics ; more satisfactory results would, we venture to think, be obtained through the Civil Authorities from the head men of villages.

As to the best means of diffusing vaccination, Dr. Cunningham recognizes the value of concentration, as originated by Dr. Pearson. When the people see a particular district (that has been vaccinated) free from small-pox, whilst surrounding villages (not so protected) are succumbing to its ravages, the value of the prophylactic will be brought home to them. Dr. Cunningham thinks that vaccination will thus come to be recognised and solicited as a favour ; this we very much doubt. The "circle" system of vaccination may do much wherever it be introduced ; but, until the *quondam* inoculators for small-pox turn vaccinators, the crust only of the population will be touched ; they alone can reach the core. Inoculation for small-pox has been made penal in several districts with highly satisfactory results. Inoculators have applied to the Civil Surgeon for vaccine lymph which they have used in the same way as the virus of small-pox ; and it only remains to encourage this system for a few years longer when we may safely leave it to work its own way. Once let the operator feel that he is no loser by the change, and the people that they are as well protected, there need be no fear for the result. But it must never be lost sight of, that it is through the people themselves that this result must be effected. We should be less anxious to secure large returns of persons vaccinated by our own vaccinators than to chronicle half the number operated upon by *quondam* inoculators for small-pox. Amongst other matters of general interest referred to in the State volume, are the regulation of the transit by rail of persons suffering from small-pox and other contagious diseases, (now under consideration,) and the better supply of drinking-water for emigrants from Calcutta ; but upon these points we have no detailed information. Both are subjects of great importance ; and we trust that, in the next volume, the regulations made by Government will be recorded.

Dr. Cunningham, in noticing the marked improvement of the health of the town of Calcutta during 1870, is doubtful whether it simply represents the healthy character of the year, or whether we may recognize the *post hoc, ergo, &c.* The general opinion seems to be in favour of the latter view. If it be correct, force is given to the theory of the cholera poison existing in water, and of its being a medium for the propagation of other diseases.

With regard to the discoloration of the water of the lake at Nainital, it is satisfactory to know that the *Infusoria*, to the presence

of which it was due, affect clean water in preference to that contaminated by sewage. Their presence, therefore, not only in the Naini-Tal lakes but in other lakes in Kumáon, is a guarantee for their cleanliness.

Of the appendices which are attached to Dr. Cunningham's Report, Appendix A. is a general review of the annual reports of the local Sanitary Commissioners for 1869. Appendix B. represents a report on cholera by Dr. Douglas Cunningham, Assistant Surgeon, H. M.'s Indian Army, who is attached to the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India. This is a very valuable report, as showing what has been done so far in India, to test the truth of Pettenkofer's, or the germ, theory respecting cholera. The report is profusely illustrated; but, although the microscope has revealed an almost innumerable variety of forms, no single one has been detected as characteristic of cholera. Further investigations are being made, and it is satisfactory to know that such zealous workers as Drs. D. Cunningham and Lewis (his coadjutor in the enquiry) are in the field.

Appendix C is a report (from the pen of Dr. Bryden) on the influence of age and length of service in affecting the mortality and invaliding of the European Army of the Bengal Presidency, the gist of which we have already given; and the volume concludes with the annual returns of the European and Native armies and of the jail population of the Bengal Presidency for the year, also from the same accomplished author's pen.

We cannot conclude this notice without recording our testimony in favour of the energy and zeal which are displayed by the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India in the performance of his annual task; although we are of opinion that this record of Indian State Medicine should be compiled in the office of the head of the Indian Medical Department, the materials being furnished by his deputies.

---

*A Brief History of Bengal Commerce, from the year 1814 to 1870; with a short sketch of Indian Finance.* By Kissen Mohnn Mullick. Calcutta. 1871.

THIS pamphlet is by a veteran in the Calcutta commercial world, who speaks of that which he has seen and known. We believe that there is no man in Calcutta better qualified to speak on the commercial history of the province and its great port, than Bábu Kissen Mohun Mullick; and his pamphlet is valuable both from a commercial and from an historical point of view. He traces well and clearly the progress of trade in Bengal, and especially of the trade with Europe, since the abolition of the Company's monopoly in 1813. He delineates very carefully the various phases both of the export and of the import trade

showing especially how they have been affected at various times, *e.g.*, by the Civil War in America, by the opening of telegraphic communication, by the opening of the Suez Canal route. The Bábu speaks in the most hopeful way of the condition and prospects of the Indian tea trade; about many other branches of the export trade of the province he is equally sanguine, and we have no doubt that his thoughts and suggestions will be read with interest by commercial men throughout Bengal. The present state of the import trade, however, seems generally to be anything but satisfactory. For the unhealthy state of the import trade in British plain and colored goods, the Bábu offers the following reasons—most of which affect more or less all classes of imports:—

1st.—The facility of communication by the wire between Europe and India.

2nd.—The time-bargains influenced thereby, and the same multiplied for the sake of mere insignificant margins.

3rd.—The consequent repeated fluctuations.

4th.—The opening of the Suez Canal, by which route Calcutta is brought nearer to England in respect to the transmission of goods by one-third of the time occupied by vessels coming round the Cape of Good Hope.

5th.—All estimates and calculations therefore set at naught.

6th.—The difficulty, if not impossibility, of the fulfilment of contracts on the landing of goods sold for arrival.

7th.—The distrust prevailing among sellers, which dissuades them from freely delivering goods to the purchasers upon credit.

8th.—The impossibility of realising goods for cash payments under reasonable discounts.

9th.—The absence of an adequate capital among dealers to enable them to make their payments with promptitude.

10th.—Hence the trade depending alone upon credits of purchasers, whose position and sterling worth are unknown to the sellers.

11th.—The purchasers again depending in their turn upon their customers on the spot and abroad for enabling them to meet their liabilities.

Of the Bábu's remarks on Indian Finance, the most important are directed to show that the Government can remedy the fluctuations of the opium revenue, by largely increasing the cultivation. Indian opium will thus be enabled to compete with the Chinese home-grown drug, not only (as it does at present) in quality, but also in price. In this way, the Chinese cultivation of opium will be arrested; and though each maund will then sell at a considerably lower figure, the Indian revenue will be more than recouped by the larger quantities exported.

---



*A Compendium of the Law on Mortgages, as contained in the compilation of Mr. Macpherson ; with the necessary amendments consequent on the passing of Acts VIII and IX of 1871. Calcutta. 1871.*

THIS little compilation, based on the larger work of Mr. Macpherson, has been prepared by Bábu Nil Chandra Banerjea of Chinsurah, for the use of students studying for the Senior Pleadership and the University Law Examinations. It seems well suited for this purpose, as it is in a concise form, and the illustrations have been condensed and simplified.

---

*The Indian Limitation Act (Act IX. of 1871,) with Notes.*  
 Edited by Rajendro Missry, Vakeel, High Court. Thacker, Spink and Co. Calcutta. 1871.

THIS edition of Act IX. of 1871 is one which reflects great credit both on the able editor and on the publishers. The notes are particularly full and clear, and display a thorough knowledge of the existing state of the law. A very large number of cases are cited ; and the index is an excellent one. The printing is such as we expect from the high reputation of the City Press, and as the price of the treatise is only two rupees, we have no doubt that it will meet with a large sale.

---

WE are promised articles on (1) Professor Cowell's *Tagore Law Lectures*, 1871 ; (2) Mr. Bruce's *Report on the Dera Gházi Khán District*—which must be our apology for omitting all notice of those valuable works in this place. We can offer the same valid excuse for our brief notice of Mr. Westland's admirable *Report on the Jessore District*. In addition to the works which we have reviewed in these *Critical Notices*, we have to acknowledge with thanks the receipt of many important reports, &c., from the various Governments and Departments of India ; and of a few pamphlets of no public interest.

---

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

*vol. LII*

No. CVIII.

## CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
ART. I.—THE TERRITORIAL ARISTOCRACY OF BENGAL.—	
No. 1.—The Bardwan Raj ... ..	171
„ II.—CHILDREN'S STORIES FOR GROWN-UP PEOPLE.—	
1.—Misunderstood. By Florence Montgomery. Sixth thousand, 1871.	
2.—The Fight at Dame Europa's School.	
3.—Nonsense Songs, Stories, Botany and Alphabets. By Edward Lear. 1871 ... ..	195
„ III.—THE MOFUSSIL RECORDS OF BENGAL ...	204
„ IV.—THE LANGUAGES AND RACES OF DARDISTAN.—	
The Languages and Races of Dardistan. By DR. G. W. LEITNER; Lahore and London ...	223
„ V.—DEGRADATION OR DEVELOPMENT.—	
Primitive Culture. By Edward B. Tylor. London. John Murray, 1871 ... ..	251
„ VI.—THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.—	
PART II.—Matériel ... ..	267
„ VII.—THE BRAHMA SAMA'J AND THE NATIVE MARRIAGE ACT ... ..	285
„ VIII.—TOPICS OF THE QUARTER.—	
Lord Mayo ... ..	314
Education in Bengal ... ..	316
Vigorous Government ... ..	326
The Orthography of Indian Proper Names ...	330
Bengal Municipalities' Bill, 1872 ... ..	332
Indian Patronage ... ..	339
The Muhammadan Faith ... ..	345
The Budget, 1872-73 ... ..	350

## CRITICAL NOTICES.—

## 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

Kámrupa Kámalatá. By Ráj Krishna A'dhya. Ma- dhukari Press. Bhátpáda : Sahábdá, 1793	...	lv
Kavitá-Kalápa. Part I. By Káli Charan Adhikári. Tamohara Press. Serampore : B.E. 1278	...	ib.
Bámárachanávali. Part 1. J. G. Chatterjea and Co's Press. Calcutta : 1872	...	ib.
Kusuma-Máliká. A Poem written by a Hindú lady. Edited by Jogendra Náth Bandyopád- hyáya, B.A. New Bhárata Press, Calcutta	...	lvi
Dhruva Charitra. A drama. By Nimái Chánu Sila. Calcutta : Columbian Press. B.E. 1278	...	ib.
Journal of Travels in India. By Ardaseer Framjee Moos. Vol. I. Bombay : Education Society's Press. 1871	...	lvii
Mahábháratam-Adiparva ; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha. Translated into Bengáli prose by Jagan Mohan Tarkalankára. Calcutta : Kávya Prakash Press. B.E. 1277	...	lviii
Mahábháratam-Adiparva ; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha. Translated into Bengáli prose. Edited by Sasibhusan Chatto- pádhyáya. Serampore. Alfred Press, Sak. 1792	...	ib.
Meghadúta Kávya ; by Kálidása. Translated into Bengáli prose by Nílmani Nandí. Calcutta : New Indian Press. B.E. 1278	...	lix
Eka ghaná kála mátra ekabá ámaké dekhun. By Singher Mámá Babbal Dás. Calcutta : Girisha Vidyáratna Press. October, 1871	...	ib.
Vasantasená. A translation of the Sanskrit drama "Mrichchhakatika." By Madhu Sudan Váchas- pati. Third edition. Calcutta :—Girisha Vidyá- ratna Press. 1871	...	lxi

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE :—

La Langue et la littérature Hindoustaniens en 1871 : Revue Annuelle. Par M. Garcin de Tassy, Membre de l'Institut, Professeur à l'Ecole Speciale des Langues orientales vivantes. Paris, 1872	...	lxiii
Transactions of the Bengal Social Science Associa- tion, vol. V. 1871	...	lxv

	PAGE.
Pickings from Old Indian Books. Higginbotham & Co., Madras. 1872 ... ..	lxviii
Twelfth Night. Being No. I. of "the Chameleon," an Anglo-Indian periodical of light literature. Edited by Phil. Robinson. Allahabad. 1872...	lxxii
Matheran Hill : Its People, Plants, and Animals. By J. Y. Smith, M.D., Bombay Medical Staff. Edinburgh : MacLachlan and Stewart, 1871 ...	lxxiv
Ruins of the Nālanda Monasteries at Burgāon, Sub- division Bihar, Zillah Patna. By A. M. Broadley, Esq., Assistant Magistrate and Collector, Patna. Calcutta : Bengal Secretariat Press, 1872 ...	lxxv

---





THE  
CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

NO. CVIII.

---

ART. I.—THE TERRITORIAL ARISTOCRACY OF  
BENGAL.

---

NO. I.—THE BARDWA'N RA'J.

IN the series of which the present paper is the first number, we propose to narrate, with the utmost care and in some detail, the territorial and genealogical history of the noblemen and gentlemen of a vast province—the titled and untitled zamindárs of Bengal. Whilst we propose to give (as far as we are able) those particulars of the family and history of the present incumbents of the titles or estates, which are usually given in "Peerages," "County Histories," &c., in England, we also wish to do more than this. In the first place, in narrating the genealogical history of each family, we shall endeavour to make it illustrate the general political and social history of the country. That this is quite possible, in the dearth of authentic published records and other materials for local history, has been abundantly proved by the highly interesting and most valuable labours of Dr. W. W. Hunter in Birbhúm. In the second place, in narrating the territorial history and in describing the territorial possessions of each family, we hope to present our readers with a topographical and statistical account of the estates in question. The scientific value and interest of such information where it is authentic—and to this end our utmost efforts will tend—must be allowed by all; and at present, even where it is at all attainable, it is only to be found by ransacking dingy record-rooms, and by laborious enquiries which in many cases must occupy a long time.

Mr. J. Z. Holwell in his account of Bengal, as it was during the later Muhammadan times, thus describes Bardwán or Burdumanna as he calls it—"North-west of Fort William and

## 170 The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.

about three days and a half distant lie the lands of Rajah Pillnook Chunder, extending twelve days' travel; the stipulated rental these lands, thirty-two lacs per annum, but its real produce and value from eighty lacs to one khrore. This is the principal of the three districts ceded in perpetuity to the Company by the treaty with Cassim Ali Khan in the year 1760." Mr. Holwell adds "Burdumaun is high and better peopled and better cultivated than any part of the three provinces, blessings that caused it every year more particularly to become a prey to the Mahrattahs, as before recited."

Sir Bernard Burke, in his *Peerage and Baronetage for 1871*, gives a brief account of the Bardwán Ráj under the heading *British subjects enjoying titles of Foreign Nobility*. This classification is obviously wrong; the titled zamíndárs of Bengal are no more foreign noblemen than the Scotch or Irish peers or the Ulster baronets. It was, however, difficult for Sir Bernard Burke to decide under what other category to place them. The following is the account to which we refer:—

### BARDWAN.\*

Mahtáb Chánd Maháráj Adhíráj Bahádúr of Bardwán, Bengal, originally of Kotli in Lahor; *b.* November 17, 1820, *s.* to the title and ráj after the death of his father the Maháráj Adhíráj Tej Chánd Bahádúr, 16th August 1832, *m.* first, 18 February 1829, Nayan Kumári dau. of Piará Lál, originally of Sirhind in Pattiala. She was *b.* 10th March 1822; *d.* 24th June 1840; and had issue.—

Dhandei Maháráj Kumári of Bardwán, *b.* 17th June 1840; *m.* 20th March 1847, Lálá Gopináth Mehra (son of Lálá Gangáram Mehra of Patna), *b.* 6th December 1829, *d.* 10th July 1853.

He *m.* secondly, 24th June 1844, Náráin Dei, now Náráin Kumári Maháráni Adhíráni of Bardwán, *dau.* of Lálá Kedárnáth, of Bharáich, in Oudh, *b.* 5th June 1833, and has issue:—

Aftáb Chánd, Mahtáb Bahádúr Maháráj Kumár of Bardwán, son and heir-at-law by adoption, *b.* 8th August 1860.

Crest.—As, an ancient (Hindustáni) shield, ppr, between in chief a sunburst, and in base two swords in saltire, points downward also ppr.

Supporters.—An iron-grey horse's head couped, around the neck a riband argent, and pendant therefrom an escutcheon of the last charged with a lion passant guardant.

Motto.—*Deo orato, justitiam colito.*

Residence.—Mahtáb Manzil (Rájbarí), Darulbahar (Dilkhusha), and Mahtáb (Krishnasagar), Bardwán; Rájbarí, Chinsurah; Rájbarí, Bonga Bank and Woodlands, Dárljling; and the Retreat,

\*The name of the family is not given in the original text, but it is clear from the context that it is the family of the Bardwán Ráj.

The igree of the Bardwán family thus runs,—

Abu Rái,	Mahárájá Trailokya Chandra
Bábu Rái,	Rái,
Ghanasyám Rái,	Mahárájá Biráj Rájá,
Krishnarám Rái,	Mahárájá Tej Chandra Bahá-
Rájá Jagat Rám Rái,	dúr,
Rájá Kirtti Chandra Rái,	Mahárájá Pratáp Chandra
Rájá Mitra Sen Rái,	Baháddúr,
Mahárájá Chitra Sen Rái,	Mahárájá Mahtáb Chandra
	Baháddúr.

Abu Rái, by caste a Kapur Kshatriya, was the founder of the Bardwán family. He migrated to Bengal from the Panjáb, and settled in Bardwán. In the year 1068 of the Muhammadan era, he was appointed Chaudhri and Kotwál of Pek-abe Bágán, &c., in the town of Bardwán, under the Fauzdár of Chakla Bardwán. His son Bábu Rái, who owned Parganá Bardwán and three other mahals, was succeeded by his son Ghanasyám Rái. On the death of Ghanasyám Rái, his son Krishnarám Rái having succeeded to the zamindáris, acquired new estates, and was honoured with a farmán from the Emperor Alamgír. It was in his time, and in the year 1107 of the Hijrah and A.D. 1696 that one of his feudatories, Subhá Singh, the tálukdár of Jetwá and Bardá, in the district of Bardwán, being dissatisfied with his administration, raised the standard of rebellion for the avowed purpose of overturning the Ráj. Rahim Khán, an Afghán chief, co-operated with him in the expedition. In a stand-up fight, they slew the Mahárájá and captured all the members of his family except his son Jagat Rái; who escaped and proceeded to Dháká and urged the Governor to espouse his cause and assist him in expelling the rebels. The Governor deputed Núr Alí, the Fauzdár of Jessor, and a *Tinhasdár* or military commandant of 3,000 horse. The Fauzdár, however, believing with Falstaff that discretion was the better part of valour, marched from Jessor, but instead of fulfilling his mission shut himself up in the fort of Hugli and invoked the aid of the Governor of the neighbouring Dutch settlement of Chinsurah. The insurgents, emboldened by the pusillanimous proceedings of the Fauzdár, laid siege to Hugli, and acquired possession of that city without resistance. They were, however, in their turn, attacked by the Governor of Chinsurah, and compelled to abandon Hugli. Amongst the members of the family of the Mahárájá captured by the rebel, was his beautiful virgin daughter, whom Subhá Singh endeavoured to sacrifice to his passion. He at first flattered and enjoyed her; but his proposals being indignantly refused, he entered her room or rather prison, and proceeded to offer her violence. The Ráj-Kumár, prepared for the outrage, drew from the folds of her sari a sharp-pointed instrument and stabbed him with it in the abdomen.



## 174 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

The wretch Subhā Singh died a victim to his lawless lust. Animated by an heroic sense of honour, the Rāj-Kumārī felt she had been polluted by his touch, and plunged, Lucretia-like, the dagger into her own breast.

It may be here mentioned that in the rebellion of Subhā Singh originated the formation of the towns of Calcutta, Chandernagar, and Chinsurah. The English at Sutānati, the French at Chandernagar, and the Dutch at Chinsurah being intimidated by the outrages of the rebels, applied to the Nawāb Nāzim of Murshidābād to be allowed to put their factories into a state of defence. The Nawāb granted their application and they accordingly fortified their settlements.

Jagat Rām Rái succeeded his father Krishnarām Rái. He also made additions to the family estates, and was honoured with a farmān by the Emperor Alamgír. He was slain by a traitor at about the termination of the year 1108. He left two sons—Kírtti Chandra Rái and Mitra Sen Rái. The elder brother, Kírtti Chandra, inherited the ancestral zamíndārís; and acquired parganás Chatuyan, Bhurshut, Bardá, and Manoharsháhi, and was honoured by a farmān by the above-mentioned Emperor. Kírtti Chandra was a bold and adventurous spirit. He fought with the rājás of Chandrakoná and Baradá near Ghátál, and dispossessed them of their petty kingdoms. He also seized and took possession of the estates of the Rájá of Balghará, situated near the celebrated shrine of Tárakesvar. These estates were consolidated into the Bardwán rāj. Kírtti Chandra then proceeded to Murshidābād, and got his name registered as proprietor of the new properties. But the boldest achievement of Kírtti Chandra was his attacking and defeating Badyajama, the powerful Rájá of Bishnupur and the chief of the aboriginal Bāgdís of Bengal. He was, however, afterwards reconciled to Badyajama; and co-operated with him in assisting the Nawāb to repel the Marhattás who had encamped in Kátwá after plundering the Western districts. Kírtti Chandra died in the year 1146 and was succeeded by his son Chitra Sen Rái, who added the parganás Mandalghát, Arsa, and Chandrakoná to the paternal estates, and in 1138 was invested with the title of rájá by the Emperor Muhammad Sháhjahán.\* He died in the year 1151 A.H. without issue, and was succeeded in the rāj by his cousin (paternal uncle's son) Trailokya Chandra Rái.

In 1167 Trailokya Chandra Rái was honoured by the Emperor Ahmad Sháh with a farmān recognising and confirming his rights to the rāj. In 1172 he was invested with the titles of Mahá-rájá Dhiráj Bahádur and *Panjsháhrí*, or commander of five thousand cavalry, by the Emperor Sháh Alam.

---

\* The puppet-emperor set up by Alamgír II. in 1759 A.D. Gházi-ná-din, after the assassination of

The Mahárájá, like his immediate predecessors, exercised almost absolute sway within the limits of his territories, as the following fact will shew. In 1755 A.D., an Englishman, having to receive money from one Gomashta Rámjiban Kabiráj, complained to the authorities of the English Settlement at Hugli, and invoked their interference for the recovery of his dues. Thereupon the authorities put peons upon the Rájbari, believing the Gomashta to be concealed there. The Mahárájá feeling this indignity, revenged himself by putting chowkees upon all the Company's factories within his district; and thus stopped their business. Upon the representation of the English authorities, the Nawáb directed the Mahárájá to withdraw the chowkees and allow the English to resume their business.

We find from the proceedings of the Council, dated 24th December 1760, that for the purpose of conciliating the Mahárájá the Hon'ble Company made him the following presents :—

				Rs.
1. Elephant	...	...	...	2,000
2. A suit of clothes...	...	...	...	600
3. Sirpaich	...	...	...	400

Total Rs. 3,000

During the time of the Mahárájá, Bardwán was plundered by the Marhattás as the following letter from him to the English authorities will show :—

"How can I relate to you the present deplorable situation of this place? Three months the Marhattás remained here, burning, plundering and laying waste the whole country; but now, thank God, they are all gone, but the inhabitants are not yet returned. The inhabitants have lost almost all they were worth."

The raj took some time to recover from the effects of this devastation. The calamity was thus pleaded by the Mahárájá for non-payment of money due from him to the Company.

"You are well acquainted with the bad situation of this place at present, but hope I shall be able to pay you the money in the time that I agreed. It has been my bad fortune to have my country burned, plundered and destroyed by the Mahrattás, which is the reason that there is now a balance due to the Company; and to reinstate my country again must be attended with great difficulties which give me much uneasiness."

The elasticity of the resources of the ráj enabled the Mahárájá to regain his position.

In his time there was a Rájbari at Beallah, about seven miles south of Calcutta. The fort of Bajbaj on the Hugli was also his property.

## 176 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

He died in 1177, and was succeeded by his son Tej Chandra ; who, in 1184 B.E., was invested with the hereditary title of Mahárájá Dhiráj Bahádúr by the Emperor Sháh Alam. In 1791 A.D., he was confirmed in the ráj and title by the English Government.

The career of Tej Chandra, as well as that of his successor the present Mahárájá, is interlaced with the condition of the Bardwán ráj during the English administration, and will be told in the course of this narrative.

After the late East India Company took possession of the Dívání, no immediate steps were taken for regulating the collection of the revenues of this or any other part of the country. "Every zamíndárá," as Warren Hastings observes in his admirable letter to the Court of Directors, "and every táluk" was left to its own peculiar "customs." We also learn from the high authority above quoted that Bardwán, which had been in the possession of the Company before the acquisition of the Dívání, continued subject to the authority of the Chief (i.e., the representative) of the Bardwán family who was "immediately accountable to the Presidency." In 1772 the Committee of Revenue at the Presidency, who were the members of the Council of Warren Hastings, prepared the settlement of Hugli ; but they did not interfere with Bardwán, where the lands were already let in farm, on leases of five years, which did not expire till the end of the Bengali year 1162.

Mahárání Bishnu Kumárá, the widow of Mahárájá Trailokya Chandra Bahádúr, was in charge of the administration of the Bardwán ráj, and also the entire district, from 1776 to 1779 A.D.

In 1782 Mahárájá Tej Chandra was entrusted with the management of the district, and remained in charge of it until the English Government appointed its own officers.

The municipal system of the Hindús has been so often described that we need not enter into it at large ; suffice it to remind our readers that it was essentially democratic in its constitution. It formed a society complete and perfect in itself. The organism of the system was enclosed, so to speak, within its structure and framework. It had a *quasi*-independent character. It was an *imperium in imperio*. Each *grám* or village contained within itself the elements of a republic, consisting of a corporation of rayats owning all the land, and headed by an elected chief called the Gráma-Adhikárá. That officer was assisted by a registrar called Gráma-Lekhak. The municipality also consisted of professional persons representing all the agricultural and other crafts, namely, the púrohit or priest, the poet, the gurumahásay or schoolmaster, the kumár or potter, the kámár or blacksmith, the sutradhar or

carpenter, the muchī or cobbler, the nāpit or barber and surgeon, the dhobi or washerman, the ahari or water-carrier, &c. These village officers were supported by chākran lands and jāgirs, or assignments of land held rent-free, besides fees paid by the rayata. The fees were not defined, but differed in different districts. The Grāma-Adhikārī was nominated by the rayata and appointed by the king. He was both an executive and a judicial officer. He was the head of the police; and, as such, was vested with full powers to call upon the people to assist him in ferreting out thieves in cases of robberies, &c. He also decided criminal and civil cases either in person or with the assistance of a panchāyat. It will be perceived that every grām was a small government. A number of villages adjoining each other comprised a district or parganā, presided over by an officer styled Des-Adhikārī, assisted by a registrar or clerk called Des-Lekhak. The Des-Adhikārī had to supervise the concerns of all the villages of the parganā—as the Grāma-Adhikārī managed those of his village. The Muhammadans found this system in its full vigour. They accepted it, and founded their revenue administration on it. That administration would have been inextricably confused, and would have most probably broken down if they had disturbed it. They availed themselves of the great influence of the Grāma-Adhikārī and other village officers to collect the revenue, and to reconcile the rayat to his jot. They converted the Des-Adhikārīs into zamīndārs, and made them responsible not only for the revenue, but also for the peace of the district in their charge. This was not a change in the position and functions, but simply in the title of the Des-Adhikārī. Thus it will be seen that the zamīndār was not simply a middle-man or tax-gatherer.

It is, however, a common but egregious mistake to suppose that the zamīndārs were mere middlemen, whose function was to collect rent from the rayat. During the Hindū régime the Des-Adhikārīs were vested with large police and judicial powers. They represented the people. They were moreover essentially the Lords-Lieutenant of their districts. Though they were nominated by the people, and their appointment was confirmed by the king, yet their office was generally hereditary. The Muhammadans, on taking possession of the country, confirmed their rights and privileges, and recognised the inheritable quality of the tenure of their office; as is shown by their never conferring, except under extraordinary circumstances, sanads on outsiders, to the prejudice of the heirs. Though representatives of Government, yet they were the chiefs of the people. The Muhammadans found and confirmed them as such by sanads. Those sanads did not create, they only recognised existing rights. They were conferred only on the principal zamīndārs, such as those of Nátor, Naddea, Dinápur, Bardwán

## 178 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

&c.; who were virtually Viceroys within the limits of their respective jurisdictions. The great majority of the zamíndárs, however, succeeded according to the law and usages of the country, their names being only enrolled in the Náma-jári book. The Muhammadans further conferred on them responsible and lucrative offices by sanads. They made them Ziládárs or Viceroys, Fauzdárs or Superintendents of Police, Kázís or Judges, Amalgírs or Revenue Collectors, Kotwáls or Police Inspectors.

Hence zamíndárs were not mere contractors or collectors of revenue, but hereditary lords of their districts. Of this position the history of the Bardwán ráj affords ample proof. The British Government recognised them as such after a series of investigations into the respective rights of the rayats, zamíndárs, and rulers. In 1777, when the Court of Directors assumed the direct management of affairs, the then Governor-General, Warren Hastings, and his colleagues formed themselves into a committee for forming fiscal regulations; and a Board of Revenue was constituted for supervising the fiscal affairs of this country. The Governor-General appointed local European officers denominated "Collectors;" and vested them with authority to contract for the public revenue for five years as a temporary arrangement. He also appointed a committee consisting of two Europeans and several intelligent and experienced native revenue officers, for the purpose of collecting information on the rights and condition of the rayats and zamíndárs as a preliminary step to a fixed valuation—a permanent revenue settlement, having for its object the "fixing of the deeds by which the rayats hold their lands and pay their rents, and limiting certain bounds and defences against the authority of the zamíndár." But the hereditary chiefship of the zamíndárs was fully recognised by Warren Hastings, who had made himself thoroughly acquainted with the working of the institutions of the country. His object, as expressed by himself, was to fix the demands on the cultivators, and to secure to them the perpetual and undisturbed possession of their lands, and to guard them against arbitrary exactions. The periodical revenue settlements were at first effected with zamíndárs for 1777-78-79 and 1780. The revenues were afterwards farmed out to them in consideration of a specific amount, the non-payment of which was visited with confiscation of their property. This arrangement resulted in the sale of several zamíndáris. The evil attracted the notice of Parliament, and called forth the Act 24 Geo. III, cap. 25, "charging the Company no inquire into and remedy it." Meantime Warren Hastings had left the country and was succeeded by Sir John Macpherson. This was in 1784-5. In 1785 Mr. James Grant wrote an historical sketch of the revenues of Bengal; in which he noticed a work which had been

recently published by Mr. Francis, entitled "Original Minutes of the Governor-General and Council, 1776, with a plan for the settlement of the revenue of Bengal"; and urged the necessity of instituting a full inquiry into the rights of zamíndárs — an inquiry which had been deprecated by Mr. Francis, apparently for no other reason than that it had been proposed by Warren Hastings. He says:—"To define the rights and privileges of zamíndárs of India, forming the only intermediate class of territorial subjects existing between the prince and peasantry, would be in truth to distinguish also those of the two latter descriptions of persons by marking the common boundaries of all in the chain of mutual dependence." He also combated the idea that the zamíndárs are the proprietors of the land, and maintained that the sovereign was the virtual proprietor. In 1788 Mr. Shore, afterwards Lord Teignmouth, put forth his celebrated minute on the rights of the zamíndárs and tálukdárs. It gives an historical sketch of the administration of the Muhammadan revenue system from the time of the illustrious Akbar to the conquest of this country by the British. He successfully controverted the opinion that the sovereign was the proprietor of the soil, and conclusively proved the hereditary character of the zamíndárs. At length the Marquis of Cornwallis effected the permanent settlement, which has been lauded by some as a constitution, as the Magna Charta of the country, and condemned by others as an abnegation of the rights of the rayats. The author of it recorded his opinion as follows:—"In raising a revenue to answer public exigencies, we ought to be careful to interfere as little as possible with those sources from which the wealth of the subject is derived. The attention of Government ought, therefore, to be directed to render assessment upon the land as little burdensome as possible. This is to be accomplished only by fixing it. The proprietor will thus have some inducement to improve his lands; and as his profits will increase in proportion to his exertions, he will gradually become better able to discharge the public revenue."

The vast estates of Bardwán were brought within the beneficent operation of Regulation I of 1793. The Mahárájá Tej Chandra entered into an agreement dated 21st Srávan 1195 with Government, promising to pay regularly the revenue, amounting to Rs. 40,15,109-2 "according to the statement of collectors which has been adjusted at the Presidency,"—and also Rs. 1,93,721 for *pulbandi* or repairs of embankments. But the benefits of the Permanent Settlement were not fully reaped by the ráj, owing to careless management. It fell into arrears, and was disorganised; so much so that the mother of the then Mahárájá, Rání Bishnu Kumári, compelled him to execute a *kabálá* or deed of sale, assigning over the estate to her. Another

cause of the disorganisation of the estate was its being parcelled out to a large number of *ijárádárs*, the *ijárá*s extending from five to ten years. Most of these *ijárádárs* withheld payment, and were put in jail; but they were liberated after a certain time under promise of paying their rents by instalments. The inevitable result of this subinfeudation was the accumulation of arrears of the Government demand. The then Mahárájá was summoned to the Board, and was threatened with the forfeiture of his *zamíndá-rís*, but to no purpose. At last Munshí, afterwards Rájá, Nava Krishna Dev was appointed *crook sajoal*, but he could do nothing. The Collector of Bardwán suggested the sale of the Bardwán *zamíndá*ri by *lot bandís* as the only way of recovering the arrears of revenue. The Board ordered *lot bandís* to be prepared, and the Collector submitted them. In 1204, corresponding to 1797, the Board commenced selling portions of the estate. Each lot consisted of several villages ascertained from the *Bilá Bandí* papers of the *ijárádárs* filed in the Collectorate.

The principal purchasers of the lots sold by the Board were Dwárká Náth Singh of Singhar, Chhaku Singh of Bhástará, the Mukharjis of Janái, the Bánarjis of Telinipará and others. Some of them had been *ijárádárs*, and were fully acquainted with the resources of the lots, while others had been in the service of the Mahárájá; and from their association with the *sadr* and *mufassal amlá*, knew the ins and outs of the properties.

Thus was laid the foundation of the landed aristocracy of Bardwán and Hugli. While the sales were going on from quarter to quarter, the Bardwán family got alarmed at the dismemberment of the estate; the Mahárájá Tej Chandra bought in several lots in the names of his *amlá* and dependents.

In 1205, while these compulsory sales were being effected, Rání Bishnu Kumári died. She was an energetic woman and was endowed with a large capacity for business. She might have ultimately succeeded in saving the estate if her life had been prolonged. Mahárájá Tej Chandra resumed the management of the ráj. One of his first acts was to endeavour to arrest the ruin of the ráj by giving away the lands in perpetual leases. These leases created in point of fact *pattanis* before the *pattaní* regulation was enacted. The system gradually extended, and its extension was facilitated by Regulation V. of 1812, removing the restrictions on the maximum period of *ijárá*s for ten years, and affirming the right of *zamíndárs* to let out lands for any term of years. In 1825 there was scarcely any land under *khás* management. Nearly the entire estate, except Bánkurá or West Bardwán, was let out in *pattaní*. Bánkurá being jungle mahal was not considered susceptible of cultivation. The Mahárájá tempted his *amlá* and others to take in *pattanis* for a song. The *pattanídárs* let out their *táluks*

to darpattanídárs; the darpattanídárs, in like manner, let them out to sepattanídárs; and the latter to chaharam-pattanídárs.

The Mahárájá used to let out in *pattanís* in auctions held in his *sadr kachárf*. Regular account sales were executed. In cases of arrears the *pattanís* were sold in *kachárf*, by which process as much was recovered as could be had. These transactions were sometimes recognised and confirmed, and sometimes ignored and set aside by the revenue authorities. Great irregularities and confusion ensued, and loss to both parties was the inevitable consequence.

At last the idea of legalising *pattanís* dawned on the mind of Rádhágovinda Rái, the Díwán of the ráj. It was approved by the Mahárájá Tej Chandra and his son Pratáp Chandra. The latter came down to Calcutta and suggested it to the Board. The Board at once recognised the propriety and feasibility of the plan; and under instructions from the Government deputed Mr. H. T. Prinsep to Bardwán to consult with the Mahárájá with a view to frame a law for facilitating the letting out into *pattanís*, and selling the same. Mr. Prinsep came to Bardwán and remained there two weeks. The result of his inquiries was the celebrated Regulation VIII. of 1819. It was passed on the 3rd September 1819, corresponding to the 19th Bhádra 1226, declaring *pattaní* tenures valid, transferable, and answerable for debt.

"The tenures known by the name of putnee talooks, as described in the preamble to this Regulation, shall be deemed to be valid tenures in perpetuity, according to the terms of the engagement under which they are held. They are heritable by their conditions; and it is hereby further declared, that they are capable of being transferred by sale, gift, or otherwise, at the discretion of the holder as well as answerable for his personal debts, and subject to the process of the Courts of Judicature in the same manner as other real property."

Pattaní táluكدárs were also vested with the right of letting out their táluكدs in any manner they might deem most conducive to their interest, and the engagements so entered into by them were declared legal and binding.

This law proved an inestimable boon to the táluكدárs; and was the salvation of the Bardwán ráj. Although, under careful *khás* management, the ráj might have reaped a larger profit than it does now; yet judging from the analogy of other large estates, like those of Nátor and Naddea, and the circumstances incidental to landed property in this country, it could not have been otherwise perpetuated.

It is supposed that if the *pattaní* system had not prevailed, the income of the ráj would have soon risen to 60 lakhs per annum; but it must be remembered that the *sadr jamá* of the Nátor ráj was above 52 lakhs. But how has *khás* management operated? It has



## 182 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

reduced the family to nothing. It is now divided into two branches—the elder and the younger—the *bara* and the *chhota tarafs*; and the former branch has only an income of two lákhs per annum.

As Hugli forms an integral part of the ráj, a few particulars regarding its past condition may not be uninteresting.

Soon after the establishment of the British supremacy, there were in Hugli a magistrate, a judge, and a customs collector; yet in point of fact that district formed part and parcel of Bardwán. It was fiscally dependent on Bardwán. All the revenues derived from Hugli were paid direct to the Collector of Bardwán, there being only an assistant collector to take charge of the rents of small *amfúdárs* before transmission to Bardwán. There was a small number of *málguzardárs* in parganáas Arsun, Puran, and Boroa who formerly paid their rents to the Collector of Krishnagar; but the payment was transferred to the Collector of Bardwán. The large estate of Dárbásiní, which formerly belonged to a Mughul zamindár, was also transferred within the local limits of Bardwán.

The district was divided into 18 *thánás*; each of which embraced a large area, was situated at a long distance from the *sadr* station, and was superintended by a *dárogá*, who was virtually irresponsible and exercised absolute authority. A *dárogá* of Jahánábád was in the habit of instigating dacoity, for the purpose of filling his pockets and earning a good name as a detective officer. Having a secret understanding with the dacoits, he first led them to perpetrate the robbery and then took down the confessions of a few of them. He *challáned* these men to the Magistrate with their confessions and with some brass utensils and old clothes—himself appropriating the lion's share, consisting of jewels and other valuable articles. A portion, however, of the *dárogá's* gains went to the support of the families of those dacoits who had confessed. When batch after batch of such dacoits were forwarded to the Magistrate, and when they repeated their confessions and were convicted and punished by the Sessions Judge, the admiration of the committing officer for the detective capacity of the *dárogá* knew no bounds. *Dárogáji* received *Neknámi* parwanás, and his valuable services were brought to the notice of the Superintendent of Police. The office of a *dárogá* was generally sold to the highest bidder by the *Sarishtádár* and other *Ẓadr Amlá*, sometimes as much as Rs. 10,000 being paid by the successful candidate for *dárogášhip*. The *Dárogás* recouped themselves by levying a subscription called *Agámaní* from among the Mandals and *Gomášhtás*. The officer who succeeded in a great measure in removing these abuses was Mr. D. C. Smith. He was appointed Assistant Magistrate of Hugli in 1820, and rose to the office of Judge and Magistrate in 1826. He was an energetic and honest officer, who directed his best exertions to the task of

improving the district. He built the jail and *kacháris* from the materials of the old fort, of which particular mention will be made hereafter. Mr. Smith also built the *pakka ghát* called after his name. Being a cosmopolitan in religion, he rebuilt the mosque called "Say-yid Pír's Asthana." He planted lines of trees before the *kacháris*, and also excavated a tank on the spot. He also re-excavated the old tanks, and constructed several *pakka* roads. He, in fact, converted Hugli from an old third-rate into a model town. In his early days Mr. Smith was imbued with certain prejudices against the zamíndárs. In his cold-weather tours he proclaimed by beat of "tomtom," that all proprietors of land and houses should produce their pattás for his examination and confirmation. This proceeding was quite illegal and arbitrary, and was a source of great oppression to zamíndárs. It was, therefore, quashed by the Provincial court on appeal. Mr. Smith afterwards became the firm friend of the zamíndárs, settling their family disputes in an amicable way, and thereby preventing endless litigation. He became the "má-báp"—the earthly providence of the district. His decisions, although not in exact conformity with the requirements of technical law, were calculated to render substantial justice. Dacoity having increased in his time, Mr. Smith established *ghátis* and *pháris* or police sub-stations, supplying the *ghátidárs* and *pháridárs* with spears and masháls. The *badmáshes* of the village were locked up in the sub-stations at night. The *gomáshás* and *mandals* were enjoined to keep the watch. Mr. Smith dealt sharply and severely with the dacoits. He was not squeamish in taking down their confessions; and, it must be confessed, did not hesitate to stretch a point to ensure their conviction. If he had lived in the days when Mr. Theobald raised a cry against confession by intimidation and other coercive means, Mr. Smith's success as a police functionary would have been very problematical. But he thoroughly knew the state of the country in his time, and he was then the right man in the right place. During the administration of Mr. Smith, the Dutch Settlement of Chinsurah was purchased by the English for 10 lákhs of rupees. The transaction was conducted by two Commissioners, *viz.*, Governor Overlong, on the part of the Dutch, and Mr. Smith on the part of the English. It was completed in 1822.

In 1833, Sir (then Mr.) Frederick James Halliday, succeeded Mr. Smith as Officiating Judge and Magistrate. Finding dacoity very rife in the suburbs of the town, he got half-a-dozen soldiers from the Chinsurah depôt, and used to patrol with them at night, but he did not succeed in putting down dacoity.

About this time the offices of judge and magistrate were separated; Mr. Brownlow was appointed magistrate, and Mr. Barlow Judge of Hugli.

## 184 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

In 1820 the separate revenue collectorate of Hugli was created, and Mr. Saunders was appointed the first collector. He was succeeded by Mr. W. H. Belli who remained in office for more than twenty years. Records, Tahut papers, &c., were brought in 1827 from the Bardwán Collectorate. Proprietors of zamindáris purchased from the Bardwán ráj, commenced paying revenue to the Hugli Collector. Thus was Hugli sundered from Bardwán and formed into a separate district.

The cyclical changes in the Bardwán ráj have been something marvellous. It has suffered and benefited from alternate inundation and drought, as well as from seasonable rains. For instance, for twenty years, from 1190 to 1210, B.E., it suffered from heavy rain and no rains. All classes, from the rayat to the táluk-dár, were great losers. Then from 1211 to 1230 the calamity ceased, and the value of land increased manifold. The pattaní táluks sold for twenty to thirty times their annual income. Again, in 1230 there was a great inundation, still known as *the* inundation of "'80." At Bardwán it commenced on the night of the 26th September, 1823. Incalculable mischief was caused by the bursting of the bándhs of the Dámodar, Hugli, and minor streams. A correspondent of the *Calcutta Monthly Journal* thus describes the inundation—"Picture to yourself a flat country, *completely* under water running with a force apparently irresistible and carrying with it dead bodies, choppers of houses, palankeens and wreck of every description." It lasted for three days; communication was cut off, and the owners of *pakka* houses took refuge on the roofs. For many *kos* the thatched and mud houses, as well as hundreds and thousands of trees were prostrated. Such trees as had withstood the ravages of the flood, formed the resting-places of men. The area embraced by the flood commenced from Báli, and extended twenty-five miles. The villages situated on the west, as well as on the east bank of the Hugli, especially the former, were submerged. The height of water in these villages was at first about three feet; they were navigable by boats during the continuance of the flood. On the 29th September, a boat which had started across the country from Calcutta, and gone all the way full sail, arrived at Bardwán. A budgerow striking against a buoy instantly foundered and every soul on board perished. The loss of life was immense. The inundation rose; and at its height, on the 2nd October, the water was about seven feet. The crops were destroyed by the water; the houses were submerged, and ultimately carried away by the flood; the people were foodless, insomuch that parents sold their offspring for a mouthful of rice. The landmarks, distinguishing the *jots* of the rayats, being swept away, gave rise to great confusion and endless litigation. The owners of properties were converted into claimants for land

which had been in their possession and that of their forefathers for generations. The land-holding and the agricultural community were overtaken, so to speak, by a cataclysm.

In 1840 there was a salt inundation from which Mandalghāt and the southern part of Hugli were covered with saline matter. Land again deteriorated and sold for a song. Between 1240. and 1250, no less than two hundred *pattān* tāluks, and a hundred zamindāris changed hands.

The soil of Bardwán proper is high and dry ; and the rainfall is smaller than in Hugli, which is more fertile in certain products than the former. A bighā in Hugli produces fifteen maunds of rice, whereas a bighā in Bardwán produces ten maunds. The annual rent per bighā of rice-producing land in Hugli is three rupees ; whereas in Bardwán it is two rupees.

In this rāj a rayat's holding would be considered very large if it were to consist of more than 100 bighās, and very small if it were to consist of less than 10 bighās. There are, however, some rayats who hold more than 100 bighās ; and, on the other hand, several who hold one or two bighās only. Although the latter are called rayats, they earn their livelihood, generally, by acting as *kurfā prajās* or day-labourers, or by working as *krishāns*. A rayat, whose family consists of four or five persons, gains a comfortable living if he has a holding of 15 bighās. One pair of oxen usually cultivates 15 bighās of land ; but a pair of superior oxen cultivates from 20 to 22 bighās. A rayat with a holding of 15 bighās is rather poorer than a respectable retail shopkeeper ; and his holding does not enable him to live so well as an income of Rs. 8 a month would. It may be questioned whether steam-ploughs would answer in this country. They penetrate deep, and turn up sub-soils which would not be adapted to at least rice, the staple product. The poorer rayats are generally in debt : in most cases the debt is contracted for the cost of cultivation, and liquidated within the year after the harvest is reaped. The interest charged by the mahājans is often heavy.

By far the largest number of rayats have acquired rights of occupancy under Act X. of 1859 ; not less than 80 per cent. of the rayats of this rāj have rights of occupancy. This argues a state of society different from what exists in several countries in Europe ; notably in England, where a tenant after 50 years of occupancy is liable to be ousted. Before the passing of Act X. of 1859, scarcely one per cent of the rayats had their tenures protected from enhancement of rent ; but after the passing of that Act the Courts have declared in about 20 per cent. of the cases that have been determined, after a contested judicial investigation, that the tenures were protected from enhancement. There are thousands of tenures the legal status of which has not yet been determined, and will not be determined unless one of the interested parties seek for a

## 186 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

decision in a Court of Justice. In the present state of things, it might be fairly estimated that about 4 per cent. of the rayats have succeeded in having their tenures declared protected from enhancement. The only class of proprietors who have no zamíndárs above them, are the lákhrájdárs or the holders of rent-free lands; most of these rent-free tenures were bestowed by the Mahárájas on meritorious Bráhmans. One-fourth of the cultivated area of this ráj is owned by numerous lákhrájdárs under valid and invalid grants; and, in several cases, under no grants at all. The quantity of land in the possession of each lákhrájdár varies from 1 bighá to 200 bighás and upwards. In the case of small and poor lákhrájdárs, they own, occupy and cultivate their own hereditary lands; and there are more than 400 of such persons in the district; but the rayats have either let their lands, or they cultivate them by hired labour. An income of Rs. 10 a month would enable a rayat to support comfortably a household of moderate size.

There is not much spare land in this ráj. During the last few years large quantities of land have been out of cultivation here and there on account of the heavy mortality among the rayats by the epidemic fever; but these lands, if in a village, are disposed of and rented as soon as the condition of the village improves. There is no tenure similar to utbandí or jamai tenure here. The tenures in this ráj are favourable to cultivators, inasmuch as the majority of the tenants have rights of occupancy. The following are the tenures between the zamíndár and the actual cultivator:—

**Pattaní** ... Permanent and fixed proprietary tenure, the rent of which is payable to the zamíndár.

**Darpattaní** ... Do. do., the rent of which is payable to the pattanídár.

**Sepattaní** ... Do. do., the rent of which is payable to the darpattanídár.

**Mukarrarí Ijára.** Permanent and fixed proprietary tenure, the rent of which is payable to the zamíndár, pattanídár, darpattanídár and sepattanídár, by whom the tenure was created; but the rent of which is not realisable in the summary way in which the rent of pattanís, darpattanís and sepattanís can be realised under Reg. VIII. of 1819.

**Miádi Ijára** ... Proprietary lease for a limited time.

**Mukarrarí tenure.** Hereditary and fixed rayatí tenure.

**Maurúsí tenure...** Hereditary rayatí tenure.

**Occupancy tenure.** This tenure is a creation of Act X. of 1859. The right has attached itself by the Act to all the tenants-at-will who have been in possession of their tenures for more than 12 years without

any express written agreements. Formerly, with the exception of mukarrarí and maurúsí tenants, only khúdkásht tenants, *i.e.*, those who cultivated the lands of the village in which they lived, had occupancy rights; while all páikásht tenants were tenants-at-will.

Thiká tenure ... Tenancy-at-will.

Kurfá tenure ... Sub-rayatí tenure.

The following are the different varieties of land in this ráj, with their rates of rent:—

*Present rate of rent per bighá.*

Bástu :	Homestead land	...	Rs.	10	0	0
Udbástu :	Land around the homestead	...	..	7	8	0
Bázár :	Market land	...	..	16 to 50	0	0
Bágán :	Garden land	...	..	5 to 8	0	0
Pukur :	Ponds, tanks	...	..	2 to 5	0	0

The agricultural lands are divided into two grand classes—the soná and the sálí. Aus paddy, potatoes, pulse, mustard, sesame and sugarcane are cultivated on soná or dāngá lands, while áman or haimantik paddy, bora paddy, and jute are cultivated in sálí lands. These lands are sub-divided into four classes with reference to their qualities. These sub-divisions with their average rate of rent at three different times are stated below.—

	Present rate of rent.	Rate of rent 20 years ago.	At about the time of the Permanent Settlement.
Soná Awwal, <i>i.e.</i> , 1st class Soná	Rs. 4 to 6 0 0	Rs. 2 8 0	Rs. 1 0 0
Soná Doem, <i>i.e.</i> , 2nd class Soná	„ 3 0 0	„ 2 0 0	„ 0 12 0
Soná Soem, <i>i.e.</i> , 3rd class Soná	„ 2 4 0	„ 1 8 0	„ 0 8 0
Soná Chahram, <i>i.e.</i> , 4th class Soná	„ 1 12 0	„ 1 0 0	„ 0 6 0
Sálí Awwal, <i>i.e.</i> , 1st class Sálí	„ 4 0 0	„ 2 8 0	„ 1 0 0
Sálí Doem, <i>i.e.</i> , 2nd class Sálí	„ 3 0 0	„ 2 0 0	„ 0 12 0
Sálí Soem, <i>i.e.</i> , 3rd class Sálí	„ 2 0 0	„ 1 8 0	„ 0 8 0
Sálí Chahram, <i>i.e.</i> , 4th class Sálí	„ 1 8 0	„ 1 0 0	„ 0 6 0
Mulberry and Tobacco lands	„ 6 to 10 0 0	...	...
Sugarcane lands	„ 4 to 8 0 0	...	...

# 188 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

Except in soils newly brought under cultivation, manure is not generally used for the cultivation of paddy; but it is largely used on these estates for the cultivation of potatoe, sugarcane, mustard, pulse, &c. Cow-dung, earth from the bottom of tanks, and ashes are used as manure for rice fields, and castor-seed cakes are used for manuring potatoe and sugarcane lands. The quality of manure required for a bighá of land and the cost incurred for it as well as the different kinds of manure are given below.—

	Quantity required for manuring one bighá.	Cost incurred for manuring one bighá.	
Cowdung ..	5 to 6 mds. ...	8 annas ...	Every 2nd year
Ashes ..	1 to 5 " ...	10 " ...	Every 3rd "
Earth taken from old mud walls	10 " ...	4½ " ...	ditto
Pank.—The putrid vegetable sediment deposited in ponds	16 " ...	4½ " ...	ditto
Castor-seed cakes	3 " ...	Rs. 3-8 ...	Every crop.
Mustard-seed cakes	3 " ...	" 3-0 ...	ditto

Potatoe and sugarcane crops are commonly irrigated here. In fact without irrigation these crops do not grow; mustard and brinjáls also require irrigation, and paddy and other crops are irrigated only when there is a scanty fall of rain. There are no irrigation wells here as in the Upper Provinces; and the water required is taken from the nearest khál, river, nalá, or dobá. The cost of labour for irrigating a bighá of paddy land is from nine to ten annas, and for sugarcane land usually six rupees. Where water is to be bought for irrigation, an additional cost of four annas per bighá for rice land and of one rupee per bighá for sugarcane land is incurred. The husbandmen fully understand the advantages of leaving lands fallow, and of rotation of crops. On these estates lands are not left fallow for a whole year or two, as in some of the other districts; all that is done is that, after the aus paddy crop has been reaped, the lands are left fallow for six months, in order that they may produce a good crop of potatoes. As to rotation of crops, the cultivation of potatoes is alternated with that of sugarcane and flax; and the cultivation of the aus paddy with that of potatoes, pulses, mustard, and barley. In years of drought the husbandmen buy water from those of their neighbours who have tanks near their fields; and also draw water from kháls and rivers where there are any. The zamíndárs also allow them to irrigate their fields from the tanks which they hold khás. These, however, do very little good, owing to the absence of a sufficient number of canals and tanks; and also owing to the heavy cost of labour for

irrigation, and to the rude means for drawing water which prevail in the mufassal. Much good would be done to the district if it were to be intersected with a sufficient number of artificial water-courses. These would not only improve the sanitation of the district by draining it, but also place within the reach of the cultivators a resource on which they might fall back in years of drought.

We have entered into these details because we believe that land, its cultivation and the revenue derived therefrom and the legislation connected with it, constitute the most important element of material well-being in this country.

Although Bardwán, and Hugli are essentially agricultural districts, yet manufactures have largely been, and still are to some extent, carried on. Mr. Holwell in his tract names as the principal towns of the ráj, *Burdwan, Kirpoy, Radnagore Dewangunge and Bullipughur*; and adds "these used to supply the East India Companies with the following sort-ments of piece goods, viz. dooreas, terrandum, toosies, soot-romals, gueras, sesters-ags, tanton rupees, cheridreics, chilys, custas and dosoota; the capital Burdwan may be properly called the centre of the trade of the provinces, in tranquil times this place affords an annual large vend for the valuable staples of lead, copper, broadcloth, tin, pepper and tootanaque. The *Porbiah* merchants from *Delhy* and *Agra* resorted yearly to this great mart and would again if peace was established in the country:—they purchased the above staples either with money or in barter for opium, tincal, salt-petre and horses." The principal centres of commerce and manufactures are now Chandrakoná, Khirpái, Kálná, Chanderuagar, and Baidyabátí. In Kátwá, Rámjíbaupur, Dipaidarhátá, Ghat-tál, Bhadreswar, and Chandrakoná, dhotis and chadars were at one time largely manufactured; but the famine of 1867 decimated the population of that part and almost put a stop to the manufacture. Those whom the famine had spared, migrated to Calcutta, and were fed in *Annachhutras*. Khirpái was likewise the seat of the manufacture of cotton fabrics: the manufacture was formerly a Government monopoly, and was superintended by a resident and a díwán. Rámjíbaupur is noted for brass utensils. Dipaidarhátá was the seat for silk filaments. Gbátál was, and still is, the centre of an extensive trade in salt, and is also the seat of the manufacture of silk filaments. Bhadreswar is one of the largest marts in the country. Chanderuagar is another mart. Baidyabátí is a great emporium for vegetables.

Besides the abovementioned places, the following may be mentioned:—

Bainchi	...	is noted for brass works.
Manoharpur	...	" silk filaments.



## 190 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

Kolm	...	
Rájbalhát	...	} ... are noted for cotton fabrics.
Mayápur	...	
Begampur	...	
Krishnapur	...	
Uttarpára	...	} ... „ „ jute and hemp rope.
Konnagar	...	
Bandipur	...	} ... „ „ mats and baskets.
Serámpur	...	
Sukhandiyá	...	} is noted for pottery, prized for its durability and gracefulness; and fruits and vegetables supplied to the Baidyabátí market.

Raw sugar, indigo, and raw silk are extensively exported to the Calcutta markets; and thence to Europe. In the absence of official returns or any reliable statistics we cannot give any authentic account of the quantity; but from the several enquiries we have made, we are led to think that the value of sugar alone amounts to nearly a crore annually.

The distillation of rum from molasses is rapidly increasing from the great demand in the English market; but formerly only one distillery existed, and that at Bandel. Now there are several distilleries, the principal one being in the heart of the city of Bardwán.

A majority of the manufacturers carry on their business with their own or borrowed money, and on their own account. There are, however, several capitalists who invest money in different manufactories, and take upon themselves the risk of business as they enjoy its profits. The social condition of the manufacturers, like that of the rayats, varies with the extent of their business. In the majority of cases, where the manufacturer wants to borrow money to carry on business, the money-lender, instead of advancing money, buys on his own account the raw materials for manufacture and gives them to the manufacturer. He thus acquires a lien on the manufactured articles, and not unfrequently, he finds out customers for the same; and as soon as the articles are sold he gets back the money advanced, with interest which varies from 25 to 36 per cent.

There is another class of manufacturers on a small scale who have since died out in this part of the country. Formerly the women of the poorer classes of Bráhmans, as well as of well-to-do artisans and manufacturers, spun a very fine description of silk and cotton thread; which was sold to the weavers of Dhoniákháli and other places for the manufacture of "dhotis" and "sáris." These dhotis and sáris weighed usually no more than three or four tolahs each, and were very much valued by the wealthy Hindús.

The chief articles of trade are rice, silk, indigo, jute, hemp, cotton, filaries, potatoes, molasses, and culinary vegetables. The only occasions on which trade is carried on by means of religious festivals in this ráj are the *Dol Játrá* in the Bengálí month of Chaitra, and the *Rás Játrá* in Kártik at Mahesh and Ballabhpur near Serámpur, and Tárkeswar. The trade is otherwise carried on by permanent markets.

Whenever accumulations of capital exceed Rs. 10,000 or 15,000, it is generally invested in landed property by those who have no such property. This statement would apply to more than ninety cases out of a hundred. Owners of capital who cannot boast of any large amount, and a few of those who come under the former class, invest the money in Government Securities or lend it to others. Money is never hoarded in this part of the country, under ordinary circumstances: In small transactions, when some article is pawned, the rate of interest varies, according as the condition of the borrower is solvent or otherwise, *i.e.*, according as the risk of recovery is small or great, from 12 to 24 per cent. per annum. In large transactions, when there is a mortgage of moveable property, the rate is usually 12 per cent. per annum. In large transactions where lands or houses are mortgaged, the rate varies from 9 to 12 per cent. The rate on petty agricultural advances is from 18 to 25 per cent. per annum; and the same rate of interest obtains when there is a lien on the crops. If a person buys an estate paying revenue to Government, there would be a fair return for his money, if the purchase-money does not exceed 16 times the existing net profits of the estate. There are no banking establishments; nor are the shopkeepers, the persons who usually lend money. It is the small capitalists, and, in several cases, the landholders themselves that chiefly lend money to the rayats, manufacturers, and others. Banks or branch banks in mufassal towns are a desideratum.

A few deer and wild hogs are to be found in Chandrakona. Elephants, tigers, wolves, and buffaloes are not indigenous, though now and then met with; but Báukurá or West Bardwán abounds with game.

The ráj consists of estates lying in Bardwán, Hugli, Calcutta, Krishnagar, Báukurá, Midnapur, Cattack, Bírbbhúm, Murshidabad, Dinájpur, and Dárljiling. They extend over hundreds of square miles; and such of them as are revenue-paying bring to the Government an annual income of nearly thirty-one lákhs and a half.

The Bardwán ráj has always been famous for charity, but it was not invariably a discriminating charity. Money used to be lavished on nautches, poojahs, shrads and ceremonies. Maharájá Tej Chandra was the first to realise the true nature and uses of charity. He opened out, at an immense cost, the road from Bardwán to

Kálná, extending over thirty miles. He also bore the whole expense of building the bridge at Magrá, about five miles to the north of Hugli; and made several improvements in the town of Bardwán and other places. He excavated tanks and established asylums and schools.

The Mahárájá had a son, Pratáp Chandra, whose name has already been mentioned in connection with the enactment of the *pattaní* regulation; but he died during the life-time of his father. Several years after that event, a pretender appeared claiming the ráj, but his claim, after a searching investigation, was dismissed by the Civil Court; several persons of the highest respectability, such as Bábu Dwáráká Náth Tagor, Dr. Wise, and others, who had been subpoenaed to identify him, swore to his being an impostor. The case created great sensation; and involved a far larger amount than the Tichborne trial.

In the year A.D. 832, Mahárájá Dhiráj Tej Chandra Bahádur died, leaving to his adopted son, the present Mahárájá, the colossal wealth, both landed and funded which had been amassed. On the latter succeeding to the ráj, in A.D. 1833 the English Government honoured him with a *khilát* in due form. He has proved a most enlightened representative of the landed aristocracy of the most enlightened province.

One of the first acts of the present Mahárájá was the establishment of a free Anglo-Vernacular school in Bardwán, where five hundred boys gather daily to receive the benefits of English and Bengáli education. It is a first-class institution and is efficiently conducted by an instructive staff of educated Hindús. The Mahárájá has also established hospitals and dispensaries for the sick poor of Bardwán and Kálná. These institutions, as well as the other charities established and maintained by the Mahárájá, attest his benevolence, and afford an example of enlightened liberality which should be emulated by other zamíndárs.

During the Santál Rebellion in 1855, the Mahárájá aided the military authorities in forwarding and supplying stores and means of transport. He also kept a line of communication by sawárs.

During the more important and terrible outbreak of the Sepoy Army in 1857, the Mahárájá did everything in his power to strengthen the hands of Government and to give every aid that was considered necessary; he placed elephants and bullock-carts at the disposal of the authorities, kept the roads between Bardwán and Bírbbhúm, and Bardwán and Kátwá open; so that there was no interruption of intelligence between the seat of Government and the anxiously-watched stations of Bírbbhúm and Barhampur; he entertained a guard of European sailors for the defence of the town of Bardwán. He supplied firearms for the use of all European residents in that station; and set apart a por-

tion of the Rájbañi for the accommodation of European residents in case of an outbreak.

These services were acknowledged not only by the local authorities, but also by the Government of India, as well as that of England. The following is an extract from Mr. Commissioner G. H. Young's letter to the Government of Bengal, dated Bardwán, the 2nd February, 1860 :—

“ I have myself seen and known, and my predecessors have also observed, the ready and willing co-operation which the Mahárájá has invariably, when called upon, given to the Government during the Santál insurrection. He did everything in his power to forward the troops, to give them supplies and carriage, and to keep up a constant and speedy communication for us. During the Mutiny I believe his heart was thoroughly with us. He did willingly and effectively all that was required of him ; and would have done much more, I am satisfied, if it had been necessary. The Mahárájá, I need not tell His Honour, has large estates and a large revenue, and I believe him to be a very good landlord. For so extensive a proprietor he is seldom in the courts, and gives the officers of Government no trouble.”

Believing all direct taxation to be opposed to the genius of the people, we have deprecated the income-tax from its inception by Mr. Wilson, when there was a great deal in the circumstances of the country to justify it, down to the time of its re-imposition by Sir Richard Temple, when there is nothing to justify it. That the income-tax has proved a prolific source of terrible oppression, does not admit of a moment's question ; but the Mahárájá, like several other enlightened zamíndárs and merchants, thought that the exceptional circumstances engendered by the Sepoy Mutiny fully justified Mr. Wilson in imposing the income-tax. He therefore gave his support to the Finance Minister. On this, the Council passed a Resolution, dated 4th May 1860, conveying their special thanks to the Mahárájá. The Council said,—“ This expression of sentiment supported by true and correct reasons, is entirely consistent with the Mahárájá's well-known character for loyalty and fidelity, and proves that he properly comprehends the actual situation of affairs.”

In 1864, the Mahárájá was appointed an Additional Member of the Viceroy's Council for making laws ; being the first native gentleman of Bengal who was so honoured. He continued in the office for three years.

During the Great Famine of 1867, the Mahárájá established large Annachhatras ; where he fed daily about 1,500 souls—men, women, and children. He dispensed to them rice, dál, vegetables, and fish ; and he also provided milk for the babies. When better times arrived, and the paupers thought of returning home, they

were each supplied with a piece of wearing apparel and money sufficient to defray their travelling expenses.

During the epidemic the Mahārājā contributed fifty thousand rupees for the relief of the fever-stricken population of the rāj. The Mahārājā, owing to the bulk of his estates being let out in *pattant*, is not often brought into intimate and familiar contact with the rayats; but he nevertheless has a large influence over the destinies of a great number of the agricultural population and of the superior under-tenureholders. We are glad to be able to add that, in public repute, the testimony of the local authorities as to the paternal care of the Mahārājā for the interests and well-being of all who are in any way dependent on him, is more than deserved; and the records of the Courts show that the number of cases instituted by him for the recovery of his rights, is singularly small when compared with the magnitude of the estate. It is only fair to conclude that we have here one of those cases where both landlord and tenants appreciate the great truth that their interests are really identical; and from this happy state of affairs must always flow the same results—contentment and a certain amount of prosperity on the part of the rayats—increased resources and a pleasant consciousness of having deserved well of their country, on the part of the zamíndár.

---

## ART. II.—CHILDREN'S STORIES FOR GROWN-UP PEOPLE.

- 1.—*Misunderstood*. By Florence Montgomery. Sixth thousand. 1871.
- 2.—*The Fight at Dame Europa's School*.
- 3.—*Nonsense Songs, Stories, Botany and Alphabets*. By Edward Lear. 1871.

WHAT peculiar charm is it which accounts for the fascination exercised over all classes of minds by books such as those whose titles are at the head of this 'page, and for the sale by thousands of such simple literary delicacies—children's stories for the diversion not at all of the children to whom they seem to be addressed, but of grown men and women? Is it only, in one case, a reaction of taste from the richer diet of sensation novels; and, in another, the attractive force of allegory? Is it the delight of living over again in the luxury of children's nonsense, of following the abandoned flights of the child's imagination, such as are impossible to the maturer mind; or is there more in it than this? Why should the mere fact of its being clothed in this simple garb render so attractive to readers of every class, a very general and common-place view of the motives and feelings of the actors in the terrible drama which was played last year on the green boards of Europe, or a series of nonsense songs and nursery stories? Why should they appeal with such irresistible force to a thousand cultivated minds far more than to the childish ones for which they would at first sight appear to have been written? It may not be waste of time to trace some of the causes of this influence, and to examine some of the peculiar attractions of this beautiful bye-path of literature. Of the works which we have selected, all seem to have this in common, that the influence which they exercise is derived not from any intrinsic value in the 'moral' which they convey, not from startling incident or intricate plot, but mainly, if not solely, from the form into which they are thrown, from the fact that they reflect the innocent mood of childhood and are enveloped in its lisping language. And for our purpose perhaps, no better type could be taken than the choice sample of the class which is placed first on our list. A work of this exceptional nature seems to call for a combination of special qualities in its author which is sufficiently rare. It is not only the creative power of the writer of fiction, nor only a pure style and simple diction, which are required: there must be a real insight into one of the subtlest and most mysterious

## 196 *Children's Stories for Grown-up People.*

phases of character, when, unformed though it is, the mind seems in many ways nearer than ever after to perfection ; more than at any other time, till the moment of death, in accord with the unknown and unseen, and with all its attributes fresher from the pure fountains which are their source. And with this insight must be united a vigorous imagination, capable of comparing constantly each unfolding phase of the young character with the same in its after-development ; a sense of humour too, to relish the supremely ludicrous situations which present themselves in child-life, without depreciating their reality. But more than all and rarer than all, the writer must have retained to mature years much of the child's real nature, a loving adherence to the simple affections of that beautiful age.

"Misunderstood" is a plain story of two curly-headed English boys of seven and four years old. There is no wandering for effect outside the simple occurrences of the simplest form of everyday life, no high romance, no excitement of scenes where the larger interests of life are at stake ; and yet we venture to say that to a really cultivated mind no sensation novel ever appealed more powerfully than this tale of two children. It is a story of such simple and yet tragic pathos, that men will not let their sensitive wives read it, and men of no weak sentiment are not ashamed to shed tears over it themselves.

It is indeed professedly not a child's story. A child could no more understand the deep feeling which breathes through it than the plough-boy on the Yorkshire wolds can see anything to wonder at in the boundless circle of earth and sky and sea by which he is surrounded, poetry in the clods which his plough turns up, or history in fossil fern or Roman blade. And as no child could understand, so we question whether any man could have written such a story, the charm of which is heightened by its being the powerful expression of a purely feminine view of a child's character, tinged throughout with that refined and tenderest sympathy for children which is given only to women. Florence Montgomery (she does not allow us to call her anything else) is not the first person who has read the mind of a child like a book and written it out for all to read. The thoughts which pass through David Copperfield's childish brain in church are as natural as those ascribed to little Humphrey Duncombe in the same situation, in the tale before us ; but the authoress of "Misunderstood" has thought it worthwhile to concentrate her not insignificant powers on the full delineation of a phase of character which Dickens from time to time depicts with a more masculine touch, with more, as we think, of artificial sentiment, and therefore with less force. She has here brought out into relief all the points of a child's character which are most winning to us all, and yet

which few would have either the insight to detect or the power to delineate. Hence her work has the value of a poem, and she proves herself a genuine artist in that she is able to give expression to some of the exhaustless modifications of human feeling; deep and familiar to all, but without the magic touch of art speechless.

And in tracing these, she has not failed to recognise and value the reality and intensity of the feelings which she depicts—a depth and reality lightly overlooked by most of those in charge of children—or, if noticed, regarded only as the passing effect of the disproportion between the unformed mind and the world on which it acts. But the loves and hatreds of children, transient as they are, are deep and true with the vigour of unmixed and unthwarted feeling; and we know nothing in the after-character to compare with the pure integrity of the feelings which govern the heart of a child: the brave truthfulness, the tender indiscriminating sympathy, the devoted love, the profound and picturesque religious sentiment. Jealousy too, and hatred, and even the bitterness of despair find their place in a life in which a mushroom or a butterfly is an absorbing interest, and solitude the most haunting dread.

Without robbing the story of its charm by offering a bare analysis of its simple plot, let us follow the delineation of some of the most prominent traits of childish character which are here seized and fixed on the canvass. Before all and embracing all, comes what we call the simplicity of a child, that fearless truthfulness which confers on childhood a more than imperial power; which accepts unhesitatingly what it is told, attributing in its sublime ignorance of the world the same guilelessness to all; which has no reason to question, no need for what in after-life becomes a high virtue—to cavil and doubt and be content with nothing short of demonstration; and which can no more understand irony or sarcasm, those bitter fruits of contact with life, than the innocent palate can relish the artificial stimulus required by the man's vitiated taste.

Sir Everard Duncombe of Wareham Abbey, the father of Humphrey and Miles, is left a widower at the outset of the story. Sitting at dinner one evening with his lost wife's sailor-brother, and with his little boys on each side of him, Sir Everard, who is Member of Parliament for the county, announces that he is going to give a dinner to the 'aborigines,' that is, to his country constituents. The boys are of course all eagerness to know the meaning of such long words; and accept with simple delight uncle Charlie's assurance that 'aborigines' means 'wild men of the woods, half human beings, half animals.' Lightly spoken and as lightly forgotten by the speaker, the words sink deep into the childish minds. For days in the intervals of lessons, and night after night in the



## 198 *Children's Stories for Grown-up People.*

little nursery, nothing is thought or talked of but the coming feast of wild men. The scene which follows is among the best in the book. The evening comes, the guests arrive, and little Humphrey appears on the scene dressed in his best, his eyes sparkling with excitement, "like a being of another sphere." But no wild men are there, no monsters of unknown form and barbarous dress, but only an ordinary party of the "rusty old gentlemen" of the neighbourhood. Words cannot express the horror and amazement of the child: amazement at the total failure of his own confident imagination, and horror at the discovery that his loved and trusted uncle has basely deceived him. And at night the boy is found in tears in his bed at the thought that "Uncle Charlie will go to hell for telling such a dreadful story." Ludicrous the situation may seem to many; to us it is more truly pathetic than many a scene of a more conventionally tragic nature.

Closely allied with and protected by this guileless simplicity, is the deep religious sentiment which is so beautiful in children reared like delicate plants in the sweet atmosphere of an English home; which once implanted never loses its influence; which gives throughout life their unspeakable charm to the distant peal of church bells and the almost unearthly quiet of the English Sunday; the early sentiment checked by no shade of doubt and coloured by the materialism so well detected by Florence Mont gomery. The gates and the palms of Heaven are as much realities to such a child as the equally unknown, but equally accepted, wonders of the tropical world. And here it is that the simplest eloquence of the village pulpit reaps its unknown reward, and never fails to reach even beyond its aim. Men may nod over the well-worn platitudes; but the preacher need never complain while his words are able to bend with an almost supernatural power the youngest and purest heart in his flock, and the high-spirited boy, full of mischief and brimful of vigorous life, is mute and thoughtful as he listens to the story of the white-robed ones and the Jasper sea, "ten thousand times ten thousand, and thousands of thousands."

We have heard it remarked how cheerful people look as they leave the church-door on a Sunday as if released from a weary duty; but would it not often be a more truthful interpretation which is given here? "Softly blew the summer breezes on little Humphrey's face as he stepped out into the porch, and the calm beauty of the summer morning was in perfect harmony with the turn which the sermon had given to his thoughts. All around was the beautifully wooded country, lying calm and still under the cloudless sky." Perhaps if his vague ideas could have taken shape, they would have formed themselves into some such expression as—"Can heaven be fairer than this?"

How unalloyed, again how transcendently innocent and undiscriminating, are the love and sympathy of children! No red republican is a more resolute leveller of all class distinctions. We must indulge ourselves here with one quotation at some length which speaks for itself in illustration of this trait of early character. It is at the same dinner at which the wild men were first mentioned:—

"Uncle Charlie was enjoying his soup and Sir Everard dividing himself between his little boys and his meal.

"It's William's birthday to-day," said Humphrey, breaking silence. The unfortunate individual in white silk stockings, thus suddenly brought into public notice, reddened to the roots of his hair; and in his confusion nearly dropped the dish he was in the act of putting down before his master. "He's twenty-two years old to-day," continued Humphrey; "he told me so this morning. Sir Everard tried to evince a proper amount of interest in so important an announcement. 'What o'clock were you born, William?' pursued Humphrey, addressing the shy young footman at the sideboard, where he had retreated with the dish-cover, and from whence he was making all sorts of signs to his tormentor, in the vain hope of putting an end to the conversation. Sir Everard hastily held out a bit of turbot on the end of his fork and effectually stopped the boy's mouth for a few minutes; but no sooner had he swallowed it than he broke out again. 'What are you going to give William for his birthday-present, father?' he said, putting his arms on the table and resting his chin upon them, that he might the more conveniently look up into his father's face and await his answer. Lower and lower bent Uncle Charlie's head over his plate, and his face became alarmingly suffused with colour. 'I know what he'd like,' finished Humphrey, 'for he's told me!'

"The unhappy footman snatched up a dish-cover and began a retreat to the door; but the inexorable butler handed him the lobster sauce, and he was obliged to advance with it to his master's side. 'I said to him to-day,' proceeded Humphrey, in all the conscious glory of being in William's confidence, 'if father were to give you a birthday-present, what would you like? You remember, don't you, William? and then he told me, didn't you, William?' The direct form of attack was more than flesh and blood could stand. William made a rush to the door with the half-filled tray, and, in spite of furious glances from the butler, disappeared just as Uncle Charlie gave it up as a bad job and burst out laughing."

One of the most powerful and least often detected feelings which influence a child's home-life is a deep abiding jealousy, gnawing as that of Othello but untempered by a dream of com-

pensation or even by a consciousness of the nature of the haunting sensation itself: a jealousy which accepts the fancied daily slight as meekly and in as matter-of-fact a way as any other of the strange things that throng around the new comer; for "where everything is so strange, one thing is not much more strange than another";—which hides its bitterness till some chance occasion brings forth its expression, and then it is told only with sorrow, with no hesitation or surprise, not even with a touch of remonstrance against its well-loved and innocent cause: like the stings of insects and the bruises of the play-ground, it has been accepted as what is only natural and right, however hard to bear. "You never take *me* in your arms," says the dying child. "I didn't ever think you would care to come, my little Humphrey." "Oh! but I often should, though only I knew you would rather have him." With all his passionate tears and stormy griefs we question whether any one more nearly than such a child rises to the philosophical attitude with regard to human happiness which is laid down by Froude: "Whether happiness come or not, it is no very weighty matter; if it come, life will be sweet, if it do not come, life will be bitter,—bitter not sweet,—and yet to be borne."

But for intensity of feeling and even dramatic power we hardly knew a more striking picture than that of the motherless child Humphrey with the despair of manhood in his heart, when through his own thoughtlessness his only brother and companion is lying sick—for all he knows, to death—and he himself is meeting only with the neglect he knows he has deserved. It was he who forced the delicate child into an escapade, the wildest that ever suggested itself to his boyish thoughts; and it is for this mad and selfish indulgence that his little brother is struggling with fever, and, as he well knows, with little strength for the struggle. The boy's feelings are the same as those of the strong man when he is baffled and helpless in the wrestle with life, when there seems not one gleam to lighten the black prospect which presses around him, not with dead passive influence, but with active, tormenting, relentless, persecution.

All that was most precious to little Humphrey was taken from him long ago with the mother whom he adored and whose idol he was: and now what he has clung to in her stead, the loving younger brother, whose homage he has accepted so lightly as his due, his faithful and devoted admirer and comrade is passing away too, dying as his mother died before. Only it is worse now, for the blame is all his own; he has struck the blow; 'his hand is against every man and every man's hand against him.' Full of tender longing for his brother, he is rudely and harshly pushed aside, as though his cup of guilt were now full, and he had no more part or lot in his only friend. His life is a failure, and

there is not a ray of comfort left. Something like these are the deep despairing thoughts of the young child—thoughts which sway his little being with a power the more absolute and mysterious that he cannot analyse them—as he stands at the door of the sick-room with the tears in his eyes “and his bunch of radishes in his hand.”

But it would be endless to touch upon all the indications here offered, of the genuine insight into, and appreciation of, the many-sided character of childhood displayed by an authoress who has not even missed the perception of the profound pathos of childish prattle at a crisis of life and death. Look at the brave ingenuousness, proverbially characteristic of early years, which confesses with equal absence of shame or pride its own merits or faults: “You needn’t scold Miles, it was all me,” or “Oh! that’s my money that I am saving to buy old Dyson an ear-trumpet with.” Look at the early and instinctive reverence for age in the elder brother’s assumption of superiority acknowledged so frankly by the younger.—“There’s lots of things you don’t know.” Look at the genuine modesty which blushes before the grown man, the sensitiveness to a word of blame, the intense enjoyment of life in its most innocent forms, with no need for artificial excitement; and a thousand other varying lights and shades, which go to make up the picture so exquisitely and faithfully drawn in this volume. Imperfect and ephemeral as it is, how essentially attractive is the character of the young child, as of all else that is young and fresh in nature.

Compare for a moment a character of this kind, transparent as crystal, with the state of mind of a young man lately emerged from school-life, say at that crudest, and yet in its way glorious, age—nineteen. How infinitely more winning and loveable are the untouched feelings we have noticed than the gradually hardening sensibilities and tastes of a youth of this kind, just beginning to perceive and counting himself superior that he can detect all that is hollow and false and rotten in the world about him. He is not to be “done” so easily; he has no respect for your parson with his hymn-book—no tenderness for, no knowledge of, the suffering by which he is surrounded. Most ignorant and selfish of men; void of or trying successfully enough to quench what he has of that most divine of our faculties—imagination, by which we are empowered to read the hearts of others; how should he fathom a hair’s breadth below the surface of a mind innocent in youth or tried by the troubles of years? Is it not because this most common picture is so really repulsive, although conventionally regarded as the reflection of all that is manly, that we welcome the innocence of childhood and are captivated by a portrait of its most charming features so artistic in effect, so fresh in colouring,

## 202 *Children's Stories for Grown-up People.*

so faithful in delineation, and so carefully worked out? For the form is not by any means the only merit in the work with which we are now dealing. A simplicity and force of expression rises at times almost to the level of the Epic, as in the description of the child's delirium, and its influence on the unhappy father. "Three times Sir Everard strove to answer, and three times his voice failed him."

And to the plot itself too a brief tribute must be paid. It is with nothing short of consummate art that throughout the earlier part of the story not Sir Everard only but the reader is thrown off the scent by the delicacy of the younger child, and the careful preparation, as it were, for some calamity in the person of the little Miles, the father's pet, and the fragile image of his mother, till the moment before the catastrophe he is almost ready to exclaim with Sir Everard that no punishment could be too severe for Humphrey; and the surprise of the catastrophe, when it comes, is felt to be as real to the reader as to the father of the child.

Apart, however, from its execution, such a story as this undoubtedly appeals to us with a somewhat rare force, because it reminds the hardest of us that, hardened as we love to think ourselves, it is after all only a rough shell that has been formed on the outside of our nature; that the delicate life is still there with all its sensitive fibre, ready to come forth like the nautilus when the surface of life is smooth and the evening sky unclouded.

And does not a 'brochure' like 'The Fight at Dame Europa's School' cut deeper than history clothed in words of burning eloquence, because it reminds us, and because we like to be reminded, how simple in reality are the clouded motives of men?—how in truth what we teach ourselves to regard as patriotism and policy of State is often nothing but a child's wilfulness and selfishness? Because it reveals to us—and because we appreciate the revelation—how absolutely and perpetually we blind ourselves and cloak under the easy mask of manhood the very simple feelings and motives of which as children we were ashamed?

We have tried to urge that one reason why books of the class of which we are treating are so generally welcomed by the mature intelligence of men and women, is the form in which they appear; and that the charm of the form has its origin in the instinctive sympathy which is at least latent in most of us, however unacknowledged or even unsuspected, with all that is most simple and innocent in nature. In short, that here is one indication that we are not so bad as we are often painted even in the secret studio of our own hearts, where, if anywhere, the angles and disfigurements of the portrait are usually softened down.

But if a political *jeu d'esprit* presupposes at least some acquaintance with the public affairs of the day, and if thoroughly to appreciate a simple tale of child-life, requires more of the child-nature than is perhaps given to the majority of men, it is to our purpose to observe that a skilful writer is able to touch the sensibilities of a very large class by a nursery Book of Nonsense. It is not in the nursery that the ridiculous nonentities of the Clangle Wangle and the bright blue Boss Woss are most welcomed or best appreciated. Grey-haired men and women—men of the world and men of science—join in the laugh over the story of the Four Little Children and the extracts from the Nonsense Gazette; and Lionel and Guy are at once received as playmates by all, of whatever age, who have not altogether lost the echoes of their childish years. And that this is a larger class than modern cynics are usually wont to admit, one proof may surely be found in the wide popularity of a book of children's nonsense, full of the most extravagant absurdities, of receipts for "Amblongus pies," pictures of 'Baccopipia gracilis' or 'Plumbunnia nutritiosa,' and songs of which the burden has no more rhyme or reason than

"Far and few, far and few  
Are the lands where the Jumblics live"

---

### ART. III.—THE MOFUSSIL RECORDS OF BENGAL.

THE neglect, which is universal throughout India, of all modern means and appliances for ensuring the preservation and accessibility of the Public Records and State Papers, has been often deplored in these pages. The apathy of Indian Governments about the condition of the materials and sources of the history of the country, is unparalleled amongst the civilised nations of the world : India, whose records (from the nature of the climate and from other causes) daily encounter more perils than those of any other civilised country, stands alone in having absolutely no machinery for the safe custody of its literary and scientific treasures. With regard to the other points that characterize a good administration, we are wont to compare ourselves with France, Italy, Holland, or even Germany, or England itself ; in record administration we have every thing to learn even from the countries which we are accustomed to consider the least advanced in the arts of civilisation ; for at the present moment the magnificent archives of Spain are pouring forth a flood of light on the mediæval and modern history of Europe. Meanwhile, month by month and year by year, the priceless gems of our Indian record-offices are surely and by no means slowly decaying ; all but the most modern must ere long be lost to science for ever.

And whilst the process of destruction, heart rending to any man with a spark of historical or antiquarian sensibility, is progressing, it is absolutely impossible for any private person, however ardent may be his scientific zeal, to rescue more than a few isolated scraps from the general ruin. India is, for most Englishmen, a land of incessant toil ; they are compelled, by the demands of health or by the ties of home, to spend most of their holiday-time in a distant country. Every man of science in the Anglo-Indian community, with hardly an exception, is necessarily a busy man ; and is absolutely precluded from anything like an extended or profitable search in the mine of the public records, until facilities be afforded for that purpose by the Government. Even in England, where there are thousands of learned and wealthy men who delight to devote their time and their money to these pursuits, the Government finds it necessary to expend considerably over two lakhs per annum\* for the *establishment* of its Record Office alone ; and this

\* In the *Civil Service Estimates* for 1866-67, the salaries of the superior officers of the London Record Office amounted to £11,762 ; the wages of copyists and workmen, £3,886 ; the

Police charges, for watching against fire, &c., £521 ; the charges for editing and publishing Calendars of State Papers and Historical Documents, £5,950 ; making a total of

does not include immense sums annually spent on buildings and appliances ; nor does it include the charges of the Irish and Scotch Record Offices, or of those of the Crown Lands, or of the Duchy of Lancaster, or of the Court of Probate, or indeed of any of those courts and offices which have not yet come under the operation of the Record Act. And yet this most important function of a civilised Government, which is fully recognised and liberally provided for in every country of Europe, is absolutely ignored in India ; where, more than anywhere else, scientific men require those facilities of access which are afforded by the European record-offices, and without which any attempt at investigation is perfectly hopeless. At present it often costs days and even months to find a fact ; and in India men who care about facts cannot spare months or even days.

The officials under the various Indian Governments have always been acknowledged to form one of the most highly-cultivated bodies of public servants in the world ; and yet those Governments have been content to allow their literary productions—scientific, statistical, or political—to moulder in dusty presses, unknown and unused. “We may safely affirm,” said a recent Indian writer, “that a scientific state-paper, however valuable, when once deposited in a Government record-room, seldom issues thence except in “the stomachs of white-ants ; it is at any rate almost invariably “lost to science.” With us there is no possibility of any transmission of results from one student to another ; as a rule every officer who takes any interest in the local history and antiquities, has to set to work exactly in the same manner as if he were in a newly discovered country. Dr. Hunter, who has probably done more in this line than any other district-officer, declares in a recent work his solemn conviction that “till arrangements are made for bringing “the District Records into intelligent contact with the European “world, the Indian Government continues guilty of a great historical injustice to the British nation.”\*

As matters at present stand, our rulers enact in this question the part of the dog in the manger ; they refuse to publish records at the expense of the State, and they neglect to provide the simplest

---

£22,119. In the same year we find an additional vote of £27,070 “to “defray the charges which will come “in course of payment during the “year ending 31st March 1867, towards the enlargement of the Public “Record Repository, and providing the “necessary fittings.” Since that year, we believe that the votes for editing, &c., have been considerably increased ; and a separate Royal Commission has

been established, for investigating the historical treasures in the possession of private persons or corporations.

The magnificent Dublin Record Office, reconstituted by the late Lord Mayo when Chief Secretary for Ireland in 1867, is supported on a still more liberal scale ; and the votes for the editing, &c., of Irish historical documents, are most munificent.

\* *Our Indian Musalmáns*, p. 161.



facilities in the way of muniment-rooms or search-offices, for those who would do so at their own cost. Instances are continually cropping up of irretrievable losses to science, resulting from this neglect; for which, we cannot doubt, posterity will hold the Indian Government of the present day responsible.

Two years ago, under the heading of *Public Records and State Papers*,\* we put before our readers a statement of the case in some detail, with especial reference to the metropolitan records of the great departments of the Government of India, and to the miserable *fiasco* of the late Record Commission.† The remarks we then made about the records of the Home and Foreign Departments apply exactly to those of the Board of Revenue in Calcutta. We propose to confine our attention in this place to the subject indicated by the title of this paper; to endeavour to point out the historical and scientific value of the Mofussil records of Bengal; to shew how those records have been neglected, and how consequently the loss to science becomes every day greater and greater; and to point out what are the measures which, we venture to think, might be attempted to stay, and ultimately perhaps partially to repair the mischief. In this sketch we shall freely refer to, and quote from, the two books of comparatively recent date which best illustrate the value of the local archives of this province—Dr. Hunter's *Annals of Rural Bengal*, and Mr. Westland's *Report on the District of Jessor*. We shall endeavour to point our statements, mainly from these works, and from the results of careful researches into all the original sources of information on the subject which are accessible to us; if further illustrations were necessary, it would be easy to draw them from the numerous works of a somewhat similar design which have appeared in other provinces of India.

We will first consider the *present state and accessibility* of our local records. Any one who has ever had occasion to visit a Mofussil record-room will be well aware that the records—where they are not “lying in a neglected condition on an open rack in the ‘clerk’s room’‡, as was the case with some singularly valuable papers at Bîrbhûm, when Mr. Commissioner Buckland inspected the Collector’s office—are at best secured in common wooden boxes or *ulmiras*, generally old and rickety, fastened by ordinary pad-

\* *Calcutta Review*, No. C.; April 1870.

† The Record Commission lasted a few years, and frittered away some of the public money. We believe that it did absolutely nothing for the preservation and accessibility of the Indian Records, which ought to have been the chief aim of such a commission. It produced only one work of

any historical or scientific value; we hope to give our readers a review of that work in an early number.

‡ See a letter, communicated to the Calcutta newspapers, from C.T. Buckland, Esq., Commissioner of the Burdwan Division, to the Officiating Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Revenue Department; dated Burdwan, 28th November 1871.

locks, and placed in a room of general public resort. They are, as a rule, exposed daily to every conceivable peril. The dangers resulting from the dampness of the climate ; from the ravages of white-ants, rats, book-worms, and other vermin ; from decay ; from mutilation, inflicted either intentionally or through ignorance or carelessness ; from fire, &c.,—all these are sufficiently obvious. The annual destruction of valuable documents that must go on in a climate like that of Bengal is doubtless enormous. Only a short time ago, a valuable collection of oriental manuscripts, the property of Government, was seriously damaged by rain ; in consequence, a circular was issued by the Home Department, ordering that in all annual reports made by officers in charge of public libraries, museums, or collections, it should be specially stated whether or not the whole of the property is safe and in good condition ; but in the present state of our Mofussil record-offices, it is impossible that any documents can long remain in good condition. We believe that it was discovered, a few years since, that the Collectorate Records at Jessor had been so extensively tampered with by interested parties, that the evidence of any of these documents was held to be worthless ; and a similar state of things is believed to exist in many, if not most, of the local archives. It was stated recently in the *Pioneer* that the records of one of the N.W.P. cutcherries were inaccessible, owing to the number of venomous serpents that had taken up their abode amongst them !

But perhaps the most perfect illustration of the deplorable, we had almost said criminal, neglect from which the materials of the rural and local history of Bengal have suffered, is afforded by the correspondence to which we referred above, on the records of the Collectorate of Bîrbhûm. It should be remembered that public attention had been drawn to these records more than to those of any other district, from the fact that Dr. Hunter had founded on them his *Annals of Rural Bengal*. These records at any rate have been looked into, if any have in the whole of Bengal. Now let us hear what Mr. Buckland says about them :—

Whilst inspecting the Collector's office at Beerbhoom, I found a number of old English manuscript books lying in a neglected condition on an open rack in the clerk's room. They had been exposed to the ravages of time and insects . . . The Assistant Collector, Mr. Macaulay, was good enough to undertake the examination of these old books, and among them he has found *some letters of particular interest, and of greater age than were believed to exist* in the Beerbhoom office.

Mr. Allen, the Officiating Collector of Beerbhoom, adds his testimony to the same effect, and with the greatest candour :—

The books from which these letters have been extracted were lying mouldering on an old rack in the English office, *much injured by age*

and insects. They to all appearance have been undisturbed by any previous explorer, and seem to have escaped even Mr. Hunter's researches, possibly owing to the fact of their not being stored in the treasury almirahs.

It will hardly be credited, by those accustomed to the notions on the subject of records prevalent in Europe (where an ancient and valuable document is treated with much the same reverence as that with which a book-collector treats his unique Elzevir), that Mr. Macaulay's researches proved that the history of the earliest part of the English rule in Bīrbhūm had been crumbling away in these neglected papers!

Mr. Buckland justly adds:—"It is very creditable to Mr. Macaulay to have devoted his time to this extra work, considering the importance of his ordinary duties, in addition to which he had charge of the district treasury, whilst the pressure of preparing himself to pass the examination was always upon him." But neither the Commissioner nor the Collector seem to be much struck by the more than Gothic indifference to science displayed by a Government which can permit the materials of its history to fall into such a grievous state as that which is here indicated; and which can trust, for the reparation of the mischief caused by the State neglect, to the zeal and discretion of young gentlemen who, however industrious and intelligent, must always be utterly without experience in record work, and terribly hurried by the multifarious duties which their official position entails upon them.

So much, then, for the care that is bestowed on the preservation of our literary and scientific treasures.\* With regard

\* The insecurity of such custody may perhaps be illustrated by a very brief description of the method of custody which is found necessary even in England, where the climate is much less injurious, and the fear of mutilation smaller. The Record Act directs that all public documents of a certain age shall be handed over to the Record Office. As soon as any sets of Records have been taken into the custody of the Master of the Rolls (who is ex-officio head of the English Record Department), they are cleaned, sorted, bound or mended as far as may be necessary and practicable, and placed in boxes for subsequent arrangement. Then a catalogue or general descriptive list is drawn up; and afterwards the more important documents are indexed, and the most

important are ultimately calendar-ed. When the work of arrangement is complete, they are placed in iron presses in the room assigned to their class. Every room in the building is separately fire-proof, being cased with iron and furnished with an iron-door which is thief-proof. Water can be turned on at a moment's notice in any room for the extinction of fire. Hot-air pipes are placed around every room, so that an equal temperature is preserved throughout the year; and by this means damp is excluded and rot arrested. Every part of the building being thus protected by every means that science can devise, the whole is constantly watched night and day, both by the Department (an officer and an office-keeper being resident in an adjacent house) and

to their accessibility, we need only add to what we have already said that they are scattered in scores of remote and almost unknown hiding-places, without calendars or indexes worthy of the name, and in the custody of native record-keepers of no scientific skill and comparatively little intelligence.

We will now endeavour to show the real historical and scientific value of the Mofussil Records, and the importance of their being carefully preserved and arranged. The first point that strikes us is the consideration that many of these documents are to be found in duplicate, in a more manageable and accessible form, in the great metropolitan archives, and especially amongst the records of the Board of Revenue in Calcutta. This consideration, if it were generally applicable, would of course greatly diminish the responsibility of the Government in the matter of its neglect of the rural records; for the latter, though still valuable for purposes of verifying or supplementing the information to be found in Calcutta, would lose their unique character; and the mischief occasioned by their destruction, though serious, would not be irreparable. But we shall shew, in our review of the contents of those of the mofussil offices about which anything is known, that this consideration will apply only to comparatively a small portion of the bulk; there are certainly tons and tons of valuable documents, especially those of the earlier series, which are only to be found in these insecure rural offices. On the general question of their value, we shall quote one or two passages from Dr. Hunter's eloquent introduction to his *Annals*; premising that, in our humble opinion, even the glowing periods of this enthusiastic writer will be regarded by posterity as all too cold in their denunciation of a system, or rather a lack of system, which is mutilating the history of a great country :—\*

Four years ago, in taking over charge of the district treasury, I was struck with the appearance of an ancient press, which from the state of its padlocks seemed not to have been opened for many years,

by the police; a police patrol is on duty throughout the night in the building. The perfect accessibility of all records is also well provided for, by a splendid system of Calendars and Indexes, and by the employment of a thoroughly trained staff of archivists. On this, see *Calcutta Review*, No. C., April, 1870.

\* It will, we trust, be remembered that the legal rights of the whole of the people are vitally affected by the neglect of which we are complaining in this paper; and we should be unwill-

ling to lose sight of this all-important fact, though in this place we are more immediately engaged in pleading the claims of science. The Public Records have been called, by the British Parliament, the "Evidences of the People;" and it has been declared, both in the Record Act itself, and in many reports of Committees of the House of Commons, that the people have an undoubted right to insist on the most careful preservation of all public documents, even on this ground alone.

and with whose contents none of the native officials was acquainted. On being broken open it was found to contain the early records of the district from within a year of the time that it passed directly under British rule.\* The volumes presented every appearance of age and decay: their yellow-stained margins were deeply eaten into by insects, their outer pages crumbled to pieces under the most tender handling, and of some the sole palpable remains were chips of paper mingled with the granular dust that white-ants leave behind.†

Such was the condition of some of the chief materials of the *Annals*! Of all the heaps that had already been destroyed—of the tons of records that in the various offices of Bengal have already been converted into “the granular dust that white-ants leave behind”—history is for ever silent; their testimony for good or bad is for ever hushed. Dr. Hunter continues:—

Careful research has convinced me that these neglected heaps contain much that is worthy of being preserved. For what trustworthy account have we of the state of rural India at the commencement, and during the early stages of our rule?... In the chief Government office of every district in Bengal are presses filled with papers similar to those I have described. They consist of reports, letters, minutes, judicial proceedings, and relate in the words of eye-witnesses, and with official accuracy, the daily history of the country from the time the English took the administration into their own hands. Many of them are written in the curt, forcible language which men use in moments of excitement or peril; and in spite of the blunders of copyists and the ravages of decay, they have about them that air of real life which proceeds not from literary ability, but from the fact that their authors' minds were full of the subjects on which they wrote. We learn from these worm-eaten manuscripts that what we have been accustomed to regard as Indian history is a chronicle of events which hardly affected, and which were for the most part unknown to the contemporary mass of the people of India.

\* Mr. Macaulay's researches prove that Dr. Hunter was mistaken in this assertion; as the former gentleman has actually “discovered”(1) two earlier magistrates than any of those whose records are noticed in the *Annals*. It would be amusing, were the subject less serious, to observe in what a hap-hazard way the record-discoveries both of Dr. Hunter and of Mr. Macaulay were made: documents, of the most inestimable value from a scientific point of view, are turned up, because Dr. Hunter is struck with the appearance of a particularly rusty old box, and because Mr. Buckland some years afterwards

(in the *same* office!) observes some papers which appear to be particularly tattered and neglected!

† This terribly suggestive description will remind English archivists of the evidence given, in a report to the House of Commons, of the state of the Welsh Records before they were made over to the custody of the Master of the Rolls. The evidence created quite a sensation at the time; and a special Act of the Legislature was found necessary to protect the rights of the Welsh landowner. But Bengal is not Wales; “it is a far cry to Lochawe.”

This plea for a careful record system, on the ground of the historical value of the records, we shall endeavour further to illustrate presently. Let us now hear what Dr. Hunter has to say about the administrative value of such a system :—

Besides the value of these memorials as a 'groundwork for an accurate and a yet unwritten history, they possess a special interest to those who are charged with the Government of India at the present day. When the East India Company accepted the internal administration of Bengal, it engaged to rule in accordance with native usages ; and the first step towards the fulfilment of its promise was to ascertain what these usages really were. To this end instructions repeatedly issued during a period of thirty years, directing all local officers to institute enquiries ; and even after the formal command was removed, the habit of collecting and reporting information continued till 1820. The period on which the rural records open in the western districts is one of peculiar interest. It stands on the border-ground between the ancient and the modern system of Indian government. The evidence on which to form a permanent arrangement of the land-revenue was in process of being collected, and not a single subject of fiscal legislation nor a detail in the agricultural economy of each district escaped inquiry. The tenure of the landholders and their relations to the middle-men ; the tenure of the cultivators, their earnings and their style of living, their clothing and the occupation of their families at odd hours ; the price of all sorts of country produce ; the rent of various qualities of land ; the mineral products of the district ; the condition of the artisans and manufacturers, their profits and public burdens ; the native currency and system of exchange ; the native system of police ; the state of the district jail ; lastly, cesses, tolls, dues, and every other method of recognised or unrecognised taxation—formed in turn the subject of report.

We will make one further extract only from the *Annals*, to illustrate the lack of continuity, which we have complained of as a necessary characteristic of Indian antiquarian research in the absence of any system of record administration :—

The labours of a previous school of officers soon became a subject of indifference to their successors ; the quick decay of a tropical climate began its work ; and of the researches that had occupied the ablest administrators during the first fifty years of our rule—researches that they had designed as the basis of a consistent system of Indian rural law—the greater part has, during the second fifty years, been made over as a prey to mildew and white-ants.

What proportion has perished can never be known. *What part survives can only be permanently preserved by the intervention of the State.*

What good use Dr. Hunter made of the surviving portion in Bírbrhúm—so far as it was possible for a young executive officer, burdened with a large amount of regular work and with perpetually recurring examinations, to make any use of a chaotic mass

of documents and rubbish—is well known from his *Annals* ; of which the second, fifth, and sixth chapters were based on what he found therein. His graphic accounts of the state of the country, when it passed under British rule, of the great famine of 1769-70, of the Company's first attempts at rural administration from 1765-90, and of the Company as a rural manufacturer as well as administrator, have become the type of a new school of Indian literature. Mr. Westland in Jessor, Dr. Oldham in Gházipur, and many other officers in other parts of the country, have followed in the same track; and the promised series of *Imperial Gazetteers* will doubtless serve at once largely to stimulate this branch of research, and to put the chief results in an accessible form before the public. At the same time it should not be forgotten that the meagre contents of a *Gazetteer*, however comparatively full of detail it may be, can preserve for us little more than a drop out of the ocean of knowledge to be obtained from a scientific examination of the records.

Mr. Westland, in his *Report on the District of Jessore*, has made a more thorough and scientific use of local records than has been attempted by any other searcher; and his book, for the period of which it treats, approaches as nearly to what a good *Calendar of local State Papers* should be, as is possible under present circumstances. Dr. Hunter in his *Annals* has endeavoured to combine the work of the archivist with that of the historian; and naturally the latter has well-nigh swallowed up the former. The Jessor Report, without any attempt at the literary embellishment which has won fame for the *Annals*, gives a fairly exhaustive account of the first thirty years of British administration in that district, from 1781 to 1811. Every statement is verified by references to the documents used; and is as precise, and consequently as valuable for future use by either historians or officials, as an entry in the magnificent series of calendars of the English Record Office. A glance at the contents of this chapter (Part III. of the *Report*—which is the only portion of the work with which we are concerned here) will demonstrate the value of such researches; and a more careful examination of the text more than confirms the favourable impression. We will quote Mr. Westland's account of the general object and scope of this part of his labours.

The third part is for the most part a compilation from early official records; it is a history of the first thirty years, the most interesting period of British rule in the district. From the old regulations, and especially from their preambles, it is possible to gain an idea of the general outlines of the Company's administration in those days; but avoiding what might be a mere recapitulation of the general or legal history of Bengal, I have concerned myself rather to give a view of the state of affairs with which the district officers in those days had to deal,

to give a history of the various attempts that were made to put matters on a better footing, to show the difficulties that had to be encountered, and the successes or failures which attended the various measures adopted. I imagine that few who have not examined the early records of the Bengal districts have any conception of the ordeal through which these districts passed during the period whose history I have attempted to narrate, the period of transition from the old *régime* to the new. Viewing the quiet and settled state of the districts now, one is apt to forget that eighty or a hundred years ago their condition in all that regarded internal administration was but a few degrees removed from barbarism; and one's present experience affords little aid in measuring the bearing and effects of even the most prominent public measures of that time.

Mr. Westland's remarks put in the clearest possible light the immense advantages which an improved system of record management would confer on the district officers and others engaged in the administration of the country; for it is only from such management that we can hope for any collection and diffusion of that kind of information of which he speaks. Turning to the test of his analysis of the records, we find that he commences with a careful account of the state of the country prior to the establishment of British administration in 1781; at which time it was divided chiefly among three or four great zamíndáris. This account is of course less circumstantial than what follows, as it is derived only from allusions or incidental references in the earlier records. The details, however, of the establishment of the British rule—the early police administration, from 1781 to 1790—the administration of civil and criminal justice—the salt department and its fights with the magistrate the quarrels between the judge and the Company's cloth factories—the details of all these during the eventful years that followed our assumption of power are highly instructive and suggestive, and abound with passages of the deepest interest. The story of the permanent settlement, and the melancholy tale of the ruin of the old zamíndárs and the creation of a new class of zamíndárs during the eight years from 1795 to 1802, when the full effects of the permanent settlement were first beginning to be felt, are here invested with all that life-like reality which attaches to accounts written by men living among and deeply moved by the events which they describe. We find the same vividness and reality in the history of the various famines and of the measures taken to provide against them or to alleviate the distress, from 1787 to 1801; of the floods, and of the construction of embankments, so characteristic of a deltaic province; of the establishment of excise, 1790 to 1810; of the coinage and currency; of the early state of trade and agriculture; and of many similar matters of the greatest importance and interest.



We have only touched thus lightly on a few of the many striking points of record-lore preserved for us by Mr. Westland, because we imagine that the book itself is already familiar to most of our readers who take any interest in these subjects; who will all know that, under each of the heads we have mentioned above, the *Report on Jessore* contains a mass of information that will be an almost inexhaustible mine for future historians and administrators of the district. We cannot better illustrate the value of precise and accurate information of this nature, than by adverting to a work on India recently published in England by an able and forcible writer, Mr. McCullagh Torrens. For a part of his work, Mr. Torrens had the advantage of consulting some of the very few books that have been based on actual Indian records; for other parts he had to rely on current or standard Indian literature; and the contrast between the two sections of his work is well pointed out in the following brief review, which we will quote from an ably written article in a Calcutta newspaper:—

We do not propose to show in detail where we think that Mr. Torrens has failed in his picture of Warren Hastings and his times. But it should not be forgotten that his picture is the one which still has possession of the mental vision of most English statesmen who take the trouble of thinking at all about Indian affairs. Indian history has too generally been compiled from the impassioned utterances of English party leaders—men who could have no original knowledge of the subject, whose views were confessedly distorted by partizanship, and who, as a rule, were simply personal advocates or public prosecutors holding a brief. Such materials, although prolific in striking colors and exciting episodes, fail to yield any solid instruction as to what was really done in those times, or as to the bearings of the past action of the English Government of India on the great questions of the present day. The calm jurisdiction of history has a very different *venue* from the noisy arena of Parliamentary debate. If we are to learn the truth, we must search for it in the local records in this country. The Indian Government does an injustice both to the people of India and to the succession of eminent Englishmen who have in one century built up a stable and peaceful rule upon a seething whirlpool of anarchy, by its parsimony in leaving its archives to perish unedited and unknown.

While, therefore, we hold Mr. Torrens' treatment of Warren Hastings and his times to be wholly inadequate, it would be mere injustice to blame the author individually for a blemish unavoidable from the very nature of the materials which are the only ones available to an English writer on Indian affairs. The merit of Mr. Torrens' book is that he has placed his mind in full accord with that new and higher conception of Indian history which finds its themes, not in the exploits of a handful of rulers, but in the vicissitudes of the people. This conception may be said to have been introduced by the "*Annals of Rural Bengal*" at a single stroke; and one of Mr. Torrens' most interesting chapters, "*The Plight of the People*," is a very able abstract

of the facts collected in India for that book. He also makes a skilful use of the volume of "Selections from the Records of the Government of India," edited by the Rev. Mr. Long; and several of his pages attest in an unmistakeable manner the value of such compilations in bringing the truth about India home to the minds of English statesmen.

We believe that the point brought out in this last sentence is well worthy of the consideration of the Indian Government, and generally of those who desire to see a larger and deeper interest felt in England on Indian topics. May it not be possible that much of that indifference about India, in Parliament and elsewhere at home, about which we so often complain, is owing to the lack of accurate and trustworthy information? And can this lack be satisfactorily supplied otherwise than by the publication of calendars of, or extracts from, the official records of the country?

We have hitherto confined our attention to the archives of two districts which have been brought prominently before the notice of the public, by the accidental presence in each district, at various times, of civil officers of antiquarian tastes and literary abilities. The records of Bírghúm and Jessor have been rendered famous by the labours of Dr. Hunter and Mr. Westland; but many other repositories contain materials of history of equal interest and importance. We have endeavoured to obtain some statistics of the contents of the more important of these repositories; and we now offer to our readers the results of these enquiries, premising that we have little doubt that a detailed and careful examination by skilled archivists would bring to light innumerable scientific treasures of even higher value than many of those to which we are now about to refer.

It may be presumed that next to the records preserved at the Presidency, with which we are not concerned in this place, the oldest records of the English rule in Bengal will be found in the offices of Bardwán, Dacca, and Chittagong. And this is doubtless the case; for though we have no information about the two former, we learn that at Chittagong original documents are still surviving which date from the period of Clive's first administration, A.D. 1760—only three years after Plassey. Such a series as this of Chittagong, extending over considerably more than a century, must obviously contain an immense amount of interesting information; but we can only give a few samples, almost at hap-hazard. In 1771, the year preceding the advent of Warren Hastings as Governor of Bengal, we get a voluminous letter of twenty-one foolscap pages from the Commissioner to the Commissioners of Revenue on the revenues of the division. In 1774, when our histories are mainly concerned with the affairs of Chait Singh of Benares and with the squabbles of the newly-appointed

Governor-General and his Council at Calcutta, we get an interesting letter from Warren Hastings to "the Chief of Chittagong" on the subject of slavery. In 1777 there is one of even greater importance—when we remember that the history of the Arakán frontier and the depopulation of the Sundarbans is the *opprobrium historicorum* of Bengal, and that this letter can hardly be found in duplicate—from Captain Ellerker to the Chief of Chittagong, about certain invasions of the Mughls. Later in the same year, Warren Hastings writes to the same official for information about Burmah; early in 1790 we find a guard ordered for Moheshkally "on account of the Burmese;" and again in April 1791, there is a letter from the Board to the Collector of Chittagong regarding disturbances by Burmese in the south of the district. In 1789 there is an important petition from the zamíndárs of Sandwipa; in 1790 a memorial from the zamíndárs and talukdárs of Chittagong; and later in the same year, an important series of petitions, extending over twenty-five pages of foolscap and containing a large amount of interesting information, relative to the malpractices of the Diwán. Letters about the French in Chittagong; bills "for dieting people sent by the King of Ava;" and documents about police, embankments, waste lands, hâts, "cases of alluviation and decrease in lands," salt, cotton, and indeed every possible detail connected with revenue, commerce, agriculture, and the administration generally—are to be found in this treasure-house of antiquities, only awaiting an intelligent examination and selection.

In default of any trustworthy information about the archives of Bardwán and Dacca—likely to be more valuable than any others—we turn to those of Midnapur, which probably come next in point of age. These date from 1764; they throw light upon the commercial proceedings of the East India Company, and upon the relations between officials and independent traders; and as usual, they are most full and explicit upon almost every matter of interest and importance concerning the district.

Hugli has only acquired in comparatively recent times its present dignity as a *Sadr* station; consequently the English records preserved there can boast of no high antiquity. But most of the official documents of the Dutch Settlement of Chinsurah, and of the Danish Settlement of Frederiksnagar or Serampur, were deposited at Hugli at the times when those territories passed respectively under the British rule. The Dutch have always been conspicuous, even amongst European nations, for the scientific care bestowed on their archives; and the records of Netherlands' India preserved at Chinsurah, were worthy of that reputation. We regret, however, to find (from a paper read before the *Asiatic Society*, and published in its *Proceedings*, in April 1871) that

most of those which possessed any historical and scientific value were, in 1858, "handed over bodily, and without even any proposal to retain copies of them in this country, by the Government of India to the Government of the Netherlands' India" for transmission to the Hague. The extraordinary historical interest of these documents may be seen from the list, which is printed *in extenso* in the *Proceedings*. They contained a complete series of the *Minutes* of the Governors of Chinsurah, from 1674; which, as Mr. Torrens (who was Judge of Hugli at the time of the transfer) stated, "must undoubtedly, I think, have been of very considerable historical importance." The other sets of documents were numbered from 1 to 66; we will quote a few of the numbers:—

No. 3 contained copies of "grants respecting lands at Pipley and Balasore, in 1676."

No. 4 contained documents respecting "the acquisition of land at Baranagore" by the Dutch in 1680.

No. 6 contained "two Perwanas under the seal of Vizier Sadoolah Khan" respecting a house at Patna.

No. 8 was a packet containing documents respecting transfer of some premises at Dacca from the French authorities to the Dutch in 1674. This is almost certainly the earliest mention on record of the French being settled in Bengal; the India House Records calendared by Mr. Bruce in the *Annals of the East India Company* only mention the arrival of the first French fleet under Admiral De La Haye in the Bay of Bengal in 1673; Stewart, in his *History of Bengal*, says that the French settled here about 1676; and yet in these documents we find them possessing premises at Dacca, and even disposing of those premises, as early as 1674.

No. 12 was a packet containing copies of five *farmāns* permitting the Dutch to trade in the provinces of Oudh, Allahabad, and Agra.

No. 42 contained twenty-one volumes of journals and minutes of the Dutch administration from 1773 to 1805. These would in all probability furnish materials for a fairly complete history of Netherlands' India for that period: and would admirably illustrate the history of the British power during the same time.

No. 57 was a book containing a Note of Warren Hastings on the capture of the Fort and Town of Chiusursh in 1781.

The Danish records of Serámpur date from 1745. Both these, and the surviving relics of the Dutch papers, are described as "covered with the dust of years," "worm-eaten and decaying," "many in a state of inseparable cohesion."

The papers of the old Purniah Council are believed to be at Allahabad; but in the Collectorate at Purniah are a large number

of documents of the highest interest, dating from 1786. Some of the earliest of these throw light on the state of Nepál, the Morung, the frontier tribes, and trade between them and Purniah, at this period—a period far removed from the present day in point of civilisation, in this part of Bengal. There are papers fully illustrating the famine of 1791; grants of lands to Europeans and permissions to set up factories; measures undertaken to put down excessive usury, and exactions on the part of the zamíndárs. There is, moreover, a most important account of the state of the various zamíndáris of the district in the year 1788.

Probably few districts surpass Bhágalpur in the scientific value of their archives; for here we find not only the usual series, but also such valuable monographs as Sutherland's *Reports on the Hill Tribes*—not to mention numerous letters of Cleveland, the pioneer of civilisation amongst the aborigines of the hill-tracts. If those enquiries into the condition and history of the non-Aryan tribes of Bengal, so well commenced by Hodgson and Hunter and a few others, are ever to be made thorough and exhaustive, it must almost necessarily be by the aid of these most important documents; which (the statement will perhaps appear incredible to many of our readers) are sharing a common fate with the most trivial and worthless bills and accounts of a mofussil office! With materials such as these at his command, a writer possessing a lively imagination and a facile pen might perform for the Santáls and the other wild tribes of Western Bengal a service similar to that which Sir Walter Scott did so well for the Highlanders of Scotland; meanwhile, these materials are consigned—*horresco referens*—to the tender mercies of the climate and the ants.

The records of the divisions of Patna and of Chuttia Nágpur were much mutilated during the troublous times of 1857—those of the Collectorate of Gya having been totally destroyed by the mutineers, whilst those of Sháhábád in the former division, and those of Hazáribágh and Mánbhúm in the latter, were much injured. We are assured that there formerly existed a large mass of highly interesting correspondence connected with the affairs of Chuttia Nágpur and the jungle mahalls, extending back as far as 1765; of which all, or nearly all, has doubtless perished. There are, however, still remaining in the office of the Commissioner of this division, many letters and reports on operations undertaken to suppress disturbances, and much interesting information respecting the relations of Government with the different states forming the agency, embracing a period from 1813 to 1836.

The offices of the Assam Commission are generally of very recent creation; nevertheless, amongst the Commissioner's archives are many documents which, if accessible, would prove not only of general interest, but also of the highest value to the officers

of the Commission. These mainly consist of reports referring to the relations of Government with the surrounding hill tribes, the state of the country when first taken possession of, and other similar topics.

In the Collectorate of Tipperah is to be found a highly valuable series of papers, of the years 1781-1792; wherein is buried an immense amount of information about the interesting State of Hill Tipperah. Turning to the division of Rájsháhi, we find a great number of documents of a similar nature in the Rangpur Collectorate, illustrating in the same way the relations of Government with Bhután, Kuch-Behár, and Assam. These records date from 1781, and those of the Dinájpur Collectorate from 1790. In Rájsháhi itself, we get papers dating from July 1782; some of these are kept in almirahs, others carelessly bound together in bustahs; and, as usual, most of the volumes have been damaged either by damp or by white-ants.

The mutilation of the ancient and extremely valuable archives of Murshidabad is, we believe, a matter of history. Of the whole mass of the old English records of this collectorate, *three* volumes alone now survive! The first of these volumes contains the minutes of the Provincial Court at Murshidabad for the latter half of the year 1778; the second volume contains the minutes of the Provincial Council for the first half of the year 1780; the third volume contains the correspondence of the collectorate during the years 1791 to 1795. Between these records and those of recent years there is, alas! an historical blank—*hiatus valde deflendus*, which can now never be filled up.

We have here glanced at the literary treasures of some of the chief districts of Bengal—treasures which are being yearly dissipated and destroyed under the very eyes and with the tacit sanction of the Government. It will be observed that we have dwelt for the most part only on the purely administrative records; but it must be remembered that, in addition to these, there is a vast mass of judicial records scattered about over the country, exposed to the same dangers and treated with the same neglect. Moreover, these judicial records are hardly inferior in importance to the records of the executive; like them, they vitally affect the rights and interests of the subjects; and from a scientific point of view, every archivist well knows that records of judgments and pleadings are often the best possible guides in matters of social history, and are always the most trustworthy sources for illustrations of the manners and customs of the people. And yet what hope have we of any intelligent use being made of all these materials? Wherever we go we find, in traversing the various districts, almost exactly the same accounts meeting us at every turn. In every one of the richer and more ancient repositories, there are

large numbers of highly important and interesting documents ; but everywhere, with dreary monotony, we find the same ignorance of the real nature of the treasures, and the same neglect attended with the same inevitable loss and decay. Everywhere, the damp and the white-ants are the masters of the situation. Even where, in some districts, the rule of King Stork has been temporarily substituted for that of King Log on the advent of some particularly zealous and energetic district-officer, the hapless records still suffer no less ; and it cannot be doubted that many a priceless literary gem has been sacrificed to misguided industry in the clearance of so-called rubbish. Even in the one office which has been most thoroughly searched, the scene of Dr. Hunter's labours and the birthplace of the *Annals of Rural Bengal*, we find the Commissioner of the Division, merely in the course of a casual inspection of the office during the past year, turning up (amongst what would have been doubtless considered rubbish by a less acute observer) the most ancient records of the district ; and we find an intelligent Assistant Magistrate, notwithstanding his pre-occupation and his inexperience, able to evolve from this rubbish the history of the earliest period of British rule in the locality. It is impossible to doubt what would have been the fate of this history, but for the acute archæological perception of Mr. Buckland and the accidental possession of archæological tastes and industry on the part of Mr. Macaulay. If this is the case with the archives of Bîrbhûm, over which a special providence seems to have watched, what may we not fear for the unknown and unfriended archives of less fortunate districts ?

It now remains for us to consider whether any reasonable measures—reasonable, we mean, in point of the trouble and the expense which they would involve—can be devised to remedy the melancholy state of things which we have pointed out ; or, at least, to arrest the work of destruction. The plan which has been most commonly suggested, and which would probably appear to most at first sight a feasible one, is, for the local district officers to select the most valuable and important records, which might then be printed *in extenso* and thus effectually rescued from the general wreck. But we shall endeavour to show that this scheme is impracticable ; even if it were not so, the value of the results would only be in direct proportion to the amount expended on the copying and the printing ; and unless the expenditure were most lavish, the bulk of the records would still be untouched. That the scheme is impracticable, however, will hardly be doubted by any one who knows how numerous and how pressing are already the calls upon the time and attention of the district officers ; to impose upon them the duties of archivists in addition to all the rest, would be to add the last straw to a load already well-nigh insupportable. Moreover,

his is exactly the kind of work which is only done well by those who have a taste for it. A very wise man once said : " Use such " persons as affect the business wherein they are employed, for " that quickeneth much ;" and we will venture to say that, in antiquarian investigations, the absence of this quickening affection absolutely disqualifies a man for the task. Not every Assistant Magistrate has the taste of an Oldbuck or a Dryasdust ; nor can every one drink of the inspiration which the Bîrbhûm record-room seems to afford—*non cui-vis homini contingit adire Corinthum*. We have no doubt that, as a fact, nine officers out of ten would find the task of wading through dusty and musty records, weary, stale, flat, and unprofitable to a degree ; and would either delegate it to some ignorant subordinate, or perform it in such a perfunctory manner as to make the selection absolutely valueless. And, as we have already suggested, no selection that could be made within any reasonable limits would adequately represent the archæological treasures of our mofussil archives.

The great fundamental error which underlies this and most other propositions that have been made for putting the record-literature of India on a better footing, is comprised in a mistaken notion of what really are the duties of a civilised Government in this matter. It is not for Government to print records *in extenso* : this task may safely and indeed with advantage be left, even in India, to the scientific zeal of individuals or of learned societies—provided always that due facilities are afforded them for making a judicious selection. The functions of Government in the matter are now recognised, in the practice of every enlightened state of Europe and America, and by the unanimous opinion of the whole world of archivists, to consist in—(1) securing all public documents of value from the numerous dangers to which they are exposed, by the use of all the appliances and inventions of modern science ; (2) superintending the destruction of useless documents, with the adoption of such precautions as may ensure that nothing of value (either to the public or to individuals) is lost, and that no improper use is made of the condemned papers ; (3) securing the perfect accessibility of all public documents (except those that may be withheld for valid reasons of state, as for instance, in England, the *recent* records of the Foreign Office) to all classes of searchers, whether the searches are made for official purposes, for scientific purposes, or in the establishment of legal rights. These principles were first laid down by M. Guizot, when Minister of Public Instruction in France. In a memorable note relating to the consolidation of the Department recently known as the *Archives de l'Empire*, the same acute scholar and statesman reviewed the record works of the *Académie Royale des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres*, and of the *Société de l'Histoire de France* ; and pointed out that whilst



such societies may and should follow up and supplement the work of the Government by publishing records of value opened up to them by the State calendarers, it is for the Government alone to make their archives thoroughly accessible by means of complete and scientific calendars prepared by their own officers. These principles have been accepted and acted upon by nearly every Government in Europe and America.

These, then, are the two cardinal points to be aimed at—*preservation* and *accessibility*. It is, we boldly affirm, impossible to obtain these without—(1) the concentration of all record repositories and the establishment of a public and convenient search-room ; (2) the compilation of good and scientific calendars. It may be noted, however, that here in India the question of the preservation of the records is of far more pressing importance than even that of providing for their accessibility. Hence, the first measure that is urgently demanded by the state of our mofussil records, is their concentration under proper superintendence in some safe and dry central repository. Any attempt to provide for their preservation in their present scattered state, must be either wholly futile, or ruinously extravagant ; whereas their transport to Calcutta and the provision of a proper building for their reception and of a small establishment for their custody, might be effected at a cost inconsiderable in itself, and absolutely insignificant when considered as the price of such an inestimable boon to the scientific world. To provide for the accessibility of the treasures thus collected, by means of search-rooms and calendars, would fairly demand attention after this concentration had been effected ; but to secure the safety of the treasures themselves is the great point. Like Tarquin haggling over the Sibylline books, the longer we hesitate about collecting the Bengal records, the less will be the value of the collection when made.

---

#### ART. IV.—THE LANGUAGES AND RACES OF DARDISTAN. .

*The Languages and Races of Dardistan.* By DR. G. W. LEITNER ;  
Lahore and London.

OUR present review of this work does not extend to the first two volumes which have already been published, but embraces only the first part, entitled—*A Comparative Vocabulary and Grammar of the Dardu languages.*

Hitherto, as it appears, this interesting work, the materials of which were collected by Dr. Leitner on a tour to Dardistan in the months of August, September, and October 1866 under great difficulties, has passed nearly unnoticed by professional philologists; but apparently from no other reason than that they did not know how to make use of it. It is to be regretted that nearly the whole attention of our learned orientalists at home is bestowed on Sanskrit alone; Pāli has, till recent times, been very little studied, and it is significant that since Lassen's *Institutiones Linguae Prākriticae* have appeared (1837), nothing has been done (the little work of Delius, *Radices Linguae Prākriticae*, excepted) on this vast field. The modern idioms of India, derived from the Sanskrit through the medium of the Pāli and Prākrit, are nearly utterly neglected, as if they had no right of existence. We accept therefore most gratefully the valuable contribution which Dr. Leitner has given to a more comprehensive and comparative study of the modern Sanskritical idioms of India in his Dardistan. The subject itself is interesting enough, were it only, that languages which were hitherto only known by name, are brought within our research; but it is doubly interesting, when we find that the races inhabiting Dardistan are of *Arian origin*, and speak dialects which, on nearer investigation, will be found to have gone through the same process of development (or decomposition, as it might be called), as their sister-tongues in the plains of Upper India.

But from another point of view also the subject in question deserves our closest attention. It is proved now fully, by the Dardu dialects being brought within our reach, that the large mountain chain separating India from the steppes of Tartary and Turkistan, is still inhabited by an Arian race. Of the *Kāfirs*, who live in the inaccessible valleys of the *Hindūkūsh*, the writer of this paper has proved years ago that they are *Arians* and not *Tutārs*, (as it was supposed for a long time) and that they are speaking a language which can only be compared with the Prākrit of the

## 224 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

middle ages.\* We may therefore consider it now as fully established, that the *original home of the Arian race of India has been the northern mountain range, which is still inhabited by the descendants of the same people.* The supposed emigration of the Arians from *beyond* the Hindūkūsh (i.e., from the ancient Bactra or thereabout), which is now the favourite theory of our Sanskrit scholars, is perfectly gratuitous, and not borne out, or supported by any tradition. All we know from the Vēda is, that the Arians first lived in a cold, mountainous country, covered frequently with snow, that from the north they moved down into the Panjāb (Panch-nada) and gradually further towards the south, till they finally reached the ocean on the Bengal side; towards the south-west the Mahārāshtra (Marātha country) was their last settlement. But this emigration from the northern Himālaya and Hindūkūsh has by no means embraced the whole population originally settled there. They were only single tribes or clans who descended from their mountain fastnesses, and conquered, as a hard, sturdy race, the (apparently) weak and small-bodied aborigines of the low lands; just as the Afghāns, their brethren according to the flesh, have done it in later times. The settlements gradually increased, as we may well suppose, by new adventurers or clans from the hills joining their brethren in the fertile plains of India; and either necessity or a spirit of adventure prompted their movements towards the south. How long this process went on, nobody can tell in the absence of any chronological data or firm tradition. But after the Arians had been settled for centuries in the valley of the Ganges, and their whole mode of life had undergone a thorough change, their old home in the mountains of Northern India was forgotten in proportion as the connexion with it ceased. Their old warlike spirit gradually gave way, as they settled down to the peaceful pursuits of life, which soon brought them to a comparatively high degree of civilisation; and we need therefore not be astonished, if in later times their northern brethren, who having to contend with a rugged sterile soil had remained in primitive simplicity of life, and who, being shut out by high and often impassable mountains from contact with other nations, had retained also their primitive freedom unchecked by narrow caste-rules, were looked upon as *Mlēchas* (*Barbarians*), just as a Bengālī Babu of our days looks with horror on the savage and uncouth appearance of an Afridī of the Khaibar mountains. That there were native kingdoms in the countries of the Dardus, and some of them very flourishing, we know from the travels of the Chinese Buddhist Chi Fah Hian, who traversed these regions A.D. 400. They had all embraced

---

\* See my essay: *On the Language Caucasus.* Journal Royal Asiatic of the so-called *Kāfirs* in the Indian Society, 1861.

Buddhism, and were thereby brought again into close contact with their brethren in the plains. The further history of those regions is covered with darkness. We do not know how and by whom and when Buddhism was extirpated, and with it the little learning that was kept up in the Vīlāras or monasteries. The country was overrun by Tātār tribes, and the people embraced Islām, but they were not or could not be expelled from their mountain fastnesses. The only Tātār tribe, which has effected a permanent settlement in the Dardu country, are the *Khajuna*; for their language is not Arian, but of Tātār origin.

In the first part of the Dardistān, Dr. Leitner gives us specimens of four Dardu dialects, the *Ghilgitī* and *Astōrī*, which are comprehended under the common name of *Shinā*, the *Arūyīū* and *Kalāsha Mānder*. No doubt there are many more dialects in those mountainous districts, as the difficulty of intercourse favours particularly the formation of new dialects amongst people, who have no literature and therefore no standard of language.

We shall try to exhibit in the following lines the chief grammatical features of these Dardu dialects.\*

I. *The declensional process.*

II. *The terminations of nouns.*

Nouns in the Dardu dialects have on the whole the same terminations as in the North-Indian vernaculars. Most nouns end in a consonant, the Prākṛit termination *ō* having first been shortened to 'u' (as in the old Hinduī) and then dropped altogether; e. g., *rōsh*, anger, (p. 1.) Hindi *rōsh*; *ūtsh* (= *ich*), bear (*Shinā*), *Kalāsha Mānder ūtz*, *Arūyīū ōrtz*, Hindi *richh*, Sanskrit *riksha*; *dēs*, day (p. 2), *Ghilgitī dēs*, *Astōrī, bāsan* (perhaps *bāsa*?) (*Kalāsha Mānder*, Sanskrit *divasa* and *vāsara*). The old Prākṛit termination 'ō' seems at the same time to have been retained in some nouns, just as in Sindhī and the old Hinduī, where it is still optional to let the noun end in a consonant or in 'ō', as *manūjjō* man (Sanskrit *manushya*; the Prākṛit assimilation is *manussō*; the transition of s, ss into j, jj is borne out by the cognate dialects, for instance, Sindhī *hanju* goose, Sansk *hansa*). Dr. Leitner gives too few examples of nouns ending in 'ō', so that no safe conclusion can be ventured upon. The termination 'ō' seems to have

\* The phonetic laws of the Dardu dialects are very interesting, but we must forego them here, as they would lead us too much into details. Suffice it to notice, that no aspirates are to be found, and if we are to rely on the correctness of the orthography given, no cerebrals either. The latter point, however, must be left open as yet; if it should be fully proved, that

these dialects contain no cerebrals, a far-bearing conclusion could be drawn from it. The Pushtō has no aspirates, but the whole cerebral row; the Persian, as it is well known, has already dispensed with both aspirates and cerebrals. With the old Bactrian (the so-called Zend) the matter stands differently.

been changed already to ā, as it is now common in *Hindī* and *Panjābī*; e.g., *phalā* apple (*i.e.*, fruit) in Ghilghitī, *phalō* in Astōrī (p. 1.) Though Dr. Leitner mentions nothing of the *gender* of nouns, we may safely assume that *phalā* is *masculine*, as in *Hindī* and its sister dialects; and that the *neuter* has been dropped in the Dardu dialects and transferred (at least for the greatest part) to the *masculine*, as it is now the case in the northern vernaculars (*phalam* being *neuter* in Sanskrit). The matter is different with nouns like *rā* (p. 35) King, Astōrī *rāsh* (perhaps *rāz*); for this is the Sanskrit *rājā*, Prākṛit *rā-ā* and contracted *rā*. In Astōrī, on the other hand, the final (original ā) is dropped, and the *palatal j* changed (as I fancy) to *z* or *zh* (by no means *sh*), a change which is quite common to the Pushtō (and to the Marāthī likewise), and is also borne out by the *Panjābī*. In the same way is to be explained *kā*, a crow (p. 2), Sanskrit *kāka*; *Panjābī*, *kāu*; contracted, *kā*. We see from these few examples that the same Prākṛit rules, which have been operating in the modern Arian idioms, apply equally to the Dardu dialects.

Dr. Leitner says nothing about *feminine* nouns, but we may safely infer that nouns like *nāō*, boat (*Hindī* and *Panjābī*, *nāō*; Sanskrit, *nau*)—*ātī*, bone (Sanskrit *asthi*, *neuter*; *Hindī*, *haddī f.*; old *Hindī* *asti m.*)—are *feminines*. We find also nouns terminating in long *i*, which are, according to all analogy, *feminine*, as, *atshī*, eye (Sanskrit अक्षि; *neuter*, *Panjābī* *akkhī*, *fem.*; *Sindhī*, *akhi*, *fem.*). Nouns ending in *i* and *ī*, however, may be *masculine* and *feminine*, as *agāi*, sky (Sanskrit *akāsha*, *Panjābī* *akās* or *agās*, *m.*; in *agāi*, the final *s* is dropped, and after long ā a euphonic *i* affixed, as in *khudāi*, God); *giri*, mountain (p. 6, explained by *great stone*, but apparently signifying a *rock*=mountain) Sanskrit, *giri*, *m.*; *Hindī* and *Panjābī* likewise *masc.* The terminations *ū* and *u* likewise may be no doubt equally applied to *masc.* and *fem.* nouns, though the nouns contained in the list are all (very likely by chance only) *masculine*. Thus we find (p. 4) *patu*, leaf (should no doubt be written *pattu\**); Sanskrit *patra* (*n.*); *Hindī*, *pattā* (*m.*), *Panjābī*, *patt* or *pāt*. In this case the 'a' is the shortened Prākṛit termination *ō*, as already alluded to. The same is the case with *barā-u* (p. 4) husband; Sanskrit *bhartār* (*bhartṛi*), Prākṛit *bhattārō*; the assimilating process has been somewhat different in Ghilghitī=*bharā-u*=*barāu*. An example of a noun (*m.*) ending in *ū*, is *shū* (p. 2) dog; Sanskrit *shvan* (*shun*). If nouns are exhibited in the list ending in *é*, *e*, we are inclined to consider them as mistakes; they are in all probability *plurals*, as will be seen afterwards. In the same way the spelling of words with a final 'y', as *day* (p. 1), *beard*, is

---

\* Or *pātu*.

apparently the same as that with final *i* or *ī* = *dāi* (=Hindī *dārhī* ; Sanskrit, दाहिन्). We find thus, that the terminations of Dardu nouns are essentially the same as in the North-Indian Vernaculars.

## 2. The Formation of the Plural.\*

From the examples given on pp. 35, 36, and 37 we can draw the following inference. There are only *two* methods of forming the plural in the Dardu dialects, that of *masculine* and *feminine* nouns.

*Masculine* nouns ending in a consonant form their plural (*nominative*) by adding the termination *ī†* ; as *bāl*, a boy, plural *bāl-ī*, boys ; *batt*, a stone (Hindī *patthar* ; Sanskrit, *prastara*) plural *batt-ī*. The same rule seems to hold good with reference to nouns ending in *ā*, as *rā*, king, plural *rāj-ī* (where very likely for the sake of euphony original *j* has been restored). An exception from this rule make nouns in *ō*, which form their plural by changing final *ō* to *ē*, as : *manujjō*, man, plural *manujj-ē*. This, however, requires further confirmation.‡ The Astōrī dialect seems quite to agree, as regards the formation of the plural, with the Ghilghitī, The Arnyā dialect, however, deviates considerably from the Ghilghitī and Astōrī in this respect ; for we find (p. 35) *sing. mitēr*, king, plural *mitērān* ; *hōst*, (Hindī, *hāth* ; Sanskrit, *hasta*) hand, plural *hōstār* (but is *hōstār* not a misprint or mistake for *hōstān* ?) Both these methods of forming the plural are very remarkable.

The termination *ī* has no analogy in any of the Indian vernaculars sprung from the Sanskrit, nor in Prākṛit, less still in Sanskrit. We may, however, be allowed to assume, that the Dardu plural ending in *ī* corresponds to the termination *ē*, which is used in the inferior (more vulgar) Prākṛit dialects, such as the Ardhamāgadhī (cf. Lassen, *Institutiones Linguae Prākṛiticae*, pp. 412, 5). We know from the Prākṛit grammarians, that already in Māgadhī the termination *a=ō=u* of the nominative singular was changed to *ē* ; which is fully borne out by the old Hinduī of the middle ages, where nouns which end now in a consonant frequently adopt the termination *i=ē*. The Dardu plural termination *ī* may be a remnant of it. The Pushtō, which is likewise an Arian tongue and closely allied to the Prākṛit idioms of India, comes very near the Dardu plural formation, all Pushtō nouns, ending in the nominative singular in *ai* (=ō=Māgadhī *ē*) forming their plural by changing *ai* to *ī*.

\* The Dardu have in all likelihood is this long or short? We have dropped the *Dual* just as their sister-idioms in the plains. taken it as long *i*.

† We find also (p. 37) *phunēr*, ‡ Dr. Leitner writes only *i* or *ī* ; flower ; plur. *phunēr*, flowers.

## 228. *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

The Arnyiā plural termination ān finds its analogy in Pushtō and Persian; in both languages nouns ending in a consonant, affix in the plural the syllable ān (though in Persian now restricted to nouns denoting animate beings). It is generally agreed upon, that this termination ān is originally the Sanskrit plural accus. ān. From the few examples given of the Kalāsha dialect, it would appear that Kalāsha nouns do not affix a plural termination at all, a circumstance which will require further investigation.

*Feminine* nouns form, according to the two examples given (p. 37), their plural in ē; as, tshēi (Sanskrit, strī, old Hindui, tria or tia), plural, tshēyē; dī, daughter (Hindī, dhī or dhiyā; Sindhī dhia; Prākrit धीदा or दीया; Sanskrit दुहिता), plural dijār-ē (very likely for diyār-ē; for the Sindhī also forms the plural of dhia in dhiara=Sanskrit duhitarah). This plural formation is quite in accordance with the usage of the North Indian vernaculars (ē=ēn.) ||

### 3. *The Formation of Cases: Case-affixes.*

\* The modern Indian vernaculars of Sanskrit origin (as well as the Pushtō and the Persian), have for the greatest part lost the power of case-inflexions. The Prākrit is already very deficient in this point; and the idioms, sprung from the Prākrit, have gone gradually a step farther, till they have lost (with few exceptions) every sign of a (grammatical) case-inflexion, and were consequently compelled to make up for this loss by using or substituting *adverbs* (now called *postpositions*) in lieu of the original inflexions. It is very remarkable, that the Dardu dialects have also in this respect closely followed the footsteps of the other Prākrit idioms, though they have occasionally beaten out a path of their own.

The *affix* denoting a *dative* relation is t or tē; as, rā-t to a king; rājō-t, to kings; hatē-tē, to a hand; hatō-tē, to hands. It is very interesting, that the same affix is used in Pushtō, where it is tah. We cannot doubt a moment that this t, tē, or Pushtō tah is the Hindī tāi (now taīq); Sanskrit, स्थाने (Loc.), signifying literally *in the place*, =to. The other prepositions given (p. 35) likewise agree with the Hindī; as sāti, with (=sāth; in sāti we have still the old locative); majjā (better written majjā, the Hindī and Sindhī majjb)=Sanskrit, मध्ये in.)

The *accusative* is apparently identical with the nominative, as in all the modern Sanskritical vernaculars. An *instrumental* is not given under the noun, but we shall find one under the pronoun and see that its form is kātsh. The *ablative* relation

\* Compare on this point my essay *ed with the Sanskrit, Pāli, and Prākrit. Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society.* 1862.

is expressed in Ghilghitī by the postfix jō (to be pronounced shō, or rather zhō), which we do not hesitate to identify with the Hindi postposition **से** (old Hinduī **सिउ**) *from*, which corresponds to the Prākrit ablative affix **तो**(=Sanskrit **तस्**)\*.

It is very well known (what gave our first Hindī and Hindūstānī grammarians so much unnecessary trouble), that the modern (Sanskrit) vernaculars, along with the other case-inflexions have also lost the *genitive*. They made up for this case in a very easy and ingenious way, by turning the noun, logically standing in a genitive case-relation, into an *adjective*, by adding to it the adjective affix **kā**, fem, **kī**, (Sanskrit **इक**) ; for this very simple reason **kā** (or rather the adjective formed by **kā**) agrees with its governing substantive in *gender*, *number*, and *case*, as all other adjectives, which are flexionable, do. The Hindī cannot say, *the house of the Lord*, but only **साहिब का घर**, in Latin, *dominus domus*, the lordly house, the Latin affix *icus* being absolutely identical with **kā** (ikā.) In all the northern idioms this method of making up for the lost genitive has been adhered to, though the adjective affix used for this purpose varies. We find thus **kā**, **chā**, **jā**, **jō**, **gā**, **rā**, **nā**, and **dā** in use ; the last (used in *Panjābī*) being originally identical with the Sanskrit ablative affix **तस्** (Prākrit **दे**), but in spite of this turned into an adjective affix. The Pushtō, the nearest neighbour to the *Panjābī*, uses likewise **da**, with the only difference, that it is used as an (indeclinable) *prefix*.

It is very remarkable, that the Dardu dialects differ in this respect from their sister idioms in the plains, they having retained the old Prākrit genitive case of the singular ; which, not being treated as a common affix, has not been transferred to the genitive of the plural. In Ghilghitī the genitive affix is **ē** or **éy** for the singular ; as ; **rā-e**, of a king, **hat-éy** (**éi**) of a hand, **son-ēi**, of gold, *etc.* The Prākrit genitive singular ends in **अस्** (=अस्), which in the inferior dialects has already been contracted to **से** and thence to **हे** **hē**. In the old Hinduī the genitive singular still frequently ends in **हि**. We believe that the Ghilghitī affix **ē** is identical with this **हे** or **हि** ; **éi** seems only to be a euphonic change of **ē**. In the Astōrī dialect we find (p. 35) the genitive singular **rājō** ; but this must be a misprint, as on p. 36 we find the genitive singular **son-éi**, of gold, **hat-éi** of a hand. The *Arnyā* genitive singular ending in **u** (perhaps only shortened for **ō**) looks very curious, and we are at a loss how to account for it. In the *Kalā-*

\* We do not know how to account for the Astōrī abl. affix **nyō** the old Hinduī **दे** which signifies *from* and for the *Arnyā* *sār*. The *Kalā-* *sha* affix **pi** may be compared with the old Hinduī **पि** which signifies *also from*.



## 230. *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

*sha* dialect, on the other hand, we meet with the genitive singular (and dative) *shā-as*, which tends greatly to confirm our surmise respecting the origin of the Ghilghitī genitive singular affix *ē*. For there can hardly be a doubt, that the affix *as* corresponds to the Prākṛit genitive *अस*, as we still find it in the Kapur-di-giri rock inscriptions. In Prākṛit the *dative* is already completely lost, and its functions transferred to the genitive; which will easily account for the circumstance that in *Kalāsha* the same affix serves also to express the dative case.

The genitive *plural* ends in Ghilghitī and Astōrī in *ō*, which is, as we shall presently see, also the termination of the *formative plural*. This affix *ō* we take for the Prākṛit genitive plural *āṇa* (Sindhī *ani* and Panjābī *āṇ*, Hindi *oṇ*, final *n* having been dropped in the Shinā dialects, whereas it is preserved in the *Arnyā*, as *miterān*. That in the *Kalāsha* dialect the plural should in all the oblique cases be identical with the singular, is hardly credible.

In Hindī and its cognate dialects a certain number of nouns (especially those ending in *ā*, *ō*, *etc.*, which for brevity's sake we cannot detail here) subject the final *vowel* to certain changes before the accession of the case-affixes; which has been generally (but wrongly) called the *oblique case*, and which we will call, as it is no case at all, but only serves as a *base* for certain cases, the *formative*. In the singular, nouns ending in a consonant attach, in Hindī, *etc.*, the case-affix, without any further change, as *ghar-kā*, *etc.*; but on the other hand, *betō-kā* (from *betā*), with change of final vowel. In the formative plural we find throughout the termination *ōṇ*; as, *gharōṇ kō*, *etc.* That this formative plural is originally the Prākṛit genitive plural can hardly be questioned.

The Dardu dialects differ but little from this. They use the *genitive singular* and *plural* as *formative* for the other cases. In the singular only the final (euphonic) *i* is dropped; as *hat-ēi*, of a hand; formative, *hat-ē*, *hatē-tē*, *hātō-sāti*, *etc.*; *manujj-ēi*, of a man; formative, *manujjē*, *manujjē-jō*, from a man. In *rā-te*, *etc.*, final *ē* seems to be dropped only for euphony's sake.

The final *ē* of the formative singular, however, may also be a *euphonic* addition to facilitate the accession of the case-affix; or it may be considered as the original termination of the noun (old Hindui) dropped in the nominative, but restored again as soon as the noun receives an accession in the form of an affix. Nouns ending in a vowel (except *ō*) would then remain unchanged in the formative singular; as, *rā-te*, *rā-jō*, *tshē-jō*; or they would add *e* before the accession of the case-affix, as, *tshē-e-tē*. According to the examples given, both forms seem to be in use. Nouns ending in *ō* (=Hindī *ā*) change final *ō* to *ē* in the formative singular (just as in Hindī, *etc.*), in whatever way the formative singular may be explained. The formative *plural* ends uni-

formly in ō (Hindī ōñ) ; as rāj-ō, hātō, tshēy-ō (with euphonic y interpolated), bāl-ō, *etc.*, final ā and ō being dropped before the formative plural termination. The *Astōrī* dialect seems to agree in this respect quite with the Ghilghitī ; for we find there formative singular, rājā-te, plural rājō ; putsh<sub>2</sub>e, putsh-ō, *etc.* It is true, that under the head of the genitive singular (the formative) we find different forms, such as bāl-ā ; but this is obviously a mistake.

The declensional features of the Dardu dialects are therefore essentially the same as those of the North Indian vernaculars. Many points still remain doubtful, but on the whole we may rest assured that the forms given by Dr. Leitner may be safely relied upon, as they are fully borne out by their sister idioms in the plains. It would be an absolute impossibility to give a detailed description of so many dialects, hitherto totally unknown, within the space of a few months. May others, who may have in future the chance of visiting those regions, fill up with the same circumspection and perseverance, as Dr. Leitner did in giving us these first outlines, the gaps which still remain ; and we shall soon be able to put at the side of the modern Indian vernaculars of Sanskrit origin old sister-dialects, which will throw a new light on the decomposition or transition of the old Prākṛit into the present idioms.

#### 4.—*The Numerals.*

The numerals, of which only the *cardinals* are given, are altogether identical with those of the Prākṛit idioms of India ; only the laws of assimilation of conjunct consonants and of elision of single consonants differ to some extent, as might be expected. We find thus in Ghilghitī : ēk, one, dō, two, which we may dismiss without any remark. The form trē, three, differs from the Hindī tīn (=Prākṛit, tinnī) and goes back to the Sanskrit tri ; in Sindhī we find likewise trē ; tshār (=chār) four ; pōn, five, (instead of panch) shows a peculiar assimilation ; sāth, seven ; atsh, eight (Sanskrit asht=ash=ach), which is not without Prākṛit analogy ; nau, nine ; dāi, ten. This form is again peculiar ; Sanskrit, dasha ; Prākṛit, dasa (Hindī, das) ; Sindhī, dāha. In Ghilghitī this form has been lengthened to dāh, and instead of h, which is likewise dropped, short i (as I take it) has been affixed. The numbers from 11-19 show a remarkable contraction ; akāi, eleven ; bāi, twelve ; tshōi, thirteen ; tshaundēi, fourteen ; panzēi, fifteen. At first sight these numerals are quite puzzling ; but tshaundēi fortunately lets us have a glance into their composition. We must therefore commence with the analysis of this numeral. The Sanskrit form is chatur-dasha, Prākṛit chaddaha (thence the Hindī chaddah ; the Ghilghitī form goes back to the Prākṛit chaddaha (with

## 232 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

the interpolation of a nasal = chaun-) changing at the same time dāi (=daha) to dēi. We see from this process that akāi and bāi, as well as tshōi (chōi) stand for ak-dāi; Sanskrit, ēkādashā; Prākrit, ēāraha; Hindī, ikārah or yāraha:—ba-dēi (Sanskrit dva—dashā; Prāk it, va-raha, hence Hindī bārah):—tshō-dēi (Sanskrit, trayō-dashā; Prākrit, tēraha; Hindī, tērah) which is, as Dr. Leitner indicates under the *Āstōri*, nearly to be pronounced as trōi-dāi, a form, which solves at once all difficulty; panz-ēi=panz-dāi. The following numerals, shōnj, sixteen; satāj, seventeen; ashtāins, eighteen; and qunī, nineteen, are again quite peculiar. The Sanskrit form for sixteen is, shōdashā, which has become in Prākrit sōlahā (thence Hindī sōlah). The Ghilghiti has here left the trace of the Prākrit, and gone back again to the original Sanskrit, by contracting shōdashā into shōnj (instead of shōns), the palatal sh having been changed for euphony's sake to j. In the same way must be explained satāins, Sanskrit saptadashā (but Prākrit sattaraha); and ashtāins, Sanskrit ashtād-dashā (Prākrit, atthāraha). As regards qunī, nineteen, we cannot help thinking that there must be some mistake about it. The Sanskrit is ūnavinshati (one less than twenty; Latin, un-de-viginti); Prākrit (ūṇvīśai=ūṇṇīśai (assimilated), thence Hindī unīs, Sindhī unīha (or univīha). But where shall the q come from?

Is perhaps q a euphonic augment to facilitate the pronunciation of initial u?—for in the root itself it has no foundation. If so, this had to be shown in the laws of sound, peculiar to the Dardu dialects.

Bī, twenty, is already explained (= Sindhī vīha=vīh). Strange it is that bī, when compounded with another numeral, becomes biga, as biga-ēk, twenty-one. The Indian vernaculars offer no analogy to this, but we know from other sources, that the Sanskrit palatal sh is changed to k and g; for instance the Sanskrit shvan, dog, becomes in Greek κύων; and the very numeral vinshati, twenty, has been changed to viginti in Latin. There can therefore be hardly any doubt about the correctness of the form biga. Most curious it is, that the other tenths are made up by *multiplication* and *addition*, and that the original Sanskrit-Prākrit numerals are dropped altogether. The very same phenomenon we meet with in the language of the *Siāh Pōsh Kāfirs*\* in the Hindu Kush, who are likewise sprung from the great Arian stock. We find thus biga-dāi, twenty and ten=thirty; dubiō (=du biha), twice twenty=forty; du biōga-dāi, twice twenty and ten=fifty; tshē biō, three times twenty=sixty; tshē biōga-dāi=three times twenty and ten=seventy; tshār biō, four times twenty=eighty; tshār biō dāi, four times twenty and ten=ninety. We do not know how to explain this fact; for there can be no doubt that the Dardu races had

\* See my essay on the Language of the so-called Kāfirs.

originally the Sanskrit-Prākṛit numerals.\* Why did they drop them? We can hardly fancy that they dropped them for convenience sake, for it is far more troublesome to make up for original numerals by multiplication and addition, than to express them by one noun. But not only among the Dardu races and their brethren, the Kāfirs in the Hindukush, we meet with this strange fact; the same phenomenon may also be observed in the decomposition of the Latin into the Gallico-French (*not in Italian or Spanish*), as quatre-vingt, four times twenty=eighty; quatre-vingt-dix, four times twenty and ten=ninety. We see thus, that when an old language is once giving way and going to pieces (which is generally the case amongst great commotions or in times of great ignorance), essential parts of it may be lost which can no more be recovered,

In *shal*, one hundred, Sanskrit शत, Prākṛit सद or सख (thence Hindī sau) we find, that final t (d) has been changed to l. The change of d to l is very common in Pushtō, and consequently we find there also the form sil or sal for one hundred (similarly, las, ten=das.) For a hundred thousand the Indian lāk (without aspiration of k, as indicated above) is in use.

Only a few *ordinals* are given in the list (p. 8).

Muchino or yarr, first. We suppose that muchino is perhaps a derivation from the Sanskrit मुख (Hindī मुख or मुखि) in front, first, though we cannot speak with any degree of certainty. We confess that we do not know what to make of yarr, as we are not able to lay our hands on any analogous form in the cognate idioms. The following numerals are erroneously put down as ordinals; dogūnō is not *the second*, but *twofold* (Panjābī, dugunā); similarly, tshēgūnō is *threefold*, tshār gunō, *fourfold*. Pōn and shā can apparently not be the *fifth* and *sixth*, as there would be no difference whatever between the cardinals and ordinals, which is by no means likely. Biga-gūnō (so very likely it should be written instead of biga egūnō) is likewise *twentyfold*, and not the *twentieth*.

Trang, *half*, is rather curious. We suppose it is derived from the Sanskrit अर्ध *half*, and अर्ध-part or share = अर्धांश; initial a has been elided=dhrāns'h=trang (by transition of (अ into k, g.)

Once is ēk dam, twice dō dam, *i.e.*, one breath, two breaths; apparently a later formation, ۛ being of Persian origin. The other Dardu dialects offer few variations from the Ghilghiti. Under the Astōrī we have only to notice, that two is du (instead of dō; five

\* One circumstance, however, is not to be lost sight of, that even the original Sanskrit numerals for twenty, thirty, &c., are made up by multiplication. But we can hardly suppose that the Dardu races were conscious of this fact.

## 234 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

pōsh (instead of pōn; eight asht (instead of ātsh); fifteen, paziley (instead of panzéi), lei being apparently only an alteration for déi.

The Arnyā offers more differences. One is ī (with elision of k); two is djū; and the same form is put down for twelve. There must be some mistake about these forms; for it is not likely that the Arnyā should not distinguish between two and twelve. With regard to the other numerals it may be observed, that a is generally changed to ō, as tshōr, four (instead of chār); sōt, seven (= सप्त), ōsht, eight (= asht). For *ten* we find the form djōsh (how is this to be pronounced?). Is dj=simple j (ज)? We can hardly believe this; how should simple d (द) become j? We do not remember that any such change occurs in any idiom derived from the Sanskrit-Prākrit. We forego, therefore, any surmise on this form, as we doubt its correctness. Twenty is bīshir in Arnyā (in Persian بیست bīst=bīsil=bīsir or bīsil), final t having been again changed to l and thence to r. The same we find in the Pushtō شل shil. This our derivation is fully borne out by shōr, one hundred, Ghilghitī shal, l being changed again to r in Arnyā. The Kalāsha numerals offer also a few peculiarities. Ten is dash; but eleven dajē-ga; and twelve, dajē-dūa. We see that in these two forms the original (palatal) sh is again dropped (being first changed to h) and the encliticum je\* (and) affixed. The following numerals are very much mutilated; tria, thirteen; tshaua, fourteen; pondja, fifteen; shōa, sixteen; satta, seventeen; ashta, eighteen; nōa, nineteen. They are all formed on the same plan, and final a only expresses the number *ten*. This can only be explained in this way, that dash has lost the initial d (which is quite in accordance with Prākrit usage), and that final s (sh) was changed to h (as Sindhī daha) and then dropped altogether. It is very remarkable, that the Kalāsha has formed in this way a *new* form for *nineteen* (nōa), leaving the trace of the Sanskrit and Prākrit. *Twenty* is bīshi (=bīs), and twenty-one, bīshje ek, twenty and (=je) one.

### 5.—*The Pronouns.*

#### a.—*The Pronoun of the First Person.*

The declensional scheme of this pronoun is the following in Ghilghitī:

#### SINGULAR.

Nom. mā, and (as we can see from the verb, p. 21) *mas* in the feminine. Formative, mā.

---

\* We have no doubt, that je is the in the old *Hindui*. Sanskrit ज, and, still to be met with

Genitive (mē-i?), or pronominal adjective, mēyō ; fem mēyī  
my, mine.

Dative	mā-tē, to me.
Accusative	mā, me.
Instrumental	mā kātsh, by me.
Ablative	mā-jō, from me.

PLURAL

Nominative	bē (or) bēs, we.
Formative	assō.
Genitive	assē-i, of us ; our
Dative	assō-te, to us.
Accusative	?
Instrumental	assō-kāts'h, by us.
Ablative	assō-jō, from us.

The form mā, f., is borne out by the Sindhī ; in old Hinduī we find also the form मोहि, mōhi (the Prākṛit is म॒हं हं and म॒हनि). It is, however, very probable that mā (like मोहि) is originally the *accusative*. The formative mā is likewise identical with the Sindhī formative singular māñ, mōñ (or mūñ), corresponding with the Sanskrit acc. मा, me. We do not hesitate to put down mē-i as a genitive, as such a form is very likely to occur.\* The pronominal adjective mēyō and fem mēyī is quite peculiar to the Ghilghitī and Astōrī. The Sanskrit possessive adjective is मदीय (from which the Latin *meus* has sprung), which has been totally given up by the modern Indian idioms ; they have formed an adjective of their own in its stead, mē-rā, mine, by adding the adjective-affix rā to the original genitive mē, which is still frequently used in old Hinduī (rā = kā †), though now quite out of use.

The plural bē or bēs is peculiar too. It is a contraction from the Sanskrit वय, vayam, Prākṛit, वयं. The modern Indian idioms have mostly had recourse to the other Prākṛit form वय्हे, we (thence *ham*) ; derived from a Sanskrit (obsolete) root, वयस् (thence the Sindhī asīñ ; Panjābī, also asīñ). In the formative, however, the Darḍu dialects exhibit the same root, assō (very likely to be written asō only) ; Sindhī, asāñ, Panjābī, asā ; Prākṛit, amh ; thence the Hindī *ham* in the formative also.

We are very happy to detect in this declensional scheme for the first time an *instrumental*, which is expressed by the post-position kātsh (Astōrī, kātshi), rather a strange-looking form. What may this kātsh be, or how is it to be explained ? We find no analogous form in any of the cognate dialects which form their

\* Compare tē-i, of thee.

† We do not mean to say that rā is only a change for kā, but that it

is used *instead* of kā. Rā corresponds to the Prākṛit adjective-affix ia.

## 236. *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

instrumental in a different way. We suppose that *kātsh* is identical with काज (= Sanskrit कार्य), and ought very likely to be written *kāj*. We are confirmed in this supposition by the Dakhnī *kāj*, which is quite used as a sort of postposition and signifies by *reason of, for the sake of*. *Mā kāj* (for we will write it thus) denotes therefore *by my work*, which is a very fit circumscription of the instrumental case.

The Astōri dialect agrees on the whole with the Ghilghiti; only a few variations are to be noticed. Thus we find *mū*, *f.*, = *mā*; in the formative singular both forms, *mū* and *mā*, seem to be in use; as *mā-tē*, to me, and *mūkātshi*, by me.

The Arnyā forms, we confess, are for the greatest part quite unintelligible to us. *Awwā* (very likely only *awā*), is plain enough; it corresponds to the Sindhi *āun*, *f.*, the labial *m* having been changed to *v*, which is still quite a common thing in Panjābi. The formative singular is *mā*, as *mā-tē*; the instrumental *mā-nāse*, by me. What is this instrumental affix derived from? We do not remember any analogous form in the cognate idioms, and we do not therefore venture any surmise as to its origin or derivation. In the nom. plural we find *ispā*, we. This form might be explained by referring it to the Prākrit plural, अणे (derived, as shown, from an original Sanskrit form अस्म). It would appear, that the Arnyā retained the original form अस्म, changing the labial *m* to *p* and shortening initial *a* to *i*, which is quite possible. For the genitive plural we find *tshikkān*; for the dative *ispā-tshikkān*; for the instrumental, *tshikkāu-nāse*; for the ablative, *tshikkān-sār*. There must be some mistake about these forms, as is clearly seen by the so-called dative, *ispā-tshikkān*, which sounds very unlike an Arian form. Besides this, where is the postposition *tē*? What this *tshikkān* is we cannot tell; only so much is known, that it is a plural and that its singular must therefore be *tshikk* (or very likely, *tshik* = *chik*.) In the Kafir dialect we have the demonstrative pronoun *sigā*, this (derived from the Sanskrit स, with the adjective affix *ka*); and it may be very likely that *sigā* and *tshik* are the same. This our surmise is very much confirmed by the form *hē tshik*, which we find set down (p. 15) for the demonstrative pronoun they (fem.). *Ispā-tshikkān* would therefore signify *we here*.\* To all the other forms therefore, *ispā* has to be added; or rather, *tshikkān* is more or less a superfluous addition.

In the Kalāsha dialect we find *ā*, *f.*, an abbreviation from *awā*, or from the Prākrit अहं. In the genitive singular we meet with the form *māi*; which serves at the same time as formative for the

---

\* Or, *we all*, as it would appear.

other cases, the dative excepted. This māi corresponds to the Sanskrit accus. singular, मा, as noticed already above. In the dative we meet with the form mōtshes; Hindī, मुझे, Prākrit मज्झु; which has been dropped in the other Dardu dialects. The instrumental sing. is māi tada, by me; and the ablative māi pī; the origin or derivation of both these postpositions is unknown to us.\* The nom. plural is abī, we; very likely derived from the Prākrit अवे, by changing m to v=b, and dropping w; amē=ave or abē, and thence abī. In the formative plural, we find again hōmō (=ham, a being changed to ō). The dative plural is stated to be hōma, which must be left doubtful, as we cannot sufficiently elicit, from the few examples given, the formation of the dative in Kalāsha.

*b—The Pronoun of the Second Person.*

The declension of this pronoun in *Ghilghitī* runs thus:—

SINGULAR.

Nominative	tū, tūs, thou.
Formative	tū
Genitive	tēi, of thee, thy (or, tō, see Part II., p. 33).
Dative	tū-t, to thee.
Accusative	? (tū ?)
Instrumental	tū kātsh, by thee.
Ablative	tū-jō, from thee.

PLURAL.

Nominative	tzō, you (or tzōs; fem. tzās; see p. 21)
Formative	tzō.
Genitive	tzā-i, of you; your.
Dative	tzō-te, to you,
Accusative	? (tzō ?)
Instrumental	tzō kātsh, by you.
Ablative	tzō-jō, from you.

Tū is the regular Hindi form; and tūs, like mās, is only a dialectical variation.† The genitive tē-i corresponds to the Sanskrit-Prākrit genitive ते. In the formative sing. the form tū is retained.

The nom. plural tzō (which, however, ought to be written tsō, as z can only be joined to a *mediu* and not to a *tenuis*,) is peculiar. The Prākrit is तुहे (formed from the case तु or रब and ह), like अस्स; this has become tusī in Panjābī (in Sindhī, tavhīn or

\* Pt might be compared with the नहोइ, from me no answer is made.  
old Hindi मै, which signifies not only upon, but also from. So says the original pronominal affix sm lingering?  
for instance Nām dev: नो मै अबार



## 238. *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

tahīn) ; in Pushtō *تاس* tāse ; and in Ghilghitī *tsō*. In the formative plural the Panjābī *tusīn* becomes *tusān* (Sindhī *tavhān* or *tahān*) ; and in the Ghilghitī genitive *tzā-i*—*i* being, as indicated, the genitive affix, which in the pronouns seems to have been transferred to the genitive plural likewise. The genitive sing. (*tēi*, like *mā-i*) is to be traced back to the (original) Sanskrit genitive, *मे, ते*.

The Astōrī on the whole agrees with the Ghilghitī. We only find in the genitive sing. the two variations, *tōo* for the masc., and *tei* for the fem. Under the pronoun of the first person, no such difference of gender is noted ; nor do we find any differences of gender in the other cases. It is therefore more than doubtful if any such difference of gender exists at all.

In the genitive plural we find likewise *tsō* for the masc., and *tsēi* for the fem. ; we have at present no means to decide on the correctness of these forms.

In the Arnyā dialect the nom. sing. is *tū*, and the formative and genitive *tā* (originally the accus. ; Sanskrit, *तवा* or *त्वा*, Prākrit, *तं*.) The nom., formative, and genitive plural is *bisa*. This leads us to a very interesting observation. The Sanskrit form is *यूयं*, *yūyam*, you ; which, as we have seen already, is abandoned in Prākrit (and in the modern idioms), and recourse is had to a new plural formation on the base *रव*, with the pronominal affix *स्म* (= Latin *met* ; as, *ego-met*, etc.) = *तुम्हे*. But besides the base *yū* (*yūyam*), we find in Sanskrit also the form *vas* (*वः*), though now only used in some cases of the dual and plural. In Latin the base *yū* is totally abandoned (though not in Greek, *ὕμεις*, *ὑμεῖς*, standing for *युष्मद्*), and *vas*=*vos* substituted in its stead. In Arnyā the old base *vas* has been preserved likewise, and corrupted (if we may say so) to *bisa*. But the base *vas* itself is no doubt identical again with the Prākrit form *तुम्हे*, derived as it is from the base *रव* and *स्म*. *Tva* is first assimilated (by transition of the initial *tenuis* to its corresponding media *d*) to *dva*, this again to *vva*=*va* or *ba*, and with the pronominal affix *sma* to *bas* (instead of *basmi*), the final *m* being dropped altogether. The same process of assimilation (which is quite in accordance with Prākrit usage) we find in the Sindhī *ba*, two, instead of *dva* ; even in Sanskrit, initial *dv* is occasionally assimilated to *v* ; as *विंशति*, twenty, instead of *द्विंशति* (two times ten, *शति शत्* being apparently an abbreviation for *दशति* and identical with *दशत्*). The Kalāsha nom. sing. is apparently *tū* ; though, by a misprint, we find in its place *hōmō*. What *tū* Kashalatai is, we do not venture to guess ; but whatever may be the meaning of Kashalatai, it has certainly nothing to do with the

pronoun of the second person. The formative and genitive sing. *tāi* (=tā=tvā). In the plural nom. we find the curious form *abs-tshikk*. That *tshikk* is very likely a demonstrative pronoun we have shown already; the pronoun itself would therefore only remain *abs*, you. In Sindhi we have, besides *tavhēñ* and *tahēñ*, also the form *avhēñ*; which apparently goes back to the pronominal base *vas* (*vasmī*) with euphonic initial *a*=*avhīñ*. Quite in the same way the Kalāsha *abs* is formed. In the formative plural we meet with *mimi*. We are at a loss how to account for this form. The only explanation that seems to offer itself is, that initial *m* is a change for *v*, so that *mimi* would stand for *vimi*. This brings us to forms like the Greek *ῥμεις*, *ῥμμες* (Ionian), which are derived from the Sanskrit base *युष्म* (=yu—sm).

c.—The Demonstrative Pronouns.

The Dardu dialects have no personal pronoun for the third person, as little as the Sanskrit-Prākṛit and the modern idioms derived from them; they use instead *Demonstratives*. Under the Ghilghiti, two demonstrative bases are given; *anu*, this, and *rō*, that. Their declension is as follows:

SINGULAR.

Nom.	anu, masc. ;	nē, fem., this;*	rō, masc. ;	rē, fem., that.
Form.	anēsē, "	nēsē "	rēsē, "	rēsē "
Gen.	anēsē-i, "	nēsē-i "	rēsē-i, "	rēsē-i, "
Dat.	anēsē-tē, "	nēsē-tē "	rēsē-tē, "	rēsē-tē, "
Accus. ?	...	...	...	...
Instrum.	anēsē kātsh, m. ;	nēsē kātsh, f.	rēsē kātsh, m. ;	rēsē kātsh, f.
Ab.	anēsē-jō, m. ;	nēsē-jō, f.	rēsē-jō, m. ;	rēsē-jō, f.

PLURAL.

Nom.	anē, masc.	nā, fem.	rī, masc. ;	rā, fem.†
Form.	aninō, "	ninō, "	rinō, "	rinō, "
Genit.	aninō-i, "	ninō-i, "	rinō-i, "	rinō-i, "
Dative	aninō-tē, "	ninō-tē, "	rinō-tē, "	rinō-tē, "
Accus.?	...	...	...	...
Instrum.	aninō kātsh, m.,	ninō kātsh, f.,	rinō kātsh, m.,	rinō kātsh, f.
Ablative	aninō-jō, "	ninō-jō, "	rinō-jō, "	rinō-jō, "

In Sanskrit the pronominal base *ana* is no longer found in the nominative, but only as a supplementary base to *इदं* (instr. sing. *अनेन*) ; but in Pāli and Prākṛit it is used in some of the oblique cases, which shows quite clearly that *अन* (Prākṛit *अय*) is an independent pronominal base.‡ This is fully corroborated by the Ghilghiti. In the Indian Prākṛit idioms this base has been entirely

\* Under the verb (p. 21) we find also masc. nus, he ; fem, nes ; rōs and rēs respectively.

† Or, rēs and rās ; see p. 21.

‡ Compare also the modern Persian *آن* that.

lost.\* The formative singular anēse we take for the original genitive=anasya (अनस्य), which serves still for the genitive case, only that i (= इ) has been added to it. The formative plural aninō would point to a Prākṛit form anānam, to which the Sindhī inauē corresponds. In the genitive i has been added, before which the final ō of the formative is changed to ē=aninē-ī.

Curious it is, that in the formative of this pronoun, initial a (the real pronominal base) has been dropped altogether; but we find this already done in Prākṛit (as अ for अहं); and in Pāli we have the nom. plural masc. nē and fem. nā, those.

The pronoun rō is quite peculiar, and no trace of such a base can be detected either in Sanskrit-Prākṛit nor in any of the modern idioms of Northern India. The only trace we have is the Hindī interjectional particle rē or arē, m., and rī, or ari, fem., in calling out to an inferior person. But in the old Hinduī arē and ari are used as a common interjectional particle, without involving any slight. The exact meaning of rē (arē) and rī (arī) has long been doubtful; and the change of gender in an interjectional particle made it very uncertain if rē and rī (arī) could at all be taken as such. Dr. Caldwell in his *Comparative Grammar of the Dravidian languages* claimed arē† for the languages of the South, explaining it by "slave?" Though it would be very curious, that a Dravidian word of this kind should have become a common vocative particle in the North of India, it does by no means explain how the change of gender could take place, which is quite uncommon in an interjectional particle. It is true, that अरे is already found as an interjectional particle in Sanskrit; but it is not to be overlooked, that it only occurs in the *later* Sanskrit, when Prākṛit had already become the common language of the people. There can therefore be hardly any doubt, that rō (rāī) is originally a pronoun, and that rē (rī feminine) is the vocative of it, denoting, *o, the one here!* The original base of this pronoun is *da* (or *ta*), in Prākṛit always *da* (as देण, दे etc.) We have seen already, that *d* is frequently changed to *l* (in Push-tō quite a common phenomenon) *da*=*la* and *l* to *r*=*ra* or *rō* (compare with this the Latin *ille*=*i-da* in Sanskrit; Greek *δακρυμα*=Latin *lacrima*.) But we have the very same form in Push-tō too, *viz.*, *ra* or *la*. In Push-tō we find in the *oblique* case of the pronoun of the first person अहं, to me, or अहं, literally, to this one.

The formative singular rēsē is to be explained in the same way

\* The Sindhī makes an exception for a—(n). But this is still doubtful, from this, as it has preserved in the sing. formative the form *ina*, *hina*, which may be identical with *ana*—supposing that *i*-(n) is only a change though Bopp takes it as such. † He compares it with the Telugu *arē* and the Tamil *adē* or *adā*, p. 440.

as anēṣē (i.e., = rasya). The plural masculine rī points to an original rē = tē, and ra (fem.) to tāh (Sanskrit तः). The instrumental singular and plural is the same for both genders.

In the *Astōrī* we find shōt as demonstrative pronoun, corresponding to the Sanskrit Prākṛit शो. The genitive singular is shosso = Sanskrit तस्य; in the form shosso the old Prākṛit genitive termination स ssa is most clearly distinguishable. The formative singular is shossē, o being depressed to ē, to facilitate the accession of the case-affixes. The nominative plural is shē (= Sansk. ते) for the distant, and nyō (= Ghilghitī anī) for the near demonstrative. Their respective genitive is shinē-i and aninē-i and their formative shino and aninō.

In the *Arnyiā* dialect the demonstrative pronoun is hē, fem. hes; genitive and formative singular masculine hatō, feminine horo; nominative plural masculine hamī, feminine he tshikk; genitive masculine hamitan, feminine likewise hamitan; the formative is identical with the genitive. The base hē is identical with sō (or shō\*) the genitive masculine hatō reminds us of the old Hindi where we likewise find तत्, hat, as formative singular (स having been hardened to t). The genitive feminine hōrō is peculiar. It strikes us that in the plural another pronominal base has been substituted; hamī comes nearest to the Sanskrit अमी (singular अमौ), and the genitive and formative plural hamitan can easily be identified with the Sanskrit genitive plural अमीषां s (= sh) having been changed to t, as in the singular. We do not know what to make of the nominative plural feminine he tshikk. We have already indicated above that tshikk is very likely a demonstrative base, but we must leave this for the present undecided.†

In the *Kalāsha* dialect the base āsā is given; which remains, as it seems, unchanged in the genitive singular and in the formative. The nominative plural shēli (com.) looks very curious. In the plural genitive we find isi, and in the formative āsi = shāsi. Asā we would identify with the Sanskrit demonstrative pronoun अमौ that, though the plural shēli remains for the present a riddle, which we have no means to solve.

#### 6.—The Verb.

The Dardu verb is full of interest, as we meet with many forms of which we cannot find a trace in the cognate idioms. We can see at the first glance, that the conjugation of the Dardu verb is

\* Dr. Leitner remarks expressly simply written it shō (properly zhō). that in jō, j is to be pronounced like † In the dialogues tshikk is once the French j; we have therefore translated by "all."

## 242 The Languages and Races of Dardistan.

richer in form, than most of its sister dialects in the plains of India, though the grand features of the conjugational process are the same. We should very much like to know, how the *causal* verb is formed ; for there can scarcely be a doubt, that the Dardu idioms are possessed of a *Causative*; there must also be a *Passive Voice* of some kind or another, but we cannot find any example of either. In the following lines we shall try to give a general survey of the conjugational process, in which many old forms, which are lost in Hindī, have been preserved.

### The Infinitive.

In *Ghilghitī* the *Infinitive* ends apparently in *ōki*, for all verbs given in the list, whatever their final root-vowel may be, have the termination *ōki*, as *arōki*, to bring (root *ar*); *tshakōki*, to see (root *tshak*). This termination is very puzzling. We know that the old Sanskrit infinitive termination *tum* has been lost in all the. Prākṛit idioms (and for the greatest part already in Prākṛit itself), and that the *verbal noun* ending in *ana* has been substituted for it ; so we find in Hindī *nā*, Sindhī, *aṇu*, Marāthī *anēñ*, *etc.* ; even in Pushtō the infinitive ends in *al* = *ana*. We see that the *Astōrī* quite agrees with this formation of the infinitive, for we find there instead of *arōki* the form *arēōnō* ; instead of *tshakōki*, *tshakeono*. The *Arnyā* and *Kalāsha* dialects seem to point on the other hand to the same form ; for we find in *Arnyā* for the *Ghilghitī* *arōki*, *angīko* ; and in *Kalāsha*, *ōnik*. The terminations *ōki*, *ikō* and *ik* are apparently only variations of the same affix. But what is this affix likely to be ? We find in Sindhī and in the old Hinduī the affix *kā*, feminine *kī* (=Sansk. *इक*) used in a similar way ; as, Sindhī *लुक्का*, to be tossed about, *लुक्की* the being tossed about ; old Hinduī, *कटिकी* s. f., deliverance, from *कुटना*. The affix *इक* forms originally adjectives ; and *लुक्की*, *etc.*, signifies therefore (as a *secondary* theme derived from *लुक्क*) *that which tosses about*\* and (as an *abstract* noun) *the tossing about*. The Infinitive as a verbal noun is therefore not the root of the verb ; this must be looked for in the *imperative*, as we shall presently see.

### 2.—The Participle Present.

The *participle present* is formed by adding the affix *ēta†* to the root of the verb, as *tshak-ēta*, seeing, *ē-ta*, coming (Inf. *ōki*, Imper. *ē*), *ar-ēta*, bringing, feminine *ar-ētī*. This agrees quite with

\* That forms like *tshakōki* are to be taken as *verbal nouns* may be seen from the phrase, *piōki kārē* (p. 31,) *for the sake of drinking*.

† Perhaps to be written *ētā*, fem.

*ētī*. We find also *ētā* ; is this another nominative form, or is it not a locative, as it is still in use in Hindī, as *bolētā*, in speaking ?

the old Hinduī, which likewise forms the participle present by the affix *ēta* or *ēda*, as *करेता* or *करेदा* now *करता* doing; we find already in Prākrit *करेन्त-करन्त* (Sansk. *अत, अन्त*). The original nasal has been dropped in this affix, and in its stead the preceding vowel (originally a) lengthened to *ē*, to keep up the quantity of the syllable. Afterwards *ē* was shortened to *i*, and then dropped altogether.

### 3.—*The Participle Past.*

The participle past is formed by adding *ē* to the root of the verb; as, *ar-ē*, brought; *tshak-ē*, seen; *gyē*, gone\* (p. 32). The Hindī forms its participle past by adding *ā* to the root of the verb; as, *देखा* *dēkh-ā*, seen. We know that the old Hinduī form is *देखिषा* *dēkh-iā*, as it is still to be found in Sindhī and Panjābī. *Dēkhīā* is a Prākrit form, instead of *dēkhitā* (by elision of *t*.) We find also a past participle ending in *lō*, as *bilō*, been (p. 18). In Marāthī *ta* (*ita*, the affix of the participle past in Sanskrit) has been regularly changed to *l*; and in Pushtō the past participle is either formed by *ai* (= *ā* or *ē*, with elision of *t*) or *alai* (= *ita*). Other forms of this participle, like *pī*, drunk, *rēy*, spoken, *bēy*, seated, are very likely only euphonic variations instead of *pī-ē*, *rē-ē*, *bē-ē*.

### 4.—*The Imperative.*

The Imperative is formed by adding *ē* to the root of the verb, as *ar-ē*, bring (Persian *آوردن* Imperative *آر* *ār*). The plural of the Imperative is nowhere given, but it seems to end in *eā*, as *areā* (p. 24). In the old Hinduī the Imperative still ends in *i* in the singular, and the same termination is preserved in Sindhī (at least for all transitive verbs.) The Imperative plural ends in *ō* or *ahu*. We find already in the lower Prākrit dialects forms like *करहि* or *करि*, do thou, and in the plural *करउ*, *kara-ū*, from which *karō* has been contracted. The Dardu plural Imperative ending in *ā* goes back to the Prākrit termination *aha*, which is the older form.

### 5.—*The Present or Subjunctive.*

In Ghilghiti the Present tense is conjugated as follows:—

#### SINGULAR.

- |        |           |                           |
|--------|-----------|---------------------------|
| 1. Mas | arēm,     | I bring, or, I may bring. |
| 2. Tus | arē m.    | } Thou bringest.          |
| „      | arēni f.† |                           |

\* It is, however, a question, if *arē* be not the participle past *conjunctive*, and the regular participle past *arēya*, etc., as it would appear from the *Preterite*, as exhibited hereafter.

† The second person feminine ending in *ē-ni* is quite peculiar; we are utterly at a loss how to account for it. Very likely it belongs to the *Present Definite*, which see.

3.	Ros Res	} arōi,	He She	} bring
----	------------	---------	-----------	---------

## PLURAL.

1.	Bes	arōn,	We bring,
2.	Tzōs Tzās	} areāt.	You bring.
3.	Rēs Rās	} aren,	They bring.

According to this paradigm the verbal terminations are *ēm*, *ē* and fem. *ēni*, *ēi* ; *ōn*, *eāt*, *ēn*, which are far nearer to the old Prākṛit than the terminations now in use in the North Indian vernaculars. The Prākṛit terminations of the Present tense run thus : *ami*, *asi*, *adi* or *a-i* ; *āmō*, *attha* or *adha* or *aha*, *anti*. In Ghilghitī these terminations have undergone very little change ; *ami* has become *ēm* (Persian *am*, Hindī *ūn*, Sindhī *ān*, Panjābī *ān*) ; *asi* has first become *ahi* and, with elision of *h*, *a-i=ē* (Persian *ē* or *i*, Hindī *ēn*, Sindhī and Panjābī likewise *ēn*) ; *ati*, Prākṛit already *a-i* (by elision of *d*) has only changed *a* to *ē=e-i* (but Persian still older *ad*) ; in Hindī, Sindhī, and Panjābī final *i* has already been dropped=*ē*. The Prākṛit plural termination *āmō* (*āmu*) has become *ōn*—Persian *īm*, Hindī *ūn*, Sindhī *ūn*, Panjābī *iyē* ; the Ghilghitī has thus managed to distinguish between the first person singular and plural, whereas in Hindī both persons have become alike ; *attha* has become *eāt*, which is very primitive—Persian also still *id*, whereas in Hindī, Sindhī, and Panjābī the Prākṛit termination *aha* has been changed to *ō*,—old Hindī *ahu* or *ahō*. The termination of the third person plural *anti* has become *ēn*—Persian, and. In all the North Indian vernaculars *t* has been elided, as Hindī *ēn*, Sindhī *ani* (=anti), Panjābī *an*.

As we see from other examples given, the Present tense serves also at the same time for the *Future*. From this circumstance we conclude, that also in the Dardu dialects the Present has become a *Subjunctive* or Aorist, as it is generally but very wrongly called ; that is to say, a tense which more or less corresponds to the Sanskrit *Potential* and has a wider range of meaning than the strict Present tense. Masculine *arēm*, etc., is therefore properly to be translated, I may or will bring. It is at any rate very remarkable that the Dardu dialects have made no attempt to form a new Future, after the proper Future tense had been altogether lost in the later Prākṛit dialects. The Pushtō has also retained the Present for the base of the Future, but at the same time added some distinguishing particle *aj* to mark it off as such ; whereas the North Indian vernaculars have followed a variety of methods to make up again a Future. Yet it is not to be lost sight of, that even the Hindī and Panjābī have formed their Future

on the base of the Present or rather Subjunctive ; for चलूंगा is nothing else than a compound tense=चलूंगा chalūṅgā ; literally, I am gone (गा गया) that I may go, that is to say I wish (will) to go.\* For this simple reason ḡā agrees as a participle past, with its subject in *gender* and *number*.

### 6.—The Present Definite.

This tense is conjugated in the following way :—

#### SINGULAR.

1.	Mas	arēmus,	m. }	I am bringing.
	„	arēmis,	f. }	
2.	Tus	arēno,	m. }	Thou art bringing
	„	arēni,	f. }	
3.	Ros	arēyen,	m. }	He is bringing.
	Res	arēyin,	f. }	

#### PLURAL.

1.	Bēs	arōnes, com.	We are bringing.	
2.	Tzōs m. }	areanet,	You are bringing.	
	Tzās f. }			
3.	Rēs m. }	arēnen,	They are bringing.	
	Rās f. }			

It is most remarkable, that the Dardu dialects distinguish in the terminations of the verb the *masculine* and *feminine*, which is not to be found in any of the cognate idioms. But this is only apparent ; in reality, as we shall see hereafter, all these forms are properly *participles*, to which the termination of the substantive verb “to be” accede so, that they really coalesce with them. *Arēmus* must be separated into *arem* and *us*, feminine *arem* and *is*. We see, on p. 18, that the Present of the substantive verb ‘to be’ is *hanus*, and feminine *hanis*, I am. These two forms are again compounded of *hanu* and *s*, feminine *hani* and *s*, *hanu* being the participle present (fem. *hanī*), to which the termination *s* (=asmi) accedes ; literally, I am being.† In the Dardu dialects the Present Definite is formed in the same way as in the Hindi, i.e., the Present of the substantive verb is added to the Subjunctive Present. In the Dardu the Present *hanūs hanis*, etc., is shortened in this way, as it appears, to *us*, *is*, etc. ; second person *nō*, *nē* or *ni* (=hanō masculine, feminine *hani*). The third person singular *arēyen*, masculine, and *arēyin* are rather puzzling ; according to all analogy, however, *en* must be the termination of the substan-

\* The Hindi Future is, therefore, besides *hanū-s*, etc., there must be some other form of the Present of the substantive verb in Dardu.

† We have hardly a doubt that

substantive verb in Dardu.



## 246 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

tive verb (feminine *in*). The *Astōrī* seems to point clearly to this; for there we find (instead of *hanu*) *hōn*, feminine *hēyn*. A similar termination must exist in *Ghilghitī* likewise; though, perhaps, now only used in *compound* verbs. In the first person plural (*arōn-es*) the termination *os* (*hanōs*) is shortened to *es*, which seems to be in use for both genders.

The form *areanet*, given for the second person plural, is apparently a mistake; the corresponding form of *bomus* (p. 20), has in the second person plural *beätt*; the substantive verb itself is *hanett*, according to which we should expect a form like *areat-et*, or so. We must leave this undecided, as unfortunately no other example is given, from which we might be able to draw a conclusion. In the third person plural, *arēn-en*, we find again the termination *en* (*com.*) as in the singular masculine.

### 7.—*The Imperfect.*

#### SINGULAR.

1.	Arémusus,	m.	}	I was bringing or brought.
	Arémisis,	f.		
2.	Tus aréso,	m.	}	Thou wast bringing.
	„ aréese,	f.		
3.	Ros aréso,	m.	}	He } was bringing.
	Res aréis,	f.		

#### PLURAL.

1.	Bes arónasis,	com.	We were bringing.	
2.	Tzōs } aréasit,		You were bringing.	
	Tzās }			
3.	Ris arēnis,	m.	}	They were bringing.
	Rās arēnisi,	f.		

That the form in question is an *Imperfect*, can hardly be doubtful. It is compounded of *arem-u-sus*, *etc.*, in the same way as the Present Definite is; with the only difference, that the Imperfect of the substantive verb is joined to it. This is (see p. 19) *asūs*, feminine *asis*, *etc.*, *asū* and its feminine *asī* being likewise participles (compare the Panjābī *sā*, feminine *sī*; Hindi *thā*, feminine *thī*), to which the Present of the substantive verb accedes (in its shortened terminations); this will sufficiently account for the (thus necessary) distinction of the two genders. The *u* between *arem* and *sus* is, to all appearance, only a *euphonic conjunctive* vowel, which varies according to the sequence of the vowels, therefore *arem-usus*, feminine *arem-i-sis*; the *a* of *asūs*, *asis*, *etc.*, seems to be dropped, when preceded by a vowel.

The second person singular feminine *aréese* is remarkable; according to analogy it should be *arési* or *arése*. In the third person

singular masculine arē-so (asū) final u is changed to o, the accent being drawn forward to arē. The feminine aréis is quite peculiar : it ought to be arēsi (are-asī). In the first person plural we find that the initial *a* of asīss, *etc.*, has been restored, as, arón-asis (asis). The second person plural aré-asit is a contraction from areāt-asit (asièt). In the third person plural masculine arēu-is, *is* seems to be a termination, only used when compounded with another verb, the absolute form being asē ; in the feminine arēn-*isi* the termination *isi* seems likewise to be a shortening of *asij*.

That our conjecture with reference to the formation of this tense is correct is corroborated by the *Astōrē*. There we find the forms arēmalus masculine, feminine arēmalis,\* *etc.* In *Astōrī* the Imperfect of the substantive verb is asillus (very likely only asīlus, as there is no reason for a double l), feminine asilis ; asilu, feminine asili, is the participle past, formed exactly (from अस to be) like the Marāthī असला (अ = त), to which the terminations of the substantive verb accede, as in Sindhī (hō-si), Marāthī (asal-ōñ).

This formation of the Imperfect, on the base of the Present with the addition of the Imperfect of the substantive verb, is quite peculiar to the Dardu dialects ; with regard to this tense they quite struck out a path of their own, being apparently guided by the formation of the Present Definite.

### 8.—The Preterite.

#### SINGULAR.

1.	Mas	arēgas,	m. }	I brought.
	"	arēgis,	f. }	
2.	Tus	arēga,	m. }	Thou broughtest.
	"	arēye	f. }	
3.	Ros	arēgu,	m. }	He }
	Res	arēyi,	f. }	She } brought.

#### PLURAL.

1.	Bes	arēyes,	com.	We brought.
2.	Tzōs } Tzās }	arēyet,		You brought.
3.	Ris } Rās }	arēye,		They brought.

It seems that there is only a *Preterite* or Aorist in the Dardu dialects ; a *Perfect* is at any rate, if it may exist, not given in the conjugational survey.

The form *arēga* seems only to be a euphonic change from arēya, the participle past. To this participle the terminations of the

\* The forms given on p. 23 are apparently misprints ; according to all analogy they should be written, as we have done.

## 248 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

substantive verb accede, as this is the case in the Sindhī Preterite First person masculine aréga-s, feminine arégi-s; Sindhī, si—as आयुसि āyu-se masculine, feminine आयसि āya-se, I am come; second person arégá masculine, feminine aréye; in Sindhī similarly, ēn masculine, an feminine, as: आय ēy-ēñ, आहस ai-añ, thou art come. In the third person singular, arēgu and aréyi seem to be mere participles, without a termination; arēgu being apparently another form of the participle past masculine. The plural of the participle past seems to be aréye, to which the terminations *es* and *et* accede, no distinction of gender being made in the plural. In the third person plural, we have only the plural of the participles without any termination. This is fully borne out by the *Astōrī*; where we have arā-s, arē-s (very likely ari-s, as elsewhere too), plural arés, feminine arē-es, etc.

It is very remarkable, that the participle past is used in the Dardu dialects in an *active* sense too, as in Persian, whereby they have managed to form a Preterite of the *active voice* from *Transitive* verbs; whereas in the idioms of Upper India a *passive construction* is resorted to, the past participle of *transitive* verbs having only a *passive* meaning. The only exception is made by the *Bungālī*, which has likewise used the past participle in an *active* sense.

### 9.—*The Pluperfect.*

#### SINGULAR.

- |    |     |           |      |                     |
|----|-----|-----------|------|---------------------|
| 1. | Mas | arégasus, | m. } | I had brought.      |
|    | „   | arégasis, | f. } |                     |
| 2. | Tus | arégaso,  | m. } | Thou hadst brought. |
|    | „   | arégise,  | f. } |                     |
| 3. | Ros | arégasu,  | m. } | He }                |
|    | Res | arégasī,  | f. } | She } had brought.  |

#### PLURAL.

- |    |        |            |      |                   |
|----|--------|------------|------|-------------------|
| 1. | Bes    | arégeses,  | com. | We had brought.   |
| 2. | Tzos } | arégeset,  |      | You had brought.  |
|    | Tzās } |            |      |                   |
| 3. | Ris    | arégese,   | m. } | They had brought. |
|    | Rās    | arégisiji, | f. } |                   |

The Pluperfect is formed in the same way as the Preterite, only *sus*, etc., being added to the past participle, as shown already under the *Imperfect*. In the third person plural feminine, we meet with the termination *siji*, which corresponds to the feminine *rā asij*,\* they were (p. 19). *Iji* seems to be another termi-

\* Should very likely be written *asiji* according to *haniji* (p. 18).

nation of the feminine plural, for in Astōrī we find only instead of haniji the form hanī. The Astōrī affixes, as shown already under the Imperfect, the termination *alus*.

In conclusion, we will give a fable from Dr. Leitner's *Dardu Legends*, p. 17, composed in the Astōrī dialect. It runs thus:—

Eyk tshéekeyn kokói ek asilli ; sese soni thul déli ; se tshéy se kokói te zanma lāo wēi ; tule du déy thē ; se ēkenu lang bili ; kokói dēr páy, múy.

Moral : Anēsey maní aní haní.

Lāo arēm the apejo lang biló.

From the grammatical remarks we have premised, we can pretty fairly explain this piece.

Eyk or *ek* is one (p. 7), *tshéy* is woman, and *keyn* apparently the feminine affix of the genitive (referring to kokói, feminine, hen.) It would be very remarkable, if the affix *kā*, *kē* should be used in the Astōrī ; else the genitive sign in Astōrī is *éy éi*, or, as it appears *eyn*. Perhaps *tshéeke* is to be taken as one word. *Asilli* = was, feminine (p. 19). *Sese*, ablative singular, *from that, by that* (else written *je-se*). *Soni* is the genitive singular of gold. From this it would appear, that *ey* is only to be pronounced like short *e* (equal to *i*). *Thul* egg, feminine. How is it to be written, *thul* or *tul* ? We do not hesitate to consider *thul* a faulty spelling, as no *aspirates* are to be found in the Dardu dialects. The derivation of *tul* is unknown to me. *Déli*, was given, the past participle—*ditā* (Pan-jābī), as explained above. The literal translation runs, therefore, thus : “ *Of a woman one hen was ; by that an egg of gold was given. Se tshēy se*, from that woman ; *se* is apparently an ablative postfix, corresponding to the Ghilghitā *sō* (jō) ; the affix *nyō*, put down for the Astōrī, is not to be found here. *Zanma* signifies *food*, origin unknown ; *lāo* signifies *much* (p. 13), in Ghilghitā *bōdō* ; *wēi* is the feminine of the past participle, and *zanma* must therefore be feminine ; we cannot find the meaning of *wēi* amongst the list of verbs. *Tulé* is plural, eggs. With regard to *déy-thē* (or *dey té*)—*toki* signifies *to do* ; *déy té* is very likely a compound verb like the Hindi *दिखा करना*, to be in the habit of giving ; it would therefore signify *it will be in the habit of giving* ; (in future) it will (always) give two eggs. *Sé*, that (i.e., woman) ; *ekenu*, *from one* ; the *nu* seems to be the ablative postfix, identical with *nyō*. *Lang* is an adjective, the exact signification of which is not known, very likely its meaning is *deprived*. *Kokói dēr*, *the stomach of the hen* ; *dēr* is put down on p. 6 ; origin unknown. *Kokói* has no sign of the genitive ; is the genitive affix *i* perhaps dispensed with, when the noun ends in *i* ? or does it form a compound (Tatpuru-sha) with *dēr* ? *Páy* (pāi), very likely a past participle (feminine), *to burst*, Hindi *फटना* ; *múy*, died i.e., the *Kokói*, (Hindi *कुक्की*

## 250 *The Languages and Races of Dardistan.*

Sanskrit ककुटी). Mûa corresponds exactly with the Hindi मुआ = Sanskrit मृत, dead.

The first part of the moral : Anésey maní aní haní signifies literally : “ *of this (anese) the meaning (maní) is (haní) this (aní) apparently feminine, as haní* ). The following words are, we believe, to be interpreted thus : Láo arêm té, *having made* (or said, as in Hindi, where करना is used in the same sense), *I will bring (get) much* ; ape-sô lang biló, *he became deprived of the little* (he had). Apo signifies in Ghilghití and very likely in Astōrī also, little (p. 13), Sanskrit अल्प ; sô is postfix, *from* ; biló, *he became* (p. 18).

There can be little doubt that, if more Dardu stories are brought to our knowledge, the grammatical structure of these dialects will soon be satisfactorily settled.

The public is indebted to Dr. Leitner for the discovery of these most interesting idioms ; which, when once more known in their details, will shed many a ray of light on the development of the cognate idioms in the plains of India. They involve a most interesting philological problem,—how idioms, identical and collateral with those in the plains, have, though apparently totally separated from them, gone through the same process of internal decomposition and reconstruction. The Dardu races, like their brethren the Kāfirs in the Hindū Kūsh, are at present, from all we know, sunk in the deepest ignorance ; but the day is perhaps not far distant, when even these barbarous or semi-barbarous members of the great Arian family will be reclaimed to a civilised life, which can only be done, in the first instance, by an acquaintance with their language. He who opens the language of a barbarous race, lays thereby the foundation-stone of its future civilisation.

E. TRUMPP.

---

## ART. V.—DEGRADATION OR DEVELOPMENT.

*Primitive Culture.* By Edward B. Tylor. 2 vols. London. John Murray, 1871.

THE author of "Researches into the early History of Mankind" has given to the world a very valuable addition to the particular department of ethnology which he cultivates, in these volumes. He has made himself, by an enormous amount of labour and care, one of the most reliable authorities regarding the primeval customs and beliefs of mankind. The book before us contains a vast amount of materials which are partially digested into general theories, and which afford a foundation for a great deal of thought regarding most important subjects connected with the history of man. We shall make it our object in the present paper to study carefully the two opposite ethnological theories with which Mr. Tylor is occupied in this work, and which he has called the *degradation* and the *development* theory respectively.

It has been a widely prevalent belief in many parts of the world that the present race of men is composed of sadly degenerated descendants of primitive ancestors who were greatly superior to any present representatives of the human race. We need not now enquire into the origin of this belief; the fact of its existence and widespread prevalence is sufficient for our purpose. We can trace it in the worship of ancestors which is the characteristic religion of China and which prevails throughout the whole of the East; we can see its operation in all the legends of a golden age, when mortals were considered fit companions of the gods, and when exploits of wonder and deeds of daring were performed by men upon whom the favour of heaven had rested. The same belief has resulted in the modern theological doctrine of a primeval Paradise and a subsequent Fall, which lies at the foundation of a large part of mediæval theological speculation. In this doctrine, it is assumed that the first pair of the human race were created in a state of moral and intellectual perfection; that a full revelation was made to them of God's nature and laws; and that all the faculties and capacities of human nature were found in them in a state of perfection. It is assumed that they continued in this state of moral and intellectual perfection until, by the seduction of an evil spirit, they broke a certain apparently arbitrary commandment; that then they fell from their perfection and their purity, were driven from paradise and the presence of God, and became subject for the first time to death and "all the ills which flesh is heir to." It is assumed that after this, wickedness multiplied; that from henceforth the vast majority of men were cut off from all knowledge of God

except the traditions and relics of that original revelation which was made to man in his condition of perfection and happiness, which traditions and relics, however, were not sufficient for their moral and spiritual guidance ; and that to a very small minority, a chosen section of the human race, a gradual revelation was made which should, after many centuries had elapsed, be made known to the whole world for its enlightenment and salvation. Thus this theory maintains an absolute degeneration of the whole of the human race with reference to the original condition of our first ancestors ; while at the same time it admits of a certain relative progress, brought about by supernatural means, in a small section of the race, as compared with the vast majority who continued to sink, by the working of natural causes, into deeper and more hopeless degradation.

There are many, however, who hold a theory of degeneration of a much less extreme and more philosophical form, but not differing essentially from that now described. "It has practically resolved itself into two assumptions. First, that the history of culture began with the appearance on earth of a semi-civilized race of men ; and second, that from this stage culture has proceeded in two ways, backward to produce savages, and forward to produce civilized men." \*

This degeneration theory has received many rude shocks in recent times from a great many different quarters. Geologists tell us that the earliest relics of human life upon the earth indicate that man's first condition was one of savagery, that he had nothing but rude stone implements, that he was ignorant of the use of fire, and that he advanced gradually through the stone, bronze, and iron ages to his present state of culture. Philologists give us a kind of evidence, limited in extent, which leads to a similar conclusion. History fails to establish the theory of degradation because it does not begin till comparatively recent times. Many of those who look upon the Bible as containing the oldest true account of man's existence, do not admit that it supports a doctrine of a primitive state of advancement and a subsequent decline. And finally, ethnology has collected an enormous mass of evidence bearing upon the question, which every careful and unprejudiced student must admit to have great influence in overturning that view of human degradation which has so long and in so many countries borne sway over the human mind.

The general thesis which Mr. Tylor endeavours to maintain in the two volumes before us, is thus stated in his own words :— "That the savage state in some measure represents an early condition of mankind, out of which the higher culture has gradually

---

\* Ty. I, 31.

been developed or evolved, by processes still in regular operation as of old, the result showing that, on the whole, progress has prevailed over relapse." In making a brief review of the attempt to maintain this thesis, we find the work naturally dividing itself into four great portions. In the first of these evidence is collected from relics of primitive arts, such evidence as has been rendered familiar to modern readers by the science of Prehistoric Archæology. To this must be added the facts for the knowledge of which we are indebted to the study of language. This portion of the work is manifestly only preparatory to that which follows in the second part, and which is really the most important of them all, inasmuch as it furnishes the key by which the author explains all the psychological and other difficulties that meet him afterwards, namely, the doctrine of souls, or Animism. In the third great portion the doctrine of souls is merged into the more extensive and complicated doctrines of Spirits and Deities, leading us more immediately to a study of various systems of religion. Finally, we have a long and interesting chapter on religious cultus, being an account of important religious ceremonies, with their meaning and bearing upon the general subject of discussion. We shall give our attention successively to these four great classes of subjects.

I. In dealing with the great and various mass of facts which constitute the history of general human culture, the author appears to set out with two leading hypotheses which it is his object to establish. These hypotheses may be thus briefly stated: First, that there is amongst men a power of developing culture from the rudest beginnings; and second, that culture thus developed has an invariable tendency to survive through succeeding generations. With reference to the first of these two propositions the author admits that a people may degenerate from a comparatively high state of culture, and also that elevation from a low state of culture is frequently the result of contact with more civilized races. Thus the out-lying offshoots of a great tribe or race are frequently placed in unfavourable circumstances, and, consequently, of necessity degenerate from the condition of their brethren who are more favourably situated. Thus also when a more civilized race comes into close contact with a less civilized one, a transmission of culture takes place by which the latter is elevated; unless, indeed, the difference in culture between the two be so great that the latter is corrupted and ruined by acquiring the more artificial habits and inclinations of their powerful neighbours. But independently of these two occasional results of peculiar circumstances, there is amongst men a certain power—an inventive faculty—by which an instrument, an art, an ability is developed into something better. "Throughout the various topics of Prehistoric Archæology, the force and convergence of its testimony



upon the development of culture are overpowering. The relics discovered in gravel beds, caves, shell-mounds, terramares, lake-dwellings, earthworks, the results of an exploration of the superficial soil in many countries, the comparison of geological evidence, of historical documents, of modern savage life, corroborate and explain one another. The megalithic structures, menhirs, cromlechs, dolmens, and the like, only known to England, France, Algeria, as the work of races of the mysterious past, have been kept up as matters of modern construction and recognized purpose among the ruder indigenous tribes of India. The series of ancient lake-settlements which must represent so many centuries of successive population fringing the shores of the Swiss lakes, have their surviving representatives among rude tribes of the East Indies, Africa, and South America. Outlying savages are still heaping up shell-mounds like those of far-past Scandinavian antiquity. The burial-mounds still to be seen in civilized countries have served at once as museums of early culture and as proofs of its savage or barbaric type. It is enough, without entering further here into subjects fully discussed in modern special works, to claim the general support given to the development theory of culture by Prehistoric Archæology." \*

But the facts of Prehistoric Archæology are not, according to our author, the only ones which tend to establish the proposition in question. The history and antiquities of the useful arts attest the existence of a natural power of invention and development amongst all races of men. The appearance of any art in a particular locality, where it cannot be shown to be foreign in its origin, is a *primâ facie* evidence that it is indigenous amongst the people with whom it is found. And if its history could be traced, the probability is that it could be shown to be the result of a development from a still simpler and ruder original. The researches of philologists lead to a similar conclusion. Language grows, which means that men have a power of multiplying and rendering more expressive the signs of their feelings and thoughts. Those products of the imagination which we call myths also grow; they are developed in accordance with natural laws which have already been partially discovered, but which still remain a subject of interesting scientific enquiry.

The second proposition which Mr. Tylor endeavours to establish is, that any element of culture once developed amongst a people has an invariable tendency to survive, even long after its meaning has been forgotten, and the general culture of the people has advanced far beyond it. There is certainly nothing very recondite in this proposition, nothing which would seem to a casual observer

to be at all striking. Yet its very simplicity and obviousness is an evidence of its scientific truth, and the number of facts and illustrations which the author has brought to bear upon it renders the discussion one of extreme interest. It is only a particular way of stating that principle of connection which binds together different generations of men into a harmonious unity. The fathers give to their children that knowledge and those habits which they have themselves inherited or developed. The children receive this inheritance with filial reverence, preserve it in some respects unchanged, develop it in some of its elements to suit their advancing civilization or changed circumstances. Frequently a particular ancestral custom or notion continues amongst a people long after the general condition of civilization has advanced far beyond that in which it originated. Such a custom or notion is called by our author a "survival;" it is a relic of the past, a fossilized product of a time and a people long gone by. As a survival it cannot be understood except through a knowledge of its history. A knowledge of its history furnishes likewise an important element towards the study of the past history and condition of the people.

These two principles which we have thus briefly examined furnish the key to the whole of the work before us. The author makes use especially of what, by a happy invention, he calls survivals for the purpose of solving many of the difficult problems with which he grapples. It would be impossible in the course of a brief article to do any justice to the wonderful variety of fact and circumstance which are made use of in the elaboration and support of his theory. All that we can do is to refer to some of the important results which he has reached and some of the consequences which follow from them. Carrying with us then the leading principles which he has unfolded in what we have called the first part of his work, we shall advance to the consideration of the second which comprehends the doctrine of Souls.

II. In this doctrine the author sees the essential element of religion. A people may not hold any clear belief regarding a Supreme Being, or future retribution, or any of the other great doctrines which constitute the religious belief of a higher civilization; but if they possess a simple belief in the existence of Spiritual Beings, either human or not human, they cannot be described as non-religious. This belief is the root-element of all religion; it appears to be almost universal in its prevalence; it is the original trunk upon which all the other elements of the higher religions are grafted. "The conception of a personal soul or spirit among the lower races may be defined as follows:—It is a thin, unsubstantial human image, in its nature a sort of vapour, film, or shadow; the cause of life and thought in the individual

it animates; independently possessing the personal consciousness and volition of its corporeal owner, past or present; capable of leaving the body far behind to flash swiftly from place to place; mostly impalpable and invisible, yet also manifesting physical power, and especially, appearing to men waking or asleep as a phantasm separate from the body of which it bears the likeness; able to enter into, possess, and act in the bodies of other men, of animals, and even of things.\*

How this conception of the soul has been attained may perhaps be inferred from the language used by savage and other races in describing it. It is frequently spoken of as a *shade* or shadow similar to that unsubstantial image caused by our bodies intercepting the light of the sun. It is spoken of as breath or air, thus being likened to that essential condition of life, the vital air which we breathe. It may be suggested by dreams and visions, by the passing of the breath from the body at death, and by many other similar phenomena of human life.

However this conception of the soul may have been acquired, it manifestly contains within itself elements which only require a little development and elaboration in order to produce some of the most important elements of the world's great religious systems. The soul, according to savage conceptions, is capable of departing from the body even during life, as for example, in dreams when the person fancies himself far away from the place where his body lies. At death, it is absolutely certain, that the soul does leave the body, but amongst few, if any, savage peoples is it believed to cease to exist. Various views are entertained regarding what becomes of it after it has left the body, and from the nature of these views we can draw important conclusions regarding the religious and moral condition of those who hold them. The highest moral conceptions of a people will undoubtedly exhibit themselves in connection with this belief regarding the future condition of the souls of their deceased friends or enemies. And Mr. Tylor has placed in the hands of moral philosophers, most important materials for supporting, or modifying, or over-throwing current ethical doctrines. Professor Calderwood, writing in the *Contemporary Review* of January 1872, thinks that "recent investigations of savage life are tending towards a confirmation of an intuitional philosophy, and what is now required to make this more manifest, is a rigid scrutiny of the vast mass of evidence now at command such as would make it possible to throw off the accidental, and clearly mark out the constant and uniform testimony of the several stages of life on the highway towards civilization." Probably this writer is somewhat biassed by his desire to support a

pet theory, and we think it is a pity that formidable names such as "intuitional," "development," and many others should exercise such a power over men whose sole object should be to reach the truth. We shall examine as thoroughly as we can in this brief article the ethical elements which show themselves in the vast mass of facts which Mr. Tylor has collected from the records of savage nations regarding the soul.

The leading essential fact connected with the soul's existence which is of world-wide distribution is, of course, that it continues to exist separate from the body which it leaves at death. Now in this continuity of existence, the soul may either be connected with some other physical organism, or may have a separate spiritual existence. "The one is the theory of the Transmigration of Souls, which has indeed risen from its lower stages to establish itself among the huge religious communities of Asia, great in history, enormous even in present mass, yet arrested and, as it seems, henceforth, unprogressive in its development; but the more highly educated world has rejected the ancient belief, and it now only survives in Europe in dwindling remnants. Far different has been the history of the other doctrine, that of the independent existence of the personal soul after the death of the body in a Future Life. Passing onward through change after change in the condition of the human race, modified and renewed in its long ethnic course, this great belief may be traced from its crude and primitive manifestations among savage races to its establishment in the heart of Christianity, where the faith in a future existence forms at once an inducement to goodness, a sustaining hope through suffering and across the fear of death, and an answer to the perplexed problem of the allotment of happiness and misery in this present world by the expectation of another world to set this right."\*

With reference to the special ethical question which we wish to discuss, it makes very little difference to us whether we are dealing with beliefs regarding transmigration or continued independent spiritual existence. We find ethical notions prevailing amongst the one class of belief as well as the other. The character of an individual in his life in one body determines his condition in subsequent births as frequently as in the case of separate future existence. Now if we examine the notions of savages or barbarians regarding the state of the soul after death, we may arrange them apparently into three different classes. First, we have those notions in which the soul is represented as enjoying a mere continuance of its existence in the present life without any material change except that of being separated from the body, or joined to another similar body. Secondly, we have another class of notions in which certain qualities or conditions not properly ethical, such as bravery, rank, endurance,

determine the future state of the disembodied or transmigrated soul. And finally, we see amongst many peoples, especially those approaching the higher culture, a distinct recognition of moral retribution in a future life, the good being rewarded and the evil punished. Let us see what we can learn from this analysis.

A glance at these classes of notions regarding a future life discovers a transition to a distinct ethical consciousness; but in the first and simplest theories there appears to be no element which we now recognize as ethical. A study of the illustrations which Mr. Tylor has collected bearing upon the simple continuance theory will lead us to the conclusion, however, that there are certain primary elements which form, as it were, the ground-work upon which moral principles may afterwards be based. Wild Indian tribes look forward to a land where they shall engage in labours and enjoy pleasures similar to those of the present life. They collect together in their imagination all that is good, all that they take pleasure in; they form with this a conception of an ideal existence better than the reality which is around them; they project this ideal image into the future life and believe firmly that they will one day realize it.

Now there is not much here that *we* would consider ethical; but there appear to be the same principles in operation which in a higher culture produce true ethical doctrines. There is the formation of an ideal conception of life—something to be aimed at, and to be hoped for. There is a gathering up in the mind of all that is thought to be best and happiest in human life, and a distinct hope of attaining to it. Now what is the highest aim of a moral life, as we understand it, but the striving after an ideal? And if our ideal be higher, more complex, and more perfect than that of a wild Indian, still the mental principles involved appear to be essentially the same.

We now ascend a step higher and observe a second class of notions regarding a future life in which there is an important element added to that which we have been considering. The life which now is continues beyond the grave; there is here also a projected ideal of that which is most esteemed in the present life. But in addition to this there is a distinct recognition of a causal connection between present character and future condition. Those who have been brave in battle, who have shown fortitude in suffering, who have occupied an exalted rank, are rewarded by a life in every way desirable in the spirit land. Thus the enjoyment of the ideal life is considered the appropriate reward of the most estimable character. And thus there is a distinct recognition of a better and a worse in human character, of something considered noble which we should seek after, and of something considered unworthy which we should shun. We do not find here any

such abstract ideas as right or wrong, the good or virtue. But we do find certain qualities and conditions which are considered worthy of approbation, and deserving of reward. And undoubtedly this conception of the worthiness of those qualities and conditions must practically operate as a rule of life; and therefore with reference to the mode of its operation it is essentially moral.

We cannot, therefore, agree with Mr. Tylor when he says that "on the whole the evidence tends toward the opinion that the genuine savage doctrine of the future life either involves no moral retribution, or accepts it only at a rudimentary stage." \* On the contrary, we think that the principles which we have seen in operation are essentially moral. The ethical standard—the ideal life—of the savage is not that of the more cultured man. But still there is an ideal life either as a present object of approbation or projected into the future; and the very existence of this ideal object of approbation and desire constitutes a moral aim in life.

Undoubtedly the moral elements of such doctrines are rudimentary; that is to say, the moral standard has not been developed, the idea of abstract good or virtue has not been elaborated, the notion of duty, as distinguished from particular actions which one should do and a particular character which is deserving of approbation, has not been conceived. But there is very distinctly exhibited a sort of frame or setting into which these developed ethical products may be fitted as soon as they are formed. As knowledge increases and experience is gained, the idea of a worthy life may be modified; but still as an ideal it must always occupy the same position. The abstract ideas of right and wrong, the good and evil, are, in the higher culture, distinctly seen, whereas in the lower they are not; but the principles in accordance with which these ideas are formed appear to be at work in the lowest culture, and the mode in which these ideas influence the life finds a close analogy in the lowest culture. The ethical elements, therefore, which we would vindicate for savages do not consist in those developed abstract ideas of right and wrong with which we are familiar. They consist rather in certain modes of thought—what Kant would call *Forms*—certain ways of looking at life and the aim of life; the matter of these forms being supplied by an ever varying and continually accumulating experience. The most primitive and therefore most essential of these modes or forms of ethical thought is the formation of an ideal life, an actually unrealized life in spirit-land. Perhaps this ideal is first formed in projection, as it were, into the future, and afterwards recalled into the present

---

\* II., 83.

and applied to certain qualities and conditions of actual life. However this may be, the next important form of ethical thought appears to be the connection of the ideal life as a consequence with the actual life as realized. And the only other step necessary to the completion of ethical doctrine is the formation of certain moral ideas as right and wrong, which constitute the matter that experience supplies to fit in to those primitive forms which we have been considering. These abstract moral ideas, however, are found only in religious systems of peoples who have advanced considerably on the high road to civilization. Amongst the ancient Egyptians, the well-known "Book of the Dead" is the record of the existence of an idea of virtue and a belief in future retribution. In the hymns of the Rig-veda abstract moral ideas are continually appearing, showing that the writers of those hymns had advanced to tolerably matured ethical conceptions. As to the manner in which these moral ideas are formed, the historical study which we are conducting does not inform us. They appear more or less clearly expressed in various systems of higher culture. They apparently take the place of other cruder and more concrete conceptions which form the ideal ethical life of more primitive peoples. They are not, therefore, essential elements of universal ethical doctrine. That which is essential must be formal, and we have endeavoured to indicate briefly and crudely what we think are the important formal principles.

It is with regret that we leave the discussion of this part of the subject, as we think that historical analysis alone can decide some of the disputed questions in morals. The old battle-field between the theory of intuition and others opposed to it appears to be shifted; and moralists would be much better occupied in endeavouring to make an accurate investigation and analysis of the ethical phenomena of history, than in engaging in never-ending speculative discussions about questions which mere discussion can never decide. We now advance to a study of the doctrine of spirits.

III. We have collected in this third part most important elements for the study of what has been called the natural history of religions. In old days when the adherents of every great religious system made an exhaustive division of religions into the absolutely true and the absolutely false, viewing his own religious system as the sole representative of the former class, there was not believed to be that community of principles and origin between different religious systems which scientific investigation is now demonstrating. But careful and unbiassed enquiry is gradually leading men to the conviction that religious systems are not isolated phenomena, that there is not one of them which is not intimately connected at many points with all the others which have preceded it or co-exist with it. This conviction is at the foundation of the various modern

attempts to construct a science of religions. No science of any series of phenomena can be constructed unless those phenomena are recognized as governed by laws and connected together upon some rational and discoverable principles. The work before us cannot claim to be a science of religions ; but it contains a great and varied collection of facts systematically arranged, which must be most valuable to the professed student of theology. The general principle in subordination to which the facts are arranged is expressed in the following sentence :—"It seems as though the conception of a human soul, when once attained to by man, served as a type or model on which he framed not only his ideas of other souls of lower grade, but also his ideas of spiritual beings in general, from the tiniest elf that sports in the long grass up to the Heavenly Creator and Ruler of the world, the Great Spirit !" \* The facts which are adduced appear, in a general way, to bear out the truth of this theory.

The most direct and immediate employment of the conception of the human soul in religion is, of course, manes-worship or the worship of the souls of deceased ancestors. In this case the objects of worship are actual human souls, existing separately from any material embodiment. But in the great majority of lower religious forms the spirit is supposed capable of becoming embodied, of connecting itself more or less permanently with some material object. Thence arises the theory of possession, of spirits, usually malign, taking up their abode in human or animal bodies and speaking and acting through them. Thence arises Fetishism, in which spiritual beings, good or evil, are supposed to be embodied in particular objects, to act through them, to communicate by them. Thence arises the worship of "stocks and stones," believed to be an embodiment of some spiritual agent. From this origin, by a little development, springs the practice of idolatry, which involves essentially two ideas ; that of the idol being, in a sense, a representation of the unseen spirit, and also its embodiment or abode. The various forms of nature-worship are but different manifestations of the same ground-conception. The great powers of nature are personified, considered to be exhibitions of the power of some spiritual beings analogous to the human soul ; and these occupy a ruling position in the great hierarchy of polytheism. From this point, the exercise of the generalising power leads either to a religious dualism of good and evil as amongst the Persians, or to a kind of monotheism in which some one of the great deities is elevated to a supreme position, the others being degraded to the rank of lower deities, or angels or demons. Into any criticism of the details



which are brought to support these positions we cannot at present enter, but shall make some general observations which occur to us regarding their influence upon current theological beliefs.

1. If the facts contained in these volumes be true, and the inferences naturally following from them consequently well founded, the hard and fast line of demarcation which has been supposed to separate Christianity from other and lower forms of religion must, to a great extent, be obliterated. Many modern Christians have been accustomed to look upon Christianity as the only divine religion, all others being so-called human religions, as the only absolutely true religion, all others being absolutely false, or if true at all containing only so much truth as has been received by tradition from some primeval revelation, or as has been excogitated by the natural reason of man. Such, however, is not the conception of the relations of Christianity to other religious systems which we should form from the book before us. We find that there are innumerable beliefs connected with religion which appear to take their rise in their crudest form amongst savages or barbarians, which reappear more or less purified amongst people of higher stages of civilization, until finally they are incorporated in the Christian system. The mass of evidence at our disposal appears to lead to the conclusion that there is an actual historical connection between lower and higher systems of religious beliefs, that the former have formed as it were the stepping-stones by which the minds of men have risen to the latter, and that all religious conceptions have advanced and become purified, from our human point of view of course, by keeping pace with the progress made amongst the other mental and moral elements of our constitution. The strangely complicated character of human life and human history forbids us to isolate any one element as the religious, and fancy that it can be implanted and make progress independently of all the others; it forbids us also to isolate any historical period or people and fancy that they drew their religious beliefs from a source entirely different from that which is the common origin of all religious belief. We may maintain strenuously that Christianity is the best and truest and purest form of religious life that the world has ever seen, and also maintain just as strenuously that the most essential elements of Christian belief are found more or less crudely exhibited amongst peoples whom we look upon as heathens.

2. As another conclusion from this investigation, we point out that the distinction usually drawn between natural and revealed religion is untenable. "The distinction between natural and revealed religion, as commonly understood, does not mean simply that there are truths which are peculiar to revelation; or that Christianity has communicated to us what we could not have learnt from

any other source of knowledge, and has exerted on the human spirit a divine and holy influence unattained and unattainable by any other moral agency ; for, so understood, the distinction does not seem to admit of question. But the notion generally attached to the phrase 'natural religion' is that there are certain religious ideas, principles, doctrines, which are within the province of human reason, and have actually been evolved by it, as distinguished from certain other ideas and doctrines which lie altogether beyond that province, and which can be known only by a special authoritative communication from heaven. Examining the contents of our religious belief, it is supposed that we can discern in it certain elements which are not exclusively Christian, which the human mind is capable of excogitating from its own resources without supernatural aid, which were actually recognized by thoughtful men before Christianity, and are still believed by many who do not accept the peculiar or characteristic doctrines of the gospel." In this distinction thus eloquently stated in a recent lecture by Dr. Caird for the purpose of condemning it, we have a position which cannot be maintained consistently with the facts and conclusions contained in the volumes under review. All religion is in a sense "natural," as all religion may be in another sense revealed. All religion is relative to the faculties of our human nature and is the expression of our most deeply felt spiritual wants and longings, and is therefore in that sense natural. All true religion, likewise, should have reference to something out of ourselves, to something higher and better than ourselves, should be to our minds an interpretation of the highest meaning of things around us, and of our own lives in relation to them, and in this sense should be a true revelation in our hearts of the divine. Hence, if we would wish to understand one religion in its fulness we must study others which have prepared for and led up to it. And in making this study it will not do to abstract certain elements supposed to be natural, rational, or the reverse, and arrange them in different bundles and call them by different names. This will be doing violence to the facts of history, to our own nature, and to truth. We must take the elements of our human nature to constitute one whole, and the religious facts of history to be a great harmonious unity, if we would wish to understand the nature, the powers, and the complex life which we possess.

3. The history of religions is of something essentially subjective, a history of the subjective notions and beliefs which have borne sway over the minds of men. It matters not whether we turn our attention to the lowest or the highest form of religious belief, this is true. The external material facts of the universe are everywhere and at all times pretty much the same. The exter-

nal events of man's life have varied greatly, it is true, at different times and in different countries of the world; but the variation has been chiefly in accidental circumstances. Religious history and progress are essentially subjective, although expressing themselves in objective forms. This applies to all religion, whether so-called natural or revealed, as well as to revelation, the source from which religion is excited and advanced. Revelation is an inward light in the heart of man, enabling man to interpret the meaning of external nature, or to put a meaning upon otherwise, to him, meaningless phenomena. The language of any so-called book-revelation is but the expression recorded for the use of after times of the religious light and life which were glowing and throbbing in the hearts of those by whom it was spoken. Indeed a so-called revelation which is simply external, a series of words uttered and heard, an object presented to the senses, an event taking place must be entirely meaningless and useless, unless they serve to call forth a response from the heart, unless they are caught hold of and interpreted and invested with meaning and life by the mind of the individual to whom they appear.

IV. In the study of the history of religious cultus we must carry with us the results which we have already reached. We have had certain materials laid before us from which we may learn something as to the *kind* of experience which first gave rise to the conceptions of the human soul, of the future existence of that soul, and of the ideal life in the future or in the present which is the object of ethical consciousness. We have seen that this conception of the soul furnishes the type upon which the conception of the more extensive world of spirits is based, a conception which rises finally to a spirit supreme over all. There remains to be considered the doctrines and customs which have arisen out of the relation believed to exist, and the intercourse held to be carried on between the human soul and other spiritual beings. The most important elements of this religious cultus are prayer and sacrifice.

There is nothing in the conceptions of either prayer or sacrifice which could not naturally arise out of the belief that men are related to other spiritual beings in something the same way as they are related to one another. The prayers which rude barbarous tribes present to their deities are pretty much the same as the requests which they make to persons in authority amongst themselves; that is, they are formed after the same model, conceived in the same spirit, although of course the objects after which they seek are different. We should naturally expect therefore that prayer, being the expression of the most deeply felt wants of men, would vary greatly amongst different peoples according to the nature of the ideas which pre-

dominate in their minds and their general state of culture. Where the minds of the people have not arisen above utilitarian conceptions we need not expect anything higher in their prayers. Where there have been formed distinctly ethical ideas of right and wrong we may certainly expect to find these, if any where, in the petitions presented to the deity. The few specimens of prayers collected by Mr. Tylor are sufficient to bear out the general theory which he wishes to support. But we think that a much more extended study of the prayers of different peoples might result in important discoveries in the history of religious and moral thought. The examination of this field of research still requires to be performed, and when it is thoroughly carried out by a competent scholar we have no doubt but a great deal of light may be thrown upon obscure questions connected with the history of humanity.

The custom of presenting sacrifices follows just as naturally as prayer from the general conception of the relation between man and higher spirits. And the meaning of the sacrifice, that which it is designed to express, must of course vary according to the idea in the worshipper's mind of his relations to the deity. We have many instances in which the sacrifice presented is considered to be only a gift designed for the use of the deity with a view of pleasing him or securing his favour. We have other cases in which, besides this, there is involved the idea of rendering homage to him as superior. And finally when moral ideas, and the conception of God as supreme have arisen, the meaning of sacrifice becomes much more complicated. It involves the idea of propitiation, of giving up to God something valuable to the worshipper as an expiation of sin committed. Thence arises the sacrifice of children, the cutting off of members of the person's own body, and the presentation of other things valuable to the sacrificer. In this is involved also the idea of substitution, that the sacrifice presented is a substitute for the life of the sacrificer which has been in truth forfeited by the commission of sin, but that a merciful deity is willing to accept some other offering as a substitute or as a symbol of the life which ought to be sacrificed.

All these and other ideas involved in religious cultus are abundantly illustrated in the chapter before us. Many of these ideas have found their way up into Christianity; many of them are still incorporated in the theological systems of Christian churches; some of them have been rejected, some of them are now being rejected by the increasing enlightenment of the modern world. Let us see what conclusions we can draw from this progress of religious history.

1. No single phase of religious thought appears to be final. Every religious conception is a successor more or less purified and

developed to some one that preceded it ; and is itself a stepping-stone to some higher and, it may be, truer conception which is to follow it. Every religious system must contain in it materials taken from other religious systems out of which it may have sprung ; and is liable, nay, judging from the history of religions, certain to become developed or purified or, it may be, corrupted into something else. The doctrine of the development of religious belief is now a firmly established scientific principle, whatever view we may take as to the manner in which that development is brought about, or as to the standard by which it should be judged.

2. Consequently it is not proper for the adherents of any system of religion to rest in that system as absolute truth. As far as the human mind is concerned there appears to be no such thing as absolute truth, or at least to human faculties in our present state of existence the knowledge of absolute truth is unattainable. It is right that men should seek to know what is true and good ; it is right that they should reject what will not stand the test of examination, and that they should receive as an article of belief what their intellect and conscience approve. But to rest in any system of religious beliefs and to cease searching after something still better and higher is a sign not of the culminating point of a religious character, but rather of religious death.

3. Religious beliefs appear to be valuable chiefly from their influence upon moral character. Almost as soon as moral ideas began to be formed they were connected with religion. And the beliefs of religion affording, as they do, a sanction and a powerful motive to the practice of that which has been regarded as virtue, have exercised a very powerful influence in the formation of morals. We say this of all religious beliefs whether we regard them as being true or not. The argument that the good moral results of a religious faith prove the truth of the principles of the religion is a false one. Granting that correct moral ideas have been once formed, the presence of a strong religious belief will have a powerful effect in stamping as it were those moral ideas upon the character. But this is true of all religious beliefs, unless there be involved in them elements essentially immoral.

But we must leave the subject with the reader. The book must be read in order to be appreciated, and deserves to be carefully read. And it should be particularly interesting to people in India who have so many opportunities of becoming acquainted with the customs and beliefs of tribes comparatively low in the ranks of civilization and of adding to the amount of available knowledge regarding the subjects we have been discussing.

---

## ART. VI.—THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.

### PART II.—*Matériel.*

IN proceeding to investigate this portion of the subject, it will be necessary to consider separately the different services entrusted to the Commissariat Department. Of these the supply of sustenance for men in health, and for patients in Hospital, technically called "Rations" and "Diets," naturally takes precedence. There is no intention of criticising here the bill of fare; or of entering upon any elaborate discussion regarding the dietetic value of the aliment provided for the soldier in proportion to its bulk. Suffice it to say that the quantity provided is even more than ample. It remains to be ascertained, whether the quality of the edibles and potables supplied is the best obtainable for the money, or whether equally good articles could not be procured at a cheaper cost. Paterfamilias, wroth at what he may consider extravagance in his household accounts, or puzzled by the domestic enigma of how to make ends meet, can at least scrutinise closely each item making up the "dim'd tottle" of his expenditure, and solace himself somewhat by issuing the ukase for retrenchment in what he conceives the right direction. The public, albeit justifiably indignant at the continuance of the Income-Tax, is not so fortunate. "Victualling" and "dieting" of European troops figure for a large amount in the Military portion of the Budget; but any one anxious to investigate these items of public expenditure for himself, will look in vain for any appendix exhibiting details affording a satisfactory check on them, or indeed over any part of the Commissariat Department grant. This is to be regretted; for, if data for ratios were given, the *veraxa quæstio* of economy would, in this instance, be brought within the ken and ready apprehension of every housewife even. It is particularly unfortunate too for the purposes of this article, that this information is wanting; for in its absence, the precise economic effect and scope of the observations herein to follow, must be the less readily appreciable. Howbeit, the general reader will do well to bear in mind, that, from what may *primâ facie* appear a trifling difference in the price of a commodity, when calculated in the aggregate for the consumption of say 36,000 men, a total amount will present itself, often perfectly startling in magnitude. *Scotticè*—"a little oft mak's a

mickle." A truism, be it observed, that mainly underlies economy in any country, but more particularly so in India. Enough said, however, by way of preface! To the subject.

*Bread.*—To provide the "staff of life" for the soldier, the Commissariat officer is concerned with three operations, *viz.*, the purchase of wheat, the grinding of it into bread stuff, and the baking of the latter into bread. In none of these transactions would there appear to be any systematic attempt at economy. In place of wheat being purchased either by contract, or by direct purchase in the bulk for the whole year's consumption at harvest time, when, of course, it can be procured cheapest; save in the one instance of the Bovill's flour mill at Cawupur (which will be referred to presently) it is now bought as required, to meet the daily consumption. Thus Government buys in the very dearest manner possible. It may be urged, that buying in large quantities necessitates large store-rooms, and entails risk from the ravages of weevil, etc. To this it is readily answered, that natives have most excellent, simple, and cheap methods of storing wheat without risk from either weather or insects. It does not concern the subject to describe these ingenious contrivances here; it is merely necessary to make the fact known that they do exist, and are cheap and effectual. And further, that the very native dealers retailing to Government invariably employ them. In fine it is calculated that by the present retail system of purchasing wheat a loss (all risk of storing considered) is entailed of at least 20 to 25 per cent. Say the daily consumption is 3,600 maunds, and that the price varies in the average from Rs. 2 to 3 a maund, some conclusion as to the large amount which might be saved annually, were better arrangements made for wholesale purchases at the proper season, can easily be arrived at. Be it understood that the Commissary General, not the Executive Commissariat officer, is responsible for this annual waste of public money.

In co-relation with this sub-division of the subject, it may be well to notice here an item of expenditure which figures in the Budget for about 4 to 4½ lakhs of rupees annually. When the price of certain articles, *viz.*, atta, dhall, ghee and salt, exceeds a fixed limit "compensation for dearness of provision" is paid to the native soldier. This boon is a relic of bye-gone days, when it was deemed politic to fling an occasional sop to the sipáhi Cerberus, which might show its teeth. Granted ostensibly in the first instance as an indulgence, it is now regarded as a right; but looking at the item in the latter aspect, it is affirmed, that in many instances it is unnecessarily paid, and in most instances more is paid on this account than need be. It may so happen that from some local cause or through the machinations of native dealers, the price of grain may be fictitiously raised at a

garrison station ; or it may be, that the sudden influx of large bodies of troops into a district may lead to a like result ; but surely with the improved means of intercommunication now at command, a little prudence and foresight would prevent a heavy pecuniary loss to Government on such occasions. It is not uncommon, particularly in the vicinity of native States, to find grain selling in a cantonment at famine prices, while at a distance of perhaps less than ten miles it is moderately cheap. Mayhap too, at the same cantonment a large establishment of carriage is maintained, which might, within reasonable limitation, be utilised for the transfer of the grain from the district, but which is kept in complete idleness unless an emergency call for its employment with a moveable column. Under all circumstances, therefore, it is suggested, that money compensation should never be paid ; but that when the price of provisions exceeds the prescribed limit, the Commissariat Department should be empowered to supply in kind. It is believed by this means, the heavy item of compensation for dearth of provisions would seldom, if ever, appear in the public accounts.

Until within the last five or six years, wheat was ground as well in the Government bakeries as elsewhere throughout the country by the primitive native hand mill—bread material being likewise prepared from the meal by hand labour. These operations are now generally performed by machinery, but no uniformity of system exists. A word regarding the introduction of this machinery. Considering the vast and accumulative inventive genius, which has been for generations employed in Europe in bringing flour mills to the perfection they have now attained, it would naturally be supposed, that the only difficulty in the way of the administrative head of a Department desirous of dispensing with the cumbrous, and it may be added, filthy native methods of obtaining flour above referred to, would be in selecting the most suitable of the numerous excellent models before him. But far from it ; a late Commissary-General, ignoring all experiences, determined to strike out a new line of his own, and in an evil hour lent ear to the flattering tale of a certain would-be Archimedes in the department. To describe the fantastic crudities, and “horrible inventions” (*inter alia*, his *chef d'œuvre*, a beautiful combination of a kneading machine and guillotine in one) of this rash aspirant for mechanic fame, might doubtless be amusing, but would hardly be edifying. Suffice it, that after wasting large sums of money, this visionary left nothing but “wrack behind,” to wit, amorphous fragments of wood and iron, circumjacent in every large station, sad evidences of his folly and presumption. It must not be thought that this little episode in the career of a foolish amateur inventor is narrated with any ill-nature ; but merely as a warning, and in hope that it



may serve *pour encourager les autres*. Again, the Commissariat Commission of 1864 suggested, that a very superior flour mill, well known as "Bovill's Patent Blast Mill" should be introduced in o this country. But how has this excellent suggestion been acted on? In place of any attempt being made to ascertain in the first instance by careful investigation, what was likely to prove the most suitable locality for the experiment, and what were the conditions of supply there required in view to a machine of the proper dimensions being provided; one of the largest size was at once ordered out by the Secretary of State, and directed to be tried at Cawnpur. The machinery arrived, as likewise the miller to work it; when it was discovered that a costly building of five stories high was needed, which took four years to erect. Meanwhile, the miller on a salary of Rs. 400 a month remained idle, and the machinery had to be carefully protected and stored, with every risk of deterioration in such a climate. But this is not all: though the mill has been working well during the last two years, and though most excellent flour has been provided from it for many neighbouring stations, still it is a failure in a financial point of view. What is the cause of this? Mainly there is not enough duty for the machinery to do, or in other words, it is proved that a mill of too large dimensions has been provided for the locality in which it has been established. Can there be a greater evidence of what unreasoning and unreflecting folly may effect towards rendering abortive the soundest conception? Further it may be added, that in not two stations are the appliances for producing flour alike; consequently, although the cost of labour and other conditions may be but little dissimilar, the price of production varies notwithstanding, often in the proportion of cent per cent. The same remarks apply to bread-baking. No two sets of ovens are alike; and most of them are of the rudest construction possible. The consequence is that the cost of fuel is quite double what it should be and would be, were ovens of improved and really scientific construction used. The moral to be derived from all this is, that, if Government really desires to obtain the full benefits of increased efficiency, cleanliness, and economy, which the introduction of machinery into its bakeries is so well calculated to afford, it would do well to appoint a skilled mechanical engineer, with full power to initiate and supervise all arrangements in view to a uniform system of working being established.

*Meat.*—Notwithstanding all assertions to the contrary, the beef ration issued to the soldier is indubitably of much poorer quality than it should be; while the mutton, as is universally admitted, is simply execrable. Breeding and fattening animals for the shambles has almost been elevated into a science in

England; whereas the people in this country have, for the most part, strong religious prejudices opposed to every thing of the kind. Certain it is that unless Government takes direct action in the matter, no improvement in the quality of the meat ration can be looked for. Moreover though Government has persistently endeavoured to blind its eyes to the fact, it is one the no less real in the opinion of those best qualified to judge, that the stocks of cattle and sheep (of the latter more particularly) are becoming gradually, but steadily diminished, and rapidly tending towards complete exhaustion. The resources of the country in flocks and herds are doubtless very great in proportion to the demand for flesh; but still it must be remembered, that as wealth increases, a largely increased consumption by natives is to be anticipated. Besides, however great the resources of the country may be, they can never be expected, throughout all time, to stand the heavy drain now caused by the wholesale and indiscriminate slaughter of cows and ewes. It will hardly be credited, but is a fact nevertheless, that of the animals slaughtered throughout the country, at least 90 per cent. are females. A further evidence of exhaustion may be found in the circumstance, that the price of cattle and sheep has increased, and is still increasing year by year in a degree which cannot otherwise be accounted for. In fine, if Government desires to save itself from a great future embarrassment, and the concomitant heavy outlay sure to result, it would do well to reconsider its decision, all too eagerly arrived at, in concurrence with the opinion of the Commissariat Commission of 1864 "not to connect itself directly or indirectly with breeding farms small or great." The reasons for this decision are nowhere set forth; but it is presumed it may be ascribed to prudential considerations, and to the dread Government has of being entangled in heavy expenses. Breeding cattle for slaughter pays in every other country; and why should it not pay in India, it may be asked? Of course every thing must depend upon the manner in which these farms are established, to make them either economical, nay profitable, as they assuredly should be, or quite the reverse. Strange to say, the Secretary of State in endorsing emphatically the opinions of the Government of India relative to the non-establishment of breeding farms, adds, "that this decision should not be considered as adverse to the establishment of model farms, which subject would have due consideration hereafter." Elsewhere, model farms are more frequently maintained in connexion with stock breeding as a primary object; and why this important branch should be specially neglected in India, is not quite apparent. Indeed, it is believed, for reasons above touched on and further to be shown, that in India, more particularly, cattle-breeding has become an imperative duty, and should

assuredly be associated in every scheme for Government model farms. To go further, it is maintained that in the possession, without fear of injurious competition, of the natural outlet afforded in the ever present demand for farm produce of all kinds for its European troops and for European residents generally, lies the only chance Government has of establishing model farms on an inexpensive, and even remunerative basis. The experiment must be initiated cautiously and tentatively. Exemplary illustration is often the aptest method of description in treating of practical matters. Therefore, to roughly shape a scheme :—Let the different garrison and *sadr* stations be grouped into circles of supply, and in each circle let some central locality, presenting the best facilities for pasturage, *etc.*, be carefully selected. It is probable, that Government waste-lands would frequently be found available. Let the cattle and sheep required for slaughter-purposes be then bought, and drafted to each station therefrom ; care being taken to select and retain all animals approved for brood purposes. Thus, gradually, a nucleus of promising stock would be formed, which, when crossed judiciously and intermediately, would soon yield a type of animals for the shambles, rivalling the highest standard of foreign breeds. It is necessary to add that, as the formation of these dépôts would render possible large reductions in the establishments now maintained at each station, any original outlay incurred would soon be recovered ; and thereafter they might be made not only self-supporting, but highly remunerative. In connexion with cattle dépôts, home farms for the production of grain and green fodder for the stock, might with advantage be established. At these might be tried all the experiments necessary for developing and improving the agriculture of the country. In short, they might be made to answer all the purposes of the model farms, the establishment of which is now occupying the attention of the Agricultural Department ; to which Department the above remarks are, therefore, specially commended.

Having thus disposed of the question of the quality of the meat ration, it is now necessary to consider its present cost. Previous to 1866, meat rations were invariably supplied by contract. The average rates paid were Rs. 9 for beef, and Rs. 12 for mutton per hundred pounds. Even now, when rates have become nearly doubled, a cow yielding from 140 to 160lbs. of meat for rations, besides the hide and débris, can be purchased at Rs. 8 on the average ; while a sheep weighing 20lbs. when dressed, besides the skin and offal, can be bought for about Rs. 2. On the other hand, grass feeding for 15 days only, was all that was stipulated for from contractors ; and this condition was rarely insisted on in its integrity. Such being the case, some idea may be formed of the handsome profits enjoyed. To obtain a meat contract was to secure a colossal

fortune. It is notorious, that the contracts granted at the above named rates, were sublet at Rs. 5 per 100lbs. for beef, and at Rs. 7 per 100lbs. for mutton. Even at these rates, therefore, profit must have been possible. All this notwithstanding, the Commissariat Commission of 1864 expressed itself satisfied with the rates, and even suggested an increase in those paid for mutton. In effect, however, the rates for beef have been since much reduced. This has been brought about through the discontinuance of the contract system, and the substitution of supply by direct Commissariat agency. The price of beef, which is issued six days in the week, has been reduced to about Rs. 7 per 100lbs. on the average; while the rate for mutton has remained stationary. General Norman recently boasted that, although the price of provisions generally had increased greatly, still the cost of the soldiers' rations had been cheapened. He is entirely reticent, however, as to how this desirable result has been attained; and gives no credit where credit is due, namely, to the Executive Commissariat Officers, through whose good exertions a large saving in the cost of the meat ration has been effected. Nor has any attempt been made to ventilate the subject further; albeit it might well have struck any ordinarily acute observer that, if a considerable saving were effected by the unskilled and unsystematic efforts of Executive Commissariat Officers, a good deal more might be expected to be achieved in the same direction, when the light of experience was fully turned on the subject. The utmost discrepancy exists in the rates at the different stations on the plains. These vary from 4/12 to 9/ per hundred pounds for beef; and from 7/8 to 19/ per hundred pounds for mutton. The rates for meat on the hills must, for sometime, necessarily remain high; but excluding these from present consideration, there would seem to be no special circumstances or conditions to which the great difference in rates above-stated can be attributed. The fact is, that Executive Commissariat Officers are permitted to make such exertions as they may severally please towards an economical supply; while those whose duty it is to systematise and control their efforts, remain supine, complacently monopolising the credit due to others. It has been stated above, and the assertion is no loose one, that, on the average, a cow yielding 140 to 160lbs. of flesh for rations, can be bought for 8/. Add to this on the average for feeding previous to slaughter, and for expense of establishments, &c., Rs. 1-8; and a total cost of 9/8 results. Deduct value realisable for hide, débris, &c.; and the sum of Rs. 6-4 remains as the price of 140 to 160lbs. of flesh. Or say 4/8 to 4/ per hundred pounds. To ensure this, and even a more favourable rate still, three points must have special attention.

I. Careful selection of cattle, and thwarting of the dealers' efforts at monopoly.

II. Utilisation of the *débris*, and sale of hides, skins, &c.

III. Control of waste at slaughter-houses, and ration stands.

Cattle are now bought from the native dealers, large and small together, at an average rate per head at pretty much the price demanded. Few Executive Commissariat Officers have either the requisite time, or experience, to enable them to select cattle, and to judge, even approximately, of what the outturn is likely to be. This duty is delegated to native agents, aided by butcher sergeants. The latter draw 20/ a month pay for their work, and often possess even less experience than Executive Commissariat Officers themselves. The establishment of the *depôts*, above advocated, will doubtless do a great deal towards equalising the prices paid for cattle; but even with the best experience, no accurate estimate of the value of a live animal offered for sale can be arrived at without the aid of weighing platforms. Though these are commonly used in Europe, all applications on the part of Executive Commissariat Officers for permission to introduce them into Government slaughter-houses in this country, have met with stern denial.

The price realised in the different executives by sale of hides, skins, *débris*, and offal, varies in as great a ratio as that of meat. Hides are now bought for the Government Tannery at Cawnpur, in the market at from 2/12 to 3/ each, while freshly slaughtered hides of the largest size are sold in the neighbouring Commissariat Executives at prices varying from 2/ to 3/8 at the outside. Sheep skins are bought for 6 annas and upwards; while Government itself realises at 2-6 to 4 annas. Again, no attempt has been made to obtain a general contract for the purchase of hides; though it is believed that, either at the Presidency, or in England, one could be obtained at very superior rates. Nor is there any reason why Government should not ship to England direct. This trade is in the hands of a single firm at the Presidency, and in ordinary times is very lucrative; while during any crisis on the continent of Europe, when the shipments to England from Russia, Germany, or Austria, for instance, become interrupted, a splendid fortune can be made in it in a few months. Further, the fat, suet, marrow bones, neck, tongue, head, liver, horns, and hoofs—in short all that is styled technically the *débris* of an animal—is now included and sold as offal for a mere song; on the average at 4 annas a head for cattle, and at 1/6 per head for sheep. It is certain that for fat 6 to 8 annas per head, and for mutton suet 2 annas to 2/6 per head could readily be obtained from the railway authorities for use in greasing carriage wheels. Whereas on the other hand, there can be no objection to the marrow bones, neck, tongue, heart, and liver, being included in the ration, in proportion, say, for half their weight in ordinary flesh.

Most of these portions of the *débris* readily fetch, singly, when retailed to soldiers and to residents, what the purchaser pays the Commissariat for the whole *débris* and offal put together. Further, there is no reason why, by a slight application of the arts, the horns, hoofs, and bones should not be fully utilised, by being converted into valuable commercial products; while the offal with trifling expense might be made to afford a more valuable fertilising agent than even guano. In fine, it is affirmed that in the cost of beef, at least 4/ per head is recoverable for the hide, *débris*, &c.; and from 8 to 9 annas per head from the cost of mutton. To conclude, the loss by wastage in dressing at slaughter-houses, and in issue at ration stands, is calculated as quite equal to 15 per cent. This could be reduced to a minimum, with but little trouble, by the Commissary General in communication with the Commander in Chief.

*Rice.*—The Commissariat Commission of 1866 states:—That rice was first issued to the soldier in 1840, since which, a daily ration of 4 ounces has been issued. That nearly ninety per cent of the Commanding Officers and Medical Officers consulted, state that the ration is excessive; and some state that it is not touched by the men. That the greater portion issued is either wasted, or pilfered, or exchanged for some other article. That not unfrequently rice is roasted and ground, and then mixed with coffee; an equivalent portion of the latter being stolen. That the only reason that can be assigned for the issue of so large a rice ration is, that it was looked upon as a substitute for vegetables, which latter were not commenced to be issued till 12 years later. That the ration should be reduced to 2 oz., and that thereby a saving of some eighty thousand rupees a year would be effected. The only notice taken of this very clear and cogent testimony as to the rice ration being excessive, and as to the fact of a very limited portion of the quantity issued being really either consumed by the soldier, or benefiting him in any way, was that flour was ordered “at the option of the soldier” to be substituted for rice. In other words, that a doarer, and equally useless substitute, should be provided; and mark!—“At the option of the soldier.” What the British soldier was supposed to do with the flour, or how he was to cook it, and how he was expected to digest four oz. of flour cooked in any shape, in addition to his already more than liberal allowance of food, is nowhere explained. Had such an order been issued a century or so ago, when the sons of Mars were arrayed in all the gorgeousness of full-bottomed wigs, a use for the flour might have been divined. But albeit, “the powers that be” in this all-wise nineteenth century, would consider such use of flour as sinful waste: it might be shewn, were the subject concerned with discipline and obedience, that at least the Govern-

ment of a century ago, would never have been guilty of the folly of permitting the soldier an option as to what he might deem good for himself in the shape of meat and drink. It need hardly be remarked, that the flour order has remained ever since its promulgation a dead letter. The only reason that can be assigned for the issue of rice, is stated to be that, when it was first included in the soldier's ration, no vegetables were supplied. But as will be shewn presently, no expense has been spared of late years, to improve the soldier's vegetable ration; and seeing that he now has excellent potatoes on his table, when his officer can procure none, and can obtain only native vegetables, the recommendation of the Commission aforesaid, that the rice ration should be reduced one-half, and that a saving of eighty thousand rupees annually should be effected thereby, would seem far from unjustifiable. On the other hand, if it be deemed that the soldier is fairly entitled to the rice ration or its money equivalent, at least supply him with an article that will really benefit him, in place of affording a premium of, say, a lakh and-a-half of rupees annually, for the encouragement of pilfering amongst regimental cooks *et hoc genus omne*. Better far, do away with the rice ration altogether, and use the money in improving the quality of the mutton ration, and in cheapening the cost of malt liquor—boons the soldier would really appreciate.

*Sugar and Rum.*—These are of excellent quality, and are for the most part supplied by contract entered into with the Rosa Factory, near Sháhjahánpur, in the North-West Provinces. There is a nominal competition for the contract for sugar; but the supply of rum is quite a monopoly, and as a natural sequence, is very lucrative to the happy possessor. It seems monstrously absurd that sugar and rum, throughout all these years, should have had to be transported to such distances at heavy expense, when there are many districts in which these products might be manufactured cheaper than at Sháhjahánpur. In the Panjáb, notably in the Jalandhar District, excellent sugar-cane is grown, yielding a much larger percentage of sacharrine juice, than that grown in the Bareilly and Fathigarh districts. This fact has been ascertained by careful experiments made some years back. Then, 25 maunds of sugar-cane could be bought in the Jalandhar District for a rupee; while, at Sháhjahánpur, the rate was 7 maunds per rupee. A suitable factory, it is estimated, could be established near Jalandhar at a cost of from 2 to 2½ lakhs of rupees, which sum would be recovered in a couple of years' working. It is affirmed that sugar could, by this means, be supplied at half the present cost, and rum at little more than one-third the present cost. Surely, with these facts before it, the matter is one well worth the prompt attention of the new Department of Agriculture, Commerce, &c.

*Tea and Coffee.*—China tea and Indian tea are issued, in the proportion of half of each, to soldiers, everywhere throughout the Presidency; but in Assam and on the hills, tea of superior quality is grown, and can be supplied actually cheaper, cost of carriage considered, than the “cheap and nasty” China tea now issued; the importation of the latter would seem, therefore, very like carrying coals to Newcastle. And herein we say nothing of the duty incumbent on Government, of fostering and encouraging tea cultivation in India in a legitimate way, by bringing a large demand to the door of the planter, and continuing its patronage so long as it is satisfied that the quality of the supply is good, and the price moderate. Indian tea is purchased by contract, but so many petty and vexatious stipulations are insisted on, that the European planters are shy of tendering. Such conditions may be all very well for checking the wiles and tricky ways of petty native contractors; but are unnecessary and even prohibitory, in dealing with European gentlemen, as most of the Indian tea-planters are. On the other hand, coffee is purchased at each station separately by contract, or by Departmental Agency. The average price paid varies from 5 to 7 annas per lb. It has been calculated that, in dealing with this supply, were the natural sources tapped, and were purchases arranged for where the coffee is actually grown, *viz.*, in Ceylon and on the Western Coasts of the Madras Presidency, the average price might be reduced to 3 or to 4 annas per lb.

*Vegetables.*—Potatoes and onions are the two kinds of vegetable preferred by the soldier. There is no difficulty in supplying onions; and a full ration of potatoes, grown on the plains, is provided as long as the season for them lasts. After the season, potatoes are procured from the hills; and, for an intermediate period, during which they cannot be obtained either on the plains or on the hills, stations as far up as Ambála even, are supplied from the far distant slopes of Cherrapoonjee. In short, no effort nor expense is spared to maintain an uninterrupted supply to the soldier of his favourite esculent. This is, of course, very creditable and praiseworthy; and, doubtless, Government reaps the benefit in the consequent improvement in the soldier's health, and in the absence of scurvy in the Hospitals. However, the present article is not concerned with pointing out the numberless instances of consideration and liberality displayed by Government in its never-ceasing solicitude for the soldier's physical well-being; and therefore no mention would have been made of the vegetable ration probably, had it not been necessary to notice, in connection with this portion of the subject, a well-intentioned, but ill-directed attempt which has been made to dissipate the annui of the soldier in this country, by affording him the means



of employing his leisure in gardening. The idea was that, while a healthful recreation was provided him, he would ultimately produce all the vegetables required for his own consumption, being paid of course for so doing; and thus that profit and pleasure would be combined for him. To this end, regimental and company gardens were ordered to be established. The Barrack Department was ordered to lay out the plots, turn up the ground, and provide manure; while seeds were to be supplied on indent from the Government nurseries at Saháranpur. Prizes were to be distributed annually for the best regimental and company gardens, respectively. The initial expenses have been incurred, the seeds provided, and the prizes awarded, with great regularity; but the result, save in a few very isolated instances, has been *nil*. This humiliating failure is partly to be accounted for in the fact that the efforts of the men have been very desultory, and have had but little support and guidance from their officers, who could hardly be expected to possess either the needful experience or interest in horticulture. It is feared, that, not unfrequently, native *malis* have been employed to sow the seeds, and to attend to the gardens in so far as was necessary to secure the prizes annually awarded with but little discrimination, and in a perfunctory manner, by Committees, the members of which are usually appointed according to the ordinary roster of duty. The original scheme for the establishment of the soldier's gardens was, however, faulty; and contained within itself the elements of its own defeat. It was either too comprehensive, if its sole object were to provide recreation for the men; or if the more ambitious view were entertained of making the gardens self-supporting, as far as Government was concerned, and profitable to the men, the means provided were inadequate to the end desired. Either esoteric company gardens alone should have been provided, or parks and gardens on a large scale established under experienced superintendence. Sufficient encouragement would have been given to the former, were land and seeds provided to each man desirous of employing his leisure hours in a healthful occupation; while the latter, if properly managed, might be made remunerative, as well as affording places of resort for pleasant recreation, where also profitable wage for labour might be obtained.

**Malt Liquor.**—This supply is procured from England by contracts made by the Secretary of State. The quality is far from uniform; but, on the whole, may be said to be tolerably good. The price on the average paid by Government, inclusive of all charges previous to issue, is about 56/ to 57/ a hogshead of 52 gallons; while canteens pay 39/ a hogshead. Government, therefore, suffers a loss of about 17/ to 18/ on each hogshead issued. The total loss on this account may be set down, annually, at from eight

to nine lakhs of rupees. A part is, however, recuperated by profits on the sale of rum, amounting, probably, to one and-a-half, or two lakhs of rupees annually. Of course, the object in selling the malt liquor cheap, and the rum dear, is to induce the soldier to drink malt liquor, which is considered more wholesome for him in a hot climate, than ardent spirits. Assuming even that this is the case, it is a matter of doubt, whether the consumption of rum has been much diminished by cheapening the former. Again, it is hardly just that malt liquor drinkers should have their beverage cheapened at the expense of rum drinkers. Further, were the supply of malt liquor not monopolised by Government, it is believed that a keen competition would arise to meet the demand thus opened out; and that more particularly, a great impetus would be given to Hill Breweries. Thus, the soldier would eventually get better beer, as cheap at least as he does now. It is suggested, therefore, that rum should be sold at its actual average cost price. That malt liquor should either be procured, as at present, by Government, and if so, sold at the average cost price also; or that the supply should be left to regimental arrangement.

As regards the large surplus of 6 or 7 lakhs of rupees annually, which would thus become disentangled, it is considered that, seeing the country has been groaning under the burden of an income-tax, it behoves its rulers to be just before being generous; and, as the amount in question represents the cost of a boon withdrawable at will, there can be no sound argument against its re-appropriation to Revenue, more particularly as the boon has not fulfilled the object the liberal donors had in its bestowal. But if the money must be spent on the soldier, let it be so in some more useful way than in enabling him to "swill" beer cheap. Deprive no man of his beer; but, by all means, let him pay fairly for what he drinks.

*Hospital Diets and Comforts.*—For the most part scraggy mutton, or fowls and chickens, of the true *quis separabit* muscular development, go to the preparation of what is commonly called "meat diet." While the "spoon diet" consists of the usual "slops" concocted from arrowroot, sago, barley, rice, &c. &c. Milk, butter, and eggs are also supplied; but are of the most inferior, if not revolting, quality. Of a truth, it requires that the simple fact be recognised, that for Hospital use, the very best supplies of every sort procurable are the cheapest. Gram-fed mutton of the best quality should be provided. Dairy farms and poultry yards should be established, and affiliated to the depôts and model farms previously advocated. These would not only afford wholesome produce for the consumption of the sick, but might be made highly remunerative, while supplying

a want greatly felt by the European community at every mofussil station.

There is nothing to be said against the quality of the various farinaceous articles of diet above mentioned. It is, however, a well ascertained fact, that arrowroot contains superior nutritive and albuminous properties, bulk for bulk, and weight for weight, than sago. Why then is sago, a foreign product, ever used? Further, arrowroot is actually procured from England, notwithstanding that the plant (*Maranta Arundinacea*) yielding it flourishes in the Birbhūm District in all the luxuriance of indigenous growth. Let the Agricultural Department look to the fact.

A few remarks are necessary relative to the wines and spirits supplied to Hospitals. These are best described as bad, and indifferent. The quality is most unequal, and barely ever reaches the standard of "good military port." The brandy, for instance, is commonly "pure British" corn distilled, or inferior whisky sophisticated on the Continent. Therefore it follows that either too much or too little is paid for it. Too little, if it be desired to use a pure vinous brandy; or too much, if a corn spirit is needed. The very best whisky can be landed in Calcutta at about 15/ per dozen quart bottles, while really pure brandy would cost not less than 24 a dozen. The only stimulant used in Hospitals to which the above remarks do not apply, is Hollands gin, which is, for the most part, of good quality. The port wine recently obtained from a well-known firm, may also stand as an exception, in so far as it is supplied. The consumption being steady and well ascertained can easily be estimated for; and it is difficult to understand why the Commissary General does not make arrangements, if not direct with the growers, at least with the respectable firms dealing direct with the growers, to meet the requirements of Hospitals in this Presidency. Many firms would be found willing and anxious to keep up the stock at each station, of wines and spirits of fixed and uniform brands, and at fixed prices. Thus, the constant complaints of medical officers would be obviated, and the best hope might reasonably be entertained that the sick received sound and wholesome stimulants.

*Barrack Bedding and Hospital Clothing.*—The scale of Barrack bedding laid down is a fair one, and the articles supplied are on the whole good. Great want of uniformity in patterns exists, however, and thus peculation is facilitated. The sheeting is procured from England: why it should be so, is not manifest. There are sixteen cotton mills in Bombay, one in Calcutta, and one in the North-West Provinces, all capable of producing excellent sheeting of the quality required, cheaper than it can be procured from England. Can it be

that in this instance, as in others, the interests of Indian industry are sacrificed to the insatiable Moloch of Manchester Commercial ambition ?

The remarks relative to the lack of uniformity in the patterns of Barrack bedding apply equally to the different articles of Hospital clothing. It is a pleasure to be able to state, that a very large comparative saving has been effected in Hospital supplies generally, and in that of clothing in particular, by the appointment of native purveyors, subordinate to the Commissariat Department, in room of the European or Eurasian stewards formerly employed. The latter were under the sole control of medical officers who could not properly supervise them. Consequently, it is feared that it not unfrequently happened that supplies of all kinds, whether required or not, were indented for at the very highest scale ; the stewards arranging in collusion with the native contractors that, while no articles were really delivered, the medical officer's receipts should be obtained under false representations, and that the profits arising should be quietly shared. The frequency of instances in which stewards had to be tried by Court Martial for peculation and misfeasance of all kinds, happily led to the change of system. The present native purveyors have to lodge security-money ; and are held responsible, and have to account closely, for all the stores in their charge to the Commissariat Officer. A large saving in the amount estimated for in the budget for Hospital supplies has resulted ; but it is regretted that this in fact has not been communicated to medical officers ; many of whom, being ignorant of it, still grumble at having lost the services of the stewards, whose cue, of course, it was to make things smooth for them.

*Barrack Furniture.*—Other arrangements, to be presently considered, have been made for this supply, which has for some years heretofore rested with the Commissariat Department. It is useful to explain the system that obtained, if for no other reason than to hold up the mirror unmasking to the public eye an almost incredible folly, in the hope that it may not be repeated. To replace, or repair, a single broken chair, no less than four army Departments, two Military Committees, besides the Regimental authorities, were concerned. To exemplify the *modus operandi*. In the first instance, a requisition had to be submitted by the regimental authorities to the Barrack-master, who having ascertained, by causing the assembly of a Committee, in what degree the chair was damaged, submitted in turn another requisition for the approval and countersignature of the Divisional Quarter-Master-General, when it was forwarded to the Commissariat Department to arrange for the work being done. The Commissariat Officer, in the first place, applied to the Regimental authorities to ascertain

whether the regimental workshops could, or would, undertake the work. Failing the workshops, the requisition was made over to a contractor for compliance; but, not unfrequently, a fresh requisition had to be made out by the Commissariat Officer on the Department of Public Works, which, probably after months of delay did the work, and delivered it to the Commissariat Department, which delivered it to the Barrack Department, which after presenting it to another Committee of Officers, redelivered it to the Regimental authorities. The House that Jack built is a joke to this! It must be mentioned that preliminary to all this, the Quarter-Master-General's Department at Headquarters had to prepare plans (some of which, by the way, are unique and curious specimens of the limner's art), of all Barrack furniture, according to which musters were made up, and kept in store as a guide. The plans themselves were not considered a sufficient guide for construction; and *en vérité* they often were not, though of course they should have been. Thus a large stock of Barrack furniture musters had to be kept up at great expense at each military station.

The supply of Barrack furniture is now entrusted to the Department of Public Works. This is a decided improvement in some respects, for that Department will at least be competent to draw accurate plans, while the services of a "number of the cooks who spoiled the broth" will be dispensed with. Still, it is doubted whether, constituted as the Department of Public Works now is, its officers are not already too much overburdened with work to be able to devote due time and attention to any increase. Why should not the Regimental authorities make their own arrangements for procuring and keeping in repair Barrack furniture? A fixed scale of furniture being laid down, a fixed sum, estimated for annually, might be paid to each regiment, to enable renewals and repairs. The regiment might then either employ its own workshops, or procure elsewhere at option. Any saving on the amount estimated for should become the property of the regiment, and should be applied for its individual benefit in such manner as the Commander-in-Chief might deem fitting. Thus, the Regimental authorities and the men themselves would have a direct interest in an economical supply, and in preventing wilful damage, or careless breakage; while Government would be necessarily relieved of much trouble and expense. All that would have to be insisted on would be that articles of uniform patterns, constructed according to standard plans were maintained, and handed over from one regiment to another, in good order and repair. This should be no difficult matter to arrange.

*Transport.*—As the question of the future supply of transport will have to be carefully considered in the sequel promised at the commencement of Part I. of this article, it is proposed to restrict

the remarks here on this head to a point, in which economy is more immediately involved.

*Rewaree Camels.*—Till within about 20 years ago, the Government maintained its own establishment of camels, when what was called the Rewarree system of supply was substituted with the result of an immediate saving of about one-and-half lakhs of rupees annually. The same system is still maintained.

The Rewaree camel system was one formerly existing under native rule, whereby camel owners (called *Thokcedara*) were salaried to provide camels for the traffic, and general purposes of the native Governments. An officer was usually appointed to supervise and administer the system, but held no pecuniary interest in it. When adopted by the British Government, it was deemed expedient to employ some native agent of wealth and influence to give the system better effect. A nominal salary was paid him; and further, he was in reality granted a contract binding him to furnish camels at fixed rates. In other words the Rewaree system in its simple form was not adopted, but a contract based on the Rewarree system. This measure was all very well at the time of its introduction, when it was expedient to cultivate sedulously local influences; and, indeed, as already said, a large annual saving was immediately effected. It is, however, worthy of consideration, whether the services of such an agent and contractor are now needed. Roads and rail-roads have had their usual effect in destroying local influences; while, happily, that of Government has become paramount. Executive Commissariat Officers can now more readily procure camels, if need be, with the aid of the civil authorities, than the contractors or Head Chowdries as they are called. Why then should Head Chowdries be employed?

There are from 5,000 to 6,000 camels employed in the Panjáb, and the North-West Provinces; and these are all now provided by a single Head Chowdry, or contractor. His deeds of agreement are made with the Deputies Commissary General of each circle. Executive Commissariat Officers, for whom, be it observed, the work has to be done, have no control over the Head Chowdry; who has, indeed, artfully arranged that their authority and power of supervision shall be reduced to a minimum. This leads to the worst abuses. The rate paid for camels "present at station" is nearly double that paid for camels "at graze." Hence, it is an object to keep the fewest number possible at the station. The camels entered on the rolls as "at graze" are, therefore, only periodically, generally once a month, brought into the station for muster and inspection. It is feared that during the remainder of the month they are hired out for private purposes. It is notorious too, that the contracts granted to the Head Chowdries were sublet by them to the Naib Chowdries

at each station at from 12 annas to one rupee 4 annas per camel per mensem ; while the Naib Chowdry received in turn four annas per camel per mensem from the Thokeedars or camel-owners. In short, Government pays very needlessly from 1 to 1-8 per camel per mensem for each camel employed. This calculated on 5,000 or 6,000 camels represents a very handsome income enjoyed by the Head Chowdry and his Naib Chowdries, in addition to the monthly salaries of 150 and 20 respectively paid them by Government. The salary of the Head Chowdry has recently been raised from 100 to 150 a month on the representation, it is believed, that he was a poor hard-worked man inadequately remunerated. There is a touch of humour in this, irresistibly comic to a native's fancy. Many would doubtless be glad to possess an equally good receipt for making £6,000 to £7,000 a year so easily.

This concludes the remarks under the head "Matériel." The subject has been a difficult one to handle popularly ; while in considering economy it must ever be expected that the necessary ventilation will not always prove palatable to those who may have interests imperilled. The writer, whilst emphatically disclaiming all pretensions to infallibility in the statements made and opinions expressed, has endeavoured, by a conscientious *exposé* of things as they appear to himself, to place the public in general in a position to judge for themselves. His aim has also been to attract wiser heads and abler pens to a subject of no mean importance ; and if he has but succeeded in this aim, he is well content.

---

## ART VII.—THE BRA'HMA SAMAJ AND THE NATIVE MARRIAGE ACT.

THE most important social disabilities under which the people known as the Bráhma Samáj have heretofore laboured, have been removed by the passing of a Civil Marriage Bill on the 19th March 1872. When the measure was brought forward in February last, some of the Hon'ble Members of the Legislative Council asked for a postponement; and as the grounds on which they demanded this delay seemed not altogether unreasonable, the postponement was agreed to, and was on the whole sanctioned by public opinion. The opposition, however, which the Bill had to encounter at its final stage was, to a certain extent, unexpected; and seems to us to have been unnecessary and injudicious. We believe that in this matter the people of India owe a large debt of gratitude to the firm will and conspicuous abilities of Mr. Fitzjames Stephen; to whom, supported by His Excellency the Viceroy and other members of the Council, we chiefly owe the abolition of disabilities which were utterly repugnant to those principles of toleration under which we profess to govern this country. We admit that, in legislation of this kind, the utmost care and discretion is needed. We are entirely opposed to hasty reforms, even in the direction of toleration. But we believe that a movement, which has largely commended itself to the educated classes amongst the natives of this country, and which has enlisted the sympathies of a number of thoughtful and intelligent persons both here and in Europe, has at any rate a claim to be so far recognised by the Government as to be freed as much as possible from oppressive disabilities. The leaders of the movement themselves deprecate any interference with, or any appearance of unnecessarily shocking the prejudices of those of their countrymen who insist on implicit adherence to ancient customs and institutions. But they demand personal liberty of opinion, and as much protection from an unjust amount of social persecution as is accorded by law to native Christians and the converts of other religions; and we are distinctly of opinion that this enfranchisement could not reasonably have been denied them.

The deliberations which have accompanied the elaboration of this measure, and the careful and earnest consideration which has attended its progress, on the part both of the press and of the responsible leaders of public opinion in this country, have not been unworthy of its importance. The gravity of an Act which, for the first time in the history of legislation in India, lays down the important principle that the privilege of legal marriage is neither to



be contingent on any religious conformity, nor to be denied to any religious scruples, can hardly be overrated. We consequently believe that an historical *resumé* of the fitful progress of the question whilst it was yet under deliberation, may be both useful as a record of a most eventful controversy, and interesting to a large number of our readers.

The Bráhma Samáj, having adopted a mode of worship more or less assimilated to that which is sanctioned by the usage of Theists throughout the world, were not unreasonably anxious to eliminate from their marriage rites (which had been as yet necessarily in conformity with ancient Hindú usage) those portions which appeared to be inconsistent with their professions and their other rites and observances. Babú Debendra Náth Tagore, a minister of the new sect, married his eldest daughter a few years ago in accordance with a reformed ritual, which was specially prepared for the body, and from which all ceremonies inconsistent with its professed opinions were excluded. The marriage was presided over by a Bráhman minister; and the collateral social observances which obtain on the occasion of marriages amongst Hindús, were adhered to. Yet his Hindú friends and relatives forsook him; they did not even honour the nuptials with their presence. Since then he has been held to be an outcaste by those who had heretofore been dear and near to him. Babú Rajparain Bose, another Bráhma minister, also married his daughter according to the reformed ritual, but he likewise was treated no better. Since then about forty marriages have been contracted in accordance with the ritual laid down by the Samáj. Widows have remarried and some Bráhmas have intermarried. But a doubt occurred to certain members of the body, who were interested in the movement, whether the marriages celebrated were valid in the eye of the law. Under these circumstances they thought of taking the opinion of the Advocate General in the matter. Mr. Cowie, in reply to certain questions on which his opinion was solicited said,—“In the present state of the law, such marriages are not binding on the parties, and the (so-called) wife would have no legal redress if deserted by her husband, nor would the offspring of such unions be legitimate or have any rights of succession, though it would of course be perfectly competent for the parents to provide for such children by will. I cannot offer any anticipation as to what the legislature would or would not do. The adoption of a particular form of marriage by the members of the Bráhma-samája would, in the legal sense, be no more a custom than their adoption of a particular religious creed. Any provision made by will by a member of the Bráhma-samája in favour of his children would be paramount to the claims of any Hindú relatives, and this would extend, so far as Bengal is concerned, to the father's

"share in ancestral, as well as to his self-acquired property. In the provinces other than Bengal, where the testamentary power is more limited, and also in the absence of a will, the children would not be entitled to the succession. But even where the Mitáksharā law prevails, the father may leave by will his self-acquired property to his children by a marriage according to the forms adopted by the Bráhma-samāja. It would be a prudent precaution in all cases for the testator to name the children whom he intends to make his devisees, and not merely to refer to them as his children or sons or daughters. I would suggest to the Bráhmist community, that it will be of great importance to their interests to obtain, if possible, some authoritative legal decision on the question (one which I regard as at present very obscure) how far the legal validity, as distinguished from the orthodox regularity, of marriages between Hindús depends on the observance of particular ceremonies. And I need hardly add that marriages solemnised according to the forms adopted by the community, are morally binding on the parties, even though no rights, which the law recognises, are hereby created."

The opinion of the Advocate General was tantalising. Those who thought that Bráhma marriages were invalid, were prepared for what the highest legal authority in the land told them. But still some of the Bráhmas, who entertained the belief that such marriages were valid under the existing law, hesitated to accept the opinion as final in a matter in which the vital interests of the issues of such marriages were concerned. A large majority of these bowed to the legal opinion, and thought of using it for the purpose for which it was taken. At this time the Bráhma Samáj was divided into two sections, the Adi Samáj and the *Bráhma Samája* of India. The members of the latter convened a meeting on 5th July 1868 at the Bráhma Mission House, No. 300, Chittpore Road, Calcutta, to consider the advisability of memorialising Government for the legalisation of Bráhma marriages: Bábu Keshub Chunder Sen presided at this meeting. The opinions of the committee, appointed at a previous meeting to take the subject into consideration, were read. After an animated discussion, the following resolution was adopted:—"That in the opinion of this meeting, it is desirable to memorialise Government for the legalisation of Bráhma marriages." The chairman informed the meeting that most of the provincial Bráhma Samájes had communicated their opinions, and were anxious for the presentation of a memorial to Government on the subject. Subsequently the Bráhmas represented, through their leader Bábu Keshub Chunder Sen, to Government the extreme hardship under which they laboured in regard to the celebration of their marriages in accordance with the reformed ritual to which reference has already

been made, and the social disabilities and penalties which they incurred in the absence of a legal sanction to such marriages. Lord Lawrence was, at the time to which we are alluding, Viceroy and Governor General of India, and one of the cleverest of English jurists was legal member of His Excellency's Council. The necessity for the relief sought was manifest, and the reasonableness of the prayer could not be denied.

On 10th September 1868, the Hon'ble Mr. Maine introduced a Bill to legalise marriages between certain Natives of India not professing the Christian religion. The course pursued was just what any other enlightened Government would have pursued under similar circumstances. Mr. Maine said that the Bill had been prepared at the instance of a sect called the Bráhmas, which, since its foundation by Rájá Rám Mohan Ráy, had gone on progressing. In the course of the speech which he delivered at the meeting of Council on the introduction of the measure, the Hon'ble gentleman remarked—and we think justly—that “it was not the policy of the Queen's Government in India to refuse the power of marriage to any of Her Majesty's subjects, and he doubted whether even orthodox Hindús would wish to deny to the Bráhmas, a legal privilege fully enjoyed by Sautáls and Gonds. Some slight difficulty had occurred in the preparation of the measure. When relief in any matter connected with religion was sought by any sect or body of the natives of India, and when a case for such relief was established, he held it to be good policy to confine the relief to the particular sect or body making the application. Considering the unknown depths of native feeling on these subjects, it was better not to generalise beyond the immediate necessity; and hence Mr. Maine thought the policy which confined the relief of the Native Converts' Marriage Dissolution Act to Christians was sound, although there were doubtless other classes in the same position. But after much conversation with the native gentleman above referred to, Mr. Maine had convinced himself that the creed of the Bráhmas lacked stability. The process by which the sect was formed might be increasing in activity; but there seemed also to be a growing disinclination to accept any set of common tenets. It would be difficult for legal purposes to define a Bráhma, and if no definition were given, there might shortly be petitions for relief by persons who were in the same legal position as the present applicants, but who declared that they could not conscientiously call themselves Bráhmas. Hence the Bill had been drawn with some degree of generality. It would legalise marriages between natives of India not professing the Christian, and objecting to be married in accordance with the rites of the Hindú, Muhammadan, Buddhist, Pársi or Jewish religions, provided the marriages were celebrated under certain

“ conditions. The religions mentioned were the only recognised “ religions of India which were worth referring to.”

Whether the sect which had been formed more than forty years ago, and which, according to Mr. Maine, was increasing in activity, lacked in stability, was doubtless beside the issue raised. Many sects have from time to time started into existence: few of these have been stable, as the reader of history knows. Whether the Bengal theist would stand the lapse of time, or would be absorbed into some other sect, would be idle to speculate upon. But since the Bráhmās asked for relief on a question of vital importance, it was but fair that the relief should be afforded to them in some shape by the legislature.

The conditions on which, by the provisions of the Bill, relief was intended to be given, may according to Mr. Maine be summed up thus:—“ That marriages should be solemnised in the “ presence of an official to be styled the Registrar of Native “ Marriages; that the parties should be unmarried; that the “ husband should be over the age of eighteen, and the wife over “ the age of fourteen, and that the parties should not be related “ to each other in any of the degrees prohibited in the first “ schedule. If the wife had not completed the age of eighteen “ years, the previous consent of her father or guardian was also “ required. The Registrar would be appointed for each district “ by the Local Government, and would probably be, as in the “ case of Parsee marriages, the Registrar appointed under the law “ for the registration of assurances. The Registrar would make “ a certificate of the marriage, and enter it in his register, which “ would be open to public inspection. The Bill also contained a “ clause legalising prior marriages between the Natives described “ in the Bill, if the marriage had been solemnised in the “ presence of three witnesses, and if the provisions as to age, “ consent, and prohibited degrees had been complied with. “ Lastly, the Bill contained a clause subjecting every person “ married under the proposed Act to the penalties of bigamy “ who, during the lifetime of his other wife or husband, contracted “ a marriage without having been lawfully divorced.”

The motion was agreed to, and Mr. Maine said that the Bill would in substance be a Civil Marriage Bill. It was referred to a Select Committee on 27th November 1868, to report in two months. Several objections were urged against the measure, and in the speech which Mr. Maine made in the Legislative Council, he explained some of the objections.

The first objection was that it did not apply to Christians. In alluding to this objection, Mr. Maine said:—“ Every imputation “ that this Government intends to establish an inequality between “ different classes of Her Majesty’s subjects is serious, and therefore

"I am much indebted to those who have pointed out that this objection rests upon misapprehension. The words which render the Bill inapplicable to persons professing the Christian religion are taken from the Statute 14 and 15 Vic. C. 40, which regulates the civil marriage of Christians in India. It was necessary to keep the two systems of registration apart, since it would generally not be convenient for native gentlemen and ladies to have recourse to the Registrar appointed under the statute. But the principle of the present measure is to place natives as nearly as possible on the same footing as Europeans."

The second objection was that civil marriage was only a modern institution in Europe; and that India was not sufficiently advanced to dispense with the necessity of the forms of a religious marriage. "The fallacy of the argument," remarked Mr. Maine, "does not lie in the misstatement of the fact, but in the application of it, and in the assumption that it has any relevancy to the condition of India. It is true that civil marriage, which was once an universal institution of the Western world, disappeared for several centuries, and was only revived about a hundred years ago by the Emperor Joseph II., in the hereditary States of the House of Austria. Probably, the last relics of the absolute obligation of religious marriages at this moment is disappearing in Spain. But the theory which imposed religious marriage in Europe has never had any counterpart in India. In European countries the legislator believed, or professed to believe, that some one religion was true, and could alone impart efficacy to the rites by which marriage was celebrated. That was his justification, whatever it was worth. For the protection of that one religion, and in its interest, he compelled everybody to submit to its ceremonial. But there never has been anything like this in India under the British Government; and whatever were the theory of the Muhammadans, there was nothing like it in their practice. It is a famous saying of a well-known French statesman, 'that the law should be atheistic.' Well, if the expression be permissible, the law of marriage has in this country always been atheistic, in the sense that it has been perfectly indifferent between several religions of which no two could be true. One may be true, but not two. This peculiarity of Indian law results in the rule, that a man may at pleasure desert the religion in which he was born and contract a civil marriage. A Hindú can become a Christian or Muhammadan, or he may adopt the fetichism of the Kóls or Santáls, and he can contract a lawful marriage. But if he stops short of that, as the law stands, marriage is denied to him." Verily so. A native may become a Christian, a Muhammadan, or a Santál or a Gond. In all these cases the right of lawful marriage is not denied

to him. But when, as Mr. Maine truly observed, "he retains some tenderness for his old faith, and continues to regard it as not absolutely evil, he is debarred from all share in the fundamental institution of organised civil society. Such a state of the law is unexampled in Europe."

Yet the opposition against the measure was the strongest from those who could not consistently ignore the arguments advanced by Mr. Maine. We allude to that section of the educated native community which contended that their rights were invaded.

The third objection urged was, that the Government was bound to protect the native religions by forbidding their adherents to desert them except for a recognised faith. "There is no doubt," Mr. Maine remarked, "that there is some sort of indirect protection to native religions given by this state of the law of marriage in the existing condition of native society." But he asked:—"Now, can we continue this protection? I think we cannot. Take the case of the applicants for the present measure. They say that the ritual to which they must conform, if they wish to contract lawful marriages, is idolatrous. I don't use the word offensively, but merely in the sense in which a lawyer in the High Court is occasionally obliged to speak of the family idol. They say that the existing Hindú ceremonial of marriage implies belief in the existence or power of, and worship addressed to, idols. No doubt there are some of the Bráhmās who have as little belief in these beings as the applicants, but still do not object to go through the ritual; and, naturally enough, they exhibit considerable impatience at the scruples of their co-religionists. But that is only a part of the inevitable history of opinion. The first step is to disbelieve; the next to be ashamed of the profession of belief. The applicants allege that their consciences are hurt and injured by joining in a ritual which implies belief in that which they do not believe. Now, can we compel them to submit to this ritual?"

We reply no. Certainly not; and we believe it is opposed to all sense of a spirit of toleration to impose such a hardship on the consciences of any class or community.

Mr. Maine continued:—"We are bound to refrain from interfering with native religious opinions, simply on the ground that those opinions are not ours; and we are bound to respect the practices, which are the expression of those opinions, so long as they do not violate decency and public order. That is the condition of our Government in this country. I will even go further and say that, where a part of a community come forward and allege that they are the most enlightened members of it, and call on us to forbid a practice which their advanced ideas lead them to think injurious to their civilisation, the Govern-

"ment should still be cautious. \* \* \* \* \* Here, however, we have a very different case. A number of gentlemen come forward and ask to be relieved from the necessity of submitting to rites against which their own conscience rebels. They do not ask to impose their ideas on others, but to be relieved from a burthen which presses on themselves. Can we refuse the relief? I think we cannot. I think the point is here reached, at which it is impossible for us to forget, that we do not ourselves believe in the existence or virtue or power of the beings in whose honour this ritual is constructed. And I say this the more confidently, because I believe that such a doctrine is in the true interest of the sincere believers in native religions. If we once begin trampling on the rights of conscience, it is very far from certain that the process will continue for the advantage of native religions. The members of these communities have the strongest reason for maintaining the absolute sacredness of the rights of conscience."

We think the position taken by Mr. Maine was incontrovertible. We have no wish to notice the technical difficulties alluded to by the Hon'ble gentleman in the course of his speech. There is another thing to which Mr. Maine alluded, and that was the ignominy to which the issues of such marriages would be subjected, were the marriages to be legally disallowed. He said:—"There can be no worse penalty on improper marriages, than the disallowance of such marriages. Such a penalty has almost no characteristic which should distinguish a penalty. As regards those persons who directly join in the supposed offence, it falls on the more scrupulous and leaves the less scrupulous untouched. But in fact it hardly falls on the supposed offenders at all. It is really imposed on the children, who are dishonoured through life for an offence in which they could not possibly have participated. If it be really necessary for us to protect the native religions by forbidding marriages not celebrated with their rites, it is much better that we should effect this by any direct civil penalty, or, if necessary, criminal penalty, rather than by the disallowance of the marriage."

The above hardly needs any comment to commend it to thoughtful persons. Let us now see who were the parties who opposed the measure. Mr. Maine said:—"Three petitions had been presented against the Bill, one from the Parsis, which would probably be met by the concession he had proposed. There was another from the British Indian Association, which was in fact a petition against Act XXI. of 1850, and which in effect claimed that the majority of the members of every religious community should have absolute power to compel the minority to follow all received ceremonial. A third petition was

" from certain Native gentlemen at Bombay, who begged that the Bill might not be proceeded with till they had had an opportunity of stating their objections to it. Mr. Maine would cheerfully have complied with this request, and it would be seen that he had proposed a long date for the report of the Select Committee in order that native opinion might declare itself."

But was the report of the Select Committee presented within two months as agreed to? The report of this Committee is before us. It is dated 27th March 1871. The report on the Bill was hanging fire from 26th January 1869 to 27th March 1871, or upwards of two years. The following extracts will shew the result of the deliberations of this Committee. The Committee said :—" It is the unanimous opinion of the Local Governments that the Bill, as introduced, should not be passed. They all, on the other hand, agree that the Bill would be unobjectionable if confined to the Bráhma Samáj, for whose benefit it was originally designed. We have accordingly narrowed its operation to the members of that sect. We have provided that the parties shall, before the solemnisation of the marriage, sign a declaration that they are members of the Bráhma Samáj, that they are unmarried, that the bridegroom has completed his age of 18 years, and the bride her age of 14, that they are not related to each other within the degrees of consanguinity or affinity prohibited by the custom which would have regulated a marriage between them if the Act had not been passed, and (when the wife has not completed her age of eighteen) that the consent of her father or guardian has been given to the marriage."

The Committee recommended that the Bill as amended be passed. The report was signed by the Hon'ble J. F. Stephen and the Hon'ble F. R. Cockerell.

At a meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 27th March 1871, Mr. Stephen presented the report of the Select Committee and said that " the Bill was circulated to the local Governments and had been much discussed. It appeared that the local Governments were almost unanimous on two points. First, that there could be no objection to give relief to the Bráhmas; and, secondly, that very great objection would be felt by all classes of orthodox Hindús if the measure were made a general one. They said that the direct effect of such a measure would be to introduce very considerable alterations in their social rules and the institution of caste generally. He felt the weight of this objection. The Bill, therefore, had been reduced to meet the specific case of the Bráhma Samáj, and provided a simple form by which they would be married according to their own views."

It was expected that the Bill would be passed at the next sitting of the Legislative Council to be held on 31st March 1871. But



why it could not be passed on that date may be gathered from the following words of Mr Stephen. He said :—"This was now a Bill "for legalising marriages between members of the Bráhma Samáj. Originally, the Bill, as the council were aware, was of a "much more general nature, and was received with considerable "disfavour by the local governments to which it was referred. "They all agreed that if the Bill was confined to the immediate "object for which it was introduced, there was no objection to its "being passed, and it was clearly desirable that such an Act "should be passed. He had supposed that the matter might "be settled to-day; but he had just received a deputation from "a part of the members of the Bráhma Samáj,—which it appeared "was not altogether unanimous—who said that they had not an "opportunity of considering the Bill, although the leading members of the sect had approved of it, and that they wished to do "so before the measure, which was likely to affect their interests "to a considerable extent, became law. That appeared to be a "perfectly reasonable suggestion, and accordingly, if he now moved "that the report of the Select Committee be taken into consideration, the Bill could be published for general information. There "was no immediate hurry in regard to the matter, and it could be "passed while the Government was at Simla."

The Bráhma Samáj, at least that section of it which did not represent the Adi Samáj, anxiously looked to the appointed day. The Legislative Council met on 19th July 1871 at Simla. But the Bill as it stood seems to have been doomed. The Government vacillated, and on its vacillation Mr. Stephen remarked :—"The matter was one of great delicacy and importance, and "some explanation appeared desirable as to the course which had "been pursued with respect to it. The Bill which was originally "brought forward by his predecessor (Mr. Maine), would have had "the effect of establishing a system of civil marriage for all classes "in India. This step was justly considered one of extreme "importance, and the opinions of all the local Governments were "requested with reference to it. Their opinions were, in many "instances, unfavourable to the proposed measure; but it appeared to be generally thought that there would be no objection "to a measure which would meet the wants of any individual "sect, such as the Bráhma Samáj. A Bill, thus restricted in its "scope, was framed accordingly and published in the *Gazette*. "Thereupon a deputation had represented that there were great "objections to it on the part of many members of the sect. This "was entirely new to him (Mr. Stephen), as he had supposed "that the whole of the Bráhma body wished for a Bráhma Bill, "if the general Bill could not be had. He had accordingly promised to wait for three months before proceeding with the Bill.

“ Just before the end of the three months, there had come another deputation with memorials, the signatures to which were alleged to amount to 2,000, objecting strongly, for reasons set forth in their petition, to the passing of any Bill at all on the subject. Under these circumstances, there seemed but one course open to him, namely, to promise to postpone any further dealings with the Bill till the Government returned to Calcutta, when the representatives of the two opposite factions of the Bráhma sect might be confronted, and the real wishes and objects of each be ascertained. There had been warm discussion in the papers, and the advocates of the measure—progressive Bráhmas as they were called—had complained vehemently at the delay of three years which had occurred in dealing with the measure; their complaints were certainly not altogether unnatural.”

Mr. Stephen continued:—“ He, Mr. Stephen himself, had been blamed for delaying to pass the Bill now, in deference to objections which the Committee was supposed to have considered before it submitted its report, which objections were contained in a memorial submitted to them in 1868 by the Adi Bráhma Samáj. The fact was, that the memorial in which these grounds were urged, though mentioned in the list of papers referred to in the margin of the report, had never come before him, though it had apparently been considered by the Committee as originally constituted and probably formed one at least of the reasons why the Bill had been thrown originally into a general form. The Bill, as brought to his notice, was a general Civil Marriage Bill, and all the papers before him discussed the propriety of a measure of that nature. There was nothing in any of them to show the existence of any difference of opinion between different sections of the Bráhmas as to a Bráhma Marriage Bill. It was quite true that he had signed the report, which stated the Committee had examined a number of papers mentioned in the margin, of which the memorial of the Adi Bráhma Samáj was one; but he individually had never seen that paper. The papers which he did see referred to the general measure exclusively. The difficulty was really a very considerable one, owing to the divided condition of the sect, and their opposed wishes on the matter. Any class of persons, practically debarred from marriage by their religious belief, certainly seemed to be entitled to legislative relief; but it was one thing to meet the wishes of a small body of persons, and another to make a change which might be regarded in the light of a direct attack on the institutions of the country. When the wishes of the two contending parties among the Bráhmas had been ascertained, an opportunity would be taken of announcing the course which Government intended to pursue with reference to the

"subject, and of stating the form in which whatever relief it might be considered necessary to give, would be given. Apart however from this, the character of the new memorials submitted to him was such, that he considered himself bound to get, if possible, to the bottom of the matter, even at the expense of a delay which he regretted; and the case was emphatically one in which it was a less evil to go too slow than to go too fast."

But what was the real state of things in regard to the division of the two sections of the Bránma Samáj? In an article dated so far back as 15th October 1868, the *Indian Mirror* wrote as follows:—

"We are sorry to see the strength of Bráhma public opinion, in favour of the legalisation of Bráhma marriage, has been underestimated in some quarters; and some have highly exaggerated the disagreement which prevails amongst our community on the subject. With a view to disabuse the public mind of such misconceptions, we feel it our duty to state, that besides the members of the Bráhma Samáj of India in Calcutta, from whom the movement originated, the members of the following Bráhma Samájes have already emphatically declared their approval of it, and lent their hearty support:—Dacca, Furreedpore, Burrisaul, Mymensing, Sherepore, Krishnagur, Santipore, Cutwa, Bagachra, Burranaghur, Connaghur, Howrah, Bhágulpore, Berhampore, Malda, Jumalpole, Monghyr, Patna, Mozufferpore, Allahabad, Cawnpore, Bareilly, Lucknow, Lahore, Rawulpindee, Bunnoo and the Prarthana Samáj at Bombay. As regards the other Samájes whose opinions have not yet reached us, we have no doubt they will mostly declare themselves in favor of the movement. The oppositionists thus form a small minority, and lie scattered about here and there."

Public opinion at this time was agreed, with very few exceptions, as to the justice of the relief applied for. In an article dated 1st November 1868, the same paper remarked:—

"We have read with great interest the opinions of the press for and against the new Marriage Bill, and we are glad to find that almost all our English contemporaries, and the really progressive and liberal portion of the native press, have supported it. In some quarter it has excited opposition, but we do not in the least wonder at it. No reform movement can smoothly make its way into the national mind without meeting with some degree of antagonism at the hands of those who are inimical to progress. In the present case the position which the oppositionists have assumed, and the arguments with which they have tried to fortify it, are altogether untenable, and will not bear criticism. To say that the nation does not want the Bill, or that a certain number of Bráhmas do not want it, is of no avail;

"the legislature seeks to give relief to those who do want it, and to them only. As regards the clamour raised by some that Bráhma marriage is Hindú marriage, and is therefore already valid, it may be silenced by the bare mention of the argument that, as Bráhmism is not confined to Hindús only, but has been already embraced by a few Mahomedans, and is likely to be adopted by Parsees and men of other religious denominations in India, it is absurd to suppose that marriages among such Bráhma converts will be, or can be, recognized as Hindú marriages."

In the year 1869, the Secretary of State had issued instructions to the Supreme Government to refer the Native Marriage Bill to the several local Governments and administrations before proceeding in the matter. In accordance with those opinions, the Bill was modified as stated in the report of the select committee, which was presented to the Legislative Council in March 1871, and to which allusion has already been made.

Before the return of the council from Simla in the winter of 1871, a meeting of the Bráhma Samáj of India was held at the Town Hall on 30th September 1871, to hear Bábú Norendra Nath Sen's lecture on the Marriage Law in India, and to elicit public opinion in support of the Bráhma Marriage Bill. As a solicitor of the High Court, the lecturer demolished the position taken by those who were opposed to the Bill. The proceedings of the meeting were brought to a close by the President, Bábú Keshub Chunder Sen, who delivered an able address on the occasion. Bábú Surendra Nath Banerjea, C.S., who spoke at this meeting, said:—"It is rather strange that Government should have any scruples on this point; for it would not be difficult to refer to instances in which our rulers, on the clearest grounds of expediency, have not hesitated to disregard such sentiments. I hold it a maxim in politics, that although a Government is bound to pay deference to the religious feelings of its subjects, nevertheless, when those feelings are carried to an unwarrantable extent, it is the duty of the Government not only not to take cognisance of such feelings, but to set them at open defiance. The question which Government has really to decide amounts to this, whether it should pay deference to certain foolish sentiments, or whether it ought to remove from many a Native home one of the most prolific sources of uneasiness and disquiet, which must necessarily cast a kind of gloom over those homes."

Dr. Murray Mitchell, who took a part in the proceedings of the meeting, remarked: "But I have carefully read the well-weighed words of Mr. Fitzjames Stephen, and it appears to me that he fully concedes the principle for which the progressive Bráhmas are contending. He declares that any body of men who are not capable of being legally married according to their consciences,

"have a right to claim redress. Therefore, I say, there is no reason "to be discouraged for anything that has issued from the Legislative Council, or from Mr. Stephen. I have the most perfect "confidence that this cold season will not pass over before the "relief in some satisfactory form is granted, which many so "earnestly crave."

Mr. Stephen, on the return of the Council from Simla in October 1871, obtained the views of the two sections of the Bráhma Samáj on the question. The following extracts from a statement of the Bráhma Samáj of India furnish, to our thinking, a clear exposition of the case :—

1. "That the major portion of the Bráhmo community do not feel the necessity of such an enactment, and are opposed to any legislative interference in the matter.

1. "It will appear from the subjoined list, that of nearly sixty-five Bráhma Samájes in India, fifty-three have supported the Bill, while only three have, up to the present moment, opposed it :—

#### FOR THE BILL.

"BENGAL.—Bráhma Samáj of India, Barahanagore, Kallyghat, Barripur, Harinavi, Howrah, Connaghur, Chinsurah, Burdwan, Rajmehal, Bhagulpore, Jamalpore, Moughyr, Patna, Gya, Hazaribagh, Krishnaghur, Gournagore, Kooshtea, Coomercolly, Osinanapore, Selidah, Furreedpore, Bogra, Beaulah, Dacca, Burrisaul, Chittagong, Brahmanbaria, Kallygatcha, Kishengunge, Mymensing, Sylhet, Cachar, Sibsagar, Nowgong, Gowhatty, Gowalpara, Cuttack.

"NORTH-WESTERN PROVINCES.—Allahabad Branch of the Bráhma Samáj of India, Cawnpore, Bareilly, Agra, Toondla, Dehra Doon.

"ODDH.—Lucknow.

"CENTRAL PROVINCES.—Jubbulpore.

"PUNJAB.—Lahore, Rawul Pindee.

"MADRAS.—Southern India Bráhma Samáj, Bangalore, Mangalore.

"BOMBAY.—Prárthana Samáj.

#### AGAINST THE BILL.

"Calcutta Adi Samáj, Berhampore, Allahabad.

"As regards the parties who have married according to the rites of the Bráhma Samáj, the majority of them are anxious to have their marriages legalized. Out of thirty-nine Bráhmos who have so married, only ten seem to deny the necessity of a legislative enactment; of these ten, seven belong to the family of the leader of the opposition movement.

2. "That the Bill is aggressive, inasmuch as it invalidates all marriages between Bráhmos unless solemnized according to the provision of the Bill, although such marriages may be conformable to the Hindú scriptures.

2. "The Bill is entirely of a permissive character. It seeks to legalise marriages between Bráhmós 'when solemnised in accordance with the provisions of this Act,' but it does not say that such marriages would be illegal if otherwise solemnised. Should, however, the word '*when*' appear to the legislature to be ambiguous, the preamble may be thus worded :—

"Whereas marriages between members of the sect called the Bráhmó Somáj are held to be illegal unless solemnised in accordance with the rites of some religion recognised by law, it is expedient to legalise such marriages when solemnized in accordance with the provisions of this Act ; it is hereby enacted as follows, &c.'

3. "That the operation of the law will tend to separate the Bráhmós from the Hindú community of whom they form an integral part.

3. "It is a well known fact that Bráhmós are excluded from the Hindú community directly they take the bold step of marrying according to Bráhmó rites. It is owing to this reason that so few Bráhmó marriages have taken place. Even those who have married according to the rites of the conservative school have been excommunicated.

4. "That legislative interference is not needed in regard to the reformation of social customs.

4. "The history of social reformation in India shows, that the interposition of the legislature has always been sought and obtained by native reformers in spite of the opposition of the overwhelming majority of the orthodox Hindú community. The Act for the suppression of Suttee and the Hindú Widow's Re-marriage Act are instances in point.

5. "That there are many Hindú sects whose marriages, though not strictly conformable to the orthodox rites enjoined by the Shastras, have in course of time been accepted as valid, and that the same principle applies to the Bráhmós.

5. "The principle contended for does not apply to Bráhmó marriages. The plea of custom cannot be urged in favour of social innovations which date only ten years back. The late Advocate General, Mr. T. H. Cowie, says :—'The adoption of a particular form of marriage by the members of the Bráhmó Somáj would, in the legal sense, be no more a *custom* than their adoption of a particular religious creed.'

6. "That the Bill prescribes a civil form of marriage and wholly dispenses with religious rites.

6. "The Bill does not compel the Bráhmós to dispense with the religious nuptial rites observed by them, which in their estimation are essential to the sanctity of marriage. Its effect will be that the Bráhmós, while continuing to observe their present material

ceremony, will super-add to it the civil form of registration prescribed in the Bill. In cases where the Registrar calls at the place of marriage, the religious and civil forms may be simultaneously observed.

7. "That the age prescribed in the Bill for contracting marriage is not conformable to the usages of the country, and that the marriageable age of native girls is below 14 years.

7. "The object of those who pray for the Bill is to reform the usages of the country. In the opinion of the leading medical authorities in India, who were consulted on the subject, the age at which native girls ought to marry is 16. According to some 14 is the minimum marriageable age.

8. "That the word 'Bráhma' is vague and indefinite.

8. "It is not more difficult to define a Bráhma than to define a Hindú for legal purposes; yet public opinion has attached to each word a significance which can hardly be mistaken. It is only by a profession of belief in certain fundamental doctrines that a Hindú, Buddhist, Mahomedan, Christian, or Bráhma may be distinguished.

9. "That the Bill is unnecessary, because the Bráhmos in celebrating their marriages, discard only those Hindú ceremonies which are idolatrous, and which are not essential to a valid Hindú marriage. Bráhma marriages retain all that is essential to Hindú marriage, and are, therefore, valid both (a) in the eye of the law, and (b) in the opinion of the Hindú community.

9. (a) "That Bráhma marriages are legally invalid, and entail civil disabilities on the parties marrying, and their descendants, and that a special enactment is necessary, will appear from the following opinion of the late Advocate General:—

"In the absence of special enactment a marriage between two members of a new religious community, such as the Bráhma Samáj, not celebrated in accordance with the provision of any of the Marriage Acts in force in India, nor with those required by Hindú Law would, I apprehend, be invalid.

"It follows that, in the present state of the law, such marriages as last adverted to are not binding on the parties, and that the (so called) wife would have no legal redress if deserted by her husband, nor would the offspring of such unions be legitimate or have any rights of succession."

(b) "According to the leading Pandits in Calcutta, Benares, and Nuddea, to whom the subject was referred for opinion, Bráhma marriages are inconsonant with the Shastras, and likewise with Hindú usages, inasmuch as they lack the essential ceremonies which constitute Hindú marriage. The two ceremonies which, in their opinion, are essential to the validity of Hindú marriage are *Kushandika* and *Saptapadi*. Both these have been discarded

by the Bráhmós. It is also held essential by the said Pandits, that the parties marrying should be members of the same caste, intermarriages being strictly forbidden in the *Kali Yuga* or present age. But the Bráhmós cannot submit to the restrictions of caste in regard to marriage, since they have no faith in caste distinctions as prescribed by Hindúism; and already 14 (out of 39) marriages among the Bráhmós have been contracted between members of different castes.

10. "That the passing of the proposed law will lead to complications in regard to questions of succession and inheritance.

10 "The complications apprehended may be easily avoided by extending to the parties marrying under the proposed law the Indian Succession Act (Act X. of 1865) which is clearly applicable to them. The above Act exempts from its operation only Hindús, Mahomedans, and Buddhists. But the term Hindú does not include the Bráhmós, who deny the authority of the Vedas, are opposed to every form of Bráhmanical religion, and being eclectics admit proselytes from Hindús, Mahomedans, Christians, and other religious sects. This is tacitly admitted by the opponents of the Bill who, in stating the objection under consideration in their memorial to the legislature, instance the case of a Hindú convert to Bráhmoism marrying the daughter of a Native Christian or a Mohomedan girl who has become a Brahmo. Under the authority vested by Section 332 of the above Act in the Governor General of India in Council, he may make it applicable to the Bráhmós, who are not Hindús according to the meaning of the Act, by inserting a clause to that effect in the present Bill."

The views of the two sections were duly considered by Mr. Stephen, and a committee was appointed to report on the measure. On 16th January 1872, the Hon'ble gentleman, in an exhaustive speech on the subject, moved that the report of the select committee be taken into consideration. Mr. Stephen said:—"A religious body called the Bráhma-Samáj, which has been for many years in existence, has for some time past acquired a considerable degree of prominence and importance in most of the great cities of India. It is interesting on many accounts; but above all, because Bráhmism is at once the most European of native religions, and the most living of all native versions of European religion. One of the points on which the Bráhmas have most closely followed English views, and one of the most important points in their whole system, is the matter of marriage. Bráhmas, in common with Englishmen, believe that marriage should be the union for life, in all common cases, of one man with one woman; and the most numerous body of the Bráhmas go a step further, and are of opinion that marriage should be regarded in



"the light of a contract between a mature man and a mature woman of a suitable age."

That Mr. Stephen had thoroughly studied the subject, would appear from his remarks on the two sections of the *Bráhma Samáj*; he said:—"The Progressive *Bráhmas* have broken far more decisively with *Hindúism* than the conservatives. The object of the conservatives is to pour the new wine into the old bottles, so that the one may not be wasted nor the other broken. The Progressive *Bráhmas* undertake to provide at once new wine and new bottles:

"As regards marriage" Mr. Stephen continued, "the difference between the two parties appears to be this,—the marriage ceremonies adopted by the Progressive *Bráhmas* depart more widely from the *Hindú* law than those which are in use amongst the *Adi-Bráhmas*. The *Adi-Bráhmas*, indeed, contend that, by *Hindú* law, their ceremonies, though irregular, would be valid. The Progressive *Bráhmas* admit that, by *Hindú* law, their marriages would be void. Moreover, the Progressive *Bráhmas* are opposed both to infant marriage and to polygamy far more decisively than the conservative party."

Mr. Maine had described the marriage law of British India, as he said he understood it, in the following words:—"By the *Bengal Civil Courts' Act*, which consolidates and re-enacts the old Regulations, and by corresponding Regulations in *Madras* and *Bombay*, the Courts are to decide, in questions regarding marriage in which the parties are *Hindús*, according to *Hindú* law; if the parties are *Muhammadans*, according to *Muhammadan* law; and, in cases not specially provided for, according to justice, equity and good conscience. Custom also has, in most parts of India, the force of law in this matter, although the exact legal ground on which its force stands, differs to some extent in different parts of the country. There are also a variety of Acts of Parliament, and Acts of the Indian legislatures, which regulate marriages between Christians, Europeans and natives, and between *Pársís*. As the *Bráhmas* were neither *Muhammadans*, nor *Pársís*, nor Christians, no other mode of marriage was expressly provided for them by law, and the inference was drawn that they were unable to marry at all. I do not myself think that this inference was correct, but, for the present, I postpone the consideration of that subject. To one most heavy grievance they were beyond all question subjected. No form of marriage legally constituted, and valid beyond all doubt or question, was provided for them; and I do not know whether such a state of things is not a greater grievance than a downright disability to marry."

This was a hardship which neither Mr. Stephen, nor we believe

any Englishman, would tolerate. Mr. Maine admitted the hardship under which the Bráhma Samáj laboured in respect of its marital rites until those rites received the sanction of the legislature. Mr. Maine thought, remarked Mr. Stephen, that "a clear injustice"—and especially a clear injustice distinctly traceable to the "influence of English habits of thought—could not, and must not, be permitted, whether the persons affected were few or many, popular or the reverse. I cannot say how strongly I join in this opinion. I think that one distinct act of wilful injustice; one clear instance of unfaithfulness to the principles on which our Government of India depends; one positive proof that we either cannot or will not do justice, or what we regard as such, to all classes, races, creeds or no-creeds to be found in British India, would, in the long run shake our power more deeply than even military or financial disaster."

Of the grave injustice of allowing any portion of our fellow-subjects to labour under social disabilities on the score of religious scruples it is impossible to speak too strongly. Mr. Maine felt as an Englishman and spoke strongly on what he conceived to be a downright injustice. That section of the Bráhma Samáj which wished to have its marriages celebrated according to rites which they considered to be as yet illegal, had every right to legislative interference. But Mr. Stephen, we believe, was anxious not to displease that section of it which was bitterly opposed to a measure, the object of which was to legalise marriages which had been pronounced to be illegal by counsel, and by professors of Hindú law, not only of Calcutta, but of Nuddea and Benares. Mr. Stephen seems to have been staggered at the difficulty of reconciling the two sections, or of causing annoyance to either. To quote his own words, "What is to happen if a Bráhma wants to marry a Positivist? Are we to have a Bill for Bráhmas; a Bill for Positivists; a Bill for half and half couples? If so, when a few more sects have been established, and when a Bill has to be framed on the principle of providing for the combinations of a number of things, taken two together, our statute-book will become a regular jungle of Marriage Acts."

But in framing the modified Bill, Mr. Stephen did not lose sight of the objections which had been urged against the Bill introduced by Mr. Maine. He said:—The answers of the local Governments were "unfavourable to the Bill proposed, and stated the grounds upon which it was objected to so fully, as to supply the Government with all the information necessary to enable them to deal with the subject finally. All the grounds of objection may, I think, be reduced to one, namely, that the Bill, as drawn and circulated, would introduce a great change into native law, and involve interference with native social relations. On a full and

"repeated consideration of the whole subject, the Government were unanimously of opinion that this objection ought to prevail."

Those who opposed the Native Marriage Bill contended that the Hindú law on the subject should not be modified ; and that the legislature by taking action in this direction interfered with rights and usages which it had no right to interfere with. Mr. Stephen did not lose sight of the principle involved in this argument. He remarked :—" Native laws should not be changed by direct legislation, except in extreme cases, though they may and ought to be moulded by the courts of justice so as to suit the changing circumstances of society. If this principle is fully grasped, it will, I think, serve as the key to nearly every question which can be raised as to the alteration of native laws ; and, in particular, it will be found to justify in all its leading features, the policy pursued in this matter by the Government of India on previous occasions, and the policy which I now propose that it should pursue on the present occasion."

Mr. Stephen continued :—" If you have two or more parallel systems of personal law, and if there are no means of deciding which of them applies to any particular person, the only means of arriving at such a decision will be by considering what mode of life he has, as a matter of fact, adopted. If these systems of law correspond (as is the case with Hindú and Muhammadan law) to two different and antagonistic religions, it is necessary, either to forbid a man to change his religion (which of course is impossible under a Government like ours), or to permit him to change his law. The second branch of the alternative has been adopted by the Government of India, and has influenced alike its legislation and the judicial decisions of its courts. Its adoption was solemnly announced by Act XXI. of 1850, which provides, in substance, that no law or usage in force in British India shall be enforced as law, which inflicts on any person forfeiture of rights or property, or which may be held in any way to impair or affect any right of inheritance by reason of his having renounced, or having been excluded from, the communion of any religion, or having been deprived of caste. The effect of this enactment deserves careful attention. Sanctions, in all cases, are the essence of laws, and the unfailing tests by which they are distinguished from other rules of conduct. The subject matter of the personal laws which exist in British India (marriage, inheritance, caste, &c.,) does not admit of their being invested with a penal sanction. Their sanction lies in the fact that, if they are observed, certain civil rights are established, and that, if they are not observed, those rights are forfeited. The *Lex Loci* Act, therefore, by declaring that the renunciation

" of, or exclusion from, the communion of any religion should  
" not affect a man's civil rights, did in fact deprive the native  
" religions of the character of law as against those who might cease  
" to profess them."

But before bringing forward the third edition of the Native Marriage Bill, Mr. Stephen consulted both sections of the Bráhma Samáj, as we have already said. Those members of the Samáj who sought for the Bill, said Mr. Stephen, unreservedly accepted the offer " made to them by me on behalf of the Government ;  
" and the Adi-Samáj have, with equal frankness, admitted that  
" the measure is one to which they have no right and no wish  
" to object. As for the views of the general body of the native  
" community, they appear, I think, sufficiently from the replies  
" which were received to Sir Henry Maine's Bill. The great  
" majority of the native community would regard with indiffer-  
" ence a measure applying to persons who stand outside the pale  
" of the native religions. A minority object to the principle  
" involved in Act XXI. of 1850, and would probably like to see  
" defection from a native religion visited by the heaviest disabili-  
" ties which it is in the power of law or usage to inflict. The  
" British Indian Association of Bengal petitioned against the first  
" edition of this Bill expressly on the ground that Act XXI. of  
" 1850, was passed against the wishes of the native community.  
" It is, I think, utterly out of the question to act upon their view of  
" the subject, and whatever inconvenience arises from their objec-  
" tion to the measure must be endured. I believe, however, that  
" to the vast majority of the population, its passing will be a  
" matter of indifference. Inaction is, for the reasons already  
" stated, altogether impossible."

Now then, as regards the provisions of the Act before us. In the words of Mr. Stephen they " provide a form of marriage, to  
" be celebrated before the Registrar, for persons who do not profess  
" either the Hindú, the Muhammadan, the Pársi, the Sikh, the  
" Jaina, or the Buddhist religion, and who are neither Christians  
" nor Jews. The conditions are—that the parties are at the time  
" unmarried ; that the man is at least eighteen and the woman  
" at least fourteen, and that, if under eighteen, she has obtained  
" the consent of her father or guardian, and that they are not  
" related to each other in any degree of consanguinity or affinity  
" which, by the law to which either of them is subject, would  
" prevent their marriage. But no rule or custom of any such  
" religion, other than one relating to consanguinity or affinity,  
" is to prevent their marriage. Nor is any such rule to prevent  
" them from marrying unless relationship can be traced through  
" a common ancestor standing to each in a relationship nearer  
" than that of great-great-grandfather or great-great-grandmother,

"or unless the one person is the lineal ancestor, or the brother or sister of any lineal ancestor of the other. This proviso will permit marriages under the Act between persons of different castes, and also between persons whose marriages are at present prohibited on account of a merely fabulous common ancestor. No one who is at present unable to marry his second cousin will be permitted to do so by this Bill; but it seemed to us that a line ought to be drawn somewhere, and that the relationship between third cousins might reasonably be set aside."

It might be wished however that the legislature had taken into consideration whether the clause regarding consanguinity might not with advantage have been modified to suit those who were anxious to adapt their marriage customs according to enlightened principles. But it would be for those directly interested in the matter to lay their views before Government on the point. We mention this, as we have been told that several educated native gentlemen object to that part of the clause which permits marriage with third cousins. But this is a point of minor importance, and there can hardly be much difficulty in settling it hereafter.

The Government, we need hardly remark, was as much under a moral obligation to its subjects to recognise the existence of Hindú laws and customs, as to afford legal protection to those who renounced them from conscientious scruples. Mr. Stephen, alluding to this point, remarked—"By recognising the existence of the Hindú religion as a personal law on this matter of marriage, I think that we have contracted an obligation to enforce its provisions in their entirety upon those who choose to live under them, just as we have, by establishing the general principle of religious freedom, contracted a further obligation to protect any one who chooses to leave the Hindú religion against injury for having done so, and to provide him with institutions recognised by law, and suitable to his peculiar position. I think that it is hardly possible for us to hold other language on the subject than this—'Be a Hindú or not, as you please, but be one thing or the other; and do not ask us to undertake the impossible task of constructing some compromise between Hindúism and not-Hindúism, which will enable you to evade the necessity of knowing your own minds.' The present Bill is framed upon these principles."

On the grounds set forth, Mr. Stephen strongly recommended that the Bill as amended be passed; and it was generally expected that it would pass. But there apparently lurked an opposition inside the council chamber which the executive council did not anticipate. For the report of the select committee had been signed, and the Bill had been duly considered and amended by

the Hon'ble J. F. Stephen, the Hon'ble J. Strachey, the Hon'ble F. R. Cockerell, the Hon'ble J. F. D. Inglis, the Hon'ble W. Robinson, and the Hon'ble F. S. Chapman.

The Hon'ble Mr. Inglis moved that the Bill be recommitted, and referred for report to the several local Governments, in order to obtain native public opinion on its provisions. He did not object to the Bill being passed, but he was anxious that native advice be obtained on the details of the measure. The Bill, he said, required a declaration from any one desirous of being married under its provisions, that he does not profess the Christian, Jewish, Hindú, Muhammadan, Pársí, Buddhist, Sikh, or Jaina religion; and such a declaration will for ever bar the return of the person making it to the religious communion he does not belong to. In this view of the case Mr. Ellis said he was unable to agree. He apprehended that facilities might be afforded to clandestine marriages by the Bill. He said that there was ground to fear that advantage might be taken "by designing parties" to entrap young lads of family position, infatuated with some "dancing girl, and utterly reckless of consequences, into a marriage" which can only end in disgrace and ruin." Accordingly, Mr. Ellis moved that the passing of the Bill be postponed.

The Hon'ble Mr. Cockerell said that he fully approved of the principle of the Bill, but he was at one with the Hon'ble Mr. Ellis as to the form for giving effect to that principle. He denied that any apprehensions need be entertained as to the tendency of the measure to bring trouble and disgrace into respectable families by facilitating disreputable marriages where the male party marrying must be eighteen years of age. But it was right that the provisions of the Bill be maturely considered, and generally known; he therefore supported the amendment of Mr. Inglis. The Hon'ble Mr. Bullen Smith concurred with his two colleagues in regard to the necessity for the postponement of the measure. "He said that it certainly was a matter of great regret that any "body of men should labour under disabilities so great as those "which have been put so clearly before the Council by the Hon'ble "Mr. Stephen." But at the same he considered it "a greater evil "that anything savouring of precipitate legislation should emanate from this Council." He thought that it was a "minor "evil that an important, but still somewhat small, body who "were specially interested in the speedy passing of this Bill "should continue to remain in that condition for a short time "longer, than that a charge of precipitance should be applied "to this measure." The Hon'ble Mr. Stewart said that he concurred in the expediency of the measure, but he thought that the postponement asked for was advisable. The Hon'ble Mr. Chapman whilst admitting that "the small sect at whose in-

"stance this measure has been introduced, have a perfect right to represent the disabilities under which they believe themselves to be suffering;" and that the Government was "doing no more than their duty in affording them relief;" was still opposed to the immediate passing of the Bill. The Hon'ble Mr. Robinson said that the provisions of the Bill in general had his approval, "subject, however, to the result of further and wider discussion by these most interested; by those who, I believe, are alone competent to advise us safely in a matter of this kind." He therefore supported the motion for postponement "with much earnestness and assurance."

His Excellency the President in a speech which must ever possess a thrilling interest for all promoters of native reform, said:—"I was not aware till yesterday that there could be any reason urged against the immediate passing of the Bill.

"The Hon'ble members who have taken objection to the proceedings which my hon'ble friend has recommended in Council, seem to have forgotten that this important question has been before the Indian public for about *four* years; that every native authority in India has had an opportunity of giving an opinion upon the subject, and that the main provisions of this Bill have been more or less discussed in connection with former proposals which have been made."

His Excellency continued:—"The Bill is in thorough harmony with the principles upon which the Government is founded, namely, complete and entire liberty and tolerance in respect of every religious creed within the limits of the empire. I cannot conceive that any man will venture at this time of day to object to this principle, the existence of which is coeval with our rule in India. On the part of the Government I must say that I am quite prepared to declare that we are determined to carry out that great principle in this matter, and that we intend to relieve this, the Bráhma-Samáj, or any other sect of our fellow-subjects, from any disability under which they labour. Other religious sects in India have been similarly relieved; and no matter what reasons may be brought to the contrary, I am prepared here to say that this Government will never consent to continue a state of the law which has the effect of imposing a severe disability upon a portion of our fellow-subjects, going, possibly, even to the extent of making their wives concubines, their children bastards, and rendering the devolution of their property insecure. As far as the principle of the measure, therefore, is concerned, the determination of the Government is to enforce it."

"With regard to the details, we are convinced that, as the Bill now stands, it interferes in no way with the religious freedom,

" practice, or authority of any sect or creed, be it new or old. " I do not believe that the most orthodox Hindú—a Hindú who " is most attached to his religion—would ever declare that persons " who secede from that religion are to suffer disabilities with " regard to marriage; in fact, if I am not mistaken, it will be " found, in the earlier papers which have been published on this " subject, that Hindú authorities have declared that laws affecting " the marriage of persons other than those who profess the Hindú " creed are matters of indifference to them, and that, in the discus- " sion of such measures, they, as Hindús, had no concern. It " therefore seems to me that the plea for delay in this case is " somewhat overstated."

" At the same time, if there are members of this Council who " really believe that there is a possibility of a valid objection " being made to the details of this Bill, or of suggestions coming up " from any part of India for the improvement of its provisions, " I, for one, should not be prepared to offer any objection to the " plea for postponement for a very short time. But the postpone- " ment must be limited; and, in agreeing thereto, I must again " repeat that it is the firm determination of the Government to " pass this Bill. My hon'ble friend (Mr. Stephen) referred to a " personal promise which he gave to some of the members of the " Bráhma-Samáj who are most interested in this measure, and " most naturally desire a speedy relief from the disability under " which they lie, the disadvantage of which they deeply feel. " I myself informed one of the most distinguished members of " the Bráhma-Samáj that their case for relief was complete and " ought to be met; and, therefore, in consenting to the short post- " ponement of this measure, I hope it will be distinctly understood " that we intend to pass the Bill as nearly as possible in this " form—at all events embodying its leading principle—and that, " no matter what objection may be taken by any community in " any part of India, the Government is pledged to the passing of " the measure, and intends to redeem that pledge. In consenting, " therefore, to the postponement of the further progress of this " Bill for one month, I distinctly announce that it is the intention " of the Government to press and pass it into law as soon as " possible."

The Hon'ble Mr. Stephen agreed to the postponement on the express understanding that it should not be submitted to the local Governments for opinion, as such a course would indefinitely postpone the measure. The Hon'ble Mr. Strachey completely agreed with the Hon'ble Mr. Stephen, and earnestly deprecated any further reference to the local Governments on the subject. He thought " this was by no means a question regarding which we could " safely go on for an unlimited period, asking for criticisms and



"opinions from local Governments. We all know how prone the mind of the people of this country was to all sorts of ignorant fancies and suspicions in regard to matters which affected their religion. He thought the Council would be doing a most foolish thing if it were to run any risk of stirring up doubts and difficulties respecting this measure, which it was perfectly certain had now no existence, and which would never have any existence unless we went out of our way to excite them."

The Hon'ble Mr. Ellis said that he was glad that His Excellency the President had suggested a postponement of this Bill for short period (one month). In alluding to Mr. Maine's Bill, and the Bráhma Marriage Bill, Mr. Ellis said:—"To all those Bills objections had been taken, and Mr. Ellis thought most reasonably, by the native communities, and by the Local Governments, on the principle that the religion and creeds of other people were being interfered with for the benefit of one sect of the community. At the same time that that objection was urged, every Local Government without exception, and every Native community that expressed any opinion at all upon that point, assured the Council that there was no objection to a Bill framed upon the principle upon which the present Bill was based. He thought, therefore, that we had every assurance that the Native communities and the Local Governments had no valid objection to offer to this Bill, because they had already discussed it, and had already virtually expressed an opinion in favour of it. No one was more opposed to the former Bill than he was, or to any Bill that would interfere with the orthodox creeds of those who maintained the faith of their fathers; and he was pretty sure of his ground when he said that he was convinced that those who objected to the former Bill, would have no sort of objection to raise to the principle upon which the present Bill was based."

The Hon'ble Sir Richard Temple said:—"After all that had been heard upon this Bill, he thought he might say that every one of the sections in it was of such a character that Members ought to be able to say 'yes' or 'no' regarding it. For his own part, he was prepared to say 'yes' to every one of them; and that being the case, he was prepared to vote for the immediate passing of this Bill. He thought, however, that there could be no objection to a delay of one month; but after that, he did hope that the Bill would be passed as soon as possible."

The postponement of the Bill for a short period was agreed to. But has public opinion spoken itself on it?

The *Indo Prokash* in writing on the subject remarked:—

"We think this is a very fair decision of the question which has proved a crux to the Legislative Council of the Viceroy for more than the last two years. No party, we think, can fairly complain

of the measure as it now stands, after the amendments and changes it has undergone in the Select Committee."

The *Hindû Reformer*, another journal of Bombay, wrote as follows:—"The measure thus sketched successfully aims at completeness. It, moreover, meets the case of those who require it, but keeps clear of such as do not want it. Its spirit, therefore, is fair, but its latitudinarianism is not quite a matter of necessity.

There are one or two provisions which seem to us liable to a most serious objection. The first is the proposed rule regarding consanguinity or affinity. The parties first marrying under the Act 'must not be connected in any degree of consanguinity or affinity which by the law to which either of them is subject would render a marriage between them illegal.' Now this seems to us defective, inasmuch as hereby parties who are supposed to renounce their allegiance to the old law are still compelled to observe its restriction on this particular point. Although from principle the law must be made general, and applicable to inter-marriages between individuals of any two religions or sects, still the majority of them will be Hindûs, though of different castes, and sometimes of the same caste. In this latter case the restriction as regards the *gotra* will have force; and thus, in some cases, at any rate, the provision will act as a hardship preventing unions otherwise unexceptionable."

The *Bombay Gazette* concluded an able article on the measure in the following words:—"As regards mere abjurers of the old creed who have not adopted the new, the Bill which forms the subject of Mr. Stephen's speech provides a remedy for their exclusion from the recognized communities. That remedy could assume but one form, that of a purely civil marriage under the sanction of the State, and imposing on each party a set of obligations determined not by the traditions of Hindooism, or even of Christianity, but by such light as the experience of centuries has thrown on what is best for the individual and the community. The bill is a mere rough outline of which the details will have to be filled in by a multitude of judicial decisions. It does not go so far as we may think possible, but it points in the right direction, and is one stage won in that process of assimilation of institutions, side by side and growing out of an increasing harmony of principles, which is the necessary basis upon which diverse nations must be built up into the fabric of a united and enduring empire."

The *Friend of India* after discussing the *pros* and *cons* with its usual independence and fearlessness, sums up as follows:—

"We are sorry that this Bill, above all Bills, is delayed. It has been so long before the public, has been so thoroughly discussed, has been referred back and forward so often, and rests funda-

"mentally on principles so well understood, that the Council might very well have passed it at once; or, at least, might have entered on the discussion of it. We believe that the real secret of the delay arises from the fact that some members of the Council look upon Mr. Stephen's course as in some measure a despotic one. It may have been so—we do not know. But at all events no such opinion ought to interfere with the passing of so great a measure. If Mr. Stephen were a thorough despot, and could rest a measure on the principles upon which he has rested this measure, and could justify it by the arguments by which he has justified this, the measure ought to become law. Of course, there may be some possible amendments of which we at present know nothing, but we fancy the Bill will pass pretty nearly as it is, and it will be one of the most important steps in the history of Indian Legislation."

The *Pioneer* was so confident of the justice of the measure at the time that it undertook to predict that it would be passed before the ides of March had passed away; and the prediction has been fulfilled. The *Englishman* noticed the measure in two leaders, and refuted *seriatim* all Mr. Inglis's arguments in favour of the delay in passing the Bill; and entirely supported the enactment of the law. The *Hindu Patriot* also remarked that "the present Bill has the concurrence and support of all classes of the Indian public, and we shall be glad to see it enacted without further delay. On the broad ground of justice it cannot be fairly withheld from the Brahmos." The *Indian Daily News* was also of the same opinion.

We need hardly make other extracts from the exponents of public opinion; that opinion expressed itself most unmistakeably, and we might say with almost one accord, and supported the measure. The principle on which it was based is fully consonant with the great proclamation issued in 1858, when the administration of the Empire passed from the hands of the East India Company to the Crown, and with the words contained therein that "all should equally and alike enjoy the equal and impartial protection of the law." The judgment of the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council delivered by Lord Kingsdown in the case of *Abraham versus Abraham* upheld this principle.

A clear exposition of the principle of this Bill had already been furnished in the most lucid language to the Council, by the Hon'ble Mr. Stephen. Still on the 19th March 1872, when the last debate on the measure took place, the opposition seemed at first so strong as to lead those present in the Council to suppose that the Bill would be rejected. The Bráhmas had already waited for four years to have their marriages legalised. And they would perhaps have been made to wait much longer, but for the

determination of Mr. Stephen and his colleagues. Some of the Hon'ble members who opposed the measure supplemented their position with the opinions and views of some of the leading Natives in the N. W. Provinces, Madras, and Bombay. But the principle on which the action of the Government was based was too strong and too equitable to be upset by those views and those opinions. The Hon'ble Mr. Stephen said that after having educated the Natives and dissociated them from idolatrous customs, it was the bounden duty of Government not to send them away when they asked for relief. His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief supported Mr. Stephen, on the ground that the Government ought to be guided in its action by the spirit of strict toleration to all creeds and sects. Thus supported, the Bill was passed by a majority of eight against a minority of five members, with the amendments moved by Mr. Stephen. It would have been a blot on our rule if an estimable and enlightened section of our fellow subjects had been permitted to suffer from social disabilities from no fault of their own, other than the possession of strong religious convictions and conscientious scruples. The Marriage Bill will bear fruit in time. The 19th of March 1872, will be a memorable day in the history of Indian legislation.

---

## ART. VIII.—TOPICS OF THE QUARTER.

### *Lord Mayo.*

IT devolves upon us this quarter to tell one of the saddest stories in the history of India. On the 8th of February Lord Mayo, with a select little party, arrived at the Andamans, after a visit of much interest and intended usefulness to Barmah. The object of His Excellency's visit to the Islands was a purely practical one. There had been complaints with respect to the entire system upon which the Government and constitution of the penal settlement rested. The Governor-General had resolved to see the exact fact for himself ; and with this object he arrived at Port Blair, at about half-past nine on the morning of the fatal day above stated, in the *Glasgow*, the Flag Ship of Admiral Cockburn ; and the work of inspection immediately began. The morning of the day was spent in looking over the convict prisons, &c., on Ross Island. This occupied an hour or two. In the afternoon His Excellency visited other parts of the Settlement, especially Viper Island, where the worst convicts are kept, and Chatham, where there are some extensive saw-mills. His Excellency then proposed, contrary to previous arrangement, to visit Hope Town, where the best convicts—the ticket-of-leave-men—reside. The party arrived at Hope Town at about half-past five, and ascended Mount Harriet, which commands a fine out-look ; and with this enjoyable and enjoyed part of the proceedings, the day's inspection was to end. At the foot of Mount Harriet there is a little pier or jetty running out into the sea ; and at the end of it the crew of the *Glasgow's* launch were sitting, chatting, and waiting for the Viceroy, who went slowly along the pier, surrounded by a little group of friends. By this time it was quite dark, and the attendants—convicts—carried torches. A very few yards down the pier General Stewart, who was in command, turned to give some direction to an overseer ; and at that moment, quick as lightning, a man sprang through the gap, fastened like a tiger, one eye-witness says, on the back of the Viceroy, and inflicted two deadly wounds. It was the work of an instant. His Excellency stumbled or leaped into the water. The torches were extinguished in the excitement, but happily the assassin, with all the advantages of darkness and of the hill on the back ground covered with foliage, was immediately secured. The Viceroy was removed as speedily as possible to the *Glasgow*, but before reaching the vessel he died. The assassin was found to be a life prisoner from the neighbourhood of Pesháwar ; and, to all appearance, he had resolved, when first he heard of Lord Mayo's intended visit, to perpetrate the fatal deed, for which he was

executed on March 11th. The body of the Viceroy was received in Calcutta by an immense assemblage of people, comprising all classes of the population—one of the solemnest sights ever seen, perhaps we may say, in any country. This is not the time to fix Lord Mayo's place among the statesmen who have ruled India. Subjects of great importance have been matured during his Viceroyalty. He was particularly interested in foreign politics ; and very soon after his arrival in India concluded a treaty with the Amir of Afghánistán for the purpose of drawing a clear line within which England would consider herself bound to interfere if invasion was threatened. His great scheme of finance, by means of which the responsibility of providing for local expenditure is thrown upon local taxation, is another measure by which he will be judged in the future. We cannot attempt to discuss these measures now. Perhaps, indeed, they could not possibly be discussed now, with the feeling of the country what it is, in view of the sad event which every Englishman in India deeply deploras. Moreover, the schemes and treaties of the time must be tried by the practical success of fitness and applicability to the end for which they were designed. But there was something in the presence and bearing of the late Viceroy that made him a power in India. People spoke of his hospitality, but it was not that which gave him the social power which no Governor of India ever possessed in a larger or more important degree. Only a few comparatively could partake of even a Viceroy's hospitality ; but Lord Mayo's words addressed to chiefs, and through them, to masses of the people of India, had an influence for good which cannot easily be overrated. He succeeded in impressing upon the chiefs that the position of England in India was one of good to the country ; and that while as Viceroy he would prove a terror to evil-doers, he would not forget the equally high duty of being a praise to them that do well. In this spirit he addressed several bodies of chiefs last year ; and they believed him. There was something in the words, in the manner, which dispelled doubt. Perhaps, indeed, throughout Indian history we never had a Viceroy who had more power by his personal presence, never one who more thoroughly inspired confidence, never one who was better "liked," never one who worked harder, or acted more completely with the single aim of doing his best according to his light and gifts in the high position to which he had been called. It is not our object to write any eulogy of Lord Mayo. The feeling evoked by his death will long outlive any words that can be written on the subject. People mourned as for a friend gone, not as for a ruler merely. They recalled his kindness, his affability, his firmness, and his perfectly unstained loyalty to Sovereign, to friend, to whomsoever he had pledged his word. And that tribute will not easily die.

*Education in Bengal.*

*Proceedings of the Senate.*—Physical Science has at length taken a conspicuous place in the University Course. The scheme, as it finally came before the Senate, provided alternative courses for both the examinations. For the First Arts, the Chemistry of the Metalloids might optionally be substituted for Psychology. For the B. A. degree a more radical change was recommended. The Literature course was to be narrowed in extent, comprising five subjects instead of the previous six, *viz.*, English, a classical language, mathematics, and two out of the following three subjects:—Mental Science, History, and an additional course of mathematics. The alternative course in Science comprehended four subjects, *viz.*, English, Mathematics, Inorganic Chemistry, and one out of the following four:—Physics, Animal Physiology, Vegetable Physiology, and Geology. A singular opinion seemed to prevail that the four subjects of the Science course must necessarily be less difficult than the five subjects of the Literature course, and it was proposed to equalise the numerical discrepancy by adding another subject. The proposal to restore Sanskrit, on the ground that Bengalis who had passed in science ought to be familiar with the language by which alone the vernacular can be enriched with the necessary scientific terms, was lost on a division. A second amendment, proposing that two of the optional scientific subjects should be taken up instead of one, was withdrawn in consequence of an authoritative opinion that, with such an addition, there would be barely time to go through the course. This should have convinced the Senate of the danger of hastily widening the area of the new course. The principle of concentration had been adopted after much deliberation; and it might have been taken for granted that the Syndicate, while neglecting the trivial advantage of numerical regularity, had been careful to provide alternative courses demanding equal labour. The longer time a student has to devote to Physics or to Geology, the more complete and useful will be his knowledge of either science; if he is compelled to devote the same time to two subjects instead of to one, he runs the risk of exchanging a fruitful knowledge of his subject for a superficial acquaintance with terms. But a strong desire was manifested for 'more learning,' and eventually Physical Geography was appended to the course; Mr. Blanford undertaking to write a text-book on this somewhat vaguely-defined subject.

The introduction of the Chemistry of the Metalloids into the First Arts course was avowedly a compromise; and, like most compromises, it satisfied neither party. One section of the Senate regretted that science was not introduced into schools; the other wished to postpone the definite study of science until the foundations of a liberal education had been laid in the First Arts course.

It may be conjectured that the supporters of each scheme had not clearly set before themselves their agreement or their difference with the other. There are, in fact, two different (though consistent) objects in regard to scientific instruction which should be carefully distinguished. The first is, that an acquaintance with the elementary facts of Nature should form part, wherever possible, of every boy's education. This is what Mr. Campbell means by Physical Geography, and what the Germans mean by *Erdkunde*. Professor Huxley describes it as "a general knowledge of the earth, what is on it, in it, and about it." He refers to such questions as the following:—"What is the moon, and why does it shine?" "What is this water, and where does it run?" "What is the wind?" "What makes the waves in the sea?" "Where does this animal live, and what is the use of this plant?"—as examples of what every child ought to know, and which he would take delight in knowing. And it would, no doubt, be an unmingled blessing if we could insure to every child in India such a modicum of *Realkennntniss*. But it is absurd to ignore the present character of our educational agency. Where the schoolmasters are, in most cases, completely ignorant of the commonest physical facts, the attainment of such an ideal can exist only in the imagination of an enthusiast. It may reasonably be expected that, at some time after the next four years—and four years is no long period in the history of a University—a due supply of capable teachers will gradually be produced. Elementary facts of science may then be taught in many of our schools, and may form an integral part of the regular University course. Until then, any attempt to force the growth of scientific education in an uncongenial soil can only result in mischief.

The second object, which is clearly attainable at the present moment, is to mark off a definite scientific course for those whose tastes lead them to prefer a special to a general education. This is, in fact, precisely what the Senate has determined to do. In its present form, however, the modification seems to suggest too much science for an Arts course, and too little for a purely scientific course. We may look forward to a time, not very far distant, when it will be extended for one purpose, and contracted for another. On the one hand, we may expect to see some portion of Physical Science added to the present list of optional subjects for the degree in Arts; on the other, a more exclusively scientific course leading to the degree of Bachelor in Science.

But it is difficult to see how the introduction of Inorganic Chemistry into the First Arts Course fits in with either scheme. In the first place, it is not the logical consequent of the *Erdkunde*, which, it may be hoped, will at some time be taught in schools. And in the second, it is a subject hardly likely to seduce boys



of sixteen into the paths of science. It seems probable, indeed, that the result of its introduction will be one of two things ; either no boy will choose a course of study hampered at its outset by a subject so little attractive as Inorganic Chemistry, or having chosen it, he will find in it so little to appeal to his imagination, that he will be glad to desert it after the First Arts Examination for the pleasanter paths of literature. On both grounds, as it seems to us, it would have been better to introduce into the First Arts course some portion of Physics, say, Heat, Light, and Sound. These branches of science would not only be attractive to the student, but would also be the natural sequel to that knowledge of physical facts which future undergraduates may bring with them to the University.

*Mr. Campbell's Educational Orders.*—In his recent dealings with education in Bengal, it is fortunately possible to give Mr. Campbell credit for the best intentions, and at the same time to differ from him *toto cælo* as to the expediency of the measures by which he seeks to give effect to those intentions. His policy may be described shortly as a desire to give education a more practical turn. In describing Physical Geography as “an elementary and popular knowledge of this globe, and of the things that grow or creatures that live upon it,” he seems to be repeating Professor Huxley's words, quoted above ; and there is no doubt that such knowledge would be an unmixed boon if it were only attainable. Mr. Campbell speaks of the liberality of the Supreme Government which puts money at his disposal, and of the narrowness of the University which will not allow him to employ that money in teaching the practical arts in his own schools. But does Mr. Campbell suppose that, were the University system ever so ‘flexible,’ he would find no difficulty in introducing the education that he wishes into the schools of Bengal ? It is true that, if he refers to land-surveying and such other ‘practical arts,’ the thing might be done at once, as the Engineering College will provide any number of competent teachers. But when he charged the Senate with adherence to a rigid system, he did not care to run the risk of provoking a smile by advocating the introduction into our schools of an art which may possibly be useful to one boy out of twenty ; and he dwelt rather on the absence of ‘practical knowledge’ from the school course. The demand, no doubt, will create the supply, if the necessary time be given for its creation. Mr. Campbell has, indeed, offered “special rewards to induce masters at Zillah Schools to qualify as teachers in surveying and physical geography,” the latter of which he proposes to introduce into the schools generally as a first instalment of physical science. No one who know the Bengali can

doubt that many of these schoolmasters would, under the stimulus of a "special reward," rapidly imbibe large draughts of physico-geographical facts, which they would, in all honesty, mistake for a competent acquaintance with the subject ; but with our complete knowledge of the material and the machinery by which alone efficient teachers can be produced, it is easy to see that at least four years must elapse before such a result can be hoped for. But Mr. Campbell, with all the vigour of a mind clear to see and strong to pursue its idea, and with all the tendency of such a mind to ignore obstacles that may prove insuperable, is impatient that the reform cannot be instituted at once. He spoke of himself as representing the greatest teaching body in Bengal, and therefore as having an implied right to overleap the restrictions imposed by the University. But there can be no doubt that Mr. Campbell herein completely mistakes the relation which he bears to that body. As representing the greatest teaching body in Bengal, his opinions are entitled to the most respectful attention when he advocates them in the meetings of the University ; and if he succeeds in converting the Senate to his views, it rests with that body to carry out such principles in the only effectual manner, as being an institution that does not die. But when the Lieutenant-Governor—no longer as member of the Senate, but as the controller of education—resolves upon introducing a sudden and startling change into the schools or colleges of Bengal, he can only do so at the price of severing their connexion with the University. So long as the colleges and schools are affiliated, or can send candidates, to the University, Mr. Campbell can interfere with the course of study prescribed by the University, not one jot more than any zamindár who maintains a school. An example will make our meaning plain. The holders of junior-grade scholarships, whom Mr. Campbell will henceforth excuse from attending the logic and the Sanskrit classes, are borne, it is true, on the books of a college ; but they can no longer be said to be members of a University whose examinations they are not intended to pass. Mr. Bayley rightly refused to entertain the suggestion that a Lieutenant Governor, whose term of office was limited to five years, should have it in his power to revolutionise a system of education, and to set up another to be in its turn overthrown by his successor. The University lays claim to authority, partly because it is permanent, and able to provide for the people committed to its care a consistent and uniform education, and partly because it represents the opinions of men of different views and of varied experience ; competent, therefore, to extract what is valuable from the views of Sir W. Muir, no less than from those of Mr. Campbell. And Mr. Campbell can hardly expect to prepossess the Senate in his favour by first making, or threatening to make, a series of sweeping

changes, and afterwards complaining that he finds himself hampered by the obstructiveness of the Senate.

In order to justify our dissent from Mr. Campbell's policy, it is necessary to review his educational orders somewhat in detail. In the Preliminary Budget Orders, dated 9th January 1872, it was stated that "beyond the obligation to deal justly with the funds at its disposal, the Government is far from wishing to discourage English education . . . . The Lieutenant-Governor wishes to deal tenderly with existing institutions, and would not cut them down in a sudden and injurious manner." The abolition of the College Department at Barhampur had already for some months been decided on; that college, therefore, must be excluded from the "gradual" reductions that the Lieutenant-Governor must be supposed to have had in contemplation. But, since the issue of the preliminary orders, the following changes have been sanctioned. In the Sanskrit College the English classes have been abolished, and the chair of *Smṛiti*, or Hindu Code Law, has shared the same fate. The English classes were ordered to be transferred to the Presidency College, already full to overflowing; the effect of which was that the principal of the Sanskrit College, whose sole duty had been to teach English, found himself with no duties to perform. About the middle of March, the Principal of the Krishnagar College was informed that the B.A. classes (consisting of third and fourth-year students) must be given up at once, the students being allowed to transfer themselves to any other College. Within a day or two of this order, the Lieutenant-Governor, having observed at the annual Convocation that none of the graduates from Patna College were Bihāris, notified that he did not intend to keep up a College in Bihār for the benefit of Bengālī immigrants; the degree-classes were therefore abolished. In all these 'abolitions' the most important fact to be noticed is that they were decided on within ten weeks of the time when the Lieutenant-Governor had expressly declared that existing institutions were not to be cut down "in a sudden and injurious manner." Sudden, the changes are admitted to be; and that in some at least of their results they are injurious, is no less clear. The Krishnagar College is the pride of the landholders of Naddea. It is a noble building, standing in a compound of over 40 acres in extent. For a very large proportion of the cost of its construction, and for the gift of half the ground in which it stands, the College is indebted to the liberality of the zamíndárs of the district. "In consideration of the liberality thus manifested"—we quote from the *Calcutta University Calendar*—"a donor of Rs. 1,000 is allowed to place a boy, free of expense, at the College in perpetuity, and another for every Rs. 500 additional he may have subscribed."

The relations, indeed, which bind the inhabitants of Naddea to their College are peculiarly close and intimate. Their interest in it has been constantly strengthened by the brilliant success which the College has, especially of late years, achieved in the University examinations,—a success which, with the single exception of the Presidency College, is quite unrivalled throughout Bengal. Little wonder, then, that Mr. Campbell's action should excite the strongest opposition and discontent. The *Amrita Bazar Patrika* significantly points out that the Lieutenant-Governor is now doing precisely what the Secretary of State last year virtually forbade the Supreme Government to do. The Government of India disclaimed the policy of discouraging English education, and the Secretary of State expressed his gratification that no such desire existed. Mr. Campbell also declares that he is "anxious in every way to encourage English;" but it may be conjectured that the Duke of Argyll would hardly accept Mr. Campbell's interpretation of encouragement.

There can be little doubt also that the rough usage to which Sanskrit has lately been subjected in Bengal would find no support in England. Europe indeed is recognising, more and more clearly every day, the value of this particular study,\* and the necessity of giving it vitality; and in Europe it would, we think, be simply discredited—until surprise gave way to indignation—that a ruler in India should permit himself to manifest bitter opposition to its study. Wherever else Sanskrit learning may exist, it seems a common-place to say that it ought to be at home in India. That we are likely to see a very different result cannot but be matter for the gravest regret.

The serious evils that must sooner or later make themselves felt if the study of Sanskrit in this country be discouraged, have been so fully discussed in the pages of this *Review*, as well as in other journals both Indian and English, that it savours of wearisome repetition to recur to them. Such a policy is no less clearly opposed to the Educational Despatch of 1854, and to the principles which are still supposed in England to govern Indian education. The immediate result of Mr. Campbell's action is to alienate a body of men important in numbers and character; those, namely, who look back upon the past with reverent affection, and who shrink from all this modern restlessness as tending to produce a generation united by no ties of admiration or sympathy with that marvellous literature which enshrines all that is heroic and wise in their history. Such men he alienates, not necessarily

\* In a letter from Cambridge which we have just seen, it is stated on very good authority that, in the Classical Tripos of this year, a fair acquaint-

tance with Sanskrit was made almost a *sine quâ non* for the attainment of the highest honours.

by his measures, but by the manner in which he gives effect to those measures. The moral evil would be less if Mr. Campbell's opposition to Sanskrit were a discriminating opposition ; if Sanskrit were discouraged only in order that some more profitable study might take its place. But we are compelled to believe that the Lieutenant-Governor's conviction of the inherent worthlessness of Sanskrit is so complete, that it cannot but express itself in a somewhat contemptuous form. How else shall we explain the strange mutilation in the Sanskrit College course by which the chair of *Smṛiti*, the recorded body of Hindu law, is suddenly abolished ? In the Presidency and other Colleges, no doubt, some acquaintance with general Sanskrit literature is all that a liberal education demands ; but the Sanskrit College is a special institution which exists for the purpose of encouraging special research ; and the education which it gives should be comprehensive and complete. To cut off from the College course (with minute advantages on the financial side) a most important branch of Sanskrit study, is to diminish, so far, the necessity of its further existence. We cannot predict whether this fact will be used at any future time as a reason for abolishing the Sanskrit College ; but such a result would not greatly surprise us.

Mr. Campbell, in fact, cannot understand that any parent should wish his son to be taught Sanskrit. Some time since he promulgated an order that in all schools it should be optional with boys to learn Sanskrit or Bengali. The schools were polled, with what precise results we cannot say ; but we believe we are within the mark in saying that the guardians of four out of every five boys declared for Sanskrit. The results, at any rate, were such as to disappoint Mr. Campbell's expectations ; and in one of his latest orders he requires a declaration on honour, that no "undue influence" has been used in bringing about so mischievous a result. But if parents are so wilfully blind to their own interests, that is no reason why Mr. Campbell should not release those over whom he *can* exercise influence, from the enervating embrace of Sanskrit. Accordingly he notifies that any holder of a junior-grade scholarship "may elect to take the practical science course"—that is, the new alternative course for the First Arts Examination—"without prejudice to the tenure of his scholarship. Such a scholarship-holder must continue to attend the English language, history, arithmetic or algebra, and mathematical classes up to the First Arts standard, *but he need not attend the Sanskrit and logic or moral philosophy classes ; and he therefore need not pass the First Arts Examination*, though the Lieutenant-Governor hopes that many will do so." Such an order as this it is difficult to describe in fitting terms. We will confine ourselves to criticising the order in two of its aspects. It is clear, in the first

place, that Mr. Campbell considers Sanskrit and logic *worse* than useless. The University prescribes these two studies—and it is significant to remember that the scientific members of the Senate have, reasonably enough, insisted on logic as a necessary element in scientific education—as parts of the alternative course lately adopted. But Mr. Campbell thinks them not only useless but injurious; and, without replacing them by any subjects more congenial to his own heart, he virtually orders the scholarship-holders to abstain from Sanskrit and from logic, as from an unclean thing. Mr. Campbell stands alone in his opinion of the value of different branches of learning. Others have said that languages are not so useful to the growing intelligence as a knowledge of the order of nature. Mr. Campbell appears to hold that the study of Sanskrit must produce a deadly blight of every mental energy. Yet we suppose Mr. Campbell wishes that students of science should not only themselves possess information, but should be competent to impart it to their fellow-countrymen; that they should in time write manuals of Inorganic Chemistry in Bengali as they have already written manuals of Astronomy. It is difficult to see how this can be done, until a scientific nomenclature has been created, capable of being engrafted on the actual languages of the country. It is hardly to be desired that the Greek terms of European science should be imported bodily into Bengali; and it is equally certain that Bengali itself is a language too little developed to express minute differences of chemical nomenclature. ‘Unsanskritized’ Bengali cannot cope with the differences of *protoxide* and *suboxide*, *sesquioxide* and *peroxide*; it is even less able to express the subtler distinctions implied in the terminations of *sulphurous*, *sulphide*, *sulphuric*, *sulphate*. As men of science in Europe were familiar with Latin and Greek, so it is only on the condition that men of science in India should be familiar with the structure of Sanskrit, that we can hope to see a scientific nomenclature gradually developed, by men who know on the one hand what it is that they want to express, and, on the other, the *nuances* of the language by which alone it can be expressed.

But it is to the second result of Mr. Campbell’s order that we wish to draw special attention. He says, in effect, to the boys of Bengal who have passed the Entrance Examination with credit, and who have gained scholarships: “If you choose the literature course, you shall have the whole irksome drudgery to go through; but if you choose the science course, I will excuse you two out of your six subjects, and you shall draw your scholarship-money without the bugbear of an impending examination to frighten you to useless exertion.” What is this but to offer a premium to idleness, already (as Mr. Campbell, in other moods, would be the first to maintain) the besetting temptation of the Bengali? And does

Mr. Campbell consider the danger to discipline, and the demoralising effect on the minds of other students, if a number of young men are allowed to walk out of the room as soon as a lecture begins, and to spend an hour or two in absolute idleness?

There is a further aspect of this order which must not be ignored. It can readily be conjectured how large a number of future scholarship-holders will elect the science course which Mr. Campbell has made so smooth for them. It is not in the nature of the Bengáli to resist so strong an inducement offered to the weakest side of his character. The consequence will be, as before pointed out, a dissociation of the teaching in the Colleges—as far as regards their most promising students—from the *curriculum* of the University. Mr. Campbell has evidently never dreamed that this might be an evil; and he is determined, at all hazards, to encourage the study of Physical Science in the Colleges, in a far different sense from that in which his encouragement of English must be understood. His redistribution of the scholarship fund of Bengal affords a striking illustration of the kind of help he means to give to the new studies. How far Physical Science is meant by these new studies, and how far land-surveying, the Lieutenant-Governor's orders do not make as clear as could be wished. For instance, a sum of Rs. 20,000, set apart in the grant for Colleges, is described in one order as devoted to "surveying classes," in a later order to "Physical Science classes." Similarly, a sum of Rs. 30,000 for "surveying classes" in schools is subsequently transformed into a grant for "drawing, surveying, and elementary science classes." The final resolution, however, speaks of these sums as being granted for "science and survey classes;" it may therefore be presumed that both hold an equal place in the Lieutenant-Governor's regards. Now it happens that the conditions of demand and supply as regards these two subjects are inverted. In surveying the teaching power is unlimited, at least in comparison with Mr. Campbell's requirements. But the demand for such instruction is strictly limited by the opportunities of its profitable investment; in other words, by the number of appointments that are open to persons possessing this knowledge. The Public Works Department of course requires a much wider range of acquirements than is to be gained in the new surveying classes; and the only prospect that the pupils can look forward to is employment under Mr. Campbell's new scheme of Sub-divisional Establishments, which makes provision for 100 kanungos and junior kanungos. The effective demand, therefore, is limited by the number of these appointments that may fall vacant year by year, which will evidently be not large. As regards science, the case is reversed. We have no means of saying what the demand for scientific instruc-

tion may hereafter be, though we have no doubt it will be considerable. But this at least is certain, that the supply cannot be forthcoming for some years. And yet, though in one case the demand is insignificant, and in the other there are no means of supplying the demand, Mr. Campbell determines to encourage these incipient studies precisely as if they were enjoying the full current of popular favour. Out of a total sum of Rs. 1,28,000, which is devoted to scholarships in Bengal, he has set aside Rs. 50,000 for science and survey students ; and this at a time when only three surveying classes have been organised, and when not one schoolmaster in Bengal is known to possess any acquaintance with physical geography.

It is to be regretted that in all Mr. Campbell's dealings with the Educational Department, he should manifest towards the officers of the Department a certain tone of irritation, fatal to harmonious action. In the Preliminary Budget orders, the Director of Public Instruction is addressed in language of such unusual strength that we think it a mistake to have allowed their publication. It would at any rate have been more satisfactory if they had been published with Mr. Atkinson's reply, which brought about a large modification of the original orders, and in which, therefore, he must have satisfactorily disposed of many of the charges brought against him. In an earlier letter the professors of Mofussil Colleges were "warned" to qualify themselves for duties which, as it appeared on reconsideration, they never could by any possibility undertake. The warning was quickly withdrawn, and an invitation substituted ; but it was hardly to be expected that the professors would show very great alacrity in accepting an invitation so issued. Equally to be deprecated is the groundless suspicion that schoolmasters had used "undue influence" in inducing a majority of their pupils to learn Sanskrit instead of Bengali. The Education Department seems, in Mr. Campbell's eyes, to be the parent of all that is obstructive and of ill report. It is by this Department that the unmeaning term Urdu was "chiefly introduced." The unsatisfactory state of education in Bengal is due to the fact that "the entire staff of teachers have imbibed their tone from the officers of the Educational Department." It seems to us a pity that this semblance of hostility should so uniformly pervade Mr. Campbell's orders. Common prudence would suggest that nothing was to be gained by showing educational officers at every turn that the Lieutenant-Governor held them and their work, so lightly. It is fortunate that these officers commonly take a keen interest in their work, an interest quite independent of the favour with which it is regarded in high quarters ; if it were otherwise, much mischief might be done by the kind of criticism which is now applied to them.



*Vigorous Government.*

WE had hoped that before going to press the whole of the official correspondence relating to the late Kuka disturbances at Lúdhianá would have been published, with the orders of the Supreme Government in the case; we should then have been able to review it impartially, and express without hesitation the opinion we might have formed. We cannot do so now; but so much has been written on the subject in the newspapers, such unhesitating approval has been expressed by some journals in support of what they call "vigour," that we cannot pass without notice, what has certainly been one of the most prominent "topics" of the last quarter. We feel that in making the following remarks, we are in no way prejudging Mr Cowan:—

Stript of the exaggerations of both friend and foe, the case against that officer stands thus:—He caused 49 men to be put to death without any legal warrant for his act; such a proceeding by a British officer is of the very gravest importance, and can only be justified by the clearest proof of its necessity, that is, that the officer had before him evidence sufficient to convince any reasonable man, that unless he acted as he did far greater evils would result. The one side allege that Mr. Cowan had no such evidence, the other side maintain that he had; the Supreme Government has marked its sense of the gravity of the act by suspending him until he has submitted a report justifying his conduct. Until this report is published, we cannot say what evidence was before Mr. Cowan, and therefore we can neither acquit nor condemn him; a portion of the press, whilst warning us that it is unfair to condemn him until we have heard his defence, loudly applaud him on the evidence afforded by the accounts already published. They should remember that if they applaud him on this evidence, their opponents have at least an equal right to condemn him on it.

But a very large portion of Mr. Cowan's supporters rest their defence of him on much wider grounds than this. They treat the question of the amount of evidence in this particular case as one of trifling importance; they say generally, with reference to disturbances like those at Lúdhianá "that this sort of thing must be put down." We must not shilly-shally about legal technicalities; we must act with "vigour;" we must strike terror into all malcontents by allowing, or even encouraging, the district officers to order to instant execution the very first band that attempts to disturb the public peace. As this expression of a general policy in no way affects the particular case of Mr. Cowan, we have no hesitation in examining it at length.

Firstly, what is the sort of thing that must be put down? We shall be told, disturbances by fanatics in general and by Kukas in particular. Before we consider how these disturbances are to be

put down, let us consider who the Kukas really are. The task is not difficult, for their position is thoroughly well known. They aim at reforming their own religion, and stand as regards the Sikhs in much the same position as Wahhábis to the Muhammadans—that is in minor points, for in the main point of difference between the orthodox and the reformers there is no resemblance whatever. Our readers are doubtless aware that the Sikhs believe that the line of their Gúrus, or spiritual heads, has long since ceased; the Kúkas believe that their leader Ram Singh is himself a Gúrú. It is known that the sect originated in a true desire for the reform of the national religion and had nothing to do with any political motives.

These are still the views of Ram Singh; the utmost we have heard against him is that he must have been cognisant of the designs of some of his followers, and that he has made no real efforts to restrain them.

Meantime the sect has increased in numbers, but the very largest computation gives it only three lakhs of members. It is indeed thoroughly well organized, but we may safely say that if we were to hand over the Panjáb to the Kukas to-morrow, they could not maintain their ascendancy for a single week. Yet it by no means follows that they are powerless for mischief; the position of all new creeds in the East is much the same; they originate with true men whose sole aim is the remedy of existing corruption; they are joined by others whose aim is equally praiseworthy, but whose zeal is dangerous; their object is good, and to attain it, they would not shrink from violence; by the energy and sincerity of these men, numbers are converted, whose almost sole belief is a profound faith in the inspiration of their prophets, and who are incapable of reasoning on any point in which this faith is concerned. The number of converts of this class at length reaches its limit, and so does the patience of the more zealous of the leaders. They have not the safety-valves enjoyed by their more civilised brethren in England; there we see the leaders of the different sects, all equally in earnest, demonstrating violently to crowded audiences that the reform of the world—nay even the salvation of the souls of its inhabitants—depends entirely on its conversion to the particular “ism” of the speaker. A bystander would expect the whole meeting to rush to arms in support of its principles; it is said that they did so in the middle ages, when the state of civilisation was not unlike that of India now; but in the present day we find them all disperse quietly to their dinners, and an hour hence, one listening to their conversation would scarcely suppose they had any views at all.

Far different is it in the East; here, although by law the right of meeting is as fully recognised as in England, there are few

up-country districts where a "vigorous" official would allow it to be openly enjoyed—at any rate the exercise of the right is scarcely attempted; the whole of the proceedings of the sect are conducted almost in secret; and this very fact tends much to increase the influence of the second-rate and more violent men. Passing from place to place they keep up the zeal of the mass of their followers with ridiculous rumours of the approach of the "day of salvation," and support their assertion with a still more ridiculous reference to "signs from heaven." A republic that has for years tolerated the nonsense of Dr. Cumming, should not be too hard on these dupes. But a fanaticism which is harmless in England, in India is most dangerous; the sect becomes like a train of powder which the slightest spark may explode. In vain do the old leaders express their disapproval; their subordinates are past control; they know that unless a "sign" is given their influence must decay, and often no doubt they have talked themselves into a state which renders reasoning impossible. They may honestly believe that "the Lord is on their side;" the result of this belief has been the same from the time of the Apostles down to the outbreak at Lúdhianá. Then "false Christs" lead hundreds out into the wilderness to perish of hunger; now "false gúrús" lead their dupes to be blown from the guns. Between the two periods countless similar outbreaks have occurred, and if they have not in all cases proved disastrous failures, their success has been like that of the man who "drew a bow at a venture," and has been due to no merit in the attempt. If any Government has collapsed under the blow, it has been because it was so utterly rotten that even such a blow could overthrow it. Is the British Government in India of this nature?

But we have no hesitation in admitting that an outbreak even of a few fanatics is a thing that should be put down as far as possible. The question is, what are the best means for this purpose? The party of "vigour" have no hesitation in answering, "crush it," "stamp it out," "string up" all the men you catch; "string up" Ram Singh and all his lieutenants, or at any rate transport them, "turn all Kukas out of Government employ, and shave their heads." To these men a reference to the sanctity of human life is a "canting sentimentalism," at any rate when the life in question is the life of an opponent; so we will say nothing about the humanity of their policy. We will argue the matter as if the life of a Kuka were of no more importance than that of a dog, or even of a cabbage. We simply ask, "what do you expect from this policy?" You know that unless it is "thorough," it *must* fail. Dare you make it thorough? Can you extirpate the Kukas? Dare you even attempt to do so? You know you dare not; if you did you would most certainly be hanged, if not in India, at least as soon as you arrived in England; if Ram Singh has been guilty of any crime,

let him be tried by law for that crime. You dare not execute him or transport him for merely "political reasons;" nor can you imprison him for life on this charge; he must be released sooner or later; he will then return in triumph, nor will the sack of his home make him better disposed towards the Government. Assuming the execution of the more humble prisoners was not an act of absolute necessity, what have you gained by it? You say you have completely "cowed" the Kukas. You have merely stunned them for the moment. You have diminished their numbers by about 100 men, and have captured some of their leaders; you have also caused the lukewarm and time-servers to abandon their creed. When they see that you dare do nothing more, how long will it be before new leaders arise, and the sect recovers its spirit? We say you dare do no more, for you cannot make the mere fact of being a Kuka penal, or pass exceptional laws against the sect. Supposing you did dare to do so and that you succeeded in putting down the Kukas, in what respect have you gained? The fire of fanaticism will only break out in some other direction.

We cannot see that there is anything to gain by this policy of "vigour." On the other hand there is much to lose. By a petty persecution against the sect generally, you merely render it more fanatical and entirely crush the influence of those of its members who are well affected to the British Government; by wholesale and illegal executions you make martyrs of petty criminals. You render it certain that if another outbreak occurs, the rioters will commit the wildest excesses from sheer desperation, and that they will never again quietly surrender to a few armed men. In addition to its effect on the sect persecuted, what is the effect of your policy on the people at large? First of all on the non-Kuka relatives of the men executed? They looked on them as foolish heretics, and would have considered that it only served them rightly if their folly brought on them the chastisement of the law. Now they look on them as cruelly butchered. That they should do so is natural, for we should do so ourselves under similar circumstances; supposing relatives of our own joined the Society of Jesuits and made a frantic attempt to seize Edinburgh and establish the Inquisition; we should by no means regret to see their zeal cooled by a little wholesome correction; but if they were executed without trial, we should entirely overlook their faults and rave against the Government.

On the people at large the effect is equally disastrous. As a rule they thoroughly detested the Kukas; now they are beginning to look on them as national martyrs. No doubt many native sycophants applaud the "vigour" loudly. Some few may even really approve of it, but we are convinced (and all our enquiries confirm this conviction,) that it is viewed by them as a rule with the strong-

est disapproval. It has given Englishmen an opportunity of using the hateful talk about "a conquered country," a "ruling by the sword," which does so much to widen the gulf between the two classes. It has given natives the opportunity of saying that whilst we cant in Council about our desire to apply to India those maxims of government which have proved good elsewhere, we in our hearts desire to rule them in a way which in Europe we are loudest in denouncing as detestable.

We have expressed our disapproval of the policy of "vigour." What do we advocate in its place? We answer, a thoroughly impartial administration of the law, and a most careful avoidance of anything like a religious or political persecution. Magistrates of districts should get the best information they can of the movements of Kukas or any other fanatics, but they should let them clearly understand that as long as they refrained from breaking the law, they would be as much entitled to its protection as any other members of the community. If they were convicted of breaking it, they must pay the penalty. A so-called "political" offence is merely an offence punishable under a certain section of the Penal Code; persons accused under that section are entitled to as fair trials as persons accused under any other section, and their punishment should be regulated by precisely the same considerations. Thus of two men convicted of "levying war against the Queen," one might be a dangerous ringleader against whom a sentence of death might justly be carried out, the other might be a wretched dupe for whom a short imprisonment would be ample punishment. The party of "vigour" say we are not strong enough to shew such leniency, and therefore they shout "Death to the rebel and mutineer" without distinction. They rely on their boasted sword, but have a very uncomfortable feeling that it may at any time break sharp off at the hilt. We prefer to rely on a policy which we should not be ashamed to own before an English audience. It is a firm and impartial administration of the law, and a firm resolve that nothing but the most absolute necessity shall induce us to set it aside.

#### *The Orthography of Indian Proper Names.*

ON the 28th February 1870, the Government of India authorised the adoption of a uniform system of spelling for the Gazetteers and Maps now being prepared by the Statistical Department. The system originated with Dr. Hunter, and is explained by him as founded on "the principles of transliteration advocated by Sir William Jones a hundred years ago, but modified so as to suit the exigencies of cartography, and to make allowance for that considerable class of Indian places which have by lapse of time obtained a historical or popular spelling too firmly fixed to be

now wholly changed." During the last two years the system has been creeping gradually into popular favour and general use, and has been during the past quarter the subject of criticism and controversy in most of the journals of northern India. Public opinion, whilst it is by no means decided as to the intrinsic merits of the particular system thus authoritatively promulgated, appears to be unanimous in demanding *some* reform, and one that should be in the direction of uniformity. Whilst, however, nearly all writers deplore the present chaotic dispensation, it appears to us that comparatively few fully appreciate the difficulties that lie in the way of the introduction of any method that may have a fair chance of becoming really general in its use. Too many, underrating these difficulties, are inclined to be bigoted in the support of their own opinions, to be captious about minor points of detail, and critical about minute inaccuracies and small evils in the system which has been put forward.

We propose to devote a few lines, to point out some of the advantages of the new system, and at the same time to indicate some points in which we regard it as defective. As the best proof of our own impartiality in the matter, we wish distinctly to state that, whilst we shall be glad to see the system authoritatively modified in any or all of those portions against which we are about to raise objections, it is our full intention in any case loyally to follow it in its entirety in the pages of this Review. We are of those who believe that, in matters of orthography, uniformity is of far more importance than the attainment of any ideal perfection of detail.\* We shall briefly consider the advantages and disadvantages of the system (1) with reference to its adoption of the Jonesian (or, which is practically the same, the Wilsonian) method of transliteration; (2) with reference to the modifications of that method said to be necessitated by reasons of expediency.

We would premise, however, that, apart from all considerations of the intrinsic excellence of the system itself, the most powerful argument for its adoption is to be found in the fact, that the machinery which has been devised for facilitating its use in practice, and the large following that has already been secured for it, offer the most reasonable hopes of its ultimate establishment in general acceptance. In the first place, it is the only system which can boast of an authorised and extensive list of geographical names spelt in the way which is sanctioned by it. This most important advantage it owes to the zeal and industry of Dr. Hunter, who has recently issued (at the request, we presume, of the Postal authorities) a *Guide to the Orthography of Indian*

---

\* In articles signed by the authors, in all other cases, the Editor will undertake to secure this uniformity as will be left to their discretion; but far as he is able.

*Proper Names; with a list showing the true spelling of all Post towns and villages in India.* This list consists of four parallel columns, showing—*first*, the name as now spelt in the Postal Guide; *secondly*, the accurate transliteration from the vernacular character on the Wilsonian system; *thirdly*, the name as spelt in Keith Johnston's Royal Atlas; *fourthly*, the "practical spelling to be adopted by Government," *i.e.*, the authorised spelling under the new system. Here we get the full necessary particulars regarding the spelling of the names of no less than 2,186 places; and it is at once obvious that an immense step towards uniformity has been made by the publication of such a list. Again, the support which the system has already received is most important. The Government of India has adopted it; so have several of the local Governments (those of the Panjáb and Bombay have within the last few days issued the most peremptory orders to this effect, accompanied by a list of the chief towns and villages in the provinces); so have the Post Office, the Telegraph Department, the Surveys. Dr. Keith Johnston in his new map of India for the Royal Atlas, and Mr. John Murray in his Travellers' popular Handbook for India, adopt the system. The scientific Societies and the University of Calcutta already use the Wilsonian system of transliteration in its entirety. The leading newspaper in each of the following provinces,—Bengal, the North-West, the Central Provinces, the Panjáb,—follow the system with more or less strictness. On these points Dr. Hunter wisely says, in his *Guide* :—

If the system is to take lasting root, it must be the product of a natural growth, not a hot-house plant called into existence by Government forcing. The public must be persuaded, not compelled. But I am satisfied that the system has right reason on its side; and that, aided by patient watching and by the official machinery indicated above, right reason will in this case prevail.

Now that the works of the learned Societies, the popular newspapers, the "Post Office Guide," and the postal dies, the Telegraph Department's lists of stations, the Gazetteers and the revised survey maps, and most of the official Gazettes, will all exhibit a uniform (or nearly uniform) orthography; it seems certain that, the same name being nearly everywhere presented in the same spelling, the popular eye will be unconsciously and rapidly educated to adopt it.

Returning to the division of our subject indicated above; under the first head, we believe that the wisdom of the course which has been adopted is fully established by the consideration that the whole world of European and American scholars and orientlists has already firmly and finally adopted the Wilsonian system; and it seems to us that it would be a grievous folly if, whilst we

are attempting a great and salutary revolution for the sake of uniformity amongst Indian writers, we were to put ourselves into direct opposition to the established opinions and usages of scientific writers throughout the world. Dr. Hunter has well and fairly stated the case, from this point of view, between the rival systems of Professor Wilson (or Sir W. Jones) and Dr. Gilchrist :—

The popular spelling of Indian names is at present based on no uniform system whatever. Eighty years ago Sir William Jones published his system of transliterating Indian names upon the continental mode of rendering the vowel sounds. This system represents the Indian *i*, as in *police*, *ravine*, by *i*; the soft *u* sounds as in *rude* or *bull* by *u*; and so forth. On the other hand, Dr. Gilchrist published a system which, by the free use of double letters, endeavours to render the phonetic value of the Indian vowels more apparent to the uneducated English eye. Thus the above two vowels would be rendered not by the Italian *i* and *u*, but as *ee* and *oo*. For three-quarters of a century one set of Englishmen has been writing and printing Indian names on the first system, while another set has been using the second; and the confusion has been increased by passing travellers, mariners, and railway engineers, who have used no system whatever, but spelt the names of places which they came across in any loose fashion that struck their fancy, or roughly represented the sound to their untrained ear. It is clear, therefore, that, whatever system of spelling the Government may adopt, it must make up its mind to encounter the opposition of those who have been accustomed to spell in the other mode. The Scientific Societies and the whole body of European scholars have decided in favour of the system of Sir William Jones, which is simply the system pursued by the general commonwealth of European nations. On the other hand, the local public seems to prefer Dr. Gilchrist's mode of transliteration; and with one or two exceptions the Anglo-Indian press adopts it;\* yet one system or another must be adopted. For, in addition to the names transliterated upon these recognised systems, there is a vast number of Indian places, towns, &c., spelt on no plan whatever. The choice practically lies between encountering a loud local opposition, or placing the Government's *imprimatur* upon a system universally condemned by the Asiatic Societies, and by the whole body of European scholars. The subject has presented itself in a variety of shapes for many years, and in 1868 the Government wisely determined to face the temporary local criticism, rather than to subject itself to the permanent strictures of those who are most competent to pronounce in the matter, and whose decision will sooner or later become public opinion."

In adopting Sir William Jones' method, an important and, as we think, a wise concession has been made to the exigencies of typography and map-making by the rejection of all diacritical marks for the consonants; the only exception which we

---

\* This was written in 1869. Things have now changed.



would have been inclined to make would have been in the case of the nasal (*ñ*), which is hardly adequately represented by *n*. Of course this concession, like all other compromises, injures the symmetry of the scheme; but it would have been a hopeless task to attempt to introduce into popular and general use a system involving the continual use of hosts of *t's*, *d's*, *n's*, *s's*, &c., some dotted and others undotted, some accented and others unaccented; besides, a new element of possible error would have been introduced into all our printers' proofs, and the insertion of accents, dots, &c., in a map is a matter of considerable nicety.

The two points in the Wilsonian system of transliteration which have been most obnoxious to the criticism of the adherents of the so-called "popular" system of Dr. Gilchrist, are (1) the use of *a* to indicate the *Urvocal* or "original" vowel; and (2) the use of accented vowels instead of double letters. They object to the first, because uneducated Englishmen sometime pronounce the *a* as if it were *á* or *ah*; and to the second, because it is alleged that printers' devils misplace the accents. These two objections have been fairly answered in a letter to the *Indian Observer* of February 24, 1872, from which we will take the following extract:—

With regard to the first I would ask if you do not adopt *a*, what other symbol will you adopt? I take it for granted that uniformity is necessary. The difficulty is that, as this sound (the 'reed-sound' of the human voice) appears to be fundamentally present in all the vowel-sounds, so all the vowel-sounds in their turn have a tendency to degenerate into it; and, consequently, the temptation is very great, in random transliteration, to neglect uniformity, and select any vowel which may be suggested by the analogy of some well-known word. Thus in Elphinstone I find in *one* page every one of the five English vowels used successively to indicate this sound; at page 225 I find *Saras-watí*, *Menu*, *Bramíns*, *Mahometan*, *Jumna* (for *Yamuná* or Dr. Hunter's *Jamná*)! In Marshman also at pp. 31, 33, 36, I find all the vowels similarly impressed; in Nagarcote, *Brahmin*, *Mahomed*, *Sutlege*. Mr. Marshman, following what I believe is sometimes called the popular system, is in other parts almost pedantic in his use of *u* for this purpose; but I think no more powerful argument against this usage is needed, than a list of a few of the absurdities to which it leads him—such as *Himalayu*, *Mugudu*, *Ramu*, *Sivu*, *Dunduku*, *Goutumu*, *Ravunu*. Moreover, as I have shown above, he is not consistent; and this inconsistency is most evident and most pernicious in such words as *Madura* (p. 21) where the *u* is the Wilsonian *u*. It seems to me impossible to get over the difficulty that, if you use *u* for this philological *a*, you have no symbols whereby you can indicate our *u* and *ú*; as the double *o* must be appropriated to one of these. And the difficulty presented by the absurd appearance of *u* as a final letter appears to me scarcely less insuperable; whereas the *a* in this critical position is always pro-

nounced by Englishmen with a fair approximation to accuracy. I am very fearful of really deserving the charge of pedantry with which you appear inclined to threaten the would-be reformers of Anglo-Indian transliteration ; or I would lay more stress on one further consideration—*viz.*, that unless we get absolute uniformity, all our transliterations will be not only absolutely valueless, but actually so many *pierres d'achoppement* to European students of comparative philology—to whom, moreover, the *a* as a symbol of the *Urvocal* is perfectly intelligible under the Wilsonian system. Permit me to remind you when you poke fun at us about “not making sufficient allowance for the weaknesses of our less learned countrymen,” that the number of uneducated Anglo-Indian readers is infinitesimal, when compared with the number of uneducated readers of a vernacular language in any country of the world ; and I venture to think that any man of average intelligence will quickly learn that the *a* in Anglo-Indian names is the *a* in “woman,” “rural,” and not the broad *a* in “calm,” or the short *a* in “Sam.”

Turning to the second point, your objection to the accented vowels, it seems to me that you (in common with most other writers on your side of the question) are inclined to overestimate the difficulties of printing them ; and are forgetful of the fact that, in the type, the accents are cast with, and form a part of, the letters to which they are attached ; and consequently *cannot* be “shot down on the wrong vowels,” at the sweet wills of the printers’ devils. To a compositor, an accented *a* is as different from an unaccented one as either is from any other letter ; nor are they in any way more likely to be misprinted one for the other. The only printing difficulties that strike me as worthy of notice are—(1) press readers and authors, until they get accustomed to it, will find the work of correcting proof-sheets a little more difficult, merely because a new element of *possible* inaccuracy has been introduced ; and (2) presses will have to be furnished with as many new sets of type for every fount, as there are new (*i.e.*, accented) letters. And I think that sufficient concession has been made to these difficulties by giving up all diacritical marks for the consonants ; provided that, for other reasons, accented vowels are really preferable to the double letters. These other reasons are matters of detail into which I cannot enter fully here ; I will merely suggest one or two. In the first place, I cannot help thinking that the double letters have an ugly and unsymmetrical appearance, but this is of course merely a matter of taste. In the second place, a far more important consideration is the fact that the accented vowels occupy much less space, and are consequently invaluable for cartographic purposes. In the third place, I do not think you can adequately represent the Wilsonian *u*, if *oo* represent *û* and *u* be used for the philological *a* ; I do not think *i* can be adequately represented (unless it be a final, by *y*) if *ee* represent *î*—for neither *i* (on the analogy of the *ee*) nor *e* can perform that function.”

We now turn to the second division of our subject, *viz.*, the open departures from the Wilsonian method which have been sanctioned by the Government on the authority of Dr. Hunter. These of course are peculiar to this system, and make it essen-

tially a *new* method. The necessity for such modifications arises from two causes—English usage, and native local variations in usage, each of which we will consider separately.

The most important of these causes (though it affects a far smaller number of names of towns than are affected by the second cause) is the fact that popular English usage has given a certain fixity to the spelling of the names of some two hundred towns and districts in India. Thus, it would be obviously absurd and pedantic to a degree to alter a single letter of the names of Bengal, Bombay, Madras, or Calcutta. On the other hand, it is perfectly practicable to alter *Punjab* into *Panjáb*; for the name of the province is already spelt in both ways, and we may as well adopt the correct method where we have a choice. But the difficulty is, where are we to draw the line? We will quote Dr. Hunter's answer to this question :—

There is a large class of more doubtful cases, such as Roy Bareilly, Lucknow, and Cawnpoor. The first of these names furnishes a type of a numerous family in which Keith Johnston's Royal Atlas comes to our aid. The old Anglo-Indian form was Roy Bareilly; the mode to which Dr. Keith Johnston's map has given popular fixity in England is Rai Bareilli; and from this the change to the correct form, namely, Rai Bareli, is so slight that I have not hesitated to make it. On the other hand, the word Lucknow being the capital of a Province, and having obtained a historical fixity of spelling from the events of the Mutiny,\* I have not ventured to alter it into the correct form Lakhnau, or any modification of it, although Dr. Keith Johnston deemed this practicable. The third of the above examples, Cawnpur, is also a representative word. Its spelling in the vernacular is variously returned as Khánpur and Kánhpur, (the latter being a contraction of Kánháipur, meaning Krishnapur). Dr. Keith Johnston gives in his map the two forms—Kanhpur and Cawnpur. I have not ventured to go further than the latter form. In the same way with regard to a large class of words such as Lahore, Mysore (Maisúrú), Vellore (Vellúrú), &c., I have confined myself to striking out the final *e* which would, according to the now authorised orthography, be sounded, and have spelt the words Lahor, Mysor, Vellor. Throughout I have most carefully avoided anything like the destruction of the identity of the word by a change in the spelling."

In many names which have been thus "screwed up a little towards the pitch of scientific accuracy" by Dr. Hunter, we cannot but regard the result as deplorably unsymmetrical, and even hideous. Even if compromises of this sort be at all admissible—and we are compelled to admit that they probably are made necessary

---

\* We regret to observe that Dr. Hunter must have altered his mind after writing this; for he now spells the word *Lacknow*. This is a dreadful hash; if we have the *a* in the first syllable, the combinations *ck* and *ow* are outrageous.

sometimes by local prejudice,—for Dr. Hunter has evidently struggled hard to establish something like accuracy in his list—we would strongly urge that (except in the four firmly fixed spellings mentioned above) all forms like *ck* and *ow* and the use of *c* for *k*, which actually outrage the very fundamental principles of the system, should be rejected. For instance, *Lacknow* appears to us to be utterly incomprehensible; if we pronounce it according to the old English system, it will be *Lack-now*; if we attempt to pronounce it according to the Wilsonian method, we shall be puzzled by the *ck* and the *ow*, but will probably hit upon *Luck-nō*; and in either case we shall be wrong. For our own part we should be glad to see the word written *Lakhnau*, which every educated man would know how to pronounce; at the same time we are prepared to yield to the force of Dr. Hunter's own arguments quoted above, wherein he shows that it is historically fixed as *Lucknow*; but we protest against *Lacknow*. *Cuttack* is, we think, even more reprehensible; for it is difficult to see that any historical fixity can be claimed for *Cuttack*, which form, moreover, is invariably mispronounced by the accent being placed on the second syllable; whilst we fancy that few who are concerned with the spelling at all, would be exercised by the right spelling *Katak*.

The above are the only points whereon we shall venture to question Dr. Hunter's good judgment. In the numerous difficulties which have presented themselves, by the local and dialectic variations in usage with regard to the spelling of the names of the same place, his decisions appear to us to have been for the most part highly judicious. The multiform vernaculars of India not only differ widely in their written character; they also exhibit a most perplexing series of vowel and consonant changes and of terminal variations. With regard to the terminal variations, we will quote a paragraph from Dr. Hunter's note which will at once serve to illustrate the difficulty of the point, and to give a fair sample of the judicious treatment of which we have spoken:—

Cases constantly occur in which the transliterator has to decide between the uniform philological spelling of the word and its conflicting local variations. With regard to *grām*, I have found it necessary to follow local usage, so that it appears in the following list as *grām*, *gāon*, *gām*, and *gān*. With regard to the second great terminal affix *pur*, I have uniformly spelt it with a short *u* as *pur*.† A third common affix, *nagar*, town, which Anglo-Indians have hitherto variably spelt as *nagar*, *nagore*, *naggur*, *nuggur*, *nuggore*, &c., is here uniformly spelt

† Dr. Hunter elsewhere notes that this is written with a long *u* in Urdu, with a short *u* in Bengali, and either with a long or short *u* in Sanskrit and some of its descended languages.

It also takes the feminine form *purī* and in South India it becomes *purū*; besides several Anglo-Indian forms, such as *pore* and *poor*.

*nagar*. A fourth, *shahr*, city, has enjoyed an even wider range of orthography, but is here invariably spelt *shahr*.

Dr. Hunter admits that a protracted intricate discussion might be raised about each one of at least fourteen hundred names amongst the 2,186 post towns, on the spelling of which he has had to decide. Such discussions would probably be useless in most cases; and in all, only satisfactory to the advocates of the form finally adopted. We are grateful to the Government, and to Dr. Hunter, for what has been here done for us in rendering possible a generally uniform method of orthography; and whilst we hope to see some further improvements worked out in the details of the scheme, we trust that we shall before long see it universally used by all Anglo-Indian writers.

### *Bengal Municipalities' Bill, 1872.*

NEXT to the District Road Cess Act, this is the most important measure which has come before the Bengal Council since Mr. Campbell became our Lieutenant-Governor. The statement of objects and reasons given at the end of the draft of the bill makes out that consolidation of the various enactments under which municipalities are at present administered is the chief object of the proposed alteration of the law. In this case at least consolidation seems a very doubtful advantage; at present there is one law for budding municipalities, and another for full blown ones, and the new Act of 234 sections is intended to take the place of several short and distinct laws which are now beginning to be fairly understood. The provisions of the new act will doubtless soon be mastered by the official members of local committees, but they will certainly present many difficulties to the members of *panchâyats* and to the public, to whom this everlasting flux in the law is a standing source of amazement and perplexity. Consolidation, however, is clearly a pretext, and not a reason in the present instance; and one of the most pressing motives for the change in the law is to fit municipalities for new burthens to which they have hitherto been strangers. The attention of the Bengal Government appears to be at present fixed upon devising means to raise money for mass education; already the colleges of Barhampur, Krishnagar, and Patna, have been abolished, and we believe that a commission appointed by the Lieutenant-Governor is at present engaged upon the elaboration of a plan for the reduction of *zillah* schools. The new municipal bill appears to be framed with a view to this avowed educational policy of Government; it proposes to give the Lieutenant-Governor the power of forcing municipalities, under certain circumstances, to provide within their limits elementary education, and also allows municipalities

to support those zillah schools from which it is apparently the intention of Government to withdraw the grants-in-aid by which they are now partly maintained. It is also proposed to burthen municipalities with a share of the expenses incurred under the new District Road Cess Act ; and in order to meet the charges for these new objects of expenditure, it is proposed to permit municipalities to impose fresh taxes within their limits. The Bengal Government will of course attempt to shield itself behind the municipal commissioners from the public odium which the new taxes will be met with ; and will say that the imposition of the taxes rests with the municipalitites, and that it is optional with the commissioners to raise as much or as little as they please. But this plea will deceive no one. The existing funds of nine-tenths of the municipalities are only sufficient to cover the most necessary expenses of police and conservancy ; and if some of this money is forcibly diverted by Government to other objects, it is clear that more funds must be somehow raised, and in so raising them the municipal commissioners will be only stalking horses of the Government. The voice may be the voice of Jacob, but the hands are the hands of Esau.

---

*Indian Patronage.*

THE history of every administration in the world teaches us that purity in the bestowal of State patronage has never been attained—has never been even approached—except under the pressure of a very strong and united public opinion on the subject ; nor indeed by this means (*teste* the jobbery that notoriously exists in the United States of America), except where public opinion is guided by the intelligent and cultivated classes of the community, and avowedly governed by high moral and patriotic principles. Nowhere is this political force more powerful than in England ; and nowhere are State appointments made with greater care or with more scrupulous honesty and patriotism. Not dissimilar was the state of affairs under the late Prussian monarchy ; and its results were apparent in the administration during the war, not only in the military department, but in every other Service of the State. It remains to be seen whether under the Empire the immense preponderance given to the *Junker* party by that war, will enable it to disregard that force to whose beneficent action it owes its aggrandisement, and the country owes its prosperity ; should this unfortunately happen, the German Empire may not improbably rival, in its jobbery, the corruption, which more than anything else hastened the fall of the Empire in France. In the latter country public opinion, notwithstanding the evil influence of extreme parties like the Ultramontanes on one

side, and the Reds on the other, is hardly less pronounced, and is certainly much more vehement than in England ; but it was stifled under the weight of the Imperial military despotism, which was able to give the keys of the country's honour and safety to the minions of a selfish Court.

During the early period of our rule in India, the vast patronage of the old Company was the object of continual solicitude both in Parliament and in the Cabinet ; and we obtain the key to the right understanding of more than one of the many curious Parliamentary intrigues that attended the various renewals of the Charter, when we remember that whilst the Crown, the Parliament, and the country were alike envious of the close monopoly of Indian appointments by the Company, the Parliament and the people were even more jealous of the enormous accession of political power that would accrue to the executive by the absolute transfer of the whole patronage to the Crown. The happy expedient of the introduction of a system of open competition for the Civil Service, smoothed over many difficulties of this kind ; and whatever may be deemed to be the demerits or the virtues of the competitive system on other points, it has undoubtedly deserved well of this country in taking away from its regulation patronage the character of being a preserve for the relations or hangers-on of a few lucky families.

Old Presidents of the Board of Control and more recent Secretaries of State, satisfied with having the disposal of the great posts—the Governor-Generalship and the other Governorships, and the fat prizes of the Army, the Law, and the Church—were well pleased to make a virtue of what was (from the force of public opinion at home) almost a necessity, and to allow the rule *detur digniori* to be applied to the selection of recruits for the regular executive and judicial appointments by the unimpeachable method of an open literary competition. By this means it seemed that all jobbery in important places must be at once and for ever extinguished ; for the high and dignified posts reserved for home patronage were too much exposed to the glare of publicity to be seriously liable to any evils of this kind. Circumstances, however, which we shall detail, rendered the reform by no means so thorough as was expected. The past quarter has seen, in the publication of the correspondence between the India Office and the Government of India on the subject of the “Uncovenanted Service” Leave-rules, an exposure of a good deal of heart-burning and unseemly bickering on the subject of the right to the disposal of the surplus patronage in the first instance ; and, in one or two instances, to which we shall make a brief reference presently, the uncertainty about the rights of nominees (caused mainly by the uncertainty attending their first appointment)

has caused much discontent in more than one large and important body of public servants.

The circumstances, to which we alluded above, were those which caused the growth and development of many "Uncovenanted" Services in this country, separate from the regularly-constituted Civil Service. The causes of this growth may be divided under three heads, each of which we will briefly consider by itself. The *first* cause was the obvious fact that most of the subordinate posts under the Government of British India, and some of the higher posts, were better filled by natives of this country than by Englishmen; the *second* cause was that the exigencies of the public service demanded the retention in this country of a number of English military officers considerably in excess of the number ordinarily required by the army in times of peace, whose services might therefore obviously be economically utilised at such times in civil capacities; the *third* cause was that the services required by the Indian Governments from some of their officers were of a special and technical nature, and required a technical training such as could not be expected from the generality of their civil officers. Each and all of these causes have contributed to swell the numbers and the importance of the "uncovenanted" and "non-regulation" Services of India, until at the present day the aggregate of this patronage is hardly less valuable than that which belonged to the Company in the olden days; whilst the purity of its administration is for the most part guarded by none of those safeguards with which the disposal of the covenanted appointments has been hedged. As things stand at present, there seems in many cases to be no hard and fast line between those posts which are in the gift of the Secretary of State and those which are filled up by the Government of India and by the local Governments respectively; and the uncertainty which exists as to the rights of the respective nominees is an indirect consequence of this state of affairs. The correspondence to which we have referred demonstrates the urgent need of an immediate and definite settlement; and we believe that such a settlement may be best effected by mutual concessions, and by the imposition of certain tests as qualifications for appointments, to be fixed with the concurrence of all the authorities concerned.

We will first consider the case of those posts which are rightly and properly filled by natives of this country; and on this point we may at once say that we heartily concur with the reiterated declarations of the Secretary of State that Europeans should be rigidly excluded from holding such posts. When we remember the enormous disadvantages under which an Englishman labours in coming out to this country—the risks to health and even to life in a tropical climate, the severance of all home ties and the sacri-



fice of all home prospects, and the terrible expenses and the sufferings entailed by the necessity of educating his children in England and of occasionally visiting home himself in search of health—it is obvious that, in posts for which both are equally eligible we cannot hope to obtain an Englishman of a calibre equal to the native easily obtainable for the same pay. Hence in a mixed service of the kind to which we refer, if we offer a pay sufficient to attract highly qualified Englishmen, it is certain that we are paying their native colleagues at a rate considerably in excess of the market value of their services; whilst on the other hand, if the pay and conditions of service be calculated on the scale of native requirements, the English *employés* will either be utterly discontented, or (which must *ultimately*, from the laws of demand and supply, happen in any case) they will be of a calibre utterly inferior to their native colleagues. The plea which has been put forward that Government is bound to provide for the children of those Englishmen whom it has brought out to this country, is utterly untenable, or at least utterly inapplicable to this case; the obligation, if it exists, should be recognised in the treatment of the parents, and not by saddling the country with inferior public servants when a better article is easily procurable. With regard, then, to this branch of Indian patronage, it appears that it would be sufficient for the public interests if the Indian Governments were to be absolutely restricted to natives of the country in their choice of nominees, but to be perfectly free otherwise to make the best bargains they can. The Native Services should of course be treated liberally—but strictly according to native requirements only. If this programme, which appears to coincide with the wishes of the Secretary of State, be loyally carried out, we believe that the stability of the administration will be largely increased, by the extended employment of native agency; whilst its efficiency will be improved, and its cost (especially in the items of furlough and sick allowances) considerably diminished.

We come, secondly, to the consideration of the state of things which is caused by the obvious necessity and advantage of largely employing military officers in civil posts. An outlet for this cheap\* supply of labour has been fittingly found in the various non-regulation provinces; where, the forms of the executive and judicial administration not being as yet stereotyped, there is not so much need as in the older Governments of a high preliminary technical training in the civil officers. Mainly on this account,

---

\* We call this labour *cheap*, because the actual cost (for Civil services) to the country of a military officer in civil employ is only that por-

tion of his consolidated pay which is in excess of the military pay he would draw in any case, even if he were doing nothing.

the patronage of the non-regulation provinces has been held to be at the disposal of the various Governments concerned, and not to be restricted to the Covenanted Civil Service. So far the arrangement seems a wise and even a necessary one ; but numerous and serious complaints have of late been made of the way in which the patronage thus liberated has been distributed. A more or less formal engagement was formerly entered into by the Supreme Government, that the Covenanted Civil Service should have a monopoly of at least fifty per cent. of these non-regulation appointments ; and the question whether this engagement has been fulfilled or not has been, during the last quarter, the subject of furious correspondence in nearly all the newspapers of Northern India. The *gravamen* of the charges alleged by the covenanted civilians has been that, even in those Commissions in which their promised percentage of appointments has been given them, the percentage has often or generally been made up by a preponderance in the lower grades, and only a small share of the prizes ; and that moreover the free distribution of the patronage, originally instituted merely for the useful purpose of giving employments to military officers who would otherwise be idle, has often been abused to provide for the wants of needy relatives or favourites of men in power. We have not room in this place fully to discuss the justice or injustice of these charges, which have already been disputed over in the daily and weekly press *usque ad nauseam* ; but we may be allowed, without attempting to sit in judgment on the merits of the particular cases which have been set forth, to draw some practical conclusions from the general discussion. In the first place, the equity of the case seems to us clearly to demand that the promised percentage should be maintained, not only in the aggregate number of appointments in any Commission (which must be the case according to the letter of the law), but also in the aggregate emoluments ; and the latter condition can only be fulfilled if the percentage be maintained in the higher as well as in the lower grades. In the second place, we confess we are unable to understand the *raison d'être* of an "uncovenanted civilian" element, in addition to the "military civilians" and the covenanted civilians, in any Commission. *A priori*, the Covenanted Civil Service seems to have a right to expect a monopoly of these appointments ; inasmuch as its members have been selected in England for the very purpose, and by the method which has been authoritatively and finally declared to be the best and only proper one. Special circumstances, as we have shown, fairly bar this right, so far as to allow of the employment of as many military officers as may be deemed necessary and right ; but in the absence of such special circumstances, the *a priori* right ought to be respected. On the whole, it seems to us that the settlement which is urgently needed to set these disputes

at rest for ever, must ultimately take something of this form—rules will have to be issued, showing exactly what classes of persons, and how many of each class, in each grade, may lawfully be employed in the administration of the various non-regulation provinces. With these inoffensive and wholesome restrictions, the whole patronage will doubtless be left to the unfettered discretion of the Indian Governments. With the constitution of the *personnel* of the administrations on this definite footing, all class differences and jealousies should be entirely lost sight of; every officer who has once joined a commission should have an indefeasible right to absolutely equal treatment with his fellows, and to promotion in accordance with his merits as vacancies occur; except in cases of misconduct or incompetence, “supersession” should be as impossible in the non-regulation districts, as it is supposed to be in the regulation provinces.

We come, in the third and last place, to those appointments which require a scientific or technical training; and here again we think that a hard and fast line should be drawn as to the possession of the right of patronage. In by far the larger number of cases—we would instance the Educational, the Geological, and similar Departments—the scientific or technical training that is required can only be obtained in Europe; and for all such places it is obvious that the patronage should rest solely with the Secretary of State, and should be exercised only in England. In a few cases—*e.g.*, in some legal appointments, which are naturally looked upon as the rewards of an able and intelligent local Bar—the technical training is best acquired in India; and appointments to these places will doubtless be best made by the local authorities. But here, as elsewhere, a *rule* is wanted; and this rule should also stipulate for the possession of certain recognised qualifications by the nominee in each case. Constitutional checks and safeguards are the pride of the English method of government; and the Indian Governments may most fairly demand that the nominees of the Secretary of State should be able to present, in every case where such a thing is possible, some tangible certificate of their presumable fitness for their particular work. Such a certificate is furnished, for the Covenanted Civil Service, by the Dean’s Yard examiners. For the Educational Department, the rule (which has, we believe, in practice always been adhered to by the Secretary of State) that every nominee must be a graduate *in honours* of one of the home Universities, should be laid down in precise terms. For the Geological Department, the *testamurs* of the natural science (Geological) examiners at the Universities, or the certificates of the professors of Jermyn Street, may fairly be demanded. And so on for the other scientific and technical departments. Moreover a code of rules such those we have suggested, would also contain

a distinct statement (as proposed for the non-regulation administrations) of the rights of nominees with regard to promotion; and would doubtless render impossible such an appointment as that of Mr. Cordery to the Directorship of Public Instruction in the Panjáb—an appointment by which the whole Panjáb Educational Department has recently been aggrieved and insulted by a wholesale and general supersession in favour of a gentleman entirely unconnected with the Service.

The somewhat invidious nature of our position here in India and the comparatively high terms in many cases offered (to be paid out of Indian taxation) in the hope of attracting really good men, render it especially necessary that the purity of Indian appointments should be, like Cæsar's wife, above suspicion. It is, we venture to think, obvious that this desirable consummation can only be obtained by some such device as that of a definite and inelastic code of rules such as that we have suggested. Until some measure of this kind is adopted—however immaculately honest and patriotic may be, in reality, the intentions and the practice of our rulers—we shall not cease to hear those sneers about “taking care of Dowb,” those terrible whispers about “somebody's cousins” and “brothers-in-law,” those scarcely-disguised charges of nepotism and favouritism, which have been so rife of late, and which tend so painfully to stultify our pharisaical English professions, and to throw discredit on our English rule in India.

---

*The Muhammadan Faith.*

**A**MONG the topics of the quarter, there are few who will deny that the Muhammadan Faith has been perhaps the most prominent. What does the Muhammadan believe? Is he compelled by the very nature of his creed to live in a state of chronic hostility to the established order of things? These and similar questions have been brought forward and discussed again and again; and they are, even yet, only resting in an uneasy slumber. A very small matter would awaken them into all their former activity. We think, then, it will not be devoid of interest to give a short account of the various sources whence the Musalmán derives his rules of faith and practice. The Orientalist will smile at the (to him) very obvious facts we shall have to include in a brief notice like the present; but we are writing for the benefit of the unlearned, who regard Oriental studies with that aversion which they undoubtedly deserve from their intrinsic dreariness.

The orthodox Musalmán then must entirely repudiate the notion that the Korán was composed by the Prophet or by any other for him. The Korán is eternal and uncreated; and the first transcript of it has been from everlasting by the throne of God,

written out on a table of immense size, called "The Preserved Table," in which are also recorded the divine decrees, past and future. A copy from this table written in one volume on paper, was brought down to the lowest heaven, by the angel Gabriel in the month of Ramadan on the night of power; and thence Gabriel revealed it, bit by bit, to Muhammad, as the exigencies of circumstances demanded it.\*

According to the Musalmán tradition the first verses of the Korán which were communicated to the Prophet, were these, "Read in the name of thy Lord who hath created man of congealed blood." Gabriel announced them to the Prophet in a cave of Mount Harab, near to the city of Mecca. Muhammad was obliged to confess that he could not read, and was unable to understand a word of that which was written in the volume presented to him. The angel at once miraculously inspired him with the power to read; and from that time, for the space of twenty-three years, further revelations continued to be made, sometimes at Mecca and sometimes at Medina. But though the Korán was thus communicated in fragments, the Prophet was permitted to enjoy the consolation of seeing the whole once a year, in the shape of a magnificent volume bound in silk, and adorned with gold and precious stones. On the last year of his life he enjoyed this privilege twice.

As each revelation was communicated to the Prophet, he recited it to some of the companions or followers who happened to be present; and it was generally committed to writing by some one amongst them, upon palm leaves, leather, stones, or any other materials which chanced to be at hand. During the Prophet's life-time, no attempt was made to arrange them upon any system. We have no evidence to show that he took any special measures to preserve them from being destroyed; trusting, it would seem, to the marvellous tenacity of the Arab memory for their preservation.

At that time, it must be remembered the practise of writing books was rare among the Arabs. The history of the different tribes, their genealogies, their poetry, were preserved by the aid of memory alone, and thus transmitted down from one generation to another. A highly educated man of that time was one who carried about in his head the history, genealogies, adventures,

---

\* The Prophet records this descent in these words:—"Verily we sent down the Korán in the night of Al-kadr (i.e. power). And what shall make thee understand how excellent the night of Al Kadr is? The night of Al Kadr is better than a thousand

months. Therein do the angels descend, and the Spirit Gabriel also, by the permission of their Lord with his decrees concerning every matter. It is peace until the rising of the morn. Sura xcvi.

idioms, and in a word, all the characteristics which distinguished the various desert tribes from each other. Thus Ibn Khallikan relates the following of Hammad ar-Rawia (i.e., the narrator), "one of the best informed of men":—"Being one day present at a public audience given by the Khalif Abdul-melek he was asked by that prince in what way he merited the surname of 'the narrator,' and he returned this answer—'Because I can recite the poems of every poet whom you, O Commander of the Faithful! have ever known or heard of; and I can rehearse, moreover, the compositions of many poets whom you will acknowledge that you did not know, neither did you hear of; and no one can quote to me passages of ancient and modern poetry without my being able to tell the ancient from the modern.' The Khalif then asked him how much poetry he knew by heart, and Hammad replied, 'A great deal more than I can tell; but I can recite to you for each letter of the alphabet, one hundred long poems rhyming in that letter, without taking into account the short pieces; and all these composed exclusively by poets who lived before the promulgation of Islam.' On this the Khalif told him that he intended to make a trial of his talent, and he ordered him therefore to begin his recitations. Hammad commenced and continued till the Khalif having grown fatigued withdrew, after leaving a person in his place to verify the truth of the assertion, and hear him to the last. In that sitting he recited two thousand one hundred *kastidas* by poets who flourished before Muhammad; and the Khalif, on being informed of the fact, ordered him a present of one hundred thousand dirhems." Among a people thus abnormally gifted, trusting the preservation of his revelations to the memory merely, was not so wild an experiment on the part of the Prophet as it seems to us. It became a mark of honour to know the Korán by heart. The person who, in any company, could repeat the Korán with the greatest accuracy, was of right entitled to conduct the public prayers, to a larger share of the spoils won upon the field of battle; and if he fell a martyr of the Crescent, he was honoured with the first burial. And according to early tradition, several of the Prophet's followers could during his life-time repeat the entire revelation without a single omission.

But very shortly after the death of the Prophet was fought the terrible battle of Yemâna against Moseilama—"the Liar," as Muhammad had stigmatised him. The Liar was slain, and his followers dispersed, but the struggle had been desperate and bloody, and so many of the Faithful distinguished by their knowledge of the Korán were slain, that it became apparent a few more such battles would simply eradicate the Korán from the minds of men. Omar urged upon the Khalif Abu Bakr to lose no time in making an authoritative collection of the various fragments of

the Korán "from date leaves, and tablets of white stone and from the breasts of men." This was accordingly done, and the Korán reduced to the order and sequence in which we now find it. This compilation remained the standard text during the Khalifat of Omar.

Thirty years after the Hijrah, in the time of the Khalif Othman, a second revision became necessary. The Korán was intended to be *one*, but it was found to the great scandal of the orthodox that there was great disagreement among the copies of the Korán used in the various provinces of the Arabian empire. This was represented to Othman, and he was urged to provide a remedy and "stop the people before they should differ regarding their scriptures as did the Jews and Christians." He, in consequence, nominated a Committee of Revision, consisting of Zeid Ibn Thabit, a former amanuensis of the Prophet who had collected the fragments of the Korán in the time of Abu Bakr, assisted by three Koreishites. These last were appointed as being skilled in the Meccan dialect, in which the revelations of the Prophet had been originally communicated to men. By this committee a new transcript was made of the Holy Book ; copies were multiplied and transmitted to the chief cities of the empire, and the previously existing copies were committed to the flames. In accomplishing this work, the Committee of Revision appear to have worked with the most child-like simplicity. Everything that could be proved to have been uttered by the Prophet in his prophetic character, they regarded as the spoken word of God ; possessing as such an intrinsic value which could not be affected by the minor questions of context. Put them in where or how they would, they must remain the word of God still, and as such of quite immeasurable value to men. The consequence is that we have in the Korán (so far at least as one may judge from a translation) a book the most dreary and difficult to read that it is possible to imagine. There is not a glimmering of sequence in it from beginning to end. The reader wanders fatigued and bewildered through a wilderness of interminable repetitions and contradictions without number. The compilers seem indeed to have had quite a genius for arranging their matter in such a manner that almost every statement of any moment should have a flat contradiction following close upon its heels ; as, for example a commendation of Christianity linked with a declaration that Christians are doomed to Hell fire ; a furious incitement to religious war, immediately followed by a bitter reproof of all violence in religion, or the folly of supposing that whether men do or forbear to do, they can in any way affect the purposes of the Most High. Then there are the same legends, either taken from the past history of Arabia, or distorted from the writings contained in the Old Testament, the same ideas,

the same doctrines repeated over and over again with the most wearisome iteration. The Editor, in short, considered that he had acquitted himself of his task, so soon as he had written out continuously every fragment of speech which could be shown to have the seal of the Prophet upon it, without the least concern for its comparative importance, or the circumstances under which it was spoken. From this one fact it will be seen at once that it is simply impossible to obtain from the Korán a consistent reply to a question about any one duty incumbent upon a faithful Musalmán. It certainly passionately exhorts the Faithful to fight in the defence of religion ; but it is also most explicit in its declarations of its uselessness, and its reprobation of violence. A peaceably disposed Muhammadan, would never be in need of a reason for the faith that is in him ; e.g., " Fight for the religion of God against those who fight against you ; but transgress not by *attacking them first*, for God loveth not the transgressor."— *Sura II.*

" If thy Lord had pleased, verily all who are in the earth would have believed in general. *Wilt thou therefore forcibly compel men to be true believers ?* No soul can believe but by the permission of God ; and he shall pour out his indignation on those who will not understand.— *Sura X.*

Such verses as these appear to us to express the innermost spirit of Islám—that of resignation to the decrees of an Almighty will ; and among the Faithful, this spirit, we are inclined to think, is far stronger than the old aggressive one, which the savage tribal wars of the early Arabs kindled to such a burning heat. Mr. Lane, in his delightful book on the " Modern Egyptians," gives his testimony to the same effect :—" With the religious zeal of the Muslims," he writes, " I am daily struck ; yet I have often wondered that they so seldom attempt to make converts to their faith. On my expressing my surprise, as I have frequently done, at their indifference with respect to the propagation of their religion, contrasting it with the conduct of their ancestors of the early ages of El-Islám, I have generally been answered, " Of what use would it be if I could convert a thousand infidels?—would it increase the number of the faithful? By no means ; the number of the faithful is decreed by God ; and no act of man can increase or diminish it." Nothing could be more strictly logical than this conduct. " Whomsoever," declares the Prophet, " God shall please to direct, he will open his breast to receive the faith of Islám ; but whomsoever he shall please to lead into error, he will render his breast straight and narrow as though he was climbing up to heaven." Fatalism is the corner stone of a Musalmán's faith.

But, besides the Korán, there is another source whence the Muhammadan derives his principles of conduct, namely, the Traditions. When the Arabs became the lords of a vast empire,



the few simple rules of life laid down in the Korán were speedily found insufficient to cope with the complexities of their new state. "Crowded cities," to quote from Sir W. Muir's most valuable work, "like Fostál, Kufa, and Damascus required an elaborate compilation of laws for the guidance of their courts of justice; new political relations demanded a system of international equity. The speculations of a people before whom literature was preparing to throw open her arena, and controversies of eager factions upon nice points of faith, were impatient of the narrow limits which confined them:—all called loudly for the enlargement of the scanty and naked dogmas of the Coran, and for the development of its defective code of ethics. And yet it was the cardinal principle of early Islám that the standard of Law, of Theology, and of Politics was the Coran, and the Coran alone. By it Mahomet himself ruled; to it in his teaching he always referred; from it he professed to derive his opinions, and upon it to ground his decisions. If he the Messenger of the Lord and the Founder of the Faith was thus bound by the Coran, much more were the Caliphs, his uninspired substitutes. New and unforeseen circumstances were continually arising, for which the Coran contained no provision. It no longer sufficed for its original object. How, then, were its deficiencies to be supplied? The difficulty was resolved by adopting the custom or "Sunnat" of Mahomet, that is, his *sayings* and his *practice*, as a supplement to the Coran. . . . Tradition was thus invested with the force of law and with some of the authority of inspiration. . .

. . . Men devoted their lives to the business (of collection). They travelled from city to city, and from tribe to tribe, over the whole Mahometan world; sought out by personal inquiry every vestige of Mahomet's biography yet lingering among the *Companions*, the *Successors*, and their descendants; and committed to writing the tales and reminiscences with which they used to edify their wondering and admiring auditors." Besides these two sources, the Korán and the Traditions—there exists a third, the decisions namely of the four great Imáms, Abu Hanifa, As-Shafi, Málík, and Ibn Hanbal, pre-eminent both for their abilities and for the number of points which each settled on his own authority, and formed into a body of supplementary doctrines.

---

*The Budget—1872-73.*

**I**F Sir Richard Temple is at the present moment the best abused man in all India, he has probably only himself to blame. With opportunities which might fairly be envied, with gifts of fortune which more than compensate for his own want of ability, he is still the most unsuccessful and the most unpopular Finance

Minister that India has ever possessed. Not that we think the country is under no obligation whatever to the Financial Department as at present constituted. With all its faults it has one redeeming virtue, which with a Minister of greater tact, would have gone far to atone for them. That virtue is economy. Whatever may be said to its disadvantage, it cannot be denied that the Financial Department—and it is only fair that its Chief should have the credit—has worked hard and successfully of late years to keep down expenditure. While we are far from thinking that India should be governed by any single Department of the Supreme Government, it is a source of satisfaction that Sir R. Temple knows how to put the screw on, and is not afraid to do it.

But when we have said this, we have probably said all we can in his favour as a Financier. In our comments upon the Budget last year, we drew special attention to the opium estimates and the income-tax. We pointed out that the receipts under the former head were placed at far too low a figure, and we attempted to show that the revenue from this source is more within our own control than is generally supposed. Owing partly to a failure in last year's opium crop, our expectations as to the estimates have been more than justified; and what is perhaps of greater importance, there is evidence in the present Budget that the Financial Department are awakening to the practicability of doing away with much of the uncertainty which ordinarily attaches to this item of revenue. By fixing the number of chests to be sold nearly two years in anticipation and by forming an opium reserve, so that the quantity sold from year to year may not be dependent on the success or failure of any particular crop, the main disturbing elements in estimating the price will in future be removed. If, in addition to these measures, Sir R. Temple would condescend to set off the surplus receipts of one year against the deficit of the next, opium might easily be made as stable as any other item in the Budget. It was in 1866, we believe, that Mr. Massey declared of opium that "though a great irregular source of income, it was one capable of being calculated upon data which yield an average income in a series of years."

That the opium estimate has again been placed at too low a figure, we have no hesitation whatever in saying. Looking at the short crop of last year and the consequently limited sales of the present, and taking also into consideration the fact that the number of chests advertised for sale in 1873 is somewhat below the average of past years, our opinion is that if present prices are not maintained, they will not very materially recede. Under any circumstances, Sir Richard would have been fully justified in assuming the average of the past four years, which would give some Rs. 75 a chest more than the figure at which he has put it.

In that case of course there would have been no necessity to retain the income-tax. Such, however, is the obstinacy of the present Government that, while driven to adopt a very different tone than heretofore, it refuses to recede from the position it has taken up on this question. Though defeated, it will not yield; and a case therefore had to be made out for the continuance of a hated impost which has done, and is doing, more to alienate the good-will of the people than the bare-faced spoliation of the most rapacious Oriental despot.

It is sincerely to be hoped for the credit of his own reputation that Sir Richard's claim to be considered a master of finance will not rest upon his "explanation of the cash balances." Anything more weak and pitiable we scarcely recollect ever to have read. That twenty-four millions are not lying idle so far as the tax-payers are concerned, because the Presidency Banks have the use of a great part of the money, is a proposition so ludicrous upon the face of it that no one but Sir Richard, we will venture to say, could ever have been guilty of it. But it is only of a piece with the rest of his "explanation" on this subject. It was generally thought that the year began with a somewhat larger cash balance than was absolutely necessary; and Sir Richard actually takes pride in reminding us that the only answer he could make to the criticism of the Council on this point was his assurance "that the present amount of cash balances is not otherwise than satisfactory." With an estimated cash balance at the close of 1872-73 of 17½ millions—an estimate which is just as likely to be 7 millions below the mark as last year—Sir Richard can only again repeat his assurance that "the amount will be found satisfactorily high, though not too high."

On this subject, however, we do think some allowance should be made for Sir Richard's position. It is sufficiently evident that though Finance Minister in *India*, he is not his own master. If he might, he doubtless "could a tale unfold whose lightest word would harrow up the soul." But, like the ghost in *Hamlet*, he is probably forbidden to tell the secrets of his prison-house. And so the Secretary of State and Mr. Seccombe may go on spending and borrowing, borrowing and spending again, without any financial explanation or check whatever. There is internal evidence in his Statement that even Sir Richard chafes under his fetters, but he is getting used to them, and the gilt is not yet worn off.

Sir R. Temple is very anxious about our exports. As our readers are aware, the Secretary of State draws on this country for some 13 millions annually to defray home charges and guaranteed railway interest. "If the country is to continue satisfactorily to bear these annual drawings of money by England, she must look more and more to disposing of her products to other nations, and to

obtaining thereby the resources which can alone enable her to make the annual payments in England without monetary or other derangement within her own limits." Unfortunately there is only too much truth in this statement. These annual drawings may be said to represent to a large extent the penalty which India has to pay for a foreign administration. Not that India does not get its *quid pro quo* for much, if not all of this amount. A large portion of the 13 millions goes to defray interest on the capital which England has lent to this country, much of which, such as that invested in railways and canals, is directly reproductive in India, while even the Home administrative charges may be said to yield an indirect return in the establishment of peace, security, and good government. But the fact remains the same that India has to make an annual payment to England either in specie or in produce, of some 12 or 13 millions yearly. As this country does not yield the precious metals, it is of course to its advantage that this large tribute should be defrayed in produce, and the result is that our exports must always largely exceed our imports, even including imports of treasure. In other words, India's importing power is diminished to the extent of the annual payments made in England. As Sir R. Temple says, this is "a politico-economic fact of some gravity," which could only be very inadequately treated in this place. Sir R. Temple glanced at its bearing upon the question of exchange, but the extent to which it affects the trade and industry of the country generally is one of those huge problems which can hardly be satisfactorily explained in a bare financial statement.

---



## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

*Kámrupa Kámalatá.* By Ráj Krishna A'dhya. Madhukari Press. Bhátpáda : Sahábdá; 1793.

THE Rev. Mr. Long, in his reply to the address given him recently by the Family Literary Club, said that the Bengali language was "happily dropping the old Sanskrit style, and assuming a nervous idiomatic form." It may be so in certain instances, but the little book before us has all the worst faults of the "old Sanskrit style." It is Bengáli Johnsonese run mad. We tried to read the preface which is just one page long, but before we had gone through half of it we met with such a multitudinous host of sesquipedalian words that we gave up the attempt as hopeless. We are, therefore, not in a position to give to the reader any account of the work of this literary Bombastes Furioso.

*Kavitá-Kalápa.* Part I. By Káli Charan Adhikári. Tamohara Press. Serampore : B.E. 1278.

THIS is intended to be a Poetical Reader for Bengáli children. The subjects treated of are God, the glory of God, pride, summer, winter, infancy, happiness, youth, and the like.

*Bámáráchanávali.* Part I. J. G. Chatterjea and Co's Press. Calcutta : 1872.

THIS is a neatly got-up volume, published under the auspices of the *Bámábodhini Sabhá*, and consists of essays said to have been written by Bengáli ladies. We do not know whether they have been written by Bengáli ladies or not—and the Editor of the volume himself is not sure of the authorship of some of them; but if they are the genuine and unassisted compositions of Bengáli ladies, they must be acknowledged to be performances of great merit. By the way, why call them "Female Compositions?" We are not aware that compositions are distinguishable as to sex, and do not talk of "male compositions" and "female compositions." The book consists of six chapters: the first treats of social reform; the second, of the education of women; the third, of morals and religion; the fourth, of meditation and prayer; the fifth, of Nature in its various aspects; and the sixth is a chapter of miscellaneous matter.

*Kusuma-Máliká.* A Poem written by a Hindú lady. Edited by Jogendra Náth Bandyopádhyaýa, B.A. New Bháráta Press Calcutta.

THE Editor informs us in the preface that these short poems are the genuine productions of a respectable Hindú widow of eighteen years of age, that she set her face against their publication, and that it was with considerable difficulty and after repeated solicitations that he procured copies of the poems which he now gives to the world. If this statement be true—and we have no reason to doubt it—education must have made remarkable progress amongst Bengáli women. As the unaided compositions of a Bengáli lady only eighteen years old, they may be truly pronounced marvellous. Some of the subjects treated are as follows:—"The Lament of a bereaved Mother;" "the beauty of Nature;" "Spring;" the Garden of Society;" "Liberty;" "Verses to Lord Mayo on the occasion of His Excellency's presiding at the distribution of prizes at the Bethune School." The versification is in general good, and there is no little delicacy of sentiment. We shall be happy to meet the fair poet again.

*Dhruva-Charitra.* A drama. By Nimái Chánd Sila. Calcutta: Columbian Press. B.E. 1278.

BABU NIMAI CHAND SILA is favourably known as a Bengáli writer of considerable powers. His contributions to the literature of his country have been, for the most part, in the form of dramas, one of which, the *Chandrávati*, gave us great pleasure in its perusal some time since; and though we do not regard him as either the Sophocles or the Shakspeare of Bengal, we are decidedly of opinion that his dramatic writings are a great deal better, both as regards their literary merits and their tendency, than most of those *náta*kas or dramas which are every week issuing from the Bengáli press. While most of the Bengáli dramas of the day contain a deal of prurient and filthy matter, the plays of Bábu Nimái Chánd Sila are, from an ethical point of view, wholly unexceptionable.

The drama before us is founded on the mythical story of Dhruva as related in the Puránas, though the author has added incidents which have no place in those sacred writings. The story is simple enough. Uttánapáda, the king of Prayága, had two wives, the elder of whom was named Suniti, and the younger Suruchi. The king, as is generally the case, was more fond of the younger than of the elder queen. The play opens with preparations for the public acknowledgment of Dhruva, the son of Suniti, as the rightful heir to the throne. The two queens seem to have been always on the best terms, till the seeds of jealousy

were sown in the mind of the younger queen by Hemanti, her waiting-maid. The uxorious king was easily persuaded by the contrivances of the waiting-maid to suspect the chastity of his first queen, in consequence of which Dhruva voluntarily went into exile. The play ends with the discovery of the wicked machinations of Hemanti, the vindication of the honour of the elder queen, and the installation of Dhruva.

Though the writer does not display extraordinary power in describing the play of passion, he shows considerable skill in drawing characters. The most vigorously drawn character in the whole play is Hemanti, and next to that perhaps is Suniti. The king, like most oriental monarchs under the influence of women, is an old fool; while the younger queen, whom the reader at first takes to be an excellent person, is suddenly changed into an intriguing and treacherous woman,—the steps through which she is eventually led into villainy not being well traced by the writer. The contrivance made use of by Hemanti to impose upon the simple Rasamaya seems to us somewhat clumsy and improbable. We cannot understand why Rasamaya could not discover from her voice that it was Hemanti that was speaking to him in the garden, and not the first queen. But notwithstanding these blemishes, we regard the *Dhruva Charitra* as a drama of considerable merit, and have no doubt that it will add to the reputation of Bábu Nimái Chánd Sila.

---

*Journal of Travels in India.* By Ardaseer Framjee Moos. Vol. I. Bombay: Education Society's Press, 1871.

EIGHT years ago a small party consisting of five Pársi gentlemen, one Máhrátá, and one European, left Bombay with the intention of travelling all over India. They crossed the peninsula through the territories of the Nizám, and went to Madras; from Madras they steamed up the Bay of Bengal, and came to Calcutta; from Calcutta they went up as far as Dehli; from Dehli they returned to their island-home through the dominions of the Maharájás Sindia and Holkár. The Máhrátá gentleman of the party was the well-known Dr. Bhau Dáji, one of the best antiquarians in the country; amongst the five Pársi gentlemen were two members of the Cama family, and Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos, formerly Assistant-Professor in the Elphinstone College, Bombay; and the European gentleman who accompanied the party was engaged by Dr. Bhau Dáji chiefly for the purpose of making drawings of natural views. An account of what this party saw, in the course of their wanderings, is given by Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos in the book before us; which we have no hesitation in characterising as one of the most beautiful volumes that has ever issued from the Indian press.



The book is written in the Gujaráti language, or rather in that dialect of the Gujaráti which is spoken by the Pársis, and which is usually called Pársi-Gujaráti. The Gujaráti, like the Bengáli, is a Sanskrit-derived language; and, in its pure form, is spoken by all the Hindus of Sauráshtra as distinguished from Maháráshtra. The disciples of Zordusht, after they had settled in India, adopted the language of the land of their exile, and naturally introduced into it many words from the Old Persian which was their mother-tongue. Mr. Ardaseer is a practised writer, and the style of the book before us, so far as we can judge, is elegant and sometimes rises to eloquence. The narrative is well written; the descriptions of scenery, of men and of manners, are graphic; and the work is throughout pervaded by a sense of hearty appreciation of the benefits of British rule. A few passages have been translated, by the author himself, into English, chiefly with a view to give an idea of the contents of the work to His Royal Highness the Duke of Edinburgh, who graciously allowed it to be dedicated to him.

But the chief attractions of the book are the numerous illustrations in chromo-lithography with which it is enriched. Of these there are no less than sixty-seven, consisting chiefly of views of the principal buildings of Lucknow, Agra, and Delhi. Of the Táj Mahal itself, and of the appurtenances thereof, there are ten illustrations. Of Calcutta and of its buildings the book contains eight views, namely, of the Bank of Bengal, of Fort William, of the Gateway of Government House, of Lord Hardinge's Monument, of the Ochterlony Monument, of Prinsep's Ghát, of the Pagoda and Refreshment Rooms of the Eden Gardens. Besides the chromo-lithographs, the book contains a photograph of H.R.H. the Duke of Edinburgh, and an excellent map of India showing the route of our travellers. As to the "getting up," the volume before us may be regarded as the "beauty" of the Indian press; the Calcutta Press has issued nothing equal to it. We congratulate Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos on having written one of the best books ever written by a native of India.

---

*Mahábháratam-Adiparva; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha.* Translated into Bengáli prose by Jagan Mohan Tarkálankára. Calcutta. Kávyá Prakásh Press. B.E. 1277.

*Mahábháratam-Adiparva; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha.* Translated into Bengáli prose. Edited by Sasi-bhusan Chattopádhyáya. Serampore. Alfred Press. Sak. 1792.

**A**LTHOUGH the vernacular press has now been in active work for about eighty years, we believe this is the first time

that our Indian Pandits have applied themselves to the translation and publication of their great Épic in the tongue understood of the people. We regard these works with interest and satisfaction, not so much for the critical acumen displayed by the editors as for the cheapness of their productions, which bring portions of the great national poem within the reach of almost all classes.

Of these two editions, we much prefer that of Pandit Jagan Mohan ; his clear, chaste, and easy Bengáli is far more acceptable than the highly Sanskritised Bengáli of the Serampore editor. To those who are entrusted with the task of carrying out the recent order of the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal about the exclusion from our schools of "bastardised Bengáli," we would venture to suggest that a comparison of the styles of these two books would help them much in forming a sort of standard for their operations. It is impossible, we believe, that Mr. Campbell should persist in his endeavour to arrest the enrichment of the Bengáli from the Sanskrit by the adoption or coinage of scientific terms ; moreover the former language has now passed the stage at which it might be possible to degrade its form and idiom as spoken and written by scholars to the level of even the colloquial language, still less to that of the jargon spoken by "coolies in the streets." But we are inclined to agree with the notion which we believe is at the bottom of Mr. Campbell's somewhat exaggerated orders ; viz., that for ordinary literary purposes, and in most writing other than scientific, there is already in existence a vocabulary purely Bengáli, which it is unwise to "doctor" by an *unnecessary* addition of Sanskrit forms. Such "doctoring" has a very disagreeable and bombastic effect, which is well exemplified by this work of Pandit Sasibhusan.

---

*Meghadúta Kāvya ; by Kálidása.* Translated into Bengáli prose by Nílmani Nandí. Calcutta. New Indian Press. B.E. 1278.

WE are glad to welcome pleasing and elegant Bengáli translations of the masterpieces of Sanskrit literature ; but the translation before us is neither pleasing nor elegant. Several qualifications are needed to make a good translator ; amongst others, good taste and a familiar acquaintance with both the languages concerned ; and none of these are conspicuous in the present case.

---

*Éka ghañtá kála mátra ekubá ámake dekhun.* By Singher Máma Babbal Dás. Calcutta : Girisha Vidyáratna Press. October, 1871.

THIS small book, with a very funny title,\* is a discourse on various common-place topics of philosophy and criticism.

---

\* *Look at me once for an hour only.*



## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### I. VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

*Kámrupa Kámalatá.* By Ráj Krishna A'dhya. Madhukari Press. Bhátpáda : Sahábdá; 1793.

THE Rev. Mr. Long, in his reply to the address given him recently by the Family Literary Club, said that the Bengali language was "happily dropping the old Sanskrit style, and assuming a nervous idiomatic form." It may be so in certain instances, but the little book before us has all the worst faults of the "old Sanskrit style." It is Bengáli Johnsonese run mad. We tried to read the preface which is just one page long, but before we had gone through half of it we met with such a multitudinous host of sesquipedalian words that we gave up the attempt as hopeless. We are, therefore, not in a position to give to the reader any account of the work of this literary Bombastes Furioso.

*Kavitá-Kalápa.* Part I. By Káli Charan Adhikári. Tamohara Press. Serampore : B.E. 1278.

THIS is intended to be a Poetical Reader for Bengáli children. The subjects treated of are God, the glory of God, pride, summer, winter, infancy, happiness, youth, and the like.

*Bámárachanávali.* Part I. J. G. Chatterjea and Co's Press. Calcutta : 1872.

THIS is a neatly got-up volume, published under the auspices of the *Bámábodhini Sabhá*, and consists of essays said to have been written by Bengáli ladies. We do not know whether they have been written by Bengáli ladies or not—and the Editor of the volume himself is not sure of the authorship of some of them ; but if they are the genuine and unassisted compositions of Bengáli ladies, they must be acknowledged to be performances of great merit. By the way, why call them "Female Compositions ?" We are not aware that compositions are distinguishable as to sex, and do not talk of "male compositions" and "female compositions." The book consists of six chapters : the first treats of social reform ; the second, of the education of women ; the third, of morals and religion ; the fourth, of meditation and prayer ; the fifth, of Nature in its various aspects ; and the sixth is a chapter of miscellaneous matter.

*Kusuma-Máliká.* A Poem written by a Hindú lady. Edited by Jogendra Náth Bandyopádhyáya, B.A. New Bhárat Press Calcutta.

THE Editor informs us in the preface that these short poems are the genuine productions of a respectable Hindú widow of eighteen years of age, that she set her face against their publication, and that it was with considerable difficulty and after repeated solicitations that he procured copies of the poems which he now gives to the world. If this statement be true—and we have no reason to doubt it—education must have made remarkable progress amongst Bengáli women. As the unaided compositions of a Bengáli lady only eighteen years old, they may be truly pronounced marvellous. Some of the subjects treated are as follows:—"The Lament of a bereaved Mother;" "the beauty of Nature;" "Spring;" the Garden of Society;" "Liberty;" "Verses to Lord Mayo on the occasion of His Excellency's presiding at the distribution of prizes at the Bethune School." The versification is in general good, and there is no little delicacy of sentiment. We shall be happy to meet the fair poet again.

*Dhruva-Charitra.* A drama. By Nimái Chánd Sila. Calcutta: Columbian Press. B.E. 1278.

BABU NIMAI CHAND SILA is favourably known as a Bengáli writer of considerable powers. His contributions to the literature of his country have been, for the most part, in the form of dramas, one of which, the *Chandrávati*, gave us great pleasure in its perusal some time since; and though we do not regard him as either the Sophocles or the Shakspeare of Bengal, we are decidedly of opinion that his dramatic writings are a great deal better, both as regards their literary merits and their tendency, than most of those *ndákas* or dramas which are every week issuing from the Bengáli press. While most of the Bengáli dramas of the day contain a deal of prurient and filthy matter, the plays of Bábu Nimái Chánd Sila are, from an ethical point of view, wholly unexceptionable.

The drama before us is founded on the mythical story of Dhruva as related in the Puránas, though the author has added incidents which have no place in those sacred writings. The story is simple enough. Uttánapada, the king of Prayága, had two wives, the elder of whom was named Suniti, and the younger Suruchi. The king, as is generally the case, was more fond of the younger than of the elder queen. The play opens with preparations for the public acknowledgment of Dhruva, the son of Suniti, as the rightful heir to the throne. The two queens seem to have been always on the best terms, till the seeds of jealousy

were sown in the mind of the younger queen by Hemanti, her waiting-maid. The uxorious king was easily persuaded by the contrivances of the waiting-maid to suspect the chastity of his first queen, in consequence of which Dhruva voluntarily went into exile. The play ends with the discovery of the wicked machinations of Hemanti, the vindication of the honour of the elder queen, and the installation of Dhruva.

Though the writer does not display extraordinary power in describing the play of passion, he shows considerable skill in drawing characters. The most vigorously drawn character in the whole play is Hemanti, and next to that perhaps is Suniti. The king, like most oriental monarchs under the influence of women, is an old fool; while the younger queen, whom the reader at first takes to be an excellent person, is suddenly changed into an intriguing and treacherous woman,—the steps through which she is eventually led into villainy not being well traced by the writer. The contrivance made use of by Hemanti to impose upon the simple Rasamaya seems to us somewhat clumsy and improbable. We cannot understand why Rasamaya could not discover from her voice that it was Hemanti that was speaking to him in the garden, and not the first queen. But notwithstanding these blemishes, we regard the *Dhruva Charitra* as a drama of considerable merit, and have no doubt that it will add to the reputation of Bábu Nimái Chánd Sila.

---

*Journal of Travels in India.* By Ardaseer Framjee Moos. Vol. I. Bombay: Education Society's Press, 1871.

EIGHT years ago a small party consisting of five Pársi gentlemen, one Máhrátá, and one European, left Bombay with the intention of travelling all over India. They crossed the peninsula through the territories of the Nizám, and went to Madras; from Madras they steamed up the Bay of Bengal, and came to Calcutta; from Calcutta they went up as far as Dehli; from Dehli they returned to their island-home through the dominions of the Maharájas Siudia and Holkár. The Máhrátá gentleman of the party was the well-known Dr. Bhau Dáji, one of the best antiquarians in the country; amongst the five Pársi gentlemen were two members of the Cama family, and Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos, formerly Assistant-Professor in the Elphinstone College, Bombay; and the European gentleman who accompanied the party was engaged by Dr. Bhau Dáji chiefly for the purpose of making drawings of natural views. An account of what this party saw, in the course of their wanderings, is given by Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos in the book before us; which we have no hesitation in characterising as one of the most beautiful volumes that has ever issued from the Indian press.

The book is written in the Gujaráti language, or rather in that dialect of the Gujaráti which is spoken by the Pársis, and which is usually called Pársi-Gujaráti. The Gujaráti, like the Bengáli, is a Sanskrit-derived language; and, in its pure form, is spoken by all the Hindus of Sauráshtra as distinguished from Maháráshtra. The disciples of Zerdusht, after they had settled in India, adopted the language of the land of their exile, and naturally introduced into it many words from the Old Persian which was their mother-tongue. Mr. Ardaseer is a practised writer, and the style of the book before us, so far as we can judge, is elegant and sometimes rises to eloquence. The narrative is well written; the descriptions of scenery, of men and of manners, are graphic; and the work is throughout pervaded by a sense of hearty appreciation of the benefits of British rule. A few passages have been translated, by the author himself, into English, chiefly with a view to give an idea of the contents of the work to His Royal Highness the Duke of Edinburgh, who graciously allowed it to be dedicated to him.

But the chief attractions of the book are the numerous illustrations in chromo-lithography with which it is enriched. Of these there are no less than sixty-seven, consisting chiefly of views of the principal buildings of Lucknow, Agra, and Dehli. Of the Taj Mahal itself, and of the appurtenances thereof, there are ten illustrations. Of Calcutta and of its buildings the book contains eight views, namely, of the Bank of Bengal, of Fort William, of the Gateway of Government House, of Lord Hardinge's Monument, of the Ochterlony Monument, of Prinsep's Ghát, of the Pagoda and Refreshment Rooms of the Eden Gardens. Besides the chromo-lithographs, the book contains a photograph of H.R.H. the Duke of Edinburgh, and an excellent map of India showing the route of our travellers. As to the "getting up," the volume before us may be regarded as the "beauty" of the Indian press; the Calcutta Press has issued nothing equal to it. We congratulate Mr. Ardaseer Framjee Moos on having written one of the best books ever written by a native of India.

---

*Mahábháratam-Adiparva; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha.* Translated into Bengáli prose by Jagan Mohan Tarkálankára. Calcutta Kávyá Prakásh Press. B.E. 1277.

*Mahábháratam-Adiparva; Parts I. and II. With a commentary by Nílkantha.* Translated into Bengáli prose. Edited by Sasibhusan Chattopádhyáya. Serampore. Alfred Press. Sak. 1792.

**A**LTHOUGH the vernacular press has now been in active work for about eighty years, we believe this is the first time

that our Indian Pandits have applied themselves to the translation and publication of their great Epic in the tongue understood of the people. We regard these works with interest and satisfaction, not so much for the critical acumen displayed by the editors as for the cheapness of their productions, which bring portions of the great national poem within the reach of almost all classes.

Of these two editions, we much prefer that of Pandit Jagan Mohan; his clear, chaste, and easy Bengáli is far more acceptable than the highly Sanskritised Bengáli of the Serampore editor. To those who are entrusted with the task of carrying out the recent order of the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal about the exclusion from our schools of "bastardised Bengáli," we would venture to suggest that a comparison of the styles of these two books would help them much in forming a sort of standard for their operations. It is impossible, we believe, that Mr. Campbell should persist in his endeavour to arrest the enrichment of the Bengáli from the Sanskrit by the adoption or coinage of scientific terms; moreover the former language has now passed the stage at which it might be possible to degrade its form and idiom as spoken and written by scholars to the level of even the colloquial language, still less to that of the jargon spoken by "coolies in the streets." But we are inclined to agree with the notion which we believe is at the bottom of Mr. Campbell's somewhat exaggerated orders; viz., that for ordinary literary purposes, and in most writing other than scientific, there is already in existence a vocabulary purely Bengáli, which it is unwise to "doctor" by an *unnecessary* addition of Sanskrit forms. Such "doctoring" has a very disagreeable and bombastic effect, which is well exemplified by this work of Pandit Sasibhusan.

---

*Meghadúta Kāvya*; by *Kálidása*. Translated into Bengáli prose by Nílmáni Nandí. Calcutta. New Indian Press. B.E. 1278.

WE are glad to welcome pleasing and elegant Bengáli translations of the masterpieces of Sanskrit literature; but the translation before us is neither pleasing nor elegant. Several qualifications are needed to make a good translator; amongst others, good taste and a familiar acquaintance with both the languages concerned; and none of these are conspicuous in the present case.

---

*Éka ghañtá kála mátra ekabá ámáke dekhun*. By Singher Mámá Babbal Dás. Calcutta: Girisha Vidyáratna Press. October, 1871.

THIS small book, with a very funny title,\* is a discourse on various common-place topics of philosophy and criticism.

---

\* *Look at me once for an hour only.*



It may properly be called a controversial essay, refuting the opinions of, and attacking, a learned Bráhmán of Bhátparáh.

The author begins by ridiculing the Pantheism of the later Vedantists—the disciples of Saukarácháryya ; the main doctrine of which is that God is the *efficient* as well as the *material cause* of the universe ; or more clearly that everything that we see before us is only an emanation from a part of the Supreme Being, and corresponds with that part exactly in size, weight, colour, and smell. He then goes on to defend the doctrine of atoms, in answer to a pamphlet published about a year ago—"The *Paramánubád khandanam*," by the Pandit above mentioned, who had already sung his psœan, as if his arguments had been conclusive. Our author, in support of his defence, collects examples from many of the natural sciences (chemistry in particular), and amongst them, we select that of the "rye and the orange ;" the former of which, he says, is small, and the latter many times larger than the other. Whence comes this difference ? If both are capable of infinite divisibility, if the molecules of both are infinite, then the number of the molecules in both is of course equal, and the objects themselves, therefore, are equal in size and weight. But this is obviously not the fact ; and this difficulty, according to our author, can only be removed by accepting the atomic theory as true. The author then proceeds to a personal attack on the Pandit, who, we are now apprised, is a *Sabhá Pandit* in the court of the Rájá of Beñares. First of all, he directs our attention to his article in the *Education Gazette*, of the 18th Agraháyana, Sak. 1792, in which he criticised a small but elegant Sanskrit poem named *Kávyupetiká*. On examining this criticism, we find that the censure pronounced on him by our author, is but too well deserved. To criticise a poem, the first requisite is to understand it thoroughly ; but this article, in our opinion, only demonstrates the ignorance of the critic. Without dwelling any longer on this point, we pass on to what the author says on his *Life of the late Rájáh Rádhákantá Deb*, a small Sanskrit work of one hundred verses. "The style," says he, "is the worst possible. It is indeed, a great pity that so great and so distinguished a man as the Rájáh has for his biographer one who, apart from his poetry (for he has not a bit of it), has disgraced the harmonious Sanscrit language, with his broken metres and incorrect grammar. I say, 'apart from his poetry' for poetic genius is the reward of a virtuous former life. I need not tax the patience of my reader, with quoting long, faulty passages from this book, but at the same time I cannot refrain myself from exposing at least one line, which as it is taken at random, will, I hope, sufficiently show his power of drawing similes." In the eighth stanza, he says, "The Rájáh refrained himself from

"doing those deeds, which, though he liked to do, are denounced as impious by the Shástras, just as an old husband *shuns* a youthful wife." But surely everybody knows that an old man "dotes on his young wife." We have taken the trouble to translate so long a passage, just to show the strain in which our author attacks his opponent, and also to indicate our general concurrence with the judgment he has pronounced on the book.

The work under notice displays in an unfavourable light, the extent of erudition, as well as the good sense, of the Pandits of Lower Bengal. These gentlemen, instead of setting themselves to work in any way for the good of their country, either by improving the education of its masses, or reforming its antiquated and barbarous manners; instead of discovering by careful researches anything of the history, manners, or character of their Aryan ancestors; instead of assisting European scholars in their philological labours; instead of performing these their obvious functions, they are wasting their precious time and their more valuable brains in the discussion of vermiculate questions after the manner of schoolmen of the middle ages.

*Vasantasená.* A translation of the Sanskrit drama "*Mrichchhakatika*," By Madhu Sudan Váchaspati. Third edition. Calcutta:—Girisha Vidyaratna Press. 1871.

THE Sanskrit play *Mrichchhakatika* has long since been made familiar to English readers by the classical translation of Professor Wilson; that the Bengáli public, unacquainted with Sanskrit, should so long have been without a vernacular rendering, is somewhat surprising. Pandit Váchaspati has thrown his work into the form of a romance; and like Mr. Monier Williams in the *Sakuntalá*, he has rendered metre by metre, and prose by prose. The plot of this piece is too full of various incidents to admit of our giving more than a very slight outline of it. In Avanti (Ujjain) lived a very virtuous Bráhman named Chárudatta—a minister of the late king. His charity and generosity, running, as most virtues in India do, into extravagance, has left him almost a pauper; but he is still beloved, and held in high repute by the people. He cherishes a secret attachment to Vasantasená, a courtesan of great celebrity and prodigious ill-gotten wealth, and she too is privately in love with the Bráhman. One evening, the lovely *Hetavá* is pursued by the reprobate brother-in-law of the king, a bullying conceited fop called Samsthánaka, and his attendant parasite. In her attempt to escape from his coarse overtures, she takes refuge in the house of Chárudatta, and is horrified at his poverty, which she now learns for the first time. She is anxious to assist him in some delicate manner, and leaves with him a casket of jewels under pretext that she is afraid of

being robbed of them on her way home. The jewels are stolen from his house by a man who happens to be in love with Vasantasenā's maidservant, to whom he takes them the next day as a present. The maid of course recognises them, and informs the courtesan, who nobly forgives the robber, and further arranges his marriage with her Abigail. Meanwhile the profligate prince Samsthānaka, having an intrigue on hand, orders his carriage to come round and wait for him in the garden. But the coachman leaves it for a moment near Vasantasenā's door. She comes downstairs, intending to get into her carriage, which she had ordered, for the purpose of visiting her beloved Brāhman; and by mistake gets into that of the prince, and is driven to his garden. The prince is of course delighted at the *rencontre*, and again prefers his vile suit; but when it is obstinately refused, he gives vent to his rage, and strangles the lady, leaving her for dead in the garden. In the course of the underplot Chārudatta comes by, and being found by the police in the neighbourhood of the corpse, is hurried off to justice as the murderer. Samsthānaka is of course delighted to get rid of his rival; and in his capacity of chief magistrate condemns him to death; but his coachman, the only witness of the murder, denounces the prince. Chārudatta is, nevertheless, being led to execution: when the heroine, who has recovered the strangulation, and has revived, rushes in; and the case is thus cleared up, the prince exposed, and the lovers united. To add to the happiness of this loving couple, the reigning king is slain, and his throne seized by one Aryaka, who had formerly been under some obligations to Chārudatta, and who now as a token of his gratitude makes him prime-minister.

Vāchaspati undoubtedly deserves praise for the chaste and highly polished language in which he has translated the book; and for the variety, elegance, and harmony of his metre. True, the translation is a free one; but where he has ventured to make interpolations, the additions have tended rather to embellish and illustrate, than to destroy the beauty of the original. He has preferred to name his work from his heroine, after the manner of Kālidāsa and Śrīharsha; for, as he says in the preface, his countrymen seemed averse to the title of the original; and the change is in our opinion, certainly not for the worse.

---

## 2 GENERAL LITERATURE.

*La Langue et la littérature Hindoustanie en 1871 : Revue Annuelle.* Par M. GARCIN DE TASSY, Membre de l'Institut, Professeur à l'Ecole Speciale des Langues orientales vivantes. Paris, 1872.

A GREAT deal of attention has recently been given, both by the press and by the public at home, to the writings of M. Taine, a clever and observant Frenchman, who has given the world a very detailed account of English institutions, English manners and customs, and English literature, as they appear to an intelligent and cultivated foreigner. A somewhat similar interest attaches to the work now before us, though its scope is far more limited. The cultivation and the growth of native Indian literature are subjects on which it is especially advantageous to hear the opinions of foreigners, unbiassed either by home or by Indian prejudices; for we are too much accustomed to hear them discussed from a distinct platform, either English or Anglo-Indian. The typical Anglo-Indian is apt to look with a jealous and even a suspicious eye on all intellectual growth in this country; and often, in his heart of hearts, would fain devote the public money which is now squandered on colleges and schools, to the construction of a few more "palatial" barracks, or even to the multiplication of the *chaprâsis* of our district officers. On the other hand, the typical Englishman would often surrender the whole of our public works, or cut down the military expenditure mercilessly, in return for a single Sanskrit work edited by a native scholar. Undoubtedly public opinion in England, both in Parliament and out of it, lays far too much stress on the mere intellectual and moral improvement of India; whilst *en revanche* Indian statesmen themselves are often inclined to despise that side of the question altogether, and to look only to material considerations.

M. Garcin de Tassy is a Member of the Institute of France, and a *savant* and orientalist of no mean repute.\* His opinions therefore may fairly claim to be considered with respectful attention; though of course it must be remembered that they can only have been formed to a certain extent at second hand, and may consequently be taken *cum grano salis*. We believe, however, that if the salt of practical Indian experience be added to them out of a liberal and unprejudiced mind, many valuable suggestions may be evolved. We regret that we are unable, in this place, to do more than summarily review the leading points of the book.

---

\* M. de Tassy is the oldest Honorary Member of the Asiatic Society of Bengal. His reputation as an orientalist obtained for him that high honour nearly half-a-century ago, in 1825.

It is somewhat amusing to observe with what simplicity M. de Tassy takes all his gëese to be swans—all his correspondents and informants to be high authorities on Indian literary matters—burning with a disinterested desire to make known to him the real facts of every case as they are known in India. "Le Babu Keschab Chandar Sen" is not unnaturally accepted with effusion as an oracle. Colonel Nassau Lees is quoted incessantly ; and Captain Holroyd, late Director of Public Instruction in the Panjáb, is one of the most valued correspondents of the learned Frenchman. In mentioning, with some national pride, the fact that a prize has been offered for a Hindustáni translation of M. Guillemin's *Les cieux*, M. de Tassy naïvely calls the donor "Mr. le Poer Wynne, of Simla."

The first chapter of the *Revue* is mainly taken up with an argument which we fear would horrify the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal. Notwithstanding the recent abolition of Urdu in Bengal, M. de Tassy has the audacity to propose that Urdu be made the common language of India ; and this proposition he discusses at great length. He is for no half-measures. Mr. Campbell's edict against Urdu was not more imperious than the orders in its favour which M. de Tassy would like to see issued. Like Canute checking the waves, he would say to the other vernaculars "hitherto, but no further." He would make the Urdu the language of the courts, of the colleges and schools, of all Government publications. With regard to the last he adds with a simplicity which is almost touching—"Sans doute le gouvernement y consentirait volontiers"! Nay, even general Indian and Anglo-Indian literature should be in this language :—"Puis on tâcherait de déterminer les éditeurs des autres journaux et des revues à adopter la même langue, et on conviendrait de ne plus en publier dans aucune autre. Il devrait en être de même pour tous les livres." We commend the suggestion to the notice of the editors and writers of India ! M. de Tassy, moreover, does not leave us in any doubt as to the reality of the Urdu which he would impose upon us all.\* He regrets that a proposition has been made by one of his correspon-

\* M. Garcin de Tassy stigmatises the distinction between Hindustani and Urdu as a "classification de fantaisie" (*Revue*, p. 7) ; what would Mr. Campbell say to this ? Again, he speaks of Urdu as "la véritable langue usuelle du nord de l'Inde, et non en Hindi, dont l'usage est limité ; que d'ailleurs l'Urdu était susceptible d'assimilation, et qu'on pourrait ainsi y introduire des expressions empruntées à d'autres langues pour exprimer

des idées pour lesquelles les expressions propres y manquent encore." In another place he quotes with some vñction the opinion of the Rev. W. Brown Kerr of Bombay : "Je puis certainement porter témoignage de l'utilité très-étendue de l'urdu dans toutes les parties de l'Inde, car je l'ai presque parcourue entièrement, depuis le cap Comorin jusqu'aux Himalayas et des bouches du Gange à l'Indus."

dents, Ganpat Ram, to concede to the infirmities of some weaker brethren the use of the Nágari character; and he condemns another correspondent, Babu Nobin Chand Raí, who has a leaning towards Hindí (or for what the Babu, by "une classification de fantaisie," terms Hindústáni), declaring that Nobin Chand "est Hindou et croit agir pro aris et focis." He applauds another authority who cites "les savants indigènes" to prove that elegance of style in Urdu is impossible without a considerable admixture of Persian and Arabic; and for all scientific terms he would draw on the Arabic. He admits that the provincial vernaculars would be neglected; but he thinks that this would not be a matter for regret, since a great advantage would be gained—on pourrait étudier littérairement celles qui offrent des ouvrages originaux dignes d'intérêt.

M. de Tassy has been much exercised by Dr. Hunter's *Indian Musalmáns*, which he thus describes—"ouvrage très-hostile aux musulmans, et qui a été habilement et catégoriquement réfuté par le saïyid Ahmad Khan Bahadur"; and he devotes several pages to a defence of the injured Musalmáns, and to the old story of the *fatwáhs* and the explanations of *jihád*.

On the other hand, he notices with satisfaction the movement, originated by Dr. Hunter, for obtaining a uniform orthography of Indian proper names as written in the Roman character. He speaks of the Indian spelling as "la pierre d'achoppement des orientalistes, chacun d'eux voulant avoir son orthographe." He adds that the Government is not indifferent to the question, but intends to adopt an official orthography.

As might be expected from the nature of his subject, Bengal comes in for only a very small share of his attention. He gives critical notices of Persian, Urdu, and other works, published in the North-West Provinces, in the Panjáb, and in Bombay. He speaks with *empressement* of the zeal and ability with which the study of Arabic and that of Sanskrit are being pursued in the colleges and schools of India,—a movement which he compares to the Revival of Letters in Europe:—"De même qu'en Europe, à la Renaissance, on se mit à étudier avec ardeur le grec et le latin, ainsi agit-on maintenant dans l'Inde pour l'arabe et le sanscrit."

Reviews of many official blue-books, of the reports of the chief Indian missions, and of similar sources of information about the literary life of the country, form a large portion of a book which is very interesting, and well worthy of perusal as showing us "ourselves as others see us."

---

*Transactions of the Bengal Social Science Association, vol. V.*  
1871.

THE best of the papers in this volume of transactions is one on the drainage of Calcutta, by the Engineer of the Calcutta

Municipality. No one has a better claim to be heard on this subject than Mr. Clark, who has persistently advocated his drainage scheme through years of neglect and active opposition, and at last has his good fortune to show, by practical results, the immense of benefits the scheme which he proposed fifteen years ago.

The objects to be obtained are threefold :—

1st.—*Drainage of the subsoil.*

There are few large cities more urgently in need of subsoil drainage than Calcutta. Even during the drought of summer, water lies within eight feet of the surface, and during the rains within as many inches. The dampness of the lower floors of houses is of course due to water lying so near their foundations, and the comparative dryness of the subsoil during the hot weather is one of the chief reasons of the superior healthiness of Calcutta at that season. One of the immediate effects of the new drains is that water no longer lodges in the soil in the vicinity of the drains at a higher level than their invert, or some 8 or 10 feet lower than it would otherwise lie.

2nd.—*The removal of storm water.*

Mr. Clark estimates that when his drains are completed they will be able to carry off a rain-fall of about  $\frac{1}{4}$  of an inch per hour over the area of Calcutta. The great advantages of the speedy removal of storm water during the rainy season need no comment.

3rd.—*The speedy removal of sewage.*

If the new drains performed no other offices than the two noted above, they would be well worth all the money that has been, or is likely to be, spent upon them. They are intended, however, for a third purpose, *viz.*, the removal of the sewage of Calcutta; and it is here that the scheme has met with the most opposition. It is said that solid excreta must be excluded from them, or disease and death will result in a larger measure than prevails with all the abominations of open earthen sewers. The chief of the supporters of the dry-earth system is Dr. D. B. Smith, who would remove by train the one hundred tons of night-soil daily produced to the Piale River, 18 miles from Calcutta. He would take up four square miles of land at this place for agricultural purposes, and keep a permanent army of 500 coolies on the ground, whose duty it would be to mix the soil with dry earth, convert it into *poudrette* by means of mills, and then spread it over the fields.

The dry-earth system is no doubt in theory the best possible solution of the difficulty of the disposal of excreta; but except in the cases of hospitals, jails and barracks, where labour is cheap and well under command, it is next to impossible to carry it out. The difficulty of daily collecting from house to house much less than 100 tons of night-soil must be immense, and during the period of its transport beyond the limits of the town, it would be

much more liable than under-ground drains, to bring about the sickness which the system is supposed to avoid ; the conversion of the soil into poudrette, and its subsequent disposal, would be effectually put a stop to during the rains, and the cost of the whole would, we fear, greatly exceed Dr. Smith's modest estimate. We do not join in his sanguine expectation that after a time the profits of the cultivation of the land taken up under his system " would, several times over, cover the cost, not only of the extra establishment, but even of all the conservancy charges of Calcutta."

The system of water carriage of sewage is one of the simplest and the best ; one of the strongest points in its favour is that it leaves next to nothing to the will of the individual. Mr. Clark's drains have been planned on a scale sufficiently large to carry off the sub-soil-water and storm water, and are quite able also to dispose of the sewage of Calcutta if it be put into them, and they will carry it upwards of three miles out of Calcutta before putrefaction to any considerable extent has set in. Mr. Clark has arranged to keep his drains out of sight, and to substitute wide and pleasant foot-paths for deep stagnant ditches loaded with every conceivable form of abomination.

We wish that the rest of the papers in this volume approached the merits of that of Mr. Clark. The author of a paper on the examination of witnesses in Mofussil Courts undertakes to describe their sufferings in the cause of justice. He commences by informing as that " perjury is supposed to be a crime of not unfrequent occurrence in Bengal, and that even professional witnesses are supposed to be not very rare." We think that even less guarded language might have been safely used, and that the reluctance of natives to be examined as witnesses is due in a *very* small degree to " the opinion that the bare taking of the name of God, with a full knowledge of all the frailties of our nature, and with the possibility of making an untrue statement through defective memory or through confusion of ideas, is in itself a sinful act." Our author complains that in cases where parties to a suit are at issue upon a particular fact, judicial officers, relying to some extent on the demeanour of the witnesses, have been known to believe one statement, and disbelieve the other ; " what more," he asks, " can conduce to lessen the respect due to courts than to find one's sworn statements lightly estimated and wantonly disbelieved." This is very annoying no doubt ; but if A and B flatly contradict one another, the only alternative apparently possible for not believing one or the other, is to disbelieve both.

Should any native gentleman desire to fit himself " to carry a loaded palki at full speed " or " a bhisti's full water skin even for a short distance " we commend to his attention a paper on physical education.



The present volume of transactions for 1871 contains the accounts for 1870, and the report of the council for that year. The publication of the transactions for 1871 should have been delayed until the accounts of the past year and the council's report had been laid before the Society.

Under one of the Society's rules it is provided that quarterly meetings of the Association shall be held in the months of January, March, July, and November. We notice, however, that during the past year two meetings were held in February, one in March, and one in April. After this spasmodic effort the Society appears to have ceased, and only last month gave signs of vitality. The Council in its report for the year 1870 views the financial position of the Society as very satisfactory. In one aspect this is true no doubt; the Society is not in debt, simply because its expenditure is next to nothing; the subscriptions, however, appear to be very irregularly paid. During the year 1870, a sum of no less than Rs. 540 (representing 45 subscriptions) was written off as irrecoverable, and of Rs. 2,628, the subscriptions due for 1870, only Rs. 1,428 were collected at the close of the year; so that if the Society's rule No. 5 were strictly enforced, upwards of 45 per cent. of the members of the Association would be summarily expelled as defaulters. Why cannot the Honorary Joint-Secretaries farm the collections?

---

*Pickings from Old Indian Books.* Higginbotham & Co.  
Madras. 1872.

THE above is the title of the first of a series of volumes in course of publication by a member of an eminent firm in Madras. It consists of some fifty selections or extracts; the greater part of them from the Asiatic Journal between 1820 and 1840. They extend over a wide range of subjects—historical, geographical, and archæological; with here and there a stray anecdote or humorous incident interspersed. There is no sort of plan or arrangement in the work, which is rather analogous to a volume of selections from the Poets, into which a reader may dip at random, and read a piece here and a piece there—as a bee hovers among flowers, culling the sweets now of one flower now of another. There is no original matter in the book; so that the critical portion of our task in reviewing it, is confined to the question of the compiler's judgment in making his selections. With such a fund of material at his command, it would be curious if he failed to provide us with some agreeable reading; and indeed the book, though a small one, is very interesting throughout; by far the greater part of the reprinted extracts being adapted to the tastes of general readers, and a few only (such as an article on the Laws of the Hindús) of considerable interest to *savans* and *literati*.

The most interesting extracts are to be found among the descriptions of scenery. There is an account of some waterfalls at Gersuppah in the Western Ghâts in North Canara, by an eye-witness ; who is so impressed by the solemnity of the scene that he declares it to be equal if not superior in grandeur to the Falls of Niagara. There is not nearly the same extent of fall, nor the same volume of water as at the celebrated Horse Shoe Falls ; but the great merit of the Falls at Gersuppah is that an immense rush of water falls down a perpendicular rock into a seething crater in an unbroken torrent of nearly one thousand feet high. The writer describes minutely five separate falls. He and his party endeavoured to ascertain the depth of the crater, but without success ; he guessed it to be about 1,030 feet, making a mathematical calculation of the distance by the time it took for a coconut to fall to the bottom. The following note on the subject from Bowring's *Eastern Experiences* is so interesting that we give it in full :—

“The chasm forms a semi-circle of no very great width, notwithstanding its immense depth of 830 feet, down which pours the great Raja fall in one unbroken column. The\* height of the cataract was ascertained in a manner which evinced much ingenuity and daring. A party of officers of the Bombay navy contrived to fasten a rope to a tree on the further side of the chasm, and drawing it out on the Bombay side, launched on it a cradle, in which they placed themselves, and having hauled themselves out to the centre overhanging the abyss, they ascertained the depth of the fall by letting down a plumb line . . . Any-one with a strong head can sit on the edge of the abyss, letting his legs dangle over it, and then gaze down into the cauldron below ; but nervous people throw themselves at full length on the rock, and peep cautiously over the verge. The Bombay officers having fathomed the gulf, amused themselves by temporarily turning aside the stream above the Rover fall (a branch), and letting themselves down into the cup in to which it is precipitated, breaking fasted there. They left a modest record of their plucky feat in the visitors' book, with a sketch of their operations, which some subsequent visitor had the bad taste to mutilate and disfigure.”

There is a curious description of the cultivation of melons and cucumber in Kashmir. A great portion of the country consists of immense lakes, very full of weeds and aquatic plants. These are cut off about two feet under water, compressed together, and being sprinkled with a coating of earth are formed into floating beds about two yards wide, and varying in length. The beds are kept in their place by a couple of stakes driven through them, one at each end into the bottom, and are so arranged that a small boat may work its way between them. Upon these beds are erected at short intervals conical mounds of weeds two feet high with a hollow at the top containing soft earth from the bottom of

the lake, and in these the plants are placed. The beds so formed become very consistent, and will bear the weight of a man. The narrator informs us that the fruit thus grown rivals, if it does not surpass, any of European growth, while in traversing a tract of about fifty acres of these floating gardens of cucumbers and melons, he did not notice above half a dozen unhealthy plants.

Akbar is generally renowned as the best and greatest of the Mughul Rulers of India; and the following anecdote, which is quoted in this work, places him in a very creditable light as a man of high and liberal mind :—

“ Akbar Shah was very pious to his mother, his piety appearing in this particular, that when his mother was carried once in a palankeen betwixt Lahor and Agra, he, travelling with her, took the palankeen upon his own shoulders, commanding his greatest nobles to do the like, and so carried her over the river from one side to the other. And he never denied her anything that she demanded of him but this, that our Bible might be hung about an ass's neck, and beaten about the town of Agra; for that the Portugals, having taken a ship of theirs at sea, in which was found the Alcoran amongst the Moors, tied it about the neck of a dog, and beat the same dog about the town of Ormuz: but he denied her request, saying that if it were ill in the Portugals to do so to the Alcoran, it became not a king to requite ill with ill; for that the contempt of any religion was the contempt of God, and he would not be revenged on an innocent book.”

There is a very interesting account of the idol and car of Jagannāth at Púrf, written in the year 1822. The concourse of pilgrims from all parts of India is said to be so great, that there are nearly 4,000 families of cooks employed to prepare the food. The food when cooked is supposed to be sanctified by the idol, and is then distributed or sold. There is an important advantage in the matter of this food; after its sanctification, it is so holy that the touch of a Muhammadan or Christian does not pollute it.

There are three important idols; Jagannāth himself, his brother Balbhadra, and his sister Shubhadra. The great festival of the year (there being in all 12 festivals) is that of the Rath Jattrā; when the idols come out and are drawn on their cars or Rathes to Janakpūr, where the idol was originally formed. This journey occupies a fortnight; and during that period no food is cooked. The Rathes are very large, and covered with English woollens of the brightest colours, red and blue and green; they make new ones every year, the wood of the old ones being sold and carried away by pilgrims, and looked upon as sacred. The idol of Jagannāth is a mere shapeless mass of wood, with a couple of stumps for arms to which the priests sometimes affix golden hands: the reason for its deformity is told in the following legend :—

"Some thousands of years ago in the Sutyā Yuga Maharajah Indradyumna, of Oojein, in Malwa, applied to the celebrated manufacturer of Gods to make a new idol. This request was granted, on condition that the Maharajah should be very patient, and not interrupt the work, as it could never be completed if any attempt was made to see the process. This caution was not duly attended to. The prince endeavoured to see what progress had been made, and it became necessary that he should be satisfied with the imperfect image."

In the 15th Volume of the Asiatic Society's Researches, in a very elaborate and minute article on Orissa, is to be found a description of the origin of the Idol that seems far more probable. It runs thus :—

"The Maharajah above-mentioned having heard that Vishnu abode on the earth on the Nilachal or Utkala Desa, in the form of Nil Mudhava, set out with a large army for Orissa to perform Puja at the shrine. On reaching the spot he found the deity had disappeared. Being overwhelmed by grief he was blessed with a dream wherein it was revealed to him that the God would shortly reappear under a new Avatār of the Daru Brahm which would remain for all ages. Soon after this the Raja was informed that a Daru or log of the nim Tree was floating into Pooree; adorned with the conch shell, mace, lotus, and discus, several emblems of Vishnu. Transported with joy the pious prince ran to the sea shore, embraced the sacred log, which he was satisfied from the above symptoms must be a real form of Vishnu, and proceeded to deposit it with great ceremony in a consecrated enclosure. He then obtained the aid of the great architect of Gods, to arrange the image in its proper form. At the first blow of the sacred axe of the Hindu Vulcan, the log split of itself into the fourfold image or Chatur Murti. A little colouring only was necessary to complete them, and they then became recognized as Shri Krishna or Jagannāth distinguished by its black hue, Baldeo, a form of Siva, of a white colour, (this is Balbudra) Subhadra, the sister of these brothers, of the colour of saffron, and a round staff or pillar with the chakra (discus) impressed on either end."

The two accounts resemble each other in many particulars; but the latter one of the floating log is probably the correct one. The cars commonly seen in Bengal do not resemble the real one; inasmuch as they are painted and carved all over, and are used year after year, while at Púri new cars are made annually, and they are neither carved nor painted. The article closes with a vivid description of the misery and sufferings undergone by the pilgrims, who come from a long distance; their stock of money comes to an end; they can get no help, and a great many sicken and die on the road.

There are probably few points on which the vast majority of Englishmen, with the exception of those who go to India, are so

little informed as the doctrines and practice of the Muhammadan religion. The very name of Muhammad, in its corrupted form Mahound, was long considered in England as only slightly euphemistic for the devil; and his followers are supposed to be superstitious infidels. And yet their creed and tenets are founded to a great extent on the Jewish Law; and their customs are similar. For instance, when a Musalmán prays, he takes his shoes from off his feet, and bows himself with his face to the ground, as we read of Moses doing. There is a very interesting article comparing the systems of Moses, Manu, and Muhammad, the three great law-givers of the East. Each code has a large element of religious observances intermixed with secular laws. The germ of each is the belief in one omnipotent God. That the Hindús should have degenerated into such an extravagant polytheism as they did, is a matter of wonder; but the phenomenon, when looked into closely, is very similar to the falling away of the Israelites to the worship of Baal and Moloch and the host of heaven. The Bráhmans as a tribe set apart for the priesthood are exactly analogous to the Levites. Like them "they were made the hereditary conservators and expositors of the law; they were like them exempted from secular labours, and consecrated to letters; and they derived from the sacrificial rites a portion of their revenue; besides that they had separate habitations provided for them, and special sources of maintenance." Caste was not unknown among the Jews; but it was not carried to nearly such an extent as with the Hindús. This may be accounted for by the advanced state of civilisation of the Hindús at the time of Manu's Code; while the Jews under Moses were only shepherds and husbandmen.

We confidently hope that the series of which this volume is the inauguration, will be continued, and soon. There are many very interesting as well as instructive articles; and the books from which the selections are made have become so scarce as to be unattainable to the general reader; while the selections, varied as they are, deal with subjects in which all classes of readers may find both entertainment and information.

E. M.

---

*Twelfth Night. Being No. 1. of THE CHAMELEON, an Anglo-Indian periodical of light literature.* Edited by Phil Robinson. Allahabad. 1872.

THIS initial number represents a fairly promising attempt to meet an acknowledged want amongst Anglo-Indians—a magazine which shall be at once light and amusing in its style, and yet (Arabian bird?) essentially Indian. The Editor promises that *Twelfth Night* shall appear again, Chameleon-like, as *May-day* on the first of May; and again four months later as *Michaelmas*.

He tells us that sundry unforeseen circumstances, such as sicknesses and furloughs of pledged contributors, have conspired to make the first number not quite all that he had hoped ; and every Indian editor will be well able, we are sure, to sympathise with Mr. Robinson in his disappointment at an accident which must always be recurring in this country.

Like most collections of Indian papers, the *Chameleon* is very uneven in quality. The editor himself is already favourably known to most of us from the particularly agreeable and amusing trifles which he has frequently contributed to the *Pioneer* under the name of *The Ronin*, and which, collected under the title of *Nugæ Indicæ*, were reviewed in these pages last January. We have no hesitation in saying that if all the papers in *Twelfth Night* were equal in merit to those of Mr. Robinson, it would compare not unfavourably with the best London *Monthlies*. But it must be confessed that the impression created by the first article, *From Allahabad to Nynee Tal*, which is in Mr. Robinson's best style, is not kept up in the perusal of the other papers. In our notice of *Nugæ Indicæ*, we ventured to compare *The Ronin's* writings to those of A.K.H.B. in the *Recreations of a Country Parson* ; and the likeness, without a suspicion of servile imitation, is, we think, even more striking in this article. The characteristic feature of the style is a quiet, thoughtful, and withal humorous appreciation of, and interest in, common objects and every-day occurrences. Take, for a sample, the following description of a night-train stopping at an Indian Station ; the reality of the picture is charming :—

And now a station comes sliding along towards us, the train goes more slowly forward to meet it, the telegraph-posts pass in sober succession, the trees assume a vegetable aspect, and we are once more among our fellow-beings. There is the station-master with a blue paper in his hand ; the guard who, before you have gone a hundred miles, you will recognise at each station as an old friend ; the six natives who are always going to be left behind, or who think they are ; the *bhistie* offering water to those who don't want any, but deaf to the yells which issue from the darkness where the third-class carriages are standing. There is the station Babu, a thin, sharp-faced, under-sized being whose explanations drive distracted the sore-footed villager who has just tramped in, and wishes to take a ticket to some place at which the train does not stop ; and who bustles his wife—she looks like a great fly that some greater spider has swathed in web, or like the cocoon of some monster tissue-weaving caterpillar—hither and thither as if she were a bale of inferior piece-goods. But there is little time for delay. The blood of the iron-horse is up, and it is snorting to be off ; the whistle screams, and the engine as if it had taken fright, bolts, leaving the rustic with his chrysalis wife to explain to the Babu and to the *bhistie* the absurdity of rapid motion and the where-

abouts of the village whither he had hoped to travel. And so on through the dim night.

A somewhat gushing set of verses by "Aleph Cheem," entitled *Homeward Bound*, describes the half-regretful, half-hopeful feelings of an old military officer who is bidding adieu to India for ever, after a life of thirty years in the country. The sentiments are doting and lachrymose, but are sometimes not devoid of real feeling; and the verses are quite free from the vulgarity which disfigured some of the pieces in the same author's *Lays of Ind.*

A sprightly little drawing-room farce, or proverb, called *Paddle your own Canoe*, turns on the somewhat questionable susceptibility of a grass-widow at home, and the mutual jealousies of a highly respectable and proper couple (a moral stock-broker and a model wife) with whom she is living. The proverb might be acted in about ten minutes, and requires only four actors of very moderate histrionic capacity; we have no doubt it will be found useful as an interlude or an after-piece in many Indian drawing-room theatres.

Three or four *Nugæ Indicæ* are reprinted from the *Pioneer* "by request." Doubtless the most urgent request came from the printer. But we do not wish to be impertinently inquisitive; from whomsoever the request came, we are glad that it was made, for the pieces chosen for reprinting are capital, and will bear reading a second time. Amongst the other articles we may notice some anecdotes of murder, told by "Paul Benison" under the title of *Foul Play in the Jungles*, to illustrate the amiable qualities of the "mild Gentoo;" a somewhat horrible story called *Hatchet-heads of the Copper Age*, in which Mr. Robinson does not do himself justice; and several pieces of more or less indifferent poetry.

---

*Matheran Hill: Its People, Plants, and Animals.* By J. Y. Smith, M.D., Bombay Medical Staff. Edinburgh: Maclachlan and Stewart. 1871.

IN this little volume Dr. Smith has furnished the visitors of Matheran Hill with a very valuable and convenient little guide-book to most of the objects of scientific and general interest to be found there. Matheran is chiefly known to the inhabitants of "Duckland" as being a very convenient and pleasant retreat to which they may escape, for a day or a week or a month, from the monotony of the office and the vapour-bath condition of the climate in Bombay. Every one who has been there must have a delightful recollection of the romantic winding roads, of careering along them on the backs of *tatoos*, of visiting the various "points" from which magnificent views are to be obtained of the neighbouring plains and ghâts, and, generally speaking,

of enjoying that *otium cum* (or rather *sine*) *dignitate*, that feeling, delicious after hard work, of having nothing to do, and plenty of time and a very pleasant place to do it in.

Those who frequent this delightful hill paradise will find an additional source of enjoyment by taking with them a copy of Dr. Smith's work. In it the most prominent objects of scientific interest are described in a popular and interesting manner. We cannot criticise the work in detail, but the following may be taken as a specimen :—

“Three tribes, differing in their mode of life, and more or less in physical conformation and language, are met with on and around Matheran. They are called Dhangurs, Thákurs, and Kátkaris. Their number is not known with any precision ; but in the order named, they are roughly estimated as bearing the relative proportion of fifteen, fifty, and thirty-five in a hundred. The first are known to be scattered over the neighbouring country as far as Maoli to the north, and towards Sholápur and Sátára on the east and south, and they are believed to inhabit hilly regions at much greater distances ; the second extend towards Násik in one direction, and southwards by Oomburkhind ; while the third abound in most parts of the Tanna Collectorate, and on the gháts, where belts of the Khair tree grow.” The description which follows of the habits and character of these tribes is very interesting.

The third and fourth chapters, which are much the longest, are occupied with an account of the flora and fauna of the hill. These chapters will be highly interesting to readers who are or wish to be more or less acquainted with natural history. And if any one wishes really to enjoy a week or month at Matheran, we cannot do better than recommend him to obtain a copy of this book, and make himself acquainted by careful observation with all the species which are described in it.

---

*Ruins of the Nálanda Monasteries at Burgdon, Sub-division Bihár, Zillah Patna.* By A. M. Broadley, Esq., Assistant Magistrate and Collector, Patna. Calcutta : Bengal Secretariat Press, 1872.

THIS little pamphlet is the record of the execution and results of a most successful excavation amongst the ruins of Bihár, conducted by Mr. Broadley, apparently at his own cost, and under his sole direction. The enterprise, involving as it did the employment of no less than a thousand labourers, must have been one of considerable expense ; and its issue reflects the highest credit on the archæological zeal and ability of its projector. Only those who have been engaged in such excavations can fully appreciate the care and nicety which are required, in working with a large num-



ber of ignorant and careless workmen, in order fully to reap the scientific harvest of the results ; and Mr. Broadley's book shows us that his diligence in this respect has been equal to his public spirited industry. We trust that he will no longer be left unaided in these important investigations. The excavation of the whole of the Burgáon topes and ruins would doubtless add largely to our scanty knowledge of the early history of Bengal, and might throw floods of light on the art and skill of that obscure but most interesting period of Indian history, the later Buddhist times. Mr. Broadley expresses a hope that at some future day he may be in a position to undertake the exploration, not only of these ruins, but also of those of Chandimau, Jowaffar, Jagdispur, Tillareh, Hurgáon, Tetráwan, Ghosráwan, and Rájgir.\* We cordially echo this hope, which we are sure will be joined in by the whole antiquarian world of India. What the exploration of Burgáon may do for the later history of Buddhism, that may be fairly expected to be done for the earlier history by the investigation of the remains at Rájgir.

The Village of Burgáon lies exactly six miles south-west of Bihár, and seven miles north-east of Rájgir. Of this site Mr. Broadley says :—

By its position, by the comparison of distances, and by the aid of inscriptions, Burgáon has been identified beyond the possibility of a doubt, with that Vihára-grám on the outskirts of which, more than a thousand years ago, flourished the great Nálanda monastery, the most magnificent and the most celebrated seat of Buddhist learning in the world. When the caves and temples of Rájgir were abandoned to the ravages of decay, and when the followers of Tathágata forsook the mountain dwellings of their great teacher, the monastery of Nálanda arose in all its splendour on the banks of the lakes of Burgáon. Successive monarchs vied in its embellishment ; lofty pagodas were raised in all directions ; halls of disputation and schools of instruction were built between them ; shrines, temples, and topes were constructed on the side of every tank, and encircled the base of every tower ; and around the whole mass of religious edifices were grouped the four-storied dwellings of the preachers and teachers of Buddhism."

Mr. Broadley proceeds to tell us what is known of Burgáon from the writings of the two great Chinese Buddhist pilgrims—Fah-hian, who visited it in 415 A.D., and Hsien Tsang who came in 637 A.D. During the two centuries that intervened between these visits the gorgeous monastery appears to have arisen ; for Hsien Tsang describes it in all its splendour, whilst Fah-hian only speaks of a lofty tower commemorating the *nirvána* of Sariputra. The description of the later pilgrim is very detailed. Amongst other points, he mentions the fact that a certain king surrounded all the monasteries with a brick wall, and so brought them all into one

enclosure ; that he erected a lofty entrance gate ; that he opened separate halls for disputation, and divided the open space between the monasteries into eight courts. This open space has been laid bare by Mr. Broadley ; and it is most interesting to read that he has succeeded in distinctly tracing the eight courts referred to by Hiouen Tsang.

The site is now covered with a large number of mounds, some of enormous size ; the largest and most important being sixty feet in height, and more than a thousand feet in circumference. It is this mound which has been the especial object of Mr. Broadley's attention, and from which he has obtained the highly important antiquarian treasures here described. The mound concealed a magnificent temple, which has now been disentombed ; together with a vast mass of sculptured figures and *relievos*, inscribed slabs, and other relics of its past greatness. For a detailed description of the discoveries, including no less than seventy-one most interesting figures and inscriptions, we must refer our readers to Mr. Broadley's pamphlet. An appendix contains a facsimile of the most important inscription—that on the door of the excavated temple, together with a translation and notes by Bábú Rajendra Lál Mitra. This inscription is of the highest antiquarian and historical value ; for it promises to give us a starting-point for the chronology of the age of the Pála dynasty of Bengal, a period whose history has hitherto been involved in the utmost obscurity.

We heartily congratulate Mr. Broadley on the success which has attended this, we presume his first exploration. We shall look with interest for the results of similar further searches ; and we sincerely trust his laudable example will be largely followed by other district officers, who frequently have better opportunities than can fall to the lot of others, for prosecuting such enquiries.





THE

# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

VOLUME LV.  $\frac{No\ 416}{19}$

1872.

*No man who hath tasted learning but will confess the many ways of profiting by those who, not contented with stale receipts, are able to manage and set forth new positions to the world and were they but as the dust and cinders of our feet, so long as in that action they may yet serve to polish and brighten the armoury of truth even for that respect they were not utterly to be cast away. MILTON.*

CALCUTTA :

THOMAS S. SMITH, CITY PRESS, 12 BENTINCK STREET.

BOMBAY : MESSRS. THACKER, VINING & CO.

MADRAS : MESSRS. HIGGINBOTHAM & CO.

LONDON MESSRS. TRUBNER & CO., 8 AND 60 PATERNOSTER ROW.

AND TO BE HAD OF ALL BOOKSELLERS IN CALCUTTA.



# CALCUTTA REVIEW.

No. CX.

## CONTENTS.

	PAGE.
ART. I.—THE TERRITORIAL ARISTOCRACY OF BENGAL.	
No. III.—THE DINAGEPOOR RAJ ... ..	205
„ II.—A NATIVE STATESMAN.	
1.—Copies of official papers sent from India, touching the recent disturbances in Travancore. Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed, 6th August, 1859.	
2.—Selections from the Records of Travancore. Parts I., II., III., and IV. Printed at the instance of F. Maltby, Esq., British Resident in Travancore.	
3.—Reports on the Administration of Travancore. By Sir Mádhava Ráo—from 1861 to 1870. Printed at the Travancore Sirkar Press.	
4.—Indian Journals.	
5.—The “Travancore Gazette.”	
6.—Treaties, Engagements and Sunnuds. By C. C. Aitchison, B.C.S. ... ..	225
„ III.—BENOUDHA.—PART II. ... ..	264
„ IV.—SELECTIONS FROM INDIAN RECORDS.	
Selections from Unpublished Records of Government for the years 1748 to 1767 inclusive; relating mainly to the social condition of Bengal. With a Map of Calcutta in 1784. By the Rev. J. Long, Member of the Record Commission. Vol. I. Published under the sanction of the Government of India. Calcutta. Office of Superintendent of Government Printing, 1869 ... ..	275
„ V.—THE SECT OF “THE ASSASSINS.”—PART II. THE FATIMITE CALIPHS ... ..	283
„ VI.—THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.—PART III. (Conclusion) ... ..	314

## ART. VII.—INDEPENDENT SECTION.—

## SPELLING OF INDIAN NAMES

1.—Gazette of India, 1871, 1872.

2.—Supplement to the Glossary of Indian Terms.—A.—J.  
By Sir H. M. Elliot, K.C.B. 1844 ... 325

## „ VIII.—INDEPENDENT SECTION.—

OUR COMMERCIAL EXPLOITATION OF THE INDI-  
AN POPULATIONS—(1.) ITS STATICS ... 340

## „ IX.—THE HINDU CASTES

1.—Hindu Tribes and Castes as represented in Benares.  
By the Rev. M. A. Sherring, M.A., LL.B. Calcutta.  
Thacker and Spink. 1872.2.—Memoirs of the History, Folk Lore and distribution of  
the Races of the North-Western Provinces of India.  
By the late Sir H. M. Elliot, K.C.B. Edited by John  
Beames, M.R.A.S. Part I, castes and their sub-divi-  
sions. London. Triibner & Co. 1869 ...

## CRITICAL NOTICES—

## 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE :—

A New Series of Persian and Hindustani School Books.  
Published under the direction of Dr. S. W. Fallon, In-  
specter of Schools, Bihar, by Rái Sohan Lál, Head  
Master of the Patna Normal School ...Masnawí i Mihr i Haq, the Poetical works, by Rái Sohan  
Lál, Head Master of the Patna Normal School. Litho-  
graphed, 62pp, 8vo., 1872. Printed by Munshí Súrāj-  
mall, Patna ...

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE :—

A Report on the Expedition to Western Yunan via Bhamo.  
By John Anderson, M.D., Medical Officer and Naturalist  
to the Expedition. Calcutta : Office of the Superinten-  
dent of Government Printing. 1871 ... xviiIndia : or, certain moral and social questions connected  
with our Indian Empire. An Address by Richard Con-  
greve, M.A., M.R. C.P.L. ... xxiv1.—Mookerjee's Magazine (New Series), of Politics, So-  
ciology, Literature, Art, and Science ; including chiefly  
History and Antiquities, Geography and Travels, Biblio-  
graphy and Oriental Literature, Jurisprudence and Com-  
merce, &c. Edited by Sambhu Chandra Mukhopá-  
dhyáya. Calcutta. 1872.2.—The Bengal Magazine. Edited by the Rev. Lal Behari  
Day. Calcutta. 1872. ... xxviii

	Page.
1. Notes on Surveying. For the use of Schools. By J. Middleton Scott, M.A., C.E., Professor of Civil Engineering, Presidency College. Calcutta, 1872.	
2. Notes on Practical Geometry and the Construction of Scales. By J. Middleton Scott, M.A., C.E., Professor of Civil Engineering, Presidency College. Calcutta, 1872 ... ..	xxxiv
Criticisms of the Indian Journals on a Review of Baroda Affairs; with an Introduction, Notes, Correspondence, &c., thereon. By Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan. Bombay. 1872 ... ..	xxxvi
The Constitution of the East India Company. By Mancherjee M. Bhownagree. Bombay. 1872 ... ..	ib.
Life in India. A series of sketches showing something of the Anglo-Indian—the land he lives in—and the people among whom he lives. By Edward Braddon. London. 1872 ... ..	xxxvii





# THE CALCUTTA REVIEW.

---

N<sup>o</sup> CX.

---

## ART. I.—THE TERRITORIAL ARISTOCRACY OF BENGAL.

### NO. III.—THE DINAGEPOOR RAJ.\*

THE Bengal Collectorate of Dinagepoor preserves the name, and, to a certain extent, the boundaries of one of the great Hindoo estates which grew up amidst the disorders of the last century and a half of Mahomedan rule. In the Rajbarce at Dinagepoor still resides a representative of the family by whom the zemindaree was consolidated ; but the greater number of the Pergunnas over which his predecessors ruled, were sold within ten years of the Decennial Settlement of the revenues in 1790. Before beginning to sketch the rise and fall of the family, it will not be out of place to state briefly what is known of the earlier history of the district. Various legends connect with it, as with other parts of India, the stories of Ban Rija and his wars with Krishno, of the sage Valmikee and the protection he afforded to Ram's discarded wife, of Porosooriam, of Yuddhisthir, and of Vinot Raja, whose realm of Motsyo Desh, or the Land of the Fish, was separated from that of Bhogodotto by the river Korotoyo ; but it is not until the dynasty of the Pal Rajas that there is evidence of any foundation for the stories told.

The Pal Rajas were Princes of Gour ; but rather of the province than of the city which afterwards became its capital, and the ruins of which may be seen to this day. Gour is mentioned in an astronomical treatise, the Bihat Sanhita, of the sixth century after Christ, as part of one of the regions into which India was divided for scientific purposes, but the city was probably not built until the time of the Sen dynasty, which reigned immediately before the Mahomedan conquest. The Pal Rajas appear to have lived in different parts of the district of Dinagepoor, and what is now separated from it under the name of Bogra. The most westerly

---

\* As this is a signed article, the Indian proper names is preserved.—  
author's own method of spelling EDITOR.

point where traces are found of them is about a dozen miles south-west of the station of Dinagepoor, on the road to Maldah ; where the tank Mohipaldighee, the village of Mohipoor, and the Pergunna of Mohinogor, preserve the name of that Mohi Pal Raja who, according to an inscription found by Mr. Broadley at Nalanda, and translated by Baboo Rajendra Lala Mitra, was reigning A.D. 856. A pillar still standing on the borders of Dinagepoor and Bogra, bears an inscription to show that it was set up by the minister of Narayon Pal, who according to the Ayeen Akbaree reigned four generations before Mohi Pal. Another pillar, now in the Rajbaree, but brought originally from the ruins of Bannogor, sixteen miles to the south, records the dedication of a temple to Seeb by a prince of Gour, of the line of Kamboj in the year 888 (A.D. 831).<sup>\*</sup> The tribe of Kamboj is mentioned in the Ramayana, and classed with the Yavanas, Sakas, Pahlavas, and the like, and an inscription found at Monghyr† dated in the reign of Deb Pal, three generations before Narayan Pal, indicates Kamboj as the country from which the Pal race had come ; fair grounds for believing the prince of Gour of the race of Kamboj, to have been one of the same dynasty. In the Thana division of Badolgachee in Bogra the villagers point out the sites of the houses of Deb Pal, Mohi Pal, and Chondro Pal ; in that of Lal Bazar, those of Mohi Pal and Oosha Pal (who probably dug the tank called Ooshardighee near Potiram), Hoodom Pal, and other Rajas of the same name. A copper-plate found in Pergunna Sooltanpoor contains further mention of Pal princes, and there can be no reasonable doubt that during the ninth century, and probably for several generations before and after, they were powerful sovereigns in the province of Gour, that their dominions extended at least as far westward as Monghyr, and their fame as far as Benares. It may be that their reason for settling so far north of the Ganges, which was the great means of communication with Upper India, was that the country further south had not yet, by the subterraneous action which is still going on, risen sufficiently above the level of the water to afford a pleasant residence.

How long the Pals reigned there is no certain means of knowing ; but before the Mahomedan conquest, A.D. 1203, the Sen dynasty had supplanted them, and had made Gour the capital of its dominions. It may be that the Pals had retired before the Sens, and crossed the Korotoyo, retaining some power to the eastward of that river ; the writer of an article on Ancient Assam‡ was of opinion that they were reigning in Kamroop as late as A.D. 1175.

\* Translated by Baboo Rajendra Lala Mitra.

† As. Res. vol. i. p. 123.

‡ Calcutta Review, Aug. 1867.

According to Dr. Buchanan, the kingdom of which Gour was the capital, was in the time of the Sens divided into six provinces, the central one being Gour, surrounded by the other five, Barondro, Bonggo, Bagri, Rarhi, and Maithilo. Barondro, bounded by the Korotoyo on the east, and the Mohanondo on the west, extended northwards only as far as Dumdumma, on the river Poornabhoba, near Bannogor, before mentioned. As soon as the Mahomedans had made themselves masters of Gour, they established a frontier post at Dumdumma, and another at Ghoraghat, the latter to menace Kamroop, the former directed against some power, we know not what, in Dinagepoor. The Mahomedan remains at Dumdumma are numerous, showing the strength of the force that was kept there, and the length of time for which they occupied the post. A mosque there bears an inscription recording that it was built by one Zafar Khán Bahrám Itzin in the reign of Kai Káos Sha, in the year 697 Hijri (A.D. 1297).\*

At first the Mahomedan ruler in Gour was no more than the Viceroy of the Emperor at Delhi, but it was not long before the amount of power which he derived from the rule of so great and rich provinces, and the distance at which he found himself from the controlling authority, tempted him to assert his independence. Dr. Buchanan, who had access to a valuable manuscript in Poroowa, was of opinion that Ali-ud-deen, who reigned A.D. 1340—1342 † was the first Bengal Viceroy who refused tribute. In the time of his successor Shamsuddeen, the Emperor Firoz Sha marched upon Gour, and the rebellious Viceroy fell back upon Ghoraghat, but the Emperor came to some terms with him, and left him in the enjoyment of his post. During the time when the Viceroys were endeavouring to make themselves independent sovereigns in Bengal, their attention was principally turned towards the movements of the power in the west that they were setting at defiance, and they had the less leisure to bestow upon the Hindoo chiefs to the north of Dumdumma.

It is probable also that about this time the Ganges had already partially or wholly deserted its old channel under the walls of Gour; and Rajmahal, as being upon the bank of the main stream, was found a more convenient residence for the ruler of the province. A stretch of low country, and a line of swamps, to the northward and eastward of Gour, still show where the river originally flowed; and the site, chosen as being as it were an island of stiff clay, which amid the shifting mud and sand of the Gangetic plain, defied the action of the river, and also as being on the bank of the great stream which was the highway of the

\* Deciphered by Professor Blochmann.

† Elphinstoue.

country, was no longer a suitable one for a capital when that river deserted it. The Viceroy and the troops, when at Rajmahal, were separated from the district of Dinagepoor by the Ganges, and by a tract which is inundated for more than a third of the year, and Gonesh, Hakim of Dynwaj, whom the relaxed vigilance on the northern frontier had enabled to become a powerful chief, swooped down upon Gour, and slew Shekh Bodor Islam and his son Faiz Islam who, Buchanan says, refused to give him the compliment due to the rank he assumed, the meaning of which probably is, that Bodor Islam commanded the garrison of Gour, and endeavoured in vain to defend the city.

The name which Dr. Buchanan writes Dynwaj, probably from the Arabic or Persian manuscript at Poroowa, is undoubtedly the first part of the name Dinagepoor, which means the City of Dinaj. The name strictly belongs to the village upon the lands of which the Rajbaree is built, one of the six or seven which form the town of Dinagepoor; and Dinaj must have been the name of the person who with his family and adherents first cleared and occupied the land, according to a system of nomenclature applied to new settlements in the district to the present day. This is a far more likely origin of the name than the one usually accepted, which translates Dinagepoor "The City of the Poor."

The title "Hakim" is still commonly applied to zemindars by their ryots.

Upon the death of the Mahomedan nobles, intelligence was sent to Sultan Ibraheem at Rajmahal, by the saint Kootoob Sha, and he led a force against the Hindoo usurper. The narrative of subsequent events is extremely obscure. Ibraheem took up his position at a place called Satra, between the rivers Tangon and Poornabhoba, but whether there was any fighting or no is not clear. Then Gonesh made terms with Kootoob Sha, and made his son Godasou, or, as Elphinstone calls him, Jitmal, a Mahomedan under the name of Jalalooddeen. Next Jalalooddeen takes the government, and puts Ibraheem Sha, who may or may not be identical with Sultan Ibraheem, to death, and afterwards Gonesh deposes Jalalooddeen and keeps him in confinement for four years, when Jalalooddeen for a second time comes into power and reigns for seven years, during which he compels all the Hindoos of Dinagepoor to become Mahomedans, except such as escape by crossing the Korotoyo into Kamroop. There is an air of improbability about this account; perhaps the annalist is wrong in making Jalalooddeen a relation of Gonesh. Jalalooddeen was succeeded by his son Ahmed Sha, who was murdered about A.D. 1426,\* and if he was really of the

family of Gonesh, there was an end of it so far as regards the possession of Gour. Whether it retained any power in its original district of Dinagepoor is another question. Elphinstone, who derives his information principally from Ferishta, a Mahomedan writer who finished his history A.D. 1609, dates the raid of Gonesh, whom he calls Kâns or Kânis, in A.D. 1386; Mr. J. H. Ravenshaw, who when Collector of Maldah took a great deal of trouble in verifying the history of Gour from inscriptions, manuscripts, and other sources, puts it twenty-nine years later. Kootoob Sha, otherwise Noor Kootoob Alum, died A.D. 1424, and lies buried at Poroowa.

From the episode of Gonesh nothing more is known of the history of Dinagepoor, until the reign of Hosen Sha, or, to give him his full title, Ala-ud-dunya-waddin-Abul-Mozaffar-Husen-Sha, the Alauddin who dates his reign A.D. 1497—1521.\* Whatever may have been the Hindoo powers at this time, they found that Hosen Sha had a mind to keep them in order. Several of the roads he made for military purposes exist to this day, and retain the name of Nawabee-rasta. He is said to have conquered Odissa (not Orissa, but a country to the eastward of Dacca), Kamroop, and Kamcha; one of his roads leads from the neighbourhood of Gour towards Tajpoor, on the river Nagor, half way between Dinagepoor and Poorneah, where the East India Company maintained a military post in the last century, and where it is probable that the Mahomedans had a frontier force in Hosen Sha's time if not before. It is in this direction, at Hemtabad, twenty-five miles west from Dinagepoor, that the Hindoo and Mahomedan remains are to be seen, from which Buchanan came to the conclusion that one Mohesh Raja reigned here independently until conquered in the time of Hosen Sha, in which he was very probably correct, though there seem no grounds for his belief that this was the territory of Kamaca or Kamcha, conquered by that prince. It is more probable that the name refers to the temple of Kamikhya on the Nilachol, in Assam, the destruction of which by Moslem fanatics about this time is mentioned in the article on Ancient Assam already alluded to. A second road runs in the direction of Ghoraghat by which Kamroop was entered; and a third towards Dumdumina, which an inscription at Doholdighee shows to have been in A.D. 1512 under the command of a high officer, Vazir of Mozafarabad, and High Kotwal of Firozabad, otherwise Poroowa. Probably the post was strengthened by Hosen Sha as a menace to some power near Dinagepoor, perhaps a representative of the house of Gonesh. This Hosen Sha was

---

\* Elphinstone,

grandson of that Ibraheem Sha who was slain by Jalalooddeen as before narrated. The history of his military operations is somewhat obscure, but there are numerous indications that he found it necessary to show a strong front in the direction of Dinagepoor, as well as towards Kamroop on the other side of the Korotoyo. In subsequent reigns the Viceroys of Bengal were again more occupied with the course of events in Delhi than with their northern frontier, and in spite of the repressive measures which we presume were adopted by Hosen Sha, the Hindoo subjects of the empire, during the wars between Bengal and Delhi, which were not ended until the days of Akbar, found plenty of opportunity to make themselves wealthy and powerful.

Of the earliest history of the present Dinagepoor family there is no contemporary record, and it is necessary to trace the generations backwards from the latter half of the seventeenth century, at which time the state of affairs is well known, in order to fix the dates approximately. In A.D. 1600, Akbar divided the Empire into fifteen Soobas, and made his son Selim Soobadar of Bengal. The Sooba was divided into twenty-four Sarkars, and parts of six of these Sarkars fall within the limits of the district of Dinagepoor. About the time of Akbar's settlement there was at Dinagepoor, at the place from which Gonesh, less than two centuries before, derived his title, a man, possibly of the blood of Gonesh, in possession of a considerable part of what are now the districts of Dinagepoor and Maldah. Buchanan calls him Kasi, but, whether he is correct or not, the name is now utterly forgotten. His grave is shown at the door of the *mondeer* in the Rajbaree, and offerings of cloth, curds, rice, and plantains are regularly made upon it. His life is reputed to have been very holy, and he is spoken of as a Brahmocharee, Mohonto, or Gosain. It is said that the nucleus of his estate was certain land with which an image of Kalee, named Kalika, and worshipped to this day, was endowed; and that in addition to this he became possessed of an image of Krishno named Kaliya, endowed with the whole of the Sarkar, or Havelee, of Panjara. The estate of Dinagepore was frequently spoken of as Havelee Panjara, even when it included land in several other Sarkars. Had the estate really been a debuttar, or endowment of gods, Raja Radhanath would probably have brought the fact forward as an argument, when in A.D. 1798 he urged all in his power to prevent the sale of the land on which the Rajbaree and family temples stood; but he does not mention it, and it is probably a tradition of recent origin. It is much more probable that the estate dated from earlier times, possibly from those of Gonesh. The family tradition is that the Brahmocharee left the images of the gods, with their endowments, to his disciple, or *sisoo* Srinonto Dotto Choudharee, a

Kayasth householder who came originally from the east. The story told by Buchanan is that the Brahmocharee left a wife, who procured the reversion of the estates for a slave, through the influence of Srimonto Dotto, who was, he says, a deputy of the Kanoongo of Bengal, and who, after the death of the widow and her favourite, got the estates for himself. In the complete absence of all evidence, the family story may be accepted as the more probable of the two. Srimonto, sometimes called Srimonto Dotto, sometimes Srimonto Mitra Roy, had a son and a daughter, between whom he is said to have divided his estates equally, but, the son dying without issue, the whole came to Sookdeb Roy, the son of the daughter, who was married to one Horiram Ghos, a Koolin Kayasth. Horiram was descended from one Komol Nayan Ghos, a native of Koolai, in the Pergunna Monohorshahee in Burdwan, who was Dewan to the Zemindar of Khetlal. To Komol Nayan was born Jagada Nond, or Darikee Nond Ghos, who had several sons, one of whom, Nrisingho Ram, was the father of the aforesaid Horiram, who on marrying the daughter of Srimonto came to live at Dinagepoor, and gave up all share in his ancestral property in Burdwan. There are persons now living in Dinagepoor who claim to be descended from a brother of Sookdeb, named Bisonath, but this Bisonath does not seem to have inherited any part of the estate. Sookdeb's property as received from his grandfather Srimonto, may be roughly indicated as follows, according to the present Thana divisions of the districts. Including the whole of Thana Thakoorgaon in the north, the western boundary passes through Ranisonkoil, taking in Pergunna Borogaon, but excluding Kholora and Maldwar, and through Hemtabad, including Mohasoo, but not Tajpoor, nor any part of Thana Kaliyagunj except the northern corner which falls within Pergunna Bajitpoor. This line excludes the estates of Maldwar, Tajpoor, Horeepoor, and Chooramon, which were added to the Collectorate of Dinagepoor, A.D. 1793, but never formed any part of the zemindar's property. Passing southwards, the boundary takes in half of Thana Bongshiharee, and from Kordaho runs eastward, excluding Pergunna Kordaho, across the middle of Thana Gonggarampoor, through Patiram, excluding Pergunna Sontosh, and then finally turns northwards towards Thakoorgaon, including the whole of the Thanas Chintamon Rajarampoor, Peergunj, and Beergunj. The northern and central part of the estate was in Akbar's Sarkar Panjara, the western in Sarkar Tajpoor, and Bongshiharee and part of Gonggarampoor in Sarkar Jonotabad. Besides the lands within this boundary, much of the northern part of the district of Maldah, including the old city of that name, belonged to the estate.

In the time of Sookdeb, or of his father, the family of Khetlal



became extinct, and its estates were divided, seven-sixteenths coming to Sookdeb Roy, whose father and grandfather may have inherited the office of Dewan from their ancestor, and the remaining nine-sixteenths falling to another officer who founded the family of Bordonkootee or Idrakpoor, still in existence. The lands thus added to the estate are in Sarkar Ghoraghat and comprise the Thanas of Nowabgunj and Ghoraghat, and in Bogra the Thanas Khetlal, Sheebgunj, Panchbibe, Bodolgachee, and Adamdighee, and perhaps more. Buchanan says that Pergunna Khatta in Bodolgachee was conquered and divided by the Rajas of Nattore and Dinagepoor in Ramnath's time; and that Pergunna Khangor in Panchbibe was a joint acquisition with the Jahangirpoor family, in Ramnath's time; but Raja Gobindonath makes them part of Sookdeb's property. The zemindars of Dinagepoor and Idrakpoor, in place of dividing the lands, each retained a share in every village, which caused much inconvenience when in after days the one estate was under the Collectorate of Dinagepoor, while the other was under Rungpoor. Sookdeb Roy died A.D. 1677. It is said that the extent of his possessions induced the Mahomedans to bestow upon him the title of Raja but the sunud is no longer in existence. Nothing is known of his personal character, or of his history; he perpetuated his name by digging the tank of Sookhsagor, or the "Sea of Pleasure."

Of his three sons, Ram Deb died young, Joy Deb, of whom nothing is known beyond his name, reigned from A.D. 1677 to A.D. 1682, and was succeeded in that year by the youngest brother, Praunath Roy. There is in the Rajbaree a *sunnud*, not very clearly to be deciphered, granted by Ajeémooddeen Mahomed, in the reign of Alumgeer (A.D. 1658-1707) dated A.H. 1089 (A.D. 1679), recording the succession of somebody to certain property, of which part was in the Sarkars of Tajpoor and Ghoraghat. The name of Sookdeb Roy occurs, probably as the deceased owner.

All this time the Mahomedan Viceroys of Bengal were thinking far more of Delhi than of their Hindoo subjects. Soon after Selim the Soobadar had become emperor under the name of Jahangeer, one Osman revolted in Bengal, A.D. 1612. Twelve years later Shah Jahan by force of arms made himself master of Bengal, and in his turn was defeated by Mohabat Khan; next we find Mohabat Khan answering at Delhi to charges of oppression and embezzlement during his occupation of Bengal. In A.D. 1657, Shooja, the Viceroy, made an unsuccessful attempt upon the throne at Delhi, and soon afterwards a son of Aurungzeb or Alumgeer is found in alliance with him against his father. The result of this attitude towards Delhi, persisted in by successive Governors of Bengal, while they neglected entirely the internal administration of

their province, was similar to that which had followed from the like causes in the time of Gonesh, namely, the growth of a Hindoo power which would at last have taxed the resources of the Mahomedan Governor heavily had he attempted to break it down. No such attempt, however, was made, and so long as the Zemindar of Dinagepoor paid the Soobadar of Bengal a certain portion of the rents he received, he was allowed to rule without interference over near three quarters of a million of people. Such was the position in which Prannath found himself placed, by the death of his brother in A.D. 1682.

Prannath reigned for forty years, keeping great state and maintaining numerous followers. It is said that by force or fraud he incorporated all the small zemindarees in the neighbourhood with the Dinagepoor estate, and he really appears to have made some additions to the property. Raja Gobindanauth in A.D. 1837 gave the Collector a written statement in which the estate of Sookdeb Roy is distinguished from the additions made to it by Raja Prannath and his successor Ramnath; and as the greater part of it had long since been hopelessly alienated, he had no object in concealing the truth. From this it appears that the additions made by Prannath have been greatly exaggerated, and that the property inherited by Sookdeb was very much larger than is generally supposed, or than Buchanan, who wrote in 1808, was led to believe. Prannath added to the property, how we know not, the Pergunna Maligaon, forming the eastern half of Thana Bongshiharee, and Pergunna Ajhor in Maldah, adjoining the western part of Thana Gongarampoor, besides about twelve small portions of land, most of which were surrounded by the Dinagepoor property. To the last there remained more than a hundred independent talooks or mahals within the estate. If any property was won by the sword, it was by that of Prannath and not that of his successor, but how he got possession has long been forgotten, though tradition has it that he was most unscrupulous, and made a most unjust use of his strength. Buchanan is mistaken about the inscriptions which bring his reign down to A.D. 1733, nor is it known to what he alludes. Besides several grants of land, the inscription on the temple of Kantonogor proves that it was finished and dedicated by Ramnath A.D. 1723; and sunnuds granted by Nosoruddeen and Sarfaraz Khan, on behalf of the emperor Mahomed Jahan Shah Badshah Ghazee, dated 1136 Hijra, may be taken as conclusive proof of Prannath's death and Ramnath's succession before A.D. 1724. Family papers date Prannath's death in Phalgun 1129 Bengal Era (February—March 1723). He has commemorated his name in various parts of the district. Prannathpoor forms a considerable portion of the town of Dinagepoor; twelve miles south, the road to Moorshedabad passes along the

edge of Pransagor, an artificial piece of water, said by Buchanan to be 2,600 feet by 800. The name signifies "The Sea of Life," but also records that of the Raja who had it dug. The banks are now covered with dense jungle, but in Ramnath's time, there was a temple to Seeb here, which the Raja endowed with a grant of land. Twenty-four miles north of Dinagepoor, on the right of the road to Darjeeling, at Prannogor, is an embankment, originally quadrilateral, but the eastern side has been cut away by the Poornabhoba. The people say that it contains the ruins of the Raja's residence, but the area is covered with heavy jungle, and there are too many tigers about for an investigation on foot. I have repeatedly beaten through it with elephants without coming across any masonry, except a very small *thukoor baree*, in ruins. The temple which Prannath built at Kantonogor, twelve miles up the Darjeeling road, is a large and beautiful specimen of a nobo-rotno, ornamented all over with terracotta reliefs, a fitting monument of the Raja's magnificence and taste. It was not quite finished when he died, but was dedicated by his successor in the same year.

It was during the reign of Prannath that Meer Jaffir became Soobadar of Bengal, A.D. 1702. His predecessors had been occupied in other directions. In A.D. 1695 Shooba Singh, a zemindar in Burdwan, with some Orissa Afghans, plundered Hooghly, and held the right bank of the river from Orissa to Rajmahal, a clear indication of the weakness of the Soobadar. Meer Jaffir, however, bestowed some attention on the affairs of the province of which he was governor. In the time of Akbar, Todarmull had made a *khas* settlement with the ryots, but it is probable that for a long time collections of revenue had been made through the zemindars, and possibly the payments had become very irregular, when Meer Jaffir made a new settlement, dividing the province into *chuklas*,\* and succeeded in raising a yearly revenue of Rs. 142,00,000, Rs. 109,90,000 of which were sent to Delhi. Marshman says that the Hindoos who were appointed *chukladars* took to themselves the title of Raja, and claimed hereditary rights as zemindars. I think I have shown that Prannath's rights dated from a period anterior to his appointment of *chukladar*, which he obtained, as being obviously the proper person to collect the revenues of his estates.

Having no son, Prannath adopted as his heir a relative, named Ramnath, who paid a succession fee of Rs. 4,21,450 to the Soobadar. Ramnath is popularly believed to have been still more powerful than his predecessor, and still more unscrupulous in seizing upon the property of his neighbours. He is also believed to have

---

\* Marshman.

been a warrior of great personal prowess ; and until very lately his mail shirt and spear were shown at the Rajbaree. Buchanan was told that he and his great neighbour, the Raja of Nattore, were allies, and used to make war upon other zemindars and divide their property ; but very little reliance can be placed upon these traditions, and in some cases, as in that of Pergunna Apoil, Buchanan is quite mistaken. Gobindonath's statement before mentioned, records the accession of three properties to Ramnath, each by a sunnud from the Soobadar. One gave him the property of Krishno Chondro Roy who had died intestate, comprising the southern part of Thana Potiram, and the northern part of Potnitala ; the second gave him estates in Gongarampoor and in Maldah that had belonged to Kali Choron and others, and the third gave him Pergunna Kaligaon. Ramnath is said to have gone with Raja Man Singh to the court of Jahangeer, and to have received from him the title of Maharaja Bahadoor and license to make war upon his neighbours ; but as Jahangeer reigned only till A.D. 1627 there must be some mistake here. Ramnath is said to have conquered a zemindar at Gobindonogor, near Thana Thakoorgaon, having employed a Brahman, founder of the family of Horee Mohun Chokrobortee, to steal his protecting deity Chamondo, and rewarding the service by a grant of land. The Tangon shows signs of having once flowed under the walls of Gobindonogor, where the remains of the Raja's house are still standing ; and from a point on the opposite bank a canal, said to have been dug by Ramnath in order to float the idol backwards and forwards, connects the Tangon with the Poornobhoba at Prannogor. The canal is called a Ramdangra, a name also applied to the moat and rampart surrounding the Rajbaree, which was rebuilt by Ramnath, and by him adorned with doorways and other carvings said to have been brought from Bannogor, and dating from the period of the Pal Rajas. If tradition could be trusted, it was not without cause that the Rajbaree was fortified, as the absence of any early sunnuds is attributed to a raid of Syed Mahomed Khan, Nazim of Rungpore, who is said to have stormed and plundered the Rajbaree in Ramnath's time. From this Raja are named Ramnogor, a part of Dinagepoor, and Rajarampoor, a mile or two east of the palace, where he built a *mondeer* with images of Kalee and Seeb for Kriporamroy, whose daughter he had married. He also dug Ramsagor, an artificial piece of water five miles down the Moorshedabad road, where the ruins of his house remained until A.D. 1786 or A.D. 1787 (when the materials were carted away), and where some of the European officers have bungalows to which they occasionally resort in the hot weather. It was during the time of Ramnath that the House of Dinagepoor is popularly believed to have attained its greatest splendour.

It is probable that he took advantage of the troubles of the Mahomedans to spend more of his rents than he remitted to the Soobadar, for whom work was found elsewhere. The Mahrattas were forcing the Mahomedans everywhere to the wall, and in A.D. 1742 plundered Moorshedabad; and, when Ramnath died, A.D. 1760, the English had for four years been giving too much trouble to the followers of the Prophet, to leave them much leisure for auditing the accounts of the zemindar of Dinagepoor.

Ramnath married four wives, and by each of them he had a son and a daughter; this is said to be the reason why the figure 4 is marked on the doorposts of the Rajbaree. He was succeeded by his eldest son Boidyonath, who called himself, as did his successors in turn, Raja Roy Bahadoor. The other sons were Kantonath, Krishnonath, and Roopnath, each called Koomar Roy Bahadoor. Kantonath was jealous of his brother's succession to the whole of this splendid inheritance; and the belief in the family is that he went to Delhi, and there succeeded in procuring his own recognition as Ramnath's successor, and that while on his way back with the necessary authority to turn his brother out, he died at Kordaho, near Dumdumna, either by drowning, or by the fall of the ceiling of a room which he occupied in the Rajbaree there; but, whatever the circumstances of his death may have been, Boidyonath is believed to this day to have had a hand in it. The true worth of this tradition is easily ascertained. Raja Boidyonath died A.D. 1780, and in December 1787 Mr. Hatch, the Collector, reports to the Board of Revenue that Kantonath died at Kordaho on his return to Dinagepoor on the 16th November in that year. If tradition only eighty-five years old can attribute a man's murder to his brother who had died seven years before, we must not rely upon it for the history of events several centuries ago. As regards Kantonath's attempt to supplant his brother, there is extant a paper dated Magh 1170, Bengal style (A.D. 1763-4), under the signature of Mahomed Jafar Khan, declaring that in spite of the sunnud procured from Mahomed Kasim on false pretences by Kantonath and Roopnath, Boidyonath is the rightful successor to Ramnath's estates in Panjara and elsewhere. Kantonath's widow Podyomookhee, and her mourning for her husband, are still remembered. In September 1797, she conveyed all her property, consisting of *lakhmiraj* lands, and an income from Sayer compensation of Rs. 560, to the god Krishno, whose temple stands on the north of the Rajbaree. She lived, however, till 1804.

In addition to the property of Sookdeb, Boidyonath found himself master of the whole of Maldah between the Mahanondo and the Poornobhoba, except the Poroowa endowments. It is not quite clear to which of his predecessors he owed it; but some of it Sookdeb had held, Ajhor was certainly added by Raja

Prannath, and Shikarpoor was part of the property of Kalee Choron which came to Ramnath, who also became master of some property by arrangement with the Jahangeerpoo family, zemindars of the property now forming Thana Poorsha and the south of Thana Potnitala, and of lands beyond the southern border of Dinagepoor. I doubt whether Boidyonath added one acre to the property; but he and his predecessor alienated at least one-sixteenth of the revenues by the creation of brahmootro tenures and other endowments. The Raja is popularly believed to have been a quiet sort of man, not very strong-minded, in spite of the idea that he murdered his brother. That he had some taste for music is proved by the draft of a letter he wrote to Shyam Soondor, the Vakeel, whom, as became a great vassal, he kept at the court of Delhi, telling him to send him the celebrated musicians, Pon Khan and Mon Khan. There are several legends attaching to him, but they correspond better with the violent temper of his successor Raja Radhanath, than with the character ascribed to Boidyonath. They all illustrate the saying, "*Quem Deus vult perdere prius dementat*," and are quoted to show that it was the wrath of the gods that brought on the ruin of his house as a punishment for his impiety. They say that his maternal grandfather, Kriporam Roy, before mentioned as the worshipper of Kalee and Seeb, cursed him as being a Boistob or follower of Vishnoo, and made him childless. Another curse is said to have been bestowed upon him by the Brahman who served the shrine of Kalee Siddhes-horee at Bolotar near Rajarampoor, the curse of the downfall of his family, because the Raja charged the Brahman with drinking wine and eating the flesh of hogs. Moreover he was afflicted with the curse of leprosy for his lewd attempts on the virtue of the beautiful sister of Rajchondro Roy, his own sister's daughter. Perhaps these stories have no more foundation than that of his brother's murder. Some say it was Boidyonath who brought from Brindabon the image of Kantojee, now in the Kantonogor temple; he certainly built the residence adjoining it. Five years after Boidyonath's succession to the Raj, A.D. 1765, the English obtained the dewanship of Bengal, with the right of collecting the revenues, but it was not until 1772 or thereabouts that an English Collector, or Chief of the revenue, of the zemindaree of Dinagepoor was appointed; and it is probable that the increase of strictness with which the collections were made, was the true cause of the decline of the splendour in which the family had lived under its Mahomedan masters. The records of the Collector's office do not begin till 1786, but Mr. Marriott seems to have been the first Revenue Chief; in 1782 there was a Mr. Redfearn, and a Mr. Vansittart also

appears for a time to have held the office. In 1786 Mr. Hatch was appointed Collector ; and the Judgeship of Tajpoor being abolished, he was vested with judicial powers in Dinagepoor, to which was added Silberris, then a Collectorate, now forming the southern part of Bogra. Raja Boidyonath had died in 1780 leaving no son, but his widow Ranee Soroswotee adopted a boy three years old named Radhanath, son of a relation, Okol Norayan Roy ; and on the 31st July 1780, Mr. Warren Hastings, on the payment of a succession fee of seven hundred and thirty mohurs, signed the sunnud declaring Raja Radhanath the successor to Raja Boidyonath Bahadoor, and detailing the lands of which the estate was composed. Buchanan speaks of a brother of Boidyonath's, named Ram Kanto Roy ; but he probably confuses Koomar Kantonath with a person named Ram Kanto Roy of whom I shall speak presently. For the first two years after the death of Raja Boidyonath, the revenues of Dinagepoor were farmed by Raja Debee Singh of Dilaworpoor, who had also a farm of the Rungpoor revenues ; he paid more to Government than the estates ever produced before or since, but with such oppression and villany, that he and some of his people were degraded and kept in confinement until 1791, when sentence was given, directing certain refunds, the cancelment of some fraudulent purchases of land, and Debee Singh's perpetual banishment from the districts. His machinations in Rungpoor are called an insurrection, but we know not what they were. After the farm of Debee Singh the revenues were farmed by one Janokee Ram Singh, a brother of the Rance Soroswotee, at a net yearly rental of Rs. 12,75,968 ; but he does not appear to have understood the strictness of the English revenue system, and although he collected regularly enough from the ryots, his payments to the Collector fell considerably into arrear. He kept great state in the Rajbaree, and dug the tanks of Anondosagor and Matasagor and the canal connecting them. He came from Kotalpota, Pergunna Patoolce, in Burdwan.

When Mr. Hatch came, the officers of the zemindaree found that a firm hand held the reins. In November 1786, by the Board's orders, Janokee Ram was allowed three days to make good his balance ; the collections had all been placed in the hands of Sazawols, but with the understanding that Janokee should again be made manager if he paid up his balances. He tried to raise the money but in vain ; he attempted to swindle the bankers into lending him money on the security of collections which he had already made and expended, and at last, by the Board's orders, he was sent in charge of peons to the presidency. Thence he indited petition after petition, charging Mr. Hatch with various offences which were satisfactorily disproved, and he appears to have died in Calcutta about 1790. In June 1787

Ram Kanto Roy was installed as manager of the Dinagepoor estates, his cutcherry being a Government office and the Collector's servants attending daily to check the collections. Every detail of the management was supervised by Mr. Hatch, the estate being divided into sixty-four zillas, each under a tahsildar, who collected from Rs. 6,000 to Rs. 1,00,000, receiving a percentage, while each ryot's lands were measured, and he paid rent according to the quantity and quality of his land, irrespective of the crops grown.

The revenues of the estate were well managed, but it was long before the mischievous practices of Janokee Ram ceased to bear fruit. He had raised large sums of ready money by sub-letting lands at a low rent, and the annual income of the zemindar suffered accordingly until the Collector had re-settled all the tenures. In spite however of the good management, I believe that at this time the Raja's income was injured by the abolition of numerous illegal cesses, which had been collected by his predecessors, but which could not be brought under the denomination of the Sayer for the abolition of which compensation was given, and which nevertheless is collected to this day by the proprietors in the district, though Government no longer receives ten-elevenths of it. The cesses referred to are transit duties on salt and other goods, the right of seizing the property of intestate persons, and taxes on birdcatchers, tom-tom beaters, and dealers in intoxicating drugs and the like.

Ram Kanto Roy's father and-grandfather had been settled in Dinagepoor, but he was of a Burdwan family, being descended from Horee Narayan the brother of Horeeram, to whom the latter, on marrying Srimonto Dotto's daughter, had ceded his ancestral property. The descendant of his nephew, Baboo Radha Gobindo Roy, is now one of the wealthiest zemindars in Dinagepoor. Ram Kanto in 1793 bought the pergunna Ambaree, now in Dinagepoor, but then a portion of the estate of the Raja of Rajshahye, sold for arrears of revenue, like many others, soon after the Decennial Settlement. The Raja of Dinagepoor had bid up to Rs. 2,500 for it. Subsequently, during the Raja's difficulties, Ram Kanto Roy lent him large sums of money on mortgage, and so became the owner of property subsequently inherited by his nephew.

Irritated by the treatment of her brother Janokee Ram, Ranee Soroswotee maintained constantly an attitude of stubborn defiance towards the Government, Mr. Hatch, and Ram Kanto Roy. Her *koomar* lands, 11,843 bighas of the best cultivated land in the district, brought her in seventeen or eighteen thousand rupees annually, and she was under no necessity to submit and ask for a pension. She and one Mozoomdar buried the accounts of Janokee Ram's managership under ground ; she refused to give up the



late Raja's seal, and she kept young Radhanath from Ram Kanto Roy, who had been directed to superintend his education. The folly and extravagance which afterwards led to the young Raja's ruin may be attributed in great measure to the lessons learnt in the Ranee's apartments. She took advantage of the boy's being somewhat indisposed to obtain possession of his person, and then held him as a hostage, refusing to give him up until the resumed *moshakara* or allowance, as well as the sums which had been improperly alienated by the zemindar—such as a payment of Rs. 7,700 to Brahmans as *birt*, but which had on investigation been re-annexed to the revenue payable to Government—should be again allowed to her. Twenty years before a Burdwan Ranee, for similar contumacy, had been dealt with in a manner which afforded a precedent; and in July 1790, Ranee Soroswotee was removed from the Rajbaree, and sent to Gobindonogor, thirty-six miles off, where the family had a residence. She got as far as Kantonogor only and stayed there for two months, before going on to Gobindonogor, and in April of next year she was back in her old apartments at the Rajbaree, on the excuse that all the thatched sheds on the premises at Gobindonogor had been burnt down. In the mean time her *koomar* lands had been annexed to the family estate, and in lieu of them she was allowed a pension of fifteen hundred rupees a month; and as this was withheld until she complied with orders, Raja Boidyonath's seal, which had been affixed to documents in a most improper manner, was at last given up. She mortgaged her pension for some years to one Manockjee Parsee, probably for money to enable her worthless brother Janokee Ram to prosecute his charges against Mr. Hatch; and some of Raja Radhanath's expenditure may have been on the same account. The private resources of the family were heavily burdened for years for this cause, and I have been told that Raja Taroknath paid, as the last instalment of debts incurred on account of Janokee Ram, a lakh and a half of rupees. The Ranee's feelings of hostility against the British rule are pardonable. Her husband for twenty years reigned almost as an independent prince, and after his death, her brother Janokee Ram had maintained an equal state. Suddenly her brother was called upon to pay his revenue with a punctuality never known before, and on default was sent in custody to Calcutta, and she never saw him again. The collections of the estate were taken entirely out of the hands of the family, and even the expense of repairs of the Rajbaree, and the monthly wages of the servants, were defrayed by Government officers without reference to her wishes. The herd of buffaloes belonging to the Rajbaree was sent to the uncultivated part of the district as a public nuisance, and many of the consecrated cattle were sold. The Ranee was not even allowed to take care

of her adopted son, nine or ten years old, but he was made over for education to the manager, Ram Kanto Roy, for whom she had a strong personal aversion. At the same time the income of the zemindaree was being decreased by the abolition of all the illegal taxes and cesses which the Rajas had collected as long as she could remember, and by the determination of Government that the family charities were to be paid out of the privy purse and not out of the imperial revenue as heretofore. She was naturally in no temper to look on Mr. Hatch's reforms as beneficial, or to acquiesce in the action of Government.

In January 1792, Raja Radhanath commenced his sixteenth year and was placed in charge of his estates; Ram Kanto Roy submitted his accounts as manager, and the Board of Revenue expressed themselves highly pleased with his conduct. The Decennial Settlement had been concluded two years before, and the Raja was to pay a yearly revenue of Rs. 14,44,107 for the first two years, and then Rs. 14,84,107. This will give some idea of the extent of his estates, as the total land revenue of the present Collectorate of Dinagepoor is now under Rs. 18,00,000. For a year and more all went smoothly; but when, in March 1793, Mr. Hatch was promoted to a seat on the Board of Revenue, his successor, Mr. John Eliot, soon found reason to be dissatisfied with the management of affairs at the Rajbaree. The Ranee had surrounded the Raja with the old servants of Janokee Ram, the two Mojoomdars and others; and in spite of positive orders from the Board they were turning out the tahseeldars of Mr. Hatch's appointment, and the Raja was receiving sums of money to appoint improper persons in their room. Mr. Eliot found satisfaction in believing that the Raja listened attentively to his advice, but the objectionable changes continued, and he saw no hope of amendment except in the banishment of the Mojoomdars and their company, and sending the Ranee back to Gobindonogor. The Raja admitted signing blank papers and giving them to the amlas to make what use they pleased of them.

In April 1794, the Governor General directed that Raja Radhanath should be deprived of the management of his estates; his seal was locked up in the Collector's treasury, and Ram Kanto Roy was again installed as manager. Mr. Eliot used to make the young Raja come and read to him twice a week and write him a letter daily, and flattered himself that he was fitting him for the duties of his position. In October 1795 Mr. Eliot became Judge of Tippera, and Mr. Morgan, Assistant Collector, was in charge of the office until June 1796, when Mr. Cornelius Bird arrived as Collector.

When Raja Radhanath was for the second time placed in charge of his property is not quite clear, but it was before Janu-

## 222 *The Territorial Aristocracy of Bengal.*

ary 1797, when he already owed Rs. 69,677 on account of revenue, and the decree went forth from the Board to sell some of his lands. The unfortunate young man was then only twenty years of age, but neither Mr. Bird nor the Board appear to have hesitated as to the propriety of breaking up the great Dinagepoor estate. The first sale was cancelled for informality, but in February 1798, in spite of the Collector's certifying that owing to drought the ryots had not been able to pay their rents, further sales were ordered, and yet, at the end of the Bengalee year, April 1798, more than half a lakh of revenue remained unpaid, month after month instalments became due, and lot after lot was sold. The Raja was raising money on mortgage, Ram Kanto Roy being one of his principal creditors, and he saved some part of his estate by purchasing the lots in false names; while his wife Ranee Tripoora Soondaree bought lands paying a revenue of near Rs. 50,000, and old Ranee Soroswotee bought others paying Rs. 21,517; but little was saved out of the wreck of so great an argosy, for by the end of 1800 everything had been sold, and the Raja was a prisoner, unable to leave the Rajbaree because his private creditors were endeavouring to seize his person and throw him into the common jail. On the 26th January 1801, having just completed his twenty-fourth year, he died. Mr. Bird, who had been the instrument of his ruin, had died on the 3rd June, and Mr. Courtney Smith was now the Collector. Whatever may have been the merits of the policy which broke up this large estate, there can be no question but that it was carried out with extreme harshness. The rule was sternly adhered to, of selling to the highest bidder; Dinagepoor is a long way from Calcutta, Moorshedabad, Patna, or Dacca, and bears an evil reputation of unhealthiness, and no one from a distance cared to inquire whether the purchase of land in the district would be a good investment. The competition was left entirely to the servants of the estate, to the amla of Government, and to those few zemindars who had not been ruined by the Decennial Settlement, and the consequence was that the lots into which the property had been divided sold for much less than their value, some of them not bringing so much as the annual revenue assessed upon them, which an experience of a dozen years had shown them well able to pay. The only purchasers who were on the spot were unable to bid higher. In one way the Raja derived from this some slight benefit, for a few lots were bought in by the ladies of his family, his wife selling her jewels, and Ranee Soroswotee having as much as Janokee Ram's embarrassments had left her of her monthly pension of fifteen hundred rupees. Unless it was resolved that the Raja of Dinagepoor was too powerful for a subject, and therefore that as soon

as a pretext offered his estates were to be broken up, which nowhere appears to have been the feeling of Government, it is difficult to see why a fair upset price should not have been fixed on each lot, and if no one bid up to that price, the lot sequestered and put under the management of Government officers. The indirect profits of the zemindars are so much greater than the legitimate ones, which under Government management are all that are carried to credit, that possession of the estate is worth having, and the dispossession indicated would as effectually secure the punctual payment of Government revenue, as the absolute alienation of the estates. The swarm of *loldurs*, many of them absentees, who took the place of the ancient gentry, have not done much for the country.

Raja Radhanath appears to have been a weak young man, worked upon by the old Ranee's stories of the greatness of his family and the advice of interested servants, and to have regulated his expenditure rather by the example of his predecessors who had lived under the lax rule of the Mahomedans, than by the actual income which he received under the strict revenue system of the East India Company. He is said to have been fond of liquor, and once in his cups to have so severely injured a man, that he had to bribe the Police Darogha with a quarter of a lakh to hold his tongue. He was also fond of hunting and riding on horseback, and probably had he always had a man of strong will like Mr. Hatch near him, he might have come to some good, but the people are fond of telling stories of his hatred of the Europeans, and his impertinence to them. Once, they say, the European officers asked leave to occupy a house he had at Shahapoor for a few days' sport. He said the house was in ruins, and at once sent off people to dismantle it, but, as is usual with Dinagepoor work-people, they did not go for some days, and the English gentlemen, who had pitched their tents, saw them deliberately pull the roof off a house that was in excellent order. On another occasion an English officer was calling on the Raja when the mallee came in and gave a nosegay to each of the company; the Englishman after a while began to pick the flowers to pieces, and one of the Mojoomdars who was present laughed, and made a coarse allusion to the habits of monkeys. The insult was so palpable that the Englishman left the Rajbaree in high displeasure, and it is popularly believed that this incident caused an ill-feeling which eventually led to the sale of the Raja's estates. All agree in considering the Mojoomdars, who were Boidyos of Rajnagor near Dacca, as the persons to whose advice the Raja owed his ruin. It is said that one day, when the enormous load of debt under which the Raja was labouring had become notorious, some of his principal ryots proposed that he should give them an audience

and state the extent of his difficulties, and promised to help him. The Raja had a tent pitched for the purpose, dressed himself as became a solemn ceremonial, and was on his way to the place when he met one of the Mojoomdars, who ridiculed the idea of his degrading himself by the exhibition of his person before such people, and induced him to relinquish his intention, and with it all hope of extrication from his difficulties.

With the death of Radhanath the history of the Dinagepoor Raj may be said to come to an end. He left no son, but his widow and Ranee Soroswotee continued to live at the Raj-baree. The former adopted a child named Gobindonath, who was not old enough to take possession of the remnant of the family estates until the 9th July, 1817. In the meantime the stout old Ranee Soroswotee managed the property in the name of the heirs of her adopted son. Raja Gobindonath had two sons, one of whom, Troilokhnath, died childless before his father, and the other, Taroknath, succeeded on Gobindonath's death in 1841. Raja Taroknath died in 1865, and left the estates to Ranee Sham Mohinee his widow; she adopted a son named Grijonath, during whose minority she manages the property with the assistance of Baboo Khetro Mohun Singh, who married a daughter of the late Raja. The yearly revenue paid by the estates is Rs. 1,73,240, but whereas the private income of a zemindar paying such a revenue at the time of the Decennial Settlement would have been only Rs. 17,324, it is now near Rs. 1,20,000. When Raja Grijonath comes of age, he will be the principal zemindar in the district; and though not in the position of his ancestors Prannath, Ramnath, and Boidyonath, the people will always look on him as Raja of Dinagepoor.

E. VESEY WESTMACOTT, B.A., OXON.,  
*Bengal Civil Service.*

## ART. II.—A NATIVE STATESMAN.

- 1.—*Copies of official papers sent from India, touching the recent disturbances in Travancore.* Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed, 6th August, 1859.
- 2.—*Selections from the Records of Travancore.* Parts I., II., III., and IV. Printed at the instance of F. Maltby, Esq., British Resident in Travancore.
- 3.—*Reports on the Administration of Travancore.* By Sir Mádhava Ráo—from 1861 to 1870. Printed at the Travancore Sirkar Press.
- 4.—*Indian Journals.*
- 5.—*The "Travancore Gazette."*
- 6.—*Treaties, Engagements and Sunnuds.* By C. U. Aitchison, B.C.S.

THE rise of the British Empire in India will, for all time to come, be one of the most wonderful and glorious landmarks in the history of the world. The first English settlers at Surat could have as little had before their mind's eye the Indian Empire of the present, as Æneas and his fellow-settlers had the Empire of Trajan. How from small and humble beginnings the British Indian Empire grew, what overwhelming difficulties and disasters it had to contend against, how vast the achievements of its great Generals and Proconsuls have been, what extensive changes, morally and physically, it has worked out, are all matters of history with which every intelligent reader is familiar. There is one important truth which cannot escape an observant student of history. It is that while the physical monuments, however mighty and stupendous, which the wisdom and prowess of a conquering race may rear up in the conquered land, fade and vanish by the unrelenting process of time, the deep moral leavening effected by civilised conquerors continues to assert itself and fructify. The wall of Antoninus in the land of the Scots is hardly traceable at present; but the substratum in the civilisation of Britain which the great Roman conquerors laid is as visible as ever. Similarly a thousand years hence all material vestiges of British rule in India, our railways, our tunnels, our telegraphs, our bridges, our lighthouses, our dockyards, our barracks, &c., may simply be in the forms of ruins and remnants interesting to the antiquary; but the steady and all-powerful moral revolution which, by precepts and examples, we are working out, will ever be a living element, and one progressively operative.

Whatever may be the defects in the system and in the management of State education in India, it is beyond doubt that one great result is being steadily accomplished. It is that the people, in so far as they come under the influence of education, do think and reason; and this great spring, when once set in motion, must inevitably produce consequences, the extent and importance of which are beyond prediction. It needs no great efforts to show that the most inviting field to which a mind sharpened and invigorated by education would turn is that of politics. It is particularly so in a land which has for thousands of years been the scene of the most wonderfully great and stirring political dramas, and is at present under the enlightened despotism of a foreign nation. There are alarmists who apprehend not only danger to our sway in India, but the worst evils to its people themselves from this enlivening of political ambition by means of education. Those, however, who have even an approximate idea of British resources and of the moral stamina of British character, will find it hard even to imagine the day when a combined army of Bengáls, Púrbiáhs, Sikhs, Parsís, and Madrassís, under a Bábu Wellington and a Chetti Blucher, shall be seen driving us at the bayonet's point into the Indian Ocean. But the day may come, though it is as yet indefinitely distant, when the British Government of India shall present to the world the noblest spectacle it has yet beheld, by making over to the people of India, when they shall have fitted themselves for its rule, this magnificent Empire, enlightened and ennobled under British guardianship. If our State education is tending, however imperfectly, towards this consummation, its aim is of the most elevated nature. And we cannot be oblivious to the fact that such must be its inevitable, if tardy, tendency. The educated natives who have risen to the uppermost ranks, though yet few in number, have done full honour to their nationality, and have been full of promise as to the future success of their countrymen. Any nation may be proud of men of cultivation like Rámáprasád Boy, Sambhu Náth Pandit, or Bábu Rájendra Lál Mitra. The sight is even more interesting and encouraging when provinces are seen to rise from anarchy, misery, and ignorance, to order, prosperity, and enlightenment under the magical wand of a Diukar Ráo, a Salár Jang, or a Mádhava Ráo. The last of these has closed his official career in Travancore, which under him justly earned the title of a "model Native State;" and we propose to present to our readers in these pages the leading features of that career, which can hardly fail to be interesting.

Sir Mádhava Ráo belongs to one of those adventurous Mahratta families which, mingling with the great wave of conquest that during the last two centuries surged to the south

through the Dekkan and made Tanjore the chief outpost of the Mahratta Empire in the south, settled in that part of India. His great-grandfather Gopál Pant, and his grandfather Guudo Pant, held offices of trust both under Native chiefs and under the rising British power. The great events of the latter part of the last century in Southern India, and the rising power of Britain amidst great political struggles, could not have escaped the astute perception of a Mahratta family which had adopted politics as its profession; and Venkat Ráo, the eldest son of Guudo Pant, cast his lot in the British service. Being recommended by his official superior Mr. Hebron to Colonel McDouall, then Resident of Travancore, he entered the service of that State; which under an enlightened Lady-Regent and the able statesmanship of Colonel Muuro, had been freed from long-standing abuses and had risen high in good government. He soon rose to the highest office—that of Dewan or Prime Minister. He distinguished himself highly in that office, and the works of public utility effected under his auspices bear testimony to the excellence of his administration even to this day. On his retirement from the Travancore service, the Government appointed him to the Mysor Commission; and Lord William Bentinck conferred on him the title of “*Ráya Ráya Ráya*,” an honorific prefix which only one other man\* in South India obtained after him. His brother Ranga Ráo stuck more to the British service, but when Deputy Sheristadar of the Board of Revenue, he was called to Travancore, where he rose to his brother’s office, and though he held it only for a short period, he was a terror to evil-doers. Soon after his retirement from Travancore he died, leaving three sons, of whom Sir Mádhava Rao is the youngest.

About thirty years ago, Lord Elphinstone, then Governor of Madras, gave an impetus to high English education in Southern India which has borne the happiest fruits. Under the auspices of this large-minded nobleman and a staff of able advisers like Mr. George Norton and Mr. John Bruce Norton—both in their days leaders of the Madras Bar—the “*High School*,” or as it was sometimes complimentarily called, the “*University*,” was established. Mr. Powell, C.S.I., now Director of Public Instruction, then fresh from Cambridge, where he had earned academic distinction, entered upon his duties with all the hope, zeal, and earnestness of the first tiller of a rich virgin soil. Young Mádhava Ráo had the good fortune to be one of the very first set of recruits that came up to be drilled by this excellent educational tactician. Gifted naturally with the highest order of talents yet

\* Thande Narsing Rao, who was of Revenue, and retired during Sir Head Sheristadar of the Madras Board C. Trevelyan’s governorship.



displayed by India, Mádhava Ráo pursued his studies with an industry, a perseverance, and a singleness of purpose which were fully rewarded. This period of the healthy infancy of English education in Madras was, on a recent occasion, tersely alluded to by the Hon'ble A. J. Arbuthnot, then Acting Governor, in these words :—

" Now, gentlemen, I should be disposed to divide the first \* of these periods into two portions, and to take as a distinct epoch the educational measures framed by Lord Elphinstone's Government in 1841. It is due to the memory of that distinguished nobleman ; it is due to those who commenced their labours under his direction ; it is especially due to our friend the Director of Public Instruction, to whom education in this Presidency owes so much, to whose early educational labors the public service of this Presidency is so largely indebted, that we should not confound the period to which I refer with that which immediately preceded it. It was during the period to which I allude that there was being trained up for the kingdom of Travancore, which, for some years past, has been justly regarded as a model Native State, a Native statesman, who first in the capacity of tutor to the heir of the throne, and afterwards in the capacity of minister, has largely aided in raising that State to its present position. It was during that period that there was being educated a native member† of our local Legislative Council, an institution at that time unthought of, who, I am bold to say, whether as regards the uprightness of his character, the excellence of his judgment, the honesty of his purpose, or the independence of his action, has not his superior in any one of the legislative bodies now at work in this great Indian Empire. It was during that period, that our friend Sashiah Sástri,‡ whom we all, Europeans and Natives alike, so highly esteem and value, was being fitted by a liberal education for the performance of those important duties, in which almost from his first entrance into the public service he has been employed, and which he has discharged so faithfully and so well."

\*                    \*                    \*                    \*

Mr. Arbuthnot, himself the first Director of Public Instruction in Madras, who has throughout his official life made education

\* Mr. Arbuthnot was here making allusion to a lengthy letter addressed to the Madras Government by Doctor John Murdoch, of the C. V. E. Society, on education generally and a portion of Vernacular literature particularly, in which he confounded the well-meant but barren educational movement of Sir

'I. Munro, with the highly fruitful one of Lord Elphinstone.

† The Honourable V. Rámaiengar, C. S.I.

‡ Head Sheristadar in the Board of Revenue, and now tentatively Dewan of Travancore in succession to Sir Mádhava Ráo.

his special study, and to whom all the recent educational movements in that Presidency are chiefly owing, carries great weight in all that he says touching education in India. Let us again hear him on the *quality* of education imparted by the "High School" in those days. On an occasion very similar to the one just alluded to, he observed :—

"Of late I have been at the pains of enquiring from persons of experience as to the present state of education, and forming an opinion if graduates who go up and obtain honours are more highly educated than the proficient of the old High School or not ; and from the accounts I have received, I find that the proficient of the old High School are better educated and possess more general information than those who, of late years, have obtained the Bachelor of Arts degree. I believe that students now-a-days find their studies more laborious in consequence of their being confined to certain text-books with the view of passing a certain examination. The effect of this constant application is that it enervates them very much. Another reason is that pupils in the junior classes do not attend as they ought to their instruction, and when they are advanced to the higher classes they are obliged to work more unremittingly, which leads them to the system of 'cram,' which is so much decried in consequence of its being carried to excess."

We see then that in the days of the High School, "cram" had not laid its iron grasp on the neck of education ; and Mádhava Ráo was one of the brightest of that glorious band of schoolboys, to whom a sound, varied, and impressive education was imparted. His scholastic career extended over about six years, during which he once acted for Mr. Powell for a short time ; which, considering that there were European junior masters of no mean abilities at the time, must be taken as a solid compliment to his worth. In 1846 he received his "First class Proficient's Degree" and Seal from the Most Noble the Marquis of Tweeddale, who had succeeded Lord Elphinstone in the Madras Governorship. Early in 1847 he got an appointment in the Accountant-General's office, in which he continued for a little more than two years.

We must now turn to Travancore, the scene of Mádhava Ráo's successful labours. Mahárájá Mártandavarmah had succeeded his elder brother in the sovereignty of that principality at the end of 1846. The germ of the financial crisis, which afterwards attained no small magnitude, was then budding. Lieutenant-General William Cullen of the Madras Artillery, the "handsome adjutant" of his youthful days, and who in a remarkable manner possessed the chief traits of character of the fine "old Indian," was the Resident-Nawáb at the Court of Travancore. His *protégé*, the amiable but feeble Krishna Ráo, was Dewan

General Cullen, with all his failings, was himself proud of his scholastic attainments, and valued the advantages of education in others. He strongly urged on the Mahārājā the necessity of giving a good English education to his nephews; and recommended the choice of a well-educated man, fresh from his own collegiate course, as tutor to the young princes. Fortunately for Travancore, there was not wanting a precedent for the introduction of a foreigner, under the auspices of the British Government, to educate the Princes of the State. Subhā Rāo, also a native of Tanjore, entered the Travancore service as English tutor to the three young princes, almost simultaneously with Venkat Rāo, whom long afterwards he succeeded in the Dewanship. Subhā Rāo owed his first appointment to Colonel McDonall. With a view to procure a competent tutor, General Cullen naturally made a reference to Madras; and the choice being left to the then leading men there, as Mr. Daniel Elliot, Sir Henry Montgomery, Mr. George Norton, &c., it unanimously fell, at a lucky moment for Travancore, on young Mādhava Rāo. All of them highly recommended him to the Mahārājā through the Resident; and Mādhava Rāo's noblest aspirations were stirred at the prospect of making his *début* on the stage on which two of his ancestors had figured so prominently. He took, however, the advice of his best and most discerning friends; and what course they counselled may be gathered from the words of one of them. "I remember, when some years since he was offered the situation of tutor to the young Travancore princes, he came to ask my advice as to his course. After pointing out to him that it was his bounden duty to accept the office, because if he excited in the breasts of those young princes a thirst for knowledge and a love of virtue, he might become the benefactor of millions of his countrymen, I bade him question his own heart, whether he had strength enough to withstand the perils and temptations of a corrupt Native Court. He went; and nobly has he stood the ordeal." \* \* \* \* Thus morally fortified he went to Travancore in July 1849, and took charge of his important duties.

Among his royal pupils were the present Mahārājā, and his brother, the First Prince. He continued to discharge these duties for four and a half years. The amount of success which crowned his labours has been admitted on all hands to be equal to the highest expectations. It may be observed that one of his pupils, the First Prince, was made a Fellow of the Madras University a year before Mādhava Rāo's own admission into the Senate. The Prince was also alluded to in flattering terms by Lord Napier in the Viceregal Legislative

---

\* Speech by Mr. J. B. Norton, late Twelfth Anniversary of Patcheappu's Advocate-General at Madras, at the Charities, 1855.

Council in speaking of the late Lord Mayo's earnest endeavours to secure the aid of competent natives in Indian legislation. It is bare justice to the memory of General Cullen to say that he took a very lively interest in the education of the princes and rendered every aid and encouragement. In April 1853, Mádhaba Ráo was appointed to a responsible office in the revenue line under the Dewan. This appointment by the Mahárájá was made with the heartiest concurrence of General Cullen.

Turning to the general administration of Travancore at that time, we may say without exaggeration that it in a measure rivalled that of Oudh before annexation. The Blue Book which we have placed at the head of this article presents to us the gloomiest picture which one could expect even in an Asiatic kingdom. The immediate occasion for the publication of the papers contained in it, was the serious disturbances which arose in the southern districts of Travancore soon after the proclamation announcing Her Majesty's assumption of the direct government of India was known to the masses; and when the women of the Shánárs (toddy-drawers) relying upon its pledges of protection and perfect freedom, assumed, contrary to former usage, coverings to the upper part of their persons; and when the Súdras, the higher caste, violently opposed this innovation. But the papers give an interesting *résumé* of the events of some years before this. No. 14 in this collection is a memorandum by the Madras Government, dated March 1858. It begins with saying—"Petitions from Travancore are numerous enough."

"In the year 1855, however, complaints of mal-administration had become so frequent and so urgent, that the Madras Government were led to form the opinion that a formal investigation was imperative. The cases which particularly attracted their attention were eight in number. A *précis* of these eight cases was prepared in October 1856 by Mr. Norman, Deputy Secretary to Government; it follows below:—

A.—Arrears of salaries of public servants.

B.—The memorial of one Emanuel Class.

C.—Petition of the Rev. John Cox.

D.—Petition of the Rev. T. O. Whitehouse.

E.—The Edapilly Murder Case.

F.—Petition of the Rev. F. Baylis.

G.—A joint petition of certain missionaries, complaining that convicted criminals are employed in high offices.

H.—A joint petition from the same, containing more general charges of mal-administration and corruption.

In noticing case A, "the Government did not think the causes assigned for the arrears were satisfactory; they observed that it was admitted that two months' arrears existed, and trusted that

such a state of things would be avoided in future." Referring to case C, the Government observe that—"On the 9th March, 1855, the Rev. John Cox, one of the missionaries in Travancore, forwarded several petitions from native converts, complaining of specific acts of oppression and violence against them as Christians. He complained that the whole of the Sirkar officials, with the Dewan at the head of them, were in league to oppress and insult the Christians; and that the good intentions of the Rájá were neutralised; and that appeals to the Resident were not only useless, but marked the appellant for further oppression. He pledged his veracity, as a Christian minister, that the grossest oppression existed, and that torture so severe as to cause death was practised." One of these petitions was "from Chinnái, the widow of Devasaháyam. It sets forth that her husband, herself, and others, were seized and confined for refusing to sign an agreement, binding themselves to do palace work without pay. Her husband was shockingly ill-treated, and died from the effects of the torture; she and the others were released after six days' confinement in the stocks. It states further, that appeals to the Resident were disregarded." The Resident's explanation on this count was that certain Shánárs, whose duty it was to to serve in the Rán's palace, refused to do so. They were, therefore, called before the Palace Káryakár for enquiry. The Hindú part of the Shánár admitted their fault and were released, but the converts refused to admit their guilt; so they were confined, and six weeks after their release Devasaháyam died of dysentery; they suffered no hardship while confined; they may have been ill-treated in the Palace, but that they were so ill-treated as to result in the death of one of them, is not to be believed.

To the Resident's explanation on this and other points, Mr. Cox put in a rejoinder; and "the Right Honorable Lord Harris considered that 'the case, as stated by Mr. Cox, was very strong.'"

Case E. is the 'Edapilly Murder Case.'

"Edapilly is a petty quasi-independent state in the north of Travancore. The Rajah (a Númbári Bráhmaṇ) and the heir apparent (the 'Velai' and 'Ilaya,' or elder and younger Rajahs) are at feud.

"On the 18th September 1852 some ruffians broke into the house of one Krishnan Elayadam, and beat him so severely that he died within 30 days.

"The house where Elayadam was living was situated in a garden which was the bone of contention between the two Rajahs.

"The case was examined by order of the Dewan, but nothing was proved.

"That result did not please the Ilaya Rajah, who forwarded substantial inducements to the Dewan, who had all the prisoners apprehended, and taken to Trevandrum, 160 miles ; then to Quilon, 46 miles ; and then to Kalikuttam, 26 miles from Quilon, where there is a small cutcherry in a lonely spot. Here the Dewan ordered Muhidin Beg, the Police Duffadar, to torture the prisoners, to extort a confession from them ; sixth prisoner was suspended from the hair of his head, and beaten on the neck and chest with a stone. Karulan Goviudan, first prisoner, had two of his teeth knocked out in the presence of Vencatramana Ayan ; and after four hours of torture, the prisoners all confessed, and were committed to the Trevandrum Criminal Court for trial upon this evidence.

"Sixth prisoner died from the beating, &c., at the door of the Criminal Court ; the Dewan refused to give the body to the prisoner's friends (who wished for a *post mortem* examination), and declared that the death was caused by 'bloody flux.'

"The 25th prisoner also died on the 20th June from injuries received. The Criminal Court examined officially the scars on the prisoners, and torture was fully proved to their satisfaction against the Dewan and Venkataramana Ayan.

\* \* \* \* \*

"A vacancy existing in the Appeal Court, the Resident, on the recommendation of the Dewan, appointed the very Police Sheristadar, Venkataramana Ayan, who tortured the prisoners, and directed that he should be specially appointed to try the case."

Indeed, this case appears to throw into the shade the worst charges against Ali Nukhi Khan of Oudh.

Under F. the Reverend F. Baylis states that, "the Deputy Peshkar does all he can to assist the robbers and oppress the poor, especially Christians."

G. and H. were united petitions from all the missionaries in South Travancore. They reiterated the individual complaints, and embodied many more bearing upon the general oppression, lawlessness, official corruption, and misrule, which had reached their climax. The contents of H. are thus summarised in the memorandum :

"I. The police is a tremendous engine of oppression : for,

(1) Prisoners are confined for very long periods without investigation (at the moment).

(2) Many are acquitted after a long imprisonment, being all the time innocent ; some have just been released who suffered five years' imprisonment.

(3) Many are imprisoned without any specific charge ; whence release is impossible ; no door is open to the cry of the prisoners who

die in gaol, though a monthly return of persons confined is sent to the Resident.

(4) \* \* \* Prisoners are repeatedly tortured in prison.

(5) The Regulations are systematically set aside throughout the country ; not only in the Courts but everywhere ; appeal to the Resident is vain ; he refers to the Dewan, who himself practises all such atrocities, such as false imprisonment, torture, &c., but uniformly shields his subordinates.

(6) \* \* \* \* \*

(7) Real criminals are suffered to be at large, committing fresh outrages, and intimidating any witnesses of their crimes.

(8) Real complaints are unheeded ; nothing can be done without extensive bribery.

(9) The police officers not only receive bribes to let off thieves, but retain the stolen property.

(10) Complaints against Government officials are quite hopeless. The consequences always recoil upon the complainants.

" II. The character of the high Government officials is bad.

(1) Convicted criminals are appointed to the most responsible offices, among which are the Accountant-General and Deputy Peshkar.

(2) Men grossly and notoriously incompetent are posted to high appointments.

(3) And new offices are created for these men.

(4) Every appointment has its price ; and when offices are filled by such men, it is no wonder that their official power is abused ' to extort bribes, to pervert justice, oppress the weak, shield the guilty, promote favorites, and amass large private fortunes. \* \* \* \*

(5) The Sirkar officials are not paid regularly ; of this there can be no doubt, and all the evils inseparable from such a system are entailed upon the people.

" III. \* \* \* The appeal Court is packed. \* \* \* Thus is the whole channel of justice corrupt, and the whole country groans under the pressure of the enormous evil.

" IV. The forced labour system exists to a great extent.

(1) In many cases a nominal equivalent is rendered which is practically worthless. And this state of vassalage is compulsorily perpetuated.

(2) Supplies are in many cases extorted *gratis* ; codjans for covering the Sirkar buildings, leaves for the elephants' fodder, bunches of plantains for festivals, fish for the table of the chief Europeans at Trevandrum, &c.

(3) \* \* \* \* \*

(4) Free men are also pressed into slavery. The palace authorities compelled and do compel men to sign documents, making themselves slaves. \* \* \* This oppression literally consumes the people.

" V. Immeasurable evils arise from the pepper, salt, and cardamom, monopoly. \* \* \* They impoverish the people without increasing the revenue, and demoralise and oppress the inhabitants."

On this, the Madras Government made a reference to the

Government of India, in which they said that "considering the very grave charges contained in the petition, corroborated in some measure by the continual petitions from natives of the country, it appeared to them that investigation of some sort was imperative." They sent up the petitions, and also copies of the two Treaties of 1797 and 1805. Lord Dalhousie was Governor-General at the time; and he always condemned half measures which are indicative of weakness. He disapproved the proposal for an enquiry; but instructed the Local Government, under the Ninth Article of the Treaty of 1805, to give to the Rájá a "formal and forcible expression of the sentiments of the British Government on the abuses which appeared to prevail, with suitable advice and warning." Shattered in health by eight years of official toil of an unparalleled nature, the Marquis of Dalhousie was seeking relief in the bracing climate of the Nilgiris, and Lord Harris, the Governor of Madras, was with him. It was from this place that the letter of advice and warning, dated 21st November 1855, was forwarded to the Rájá. Though signed by Lord Harris, the letter was full of that imperial ring which could have been imparted to it only by the masterly pen of the great Proconsul. The following is its *précis*, as given in the memorandum:—

"The letter began by setting forth in detail a series of correspondence with the Resident, and numberless petitions from the Rájá's subjects, which had led the Madras Government to believe (that the following evils) prevailed in Travancore—the inefficiency of the police; the venality of the Courts; the demoralising effects of the revenue system pursued; the neglect of public works, and the general misrule. It went on by observing that it had been brought to the ears of Lord Dalhousie; and concluded by stating that in accordance with his Lordship's views, and Clause 9 of the Treaty of 1805, it had become the duty of the Government to call the Rajah's attention, in the most serious manner, to the manifold abuses prevailing in his dominions; to urge an enlightened policy, and to warn him that it was to be feared that the contingency against which Article 5 of the Treaty was directed was not far distant, unless averted by timely and judicious reforms; the Rajah was also informed that in carrying out any such reforms the assistance of the Resident was available."

The descent of this thunderbolt created immense stir for the moment in the Rájá's Court. The ancient vaults of the great Pagoda were ransacked, and five lakhs of rupees scraped out—avowedly to pay off arrears of public salaries, and the dues on pepper received from the ryots. But through the wonderful *legerdemain* of Krishna Ráo and his satellites, scarcely a moiety of this sum ever reached its destination.

A vague and perfunctory reply, drafted under General Cullen's



correction, was forwarded by the Rájá, in which many of the charges were admitted, qualified by flimsy excuses and explanations, and ready promises of reform given. In the meanwhile General Cullen sent up his own remarks on the petition of the missionaries, in which he took special care to defend his Krishna Ráo. He said—"much blame is unjustly thrown on the Dewan in regard to the state of the finances of the country. \* \* \* The assertion that the Dewan is all-powerful over the Rajah is utterly false; the Rajah can do anything. In Cochin it is different, there the Dewan is paramount." We are fully justified in remarking that if Lord Dalhousie had continued a year more in India, if the great events of 1857 had not occurred and absorbed public attention, and if Krishna Ráo's administration had been prolonged, Travancore would long ago have been one of the richest Collectorates in Southern India. But it was otherwise ordained, and Travancore was spared to become a model of native good government. The Madras Government had, when recommending to the Government of India the institution of an enquiry by a Commission into the charges brought against the Travancore administration, simultaneously made the same recommendation to the home authorities. While the Governor-General rejected this proposal as opposed to the tenor of the Treaty, the Court of Directors strongly advised its adoption. They eschewed, however, General Cullen's proposal to appoint a local and "packed" Commission consisting of men likely to be under his thumb; and said:—"A much more comprehensive investigation than this is absolutely necessary, and though the officers to whom it is entrusted must hold their commission from the Rajah, they should be recommended to him by your Government, and should carry on their enquiries independently of the Resident. Lieutenant-General Cullen must be sensible that he is himself one of the parties under accusation; that he is alleged to be prejudiced in favour of the Dewan, who was introduced into Travancore by himself, and is indebted to him for his high appointment; and that no enquiry in which either the Dewan's instrumentality or his own is employed could be considered a fair one, or would effectually clear the official character of either from even unmerited imputation." This decision of the Court of Directors was communicated to the Governor-General; and in doing so, the Madras Government said:—"It may be proper to remark, in reference to the 9th Article of the Treaty, that practically, the intercourse between the Madras Government and the Travancore State has not been confined to the occasional tender of advice under that Article. The nomination by the Rajah of his Dewan or chief minister is reported for the sanction of Government. The Resident also exercises a general supervision over the proceedings of the Travancore Court.

\* \* \* Annual reports of the revenue and expenditure are submitted to Government, and, especially of late years, these reports and their accounts have been closely scrutinized, and strong remarks made on the subject of expenditure, even to the extent of prescribing the maximum sum, which, however, has never been observed, to be spent in Ootperas and ceremonies." They also said that the proposed Commission "must exercise a minute and searching scrutiny into the entire system of the administration of the Travancore Government in all its branches—into the present condition of the country, and into the past proceedings of the Dewan and Resident." To this reference, and to several successive ones on the same subject, no reply was given by the Government of India; while the Madras Government continued "to receive from Travancore complaints of oppression and mal-administration." Lord Dalhousie had left India, and scarcely had Lord Canning time to study the political disposition of India, before the great mutiny broke out in 1857, and absorbed the attention of every Englishman. Under these circumstances it is no wonder that the Travancore question was in abeyance. In the meanwhile, we must go back a little.

During the latter half of 1855, Mádhava Ráo was promoted to the office of Dewan Peshkar, which is the highest in the scale below that of the Dewan. The number of Peshkars at a time would appear to be varying between two and four; and these, at the time we speak of, were all stationed at the head-quarters. While they scarcely did any work of real importance and responsibility, they directed their talents and energies to intriguing against the Dewan, who in turn was ever jealously busy in annoying and impeding them. Mádhava Ráo was soon disgusted with this state of things; and suggested that the Peshkars might be entrusted with the responsible charge of a certain number of Táluks each, subject to the general control of the Dewan. He pointed also to a similar administrative arrangement which had obtained in Travancore previously to the establishment of its existing relations with the British Government. The arrangement was adopted, and Mádhava Ráo was deputed to 'the Southern Division,' comprising the very Táluks from which complaints to the Madras Government had been most frequent and importunate. Accordingly he went thither; and with power scrupulously limited by a jealous superior, began his work of reform steadily. Soon the industrious and peaceful found that there was one who was ready to espouse their cause against oppressors, and the lawless that *their* palmy days of impunity were gone. Mr. Norton observes:—"I cannot pass from the subject without another public mention of Mádhava Ráo, the most distinguished of all the High School *alumni*. His course has long been before the public. After leaving the school

with the highest distinctions and after honourable employ in the service of the Madras Government at the Presidency, he went to Travancore on the invitation of the Rajah, to superintend the education of the young princes. How he discharged that task I happen, so far as one of the princes is concerned, personally to know. And it is a proud satisfaction to think that he has instilled into the bosom of that young man the same love of the principles of justice and honesty as actuate himself. Thence, he was appointed to a post under the Dewan ; and during this last year, he has had an independent charge of two districts of the kingdom. How he has administered that important charge I am about to state. I believe that the representations constantly before the public of the state of Travancore are not, in the least, exaggerated—that nothing could be worse than its condition of anarchy, than the entire dissolution of the elements of society. The missionaries have petitioned the Government on the state of misery and anarchy in which the country is plunged. A warning, by no means indistinct, as to the consequences of this state of things, has been conveyed by the Government of Madras to the Sovereign of Travancore. Yet, within the short space of a year, Mádhava Ráo has called forth order out of disorder ; has distributed justice between man and man, without fear or favour ; has expelled dacoits ; has raised the revenues ; and his Minutes and State papers show the liberality, the soundness, and statesmanship of his views and principles. He has received the thanks of his Sovereign ; he has obtained the voluntary admiring testimony of some of the very missionaries who memorialised, to the excellence of his administration. Now, here is a man raised up, as it were, amid the anarchy and confusion of his country, to save it from destruction. Annexation, looming in the not far distant future, would be banished into the shades of night, if such an administration as he has introduced into two of the districts were given to the whole kingdom, by his advancement to the post of Minister. He is, indeed, a splendid example of what education may do for the Native.\*

It was not long before the hope so expressed was realised. Even General Cullen could not save his Krishna Ráo from the unrelenting laws of nature. In November, 1857, Dewan Krishna Ráo succumbed to a painful disease. It was during the costly sexennial Murajapam festival in Trevandrum that he died. It was necessary to appoint a person to take up the reins of office immediately. There were two Dewan Peshkars at the time ; and of these Mádhava Ráo was the junior. The senior was a native of Malabar ; and had, before entering the Travancore service,

\* Speech at the 14th Anniversary, Patcheappa's Charities. Madras, 1857.

served our Government in that Collectorate for many years, and had earned some local distinction as an efficient Police officer. But he did not know English, and was thoroughly a man of the "old school." With the death of Krishna Ráo, General Cullen's good sense returned to him, and he at once recognised the pre-eminent fitness of Mádhava Ráo for the Ministership. So, we find him thus reporting to Government in January 1858.

"I have the honor to report that, immediately on the death of the late Dewan of Travancore, His Highness the Rajah proposed to me to send for the Dewan Peshkar, Mádhava Ráo, who was then in the southern districts and close at hand, for the purpose of taking temporary charge of the catcherry.

\* \* \* \* \*

"His Highness has since proposed to me that Mádhava Ráo should for the present be placed in charge of the administration as Acting Dewan, an arrangement in which I have expressed my concurrence and which I hope may be approved of by His Lordship in Council.

"Mádhava Ráo's correct principles, his character for intelligence and energy, his perfect knowledge of English, and the considerable experience he has already acquired in the administration of the laws of Travancore, together with the well-grounded knowledge of the Company's Regulations, all point him out for the office."

\* \* \* \* \*

The Madras Government approved of this arrangement. At the end of the year the Rájá, with the concurrence of the Government, confirmed Mádhava Ráo in the Dewanship. That concurrence was thus expressed :—"The Government are glad to learn that His Highness the Rajah has shown his approval of the services of Mádhava Ráo by confirming him in the high and important office." It is but due to General Cullen to state that notwithstanding some reluctance on the part of the Rájá, he procured for him uncurtailed powers, and ever afterwards supported him cordially. Soon after Mádhava Ráo's appointment, Lord Harris visited Travancore ; and during his Lordship's stay in Travandrum, Mádhava Ráo had long and interesting conferences with him, which while they fully instilled the new Dewan with the views of the Government regarding Travancore affairs, assured the head of that Government that the interests of that State were safe in the keeping of the new Minister. Earlier in the same year the Madras Government informed the Court of Directors that "since the appointment of Mádhava Ráo, petitions from Travancore have much abated both in number and tone, affording good grounds to hope that the administration is, by his exertions, being placed on an improved footing."

Thus Mádhava Ráo entered upon the discharge of his important duties with a zeal, earnestness, noble ambition, and honesty of purpose unrivalled among the natives of India. He was in his thirtieth year ; and certainly in the general run of cases that age might be considered too young for so high a trust. But his extraordinary natural talents, combined with an excellent education and intimacy with men in high circles, had enabled him early to study the great problems of social statics, to value all enlightened and progressive movements, and to form a sound and unprejudiced judgment in a manner more than amply to make up for the immaturity of years. His task was, however, by no means easy or even ordinarily difficult. We have already shown that the entire administration was disorganised. The public treasuries were empty ; and while large arrears of payment in the way of salaries, and money for pepper, tobacco, and other articles purchased by the Travancore Sirkar were accumulating, the land-tax used to be collected often a year in advance. Tobacco of the worst description was often the coin in which pepper was paid for ; and pepper, several years old, similarly fell to the lot of the tobacco contractor, if he happened not to be in the good graces of the leaders of the administration. Five lakhs of rupees had been borrowed from the Pagoda Treasury ; and the Rájá had made a solemn stipulation to replace this sum, *plus* 50 per cent. in the way of lump interest, in equal monthly instalments, in the course of five years. This, together with the subsidy payable to our Government, not to take into consideration other charges, was enough to deter any one from taking up the reins of the administration. The public service, from the top to the bottom, consisted, with few exceptions, of an army of voracious place-seekers, who having obtained their appointments by bribes, were bent upon recouping themselves a hundredfold ; and peculation, torture, false accusation, pretended demands on behalf of the Sirkar, these were the instruments with which they worked out their object. Non-payment of salaries furnished even an open pretext for these malpractices. The courts of justice were so many seats of corruption and perversion of justice. Dacoits and marauders of the worst stamp scoured the country by hundreds ; but these were less feared by the people than the so-called Police. In short, Travancore was the veriest den of misrule, lawlessness, and callous tyranny of the worst description. We advisedly say so, because the very heart of the administration was tainted. The State vessel was drifting at random amidst rocks and reefs, without a chart, without a compass, with shattered sails and broken cables, and above all, without a pilot. It was at the helm of this vessel that Mádhava Ráo was placed. He grasped it firmly ; full of confidence in the sympathy of the enlightened public, full of eagerness to earn

a noble distinction. How he guided the vessel, not only to safety but to glory, we shall presently see. In the meantime, certain events of importance must be noticed.

The disturbances in South Travancore, which arose from a disputed question of costumes, assumed suddenly a magnitude which none could have foreseen. The causes of these were quite beyond the control of the ruling authorities. They were but one of those illustrations of the struggles of the first rays of civilisation against utter barbarism. Popular rights are little known or respected in Native states; and Travancore has long been the *brinepond* of superstition and caste intolerance. Certain castes were restricted to certain modes of wearing their clothes; and deviations from the prescribed modes were jealously watched and opposed by other castes. The women of the Shánárs, or toddy-drawers, who abound in South Travancore, and from among whom the Protestant missionaries have for the last sixty years reaped the richest harvest, had been prevented from covering the upper part of their person. Acting upon the advice of Colonel Morrison, then Resident, the Ráni Regent had so far modified this restriction as to permit the wearing by *Christian* Shánár women of the *Kuppáyam* (a sort of shirt). The mutual jealousies between the Shánárs and the Súdras were dormant for some time, but the Queen's Proclamation of November 1858, on the assumption of the direct government of India, renovated those feelings. In the whole range of official literature, in the English or any other language, there is not a State Paper expressing nobler views or entitled to greater admiration than Her Majesty's Indian Proclamation; but at the same time we make bold to say that no State Paper has given rise to more divergent constructions. The Shánárs imagined that it permitted them to infringe existing rules; while the Súdras equally considered it as sanctioning their taking the law into their own hands to repress what they took as an aggression into their caste domains. Serious affrays ensued, and these were aggravated by the gratuitous interference of petty Sirkar officials whose general standard of capacity and moral worth we have already alluded to. Public peace was imperilled. In January 1859, General Cullen reported to the Madras Government that "there is a very disturbed state of feeling at present in the south of Travancore on a matter of caste, i.e., as to the kind of dress to be worn by the women of the different castes." Further on he said—"In communication with the Dewan, I, a few days ago, sent to the south 100 men of the Nair Brigade under an European officer, to support the civil power, and which I hope may be sufficient, as the Dewan also proposes going there to ascertain on the spot the exact state of matters." Five days afterwards he again wrote and said :—

"A letter from the Dewan, dated yesterday, and received this morning, informs me of a report of the Sháuárs across the frontier in the Tinnevely district collecting there with a view to enter Travancore to join the Shánárs, and plunder the villages along the frontier. A letter from the Valliyúr Thasildar (Tinnevely) rather corroborates the report; I have communicated the information to the Magistrate of Tinnevely.

"A party of 50 men of the Nair Brigade have been detached to Soosheendrum, and the Dewan is desirous to have an additional 100 men of the Brigade at his disposal, and I have accordingly directed the Officer Commanding the Brigade to hold them in readiness."

On the 12th February, Dewan Mádhava Ráo reported to the Resident thus:—

\*

\*

\*

5. "On the 14th ultimo, I reached Patmanabhapuram. A detachment of the Nair Brigade had already arrived there on the 11th. I was followed by Captain Daly, who was put in command of all the troops in the Southern Districts. The troops were moved where mischief was apprehended. The Police was further strengthened in different places; auxiliary police officers were appointed to keep the peace, and speedily inquire into and dispose of Police cases, which were of course expected to be numerous at the time. Some minor Sirkar officials, who appear to have acted improperly, were suspended from employment. Some of the leaders of both parties concerned in these disturbances were apprehended; other measures, too, were taken with a view to preserve order. The determination of the Sirkar to exact implicit obedience to it from all classes of its subjects soon became known; and I am happy to add, that without the necessity of resorting to extreme measures having arisen, tranquillity has been restored." He said further:—

"As regards future arrangements, I think it desirable that the detachment of the Nair Brigade, now in the south, should continue there some little time longer. The additional Police establishments should also be continued. A re-arrangement of officials in certain localities will be necessary; about which, however, I may write to you at another time. I may also submit in a very few days my plans for better organising the Police of the whole country.

8. "The authority of the Sirkar having been vindicated, it may be desirable to take an early opportunity to consider what modifications should be made in the Proclamation of 1004, so as to suit the requirements of altered times and circumstances."

The agitation subsided gradually under a firm but considerate policy. The Rájá conceded, not without pressure from the

Madras Government, of which Sir C. Trevelyan had become the head, liberty of dress to the Shánárs. Sir Walter Elliot, then Member of Council, considered the Dewan's report "to be a temperate and fair statement." The Dewan, however, had to carry out the wishes of the Government under the orders of a Rájá, who while possessing many amiable and even sterling qualities, and often successfully simulating enlightenment, was an ultra-conservative; and of a Resident, who could not realise the moral advancement of the world of near half a century, and who seldom took a serious view of popular grievances. Hence the concessions made to the Shánárs were piece-meal; and naturally petitions complaining of caste intolerance continued to be sent up to the Government. Any Governor would have taken serious notice of these; but Sir C. Trevelyan was one whose spirit soon burst all bonds of patience. It was also about this time that the Government of India replied to the several references from the Madras Government, recommending an enquiry by commission into the affairs of Travancore, which had not received attention during the mutiny. They objected to a Commission, but advised the suspension of the Resident, and the appointment of an officiating Resident. The Madras Government, while conscious of their power to take this step, did not see sufficient grounds to do so, and said that one of the main objects of the proposed Commission was to ascertain the necessity for so doing. Thus there was an ellipsis of argument, the Government of India deeming the suspension of the Resident a necessary preliminary to all enquiry, and the Madras Government considering that an enquiry alone could show whether suspension was necessary. Sir C. Trevelyan was convinced of the unfitness of General Cullen; and the Indian Government had pointed to the necessity of appointing in his stead "a person of tried and known sound judgment, and one who may be expected to obtain the confidence of all parties." To effect this, Sir Charles thought it best to use moral persuasion. So, we find him writing to the Resident on the 6th May, thus:—

"It is my earnest desire to support the just authority of the Mahárájá in his ancient dominions, and I know what is due to yourself as an old and deserving officer of this Government; but the case now before me is one in which the claims of public duty are of the most imperative kind, and I must therefore desire that you will, without further delay, yield obedience to the repeated orders which have been conveyed to you, and report in detail what you have done in consequence of the resolutions of this Government communicated to you on the 27th January and on the 14th of March last, and what the Mahárájá has done in consequence." General Cullen soon found from this, and perhaps also other correspondence of a more privileged kind, that the anti-



quarian inclinations of the new Governor were not strong enough to support an 'Old Indian' against public interests.

He accordingly did "yield obedience," and retired at the end of 1859. The new year brought with it a new Resident. The Madras Presidency affords little or no field for the development of diplomatic talents; and its services, both civil and military, have seldom been adorned by men of distinction in this line. But this general void only made Mr. Francis Maltby shine all the more. He was every way fit to represent the British Government in a Native Court. His great official experience, his eminent talents, his excellent literary powers, his warm and generous heart, his humane sympathies, his keen sense of honour, his love of truth and justice, his abhorrence of all that was mean and morally sinuous, and his polished and persuasive manners, formed a happy combination rarely seen. A deep and self-humiliating, but unobtrusive, religious faith ran through every vein of his moral frame. His commanding person, his noble mien, his rare but mild and sincere smile, his well-weighed and slow-flowing speech, and even his deep bass voice, were externals which immensely added to the dignity and effect of the whole character. It was on him that Sir Charles Trevelyan's choice worthily fell. Early in 1860, he went to Travancore and relieved General Cullen. About six months after Mr. Maltby's appointment, the late Mahárájá died. The Rájá had left four nephews; and according to the Malabar law of succession, the eldest of these would have succeeded him in the sovereignty. But he was found to be completely demented from an early age. Two modes of settling the succession presented themselves to the notice of the Madras Government. These were: first, a complete supersession of the *de jure* heir and the installation of the next in seniority in full sovereignty; or, secondly, the establishment of a Regency and the placing of the heir presumptive at its head. The decision of the Government, in a very great measure, depended upon the opinion of the Resident. Mr. Maltby carefully weighed the respective merits of the two proposals. He had before him a not very remote precedent of a Regency in Travancore itself. He, however, perceived the evils which would arise from an indefinite Regency and the consequent unsettled state of the public mind. He also calculated upon the great benefits which would accrue from the increased amenability to the advice of the British Government on the part of a native potentate who might be expected to ascribe his attainment of sovereignty, partly at least, to that Government. He, therefore, strongly recommended the installation of Prince Rama Vurmah; and the Madras Government, with the concurrence of the Government of India, sanctioned it. Accordingly, on the 19th October, 1860, the present Mahárájá was installed. And under a young and amiable sovereign, free

from the bonds of self-imposed conservatism, and with a Resident of high character and abilities, Sir Mádhava Ráo's administration attained unimpeded progress.

In noticing the features of an administration, the point which pre-eminently presents itself to our attention is its financial policy. It has already been shown how the finances stood in the days of Mádhava Ráo's predecessor. With all the oppressive and demoralising monopolies and other petty vexatious taxes, the total revenue seldom went up to even 40 lakhs. We subjoin a statement of the yearly receipts for nine years beginning from 1861-62 :—

1861-62	...	...	Rs. 4,323,687.
1862-63	...	...	„ 4,754,898.
1863-64	...	...	„ 4,310,727.
1864-65	...	...	„ 4,211,140.
1865-66	...	...	„ 4,480,634.
1866-67	...	...	„ 4,482,819.
1867-68	...	...	„ 5,188,944.
1868-69	...	...	„ 5,085,645.
1869-70	...	...	„ 5,154,007.

We regret that we have not before us the statement of revenue receipts from the very beginning of Mádhava Ráo's Dewanship ; but it must be remembered that before Mr. Maltby's advent these Administration Reports never saw light. If we could have presented it, the contrast would have been greater. But the figures above given will show, without any comments from us, the buoyancy which the master hand of the new Dewan gave the revenues of Travancore. But the debit side must be considered. The very first act of the new reign was the abolition, under Mr. Maltby's advice and Mádhava Ráo's assurance, of the pepper monopoly. Pepper is a staple peculiar to the Malabar Coast, of which Travancore forms a part. It had for a very long time been one of the chief revenues of the State. "The pepper of the Malabar Coast had, from the earliest times of the Company's trade, formed one of the chief articles of export. On the 28th January 1793, the Rájá entered into an agreement (No. LII.) known as the pepper contract, to supply a large quantity of pepper to the Bombay Government for ten years, in return for arms and goods."\* Pepper had been so important an item in the revenue system that the branch of that system which embraced all the State monopolies and royalties went under the designation of the 'Pepper Department.' The amount annually realised by this monopoly, while it formed a very appreciable portion of the State revenue, was not very large, taken in itself. Dewan Krishna Ráo, in his memorandum†

\* Aitchison's Collection of 'Treaties,' &c., vol. v., page 293.

† "Selections from the Records of Travancore." No. III.

drawn up in 1841-42, when first introduced into the Travancore service, gives interesting information on the pepper monopoly as well as other points. From the tables given in it we gather that, taking an average of ten years, 4,531 kandies of pepper were annually purchased from the ryots for Rs. 1,49,587, and 5,655 kandies were sold for Rs. 8,27,177. The average sale value is Rs. 60 per kandy, and thus the 4,531 kandies give Rs. 2,77,460, from which deducting the cost, we get Rs. 1,27,873 as net revenue, which is comparatively a small sum. But monopolies are always thought elastic, and great hopes are placed in them in a mere financial point of view. The great oppression which the pepper monopoly gave rise to, and the decidedly incommensurate revenue derived from it, pointed to it as the first of the monopolies to be abolished or modified. Mr. Maltby was determined to expunge it. He would not have been able to do so, if Mádharma Ráo were not bold enough to bear the loss of revenue. But the latter was enlightened enough to realise to himself the spirit of the age, and was confident in his own abilities. Thus, the pepper monopoly was sent whistling in the air with one stroke of the bat of the master cricketer. An export duty of 15 per cent. *ad valorem* was imposed in its stead. This was again lowered first to 9 per cent., and ultimately to 5 per cent., the general level of export duty.

Next in order we come to the tobacco monopoly. This source of revenue was incomparably greater than that of pepper. It, indeed, took in Travancore the place of the opium monopoly in British India. The abolition of this monopoly, of course, entailed a proportionately large fiscal sacrifice. We cannot do better than quote from Mádharma Ráo's Report for 1863-64.

"The important fact may be announced at the outset, that the tobacco monopoly of the State was finally abolished in the year under review.

"It may not be out of place here to give a summary of the measures taken by His Highness' Government in recent years in respect to this important source of revenue, culminating in the abolition of the monopoly.

"It may be premised that in regard to the consumption of tobacco, Travancore may be regarded as divided into three circles, namely, the southern, the central, and the northern. In the first of these Tinnevely tobacco is chiefly consumed, in the second that of Jaffna, and in the third that of Coimbatore.

"The monopoly system was open to objection for the double reason that the mode of deriving the revenue was in itself opposed to sound fiscal principles, and that the taxation of the commodity was carried too far in reference to the power of the Sirkar to counteract the operations of the smuggler.

"The evils of the system, under these circumstances, could at no time have escaped observation ; but when the tobacco monopoly in the British districts of Malabar, Canara, and Coimbatore was abolished in 1853, the difficulty of maintaining the monopoly in this State much increased.

"The consequence was a rapid decline of the revenue on Jaffna tobacco. In the year 1032 (Kollam era), the year previous to the appointment of the present Dewan, the consumption of Sirkar tobacco of Ceylon growth was 1,444 kandies, while in 1024 it had stood at 2,485 kandies.

"But no reforms in the system, however desirable, could be attempted at a time when the public finances were suffering from *extreme* depression. All that could be done was to work the existing system itself with more than usual vigour and strictness, to check abuses, and to exact the largest revenue towards the rescue of the State from its perilous financial position.

"Under such a treatment, the revenues rose again, as the following statement will show :—

Malayalam year.			Kandies.
1032	...	...	3,460
1033	...	...	3,818
1034	...	...	4,405
1035	...	...	4,765
1036	...	...	3,941 (Famine year)
1037	...	...	4,376 (Ditto)

"The time then arrived for inaugurating reforms earnestly. The finances of the Sirkar were much improved, and action was no longer delayed.

"The first step was to lower the monopoly prices. They had stood thus :—

			Rate per kandy.
Jaffna tobacco	...	...	.. Rs. 431
Tinnevelly do.	...	...	.. „ 266
Coimbatore do.	...	...	.. „ 168
and were reduced as shown below :—			
Jaffna tobacco	...	...	.. Rs. 252½
Tinnevelly do.	...	...	.. „ 168½
Coimbatore do.	...	...	.. „ 105

"This, it will be seen, was a considerable fall, and could not but operate to cut off largely from the profits of smuggling, and to bring tobacco more within the reach of the consumers.

"But, be it noted that this reform was limited to reduction of taxation, but did not extend to the *system*, which was still that of a monopoly. Hence an opportunity was taken not long after to attack the system itself. Instead of the Sirkar purchasing tobacco from contractors on its own account and selling it by

retail to its subjects, it was declared open to all dealers to import tobacco on their own account, provided they paid the following import duty :—

	Per kandy.
Jaffna tobacco ... ..	Rs. 190
Tinnevelly do. ... ..	„ 140
Coimbatore do. ... ..	„ 65

“ In consideration of the pressure of the duty, importers are allowed by the Sirkar the privilege of keeping their goods in bond, a privilege without which the trade could never have prospered. But it was yet desirable to lower the duty, which the Sirkar was glad to do in reference to the handsome surplus revenues left in its hands at the end of 1038. So in about the middle of 1039 (the year under review) the Sirkar reduced the duties to the undermentioned scale :—

	Per kandy.
Jaffna tobacco ... ..	Rs. 140
Tinnevelly do. ... ..	„ 100
Coimbatore do. ... ..	„ 65

“ A still further reduction has been made in the current year.” \* \* \*

That reduction was as follows :—

	Per kandy.
Jaffna tobacco ... ..	Rs. 120
Tinnevelly do. ... ..	„ 85
Coimbatore do. ... ..	„ 40

And we find that while in 1856-57, the last year of Krishna Rao's administration, 3,460 kandies were, under the full swing of the monopoly sold, and brought in a net revenue of Rs. 8,48,978 ; in 1869-69, the import duty on 8,150 kandies brought in a revenue of Rs. 8,36,684. Thus, while a world of the most heinous crimes was made no longer possible, while their still worse demoralising influence was removed, while trade was largely unfettered, and while the innocent enjoyment of a luxury by the million was favoured, the loss to the Sirkar was brought down to the paltry sum of Rs. 12,294. If this is not a great financial success, what is ? In 1864-65, we find that—

“ Upwards of 100 minor taxes ” were abolished “ at an annual sacrifice of about Rs. 8,500.”

“ The land-tax in Nánjinád having been found to range excessively high, a maximum of 10 *kottahs* of paddy per *kottah* of seed land was fixed, and to this standard all excessive taxation was reduced, involving a loss of revenue to the extent of about Rs. 15,000.”

Another very important financial measure carrying with it great fiscal relief remains to be noticed. “ In the middle of

1863-64, the export and import duties were reduced all round."

"Then again, in the year 1864-65, the Commercial Treaty between the British Government and the Sirkars of Travancore and Cochin having been concluded, duties were very largely removed.

"The relief resulting to trade with Travancore from this treaty may be thus particularised:—

"1st.—Travancore duties on goods imported from or through British Indian or Cochin Sirkar territories have been, with a few exceptions, removed. This relief alone may be estimated at Rs. 1,20,000.

"2nd.—The British Indian duties on the above goods, so far as they used to be levied, have also been taken off.

"3rd.—The Cochin Sirkar duties on the same have also been taken off.

"4th.—The duties which the British Indian Government used to levy on the goods imported into British India from Travancore have likewise been resigned.

"5th.—The duties of the same kind which the Cochin Sirkar used to levy on the Travancore goods imported into its territory, or in transit through it to British India, have been similarly surrendered.

"Trade has thus been freed from taxes, doubtless amounting to some lakhs of rupees."

In consequence of this interportal arrangement, there ensued a very considerable fall in the Customs revenue. While in the year 1862-63 this item showed a revenue of Rs. 5,30,443, in 1869-70 it stood so low as Rs. 3,63,822. It should be mentioned that, by the interportal agreement, the British Government has engaged to pay a fixed sum annually in the way of compensation to the Travancore and Cochin Sirkars. The British Indian tariff of valuations was also universally adopted. With what elasticity trade has risen under the above arrangements will be seen by noticing that in 1861-62 the exports were to the value of Rs. 3,544,653, while in 1868-69 they went up to Rs. 7,276,200, showing an increase of more than cent. per cent.

Under the interportal agreement an evil was certainly inflicted on the people of Travancore, *viz.*, the enhancement of the price of salt. No financial argument, founded though it may be on statistics, can morally justify this heavy tax on a strict necessity of life; and it is not chimerical to hope that a future Cobden or Wilberforce will bestir the humane sympathies of the British Government to remove this burden from the poverty-stricken masses of India. Travancore *was* comparatively taxed lightly in this respect; but owing to British interference, the people of that State have been laid under this the worst of all indirect taxes.

We cannot hold Mádhava Ráo responsible for this, but we yet think that it was in his power to protest against it strongly.

It has already been noticed elsewhere that when the State had been brought to the very brink of bankruptcy during the late reign, and when Lord Dalhousie caused a significant warning to be sent to the late Rájá under the Treaty of 1805, a sum of five lakhs of rupees had been borrowed from the Pagoda to meet the exigencies of the time. In 1862-63, "a sum of Rs. 1,57,000 was paid, completing the discharge of the liability. The sum originally borrowed was Rs. 5,00,000. The interest due on the principal amounted to half as much. The whole sum of Rs. 7,50,000 has been paid off." And Mádhava adds, with excusable pride, that "Travancore has no public debt now."

The whole administrative agency had, when Mádhava Ráo came to power, sunk into a state of utter decrepitude. One main cause of this was the extremely low level of public salaries. Neither the morality nor the efficiency of the service could be improved without raising those salaries to a respectable standard. Also a numerical increase of public servants was but an inevitable necessity of a rapidly progressive administration. Hence, the expenditure of the State in this direction rose, year after year largely. The following statement will show the extent of that increase :—

Year.	Civil salaries.		
1861-62	...	...	Rs. 5,90,935
1862-63	...	...	„ 590,578
1863-64	...	...	„ 6,51,055
1864-65	...	...	„ 6,19,177
1865-66	...	...	„ 6,88,549
1866-67	...	...	„ 6,90,945
1867-68	...	...	„ 7,84,390
1868-69	...	...	„ 8,02,762
1869-70	...	...	„ 8,50,430

In this, the Police establishment alone stood in 1861-62 at Rs. 61,264, and in 1869-70 at Rs. 1,33,242; and the Judicial branch of the service cost in 1861-62 Rs. 85,206, and in 1869-70 Rs. 1,54,969. So in the Police the increase during these nine years was more than cent. per cent.; and in the Judicial establishment not much below that ratio.

The above statement, however, does not represent the aggregate of *all* civil salaries. In the report for 1868-69, a comparative statement of civil salaries between the year 1856-57 and 1868-69 is given, which shows that in the former year they amounted to Rs. 7,73,222, and in the latter to Rs. 11,68,699, presenting an increase of Rs. 3,95,477, or slightly more than 50 per cent.

Excepting a good but select English school, and a good masonry bridge at Trevandrum, both education and public works were non-

existent before Mádhava Ráo's ministry in Travancore. Captain Horsley, while in charge of the British District, was occasionally referred to for professional advice ; but it was in 1860, that a separate Civil Engineer was employed and a department organised to execute works of public utility. The State expenditure under these two heads, for the nine years from 1861-62, stood thus :—

*Public Works. Education, Science and Art.*

1861-62	...	Rs. 2,70,549	...
1862-63	...	" 2,17,380	...
1863-64	...	" 2,60,169	...
1864-65	...	" 4,76,305	Rs. 57,039
1865-66	...	" 5,61,448	" 56,036
1866-67	...	" 5,54,750	" 69,127
1867-68	...	" 5,65,021	" 81,399
1868-69	...	" 6,05,661	" 87,331
1869-70	...	" 9,69,801	" 1,14,545

For the first three years we miss the disbursements under Education, &c. ; but we suppose the item was so small that it merged into some other one. But the figures given show that the expenditure has doubled during six years under this head, and trebled under that of Public Works, in nine years.

Travancore is perhaps the most priest-ridden Native State in the whole of India ; for although in other States large sums are frequently squandered on the Bráhmans and other religious and mendicant classes, those expenses depend on the will, or rather caprice, of the rulers of those States. But in Travancore the ruler himself is not his own master in religious matters. Certain heavy expenses have *inevitably* to be incurred in the performance of appointed ceremonies, besides the current one of feeding *gratis* all Bráhmans *all the year round*. These, together with others of a more domestic nature, have been both numerous and costly during Mádhava Ráo's 14 years' administration. When it is considered that the Rájá himself is not able to do away with these, it is evident enough that Mádhava Ráo could do little beyond preventing unauthorised appropriation of the money spent on them. But the drain on the public treasury is not the less deserving of consideration. The following figures are taken from the Administration Reports for the nine years, showing the usual and extra religious and ceremonial expenses.

1861-62,	Utpurahs or feeding-houses	...	Rs. 3,08,476
"	Marriage of the Junior Rání	...	" 30,076
1862-63,	Utpurahs	...	" 3,16,939
1863-64,	Ditto	...	" 2,95,192
Carried over			Rs. 9,50,683



	Brought forward	...	Rs.	9,50,683
1863-64,	The Murajapam Ceremony	...	"	1,63,611
"	The <i>Pulikudi</i> of the Junior Ránf	...	"	2,659
1864-65,	Utpurahs	...	"	3,06,869
1865-66,	Ditto,	...	"	2,84,550
1866-67,	Ditto,	...	"	3,02,337
1867-68,	Ditto,	...	"	2,87,517
1868-69,	Ditto,	...	"	3,13,117
1869-70,	Ditto,	...	"	3,21,572
"	The Murajapam Ceremony	...	"	1,94,752
"	The Tulápurushadánam (or weighing with gold) Ceremony	...	"	1,61,177
"	The Sacerdotal Thread Investiture of the young prince	...	"	20,690
And we may add—				
	The Hiranyagarbham (or golden Lotus) Ceremony in 1870-71, about	...	"	1,60,000
	Ditto ditto Utpurahs, about	...	"	3,00,000
Total				Rs. 37,69,534

This shows an average annual expenditure exceeding  $3\frac{1}{2}$  lakhs of rupees. We have omitted the Pagoda expenses. The Pagoda lands and endowments were taken into the hands of the Sirkar in the time of Colonel Munro's Residency; and thereafter the revenues of those lands were incorporated with those of the Sirkar, and the expenses met from the public treasuries directly. It may yet be observed that the annual expenditure under this head is  $5\frac{1}{2}$  lakhs of rupees in round numbers.

Now, we have seen that Mádhava Ráo's administration started with an empty treasury encumbered with a heavy debt. The great monopolies were abolished, numerous minor taxes removed, and the Customs duties materially reduced; all this involving a sacrifice of several lakhs of public revenue. Not a single pie was *added* to the taxation, excepting in the case of salt, the responsibility of which rests entirely with the British authorities. Public salaries have been immensely increased to secure honesty and efficiency. Many lakhs of rupees have been spent upon Public Works, Education, and Medical dispensation. Costly ceremonies have been performed, and religious and charitable institutions have been maintained. And yet with all this Mádhava Ráo has come out, year after year, with a handsome surplus. Year after year, the Madras Government has justly belauded his financial success. In 1866, the Secretary of State remarked thus:—

"The financial results of the administration of Travancore for 1864-65 are, on the whole, satisfactory, and the surplus of

Rs. 1,90,770, by which the revenue exceeds the expenditure, appears to have been secured, notwithstanding heavy reduction of taxation, under the enlightened and able administration of the Revenue Department by the Dewan Mádhava Ráo. This surplus is all the more gratifying that improvements, carried out in some cases at considerable expense, have been introduced into other departments of the administration, and that public works have y no means been neglected."

Large cash balances resulted from this able administration, and in 1865-66, Mádhava Ráo wrote:—"This healthy state of the finances is, obviously, in itself, the greatest possible security to the Paramount Power for the punctual payment of the stipulated subsidy; which has, hitherto, been paid with unerring certainty on the appointed date, though it is the largest subsidy paid to the British Indian Government with but one or two exceptions. But the State has deemed it prudent to hold thirteen lakhs of rupees in the British Indian Loan, and thus to make that security still stronger. It is therefore plain that every care has been taken to fortify this State against any unpleasant contingency arising from possible difficulty of a temporary character in the fulfilment of its obligations to the British Government." There cannot be a more practically triumphant response to Lord Dalhousie's "warning" of 1855, that "the contingency against which Article V. of the Treaty is directed is not far distant." And in Mr. Norton's words, Mádhava Ráo assuredly "banished annexation into the shades of night." Mádhava Ráo's financial administration is simply admirable. In his more limited sphere in Travancore he has accomplished, with no rigorous measures, all that the great Indian financiers have done for British India only with the aid of the income-tax and other highly unpopular impositions.

We can only hastily glance over the other but no less important reforms accomplished during Mádhava Ráo's ministry. The administration of justice had been simply shameful, and the Police an engine of oppression and of extortion. In the year 1861-62, the Civil Procedure Code of British India (Act No. VIII. of 1859) was, with a few alterations, adopted in Travancore. The "Penal Code" and the "Criminal Procedure Code" soon followed. The salaries of the judges were largely increased. In 1864, one of the best native judicial officers in the Madras Presidency, and a school-fellow of Mádhava Ráo, Mr. M. Sadasiva Pillai, then Principal Sadar Amín of Madura, was appointed as Chief Justice of the Sadar Court of Travancore. In moral rectitude, in judicial experience, in mature and dispassionate judgment, in the correct comprehension of the aim of legislation, and in powers of application, he has not his superior among the natives of India.

Travancore owes to him no small debt of gratitude for the great reforms which he, with the co-operation of Mádhava Ráo, has effected in the administration of justice. For the Zilla Courts, too, judges, duly qualified by regular legal studies, were in time appointed. The duration of suits in the Courts was brought down to the lowest standard consistent with soundness of justice. Qualified vakils were admitted to plead; while formerly there was no recognised bar, and the haphazard vakils were, in the generality of cases, no better than so many pickpockets. The law of limitation was introduced from British India, in a slightly modified form. In 1869-70, the average delay in the disposal of criminal cases was but seven days in the Courts of Travancore. The Registration Act of British India was also introduced in 1866-67; and its benefits in a country, where petty holdings of land abound, where forgery is almost a normal concomitant of transactions in these, have been incalculable. The department is worked with efficiency and success. The number of moonsiffs was almost doubled, each of the 32 táluks now having one. The jurisdiction of these, as well as of the zillah judges, was much enlarged, and they were invested with powers to decide small causes finally. On the whole, the judicial administration has evinced marked improvement. It is, no doubt, yet susceptible of still further advancement; but it should be remembered that the Dewan has little or no direct authority in that branch of the administration, and the powers of general control of the Chief Justice are anything but plenary.

The Police has, from the beginning of his administration, received the best attention of Mádhava Ráo. In 1861-62, he announced that it was in contemplation "to organise a Police Force somewhat on the plan which has been pursued in the Madras Presidency." The wants of the Police Department were: "1st, increased pay; 2ndly, increased strength; and 3rdly, more method and discipline." These were attended to in due course. We have already seen that the increase of salaries in this department was more than cent. per cent. The salaries of the Tahsildárs, which had been shamefully low, were raised to a respectable standard. But no increase of pay could ensure that attention on the part of the Tahsildárs to Police duties which was necessary; simply because with the innumerable calls on their time on account of revenue, religious, Civil, Commissariat, and a thousand and one other duties, it was physically impossible. To meet this want Police Amins were appointed in such places, which, for want of a better phrase, may be called the *criminal head-quarters*. The chief towns in the country were placed under the care of special Police Superintendents. The more heinous crimes have vastly decreased; so much so that in 1869-70, out of 19,736 cases disposed of, during the year only 310 cases had to be com-

mitted to the Criminal Courts. Petty offences, as petty litigation, must generally be on the increase as society becomes more and more complex. Mádhava Ráo says :—

“Among minor complaints, those relating to landed property are numerous, as they must be in a country where agriculture is the chief occupation. It is not so much that violent trespass is often committed. But a dispute about right of possession or property occurs, and the Police officer is appealed to forthwith ; both parties often taking care to arrange a few harmless preliminaries just to give the case the appearance of a proceeding cognizable by the Police authorities.” This is done because the summary decision of the Magistracy is far less costly and tedious than a regular civil suit. There are now (1869-70) 70 officers and 1,597 constables, besides village watchmen. The most notorious offenders have been apprehended, and organised crime no longer exists. Life and property are secure ; and the strong arm of protection of the Sirkar is confided in by the people generally.

The land revenue for the nine years from 1861-62 stands thus :—

1861-62	...	...	Rs. 14,63,793
1862-63	...	...	„ 16,34,142
1863-64	...	...	„ 16,51,208
1864-65	...	...	„ 16,45,470
1865-66	...	...	„ 16,40,455
1866-67	...	...	„ 16,77,654
1867-68	...	...	„ 16,69,316
1868-69	...	...	„ 16,88,580
1869-70	...	...	„ 16,66,950

This source of revenue is perhaps the least elastic for obvious reasons. But the revenue must rise as the consequence of a new general survey and settlement, which is one of the measures which Mádhava Ráo has, for want of leisure and proper professional agency, not been able to accomplish. The land-tax is very moderate in Travancore, in most cases below one-fourth of the net produce. Unlike our Government, the Sirkar does not claim to be the lord of *all* lands. More than half of the cultivated lands belong to private lords and to pagodas. The Sirkar lands are called Sirkar *Pathám* lands. These paid *rents*, and were, in former days, subject to frequent and arbitrary enhancement of rents. Nothing was easier for one ryot than to dispossess another of his land of this sort by offering to pay a higher rent. This great want of security of possession operated to the marked deterioration of the lands, and to the consequent fall in their saleable value. In 1864-65, a notification was issued by the Maharájá to the effect—

"That the Sirkar hereby and for ever surrenders for the benefit of the people, all power over the following classes of lands \*

\* the tax of which is understood to be fixed till the next survey and assessment.

"That the ryots holding these lands may regard them fully as private, heritable, saleable, and otherwise transferable property.

\* \* \* \*

"That the holders of the lands in question may rest assured that they may enjoy them undisturbed, so long as the appointed assessment is paid.

"That the said holders are henceforth at liberty to lay out labor and capital on their lands of the aforesaid description to any extent they please, being sure of continued and secure possession."

\* \* \* \*

And in Mádhava Ráo's words : "The ryot in possession of Pat-hám lands may hereafter feel that, in effect, *he* is the landlord. He can regard the lands as his own property ; and the wholesome feeling of ownership thus generated, is obviously of inestimable value." Hand in hand with this wise measure, improved rules for the sale of waste lands were introduced ; and year after year, the industrious ryots have been reclaiming waste lands. But perhaps the most noteworthy item is the extension of coffee cultivation. Before Mádhava Ráo's ministry, there was not a single coffee planter in Travancore working in earnest. In 1868-69, "the number of estates owned by Europeans was 50, containing in the aggregate about 14,700 acres. This of course, is apart from the estates and gardens owned by natives both on the hills and in the plains." In the next year "there were about 16,000 acres devoted to coffee cultivation." "Almost all land available for coffee between the extreme south of the mountain range and Agastiar Peak has already been taken up. But between this Peak and the extreme north, there is abundance of land available." In 1869-70, 16,991 cwts. of coffee valued at Rs. 3,38,800 were exported, and paid a duty of Rs. 16,942. Along with coffee the rival staple of tea has begun to flourish in the Travancore mountains ; and the samples sent home lately were pronounced very good by connoisseurs. At Peermade the Sirkar has a cinchona garden. It has received professional visits from Mr. Clement Markham, Mr. McIvor, and Dr. Cleghorn. We subjoin the following interesting statement :—

No.	BOTANICAL NAMES.	COMMERCIAL NAMES.	NUMBER OF PLANTS.	HEIGHT OF THE TALLEST.	GIRTH NEAR THE GROUND OF THE THICKEST.	GIRTH 5 FEET ABOVE GROUND OF THE THICKEST.
					ft. in.	Inches.
1	C. Succirubra ...	Red bark ...	2,952	19 10	22	13
2	C. Micratha ...	Grey bark ...	341	18 0	12½	7½
3	C. Peruviana ...	Finest grey bark ...	109	15 4	12	7
4	C. Nitidæ ...	Genuine grey bark ...	66	7 10	7½	4½
5	C. Condamonía ...	Rusty crown bark ...	74	12 1	9	5
6	Cinchona ? ...	Name unknown ...	10	9 4	6½	6

The cocoanut palm is pre-eminently the characteristic feature of the coast vegetation of Travancore. Almost every part of it is of use. There are millions and millions of these trees in Travancore. In the year 1868-69 the exports of the produce of it brought in Rs. 1,74,097 to the Sirkar's exchequer.

Thus, while great impetus has been afforded to extended cultivation of lands, taxation has been kept under very moderate bounds, and security of possession and freedom of transfer have been fully guaranteed.

We must now turn to public works. No public measures carry with them that popular sympathy and appreciation among oriental nations which great works of public utility do. The ancient glory of India yet lives in the fragmentary remnants of its public works particularly those appertaining to agriculture. Travancore, in its olden days, had its full share of such works. There are no less than three large granite *anicuts* in South Travancore, all more or less damaged by process of time, owing chiefly to the almost entire absence of regard to mechanical principles in their construction. They, nevertheless, bear ample testimony to the genuine public spirit and the noble ambition of the rulers of those days. There is a tiny irrigation channel connected with one of these dams, of which almost a mile passes through heavy granite cutting. An interesting anecdote is related of this cutting. The Rájá of the time (he died in 1758) was personally superintending the work. He was anxious to have it soon accomplished; and one day, he sent up every available man, including his personal attendants, to work at it. Only one man remained with him to hold his umbrella. Even this man was relieved at last, the umbrella being fixed in a hole which the Rájá caused to be bored in the rock on which he sat. The hole is pointed to with love and veneration even to this day, as an interesting relic.

There is a very useful chain of natural lagoons affording internal water-communication in Travancore. These were in two or three places isolated near Trevandrum; and Dewan Venkata Ráo, Mádhava Ráo's uncle, had, during the regency, connected them with some 20 or 25 miles of canal. Since his time no public works of any magnitude could be said to have been accomplished, excepting the single masonry bridge, to which we have already alluded. It was in 1860 that a regular Department of Public Works was formed. Unfortunately, frequent changes in the head of that department have marred its vigour and unity of purpose. Nevertheless, large sums of money have been spent, as already seen, and very satisfactory results achieved. One of the earliest of these is the splendid lighthouse at Aleppy, off which port the sea is generally smooth. Its erection and fitting up with "an illuminating apparatus of the most improved construction" do great credit to Captain Crawford, the efficient and veteran Commercial Agent of the Sirkar. The only road which Travancore had was the trunk line from the capital to the southern extremity, a distance of a little more than 50 miles. This was in so utterly bad a state that carts could not pass during the monsoon and several months after it. This was thoroughly repaired in 1861-62 at an outlay of Rs. 30,000, and has annually been carefully attended to. A network of branch roads, extending in all to between 100 and 150 miles, has been opened in South Travancore of late. A splendid road with very easy gradients has recently been made connecting Quilon with the District of Tinnevely across the Gháts, and traffic has already begun to flow by it in a most marked manner. Two other ghát roads, one running to the Agastiar range directly from Trevandrum, and the other from Aleppy to the Peermade range, have been opened; also a road from Trevandrum northwards crossing and connecting these ghát roads. These trunk roads measure several hundreds of miles, and are constantly kept under repair. Besides these and a tissue of roads in the town of Trevandrum, many lines of unpretending but useful village roads have been made under the direction of the revenue authorities. A costly navigation canal has been excavated in South Travancore, but it remains an isolated work and is only locally useful. By far the most gigantic work yet undertaken is the connecting canal across the "Varkalai barrier." To quote Mr. Barton, the Chief Engineer.—"This scheme was projected 40 years ago, and since at frequent intervals was reported upon and proposed to be undertaken. \* \* \* It has received unusual criticism, but has at last received the approval and sanction of His Highness' Government. \* \* \* The scheme is to complete the line of water communication which (with the exception of this single barrier) exists from Trevandrum

northward to the ports of Aleppy and Cochin, and the whole of the Northern Districts of Travancore and the Railway station near Beypore, a distance of 228 miles." The scheme consists of extending the existing water communication on both sides by deep cuttings in the hard laterite soil, and of boring two tunnels where the crust is too deep for thorough cutting. The cuttings are nearly finished, and the tunnelling is actively progressing. There is every promise of a successful issue of this grand scheme. The length of the larger of the two tunnels will be 1,000 feet, and the tunnels will be lined with masonry. The estimated cost is 4½ lakhs ; but the actual cost may, at least, go up to half as much more.

A splendid iron girder bridge, supported by well-wrought granite basements, has just been opened at Kuliturai in South Travancore. Smaller bridges of the same sort have been put up by scores all over the country. The lagoons have been lit up in several places by means of beacon lights. A large and spacious range of public offices, and a fine Civil Dispensary adorn the capital. A commodious College house is approaching completion. Numerous District Kacharies, Court-houses, School-houses, Hospitals, Thannahs, &c., have been constructed and are under construction. Mr. Barton, the able and energetic Chief Engineer, deserves every praise, while Mádhava Ráo has ever been able to afford an unstinted supply of funds. It is only irrigation works that have been somewhat backward, though by no means quite neglected. This must be attributed mainly to paucity of competent agency. But in the aggregate Mádhava Ráo can, with pride, point to the great and enduring works which have been undertaken during his ministry, and which have inestimably enhanced the material prosperity of the country.

If the public works in Travancore owe to Mádhava Ráo so much, education owes to him still more. There was but one English school worth the name in the whole of Travancore ; and as for vernacular schools there were none. Alive to the great importance of education, as exemplified in his own case, he strove ceaselessly to extend its benefits in Travancore. We have seen how, year after year, the State expenditure under this head has been increasing. The old English school at the capital was greatly enlarged ; three European masters, two of them graduates of English and Scotch Universities, were appointed ; the standard of education raised, and the whole institution better organised. It is now divided into a Collegiate Department, a Junior Department, and a primary school. In 1869-70, the College showed on its rolls 133 students. They are trained to the University examinations even up to Bachelor of Arts' Degree. The Junior Department contained upwards of 400 students. The primary or



preparatory school contained 180 students. As feeders to this central institution there are 16 district English schools spread over the country, showing an aggregate average daily attendance of 1,222 boys. It is noteworthy that "the Christian element already preponderates and appears to be gradually enlarging." These schools, valuable as they are, could not be expected to reach the masses. So, in 1865-66 the great scheme of vernacular education was started; and the Mahārāja's sanction for an annual outlay of Rs. 20,000 obtained. A central school was opened at Trevandrum, and hand in hand with it a Normal School to train teachers. In time district schools were opened. These now number 31, and at the end of 1869-70, contained 2,426 boys taught by a staff of 101 teachers. Besides these, there are two Girls' Schools in Trevandrum, one in Quilon, and another in Patmanavapuram. The girls in one of the Trevandrum schools have shown so much intelligence that it may be mentioned that some of them work sums in simple equations. As an indispensable adjunct to these vernacular schools, new Malayalam books in the form of translations of elementary English educational works had to be produced. For this a Book Committee was established; and it has turned out a valuable series of books containing sound knowledge in chaste language. Its able and learned President deserves prominent mention. In 1870-71, the system of vernacular education has been still more extended. A scheme was started to open in each Proverti, or sub-division of a taluk (of which there are upwards of 250 in the country), an elementary school; many of these have already come into existence; and allowing the low average of 30 boys in each school, there will be more than 7,500 boys educated in them, in the whole country. The whole department was, till lately, under the masterly management of Mr. Sankarasubbeir, than whom the Travancore service does not contain an abler, more zealous, or more conscientious officer.

Hand in hand with education, medical dispensation has been progressing very usefully. There are a large Civil Hospital, a Charity Hospital, a Lying-in Hospital, and a Lunatic Asylum in Trevandrum itself. There are about ten District Hospitals, besides Jail Dispensaries. In 1869-70, the total number of patients who received medical aid in these was 46,019. The Medical Department practically evinced the great skill and assiduous application of the Durbar Physician, Doctor Æneas Ross. Vaccination is also satisfactorily carried on under a special Superintendent. In 1869-70, 56,593 persons were vaccinated.

We are tempted to dwell upon many more interesting features of Mádhava Ráo's glorious administration of 14 years, but want of space forbids us. However, we must make one more quotation from the last of Mádhava Ráo's Administration Repts. He

says :—" In conclusion, it may be briefly observed that it is the cherished aim of His Highness' Government to provide for every subject, within a couple of hours' journey, the advantages of a Doctor, a Schoolmaster, a Judge, a Magistrate, a Registering officer, and a Postmaster. The various departments concerned are steadily progressing towards this consummation." Indeed, he found Travancore in the lowest stage of degradation and political disorganisation. He has left it "a model Native State." He has done a great work. He has earned an imperishable name in India.

It has already been said that the Madras Government have, year after year, been congratulating Mádhava Ráo on his administrative success, and that even the Secretary of State accorded to him high eulogy. It may also be added that the State papers drawn up by him on special subjects, such as Interportal duties, the Boundary question, Territorial interchange, Criminal Jurisdiction over European offenders, and so forth, have elicited approbatory notice from British authorities. Both the late and the present Sovereigns of Travancore have, on various occasions, recorded their high satisfaction. Successive British Residents have borne high testimony to his excellent administration. In 1862, when he visited Madras in company with the Mahárájá, he was appointed a Fellow of the Madras University. When he next visited Madras, following his sovereign, who proceeded thither for his investiture with the Insignia of the 'Star of India,' he received his own knighthood. Lord Napier of Merchistoun, after investing Sir Mádhava Ráo, addressed him thus :—

"Sir Mádhava Ráo,—The Government and the people of Madras are happy to welcome you back to a place where you laid the foundation of those distinguished qualities which have become conspicuous and useful on another scene. The mark of Royal favour which you have this day received will prove to you that the attention and generosity of Our Gracious Sovereign are not circumscribed to the circle of her immediate dependents, but that Her Majesty regards the faithful services rendered to the Princes and people of India beyond the boundaries of our direct administration, as rendered indirectly to herself and to her representatives of this Empire. Continue to serve the Mahárájá industriously and wisely, reflecting the intelligence and virtues of His Highness faithfully to his people.

"The mission in which you are engaged has more than a local and transitory significance. Remember that the spectacle of a good Indian Minister serving a good Indian Sovereign is one which may have a lasting influence on the policy of England, and on the future of Native Governments."

The spectacle, however, was not destined to be very long lived. In April last Sir Mádhava Ráo tendered his resignation to his

sovereign. We need not stop here to enquire into the causes of the resignation.

We can well leave them to be guessed by those who have a correct insight into the internal economy of Native States, and the moral influences seething in them. It will also be remembered that an administrator, particularly of an Indian principality, has daily to refuse favours by hundreds. Be it, however, mentioned to the credit of the Mahārājā that he has settled an adequate pension of Rs 1,000 per month on the retired Minister.

We must diverge a little here, and observe that the chances of a native ruler's choice of his minister falling on a person of Sir Mádhava Ráo's high character, independence, and abilities are very few indeed. The British Indian Government cannot for a moment absolve itself from the responsibility of securing by every legitimate means, good government to the millions who reside in Native States. Every subsidiary treaty in India contains a clause empowering that Government to advise, and binding the native potentates to pay "the utmost attention" "at all times" to that advice. The Madras Government said in one of their letters to the Government of India, "that practically, the intercourse between the Madras Government and the Travancore State has not been confined to the occasional tender of advice under that article. The nomination by the Rájā of his Dewan or chief minister is reported for the sanction of Government."

The most thorough-going friends of Native States and enemies to annexation strongly urge upon our Government to advise Native Princes on administrative affairs generally, and particularly to strive to introduce educated natives of high and independent character into their services. When treaties empower advising, when men like Lord Dalhousie have practically endorsed that provision of the treaties, when the staunchest friends of native chiefs like Major Bell strongly urge it, there cannot be a shade of doubt as to the necessity and propriety of that course. And in what respect can that advice be better given than in the choice of a minister? It is well to show a generous confidence by leaving a chief to name his minister; but it is certainly necessary to reserve the privilege of vetoing that selection if the nominee does not enjoy the *fullest confidence*. If we are correctly informed, the Madras Government has ably managed the question of appointing a successor to Sir Mádhava Ráo.

Sir Mádhava Ráo is still in the prime of life, being under 45 years, and having a good and hardy constitution. Administrative work has been almost a second nature to him. He can well be under harness for ten years more. He had an offer of a seat in the Viceregal Legislative Council during Lord Napier's short viceroyalty; but he declined accepting it, owing, we sup-

pose, to a degree of nervousness about venturing into the climate of Northern India, encumbered with a large family. He had also an offer from Mahārājā Holkār when his connection with Travancore was about to cease. This too he declined, and we think very properly.

The British Government may yet profitably make use of Sir Mādhava Rāo, by entrusting to his administrative care a few districts in some of the Non-Regulation Provinces. The Assigned Districts of Hyderabad were formerly under a separate officer, but now are under the Resident, who has abundance of work without them. The districts are accustomed to be administered by native officers; they cannot be placed under a better native statesman than Sir Mādhava Rāo. Side by side with Sir Salār Jang it would be an honour for him to work. There would be a noble competition between two of India's greatest indigenous statesmen—a competition which would be watched with the greatest interest and the highest expectation, by every true friend of India.

---

### ART. III.—BENOUDHA.

#### PART II.

**V**IKRAMADITYA reigned eighty years,\* a prodigious length of time for a single individual, an usurper above all, to occupy a throne. And yet, strange to say, he is not singular in this respect, for a second example of the same kind is to be met with among his contemporaries, and it is in no other than Vikramāditya's shadow, Kadphises himself! † The coins of the numismatic monarch, as in space they demand more than a single province, so in time refuse to be confined to the duration of an ordinary reign. Lassen allows them just eighty-five years,‡ a term almost exactly equal to that accorded by the fable to Vikramāditya.

The difficulty of so long a reign in the case of Kadphises disappears before the hypothesis that there were more kings than one of that name. Why should not the same key be applied to the solution of the same difficulty with respect to Vikramāditya? Wilford, indeed, found himself able to string together such an assemblage of facts as to constitute eventful lives for no less than *eight* Vikramādityas.§ The inference that has been drawn from this circumstance, however, is not that there were so many, but that all the stories connected with them are alike open to suspicion. But if there be nothing more conclusive against them than their number, we recognise no reason whatever for depriving any of them of their existence; we know of nothing to force us to the conviction that there was but one personage of the name; we are acquainted with several arguments in favour of there having been more than one. If, we may ask, all the best authenticated events in the lives of several modern kings, namesakes of each other, were arranged in chronological order on grounds independent of the recorded dates of the kings themselves, would it be incumbent on us to cast doubt on any or all of those events, simply because they could not all be crammed into the limits of a single life-time. We think not; and are accordingly disposed

\* Fyzabad Report, p. 7.

† As we have alluded to Gondophares, we may cite him as another instance. His name bears an almost literal identity to the designation of the king mentioned in certain old church legends as the ruling potentate of India at the time of the mission of St. Thomas the Apostle; that is, as a legendary being his date

is later by many years than the commencement of our era; as a numismatically-certified monarch, he belongs to a date prior to our era.

Prinsep II., 215, Edr.'s note.

‡ Kadphises I. nach 85 vor Chr. G.

Kadaphis etwa bis 60 v Chr. G.

Kadphises II. seit 24 vor Chr. G. bis etwa 1.

§ Fyzabad Report, p. 7.

to favour the notion of a multiplicity of Vikramādityas. We are then able with the legendary as with the numismatic monarch to explain the long period of his alleged reign by the supposition that it has to be distributed over two or more successions.

We by no means go so far as to say that all Wilford's Vikramādityas ruled over the same provinces or in direct succession. We should certainly find it difficult to assign them all places among the sovereigns of Ayodhyá. Nor again, Kadphises being no more than a title expressive of local connexion, does it by any means follow from the identity of one Vikramāditya with one Kadphises that the two terms are commonly convertible. What we do insist upon is that the unity is established of two individuals, and that the designations they bear being epithets rather than proper names, dynastic rather than personal, the unity extends to the dynasties they belonged to; that the octogenarian Vikramāditya is one with the Yuchi Kings of Kipisa!

No less remarkable than the length of Vikramāditya's reign was the way in which it terminated. "According to tradition, "Rajah Vikramāditya ruled over Ajudhiá eighty years, and at "the end of that time he was outwitted by the Jogí Samudra Pal, "who having by magic made away with the spirit of the Raja, "himself entered into the abandoned body." \* Here there is a little confusion, and just of the description we must be constantly on the watch for in weighing the credibility of unwritten records; it blends into one two perfectly distinct events. The Jogí's trick undoubtedly bears reference to the story of Nandivardhana already quoted. It was Nanda, not Vikramāditya, whose body the Jogí entered, and it was "Nanda's being just dead" that suggested the trick.

The name here given to the Jogí alludes to a perfectly different occurrence which will come under notice presently. We ourselves, however, venture to be sceptical as to either the Jogí or Samudra Pal having taken any part in wresting Ayodhyá or Benoudha from Vikramāditya. He needed neither ghost come from the grave, nor spiritual foe of any kind; there were antagonists enough of flesh and blood for him to measure strength with.

We have styled Vikramāditya an usurper; and we have done so without hesitation, because we do not recollect having ever seen the assertion that he was the rightful and hereditary owner of Ayodhyá. As a preliminary, then, to his restoration of that city, it was indispensable for him to obtain possession of it; and we cannot imagine that the then lords of it, the Buddhist priests, tamely acquiesced in his appropriation of it and submitted without a blow. Here, probably, we commence to discover Vikramāditya's

---

\* Fyzabad Report, p. 7.

adversaries. The picture, that presents itself to the mind's eye is that of Ayodhyá, the theatre of religious war; and we fancy we detect therein the beginning, in Eastern India, of those sanguinary and devastating contests which attended the revival of Bráhmānism and its struggles with the creed of Buddha. "Ayodhyá," says Mr. Carnegy, "is to the Hindu what Mecca is to the Mahomedans and Jerusalem to the Jews;"\* and it is easy also to believe that, while it was in the hands of the Buddhists, it was regarded by the votaries of reviving Bráhmānism much in the same light as Jerusalem was by the Christians of the middle ages, a holy city defiled by the occupation of the infidel; and thus Vikramáditya's expedition against it partook of the character of a crusade.† Nor was it a religious movement alone that was then inaugurated; it was accompanied, according to the legends, by another, a re-migration, similar in its nature to the famous Return of the Heraclidæ of Grecian history.

For Vikramáditya was a Ponwar, a Kshattriya, and thus served to sow the seeds of a social as well as a religious revolution; he and his army were the prototypes of the re-migrant Kshattriyas of later ages. The Bráhmans, with cunning ingenuity, brought to bear upon the champions of their faith the two most powerful influences that can act upon the human mind, patriotism and religion; and the soldier of Vikramáditya, as he marched against Ayodhyá, was animated with the reflection that he had in view the noble purpose of recovering at once the

Ashes of his fathers,  
And the temples of his gods.

Of Vikramáditya's other enemies, Saliváhana was the most famous. The contest between them forms an almost inseparable part of their legendary histories. The Bais clan, who claim descent from Saliváhana, still nurse the recollection of their ancestor's victory over Vikramáditya, and tell how "his amusement was 'to make clay figures of elephants, horses, and men-at-arms, and 'before he had well reached manhood he led his fictile army to do 'battle with the great King Bikramajít. When the hosts met, "the clay of the young hero became living brass, and the weapons of his enemies fell harmless on the hard material. Bikramajít fled, and took refuge in a large Shewála, whither he was

\* Fyzabad Report, p. 5.

† Vikramáditya was according to the legendary accounts a zealous Hindu. As identical with Kadphises he was Yuchi; and "the Chinese annals describe to" "us the Yéchi as zealous Buddhists;" but of "Azes, Kadphises, the Kaner-

"his, no really Buddhist coin has "been discovered. It must there-  
"fore be left undecided whether  
"the Chinese reports did transfer to  
"the Yuchis what was only correct  
"to maintain as of a part of them."  
Lassen's Coins, p. 183.

"pursued by Salivahana. At the mere sound of the boy's voice, "the ponderous gates of the temple rolled back, and Bikramajit "acknowledged his conqueror with appropriate homage. A reasonable arrangement was made on the spot for the partition of "the royal power." \*

As Saliváhana was a Buddhist, we have here apparently another holy war. The last sentence of the quotation probably chronicles accurately the partial disruption of Vikramáditya's empire; but, as Saliváhana has been identified with the great Andhra family of Sātakarni,† it may be assumed that the attack which led to this result came from the south, and that Ayodhyá was not part of the territory ceded to Saliváhana.

Let us now see how matters stood towards the west. Archaeologists‡ tell us, that in the first century of our era, a Naga dynasty established itself in Bharatpur, Dhalpur, Gwalior, and Bandelkhand, perhaps also part of Málwá, as *Ujain*, Bhilsa, Sagar, or nearly all between the Jamná and upper Narbaddá, the Chambal and the Kayán or Cane. From this we can gather why "after Vikramáditya we hear nothing of the empire in Ujjayini,"§ and how Vikramáditya's power came to be crippled in the west; but we know also that in the east the sway of the Nagas never extended to Ayodhyá.

As then, neither Saliváhana nor the Nagas succeeded in expelling Vikramáditya from Ayodhyá, we have no resource but to despatch a third force against him. Magadha might, perhaps, be a promising base of operations; but a more northerly position appears preferable, Kapila for instance. We have already seen that it may have been a residence, perhaps the capital, of the Buddhist kings; and in after ages it is known to have become an important and independent state. We shall do well then, to keep steadily in view such data as may be forthcoming concerning it in seeking and sifting material for the history of Benoudha. Let us see what we can ascertain respecting it at the period of which we write. We discover one single circumstance to throw light upon the subject, but that is one of peculiar importance. "According to Mr. Csoma de Körös," says Prinsep, "the name of Kanishka occurs in the Tibetan works as a celebrated king in the north of India, who *reigned at Kapila*." The same writer, it is true, speaks of Kapila as being in Róhilkhand or near Hardwár, which would remove it far enough from Ayodhyá; but General Cunningham,|| on the other hand, places the two cities in much closer propinquity, and pronounces that Nagar

\* Benett's *Clans of Rai Bareli* III., 1865.

p. 6.

† *Anc. Geog.* p. 526.

As. Soc. Journal. Part I, No.

‡ Lassen, p. 181.

§ Prinsep, I., 38.

|| *Anc. Geog.* s. v. Kapila.



or Nagar Khas in the northern division of Oudh\* beyond the Ghagra river, and therefore in Kosala, possesses very strong claims to be identified with the ancient city of Kapila.

This is, at it were, a bridge over a narrow but otherwise impassable gulf; but once over it we need no longer complain of dearth of matter for argument or conjecture. Kanishka was King of Kapila; and if we question Prinsep further we shall find that Kanishka belonged to a Sakyan dynasty, of *Indian origin*. If we refer back a few pages, it will be seen that some centuries earlier a Saka dynasty ruled over Ayodhyá, and that Kapila was in their dominions. Again, if we consult Lassen's list of Kings,† we shall learn that Kanishka belonged to a dynasty that succeeded the Yúchis; and the same author corroborates the statement that the Kanerkis (partly at least) took possession of the dominions of the Kadphises.‡ The same conclusion is pointed to by the juxtaposition of the coins of Kanerki and Kadphises in Ayodhyá, in Sultánpur and in other parts of India. These remarks apply to Kanishka, and if, as Prinsep surmises, Kanerki and Kanishka are one with the locally famous Kanak Sen,§ they hold equally good with regard to Kanak Sen; what is true of Kanishka is true also of Kanak Sen. All these facts collectively amount to this, that numismatically speaking, the expulsion of the Yúchí Kadphises from Ayodhyá was effected by the Sakyan King Kanishka of Kapila; or which is the same thing interpreted into the language of tradition, it was no other than Kanak Sen by whom Vikramáditya was deprived of his kingdom, Ayodhyá being at the same time re-annexed to Kapila.

Kanak Sen, like Vikramáditya, ceased to hold Ayodhyá before his death; he is said to have migrated to the Panjáb,|| and thence to Gujarát, where he founded the Vallabhi dynasty. Now we know that Kanishka's kingdom embraced much of the Panjáb; and with this fact before us, the direction of Kanak Sen's migration demands particular attention. In the first place, it constitutes an additional argument in support of the identity of Kanishka and Kanak Sen; but its principal importance lies in its guiding

\* What is here meant by the northern division of Oudh is explained by the following passage:—"Ayodhya was the capital of Benoudha, or Oudh to the south of the Ghagra, while Sravasti was the capital of Uttara Kosala, or Oudh to the north of the Ghagra." Anc. Geo.

s. v. Sravasti.

† Prinsep, II., 177.

‡ Lassen's Coins, p. 125.

§ We imagine that in the legends

Kanak Sen rather represents the whole dynasty of Kanishka, than Kanishka alone, just as we have argued that one Vikramáditya represents a dynasty. At the same time, we think it very possible that Kanak Sen was actually identical with the famous Kanishka, and the actual emigrant from Ayodhyá, though not the actual founder of the Vallabhi dynasty.

|| Prinsep, I., 283.

us simultaneously towards the head-quarters of both Kanishka and Kadphises, and so assisting us to perceive that the struggle between the legendary heroes on the east was closely connected with the strife between the numismatic monarchs on the west. We might, perhaps, be justified in believing that we discern here one of those mighty waves of conquest which have from time to time swept over India; starting from Ayodhyá, it gathered strength and volume as it proceeded, to burst in full force and overwhelm the Yúchí power in the north-western corner of the country.

In supporting Kanak Sen's pretensions to the throne of Ayodhyá, we follow both traditional and numismatic testimony; and so to be consistent we should make his lineage agree with that described in both those sources of information. One of them, however, makes him belong to the Solar races, the other indicates a Scythian origin. This is at first sight rather startling, but it need not disconcert us; we have seen precisely the same thing happen with regard to Sakya Muni, for the line of Sakya has been seen to have been grafted on the Solar stem as far back as the time of Suddodhana his father. This being the case, the question presents itself to us whether so similar an account is given of the origin of two different Saka Kings of Kapila in consequence of an independent error regarding each, or whether the one necessarily follows the other. The unscrupulous distortions of fact, occasionally perceptible in Bráhmancial records, permits the conjecture that Kanak Sen was just as little connected with his so-called predecessors in the Solar line as Suddodhana Rájá was with his; and that the one and the other were groundlessly misrepresented to be of Solar origin simply to gloss over changes of dynasty and conceal the vicissitudes of fortune which Ayodhyá the Blessed had experienced. But if the legends and genealogies be accepted as correct, they suggest a train of very different reflections, and tempt us to take a rapid retrospective glance over the history of the six preceding centuries: they tend to show that Kanak Sen was the descendant in a direct line of Suddodhana and Sakya Muni; that during the long interval embraced between the establishment of the Seshnágs on the throne of Magadha and the commencement of the Samvat era, while the doctrines of Sakya Muni were being rapidly diffused over the most distant regions of Asia, his descendants still retained their temporal power and regal position at Ayodhyá or Kapila, and that they were the same with the Buddhist priests who "it has been affirmed were then masters of Ayodhyá, and who "recognized" the Kings of Magadha as their nominal chiefs;"\* that their line terminated with Sumitra, the contemporary of Vikramáditya† for whom it was reserved to compel them to

\* Notes on Races, p. 1.

† Prinsep, U. T., 235.

evacuate Ayodhyá; \* and that when after some years, Vikramáditya in turn had to resign his conquest, it was to a descendant of Sumitra, and no other than Kanak Sen.

Kanak Sen is said to have "migrated" from Ayodhyá. But princes are not in the habit of becoming emigrants and throwing up one crown simply to seek another, so long as they find it possible to retain the one they have in present possession; so we may conceive that Kanak Sen's "migration" is merely an euphemism for his forcible expulsion, *i.e.*, from Ayodhyá; we are not at present speaking of any other part of his dominions. We must, however, see whether there were any causes at work in his vicinity calculated to lead to this result. We readily find one so sufficient in itself that we cease to look for more. First let us examine one or two dates. Kanak Sen's foundation of a dynasty in Gujurát is dated A.D. 144; but we think it will be conceded that there is ample room for doubt whether the emigrant and the dynastic founder were absolutely identical, and the two events, the Alpha and Omega, of Kanak Sen's history occurred in one and the same generation. Some time must be allowed for his sojourn in the Panjáb; and, unless kingdoms were more easily acquired at that period than would appear probable from the number of rivals who were then contending for them, some further period must have elapsed between his departure from the Panjáb and his establishment in Gujurát. The exact duration of these intervals it is impossible to determine with certainty, but we may with safety throw back Kanak Sen's migration from Ayodhyá into the first century of our era. Kanishka's date, as fixed by Lassen, is from A.D. 10 to 40.

Now it was in the first century that there arose the powerful empire of the Guptas, the limits of which are thus defined: † "Princes of the Gupta race will possess all those countries, the banks of the Ganges to Pryāga, Saketa and Magadha." From this passage alone we derive proof positive that, at that period, Ayodhyá again became an appanage of Magadha.

Nor are reasons for hostile collision between the two neighbouring states of Kapila and Magadha far to seek. Even Bráhmical traditions admit that the later Solar princes embraced Buddhism, whence we may infer that it was the religion of Kanak Sen; and it is indubitable that Kanishka was a warm patron of Buddhism. The Guptas, on the other hand, were conspicuous for their support of Bráhmanism; not only did they actively encourage the propagation of that creed; they also signalised themselves by bitter persecution of those who professed the rival faith of Buddhism. Here, then, irrespective of the ever-present motive

\* "The age of Vikrama follows Fyzabad Report, p. 2.

† The supposed subjection of the Buddhists," Marshman, p. 18; see also † *Anc. Geo.*, s. v. Srāvasti, quoting Vāyu Purāna.

of temporal aggrandizement, were causes which might easily induce the one State to take up arms against the other. Diversity of religious opinion, it may be objected, is not necessarily provocative of war: friendly relations, nay, even close alliances, have often existed between states of opposite religions. But the same causes produce widely different results at different times: their action is directed by the temper of the age; and it must be remembered that we are now speaking of an epoch notable for the prosecution of those wars of which we traced the commencement in Vikramāditya's expedition against Ayodhyá.

We now arrive at the conclusion that Kanak Sen's exodus from Ayodhyá was more compulsory than the soft term used in legends would imply; and that it was directly attributable to the nascent power of the Guptas. It is to this event, we opine, that the name of Samudra Pál, above seen to be confounded with that of the Jogí, bears reference; for Pála is but a synonym of Gupta, and Samudra was one of the most famous of that line. With this event, also, unless we abandon Prinsep's conjecture, we are compelled to associate the cessation of Kanishka's possession of Ayodhyá.

To digress a moment. Sáketa and Pryága are named together in the Váyu Purána as border cities. We have already found them occupying that position once before, many ages previously; but how great a change has been accomplished in the interval! They are still landmarks of both religion and political power, but how different is the religious aspect of the country on either side of them! When we first found them in conjunction, they formed the easternmost boundary of Ikshváku's empire, and of the advancing tide of Bráhmanism, of Bráhmanism in its primitive, pre-Buddhistic form, which in its full development was never destined to pass beyond them, while further East lay the various modes of superstition practised by the aborigines: at the time we write of, on the other hand, on the West throughout the tract where Ikshváku had ruled of old, Buddhism had for centuries entirely supplanted Bráhmanism, while to the East lay one of the principal centres of the Bráhmanic revival!

The boundary line of Sáketa and Pryága was soon obliterated, and this brings us back to our immediate subject. The Guptas speedily encroached on the territories of the Nagas, and reduced those princes to subjection; for Ganapati, one of their number, is enumerated in the Allahabad Pillar inscription as one of Samudra Gupta's nine tributary princes of Aryavartta. It is probable enough, moreover, that even this does not adequately describe the rapid extension of the Gupta empire. The Saka era, of which the initial year was A.D. 79, is said to have derived its appellation from the defeat and expulsion from India of the

Sakas by Vikramāditya: the hero of this story has been held to be Chandragupta Vikramāditya of Magadha, and the site of the decisive battle-field is still pointed out at Kahrur near Multán. Here, then, we have a predecessor of Samudra leading his hosts almost to the extreme West of India as early as the year A.D. 79. As we have just witnessed the contest of the Guptas with Kanishka for Ayodhyá in comparatively close proximity to their capital, we may, perhaps, trace therein the incipient formation at Palibothra, the capital of Magadha, of a second wave of conquest, that of the Guptas, similar to the one we saw commence its roll from Kapila.

We may here point out, not without much diffidence, a possible reading of this page of history. Kanishka belonged to a "Sakyan dynasty, to which the term Indoscythic very aptly "applies;"\* and the Gupta coinage is closely connected with the Indo-Scythic, the former being a direct descendant of the latter. Again, on the one hand we know that Kashmír formed part of the empire of Kanishka, on the other Kalhana Pandit tells a story of the conquest of Kashmír by Vikramāditya, of Srāvastí; and the Ayodhyá legends run that "Rajah Sri Chandar † is supposed "to have been called from *Srinaggur* near Badrí Nath in the "Himalayas . . . and to have established his capital at the place "known by the various names of Bastu, Chandávati, Srāvastí "and Sahet-Mahet, near Ekona in the Bahraich district." We seem to be making a new acquaintance in Vikramāditya of Srāvastí; but we soon discover him to have been a persecutor of the Buddhists,‡ and his probable date to have been about A.D. 79; so that by means of the two particulars of character and date we are tempted to recognise in him Chandragupta Vikramāditya of Magadha. If we are right in doing so, we may credit the Guptas with the conquest of Kashmír. Now, to recapitulate succinctly; Kanishka was a Sakyan prince and ruler of Ayodhyá and Kashmír; Chandragupta Vikramāditya founded the Saka era after a triumph over the Sakas; he drove Kanishka out of Ayodhyá, and conquered his province of Kashmír; the coins of the Guptas follow in direct succession to those of the Indo-Scythic princes. This chain of evidence appears to us to render possible the conclusion that it was in commemoration of the overthrow of Kanishka's dynasty that the Saka era was established, and that the battle of Kahrur was the termination of a struggle which commenced in the neighbourhood of Ayodhyá!

During the whole of the Gupta period, Ayodhyá remained an undistinguished province of the Magadha empire; but towards

\* Prinsep, I., 241.

‡ Anc. Geo., s.v. Srāvastí.

† Notes on Races, p. 25.

the commencement of the fourth century A.D., under Budha Gupta, the "dynasty shorn of its high estate was fast verging to "complete extinction." Many of their tributaries simply changed masters and became vassals of the Balhara Kings of Gujarāt ; but we hesitate to say that this was the fate of Ayodhyá for though the Balhara Kings are said to have been lords paramount of India, we can find no such marks of the active exercise of their sovereignty at Ayodhyá as are discernible in connection with their predecessors. Ayodhyá, perhaps, professed a nominal allegiance, but was to all intents and purposes independent. If the subversion of the Magadha supremacy did not lead immediately to the independence of many petty States, it almost certainly paved the way to their creation. Thus, though history is silent about Ayodhyá, we know that in the fifth century, Kapila had its own king not only autonomous, but of sufficient importance to send an embassy to China ; his kingdom very possibly embraced Ayodhyá. Elphinstone, indeed, would contend that Kapila here signifies Magadha ; but as he does not state his reasons, it is important to notice that at the time he wrote, numismatologists appear to have considered that the initial year of the Gupta era coincided with the commencement of the Gupta empire, so that the glory of Magadha would have been at its zenith in the fifth century. But it is now more generally held that the era, was introduced by the downfall of the dynasty ; so that at the time of the embassy there was no King of Magadha for whom the King of Kapila could be intended. In the seventh century, moreover, we know from the testimony of Hwen Thsaug, the Chinese pilgrim, that Kapila was separate and independent.

By that time, however, the individuality of Ayodhyá had been restored ; and here, indeed, we reach a point where the history of Benoudha ceases to be, as it has hitherto been, wholly identical with that of its capital, for both Ayodhyá and its southern neighbour Kusapura are plainly enumerated by Hwen Thsang among the seventy States of which India was composed.

The pilgrim's accuracy on this point has been questioned : the exact measurements of modern times show that there is not sufficient land to furnish forth so many kingdoms of so large a size as he describes. It has consequently been stated that it is almost "certain that several of the minor States should be "included in the boundaries of the larger ones .... that Vaisákha, "and Kusapura and the other small districts of the Gangetic "Doab, Ayuto, Hayamukha, Kosámbi and Pryága were included "in Kanoj ;" and again "in Central and Eastern India all the "different States from Sthāneswara to the mouth of the Ganges "and from the Himálaya to the banks of the Nerbudda and "Mahanadí river were subject to Harsha Vardhana, the great

"King of Kanoj. He was the paramount sovereign of thirty-six "States." But, for our own part, we venture to dissent from this argument; we rather follow Lassen who says that Hwen Thsang's measurements must be received with caution, as is indeed apparent from the numerous alterations General Cunningham finds it necessary to make in them; for we think it more likely that Hwen Thsang was mistaken in the size of the areas of particular States than in the number of States of which the country consisted; the second point admits of easy ascertainment, the first is much more difficult.

We accordingly adopt, in its entirety, Hwen Thsang's statement as to the independence of Ayodhyá and Kusapura in his time. We believe also that they remained in that condition up to the time of the first Muhammadan invasion. In the interval it was that the power of the Bhars and other similar tribes reached its highest pitch; and legends, our only guide on the subject, are unanimous in describing them to have divided their lands into petty States, perfectly unconnected with each other, and among the best known of them an Ayodhyá and a Kusapura. Such also is the picture of the country at that time sketched by the Emperor Bábar: "All Hindustán was not at that period subject to a single Emperor; every Rajah set up for a monarch on his own account in his own petty territories."

---

#### ART. IV.—SELECTIONS FROM INDIAN RECORDS.

*Selections from Unpublished Records of Government for the years 1748 to 1767 inclusive ; relating mainly to the social condition of Bengal. With a Map of Calcutta in 1784. By the Rev. J. Long, Member of the Record Commission. Vol. 1. Published under the sanction of the Government of India. Calcutta. Office of Superintendent of Government Printing, 1869.*

THE Rev. J. Long, as a member of the Indian Government Record Commission, has been able, before leaving India, to issue from the Government Press a very useful book of "Selections from the Unpublished Records of Government for the years 1748 to 1767 inclusive, with a Map of Calcutta in 1784 ;" the latter a curious and suggestive sheet, illustrative of what the "City of Palaces" was nearly a century ago. Unfortunately, for the value of the work, Mr. Long takes into his plan of procedure only the social documents, leaving the political papers to others, a course which necessarily robs him of many interesting records. Political life of a marked character, and capable of making deep impressions on the history of nations, has never been wanting in India. Social life, on the other hand, has always been like a Dead Sea if not of inanity at least of absolute *sameness*, unchanged from age to age. At times, indeed, there has been a surface-ripple caused by the progress of some beneficent or devastating conqueror ; but essentially the life of India has, for generation after generation, gone on in the same channels, and with the same characteristics in this generation and that. The East India Company only troubled itself with the social life of India when social affairs bordered on and affected politics. Hence, we think, the two subjects ought to have gone together ; and instead of one member of the Commission taking the social and another the political, the division should have been made by periods—terms of years—as short as the compilers pleased, but confined within reasonable limits by a fixed rule.

However, Mr. Long's work is now before the public, and we must take it as it is, and glean from it what we can of a strange and eventful period in the history of affairs which have influenced the entire world, and that in a degree little dreamt of by the cursory reader of history. At the time when Mr. Long's records begin, the English may be said to have been about a century in India as a moving power, a force sufficient to affect the magnet of Indian politics in a sensible though, at first, a somewhat imperceptible degree. Our forefathers set down their feet, firmly, on the southern coast, and on the banks of the Hoogly during Cromwell's protectorship. A few years later Bombay came to us as a Royal wedding-



gift ; altogether, during the century preceding the date of Mr. Long's earliest documents, we may be said to have laid down the lines of dominion from the three great gateways of our now splendid empire. Not that those old heroes and statesmen of John Company ever dreamt of the extent to which their work would eventually grow. The wildest English dream never went so far as that ; though there were French dreams, brilliant and not by any means impracticable, which went quite as far, if indeed they did not extend farther, to that empire of the world which Alexander too dreamt of, but never achieved. The men of the English East India Company had no far-sighted dreams, no clairvoyance of any kind, but a remarkable statesmanship in some cases, and an equally remarkable executive power in many more. In fact, we began with executive power, and to that power we owe the perpetuation of our rule. Our competitors on the Hoogly were the French, the Dutch, the Danes, and the Portuguese, to all of which the records refer more or less throughout. The Dutch and English, however, made their factories to rest upon the most practical basis ; and, when the vast energies called into existence by Cromwell's stern reign had to seek new channels under the Restoration, part of the energy flowed eastward, as well as westward, and England may be said to have started foremost in the race both as a conquering and colonising power.

There is no possibility of doubt that the French had those dreams of very extensive conquest to which reference is made above. The brilliant deeds of Dupleix and Labourdonnais seemed to be stepping-stones to empire ; and at one time had to all appearance extinguished the English, even as a commercial power, in India. The tide began to turn about the date at which these records open. About that time Clive may be said to have appeared on the scene. Arcot was defended in 1751, Dupleix went home in 1754, Bussy and Lally henceforth intrigued and fought to no sensible purpose, looked at from this distant time ; Calcutta had been taken and re-taken, and the terrible penalty exacted. In short the great events connected with the names of Dupleix, Labourdonnais, Lally, and Bussy, and with the rise of Clive and his final retirement from India, are all included in this period. At the date when the records open, Warren Hastings was sixteen years of age. He came to India in 1750, a lad of eighteen, and had made a big mark in history before the period at which this volume of records closes.

The first record (25th February 1748) pictures to us the alarm of the factories at a dread rumour that the Mahrattas were upon them. In the following month the rumours grew thicker and more alarming. The terrible horsemen, of whom comparatively little

was known at that time were coming by the Soonderbunds and threatened Dacca ; one party remaining near Burdwan, and other parties scattered over the country pillaging as they came. The Dutch factory of Futtea had been plundered to the extent of Rs. 65,000, by people from Patna. Within the same month the Mahrattas had advanced to Calcutta itself, and had taken Tannah Fort, which, Mr. Long tells us, stood on the site now occupied by the house of the Superintendent of the Botanical Gardens. A month later a number of English boats were stopped by a zemindar near Pulta. The Mahrattas had spread like locusts, and to mend the matter a French fleet was reported on its way to Pondicherry. Towards the end of the month a gentleman whose name will not easily be lost from the page of history—Omichund, the Bengal millionaire, appears on the scene, as an agent of the Company, for the purchase and sale of goods. The following summary of his history is interesting :—

“ Omichund first appears in 1748 as a man of such weight that the Mahratta General on his march to Patna corresponded with him. He had some influence with Seraj-ud-dowlah when Calcutta was taken. He told the Nawab he had never known the English for four years guilty of breaking their word, to the truth of which he took his oath by touching a Brahmin's foot, and that if a lie could be proved in England on any one they were spit upon and never trusted. In January 1757 his effects were ordered to be sequestered for disloyalty, but as there was no direct evidence, the measure was not carried out. Clive describes Omichund as intriguing and recommends him a visit of devotion to Malda. The black inhabitants of Calcutta petitioned that Omichund might not share in the restitution money of 20 lakhs granted to the Bengalis, the Government rejected the petition, though the people shewed that the Nawab's colors were hoisted in his house, his goods were not plundered, and that his two servants conducted the Nawab into Calcutta, broke open the prison house, released the criminals and plundered the town.

“ In 1759 the Bengal Government got a wiggling from the Court for making a contract with Omichund for 58,000 maunds of saltpetre at six Arcot Rupees the maund, when Mr. Parkes contracted at Patna for 51,000 maunds at 2-14 Sicca per maund ; thus the Government lost by Omichund Rs. 70,000.

“ Omichund by his will left Rs. 1,500 to the Treasurer of the Foundling Asylum, the same to the Magdalen, both were paid.”

The Dutch and English drew together, about the same time, as against the French, and the former two allies cut off all communication with Chandernagore. The English Company, however, was almost precluded from acting for lack of money ; and a little later when the Dutch informed the Governor of Calcutta that the French from Chandernagore had broken into the Dutch garden at Chinsura, and hence broken the peace of the Hoogly, the English contented

themselves with an appeal to the Nawab. Here too they reckoned without their host, as men short of money and means for fighting often do. The Nawab instead of answering in the expected way wrote a menacing letter, stating that he had heard bad stories of the English, who were accused of seizing the goods of merchants, Syuds, Moguls, Armenians, and others, on the pretence that the goods were French property; and he enjoined the immediate return of those goods, or he warned the merchants of "a due chastisement in such a manner as you least expect." In this position, at the beginning of 1749, were the founders of the English Empire in India. The dispute between the Company and the Armenians, &c., seems to have been continued during the year. Towards the end of it the English were fined by the Nawab in the large sum of twelve lakhs of rupees, and were made to account for what the King's ships had done to the French. This was held to be a peculiarly hard case since the Company had no more power over the King's ships than over the man in the moon. However, such was their position that anything beyond grumbling was out of the question. The time for something beyond grumbling was fast approaching, with a magnificent destiny for the oppressed Company.

There is nothing in this volume that shows more clearly the progress of the East India Company's power than the references to the Mahrattas. At the beginning of the records, we find these wild and dangerous enemies hovering round the factories, and paying periodical visits, levying black mail, and plundering in all directions, evidently despising the merchants who had their head offices in an obscure place called London, somewhere over the Motea—the gods only knew where. When the plundering was finished the wild men retreated at their leisure with their spoils. Before the end of the volume, in 1764, we find them offering to assist the English with cavalry against Seraj-ud-dowlah. Wonderful change! Clive meantime had appeared on the scene, and had shown that he and his countrymen could take care of themselves, and inflict damage on their enemies. From that time the Mahrattas and many other people were ready to take care of these English adventurers, and help them to inflict injury on all and sundry, except, you know, gentlemen—*ourselves*, your very good friends. It was the world-old principle that "God helps those who help themselves"—who are lucky enough, for instance, to have a hero like Clive (who ought in all reason to have broken his neck at Market Drayton church steeple) preserved to defend, as Clive defended Arcot, and to win, as he won Plassey.

We shall not attempt to carry the reader from page to page through the volume; but instead of that, shall take from it a few memorable facts and incidents bearing on great names and deeds

which were the foundation stones of empire, or which afford such glimpses as can be given by this imperfect record of the social characteristics of the people. Mr. Long says, however, that "unfortunately, for a complete description, the scanty nature of the early records is a great barrier; white-ants, damp, the pilfering of ill-paid dufteries, and borrowing without returning, have reduced the number considerably. But it is remarkable in what a good condition both the paper and ink of those remaining are. The great hurricane and inundation of 1737 must have destroyed many records; but the capture of Calcutta in 1756 swept nearly all away; even the account books and Government Bouds in the hurry of flight were left behind, and the Court of Directors were, in consequence, for years in great difficulties how to balance their accounts. After the battle of Plassey, documents become more numerous; and subsequent to 1772 they are abundant on every subject."

I shall take first the glimpses given of the several European nations who had found a foothold in India. The French appear foremost in intrigue where all were intriguers; three of their pilots appear in palanquins at Balasore and give out that they are in daily expectation of a French squadron. We next find Frenchmen breaking into the Dutch garden at Chinsura, January 3rd, 1749—violating the neutrality of the Ganges. At the same time they are our active commercial enemies everywhere. Indeed, the Company's officers at this time have a strong impression that the French are inconvenient neighbours at Chandernagore, Pondicherry, Dacca, and elsewhere. Five years later, there are alarming rumours that they are fitting out privateers. But their ill luck attends them. The Chandernagore settlement is captured, and Seraj-ud-dowlah is taken, while his French friends are within three hours' march from him. These are a few of many glimpses, mere glimpses, however, given to us in these records of the East India Company's most dangerous rivals in India.

We have like glimpses of the Dutch, who appear, even in these brief records, as far more anxious about their commerce than solicitous for empire. At times they are our very good allies. At times they appear as complainants against our exacting policy; and in such cases these complaints are as a rule promptly listened to both in Bengal and England, neither the Government nor the Company having any wish for a Dutch war. Sometimes we have counter-complaints urged by the English. The Danes first come before us in these records as favouring the French, to the great indignation of the Company's servants; and a Danish vessel is seized. This is in 1759. In the same year they supply provisions to the French. In the following year, the Danish settlement is in danger, and the Governor applies to the Council for cannon, which are refused. In fact the complaints from Danes and Dutch are

incessant throughout the Company's records, though it is remarkable how well and truly the Council scent their real danger, their only formidable adversaries, the French. Almost everything hinges on them, and when power is brought to bear on the other two nations, French influence is always, or nearly always, the ulterior object.

The Portuguese day of conquest had gone before the English Company's began ; but the descendants of the enterprising men who first visited and made so deep an impression on the East remained, and were mixed up intimately with every commercial transaction of the Company. Their competitors were the Armenians, chiefly. Thus stood the affairs of European nations in India before the last decisive struggle between the French and English began. Portugal was virtually drawing out of the contest, but aiming at individual wealth. Denmark and Holland would have been content with armed factories, and a certain commensurate influence on the districts around. England, it is all but certain, had no clear idea that she was founding an Eastern Empire. France alone made no secret of it, that that was her magnificent aim ; and in fighting against that the English Company began to adopt the very idea that they were fighting to extinguish. France sought for empire, and missed it. England, at whatever time that began to be her aim, very soon found that the royal endurance and indomitable will were hers.

Then, we have glimpses which cannot fail to be interesting of historical personages. Clive, of course, is most prominent ; stern, inflexible, dominating everything with which he comes in contact, never advocating the half-and-half measure when the thorough one is possible. If an intelligent stranger, dropped down from the clouds, were to dip into these records he would soon fix upon the one man who, granting life, and accidents apart, would make the deepest mark in the history of India. How loyal and even tender he could also be to his comrades, we find in several instances, such as the death of his old colleague Admiral Watson. Seraj-ud-dowlah also appears, painted by Clive's inflexible hand ; and from the same unsparing pen Omichund stands before us as life-like as if he were on the canvas. Clive admits him to be a useful man, but warns the Council against his intrigue, which is inveterate. Omichund's first appearance in these records is in connection with a theft from the Company. He, acting as the Company's agent, is entrusted with the delicate task of recovering the goods. Rich, and capable, he aims high, plays deeply and never dreams that he is watched by the sharpest pair of eyes, or the sharpest but one pair of eyes, in India ; perhaps the sharpest were in the head of Hastings. We might refer

to a host of sketches—of Nundcomar, and others whose names will remain in connection with the more memorable figures of that marvellous historical picture. Warren Hastings appears in a trading transaction, which he doubtless managed well. Next we find him calmly indignant because the English never are mentioned but with pity and contempt at the Court of Moorshedabad. Again we find him interpreter to the Nawab, as a man "thoroughly agreeable to both" the Nawab and to Colonel Coote who is in consultation with him. In 1763 Mr. Hastings, having done good service to the Council, obtains permission to build a bridge over the "Callighaut Nulla," on the way to his house. As we have already said, these are glimpses merely, not pictures of the men whose names are referred to. Still they are valuable as historical scraps, carefully collected, condensed, and made useful for future reference; all perhaps, that the painstaking, able, and genial compiler ever intended them to accomplish.

Let us now, before closing, take a few scraps of a different kind. There is in the Records a great deal of information about Calcutta. A Charity School of from 12 to 14 boys exists, and the trustees ask for it a grant of blue percepts, or some other cloth, and some stationery; the first time a charity school is heard of, I presume, in Anglo-Indian records. Another item hands down the fact that the seamen of the *Marlborough*, having defended Calcutta, should be rewarded with fifty rupees each, and be informed that the Council highly approve of their conduct. A little later we have votes allowing Roman Catholics and Armenians to live in Calcutta, provided the former are not troublesome, but no Roman Catholic priest or layman is to live in Fort William while the French war continues. A rather important item tells us that military seniority is a failure, and that no regard ought to be paid to it—showing that the need was felt of dealing sternly with stern work; a fact to which we shall again recur when the danger threatens. About the same time it is decided to turn the Calcutta theatre into a church. I might cull facts as to the cutting of the ditch to protect Calcutta, as to the objection of the Council to granting land for gardens within the city—"let people reside there, but as compactly as possible") the establishment of a *dák* from Calcutta to Moorshedabad, &c. At the same time docks are proposed to be made, and sepoy raised for defence of the city, but above all "the French are to be distressed by every means." The President of the Council presents to the Nawab a fine organ clock valued at 5,000 rupees. The Council decides that the junior servants of the Company have no need of the baneful luxury of palanquins. Enemies, European and Native, are around, but the Council are as guarded as ever as to the small points which seem like the thin end of the wedge. A young lady named Campbell

has been shipped at the Downs ostensibly for Madeira. If the ostensible is not the real object, Miss Campbell is to be reshipped at the cost of the owners of the vessel. No ladies, nor gentlemen either, must enter India without the Company's permission.

Here we must take leave of Mr. Long's selections ; we fear the last work of his that we shall have to review as written in India itself, though we hope not by many the last that he will write for India, and for the purpose of making Indian affairs better known in England. He has done the best that could be done with his restricted material. He has given us glimpses of actual life, suggestive of thought to even the cursory reader, and valuable in a more important degree to the students of history. It certainly was a difficult task to separate the political from the social features of the records ; and we think it should not have been attempted, for almost as much trouble must have been needed for the separation as for the after selection. With that drawback, however, Mr. Long's work is well done, as much other work has been done by him heretofore.

J. R.

---

## ART. V.—THE SECT OF “THE ASSASSINS.”

### PART II. THE FATIMITE CALIPHS.

**A**MONG the Arabs there was no division of the globe known under the name of “Africa.” Egypt was not included at all in that continent, and the name of ‘Afrikia’ applied only to the northern parts of Africa, which at present include the kingdoms of Morocco, Algiers, Tunis and Tripoli, known generally as Barbary. This tract of country was divided by them into three parts,—*Further Magreb*, extending from the shores of the Atlantic, to Telemsæ, *Central Magreb* and *Afrikia* which extended, from Oran to the frontiers of Egypt. The great desert formed its southern boundary. The Atlas mountains were its most remarkable natural feature. These extend across the whole of Northern Africa, or to speak more correctly they form a series of parallel chains running north-east and south-west, and separated from each other by level valleys of varying width. The highest parts of this range are the snow capped mountains which separate Morocco from the desert. The next loftiest are the mountains of Aures which extend nearly to the Tunis frontier, and between these are several minor ranges, having rich sheltered plains running up between them, the abundant harvests of which made Numidia in the old time the granary of Rome. As the mountain land approaches Tripoli, the hills and the valleys between them become parched and sterile, and finally reach the frontiers of Egypt—a chain of barren rocks. All the western and more fruitful parts of this strip of Africa were known to the Arabs, as “the land of dates” from the abundance of that fruit which they produced. The date trees clustered round the feet of the hills, and for miles and miles, between the southern slopes of the Atlas and the inhospitable waste of the Great Desert, the interminable groves threw a broad and grateful shadow over the land.

The indigenous inhabitants of this region were known to early historians and geographers as *Libyans*, and there can be very little doubt that these Libyans are the people known in Arabian history as *Berbers*, the descendants of whom are still to be found in the south and west of Fezzan—a tall, noble-looking race of men, fair skinned, though embrowned by the scorching rays of an African sun, and with a certain air of pride, and indomitable love of freedom stamped upon their faces, their actions and their speech.

While the broad belt of desert which encloses the central regions of Africa has preserved them from any violent changes, or any notable part in the world’s history, the northern regions have been again and again the theatre of great events. Here



the great Carthaginian Republic flourished and fell. From the brave and hardy mountaineers of the Atlas she recruited the far famed Numidian Horse, whose swords did such fearful execution on the battle fields of Thrasymene, and Cannæ. Mounted on their small Barbary horses, they needed no saddles, and a halter of twisted rushes served them for bridle. The skin of a lion or tiger was their dress by day and their couch at night. When they fought on foot a piece of elephant's hide served them as a shield. Their onset was dreadful by reason of the speed and cunning of their horses. If unsuccessful, they eluded pursuit by scattering like so much chaff before a gust of wind, till a fresh opportunity arose, when the broken fragments would re-unite with the swiftness of lightning and in one compact body swoop down upon their prey. These mercenary troops were at once the strength and the weakness of the Carthaginian Republic. They were irreclaimable barbarians, with all the virtues and the faults of the savage. Severed into a vast number of tribes, divided from each other by hereditary hatreds, they rejected every attempt to make them abandon this savage and bloody independence. They hated all order, and all masters, good, bad or indifferent. Greedy of plunder, and reckless of life, they fought with rare courage in the armies of the Republic. But they had no love for the mistress for whom they gave their lives. At the least offence their swords were ready to sheathe themselves in the bosom they were intended to defend. The Carthaginians, on the other hand, treated these mercenary troops with that utterly callous indifference to the rights and feelings of "barbarians" which is characteristic of the old world. The mutual hatred long enkindled broke out at the close of the first war with Rome. The army of Carthage rose against the city, and nearly brought her to destruction. The "war of the mercenaries," though ultimately brought to a successful conclusion, inflicted a wound upon the Republic from which she never recovered. It revealed the secret of her weakness. The wandering tribes of Mount Atlas discovered that they held her fate in their hands, and with the characteristic fickleness of the savage, they flocked to the banners of Scipio so soon as he had landed in Africa. And so Rome triumphed, and Carthage fell. The one power was founded upon the rock of patriotism; the other upon the shifting sand of a mercenary army which crumbled away in the moment of need. Nothing less than the matchless genius of Hannibal could have prevailed to maintain the unequal struggle so long.

Carthage fell; the wars against Jugurtha were fought out to their bloody conclusion; the Vandals drove out the Romans; the Romans drove out the Vandals; Northern Africa from one end to the other became a theatre of religious persecution, wasted with fire and sword, but through all these tempests

and vicissitudes, the mountaineers preserved untainted their barbarism and independence. They continued as of old to wander over the desert and build their villages in the valleys running up between the parallel ranges of the Atlas. The poorer classes devoted themselves to the cultivation of the soil; the richer wandered with their flocks and herds from one pasture land to another; each tribe had its own chiefs; and they were in unison upon one matter only. No fixed Government should ever be allowed to restrict the liberty they so dearly loved. Their matchless and innumerable cavalry was ever at the disposal of any one who would aid them in casting off an existing yoke, whether of Carthaginian, Vandal, Roman or Arab. The Berbers were, in a word, the Afghans of Northern Africa; like them devoured by internal feuds, like them fierce and untameable, and too low in the scale of development, to care for aught but the savage unfettered independence of their own Libyan lions; and like them, curiously enough, ranging under four great tribal divisions, the Zenata, the Hawara, the Tanhadja, and the tribes of Ketama. It is necessary to keep these traits in recollection to understand the politics of Northern Africa under the domination of the Arabs.

The re-conquest of Northern Africa by Belisarius paved the way for the victories of the Arabs. Before that event, the land had recovered from the ravages of the first Vandal conquerors, and was rich with the accumulated treasures of peace and prosperity. But afterwards, the insatiable rapacity, and persecuting spirit of the Byzantine Court, kindled the flames of war from one end of the province to the other, and "such" Gibbon tells us "was the desolation of Africa that in many parts a stranger might wander whole days without meeting the face either of a friend or enemy. .... When Procopius first landed he admired the populousness of the cities and country strenuously exercised in the labours of commerce and agriculture. In less than twenty years, that busy scene was converted into a vast solitude; the wealthy citizens escaped to Sicily and Constantinople; and the secret historian has confidently affirmed that five millions of Africans were consumed by the wars and government of the Emperor Justinian." When the warriors of Islam appeared, the slender thread which connected Africa with Europe had been snapped asunder; the Governor of the Province had assumed the rank and title of an independent Sovereign; the Berbers issuing from the mountains spread at will over the open country; and the Arab chroniclers speak with amazement of the many ruined cities their armies passed in their march through the province.

The first expedition of the Arabs was made A.H. 27 (A.D. 647-8). Othman was at that time Caliph, and had entrusted the Government of Egypt to his brother Abdallah. Abdallah sent parties of horsemen

into Afrikia to report upon the country, and the accounts they brought back of its wealth and fertility determined Othman to undertake a regular invasion. The Caliph furnished from his private funds a thousand camels for the use of the poorer soldiery, as well as horses and arms, and bestowed a gratuity upon each soldier enrolled in the expedition. The army was composed of detachments from several Arab tribes, and these, on arrival in Eygpt, were further strengthened until they reached a total of twenty thousand men. Abdallah, the Governor of Eygpt, took command of the whole. He marched swiftly across the desert of Barca, left the walled cities of Tripoli and Cades unassailed in his rear, and attacked the Byzantine Prefect Gregorius, in a plain, twenty-four hours' journey from Carthage—"a vast city" says the *Arabian Chronicler*, "enclosing lofty edifices with walls of white marbles, and thronged with colonnades, and monuments of various colours in immense numbers." The Greek army was completely defeated and Gregorius slain. The payment of an immense sum of money, however, succeeded for a time in inducing the Arabs to withdraw to Eygpt. But the interval of peace was a short one. The rapacity of the Greek Government drove the Berbers into rebellion; they invited the Arabs to come to their assistance; an invitation eagerly responded to. It is impossible to follow the incidents of the war in the confused and rambling accounts of the Arab historians, but it seems that by A.H. 55 (A.D. 675) the Arab rule was firmly established in Afrikia proper. The Governor was the celebrated Okba, and he had built a city—Cairoan—as a point of support from which to push into the interior of the country. The Greeks still occupied Magreb, and had collected an immense number of Berbers as auxiliaries to their regular troops. In that year Okba, at the head of a large army, crossed the boundary line of Afrikia and entered Magreb; the open towns surrendered as he approached: the Greeks and Berbers hung about the flanks of his army, and tried to impede his advance, but he made his way by dint of hard fighting through all obstacles until he reached the furthest coast of Africa, and beheld before him the tumbling billows of the Atlantic. Spurring his horse into the waves until the water reached his chest, he raised his hand to heaven and exclaimed "Oh! God! but for this sea I would have gone into still remoter countries, like unto Zul-karnein, fighting for thy religion, and slaying such as believe in other gods than Thee!" \*

\* Okba here alludes to the following passage in the seventh Sura of the Koran, entitled "The Cave." Zul-karnein, it must be premised, is supposed by the majority of commentators to be Alexander the

Great. "The Jews will ask Thee concerning Zul-karnein. Answer, I will rehearse unto you an account of him. We made him powerful in the earth and we gave him means to accomplish every thing he pleased,

This triumphant advance of Okba had the effect of stilling the turbulent Berbers into a pauc-stricken quiescence; they not only hastened in crowds to tender their submission, but declared themselves believers in the one God, and followers of the Prophet. The land had rest for a brief space. Okba himself was the means of arousing the storm again. He wantonly and grossly insulted Koseila, a leading Berber chieftain. At his summons the clans resumed the weapons they had so lately laid aside, and a countless host swept down from all the valleys of the Atlas, on the handful of Arabs that garrisoned Cairoan. Okba disdained to endure a siege. He broke the scabbard of his sword in token of his resolution to conquer or die, and leading out his small force charged, into the centre of the Berbers who encompassed his capital. He fell fighting desperately; only a very few of the Arabs effected a retreat into Egypt; Koseila took possession of Cairoan, and the domination of the Moslems appeared to be at an end. But the Caliph Abdalmalek, no sooner heard of the heroic death of Okba than he resolved to avenge him. A.H. 69, (A.D. 619-9) Zobeir entered Afrikia with another army larger and better equipped than the one which had been destroyed with Okba. Koseila abandoned Cairoan at his approach, falling back in order to give the Berbers time to leave their mountain homes, and rally round him. The Arabs followed closely and according to their own account made immense havoc amid the retreating mountaineers. But their success was short lived. Zobeir had not advanced far when he heard that a Greek army, encouraged by the late expulsion of the Arabs, had appeared upon the coast of Barca. He hastily retraced his steps, rashly attacked these new invaders with very inferior forces, and he and his troops were cut off almost to a man. Africa had once again cast out the Muhammadan invader. But the Caliph was not to be baffled. A third army made good its footing upon the hardly contested soil. This was in the year 74. This army—forty thousand strong, and commanded by Hassan-ibn-Nooman—for awhile carried all before it. Cairoan was recaptured: the city of Carthage stormed and pillaged, and the Greeks and Berbers defeated in a great battle in the open field. The remnant of the Greek

and he followed his way until he came to the place where the sun setteth; and he found it to set in a spring of black mud, and he found near the same a certain people. And we said, Oh! Zul-karnein! either punish this people or use gentleness towards them. He answered whosoever of them shall commit injustice we will surely punish him in this world: afterwards shall

he return unto his Lord, and He shall punish him with a severe punishment." For the rest of Zul-karnein's adventures, and how he prevented Gog and Magog from ravaging the earth by means of a wall composed of "iron, red hot as fire," and "molten brass," so that they "could not scale it, neither could they dig through it,"—*vide Sale's Koran*, p. 246-7.

army hastily abandoned the country; the Arab was once more supreme. But the Berbers were still far from having been subdued. Koseila had died, but his vast influence had passed undiminished to a woman—*Elkahina* or the Diviner as she was called—who was supposed to have the gift of prediction, and was regarded as more than human by her countrymen. She descended at the head of an immense force from the heights of Mount Auress, defeated the Arabs with great slaughter, and compelled them for the third time to relinquish their hardly gotten prize. But the Arabs only retreated to re-appear in greater numbers. The Sibyl was defeated in a pitched battle, and slain as she attempted to fly. The Berbers exhausted by the indomitable perseverance of Arab enthusiasm, at length sued for peace. They obtained it on the condition of furnishing a contingent of twelve thousand men to aid in the invasion of Spain. "From this time," says the *Chronicler*, "Islam spread itself among the Berbers;" but the change of faith brought no change of character. They remained as much enamoured as ever of their savage independence; they hated their Arab master even more profoundly now that he had his foot upon their neck, than when on equal terms they confronted him in the field of battle. They waited only for an opportunity to assume their old attitude of active hostility. The opportunity was not long in coming. It was furnished by the appearance of a new party in Africa—the sect of the Separatists. These men had originally been followers of Ali, but when he consented to refer his rights and those of Moawia to the decision of arbitrators, they broke away from him and set up on their own account. They declared that in a matter of this kind there could be no arbiter but God, and no mode of arbitration but the bloody decision of the battle field. They held in fact, the old mediæval notion of wager by battle. They scornfully rejected all Ali's offers of conciliation, and a body of twenty-five thousand men appeared in arms against him. Four thousand of these he cut to pieces, but the sect continued to increase in numbers, and it was only after infinite fighting and cruelty and blood shedding, that they were gradually driven out of Irack, some into Haa, others through Egypt into Afrikia and Magreb. These Separatists—known in Afrikia, as Saffrites,—rejected the authority of all Caliphs indifferently; they themselves were the only true Muhammadans; all others were heretics, and as such worthy of death. To slay such was the true Holy War (*Jehad*) and whoever refused to join in this pious work, became *ipso facto* a heretic himself, who was to be slaughtered wherever he was met with, and his wife and children sold into slavery.

These were the precise leaders the Berbers were in need of.

Hitherto they had always commenced one of their fierce outbreaks with a general renunciation of the Muhammadan faith and a return to the unknown worship of their native hills. But their uniform ill success had generated the belief that this Arabian God was stronger far than any they worshipped—that they must have Him on their side if they hoped for success. The Separatists seemed to have brought this secret with them. The Berbers hated the government that was over them—the Berbers deemed that these Arab rulers were an accursed race fit only to be devoured by the sword ; and now these Sectaries came among them with the tidings that such feelings and such acts were exactly those most grateful to the Deity they wished to have upon their side. They found themselves, in a moment, converted into the true believers, and their Arab conquerors, into the out-castes and heretics. The Separatist leaders, who had been hunted like partridges upon the hills, found themselves all at once the leaders of formidable hosts. Afrikia and Magreb became a scene of tumult and blood shedding ; until in the year 124 (A.D. 742) the troubles culminated in a terrible outbreak.

Two large armies came down from the hills to make a joint attack upon Cairoan. But the Arab Governor Hanzala, a man who combined all the religious enthusiasm of the Muhammadan, with a gentleness of heart unwonted in that savage age ; was more than equal to the emergency. He sallied forth from the city and assailing one of the two armies—that commanded by Okasa the Saffrite,—before it could effect a junction with the other, utterly defeated it. He then fell back on Cairoan to repel the second army. But the force he sent out to stay its advance, after great deal of hard fighting which extended over a month, was driven back upon Cairoan with heavy loss. Okasa in the meanwhile had recovered from his defeat, and the two hosts beleaguered the devoted city. The *Chroniclers* with the usual exaggeration of the Oriental, number them at three hundred thousand men. Hanzala, however, was not dismayed. He drew out of the magazines all the arms stored up in them, and made an appeal to the inhabitants, giving to each person that enlisted a complete suit of armour, and fifty *dinars*. This attracted so many volunteers to his ranks that he diminished his gratuity first to forty and then to thirty *dinars*, rejecting all recruits, but the young and vigorous. It was a crisis never to be forgotten by those who with beating hearts and straining eyes watched till the torches of the night had burned out and jocund day stood tiptoe on the misty mountain tops. All round the city the twinkle of innumerable watchfires marked out the lines of the beleaguering host. Within, in the great square in front of the mosque, the glare of the lights showed Hanzala and his chief officers engaged hour after hour in the

arrangement and distribution of the recruits for the morrow's battle. It was for all a question of life and death. A Berber victory would instantly convert the city into a shambles, where men, women and children would be slain indiscriminately. At the break of day the besieged troops broke, every man his scabbard—the usual Arab symbol that death or victory were the only possible alternatives—and marched forth to engage the enemy. There was a terrible struggle, but the courage of despair proved at the last stronger than the force of numbers. The vast Berber host broke and fled; their own numbers encumbered their flight, and rendered impossible the preservation of any sort of order. The victorious Arabs pressed their rear and slew them by thousands. Eighty-thousand in all are said to have perished. This of course is a wild exaggeration. The statistics of oriental histories are simply worthless; but there can be no doubt that whether the loss was great or small, the victory wrought a marvellous and un hoped for deliverance. It was accounted one of the "great days" of the Arabs. "After the battle of Beder," said a warrior of that time who was not present, "I should wish to have fought in the battle in front of Cairoan."

We need not pursue the story any further. Oriental history is full of such exciting scenes, and yet at the same time almost wholly destitute of interest. The reason of this is not far to seek. There is there, no increasing purpose running through the ages, and the thoughts of men are narrowed instead of widened "by the process of the suns." All the elements of greatness exist in it—heroism, endurance, zeal, self-sacrifice—but applied to purposes either selfish or utterly useless, they work no deliverance upon the earth. We find ourselves treading for ever in the same weary mill round of battles and sieges with no other purpose than that of plunder, until, as in Muhammadan countries at present, total inward corruption supervenes upon exhaustion. The above particulars were needful to show the precarious and uncertain foundations of Arab rule in Northern Africa, and the sudden and frequent revolutions of power. When the Abbasides drove out the house of Ommeya and usurped the Caliphate, fresh elements of discord were necessarily poured into this wretched country. New leaders appeared with new claims who were sure of support, if not in one tribe then in another. Shortly after the weakness of the Caliphs, the presence of enemies nearer Bagdad, led to the virtual severance of the North of Africa from the rest of the Empire. The country was broken up into small states, the internal relations of which were in a state of continual flux. At the time when the story of "the Assassins" mingles with the stream of African politics, Afrikia and Magreb were divided between two dynasties, the Edrisites and the Aglabites.

The family of the Abbasides—who had no shadow of right to the dignity of the Caliphate—attained to that dignity by a combination of cruelty and treachery. They obtained the co-operation of the followers of Ali by the pretence that it was for the sake of his family that they had taken up arms against the house of Ommeya, and they displayed themselves in their true character only when the barbarous massacre of the Ommeyas, at a banquet at Damascus, seemed to give them sufficient strength to do so. This declaration, however, was the signal for a series of desperate revolts headed by different members of the family of Ali. Among these leaders was one Muhammad the great grandson of the martyr Hoosain. The whole of the Hejaz, including the sacred cities of Mecca and Medina, recognised him as the legitimate Caliph. He had six brothers, whom he sent forth through all the countries of Islam as missionaries to win adherents to him. One of these, by name Suleiman, after many years of wandering in Egypt and Soudan (the land of the negroes) finally settled at Telemsan in Magreb. He was the father of a numerous family of sons, and these, in their turn, carried on the work of their father, and preached the duty of obedience to the house of Ali through Northern Africa. In the meanwhile (A.H. 169) the Imam Muhammad had been slain with the greater part of his family in a battle near Mecca, fought during the Caliphate of Mahdi; one brother, however, by name Edris, contrived to make his way into Magreb. He found the people well-prepared to receive him, and he speedily rose to the position of a Sovereign with Telemsen as his capital and the tribes of Zenata as his devoted subjects. The dynasty continued to grow and prosper, and at the time when we take up the thread of African History (A.H. 357), Yahia, the eighth prince from Edris, was seated on the throne, with the celebrated city of Fez as his capital.

The Aglabites had their capital at Rekada in Central Magreb. They had originally entered Africa in the train of the representative of the Bagdad Caliph; their courage and sagacity had gradually raised them to the rank of Governors, which the growing weakness of the Caliphs enabled them without much difficulty to turn into an hereditary possession. They were virtually independent though still proffering a nominal allegiance to the ruler of Bagdad. Zyadet Ally—the last Prince of this dynasty, was the Sovereign in Rekada, when our narrative commences.

In the paper preceding this we gave an account of the events which led to the great schism of Islam into the two parties of Sunni and Shia, and the bitter and implacable enmity thereby engendered. The followers of Ali again sub-divided into various sects, but the principal among these was the one great party, still predominant in Persia—the Believers in the Imam. Even this ranged itself



under two heads—the *twelvers*, so named because they make the series of the revealed Imams—*i.e.*, the lineal descendants of Ali and Fatima—terminate with Muhammad-ibn-Askari, who was the twelfth. Of him, they believe that he disappeared in a subterranean spring not far from Bagdad, and that he will remain invisible until the end of the world, when he is to re-appear with the Prophet Elias, at the second coming of Jesus Christ, and become one of the two witnesses spoken of in the Apocalypse. The *seveners*, so called because they only reckon seven Imams, of whom the last is known as Ismail; and hence also their other name of *Ismailiens*. This Ismail was the son Djafar Sadik, who died A.H. 148; the birth of the sect therefore cannot ascend to a more remote point of antiquity. It is, however, more probable, that their doctrines did not assume a definite shape until after the death of Ismail, as his son Muhammad is regarded by the majority of the Ismailiens as the same Imam as his father; and it is in the person of this Muhammad that the dignity of Imam resides for ever. Since his disappearance all those who have been the leaders of the Ismailiens have been only his lieutenants. The expectation of his advent is the most essential part of the system. In his name and under his authority all business is transacted, and every convert is enrolled into the service of Muhammad to be ready to follow and obey him whenever he appears. The Fatimite Caliphs and—nourished under their protection,—the sect of the "Assassins," were followers of this doctrine, with, however, this important modification—that the expected Imam Muhammad or the *Mehdi*, as he was also called, had reappeared and was incarnate in each successive Fatimite Caliph.

Toward the close of the third century of the Hejira, the living representative of the Ismailien Imam was one Muhammad who died A.H. 270, leaving his rights to his son Obeidollah. Among the most zealous and successful missionaries of this persuasion, was a certain Ibn Hauscheb, originally a believer in the twelve Imams, who had been converted in a sudden and mysterious manner to a recognition of the rights resident in the family of Ismail. He resided in Yemen, and he and his subordinates had spread their faith through all that country, and had penetrated even to Magreb, where the Berber tribe of Ketama had been won over. Amongst these missionaries was one known in Arabian History as Abou Abdallah the Shiite, a man deeply versed in all the learning of that age, exceedingly subtle and wise in the formation of his plans; as bold and adroit in his execution of them, and possessed of a singular power of fascination over all inferior minds that came in contact with him. It so happened that a few years before the close of the third century the missionaries resident in Africa died, and Ibn Hauscheb selected this Abou Abdallah as their successor

He accordingly left Yemen and repaired to Mecca. It was the season of the pilgrimage, and he at once took up his residence in that quarter of the city occupied by the pilgrims of Ketama. Without revealing his character of missionary he contrived to insinuate himself into their confidence and friendship. The pilgrims were charmed by the fascination of his conversation, and awed by his piety and spiritual detachment from the world. He, for his part, gradually extracted from them all they had to tell respecting Northern Africa; the different tribes who resided there, their religious proclivities, and the amount of authority that appertained to the representative of the Bagdad Caliphs. In the end nothing would content the Ketama pilgrims short of Abu Abdallah returning with them to Africa and taking up his abode with them, and he, secretly rejoicing, consented. He found the Ketamiens zealous for Ali and the Ismailiens. There he declared his true mission as the man who was sent before to prepare the way for the coming of the Mehdi. The Ketamiens eagerly gathered round him; he was soon at the head of a formidable force, which defeated the Aglabite troops in an encounter in the open field. The Mehdi, he now declared, was at hand, and would enter upon his inheritance, and happy, he added, will be those who shall abandon country and friends for his sake. He spoke at length of the marvels which should accompany his coming, and the victories and splendor which God had in store for him. Then he despatched some messengers to inform Obeidollah of the situation, and that nothing now was wanting to success but his own appearance upon the scene of action. Obeidollah was at this time at Edessa. He set out at once secretly, but the Caliph Moctafi sent intelligence of his designs to Ziadet Ali, the reigning Aglabite, and Obeidollah was seized and placed in close confinement in Sedjelmessa—a city on the borders of the great desert. But Abu Abdallah was now a powerful captain. He assaulted and took Sedjelmessa, and liberating Obeidollah, presented him to the troops as the expected Mehdi. Ziadet Ali, a weak and cowardly sovereign, fled panic-stricken to Egypt, abandoning his hereditary possessions, and Obeidollah was crowned at Rekada at the close of the second Rebi, A.H. 297. Fez—the capital of the Edrissite dynasty—was then besieged, and Yahia only purchased a temporary relief by consenting to hold his dominions as a fief of the Fatimite Sovereigns. Such was the origin of the Fatimite Caliphs of Africa and Egypt—so called from their descent—real or pretended—from Ali, and Fatima the daughter of the Prophet.\*

\* Their claim to this honour is one of the most hotly disputed questions in Arabian History. We have assumed its validity as the most probable conclusion, but there is no trustworthy evidence on the one side or the other. No demonstration would have been clear enough to

Obeidollah's first care, in true oriental fashion, was to destroy the ladder by which he had ascended to his present elevation. Abu Abdallah was arrested on a charge of treason against the Sovereign he had just raised from the dust, and swiftly decapitated. The new monarch breathed more freely, as soon as his powerful subject was no more; but he was too well acquainted with the shifting and changeable character of African politics to suppose that his present supremacy would long remain unquestioned. The tribe of Ketama alone acknowledged him as their legitimate ruler. The rest of the Berbers were separatists almost to a man, and only stunned for a time into acquiescence by the military abilities of the man he had just put to death. He determined to build a city; so strongly fortified by nature and art, that even should his partisans be driven from the open country they might find there an impregnable rallying point. He built in consequence a city on the sea coast, called after himself as the Medhi,—Medhia. It rose, a superb city of white marble palaces, built upon a slip of land jutting out into the sea, and connected, says Abul Fâda, with the mainland, as the hand is joined to the arm. The wisdom of this proceeding was soon made apparent. Obeidollah, indeed, brought a long reign to a prosperous conclusion, but the storm burst in fury over his son and successor, Abul Muhanmad Elkaïem. A separatist fanatic Abu Yazid, a man sixty years of age, and worn down with disease and infirmities had contrived to convince the Berbers of Mount Aures, that he was a Prophet sent by God to sweep the Fatimite Caliphs out of the land. In the year 332 (A.D. 943-44) they burst from their mountain fastnesses and swept like a destroying deluge over the plains. The Fatimite troops were defeated again and again. City after city was taken by storm, and became a scene of the most frightful atrocities. The empire of Elkaïem fell to pieces with even greater rapidity than it had been constructed. The Caliph was shut up in his capital and closely besieged. But here the success of Abu Yazid terminated. The siege was still progressing when Elkaïem died, and his son Ismail-el-Mansour—a young man of rare energy and courage—mounted the vacant throne. Step by step under his conduct, the fierce Sectaries were driven back to their mountain homes. The leaders who fell into his hands were flayed alive, and their skins stuffed with straw, and nailed to crosses in the sight of the army; the rank and file were

---

convince the partisans of either side that their opponents were in the right, and consequently, the testimony in the matter of either Shia or Sunni is altogether worthless. Still one of the two sides must have been correct, and we incline to believe the Fatimite Caliphs were actually what they declared themselves to be, lineal descendants of Ali and Fatima.

either roasted to death over slow fires ; or their hands and feet were cut off, and the mutilated but still breathing bodies, fastened to crosses to linger out the painful remains of life. These atrocities obtained for the ruthless young Prince, the name of "the Flayer." They had, however, the effect of causing the followers of Abu Yazid to change sides with the swiftest rapidity ; and all such tenders of submission were cordially accepted by Ismail. Abu Yazid fled to D'jebal Selat, a precipitous and inaccessible rock rising from a parched desert, which needed eleven days to traverse. Ismail plunged boldly into this sandy solitude, but his soldiers perished of thirst ; his horses and beasts of burden died from want of forage, and he extricated himself only with immense difficulty and severe loss. It was after four years fighting (A.H. 336, A.D. 947-48) that the Sectary and his followers were at last cooped up in the mountain of Kiana, with every passage of escape barred up by the armies of the Caliph. The struggle round this last position was severe and protracted. At length, seeing his troops diminishing every day in numbers, Abu Yazid issued from his intrenchments, in a desperate effort to cut his way through the besiegers. His followers were mostly cut to pieces, and he fell covered with wounds upon the field of battle and was made prisoner. He died that same night, but his body stuffed with straw was carried in solemn procession from city to city. Notwithstanding the death of this formidable heretic, the crisis was far from past. "The wind was down but still the waves ran high," and the existence of the Fatimite Caliphate was yet doubtful when Ismail died, A.H. 339 (A.D. 950-51) or as some say A.H. 341.

Ismail was succeeded by his son, known in history under the title of Moezz-li-din-Allah. Among the freedmen of this prince was a certain Greek slave, by name Djauher. He had been a favourite of Ismail who had him carefully educated under his own eye ; Moezz regarded him with even greater partiality ; he passed him rapidly through all the inferior grades, and finally raised him to the rank of Vizier, and generalissimo of the kingdom. In this last capacity, the task of completing the work of pacification which the preceding Caliph had left incomplete was entrusted to him. This he accomplished with equal skill and success ; and Moezz-li-din-Allah found himself the undisputed monarch of all Northern Africa, from the shores of the Atlantic to the confines of Egypt. But it is not in the nature of an Eastern despot to be content with the widest dominions so long as there is a possibility to acquire any more, and having extended his possessions as far as the frontiers of Egypt, Moezz, as a matter of course, wished to absorb that fertile province also. Egypt, like the other provinces of Islam, had become virtually independent of Bagdad,

and it was at this time ruled by a hump-backed African eunuch, Kafour, who had raised himself from the position of a slave to his present eminence. This man had shown himself equally great as a soldier and a statesman, but he was now well stricken in years, and Moezz deemed it his wisest policy to defer the execution of his plans of conquest until after Kafour's death. This occurred A.H. 357: and the province at once fell into a state of the utmost confusion. The Turkish soldiers mutinied, and under the pretence of arrears of pay, demanded immense sums of money. As these were not paid up immediately, they pillaged the palace of the Vizier, and the houses of his principal friends; while some of them sent messages to Moezz entreating him to assume possession of the province, and engaging to assist him with all their power. To crown all, one of those terrible and desolating famines, peculiar to Egypt, descended upon the province. There are, in the Arabic chronicles, several such visitations recorded; and the terrible sufferings and fearful mortality were such as to be well-nigh incredible. "The river," says Benjamin of Tudela, who visited Egypt, about a century after this time, "overflows once every year, in the month of Elul (August), and inundating the whole country, irrigates it to the extent of fifteen days' journey. The water remains standing on the land during that and the following month, whereby it is moistened and made fit for agriculture. A marble pillar constructed with great skill has been erected in front of an island; twelve yards of this pillar protrude above the level of the river; and whenever the water rises to a height sufficient to cover the pillar, people know that it has inundated the whole land of Egypt to the extent of fifteen days' journey; whereas if one-half only of the pillar be covered, it shows that one-half of the country is yet dry. A certain officer measures the rise of the river every day and makes proclamation in Zoan and in Mizraim in these words, 'Praise God, for the river has risen so and so much.' The measurement and the proclamation is repeated every day. Whenever the water submerges the whole pillar, it produces great plenty in the whole land of Egypt. . . . . Whenever the overflowing of the Nile is suspended, they can neither sow nor reap, and the famine is sore in the land." Then, to quote the figure of Abdul Latif describing one of these terrible seasons of dearth, the year presented itself as a monster whose wrath must annihilate all the resources of life and all the means of subsistence. All who could, fled the devoted country. The poor ate carrion, corpses, dogs, even little children. The traveller would pass through towns and villages tenanted only by the corpses of its dead. Those guilty of the crime of cannibalism were burned to death, but in the extremities of hunger, the very executioners have been known

to tear fragments from the roasted flesh and devour them. It is needless to say that at such a time all the bonds of order must have been unloosed. Civil government was in fact at an end. Bands of kidnappers infested Cairo and the principal cities, who caught passengers by means of hooks let down from upper windows, when they were murdered for their wealth, and not unfrequently as food.

No conjuncture of circumstances could have been more favourable to the designs of Moezz, and he lost no time in acting upon the requests of the mutinous Turkish militia. The invading army was placed under the command of Djauher, and the expedition set forth from Cairo on Saturday 14th, of the first Rebi, A.H. 356. The Caliph had spared no labour or expense to ensure success. Each separate soldier received a gratuity in addition to his pay, and an immense treasure, and abundant munitions of war followed the army. On the day of departure, the Caliph, attended by his chief officers, rode to the camp to bid adieu to Djauher. After some conversation, he ordered Djauher to remount his horse, and then caused his sons, even the heir presumptive, his brothers, and the *emirs* of his court to dismount and pass on foot before the departing general, as the highest mark of honour and confidence he could confer upon him. On returning to his palace, the monarch sent to Djauher his robe and all his apparel, with the exception of his ring, to signify that he was in every respect the representative of his sovereign, and the temporary possessor of the same unquestioned authority. He wrote, moreover, to every city on the line of march, ordering the Governors to receive Djauher with the same honours usually paid to himself; and caused a number of vessels to be laden with grain and provisions for the relief of the distress in Egypt. These were to sail along the sea-coast, regulating their movements by those of the army.

The inhabitants of Fostât—the ancient capital of Egypt—were terror-stricken at the tidings of this invasion. They sent messengers to Djauher, before he had crossed the frontier into Egypt, to treat for the surrender of the capital, and to preserve it from pillage. Djauher conceded all their demands, and advanced toward the city. But Fostât in the meantime was a scene of dissension. The partisans of the former dynasty, and a part of the Turkish militia, renouncing their pacific intentions, determined to oppose the entrance of Djauher. A citizen of Bagdad, and consequently a servant of the Abbasside Caliph, and a bitter enemy of the Fatimites, rising up in the mosque just before the Friday prayers, cried aloud—"Oh! men of Islam, you have given yourselves over to the man who plundered Fez and reduced its people to slavery." Then he passed in review all the evils that Djauher had inflicted upon the people of Northern Africa; and

adured them to drive out from among them those evil counsellors whose pusillanimous advice had brought them to their present evil strait. This discourse made a lively impression upon the fickle multitude. They were now for fighting to the death. All the points of approach to the city were occupied in force. But this newly-born valour proved to be only of the Bob Acres' kind, and oozed away rapidly as Djauher approached. An insignificant skirmish placed him in possession of the city. He refrained from plundering it, and caused proclamation to be made that he would adhere to the terms of the original treaty. This calmed the fears of the people; the shops remained open, and business went on as usual; and the only incident out of the ordinary was, that the exuberant gratitude of the inhabitants caused them to murder the leaders of the war party, and present their heads to Djauher.

On 18th Ramadan Djauher made his triumphal entry into Fostât, with banners borne before him and trumpets sounding; he himself was clothed in a silken robe broided with gold, and mounted upon a superb charger caparisoned in the finest cloths of Egypt. He established his camp on the site of modern Cairo, and proceeded at once to trace out the *enceinte* of the new city and to lay the foundations of the Caliph's palace. He decreed the abolition, throughout Egypt, of all forms or ceremonies which might recall the domination of the Abbasides. He removed their names out of the public prayers, and called in the coin stamped with their superscription. He forbade the wearing of black—the colour of their family—and ordered that all preachers should be clothed in white, and should repeat this formula at the public prayers: "Oh God! shed thy blessings upon thy chosen servant Muhammad; upon Ali the object of thy affection; upon Fatima the virgin; upon Hasan and Hoosain the grandsons of the prophet whom Thou hast purified and preserved from all taint of sin; and, Oh! my God! upon the Imams, the progenitors of the Chief of Believers, Moezz-li-din-Allah."

But the power of the Fatimite Caliphs was still far from being established. They were surrounded with implacable enemies. The adherents of the Abbasides—divided though they might be on minor points—were quite at one in regarding this new heretical dynasty as the very abomination of desolation, standing where it ought not. The "twelvers"—the true servants of Ali as they held themselves to be—viewed with the deepest disgust and indignation the dominion which belonged to them handed over to another, by the inexplicable caprice of Destiny. The Carmathians were still at the height of their power. They had laid Egypt under tribute. The weakness of the government there had enabled them to make with impunity the terrible raid upon Mecca described in our last

paper. The apparition of a power, still in its youthful vigour, and backed up by all the resources in men and money of Northern Africa, was like the first warning note of their hour of doom.

Insurrections soon broke out in half-a-dozen different parts of Egypt. Rebellion, hydra-headed, was destroyed in one place, only to spring up in another. But Djauher was a man of surpassing energy, promptitude, and military skill. He seems also to have been gifted with rare discernment in the selection of fitting instruments to execute his plans. Egypt was quieted by a series of rapid and crushing blows; Syria was invaded and that province added to the dominions of Moezz. But a more formidable enemy was at hand. Hassan-ibn-Alimed, the Carmathian ruler, had had the amazing effrontery to solicit the co-operation of the Bagdad Caliph Moti to destroy the Fatimites. The Caliph rejected the proposal with indignation, declaring the Carmathian and the Fatimite to be, one as bad as the other; but Hassan not discouraged, determined to make the attempt alone. Gathering together a large army, which was further recruited by the relics of the Egyptian insurrections, he advanced against Damascus. For awhile the Carmathian carried all before him. After a brilliant victory the gates of Damascus were thrown open to him, and he advanced towards Ramlah. Djauher, in the meanwhile, had despatched a force into Syria to support the troops already there. But before its arrival, these troops had been cut to pieces in the battle before Damascus, and the reinforcement was compelled to seek shelter in Jaffa, and were closely besieged. Leaving a detachment to maintain the blockade, Hassan marched against Fostât. Djauher was awaiting him. He had encircled the capital with a deep trench; arms had been distributed to the populace, and spies were sent out in all directions to bring the earliest intelligence of the approach of the enemy. On Friday the first day of the first Rebi, A.H. 361, the Carmathians came in sight. The battle raged for two whole days, when the Carmathians were defeated with prodigious slaughter. They fled abandoning their camp, their provisions, and all their treasure. They had never received such a crushing blow. It confirmed the power of the Fatimites beyond the fear of overthrow; and Moezz, after much hesitation, determined upon coming in person to take possession of his new province. He made his entry into Fostât on the 7th Ramadan, A.H. 362, accompanied by his brothers and his children, and all the descendants of the Mehdi Obeidollah. On the 15th of the same month, the Caliph, seated on a throne of gold, received the most distinguished men of the province. Djauher presented them in the order of their precedence. Lastly he came forward himself to offer the presents he had prepared in honour of his master's arrival. These were, 1,—one hundred and



fifty horses with saddles of gold, and bridles studded with precious stones, and inlaid with amber. 2.—Thirty-one silken pavilions borne upon as many Bactrian camels. 3.—Nine riding camels covered with cloth of gold. 4.—Thirty-three mules, seven of which were equipped with saddles and bridles. 5.—One hundred and thirty baggage mules. 6.—Ninety Dromedaries. 7.—Four open caskets containing gold and silver vessels. 8.—One hundred swords enriched with gold and silver. 9.—Two silver caskets filled with precious stones. 10.—A turban studded with gems. 11.—Nine hundred boxes containing an assortment of the most precious objects to be found in Egypt.

We trust we have not entirely exhausted the patience of our readers. We have been tempted into details—perhaps unwarrantable—because, so far as we know, there exists no English account of this most important episode in the history of Islam. To the weakness occasioned in the empire of the Seljukides, by the rising of this new power quite as much as to the Crusades, we owe the preservation of Constantinople, and the time thereby gained, for that consolidation of the European nationalities, which enabled the West to roll back the tide of Muhammadan invasion, when at last the empire of Byzantium succumbed to Othman and his Turks. Hitherto the heretic Shia had been hunted from place to place a mere Ishmaelite, whose hand was against every man, as every man's hand was against him. He had, it is true, broken out again and again into fierce and bloody insurrections, but all such movements were isolated, detached acts of rebellion,—returns to anarchy which all men who had anything to lose, were glad to repress or to see repressed in the promptest and sternest manner. Now they took the field as subjects of a powerful sovereign. The Fatimite Caliphs moreover organised a vast army of missionaries for the secret propagation of their tenets through all Asia. A college was built in Cairo for the regular education of these propagandists. This was named "The Hall of the Sciences." A large sum of money was annually set aside for the payment of the professors and other officials. At the head of the whole establishment was an official known as the chief *Dai* or missionary. This office was hereditary, and descended from father to son, and its duties were manifold. The incumbent had to be thoroughly learned in all the doctrines regarding the descendants of the Prophets, and to give instruction in them. He received all subscriptions for the propagation of the Faith. He held regular assemblies in the Palace for the exposition of doctrines of the sect. These were designated "Conferences of wisdom:" one special sitting was for the *Devoted* or *Initiated*; another for the officers of the court; a third for the general public and chance visitors to the city; a fourth was held in the grand

mosque of Cairo for women; and a fifth in the palace for the benefit of the ladies and female slaves resident in the Harem.\*

Admission into the body of the Fatimites was gradual; the neophyte having to pass through nine successive grades of initiation. We have already stated that the difference between the Ismailiens and the other followers of Ali was, that they only acknowledged seven revealed Imams; while the others increased the number to twelve. The difference is said to have arisen in this way. Djafar Sadik—the sixth Imam—had four sons, the eldest of whom was Ismail, whom also he designated as his successor. One day, however, Ismail had the misfortune to be discovered in a state of inebriety, and Djafar Sadik disinherited him, declaring that he could not be his son, but a demon who had assumed his similitude. His second son Mousa was then declared to be his successor to the dignity of the Imam. The majority of the believers in the Imam accepted this decision, and on the death of Djafar Sadik transferred their allegiance to Mousa. But a small portion who held all the positive prohibitions of the Koran to be only allegories, remained attached to Ismail, and on his death to his son Muhammad. In their eyes the inebriety of Ismail was a virtue rather than otherwise, as a positive proof of his acceptance of an inner and hidden meaning in the precepts of religion. Between the disappearance of Muhammad, and the dynasty of the Fatimites, seven lieutenants or representatives of the Imams succeeded each other. These are styled the concealed Imams, because they had to conceal themselves

\* Silvestre de Sacy gives the following extract from one of these discourses. The speaker wishing to prove to an audience of women that it did not suffice to know God and the doctrine of the Unity without a knowledge also of the Imam and his ministers proceeds as follows:—"If any one among you says 'I have acknowledged the unity of God; I have never failed to make this confession of faith, and I can have no need of a Mediator,' the perception of the truth is hidden from that woman. Have you not heard in the conferences of wisdom that which has been spoken of a *torch*, which in its perfect state represents the religion of Unity, but which ceases to be a torch as soon as its several parts are divided from each other. Then the wax by itself is called 'the wax'; the wick 'the wick'; the flame 'the flame'; the chandelier 'the chandelier'; but

when all are united—the wax, the wick, the flame and the chandelier—these together constitute the complete torch. Know then, oh! female believers in the Unity! why this parable has been set before you. It is in order that you may know you cannot attain to a right apprehension of the religion of Unity unless you include in that apprehension all the ministers of that religion. Has it not been declared to you in these conferences that the Koran is a living being? When its chapters, its grand divisions in ten and in five parts, and its verses are all combined into one, then the Koran is complete; but when its chapters are divided and parted one from another, no one would call that a complete Koran. When entire it is the symbol or representative of the Imam, and men call it the 'Word of God.'"

from the persecution of the Caliphs. It is to the fourth of these concealed Imams, who lived about the middle of the third century after the Hijira, that the system is attributed of initiation by degrees. To understand this and its power over the mind we must try to gain some perception of the mental condition of the people of that time.

The great endeavour of what considers itself as pre-eminently "Modern Thought" is to get rid of the supernatural altogether; and we have so hoodwinked ourselves with phrases about "Nature" that many suppose this to have been done, and rank the achievement among the greatest of the nineteenth century. But the Physicists are, in truth, still very far from having the dominion of existence to themselves. The supernatural is blended indissolubly with the stream of our ordinary life. Any one who puts forth his hand or foot, to check a rolling stone, puts forth a *supernatural* power which counteracts a natural one—the action of gravity—*supernatural* we say in the most literal meaning of the term, because it acts under no compulsion, is self-originated, and may be put forth or withheld at pleasure. In like manner, every triumph of man over nature, from the time when the first savage fashioned his spear of flint, to these days of Atlantic cables, and locomotion by steam, are a series of victories won by supernatural power over the forces of nature. All the marvels of painting, architecture, sculpture and poetry, all the refinements of civilisation are the results of this supernatural power, compelling nature to obey its behests, and give expression to its thought. So long as Man exists, the supernatural cannot be excluded from this visible universe. That which Modern Science has done for us, is not to remove the supernatural out of the universe, but to evoke order out of seeming anarchy. Her torch has dispelled that huge shadow host of secondary agencies—Djins, Divs, Genii, Fairies and the like—wherewith a younger world was perplexed and tormented. And this she has done so completely, that most of us find a difficulty in conceiving how any human beings ever regarded them as credible. Still there are moments even in our lives, when we are conscious of feelings as if those old beliefs were attempting once more to force an entrance into the mind. At times of undisturbed communion with nature,—on the lonely summits of the hills, or in the deep silence of woods,

The fair humanities of old religion

The power, the beauty and the majesty

That had their haunts in dale or piny mountain,

revive again, and the world seems as in days of old, to be endowed with a conscious life. But most of all is this feeling strengthened when we are in any danger from the fury of the elements. Then we can readily apprehend how the untutored intellects

of an earlier world, should have imagined a personal agency directing the *fury* of the sea or the *pitiless* pelting of the blinding rain. And so it is, that even to this day, the men who are most prone to this—shall we say superstition—are precisely those whose lives are most exposed to moving accidents by flood and field. There has rarely been a great general, without his "lucky day" or "his star of destiny," or some other *deus ex machina* to lighten the obscure, and give hope in seasons of difficulty. Sailors have constructed quite a pantheon of lesser deities out of Mother Carey's chickens, and materials of a like kind. And there is not, in truth, a single superstition about the invisible world that haunted the regions of Islam, the counterpart of which may not be found flourishing under the patronage of the Church in any Roman Catholic country. In the times and countries of which we are writing, every influence combined to give a morbid activity to such exercises of the imagination. Science, as we understand it, had absolutely no existence, and the life of man was one long struggle with the ruthless forces of nature. In later times indeed, some of the more intelligent Arabs declared the earth to be globular, but at this period few would have dissented from the orthodox opinion that it was flat, spread out "as a bed," or "as a carpet." Round this flat earth was "the circumambient ocean," and around this again, closing in the entire universe, were "the mountains of Kaf," composed of green chrysolite, and inhabited by countless multitudes of Djins or Genii—the enemies of men. The inhabited portions of the earth, compared with the unknown regions, given up to deserts and demons, were as a tent pitched in the midst of the desert. And even here, such favoured spots as the gardens of Damascus, were but oases blooming in a vast and dreary ocean of sand. The appalling solitude, and still more appalling dangers of those sandy wastes, were the parents of innumerable superstitions. "In this world," says De Quincy, "there are two mighty forms of perfect solitude—the ocean and the desert; the wilderness of the barren sands, and the wilderness of the barren waters. Both are the parents of inevitable superstitions—of terrors, solemn, ineradicable, eternal . . . . . Voices seem to blend with the roaring of the sea, which will for ever impress the feelings of beings more than human; and every chamber of the great wilderness which, with little interruption, stretches from the Euphrates to the Western shores of Africa has its own peculiar terrors both as to sights and sounds. In the wilderness of Sin, between Palestine and the Red Sea . . . . . bells are heard daily pealing for matins or for vespers, from some phantom convent that no search of Christian or of Bedouin Arab has ever been able to discover. Other sounds, trumpets, the *Alala* of armies, &c., are heard in other regions of the desert. . . . .

... Forms, also, are seen of more people than have any right to be walking in human paths; sometimes forms of avowed terror, sometimes—which is a case of far more danger—appearances that mimic the shapes of men, and even of friends and comrades." The mind which has thus once fairly lost its equipoise, seems powerless to regain it. The one feeling or faculty to which it has subordinated its other capacities rules over them with absolute power. The Moslem became a slave to his imagination. The life of man was hedged round on every side with occult and malignant powers; his entire existence was dependent upon charms, amulets, the prayers of exceptionally good men, or the magic of exceptionally bad. The whole course of his history—incessant tumult but no progress, endless change without any apparent purpose—fostered this belief in a capricious Power—or rather in a host of capricious Powers—presiding over the destinies of the world. Every thing within or around him being utterly inexplicable,—being altogether a maze without a plan—there could be no degrees of credibility. Centuries of close discussion have enabled us to fix with tolerable precision the boundaries of human knowledge. But the Moslem walked the earth with all the "blank misgivings of a creature moving about in worlds not realised." What was the secret of it all; the hidden principle of life that assumed these innumerable forms? "A hair," so writes a Persian Poet of this very era :—

"A hair, they say, divides the False and True;  
Yes; and a single Alif were the clue,  
Could you but find it, to the Treasure House,  
And, peradventure, to THE MASTER too."

The essence of the Shia doctrine, as we explained in our last paper, was devotion to the Imam. For this end, the Koran was said to have an outer sense in which it was received by the vulgar, and an inner which could be apprehended only by the spiritual few. This inner sense was in truth nothing but a negation of morality, which was swallowed up in the one duty of devotion to the Imam. The chiefs of this sect perceived plainly that men, however depraved they might be, could seldom be brought to accept such teaching all at once. Many men, too, there were, who had no wish to emancipate themselves and their fellows from all moral restraints. Different characters needed different modes of approach. It behoved the good missionary to become all things to all men, if by any means he might convert some. He discovered his doctrines bit by bit; a small number only were admitted to the innermost grade. The one doctrine common to every neophyte, was a blind and absolute obedience to the Imam, who was held to be incarnate in the person of the Fatimite Caliph. This formed the first stage in the process of initiation, and was effected in this fashion,

The *Dai* having accosted this or that man, and engaged him in a discussion upon theology, would ply him with such questions as these,—why had God created the world in seven days?—why had he thought proper to make seven heavens and seven climates—why did the first chapter of the Koran contain only seven verses—why were there twelve months in the year—what was the hidden meaning of the rites during the pilgrimage at Mecca—why was man alone upright among animals—why had he ten fingers and ten toes, no more and no less—what meaning was involved in certain enigmatic expressions to be found in the Koran—with many others too numerous to mention. In general, such questions shook the soul of the Moslem with fear and anxiety. He knew that there were marvellous powers in the mere word 'Allah' whereby men could annihilate time and space, liberate themselves from this prison-house of flesh, and traverse the realms of air, as disembodied spirits. He knew, or at least he believed, that magicians and enchanters could peer into the secrets of the heart, could make the forms of the absent appear by the power of their art, could compel beings of supernatural power to fetch and carry for them like household drudges, bought in the slave market: and that these marvels were possible mainly by the use of incantations—the mysterious power resident in language. The puzzling queries propounded by the *Dai* seemed to place him at the very gate of similar mysteries. But how to enter in? The *Dai*, as soon as he saw that his shaft had struck the mark, became as reserved as he had been communicative. He had nothing further to state except this—that an oath of unconditional obedience was the indispensable condition of further knowledge. The oath being taken, the second degree was entered upon.

In this, the inquirer was instructed that to the Imams alone had been entrusted the duty of teaching the Faithful, and that all the calamities which had fallen upon Islam were due to the abandonment of these true Teachers, for so-called Doctors, who had neither knowledge nor authority. The fourth degree made the inquirer acquainted with the special tenets regarding the Imamate held by the Ismailiens. This degree was of great importance. The inquirer was taught that since the creation of the world there had been seven "Periods," each distinguished by its own peculiar religion, promulgated by its special legislator or prophet. Adam, Noah, Abraham, Moses, Jesus, Muhammad, and lastly Muhammad the son of Ismail, were these seven legislators or prophets. In Muhammad, the son of Ismail, terminated the cycle of old faiths with their positive precepts, and inculcation of the letter; and with him began the knowledge of that mystical significance latent in all the preceding religions. The proselyte who passed through this

grade; ceased by that very act to be a Moslem; since contrary to the positive prohibition of the prophet, he acknowledged a prophet posterior to Muhammad. In the fifth degree, the mind of the inquirer was imbued with a contempt for the Traditions, and the letter of the written Word. All moral commands, he was instructed, and all religious ceremonies were to be explained allegorically. Then some faint adumbration of the Pythagorean doctrine of numbers was brought in, to strengthen the special doctrines of the sect. Thus the seven Imams were declared to be figured and foreshadowed, in the seven planets, the seven heavens, the seven climates, and so forth. Each Imam had twelve principal ministers to make him known throughout the world, and these were symbolised in the twelve signs of the Zodiac, the twelve months of the year, the twelve tribes of Israel. The sixth degree made known to the proselyte the mystical sense concealed beneath the letter, resolving everything into the one duty of obedience to the Imam. Very few, however, of the proselytes advanced so far as this; and still fewer, even among the missionaries, penetrated further than this sixth degree. In the seventh degree, the proselyte was made to observe that each one of the great prophets had had an assistant to preserve and propagate his doctrine; thus Abraham had his son Ishmael; Moses, Aaron; Jesus, Simeon; Muhammad, Ali; and finally Ismail, the last of the Imams, had his son Muhammad. This species of duplicity he was then taught to perceive extended through the whole constitution of things. From the creation of the world there had been two living principles—the higher, *that which gives*—the lower, *that which receives*; the one, male and life-giving; the other, female and life-bearing. The object of this grade was to destroy the doctrine of the Unity by asserting the co-eternity of matter. The eighth degree developed this doctrine further. The two co-eternal principles, under the designation of *that which precedes* and *that which follows* were fused together into a vast and shadowy system of Pantheism which represented good and evil, joy and sorrow, pleasure and pain, as manifestations of one changeless essence—a constant *becoming*, or everlasting process of evolution not unlike the operations of Hegel's famous principle of identity. Before this last revelation the entire fabric of past faiths crumbled into ruins. The miracles by which Prophets had enforced their teaching were merely an allegorical account of the rising of one religion on the ruins of that which preceded it; the resurrection, the end of the world, the last judgment, the distribution of rewards and punishments, were figurative expressions to signify the recurring cycles of the stars—the death and new birth of all living things, from the inherent affinities and organic properties of matter. Arrived at the ninth degree, with his own former faith, as well as every other

shattered into indistinguishable ruin, with every precept of morality merged in a vague Pantheism, which converted the world into a terrible and unmeaning chaos; the proselyte was cast loose, to enjoy his freedom if he pleased, or should he prefer it, to choose from among the systems of philosophy, that which pleased him best. Coleridge has remarked on the appalling power of evil which the most insignificant man could put forth, who had completely emancipated himself from the dominion of conscience. Such men were the instruments the Fatimite Caliphs sought to frame, not without success, for their warfare with the Caliphs of Bagdad; and in the person of Hasan Ibn Sabah, first Grand Master of "the Assassins" they gave a terrible proof of the truth of Coleridge's remark.

Hasan Ibn Sabah, when yet a youth, was the companion and friend of two eminent men—Nizam-ul-Mulk the illustrious Prime Minister of the Seljuk Sultans, Alp Arslan and Malek Shah; and Omar Khayani, the astronomer and poet, whose name is in some degree familiar to English readers by the beautiful translation of his *Rubaiyat*. The Prime Minister has given an account of this connection which we reproduce from Mirkhond's History of the Assassins. "The Imam Mouafik, Nishapori," he writes, "one of the most illustrious doctors of Khorasan was every where held in honour, and his society sought out as a source of good fortune. It was the general opinion that all young men who were educated by him in the knowledge of the Koran and the traditions, obtained the favours of fortune. It was this belief which induced my father to send me from Thous to Nishapore. Two young men of my own age, Hakim Omar Khayam and the unfortunate Hasan Ibn Sabah, had also been entrusted to the care of the Imam a short time before I came. They were both gifted with excellent abilities, and we struck up a close friendship. Omar had been born at Nishapore; and Hasan Ibn Sabah had as his father, Ali, a man who led an austere and ascetic life, but who professed erroneous opinions, and was, in a word, suspected of heresy. Abu Moslem Razi, Governor of the province of Rei, where Ali dwelt, was remarkable for the purity of his faith and his zeal in the cause of orthodoxy. He openly declared himself the enemy of Ali; and the latter sought by lying words and false oaths to exculpate himself from the accusations of the Governor. As the Imam Mouafik Nishapori was held to be a model of right thinking and orthodox belief, this unfortunate man to remove from himself all suspicion of heresy, sent his son to Nishapore to study under the Imam. As for himself, he retired into a monastery, and devoted himself to a life of religious seclusion; at times, nevertheless, he was accused of an heretical attachment to the



doctrines of the Motazales; and at other times, of scepticism and atheism. He claimed to be of Arabic extraction of the family of Sabah Homāni; and said that his father first settled at Kufah, then at Kom, and finally at Rei. But the people of Khorasan, and particularly those of Thous, wholly discredited this statement, asserting that his ancestors had all along been inhabitants of that province. To come however to my tale; one day Hassan said to Khayam and me, 'It is a generally held opinion that the pupils of the Imam come to greatness; and doubtless, although the three of us cannot hope for equal good fortune, some one among us will verify the universal conviction regarding the Imam. In such case, what agreement shall we three make together?' 'Whatever you propose,' we replied. 'Well,' said he, 'let this be our engagement, that whoever among us shall attain to wealth or honour shall hold his possessions as common to all three.' We agreed to this proposal and bound ourselves by promises. The years went by, and I became Prime Minister to Alp Arslan; Hakim Omar Khayam came to me, and I did my utmost to fulfil the letter and spirit of our engagements." Omar Khayam would however take nothing, but permission to live at peace in Nishapore, on a small pension. "At Nishapore," adds the Vizier, "thus lived and died Omar Khayam, busied in winning knowledge of every kind, and especially in astronomy, wherein he attained to a very high pre-eminence." The wise poet had no wish to stretch himself upon the rack of this tough world. He has left us his philosophy of life.

Some for the glories of this world; and some  
Sigh for the Prophet's paradise to come;

Ah, take the cash and let the promise go  
Nor heed the music of a distant drum!

Were it not folly spider-like to spin  
The thread of present life away to win—

What? for ourselves who know not if we shall  
Breathe out the very breath we now breathe in!

"As for Hassan," proceeds the Vizier, "he had remained obscure and unknown the entire reign of Alp Arslan, and it was not until the time of Malek Shah, that he came to Nishapore, and made himself known. I received him with the greatest honours, and strove in every way to acquit myself honourably of the engagement I had contracted towards him when we were both young men." \* In short Nizam-ul-Mulk obtained for his former friend an influential place at Court; and Hassan at once commenced to use his new position to plot the ruin of his benefactor. A long series of

---

\* The above passages though printed in literal rendering of the Persian, but ed in inverted commas are not a condensed paraphrase.

plots, and counter-plots terminated in Hassan having brought himself into a position where he was in imminent danger of losing his head. He fled from the Court of Malek Shah, and after escaping many dangers and long wanderings he passed into Egypt and entered the service of Mostansir, the reigning Fatimite Caliph. It is important to note this incident. Malek Shah was a supporter of the Bagdad Caliphs and a Sunni, and only as an orthodox Moslem could Hassan have entered into his service. The ease with which he passed from orthodoxy to the atheism of the Ismailien, is the first evidence we have of that utter callousness of conscience which made him such a terrible scourge of the human race. Mostansir assigned him a residence in Cairo, and distinguished him by other marks of favour. At one time his prospects were so bright, that people spoke of him as about to become the Prime Minister. These changed with the swiftness characteristic of an Eastern Court. "A man is not perfect," was the maxim laid down by the Vizier of the Caliph Al-Mutassem, "unless he have abilities sufficient for elevating to the pulpit his friend though a simple soldier of police, and for sending to the gibbet his enemy, though a Vizier ;" and a rival who had both the will and the capacity to act upon this rule of conduct converted for Hassan, the prospects of a Viziership into the reality of a dungeon in the Castle of Damietta. He was, however, released ; and returning to Syria, spent three years preaching the tenets of the Ismailiens in Bagdad, Ispahan and other places, and making a great number of converts until A.D. 1090, when, partly by force, partly by stratagem, he obtained possession of the Castle of Alamut. Alamut (*i.e.*, the vulture's nest) so called from its impregnable position, is the largest and strongest of fifty castles which he scattered about the district of Rudbar, at the distance of sixty parasangs north of Kasvin. This he resolved to make his capital, and he proceeded at once to strengthen the fortifications ; he caused a canal to be dug, bringing water from a considerable distance to the foot of the castle ; and planted groves of fruit trees around the cliffs on which the fortress was built. It was here too, that he reduced to a system the vague plans of aggrandisement he had now cherished through so many years of misfortune and obscurity.

Hassan perceived that in Central Asia, torn and distracted as it was, it needed only a ruthless tenacity of purpose for a man situated as he now was, to become a formidable potentate. The endless confusions of that period had filled Central Asia and Syria with hordes of armed men similar to the "Free Lances" who roamed over Europe during the long wars between France and England. Their military skill and practised rapacity were at the disposal of any one who could hold out pay or prospects

of plunder ; and Hassan Ibn Sabah, possessed of a strong fort, would have had but to hold up his hand, to collect abundant partisans around him. But this, the established method of carving a way to a throne, was too coarse and uncertain for his political subtlety. He had seen all his life that thrones built up with a mercenary soldiery for foundation never resisted a single defeat. He must contrive some plan whereby he should at once fix himself deeply in the hearts of his subjects, and the fear of him not less deeply in the hearts of his enemies. The appearance of religious zeal should effect the one ; and the secret use of the dagger, the other. It should be his to weld together into one cutting and irresistible weapon, the unquestioning devotion of religious fanaticism, and the cold calculating prudence of utter inhumanity. He perceived that hitherto the Ismailiens had committed a fatal error in their method of proselytism. They had not been sufficiently careful to conceal the atheism and anarchy which lurked at the root of their teaching. Hassan determined this should no longer continue. These tenets were now withdrawn into an impenetrable obscurity even from the mass of his own followers. To the world in general he stood forth—as a follower of Ali it is true—but also as a Moslem adhering strictly to the positive teaching of the Koran ; demanding from his subjects a rigorous abstinence from wine, and the due and proper fulfilment of all the rites required of the Faithful. For the purpose of inculcating this return to the zeal of a primitive faith, he created a hierarchy of seven grades, which spread themselves through all Asia. And, as it always must be, that times, when disorder, misery, and irreligion are at the highest, are also those when thousands of devout hearts long most earnestly for a spiritual reformation ; the efforts of these missionaries were eminently successful. But behind these, and concealed from the knowledge of the world—an inner circle within the larger—were initiated carefully selected proselytes into that secret training which should fit them to become the co-operators and lieutenants of the Ismailien chief. This, as at Cairo, consisted in passing the student through a variety of grades up to the inculcation of the utter indifference of human actions. Hassan was himself Grand Master of the Order ; next to him came his grand Priors or Lieutenants scattered through Persia and Syria, as the sect gradually won adherents in those countries ; then came the *Dais* or missionaries—the teachers of the secret doctrines ; the *Rasceek*, or those engaged in learning ; then the *Devoted* or those who had taken the oath of unquestioning obedience ; and lastly the *Aspirants*, who waited for the permission of the Grand Master to commence the process of initiation. Of these different classes, the one with which we are chiefly concerned is the *Devoted*. These supplied the murderers.

They were young men selected on account of their physical strength and courage. The whole object of their training was to inspire them with a spirit of absolute and utter submission to the Grand Master founded upon a conviction of his divine authority. There were two elements in the faith of a Moslem which rendered this object more easy of attainment than at first sight it appears to be. Muhammad, as we stated in our last paper, addressed God as the Merciful and the Compassionate, and these epithets were invariably attached to His name. But His mercy and compassion extended only to the Faithful. Unbelievers were to be cut off simply as such by fair means or foul. Had not the blessed Prophet himself slaughtered a whole Jewish tribe numbering some seven hundred men after they had surrendered themselves to his mercy? Had not the blessed Prophet moreover, once and again—some three or four times in fact—made use of the secret dagger and the midnight assassin to rid himself of rivals who were dangerous to himself and enemies of God? The practice of assassination then, was established by the most valid precedents as an equitable proceeding provided only the authority was good who gave the order. Hassan Ibn Salah would not therefore lack instruments to execute his purposes if he could only convince them of his *right* to command them. The Muhammadan conception of Paradise rendered this a not very difficult matter. Sometimes in these latter days there is an attempt made to persuade people that Muhammad in his description of Paradise did not mean veritable damsels, or the veritable pleasures of the flesh. These things, we are asked to believe, were an allegory; and there is no doubt that in the palmy days of Bagdad, the contact with Greek philosophy and the infiltration of Christian thought operated as most potent solvents on the coarse materialism of the early Arab faith. Philosophic minds—"the Wise" as they were designated—dealt with the legends of the Koran, precisely in the same manner as the Neo-Platonists treated the old Greek mythologies. Muhammad's Paradise as well as much else, vanished in the most unmeaning jumble of language and ideas that ever styled itself 'Philosophy' since the foundation of the world. The streams of heaven and hell became the pleasures and pains endured during the time of the soul's progress and regress. The rivers of milk were held to signify rivers of knowledge for noble persons; the celestial wine served out to the Faithful was the removal of terror and fear and sadness; and the dark-eyed Houris, "concealed in the pavilions" were scientific secrets hidden from the eyes of the profane by a veil. But certainly the Faithful in Islam rejected these heretical notions with scorn and indignation. "It is related (in the *Hak-ul-Yakeen*) that Abubaseer addressed the Imam Sadik,

saying, "May I be your sacrifice! O descendant of the Prophet, excite my desires for Paradise." The Imam replied, "There is a river in Paradise on whose banks maidens grow, and whenever a believer passes and is charmed with one of them and takes her away, the Most High causes another to grow in her place." "May I be your sacrifice!" said the man, "still more increase my longing desire." The Imam continued, "Every believer will have seven thousand virgins, four thousand women, and seven thousand Houries." "May I be your sacrifice!" exclaimed Abubaseer, "will every believer have seven thousand virgins?" "Yes," rejoined the Imam\* and then proceeds to enter into the most delicate details regarding "the marrow of their ankles" which will shine through "their seventy dresses" with other particulars quite unquotable. This seems to us tolerably decisive on the matter. At any rate, whatever is the case with the Moslem generally, Hassan Ibn Sabah knew his followers too well to introduce the allegorical method of interpretation into the Prophet's description of Paradise,—and the process in his hands of manufacturing a *Devoted* was very simple indeed. One of these young men would be asked to the table of the Grand Master, and while there laid under the influence of a strong opiate. While still unconscious, he was conveyed away to a delicious garden, and there awoke amid the perfume of flowers, and the cool splashing of fountains, with crowds of dark eyed and obsequious damsels, flitting around him. After a few days passed in this Paradise, he was again rendered insensible and retransferred to the light of common day. To an illiterate uneducated mind, what stronger proof could be given of the supernatural power of the Grand Master? Paradise was no longer an anticipation; he had actually seen it and tasted of its pleasures. The momentary agony of death alone divided him from their unbroken fruition. He was only called upon to obey and die. Faith had been turned into sight.

Hardly, however, had Hassan established himself in Alamut, than he was assailed. The Sultan Malek Shah despatched a force with orders to take the castle and exterminate the defenders. Hassan was on the point of capitulating when one of his lieutenants, Abu Ali, who was making proselytes in Kasvin, sent three hundred men who effected a junction with the garrison, and in a night attack completely dispersed the besieging force. This check only stimulated the determination of Malek Shah. He ordered another body of troops to march; this time against Hassan's Lieutenant, Hossain Kaini, who was preaching with great effect in the mountains of Kohistan. Hossain took shelter in one of the hill forts and was

\* Cited by the Rev. T. Merrick, in *Muhammad. his work on the Life and Religion of*

blockaded. To extricate his Lieutenant, Hassan had recourse for the first time to the dagger. Nizam-ul-Mulk, the aged minister of Malek Shah, was stabbed to death ; and Malek Shah followed him to the grave a few weeks after, not without strong suspicion of poison. This occurred A.H. 485 (A.D. 1093), and the anarchy that immediately ensued enabled Hassan Sabah to consolidate his power. The vast kingdom of the Seljukides was torn in pieces by the struggles of rival claimants, and Asia from Herat to the Caspian Sea resounded with the tramp of marching armies.

R. D. O.

*(To be continued.)*

## ART. VI.—THE BENGAL COMMISSARIAT.

### PART III. (*Conclusion.*)

“**N**OUS avons changé tout cela.” This familiar quotation is ordinarily accepted as the embodiment of a somewhat capricious sentiment of a too fickle people; but, rightly interpreted, it will be found eminently suggestive of modern progress. The apophthegm has a double significance. It may either be regarded in its retrospective sense as the positive affirmation of a plain fact, or it may be taken as an announcement on the part of the speaker of a determination to desert old grooves entirely, and to be guided in thoughts and actions, present and prospective, by an altered and improved order of ideas and circumstances. To know when to adopt the sentiment in its latter sense and put its precepts into practice, is to possess a rare sagacity and prevision worthy a great statesman. Much undoubtedly has been done of late years in India to remove the quondam stigma, that were British rule withdrawn, no evidence of its pre-existence would remain, save in the ubiquitous presence of empty beer bottles; but still it must be confessed, that the chrysalis of European civilisation has taken, and is taking, an uncommonly long time to inchoate in this country. The fault, it is believed, lies in the several Governors-General succeeding Lord Dalhousie, either having failed to appreciate the situation presented to them in the manner above commended, or, to their having been kept in leading strings, and bound over to a policy provided cut and dry for them before leaving England. Though the stagnation complained of is general, in no direction is it so manifest as in the military policy of the country, which as a subject-matter cognate to this article must be briefly adverted to.

In the pages of a certain Blue Book, ordered by the House of Commons to be printed on the 17th August 1871, will be found several valuable minutes, recording the opinions of very high authorities on the subject of Indian Military policy. Before proceeding to notice these, it may be useful first to explain the *raison d'être* of the said Blue Book itself. The very voluminous correspondence it contains, covering nearly 400 pages, appears to have been educed by a despatch from the Secretary of State, dated 26th January 1869, wherein the Duke of Argyll “in considering recently, in Council, the present state of taxation in India” discovers, that no reduction can be made in civil charges, but, suggests, that the military expenditure should be reduced, and to this end, that a searching review of all its branches should be made “on the same principle as that adopted in 1859-60.” Army

and Garrison Staff, and the Commissariat, Barrack, and Stud Departments, being more particularly pointed out as promising possible retrenchments. The late Lord Mayo's government, while declining to appoint a commission like that of 1859-60, somehow, for it is not satisfactorily explained on what grounds, but it is presumed under financial pressure, and probably seeing no other expedient open, jumped to the conclusion, that reduction in the strength of the army, European and Native, was demanded by the Secretary of State. Accordingly four or five schemes were elaborated, each exhibiting great reductions in strength, to the extent of 9,000 men in the Native Army alone; but none of these met the approval of His Grace of Argyll, who objected to them mainly on the ground, that the major portion of the reductions proposed in the Native forces would fall unequally on the Madras Army. Meantime, Lord Napier of Magdala became Commander-in-Chief, and backed by the puissant Horse Guards, objected to reductions in strength in toto, and raised his warning voice with such effect, that the idea of completing those under projection was finally abandoned. The Duke of Argyll in retiring from the position he had taken up, reminded the Indian Government, that in his original despatch he had never hinted even at reduction of strength in troops, but had merely hoped for saving in military expenditure through more economical management without sacrifice in strength. The general result was, that a few divisional commands were abolished, a few changes were made in the pay of the officers of the Body Guard, an Eurasian Battery of Artillery was disbanded, the services of two European Cavalry Regiments were dispensed with, and the cadres (not rank and file) of fourteen Batteries of Artillery were reduced. In short, a comparatively insignificant saving in expenditure was effected. Great cry and little wool. Yet, though they missed the true mark, the Duke of Argyll and Lord Napier of Magdala had reason in their opinions, each from his own point of view. On the one hand, who with the slightest experience can doubt, that a considerable saving in expenditure, civil as well as military, could be effected by a rigorous and intelligent scrutiny of the details of all its branches. To cite an instance in point, all authorities mentioned in the Blue Book referred to, unanimously concurred in opinion, that no decrease in the expenditure of the Commissariat Department was possible through administrative action; whereas, Part II. of this Article has indeed been written in vain, if it does not point to a far different conclusion. The appointment of a self-seeking and expensive commission like that of 1859-60 is indeed to be deprecated, but surely there are members of the Council, who could bring the requisite industry, independence, and ability to a task so important. On the other hand, who, after reading the



Blue Book aforesaid, could remain unconvinced that Lord Napier had good reason for strenuously resisting all diminution of military strength as premature and impolitic, if not indeed dangerous.

No less is it certain, however, that great saving in military expenditure can only be expected from organic changes in the military policy heretofore pursued. These changes on the other hand cannot be safely attempted until the completion of the North-Western and North-Eastern Frontier systems of railways and arterial strategic lines, enabling the forces serving in the various Provinces of the empire (except Burmah) to co-operate freely and act as reserves one to the other; and, until a disarmament of the Native States, and a general disarming of their peoples, have been effected. It may be well to quote the opinion of the late lamented Lord Mayo on this important point, expressed in a singularly lucid and statesmanlike minute, dated 3rd October 1870. "It is possible, that the forces of the Native chiefs, who are individually friendly to us cannot be relied on. The existence of such armies is no doubt an evil in itself. I think that many of the arrangements made after the mutiny were unfortunate in this respect." But this brings the schemes of military policy above adverted to on the tapis.

The late Sir Henry Durand, and Sir William Mansfield (Lord Sandhurst) had each an alternative scheme. The former proposed, that the Commands-in-Chief at Madras and Bombay with the staff and offices thereto attached should be reduced; and, that there should be either only one Commander-in-Chief for all India with full executive power, but having no seat in Council, or that there should be a Commander-in-Chief for the forces north of the Nerbudda line, and another subordinate Commander-in-Chief for those stationed south of that stream. The latter scheme, though fathered by Sir Henry Durand, was not strongly advocated by him. Sir William Mansfield proposed.—I. The appointment of a War Minister for India on a similar footing, and position to that held in the French army. The war minister to remain always with the Supreme Government, and to have control of all departments of the Army, Pay, Ordnance, Military Works, Commissariat, etc. etc., included. Further, that there should be five Lieutenant-Generals commanding distinct Corps d'Armée in Madras, Bombay, including Central Provinces, Government of the Punjab and Sindh, Governments of the North-West Provinces and Oudh, including Malwa, Rajpootana, and Central Provinces north of the Nerbudda, and the Governments of Bengal and Burmah. These Lieutenant-Generals to have military functions only. II.—Or that the commands at Madras and Bombay should be abolished and no other change made.

These schemes may be very scientific and ably conceived, and the first proposed by Sir William Mansfield is unquestionably so, but it is hardly probable, that any one of them will be carried out in its entirety. Still considered collectively in conjunction with the remarks above made, it may be accepted, that sufficiently reliable premises are afforded, wherefrom to cast the promised horoscope of the Commissariat Department with tolerable accuracy.

The changes anticipated will lead in natural sequence to the following results, each affecting, more or less, the future of the Commissariat Department.

I.—Obliteration of all distinctions between the present presidential limits, as far at least as military purposes are concerned.

II.—The assumption by the State of the direct control and management of the frontier and other strategical lines of railway, including the telegraphs therewith connected.

III.—The reorganisation of the different transport services.

IV.—The redistribution of troops, garrisons, and magazines. Let these points have seriatim consideration. The extinction of presidential limits will obviously have the effect of centralising all military control, and will thus affect the "personnel" of the Commissariat, in common with that of other Army Departments. Only one Commissary General will be needed, who, it is hoped, will have direct communication with the Government, and be held strictly responsible for the economical as well as efficient working of the Department throughout India. Of course the present Departments in each presidency will become amalgamated. This unification will have many good results. A wider field of experience will be presented to the officers and employes generally, tending greatly to the increase of their efficiency; while the advantages and defects of the different systems obtaining in each of the presidencies will be forced into contrast, and comparison. An *entente cordiale* will be established amongst the superior officers, and a more elevated *esprit de corps* induced, through the extinction of petty inter-departmental jealousies, of the existence of which evidence was not wanting when the Bengal and Bombay Commissariats were brought into contact during the Abyssinian Campaign. What saving by reduction in the number of offices and establishments may be possible will much depend upon whether troops are more or less concentrated, but probably some may be expected. On the other hand, assimilation of the systems of account, and the abolition of separate offices of audit, will be attended with great general convenience, and no small diminution of expenditure. Uniformity of system will also not be without a certain effect in reducing and equalising prices. It might further be shown, that the establishment of a unified Imperial Commissariat for India

will not be without influence on civilisation and progress, if the Department be regarded as a vehicle of disseminating more advanced and cosmopolitan ideas through the medium of its large clientèle of intelligent native contractors and agents.

Much has been said, and even sung, in eulogy of the railway as the great pioneer of modern civilisation, and tomes of volumes have been indited illustrative of its value as a promoter of the arts of peace. Its uses and effects in war would appear, however, to have engaged a comparatively limited measure of attention, particularly in insular England. For this reason probably, no general maxims, for its suitable employment as an ancillary element of military power, have been available for guidance in India, where the railway system has been initiated, and is still being developed, without subordination to any intelligible principles of strategy whatever. Were other proof of this wanting, sufficient might be found in the fact, that the military force in the North-West or Trans-Indus frontier, which, as to its vulnerability by an external force may be regarded in its relation to the Indian empire, as the very heel of Achilles, remains to this day unsupported by the wings of modern war, as railways may not inaptly be styled. It is luckily not too late, though doubtless difficult, to retrieve this great error; and it cannot be too strongly urged, that to this end a commission, competent to the task should even now be appointed to determine upon a strategical system of railways—frontier, seaboard, and internal.

The cost of maintaining standing armies has been called the insurance paid for the security of national property. Hence, whatever tends to render the insurance more reliable, must be a matter of primary importance. Some high military authorities have been inclined to undervalue railways as an auxiliary to military power in India; but it is monstrous to suppose, that the superior mobilisation, and rapidity of assuming the offensive rendered possible through their possession, can be without great effect on both the strategy and tactics of any army, far less of the British army in India, against which, be it remembered, no such power can in turn be opposed. The main objections urged against railways are, the facility with which they can be destroyed, and that, when the possessors are no longer able to hold the country in which they exist the value of the railways to them ceases. These statements taken as affirming *truisms* are incontrovertible, but may be judged tantamount to a denunciation of human inventions in general. It may be safely concluded from previous experience, that all the races and tribes of Hindustan are never likely to be arrayed together at one time against their conquerors. Such being the case, were the land encompassed by a net work of railways, the destruction of a few of the

meshes would simply have the effect of isolating temporarily the tracts they had intersected, just in the same way as one damaged compartment of an iron vessel may be secluded, without the safety of the vessel itself being seriously compromised. It is also to be said, that the facility with which a railway line is obstructed, or destroyed, may conversely, on occasion prove a positive advantage to a force retreating on its reserves and resources. As regards the second objection, it is argued, that though a railway may become useless to its possessors in case of their having to abandon the country in which it exists, still it need not necessarily afford aid to the enemy. Indeed in India, it is very unlikely to do so; while the possession of a line of rail may often, as Lord Mayo justly remarked, enable a position to be held which could not otherwise be so.

Public opinion in England in 1868-69 was strongly expressed in favour of the assumption by Government of the direct management and control of railways and telegraphs; and, as a consequence, the telegraphs actually passed into Government hands. The railways would have shared the same fate, had the capital been forthcoming to redeem the country from the evil consequences of a quarter of a century of legislative blunders in permitting the construction of railways at haphazard, whereby vast sums were sunk, and wasted on lines which were not needed, and a ruinous over-competition induced. Like considerations, and others of still graver political and military urgency point to the advisability, nay necessity, of railways and telegraphs in India being placed under the sole control of the Government. Their construction, maintenance, and working should be entrusted to the Government engineers, military and civil, while the traffic management of the railways, as also the business details of the telegraphs, should be confided to the Commissariat Department. Of course it would be necessary to train officers specially for these new duties; but, once a skilled staff was secured, it is believed that both railways and telegraphs would be worked with equal efficiency, and with much greater economy, than at present. It is obvious, that in the event of military operations on an extensive scale being necessary, it would be of the first importance that the means of transport should be at the ready disposal of the generals; and that no small advantage would accrue from the railways and telegraphs being administered and worked by officers experienced in the requirements of an army, and accustomed to provide for its wants. Again, Government would assuredly gain considerable increase of influence and patronage, to say nothing of other greater collateral advantages, by assuming the direct control of railways and telegraphs. Notably, there would be no necessity for separate telegraph lines and a separate telegraph

department such as at present exist, nor for a separate staff of consulting engineers.

Before leaving the subject of railways, there is one point more which demands a brief notice. There is no need to renew here the battle of the Gauges, or to import into this article any discussion of the comparative merits of the broad and narrow systems of railroads; at the same time a hope must be expressed, that for all strategical lines a uniform gauge may be adopted affording adequate carrying power for ordnance of at least medium calibre, and for the heavier munitions of war. It is feared that this desideratum has too frequently been lost sight of in deliberations on this question. Further, it is essential, that a sufficient number of waggons of suitable construction should be provided on all main lines for the conveyance of heavy war material. The value of this latter suggestion will be at once manifest to those who may have experienced the difficulties in despatching heavy artillery and munitions by rail, where only the ordinary rolling stock was available for its accommodation.

With the development of railways, the means of transport at present obtainable for service with troops will of necessity undergo considerable change. Doolie bearers will soon find their occupation gone, and will not be available for hire. It will therefore be needful for Government to maintain a trained establishment of bearers of its own. These men should be enlisted for a fixed period of service and should form part of the transport corps hereinafter advocated. As an expeditious and tender means of conveying wounded men to the rear in action, the doolie stands unrivalled; while too high praise cannot be accorded to the moral courage displayed by the doolie bearers, who in the discharge of their merciful calling, have ever been found willing to bear no inconsiderable part of the risks, without sharing in any of the glory and excitement of battle. The advantage of doolies for conveyance of sick or footsore men on an ordinary march is not so apparent. In the first place, sick men should never be permitted to commence or continue a march whenever they can be treated better in station hospitals; while, on the other hand, ambulances can be provided much cheaper than doolies, and would afford all the relief needed on customary occasions. Ambulances might, therefore, with advantage be largely substituted for doolies for carriage of sick and wounded men on service in the plains. For hill warfare no change in the present equipment will be required.

Again, owing to the impossibility of transporting elephants and camels by rail, the sphere of usefulness of these valuable baggage animals must become much circumscribed. As regards elephants, the circumstance may be deemed a boon for the poor animal at least; for, though useful anywhere, from its great strength, patient

endurance, and docility, it is still but ill adapted for work in the arid and uncongenial plains of the North-West Provinces, and the Punjab, where its vigour and longevity become quickly impaired. It were far better relegated to its proper habitat in its native jungles in Burmah, the North-Eastern frontier and the Nepal Terai, where especially, it must remain invaluable as a beast of burthen for many a long day to come.

The case is much more serious as affecting camels. In the Punjab, Sind, and Central India, camels have hitherto afforded the principal means of transport, and better can nowhere be found. Railways will have the effect not only of driving camels off the roads, but, as a consequence, unless Government takes measures to prevent it, the breed of these animals must become extinct. It would hardly be worth while to maintain the breed of camels for baggage purposes alone, as other means can be substituted without much loss of efficiency. It is surprising, however, how little military men would appear to have appreciated the value of the camel corps raised during the mutiny. What good service riflemen mounted on horseback can perform, was fully exemplified during the last American struggle; when, more than once, the fate of a battle was decided by a judicious employment of such corps. But how much greater is the efficiency of riflemen mounted on fleet and well-trained camels? With native riders guiding, while the European marksmen sit unencumbered "en croupe" ready, if need be, to act as infantry, a camel corps can manœuvre at the rate of seven, if not eight, miles an hour, and can march fifty or sixty miles a day with ease for weeks consecutively. Moving with all the rapidity of Uhlans, and fourfold more formidable, what could not a force so constituted achieve. With what effect could it be employed in checking raids, or in nipping rebellion in the bud? In short, the capability such corps afford of bringing arms of precision to bear with the greatest possible rapidity and effect in any given direction would seem to satisfy all the conditions essential to tactical success. Why the camel corps raised during the Mutiny were disbanded is not remembered, but the sooner the blunder made in this respect is rectified the better. While equal in warlike power to three European cavalry regiments, which are, indeed, placed at great disadvantage in this country, a camel corps such as described is infinitely cheaper to maintain than a single regiment of the latter. Moreover, it must be remembered that by dismounting the extra rider, the camels of such corps might be employed, as occasion required, for baggage purposes; and, considering that camels can move with ease in countries impracticable almost to other beasts of burden, or to wheeled carriage, this must be accounted no small advantage. Having thus briefly enumerated the advantages to be derived, it is recommended, that at

least three or four of such camel corps should be substituted for a like number of costly European cavalry regiments, and that Government should take active measures to prevent the extinction of the breed of camels, if for no other object than the preservation of a novel arm of unique efficiency for India. The defects of the present so-called Rewaree system of supplying camels have been exposed in part II.

It follows, that in the future, reliance will mainly have to be placed for the means of transport on wheeled carriage, and pack animals, mules, ponies and bullocks. Much inconvenience, irritation, and loss are now too often caused to farmers and traders by the withdrawal of their draught cattle for the use of troops; and as the resources of the country expand, the evil will be in proportion enhanced. In the interests of agriculture and commerce these constant requisitions should cease, and it is incumbent on Government to make special arrangements for the provision of draught bullocks for the transport of military stores and baggage, in the same manner as is now done for artillery purposes. Wheeled carriage cannot be employed in the plains where there are no practicable roads, nor can it be employed at all in the hills. Moreover, wheeled carriage cannot very conveniently be dismembered and packed for despatch by rail.

It is therefore advisable, that the transport to be maintained for the future should consist principally of pack animals. Such can travel readily by rail, and are useful under all conditions of service, whether on the plains, or on the hills. It may be anticipated, that movements of troops will generally take place by rail; but for feeding the rail, and to enable each separate corps d'armée to provide its quota of troops effective for any emergency of service arising at a distance from its proper zone of operations, it will be necessary to maintain a suitable equipment of road transport. Generals in all ages have chafed at the anxieties and abstractions caused them by the impedimenta of their armies; and, in India more especially, armies have invariably such a following of uncontrolled, and uncontrollable rabble, as seriously to hamper their operations in the field. To remedy this evil, and to create something like order from the present chaotic confusion, organisation is needed. To this end, it is recommended, that for each corps d'armée one or more land transport corps should be formed, to which doolie bearers, and all baggage cattle and their attendants, should be attached. The men of each class should have a distinctive uniform dress; and both men and animals should receive sufficient training to enable them to perform their duties with system, and to take up and keep their proper places on a march without uproar and confusion.

It is doubted whether the location of troops, European and

native, has hitherto been arranged in reference to any general system of military policy. Regiments and detachments are even now scattered, here and there, nearly at random. It was this very objectionable dispersion of the European forces during the Mutiny of 1857, that gave to that revolt all the vitality it acquired. On its first outbreak, had it been possible to concentrate a well appointed force of 5000 Europeans, who, who has read the history of the British conquest of India or who remembers the glorious achievements of Havelock's small force, can doubt that it would speedily have been suppressed. As it was, the Mutiny starting into hydra-headed existence, found itself opposed to weak and scattered detachments of European troops, which could only remain on the defensive; and thus that event witnessed the arms of 45,000 or 50,000 of the bravest troops in the world paralyzed, and all through a vicious system, or rather want of any system, of military strategy.

It is true that since the Mutiny, carriage has been kept up to enable the ready movement and co-operation of troops to a partial extent; but the European forces are still dangerously scattered. It is hoped that, when perfect railway and telegraphic communication is established, the means of rapid concentration will be secured, and thus great reduction, as well in the strength of troops, as also diminution of military expenditure generally, will be rendered possible in combination with increased efficiency. There is no reason either, as a secondary, but far from immaterial point, why the bulk of the European army should not be located in the hill sanatoria. By this means not only will the present exhaustive drain on England's best manhood be reduced to a minimum, but other great benefits will result. *Inter alia*, it is hoped, that the opportunity of making the European soldier more self-reliant will not be over-looked. It is a national reproach, that recruited principally from the manufacturing classes of the first manufacturing nation in the world, the British soldier is more helpless and less capable of contributing to his own personal comfort than any other. In India more especially, the evil is much aggravated; for, while military reformers generally, and all who have had under consideration the moral and physical well-being of the soldier, deplore what they are pleased to call the enforced idleness to which he is subjected, not the slightest exertion is demanded of him. Of course the stock argument is, that it is not possible for the soldier to work so hard in this climate as in a more temperate zone. The location of troops in the hills will effectually serve to explode this fallacy; but it may in passing be remarked, that the influences of cold, even moderately severe, are as difficult to resist as those of heat. Further, it is quite a moot point, whether extreme indolence in a hot climate is not more prejudicial to health, especially in



the young and vigorous subject, than any amount of severe physical exertion. But no severe exertion need be demanded of the soldier. Food and requisites being supplied him, it is contended, that he should be merely called upon to do what is necessary to bring such into a fit state for consumption or expenditure.

This would not only be beneficial to the public service, but profitable to himself; for of course it is contemplated that he should be paid a fair wage for his labour. It has already been recommended in this article that he should make, and repair his own barrack-furniture; nor is there any reason why he should not bake his own bread. With the aid of machinery this latter is far from a laborious occupation. Nor do killing, and distributing meat-rations, tinning cooking utensils, pitching tents, lading baggage, etc., involve any inordinate amount of physical exertion. Again, employment for the women might readily be found in making up, with the aid of sewing machines, barrack and hospital clothing and bedding of all kinds. With proper management and after a little training and experience, the soldier might also be made equally self-reliant, and independent in the field as in cantonments; and thus the services of the army of rabble followers, which now hampers an European force in India, might be dispensed with. It may be argued that it is not only inexpedient, but a measure of more than doubtful economy, to weaken the European line of battle by withdrawing soldiers from their proper occupation of fighting. But this need not of necessity follow, for soldiers do not fight a battle, nor make forced marches every day; while the resources of a good Commissariat should always be adequate to obviate much inconvenience arising under such exigencies of service. This idea might be enlarged upon in full detail, did not respect for the patience of the general reader forbid. Suffice it to say, that it is quite feasible; and if carried out, not only would the soldier become more efficient in a fighting point of view, but healthier, wealthier, and wiser.

It will be observed that throughout this article, little comparatively has been said regarding the duties of the Commissariat on field service. The fact is, that if a good commissariat system exists in time of peace, it is sure to prove equal to the emergency of war. While in the field, much must of necessity be left to the individual intelligence, fore-thought, and resource of the Commissariat officer. Onerous as the duties of a Commissariat officer employed with troops actually engaged on service may be, the main strain of anxiety must generally rest with the Commissariat officer at the base of operations, whose duties lie in collecting and forwarding supplies of all kinds, upon which the very existence of an army may depend, while the officer in advance may merely have to distribute them. This point has not been sufficiently recognised in the distribution of rewards.

**ART. VII.—INDEPENDENT SECTION.\***  
**SPELLING OF INDIAN NAMES.**

1.—*Gazette of India*, 1871, 1872.

2.—*Supplement to the Glossary of Indian Terms, A—J*. By Sir H. M. Elliot, K.C.B. 1844.

**W**HEN measures are devised or adopted for effecting some particular object of importance, it is necessary not only to think of that object as expressed in general terms, but to have regard to the exact purpose to be served, and to the people for whom, for whose use or benefit, the measures in question are to be adapted.

There are different classes of persons to be considered, and there are different kinds of purposes to be served, in many arrangements of general importance, which often seem, when spoken of in the general terms used on the subject, to have but one application. And thus the matter is liable to be disposed of too readily, in a wrong way, when either the general object alone is thought of, without definite regard to the particular purposes in view, or people concerned; or when some one or more of the purposes and classes of people are kept in view, to the exclusion or neglect of others.

There has been much difference of opinion, and some controversy, regarding the proper mode of representing Indian words and names in English letters. And much of this difference and controversy arises from either a too vaguely general, or a too partial and restricted, view of the real object to be attained.

It goes against the natural and reasonable desire that people have to use the same method of representing sounds in Indian names that are most commonly used for representing the same sounds in their own language, to find the Government of India adopting a mode of spelling Indian words in English publications which is not in accordance with English usage. But still the question is, is it the right mode, for the purposes it is meant to serve, and the people for whose use it is intended?

There are, no doubt, inconveniences and difficulties in the system, in the want of uniformity it introduces, and the errors it is liable to cause. In every English book or paper in which this method is followed, two kinds of spelling are used, when one might be used throughout,—that, namely, which is in accordance with the general practice of our language. But does this, nevertheless,

\* See the Editorial Note at the last page of this *Review*.

best effect what is required, and best suit the people chiefly concerned?

It is true it is not in accordance with what we are accustomed to in other similar cases. How, it might be asked, would people succeed in reading the oriental words in a French book or paper,—the names of people and places in their Algerian possessions, for instance,—if, instead of taking the French sounds of the letters, the names were spelt in a way which followed the usage of some other European language? What would be the meaning or advantage of this? And what the effect, except to mislead? Yet this, it will be said, is what we are asked to do now with regard to Indian names introduced in English publications. We are to use Italian and German pronunciation of vowels, instead of English.

Now we know well that the English language contains words having very various pronunciations of vowels (and of consonants too, but we are not immediately concerned with this). But is this a reason, it may further be asked, for adding to its variations? Here is what we find with regard to this very abnormal and irregular language of ours. Notwithstanding many varieties in vowel sounds, it has certain general, recognised, well understood pronunciations of vowels and double vowels, in constant use, and about which, when used to represent the sound of strange words there is no manner of doubt.

In particular, the English language possesses a special advantage for this purpose, in the double vowels *ee* and *oo*. Though there are certain exceptional pronunciations of the latter, no English reader, coming upon an Indian word in which they are used, would pronounce these double vowels in any but one way. This may be stated quite unreservedly. There is no risk whatever of mistake. Now should we deliberately reject this advantage which our English practice affords, and adopt, to represent the same sounds, letters which *are* apt to be mispronounced? .

This liability to cause error, in the system now in question, has to be guarded against by directions for pronunciation, and by the use of accents. Instructions, or illustrations which serve as instructions, easily reach the regular readers of Government publications in India, and they have opportunities of becoming familiar with them. But what about the generality of uninstructed readers in England, as well as in India, who have a kind of right to expect, like the readers of other languages, to find Indian names presented to them in a form which they can read correctly at once, and to be able to find names in a book of reference, or in an index, by looking for them where they would be found if spelt in English letters according to their sound?

If we adopt the other spellings, in publications we send to friends at home, and in our letters to them, are we at the same

time to send them instructions, when we might use spellings which they could read correctly without a guide?

Again, to mark the vowels to which particular sounds are to be given, different from other sounds which the same vowels may bear, recourse is had to accents. This is necessary. Without them there is ambiguity, as, for instance, in such words as *hukim* and *hukeem*, which, in the Jonesian method, are spelt alike, and can have the distinction shown only by accents. There is no ambiguity in such words when they are written, as above, in the more familiar English way which needs no accents.

Accents are not in ordinary use in writing the English language. Their application to varieties of sound is not known in English. The only use we ever make of them is to mark emphasis and rhythm. They are not generally needed, either, for distinction of sounds in the writing of Indian words, if the common use of English vowels is followed, though an accent or long mark in a few cases is useful. To look at a page of a Gazette of India Supplement, plentifully peppered with acute accents, one might think our good old letters had lost their power to serve our purposes, as they have done in by-gone days, and that, in their enfeebled condition, they were obliged to have recourse to foreign help.

The principal distinguishing un-English features of the system that has been adopted are these.

The vowel *a* unaccented, is made to represent the most ordinary English short sound of *u*. The words *Suddur Bazar*, for instance, which, in this form, few English readers would mispronounce, are written, *Sadar* (or *Sadr*) *Bázár*; the distinctions in the vowel sounds being lost without accents, and even with them not made clear.

The vowel *i*, accented, is to be sounded as *ee*. Thus *satti* is the method of writing *suttee*; a word with which, in the latter form, English people are familiar.

The letter *u* is used for *oo*, as in the word *munshi*, meant to be pronounced *moonsee*. Which of these two is likely to be most readily intelligible to English readers?

The combined vowels *au* are made to have the common sound of the English *ou* as in *house*, or *ow* as in *how*. Thus *Lakhnau* is the way in which according to the new system the more familiar *Lucknow* should be spelt.\*

These are the chief points to be noticed. Now it is not to be asserted that the English language never has *i* sounded as *ee*, or *u* as *oo*. We all know it is otherwise. But here is the thing

\* Shall we have our station of ready have *Kasauli*, meant for *Kus-Dalhousie* made *Dalhausi*? We all knowlee.

to be observed; that in no word in the English language are the long sounds of *ee* and *oo* given to the single vowels *i* and *u* when the syllable in which these letters occur is not followed by some qualifying letter or syllable, in virtue of which that sound is given. That there is in short, (which is the point aimed at,) no analogy in the English language with the sound which is given to these letters in numerous Indian words spelt in the new manner, notably in the frequent termination, *pur*, of the names of towns. There is nothing in the customary practice of the English language to prepare an ordinary English reader to pronounce correctly the Indian words in which these vowels are thus used, as *Wazir*, *Nagpur*, &c., while the customary usage of the English language does enable any ordinary English reader to pronounce these words correctly and without hesitation, when they are written *Wuzeer*, *Nagpoor*, &c.

With regard to the use made of the unaccented *a*, in no instance in the English language, (or, it is believed, in any other,) has the letter *a* that sound of an English *u* which is given to it in words like *Nagar*, *Deoband*, *Jabalpur*, &c. Whether will English people be more likely to pronounce these names correctly when written as above, or when written *Naggur*, *Deobund*, *Jubbulpoor*?

In the English language *au* never has the sound it is made to represent in this system.

Thus every one of these distinctive representations of vowel sounds is at variance with the most ordinary usages of the language in which they are to be introduced.

It will be seen that it is here assumed throughout that a writing of any kind, in any language, should, to serve its purpose, be in a form readily apprehended by readers of that language;—an English writing, for instance, by English readers. The argument that the new spelling is meant to be intelligible also to readers of other languages is (even if it were true that it is so) a very shallow and untenable reason for its adoption in ordinary English writings. For if we wish to be intelligible to the readers of any other language, should we not write in their language, instead of limiting our presumed usefulness to the Indian words we have occasion to introduce? It would be a very small satisfaction to a foreign reader to recognise the Indian words, if he could not read the rest. And if he can read the rest, then he will best read the Indian words if they are represented in a manner corresponding to the rest of the writing, (that is, just according to the practice of his own country in similar cases,) instead of in a manner different from the rest, though kindly supposed to be better adapted to his capacity. Suppose French papers were to agree to put all proper names in the English form for the benefit of English readers, would it benefit an English reader, ignorant of French, to catch sight of the words

England, and London, and James, and William, and Peter, in a French newspaper? If he did recognise one of these names when he could not understand anything else in the paper, what would he do with it? And if he could read the French, would he be any the better of the English form of the proper names, or inconvenienced by meeting instead with Londres, and Jacques, and Pierre? So if a French reader should be enabled by our method of spelling Indian words to pronounce correctly the proper names in an English publication, he will gain little if he does not read English; and, if he does, he does not need this adaptation of the spelling of proper names to the usages of his own language. And why should we attempt this? We do not expect it of the writers of any other languages. Why should we? What language should forsake its own custom in this matter for the benefit of others? And of what others? Is the method in question such as is adapted to the usage of any one European language? No. The *au* which will do for the Germans, the *u* which will suit the Italians, will not help French readers to the right pronunciation; and the way in which we are to use *a* will not be a guide to anybody. The method does not therefore possess this advantage which is sometimes claimed for it. And, if it did, why this in preference to the natural and rational plan of each language adapting its spellings of foreign words to its own readers?

It is worth while to say a word or two more about one of the above noticed unusual applications of our vowels. The advocates of the Jonesian and Indian Government methods have never, so far as we are aware, fairly attempted to justify the use of the letter *a* to represent the well-marked sound of the English *u* in Indian names such as those before mentioned, *Nagar*, *Deoband*, *Jabalpur* (Nuggur, Deobund, Jubbulpoor), and words such as *basti* (bustee) *chakbandi* (chukbundee) &c., but take their illustrations of its use as a short vowel from those applications of it in Indian words which are similar to common uses of it in English; as in the words *pillar*, *patrol*, *assistant*, *above*, *abroad*, *villa*, *Victoria*, *trial*, *Chobham*, &c., when the accent or emphasis does not fall upon it, and it is lightly pronounced, as other vowels similarly situated might be, without any very distinctive sound.

It is not *this* use of the letter *a* that any English reader finds opposed to his experience, and liable to mislead. But the use of *a* to represent the English *u* sound, marked and emphatic, as when followed by double consonants and occupying the accented syllable of the word, or characterising a strongly pronounced monosyllable. It is *this* use of *a* that is justly objected to as inappropriate and misleading. It is illustrated in such names as *Chambal* (Chumbul), *Mangal* (*Mungul*), *Sakkar* (Sukkur), *Kach* (Kutch), &c., and in such words as *band-o-bast*, *hadd*, *mandi*, meant to be pronounced

*bund-o-bust, hund, munde.* This is a use of *a* which is unsupported, we believe, by any single example of similar usage either in our own or in other languages. It is not, therefore, suited for representing that sound so as to enable general readers to pronounce the words correctly. And, as we know, it actually has in such positions a very different sound. Looking to the English illustrations above given of the short indistinct *a*, (*pillar, abroad, &c.*) it is obvious that for the *a* in each of these words in which it is not initial or final, some other vowel might be substituted, an *e*, a *u*, or even an *o*, without very perceptible effect on the pronunciation. The same in Indian words. The vowel is not distinctive in character. It is merely *vowel*, in a general way, a scrap of vowel sound of a sort of hazy whiteness, as it might be a bit of mixture of all the vowels and none in particular. And the final and initial *a* is the same in character, only it could not well have any of the others put in its place; for none of them, when so thin, can comfortably stand up like *a*, without more support. How different is this loose undefined sound from the distinct strong, characteristic *u* of *bund, chund*, rhyming with the English *fund*; of *lub, shub*, rhyming with English *rub*, and so on. The *u* in these words would be very inadequately represented by any of the other vowels. You could not substitute one of them without perceptible difference in the pronunciation. It is no uncertain sound that the *u* gives in these words. And to say that an *a* in place of it is much the same thing as the familiar short *a* in *aloud*, and *Peckham*, and *Persia*, is to make a heavy demand on the dullness of readers.

In the native languages with which we are concerned it is the same vowel mark, or say the same nominal vowel understood, that occurs in the word *suttee*, and also in the first syllable of *ameer*, and the last syllable of *sikka*. But the sounds of the first and of the other two are as distinct as are those of our *a* in the English words *far*, and *hat*, and *area*. We would never think of attempting to represent these English words in any oriental characters, using the same letter for the English *a* in each case. So neither should we use *a* invariably, as in the Jonesian method, or *u* as in the Gilchristian, to represent an Indian vowel which has different sounds. We should represent the sounds, not the letter.

The advocates of the more appropriately English fashion of rendering the sounds of Indian words do not propose the use of *u* in those places where *a* is the natural representative of the sound according to the common practice of the English language. Gilchrist's awkward use of *u* for this sound, in certain positions, particularly at the ends of words, was at variance with English usage. He used it in order to maintain uniformity in a system of transliteration. It was unadapted for giving English people a

correct guide to the pronunciation of the words in which it was so used, for its appearance was so strange that it raised doubts. Some ridiculous instances of this mis-use of the letter *u* at the end of a word, as adopted by Marshman, are given in the April No. of this Review\* ; to which illustrations many readers will readily add a recollection of an old Calcutta friend, *The Hurkaru*.

The late Sir Henry Elliot, in the book named at the head of this Article, used the most English mode of representing the sounds of Indian words, and did not adopt the mis-applied use of the letter *u* introduced by Gilchrist. He wrote *Bhoomia*, *Beera*, *Fouteenama*, not *Bhoomiu*, *Beeru*, &c. He uses that method of representing Indian words which, as he says in his Preface, "certainly has the merit of enabling an Englishman to "pronounce a word in such a manner as to make it easily comprehended by the natives of Hindoostan." "Sir W. Jones's method," he adds, "is better suited to the learned." And his Glossary has a column giving the words also in this form. But in the leading column the words are spelt and alphabetically ranged according to the ordinary English method ; which enables any Englishman to find a word he has heard by reference to the spelling by which he would himself naturally represent it. This is exactly what should be done in the *Indian Gazetteers*, written in the English language, to be consulted by English readers :—the names should be given primarily in the most directly English form, followed by the Jonesian representation for those who require to know the spelling in the Indian characters.

The method adopted by the Government of India is a method of *transliteration*. Now if, in accordance with the remarks made above, we bear in mind the purpose to be served, and the people to be considered, let us ask, is this the right method ? Is it necessary, and is it suitable ? By far the majority of readers, in India as well as in England, of English publications relating to India, are not concerned to know how the words are spelt in the original languages ; but they *are* concerned to know how names are pronounced, and to be able readily to find, in a book of reference, a name which they hear spoken. Let any candid English reader say whether the method adopted by the Government, or the other, would best help him. We take up a recent *Gazette of India* publishing a Bill relating to the North-West Provinces. What is an English reader likely to make of such words as *mukarari*, *pulbandi*, &c.,—of their pronunciation, we mean ? The same Bill gives us *khood khaat* or *kadeemee Ryots*, inadvertently spelt in the old way, which few would have much difficulty in pronouncing with tolerable

\* Cal. Rev., No. cviii., April 1872, p. 334.



accuracy.\* Did these words look too ugly for general readers in their Jonesian dress? With regard to the question of transliteration, in the representation of Indian words for general English readers, let us ask, should we ever think of representing English names in any Indian characters by this system, giving each English letter one uniform representative? We could not, of course. We must let them be represented by different letters in different cases when they are differently pronounced. A system of transliteration is useful for certain purposes and certain persons, but do not let us pretend that, to the general public, it uniformly exhibits the real sounds of the words.†

English people are now pretty familiar with a number of Indian and other oriental words and proper names, and they know them generally in the shape in which they naturally write them when they hear the words. Some have come to us in other and very varied forms, as they came through different channels, old French translations of the Arabian Nights, old books of travels, &c. But it is in familiar English forms that our principal modern acquisitions of this kind have become the property of the English people. They can talk about *loot*, and they have been told about the not extinct cruelties of *thugges* and the *churruk pooja*; they know what a *punkah* is, and a *coolie*, and a *hookah*, and a *couvee*; they have heard of the valiant *Roostum*, they know where the *Kootub Minar* is, *Dhuleep Singh* lives among them, they have seen the *koh-i-noor*, they have read *Lalla Rookh*, &c. &c. &c. Now put these words into the new form, and let our friends in England see how pretty they look as *lut* (and being *luted*!) *thaggi*, *charak pūja*, *punkah*, *kuli*, *hūkah*, *kauri*, *Rūstam*, *Kūtub*, *Dhalip*, *koh-i-nūr*, *Lala Rukh*, &c. &c. &c., and let them be told that this is really the proper way of spelling them, which they will have to learn; and that we have been wrong hitherto in putting these words before them in the ridiculously easy and intelligible shape they have been accustomed to.

The readers of Indian history will find some well-known words, and names transformed: *musnud*, *guddee*, *doulut*, become *masnad*, *gadi*, *daulat*; the affixes *poor*, *nuggur*, *gurh*, *gurhee*, *droog*, become *pur*, *nagar*, *garh*, *garhi*, *drug*. *Tippoo* will be *Tipu*, and *Poona Puna*; the Peshwa's Commander-in-Chief *Hurree Punt* will appear as *Hari Pant*; the *Goorkhas* will be

\* Not with entire accuracy; in this system as in the other there is still room for mispronunciation of *kh* and *th*, but not so as to prevent the word being understood.

† We should beware of incau-

tiously charging any *system* with the laughable misrepresentations of Indian words we sometimes meet with. No system and no teaching will give a man an ear if he has none, or make another accurate who is careless.

*Gurkhas*, and the *Rajpoots Rajputs*. We see *Mooltan* beginning to appear as *Multan*, and people will soon be giving it the sound they already give to *Sultan*.\* They will have to unlearn some other names of places and people up in that quarter, which they know something about from the past history of the Punjab (*Panjáb* we are told is the right thing) and from the occasional reports they hear of disturbances on that frontier;—*Moolraj*, *Sooruj Koond*, *Bunnoo* and the *Bunnoochees*, the *Thull*, the *Murrees* and *Boogtees*, the *Khuttuks*, the *Mahsood Wuzceerees*, &c., must now become known as *Mulraj*, *Suraj Kund*, *Banu* and the *Banúchis*, the *Thall*, the *Maris* and *Bugtis*, *Khattaks*, *Mahsúd Waziris*, and so on. When people used to read about the *Hindoos* and the *Indus*, these names were very intelligibly distinct. Now they will have the *Hindus* and the *Indus*, and it will be apparent to acute readers in England that the former is only an accidental cockneyfication of the name of the river.

People in England as well as in India who have occasion to dip into Indian official papers, are acquainted with many of our revenue technicalities and other terms, as *asl*, *rubbee*, *khureef*, *beegha*, *tehseel*, *vukeel*, *nuzool*, *kanoongo*, *chowdree*, &c., and they are never likely to mispronounce them if they find them in these forms. They are not quite so safe with *asl*, *rabi*, *khurif*, *bigha*, *tahsil*, *vakil*, *nazul*, *kanungo*, *chaudhri*, &c.

The names of articles of Indian produce and manufacture with which a number of people in England, visitors to the International Exhibitions and others, have become acquainted, as *durree*, *kummul*, *Rampoor chuddur*, *pugree*, *puttoo*, *pushm*, *dosoottee*, *nynsookh*, &c., will not be so readily named when they are labelled *dari*, *kamal*, *Rampur chadar*, *pagri*, *patu*, *pashm*, *nainsukh*, and so on.

There are Indian words identical in sound with English words (not connected at all in meaning); and it seems a piece of needless perversity to give them different vowels from the English words when they are written in English letters. Would an ordinary English reader readily understand, or even believe that *sach*, *andar*, *ham*, *fan*, are really meant to be pronounced exactly like the English *such*, *under*, *hum*, *fun*; that *aur*, *sau*, *baund*, *nau*, represent the sounds of the English *our*, *sow*, *bound*, *now*; that *kul*, *but*, *sut*, *pur*, are to be sounded *cool*, *boot*, *soot*, *poor*; and *pir*, *kil*, *chir*, *dip*, like *peer*, *keel*, *cheer*, *deep*? Does not an English reader naturally say, if they are meant to be pronounced so by us in England, why are they not spelt so? If you wish us *not* to pronounce them rightly, your method is excellent.

\* In some English dictionaries the first syllable of this word is marked as accented on

Now we are told that all will become easy bye and bye, when every body has been trained to the new fashion. Perhaps. But why use a system which needs instructions when you have another which needs none? However, people are to be trained, the English people in India first, and through them our friends at home. The consideration of this subject of training to the use of the new system has given rise to a suggestion that a grand opportunity is afforded to the Government of India of reviving and establishing on a sound basis a method of spelling our own language which was unsuccessfully attempted, some years ago, in England. The people of England did not discern its merits. They will be brought to appreciate them now. The *Fonetic Nuz* lived before its time. Its time has now come, and the Indian Government will set it on its feet again, in improved form. If the method adopted for Indian words (it has been reasoned), is really the best mode of representing the sounds of the Indian words, then it would well represent also the sounds of other words. And if we would try it on familiar English words in daily use, we should all soon become accustomed to it, and able to use it easily for reading and spelling Indian words. The practical part of the suggestion, as it has come to us, is that some enterprising Kalkatta publisher should bring out a new fonetic *Kukari Buk*, to be put into the hands of the English ladies in India; under whose influence and guidance we shall be soon all reconciled to the Italian flavour that is to be given to our familiar English vowels, in the new mode of serving the old dishes.

Seriously, can we English not be allowed to retain, in the English spellings of Indian names, for ordinary purposes and ordinary readers, the most ordinary usage of the English letters? Educated people have, of course, no great difficulty in apprehending the Jonesian spelling with the help of the key, and in agreeing to call *s a n* sun, and so on, according to a method arbitrarily determined and accepted for certain purposes. And they can use this method, and do use it, for those purposes,—for purposes of scientific precision, and where accuracy in showing the exact spelling of the words in the original languages is important. But no one can honestly say that the spelling really represents to him, or will represent to his countrymen generally, the sounds which it is assumed to represent. Or that for the ordinary purpose for which Indian proper names require to be written, it is important to secure scientific accuracy, and indicate the letters which form the word in the original.

There are purposes for which this is required, as there are purposes for which scientific accuracy of other kinds, and the use of scientific forms of words, are needful; and there are persons whose pursuits or whose duties require the use of those forms for

those purposes. But to maintain a scientific system of transliteration on ordinary occasions, when this precision is not required, would be something like making constant use of terms belonging to the various sciences, in ordinary publications and correspondence ; calling, for instance, our trees and flowers by their botanica names, and giving to familiar substances their chemical designations. To do this when the occasion does not require it, would, to the generality of hearers, be a hindrance and not a help. The scientific terms, no doubt, are more precise and accurate ; and, to scientific men, they convey that definite idea of the thing spoken of which the purposes of science require. And so with a precise scientific representation of Indian names and other words, for purposes which require this. But should we not think it something more than pedantic, needless, and inappropriate, to use unfamiliar but scientifically accurate, instead of common and generally understood, words, in daily ordinary writing, and in publications dealing with common affairs, and intended for the general public ?

We are quite accustomed, in other things, to the use both of simple and familiar expressions in the ordinary business of daily life, and also, at the same time, of scientific language for the initiated, and for technical requirements. The man who writes *Febbris* in his hospital returns, and *Ol. Ricin.* and *Pulv. Rhei comp.* in his prescriptions, can say *Fever*, and *Castor Oil*, and *Rhubarb*, in writing a popular Report. He does not reckon it any great condescension to vulgar prejudices, to put the names in the most familiar and readily apprehended form. He would not think of doing any thing else. For special purposes and special persons he uses the technical forms ; but in a writing intended for the public he puts things in the way best "understood of the people." If, for certain scientific purposes and scientific men, it is desirable, (as it is,) to put Indian names in a shape belonging to an arbitrary, uniform, recognised system, by which the exact spelling in the original can be correctly exhibited, then to use this method, even though it puts some words in strange shapes, little likely to be understood by the unlearned, is, for these purposes, right and proper. If we must even write names like *Cadrudin* and *Fathgarh* in such papers, yet we know that general readers will much better comprehend *Suddur-ood-deen* and *Futtehgurh* ; and this latter form we should adopt in papers for general readers, though the other may be suited for the learned. The chemist gives *laudanum* to the public, and reserves his *tinct. opii* for the profession. It is, of course, a very different thing, having two ways, a scientific and a popular, of representing the same words. But the principle is the same. The scientific forms, in each case, have their technical purposes to serve ; but, for the public, that

which is most readily apprehended is required, not that which is most precise and best adapted for special technical purposes. Let not familiar forms, and facilities which are due to the public,—unlearned and learned alike,—be sacrificed to scientific requirements or quasi-scientific fancies.

We find among the men who are most strong, in different departments of learning, those who most readily recognise the secondary place to be assigned, in general publications, to the demands of the learned,—the precedence to be given to the needs of the far larger public. No one will question the capacity or the the oriental scholarship of Sir Henry Elliot or Sir William Muir. It was not any difficulty, or personal trouble or inconvenience in using the more strictly accurate learned system that prompted their expressed views with regard to the most suitable general mode of representing Indian words. Others there are who see no need for a simple system for general use. They perfectly understand a system of accurate transliteration, they have become used to it in their scientific pursuits, it suits them, they like it, they are persuaded that others can learn it with a little trouble; and with truth they say that it gives a more correct rendering of the exact form of the original words. But, if there is any soundness in our opening remarks, this is not what is wanted. Others again are found willingly to follow in using one of the learned methods, not because they are themselves men of learning, having occasion to hold frequent converse with works in the native languages, for historical or scientific researches, but because the use of this less ordinary mode of spelling implies and stimulates some attention to matters out of the ordinary course, some approach to scientific tendencies. And others use it because they have been told to do so, but without seeing why, or perceiving any greater resemblance to the real sound of the words in this spelling than in the other.

The Government of India, we must now observe, does not go the length of satisfying scientific requirements. A full scientific system of transliteration, with its various marks, has this value, (which is indeed its primary purpose) that the learned, who know and understand the marks, or are furnished with the key, can identify the words in the original tongues, from the mode of exhibiting them in English letters. The Government hesitates to do this. It goes a certain length to meet science, but will not go all the way. This half-and-half system serves neither purpose fully. It does not satisfy the requirements of the scientific few or of the unscientific many;—does not give the learned what they need for learned purposes, nor supply the more simple wants of the general public. Is it not very just and reasonable to say, if you agree to recede so far from a complete scientific system, so that you have abandoned all pretension to meet the wants of those who desire

a representation of the exact form and spelling of the words in the original, would it not be wise to take the further step in the same direction, which would re-establish the claim to meet the ordinary wants of the public, in England as well as in India?

Let our Asiatic Society here, in the yellow Nos. of its Journal, write *çafar*, *Qutbuddin*, *Fath Khan*, &c., which ordinary people would read more easily in the forms *Suffur*, *Kootub-ood-deen*, and *Futteh Khan*. For orientalists and for their purposes the more precise forms, though of strange appearance to the uninitiated, are of special use. They are, to them, as distinctly intelligible and definite in their indications as, to the naturalists, are such names as *Motacilla alba*, *Helix aspersa*, *Solanum tuberosum*, in the blue Nos. of the same Journal. To the vulgar herd it would be more to the purpose to say *wagtail*, and *snail*, and *potato*; but the more precise definitions have their special uses for men of science, by whom they are well understood. Neither the one kind of scientific words nor the other is suited for use in ordinary writings for the unlearned public.

In a *Gazetteer of India* let us have a second column showing the names in exact transliteration, according to an approved method; but in the leading column, in which the names will be found by their alphabetical arrangement, let the simpler forms with English vowels be used. And the same in all other ordinary publications intended for general English readers. So that any of our friends at home to whom our letters, newspapers, reports, &c. &c., are sent, any readers of average intelligence, learned or unlearned, in all broad England, who never heard of *alif*, *be*, and *pe*, and have no key or competent friend at hand, may, without need for any of these helps, read the Indian names as easily and intelligibly as they read the English text.

And now a few words with special reference to the *Indian Gazetteers*. The system of spelling above preferred for common use has this advantage, that it places together those words which have similarly sounded first syllables (by which, for the most part, words are looked for in a book of reference). And this the system of the Government of India does not do. By the use it makes of the same vowels for different sounds, it brings together words not associated by the ear, in virtue of similarity of first syllables; and it separates words which have their first sounds alike. Thus we should, in a *Gazetteer* using the new method, find *Nagpoor* and *Nuggur* together, *Chindwara* and *Cheenee*, *Mulda* and *Mullikpoor*, *Palumpoor* and *Pulwul*, *Ban-gunga* and *Bunnoo*, *Seetapoor* and *Sitana*, &c. &c., because in the system in question the first three letters of each of these pairs of words will be the same, though their sound is very different. A person looking for one of these names would not naturally expect to find it among

words having the other initial sound. It is an objection applicable, of course, to dictionaries of the English language. And by the use of one of the methods of representing Indian words, we should avoid it in our Indian dictionaries and Gazetteers, and so facilitate reference to words which in themselves are strange, and in need of any help that can be given in finding them.

Let us put it in this way. A friend in England is told of some one in whom he is interested being at Sukkur, or DumDum, or Deeg, or Noorpoor. If he desire to learn something about these places from a Gazetteer, would he naturally turn to *Sa, Da, Di, Nu*? Is he not likely to be disappointed, and to think that the names are not in the book? For, let us ask ourselves, could he have any expectation of finding the names he looks for, among words having first syllables spelt in these latter forms? We are not speaking of people familiar with India and Indian names, but of ordinarily educated English folk, using their ears and eyes on sounds and spellings in the manner they are most accustomed to. Will even a key in the preface to the book serve their turn?

Let us observe also that in a dictionary in the principal, Indian characters, the confusion above noticed would not occur. The words having first syllables of the same sound would come together and those of dissimilar sound would be apart, each in their own place. *Nuggur* would not be near *Nagpoor*, or *Seetapoor* near *Sitana*.

Is it not a just conclusion that for *Indian Gazetteers* the sensible course followed by Sir Henry Elliot in his Glossary is that which should be adopted? Let us have the scientific and accurate spelling, for the persons and purposes requiring it; and let us have it really, correctly, completely, according to an approved system. But let this be the second form of the name. They are comparatively few who need it, and few the purposes for which it is required. Let the first form of the words, the form according to which they are ranged in English alphabetical order, be adapted to the comprehension of the many. Let it be, as in the "Supplemental Glossary," the form which is in agreement with the most ordinary English pronunciation of the letters, which has, as Sir Henry Elliot says, "the merit of enabling an Englishman to pronounce a word in such a manner as to make it easily comprehended by the Natives of Hindoostan." It is the form according to which an educated Englishman, generally speaking, would naturally write the words on hearing them spoken; the form by which English speaking people, learned and unlearned, can most readily find the word they seek, on reference to the spelling which, to them, represents the sound. And in all ordinary writings and publications let us keep to this latter, the familiar and (to English people) natural form.

The matter is not unimportant. We shall create a still greater repugnance to Indian subjects, at home, and diminish yet further the scanty interest felt in them, if we make Indian names more strange, and less easily read and written.

This seems to be the kind of result at which, if our reasoning is just, we arrive. In ordinary publications for English readers, the most customary use of the English letters, in the popular manner, with uniformity of application, facilitates right pronunciation of words read, and easy representation of words heard ; and this without key, or directions, or distinctive marks not in use in our language. The other method requires instructions, requires accents, gives unfamiliar sounds to familiar letters, and thus cannot be used without error or doubt by the uninstructed. Is the general adoption of such a system convenient ? Is it expedient ? Is it wise ? Is it reasonable ?

---



ART. VIII.—INDEPENDENT SECTION.\*  
OUR COMMERCIAL EXPLOITATION OF THE  
INDIAN POPULATIONS.†

(I).—ITS STATICS.

*"In India all the vices operate by which sudden fortune is acquired; in England are often displayed in the very same persons the virtues which dispense hereditary wealth. Arrived in England, the destroyers of the nobility and gentry of a whole kingdom will find the best company in this nation at a board of elegance and hospitality. Here the manufacturer and husbandman will bless the just and punctual hand that in India has torn the cloth from the loom, or wrested the scanty portion of rice and salt from the peasant of Bengal, or wrung from him the very opium in which he forgot his oppressions and his oppressors. They marry into your families, they enter into your senate; they ease your estates by loans, they raise their value by demand; they cherish and protect your relations which lie heavy on your patronage, and there is scarcely a house in the kingdom that does not feel some concern and interest that make all reform of our Eastern government appear officious and disgusting, and on the whole a most discouraging attempt. In such an attempt you hurt those who are able to return kindness or to resent injury. If you succeed, you save those who cannot so much as give you thanks. All these things show the difficulty of the work we have on hand, but they show its necessity too. OUR INDIAN GOVERNMENT IS IN ITS BEST STATE A GRIEVANCE."*

BURKE.

**I**N conducting the following examination into the export and import trade of British India, I shall determine, first, its *statics* or its condition at some given period of time; and secondly, its *dynamics* or its development through successive periods. I shall, so to speak, take first a *lateral* and then a *vertical* section of Indian Commerce.

Beginning with the statics I shall examine 1° the export, and 2° the import trade.

There is no text upon which Englishmen connected with India enlarge more frequently or more exultingly in their incessant exhortations towards fearless borrowing and spending, than that of the long array of Indian exports. "Why, India exports every year as much as fifty-seven millions sterling of produce, and in one year, 1864-65 (the zenith of the cotton trade owing to the "American war), the sale proceeds of India's export goods touched

\* See the Editorial Note at the last page of this *Review*.

† Trade and Navigation Returns of British India. Published by the Fi-

nancial Department, Calcutta, 1872.

Finance and Revenue Accounts of British India. Published by the Financial Department, Calcutta, 1872.

“ the figure of seventy millions sterling.” The recital of this vast sum, not less than a fourth of the export trade of Great Britain and Ireland, leaves an impression with reader or listener that India possesses a like proportion of wealth, that India is in possession of fixed capital and of current earnings which bear something like an English ratio to these stupendous outgoings.

That is not so. A large portion of these fifty-seven millions sterling of exports represent sales made under coercion and under all the commercial disadvantage involved in coercion. The goods thus forcibly transferred are the cost of foreign rule ; they form the tribute of India to her alien or absentee rulers. India may or may not receive a full equivalent, but whatever conclusion one may form on that question—an entirely separate question,—it cannot undo the actual fact of the tribute. Accordingly, if any one seek to demonstrate that India is prospering under and because of foreign rule, he must make a sufficient deduction on this account from his enumeration of Indian exports, for otherwise he will be committing the fallacy of reiterating the fact of foreign Government as being itself proof of the benefit therefrom.

What then is the cost of foreign rule to India? Let us see how the London Treasury of the Indian Exchequer is filled, and how it is emptied. Let us examine the nature of the “ *Home* ” or London charges of that Government which rules without being domiciled in India. Let us also range several years for comparison, so as to narrow the risk of incompleteness of view to a minimum or to zero (p. 144, Finance and Revenue Accounts)—

## Receipts of the "HOME" or London Treasury.

	1862-63	1863-64	1864-65	1865-66	1866-67 (11 months)	1867-68	1868-69	1869-70
I.—Home Revenues ...	£ 189,056	£ 424,760	£ 195,094	£ 138,367	£ 109,867	£ 104,768	£ 177,436	£ 194,477
II.—Amount received from Her Majesty's Treasury and other Public Departments..	306,938	60,232	106,881	106,565	169,575	1,253,722	5,240,382	1,517,373
III.—Supplies from India ...	6,767,172	9,193,416	6,934,483	7,298,583	6,620,505	4,220,349	3,722,208	7,076,760
IV.—Debt incurred ...	.....	2,441,000	.....	882,800	2,731,900	1,224,407	1,534,139	4,039,412
V.—Indian Railway and other Guaranteed Companies ...	5,293,610	6,135,805	3,935,175	4,178,935	6,780,755	9,085,468	6,389,084	4,793,798
Total ...	12,556,776	18,255,213	11,174,333	12,605,250	16,412,602	15,888,714	17,063,249	17,621,820

Let us examine the nature of these several items of Receipts.

The *first* item "*Home Receipts*" represents mere incidental deductions upon vast disbursements, mere casual and infinitesimal sets-off against payments of enormous magnitude.

The *second* item of Receipts headed "*Amount received from H.M's Treasury and other Public Departments*" purports to represent repayment from the English to the Indian Exchequer of certain charges, all of which had been thrown provisionally, and some of which had been fastened absolutely, on the Indian revenues. This is in accordance with a most objectionable system whereby the Indian Exchequer is compelled to conduct Afghan, Persian, Chinese, Abyssinian or other expeditions, and thus in the first instance to bear the whole cost for the time being, and in the second instance to bear a vast proportion of the cost, or it may be the entire cost for good and all. This system is not only iniquitous in principle, but it is also most objectionable in practice, inasmuch as it disperses responsibility and so far evades control. The details of the re-imburements, so far as these have been disclosed, are set forth in the following Table which will give some idea of the extent to which the Indian is made to minister to the English Exchequer. How little vigilance is exercised on behalf of Indian tax-payers may be surmised from the laxity of that audit (if, indeed, Parliamentary proceedings over Indian budgets may be dignified with the name of auditing), which passes a charge of five or six millions sterling for the Abyssinian Expedition in the lump, and admits charges for a "late" China Expedition so many years after date.

*Details of the second item in the above Table of "HOME" Receipts.  
Amount received from Her Majesty's Treasury and other Public Departments.*

	1862-63	1863-64	1864-65	1865-66	1866-67 (11 months)	1867-68	1868-69	1869-70
	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£
In re-payment of advances in India on account of the emigration of coolies ...	24,607	16,285	44,673	23,727	45,957	34,852	33,683	41,326
Expenses of Madras Troops employed at Labuan ...	5,225	4,917	2,869	9,086	1,177	11,187	5,216	5,622
Out pensioners of Chelsea Hospital... ..	9,596	8,735	7,972	14,686	7,668	11,735	9,886	12,167
Supplies to Her Majesty's ships on the East India station ...	21,108	30,295	51,367	59,966	50,773	76,198	78,017	57,391
Charges of the late China Expedition... ..	242,400	.....	.....	.....	64,000	119,750	.....	.....
In re-payment of disbursements in England and in India, on account of the Abyssinian Expedition... ..	.....	.....	.....	.....	.....	1,000,000	5,113,580	1,400,867
<b>TOTAL ...</b>	<b>306,938</b>	<b>60,232</b>	<b>106,881</b>	<b>106,565</b>	<b>169,575</b>	<b>1,253,722</b>	<b>5,240,382</b>	<b>1,517,373</b>

Returning to the first Table, I must ask a careful consideration for the very instructive process which is betokened by the *third* class of Home Receipts, namely, "*Supplies from India.*" The process is really this :—The Secretary of State first reckons, with more or less accuracy, the amount which he expects to need for his London payments during the succeeding year, and then he advertises from time to time for tenders of drafts upon India. He wishes to place so or so many millions of Indian money in London, and accordingly he invites those London merchants or bankers trading with the East who may be wishing to place London money in India to compete with each other for his drafts upon India. He fixes a certain reserved or minimum rate of so many pence in London for each rupee which he will make over in India, and he invites merchants to bid against each other by tender at or over this rate. Those whose tenders are highest and are accepted, pay the stipulated amount of gold, &c., into the Bank of England, to the credit of the Secretary of State, and they receive his drafts upon India. These drafts are then sent by post to the mercantile correspondents in Calcutta, Madras, or Bombay, as the case may be, are there presented to and cashed by the Government at the Presidency Treasuries, and the proceeds are devoted to the purchase of exports from India consigned to the original London merchants or to some creditors of these London merchants.

Thus, the Secretary of State, in return for so many millions of pounds sterling needed for his London disbursements, finds English merchants in so many krons of rupees at Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras. How does the Secretary of State do so? He orders the Governor-General to empty Indian Treasuries to that amount, and to fill them again out of Indian taxes. These drawings of the Secretary of State form a grotesque chapter in the English Gospel of Free Trade, those glad tidings which shall be unto all peoples; but I reserve this subject for the dynamics or historical review of the compulsory export trade of India. For the present I shall only observe that the rates of exchange obtained from time to time by the Secretary of State vary according to his financial position for the time being. For he is the most important negotiator with the East, and his cash in hand or his cash in immediate prospect are the most important items in any exchange calculation of European business with the East. Further the rates vary according to the commercial vicissitudes of the particular time, for example, the existing rates of discount English and Indian; the scarcity or abundance of floating money within immediate call in England or India; the condition of general mercantile credit at the time; the past results and the present prospects of the Indian trade outward and homeward; the relative proportion

and the intrinsic character of the imports into and the exports from India under actual negotiation at the time being.

The *fourth* heading of Receipts of the Home Treasury is that deplorable item of "*debt incurred*," that register of millions after millions of money which are borrowed and spent without any definite notion whatsoever as to who is to pay the interest charge, and how long or wherewithal, and who is to re-pay the principal. It represents only a part, not the whole, of the recurring entry of our chronic deficit, and in so far it forms the periodical record of our failure, the annual condemnation of our empire in India.

The *fifth* and last item of Receipts entitled "*Indian Railways and other Guaranteed Companies*" calls for some explanation. It has been the practice with those guaranteed Companies, whose interests as Indian mortgagees are watched by the London Directorates, to raise money *as they find convenient* within their statutory powers of borrowing, and pay it into the credit of the Secretary of State at the Bank of England, whereupon they at once acquire a claim to the interest thereon. They expend the same, about two fifths in England and three-fifths in India, *at their discretion* as to progress. In all these arrangements these Directorates possess the initiative, which means the substantial, control, for the nominal post-audit of the Government is practically futile. These Directorates, acting for the Railway mortgagees who are almost all resident in England, have the real control of their incomings and outgoings, but it is the people of India (who are the nominal mortgagors) that bear the real responsibility. Now, of this Railway capital thus raised and paid into the Bank of England, about two-fifths, as I said, is disbursed in England on rails, rolling-stock, coal, freight, &c., in that enormous patronage which these obscure Directorates enjoy within the privacy of their London parlours. The remainder, say three-fifths, (for the proportion of Railway capital raised in India is infinitesimal), is spent by the Secretary of State on the Home or London charges of the Indian Government. Thus, the Secretary of State spends these Railway balances in London, and orders the Governor-General to place a corresponding amount at the disposal of the Railway employes in India, and thereafter to replenish the Indian Treasuries out of debt charged to India.

The Railway accounts, unlike those drawings technically so called of whose fluctuating rates I have just spoken, are adjusted at a fixed rate of exchange, namely, 1s. 10d. per rupee or nominal 2s., that is to say, at a loss of one penny on the shilling or 8½ per cent. In other words for every £100 paid by a Guaranteed Railway Company into the Secretary of State's Treasury, and spent by him in London, the Indian people are required to make

over £108-10, or more correctly Rs. 1,090-14-6 in India. Over and above this the Indian people are obliged to find the Companies in land free of charge, also in a fixed minimum rate of dividend, and in many other comfortable privileges. How far this state of things is in accordance with the professed principles of free trade, and with the moral sense of mankind as to the proper responsibility of capitalists,—I shall not now stop to enquire. The loss by exchange alone which has thus been charged to India during the last twenty years, amounts now to about £4,000,000. The aggregate loss on the guarantee of annual interest amounts now to about £17,000,000. In former days it was often put forth that the loss by exchange, amounting, as I have said, to now some £4,000,000, would ultimately be recouped by a converse gain on re-exchange when the railways would come to repay their subsidy of guaranteed interest, say £17,000,000, and when the railways would come to share with the Government their surplus profits.

Profits! Surplus profits! on Indian Railways!

Such, then, are the ways and means by which the "*Home*" Treasury of the Indian people in London is annually filled. Let us see now the nature of the charges upon which that Treasury is annually emptied. (P. 145, Finance and Revenue Accounts.)



## Disbursements of the "HOME" or London Treasury.

	1862-63	1863-64	1864-65	1865-66	1866-67 (11 months)	1867-68	1868-69	1869-70
	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£
I.—Charges on the Revenues of India except guaranteed interest ...	5,132,464	5,202,390	4,997,495	5,119,552	6,814,469	6,957,187	8,481,277	9,043,949
II.—Gross guaranteed interest on the capital of Railway and other Companies ...	2,166,170	2,457,075	2,686,869	2,897,849	3,043,678	3,494,317	3,894,388	4,138,150
III.—Payments i- England included as charges in the Indian accounts ...	967,833	716,944	833,736	1,442,685	.....	.....	.....	.....
IV.—Disbursements in England in respect of sums received or recoverable in India ...	1,155,102	1,112,728	1,115,565	1,209,149	11,151,128	2,367,812	1,590,876	1,127,899
V.—Debt discharged ...	1,756,200	7,968,500	186,500	28,700	150,000	500	502,500	501,300
VI.—Indian Railway and other Guaranteed Companies ...	1,863,788	1,450,212	2,035,850	3,003,426	3,973,328	4,225,045	2,301,169	2,897,278
VII.—Special disbursements [on account of the Abyssinian Expedition] ...	.....	.....	.....	.....	.....	109,624	100,071	46,743
TOTAL ...	13,041,577	18,907,849	11,856,015	13,701,361	15,132,603	17,154,485	16,870,276	17,755,319

The nature and the magnitude of these several items call for serious reflection. India, it will be seen, is required to maintain an army of such a strength as to be able at any time to lend a military force in China or Abyssinia or wherever British prestige, that is to say the interests of British Commerce, may seem to be menaced. It is futile to pretend that Britain makes full payment to India for this hire of Indian troops if she pays, (when she does pay at all,) the wages and the food of the regiments for the few months when she takes over their services. A veritable refund of cost to India would include not only charges for the time being but also a heavy charge for previous cost of organisation and for subsequent cost of pension list. No doubt Mr. Gladstone was quite right when he made rejoinder to Mr. Fawcett about the Abyssinian expedition money, that *per contra* the British Exchequer received no adequate reimbursement from India for the services of the British army and navy. The fact is, the English dominion of India is a waste of power injurious to the English tax-payer as well as to the Indian. At the same time, inasmuch as the British tax-payer has the option of terminating the arrangement, while the Indian tax-payer although the poorer has no choice whatsoever in the matter, the former deserves little pity for his own folly, but the latter merits the deepest sympathy for *his* helpless plight.

The London, or as they are significantly called the "*Home*" charges of the absentee Government of India, amount at present in nett figures to no less than £13,000,000 a year. In order to understand what these and like enumerations of Indian taxation really denote, one must consider that, whatever may be their potential capacity, yet an acre of Indian soil does actually yield not more but less food and less raiment than an acre of English soil does. When one translates rupees into pounds, one must also make a consideration for the poverty of India similar to that which was indicated in the following words by that great Englishman of our time to whom alone of our living countrymen posterity will award the name of statesman. "I would ask the House," said John Bright in 1853, "to imagine that all steam-engines and all applications of mechanical power were banished from this country (Great Britain); that we were utterly dependent upon mere manual labour. What would you think if the Chancellor of the Exchequer, under such circumstances endeavoured to levy the same taxation which is now borne by the country? From one end of India to the other, with very trifling exceptions, there is no such thing as a steam-engine; but this poor population without a steam-engine, without anything like first-rate tools, are called upon to bear, I will venture to say, the very heaviest taxation under which any people ever suffered

with the same means of paying it. Yet the whole of this money, raised from so poor a population, which would in India "buy four times as much labour, and four times as much of the 'productions of the country as it would obtain in England, is 'not enough to keep the establishments of the Government ; " for, during the last sixteen years the Indian Government has " borrowed £16,000,000 to pay the dividends to the proprietors in " England." When Mr. Bright uttered these words of rebuke, the taxation of British India was only £28,000,000. That taxation has since "*risen*," which being interpreted means that taxation has since been painfully screwed up to £49,000,000, and still it is not enough.

But this consideration of the difference of effectual monetary power of the rupee in India and the florin in England makes the problem still more difficult to solve. This other and all but irresoluble function makes the quantity still more difficult to grasp. In order to give some idea of what £13,000,000 *a year* of "Home" charges really means to the Indian people, I must have recourse again to that same solitary English statesman of our day. He was speaking, as his earnestness will of itself show, to an audience more worthy than the loungers of the House of Commons.

"I believe that I understate the sum when I say that, in the "pursuit of this will-o'-the-wisp (the liberties of Europe and the balance of power), there has been extracted from the industry of the people of this small island [in the 17th, 18th and 19th centuries] no less an amount than £2,000,000,000 sterling. I cannot imagine how much £2,000,000,000 is, and therefore I shall not attempt to make you comprehend it. I presume it is something like those vast and incomprehensible astronomical distances with which we have lately been made familiar ; but however familiar, we feel that we do not know one bit more about them than we did before. When I try to think of that "sum of £2,000,000,000, there is a sort of vision passes before "my mind's eye. I see your peasant labourer delve and plough, "sow and reap, sweat beneath the summer's sun, or grow prematurely old before the winter's blast. I see your noble mechanic, with his manly countenance and his matchless skill, "toiling at his bench or his forge. I see one of the workers "in our factories in the North, a woman, a girl it may be, "gentle and good, as many of them are, as your sisters are, "I see her intent upon the spindle, whose revolutions are so "rapid that the eye fails altogether to detect them, or watching "the alternating flight of the unresting shuttle. I turn again to "another portion of your population, which, 'plunged in mines, "forgets a sun was made,' and I see the man who brings up from

"the secret chambers of the earth the elements of the riches and greatness of his country. When I see all this, I have before me a mass of produce and wealth which I am no more able to comprehend than I am that £2,000,000,000 of which I have spoken; but I behold in its full proportion the hideous error of your Governments, whose fatal policy consumes in some cases a half, never less than a third, of all the results of that industry which God intended should fertilise and bless every home in England, but the fruits of which are squandered in every part of the surface of the globe, without producing the smallest good to the people of England."

Those military expeditions in Europe, for which the English people have been thus burdened with annual taxes and loaded with perpetual debt, corresponded many of them in the profligacy of their origin and the wastefulness of their management to those expeditions and annexations in India, Afghanistan, Persia, China, and Abyssinia which have resulted in a debt of £100,000,000, charged for the present to the populations of India. The former device of resorting to warfare in Europe for out-door relief to the British aristocracy, and the later device of resorting to warfare in Asia for rates-in-aid to the British plutocracy, both belong to that same system of government or conspiracy in the interests of a caste of birth and a hierarchy of wealth which has been worthily and frequently rebuked by our living tribune of the people. "The age of chivalry has gone, and the age of sophists, economists, and calculators has succeeded," but there has been one public man among us worthy of the country of Cromwell, one from whom no metaphysics about wages-fund, supply and demand, nor all the other quackery of a pretended science could shroud the hearts of living men that labour and are heavy laden. If the language which Mr. Bright has adopted for England could be suitably translated into its Indian equivalent, we should be enabled to form some adequate conception of what £13,000,000 a year of Indian taxes expended in London really denotes to the Indian populations. But it would need a master-mind like this own to transpose the key of his regret over poverty in England to the deeper tones of a lamentation over misery in India.

The young men of our time, who have hardly known of John Bright except as the Right Honourable member of a Cabinet, will find it difficult to form any adequate conception of the envious rage with which he was assailed, day after day and year after year, at the instance of an effete patriciate and a demoralised plutocracy. For was he not the impious Sudra wretch, the *novus homo* who, having no ancestry to speak of and no university degree at all, had, nevertheless, presumed to reat statecraft as if it were not, indeed, a mysterious lore reserved

for Brahmans and for other twice-born castes? If the young men of our time would know, as in view of the impending times of our national trouble they certainly ought to know, what is the kind of treatment that a statesman must be prepared to face at the hands of a press shameless because anonymous, then let them look back among other things at those weekly summaries of the views of good society exhibited in the cartoons and lampoons upon John Bright and Abraham Lincoln that shock the casual explorer of old volumes of *Punch*. But there is no need to go so far. Have we not all heard it with our ears last year when a few carpenters and masons gave Paris such a government as Paris had never enjoyed before? \* How convulsed was all good society, fashionable, castellated and coroneted society, throughout Europe, when those Parisian artisans presumed even to penetrate the very mysteries, the *inania arcana* of finance itself, and administered with an economy and a success to which Mr. Gladstone or Sir Richard Temple can never dare to aspire! And yet the highest official pay under that Commune of imperishable renown was only Rs. 200 a month, £240 a year. In our own coming season of English tribulation with its reckoning of £200,000,000 of discredited Indian Securities, when the helm of the State shall have fallen from the incompetent hands of rhetorical drivellers, may the ranks of the English people yield a ruler with the fearlessness of Delescluze, and a financier with the rectitude of Jourde, heroic statesmen with a single eye to duty, who in the hour of our sore need will care as little for calumny as did Abraham Lincoln and John Bright.

Putting aside the verbose metaphysics of political economy about exchanges, we come upon this solid fact. What actually defrays these annual "Home" charges of £13,000,000 is that portion of each season's industry in India which has to be deported to England or to some customer of England, in order to procure an acquittance of this annual demand upon India made by the Queen of England. A compulsory forestalment of £13,000,000 a year in an export business of £57,000,000 is surely a peculiarity which deserves careful attention. Further,

\* It will be long before Parliamentary Government at either Westminster or Versailles yield any reform so worthy as the razure of the Column Vendôme. That solemn act of national purification, in fulfilment of the prophetic command of Comte, has had no parallel in the world's history since the time when King Josiah, making good those words of the Elijahs that had been

the laughing stock of Ahabs and Jezebels, but at the same time shocking all the well-bred and dilettante society of the day throughout the fashionable quarter of Jerusalem, tore down the artistic altar to Chemosh the abomination of Moab, and the neighbouring altar to Ashtoreth the abomination of Sidon, "lust hard by hate."

let it be considered that Indian producers have now-a-days no other staples of industry, no other means of discharging their annual payments than agricultural, raw, unmanufactured, bulky produce. Let it be considered also that the assessment of Home Charges is fixed by the Secretary of State, and that the place of discharge is London; and consequently that Indian tax-payers have to limit their choice of staples to such produce of their soil, as will, after a long voyage, be acceptable in England or in some foreign country indebted to England.

Here my reader will have anticipated me in bethinking himself of other compulsory exports from India besides those which represent the Secretary of State's annual and increasing lien. The English officials, like the English Government of India, have their home out of India, and they also have their private "Home Charges." A large portion of official pay drawn in India out of Indian taxes is necessarily remitted and spent out of India, and this practically constitutes a further drain upon whatever produce is harvested every year in India. These English consumers may or they may not render a full equivalent to the Indian producers. That is a separate question,\* and no answer to that can affect the actual fact of the consumption itself.

Is there any possibility of estimating the amount of this further drain on Indian industry? There are figured estimates which purport to assess both directly and indirectly the whole of that drain on her resources which India has to suffer, because she is governed by aliens and absentees. Were it not for such estimates, there are many people who would never appreciate the difficulties of the Indian situation, nor obtain definiteness to ideas and misgivings otherwise misty. Apart from this service which these estimates confer, they have little to commend them for intrinsic accuracy.

The standard of measure, as I shall by and by show, is utterly inadequate. Yet it does help to indicate that there is a difficulty at all to be solved, and therefore I proceed to quote one or two of the more carefully considered estimates.

First of all I take an estimate framed in 1868 by Mr. Robert Knight, Editor of the *Indian Economist*, an estimate which was published in Vol. II. of the East India Association's Journal, "*England's Financial Relations with India*," page 254.

"Lastly, India, from the double misfortune of being at once a "poor country, and a country governed by strangers whose

---

\* In Dr. Congreve's "India," 1857, (Trübner & Co.) will be found a demonstration of the fact that English consumers do *not* render an adequate equivalent to Indian producers, and also a brief exposition of the general nature of the reform which ought to be instituted by Great Britain towards India.

"administration is not only very costly but marked by all the evils of *absenteesism*, has been unable to construct her railway system out of indigenous capital, but has had to borrow three-fourths of it (£70,000,000) at 5 per cent. The result is that she has now to remit £3,500,000 of produce every year to this country [England] as interest to her railway creditors. You will not suppose me to be complaining of this for a moment. I am simply explaining her position: you will see at a glance how greatly better her position would have been if she had had capital enough to build her railways out of her own resources: and she would have had it but for the Home Charges. And the general result of all this is—that whereas the total *annual drain* upon her resources thirty years ago was estimated at £5,000,000 a year (Sir C. Trevelyan's evidence before the Lords' Committee, 1840), it is now not less than £16,000,000 a year, thus:—

" 1. Home Charges [London expenditure of the	£
" Indian Government] ... ..	6,500,000
" 2. Private Remittances, &c. [ <i>i.e.</i> , of English em-	
" ployés in India] .. ...	5,000,000
" 3. Interest upon Anglo-Indian debt which is held	
" in Britain ... ..	1,000,000
" 4. Interest guaranteed to Railway Shareholders	3,500,000
	<hr/>
Total ... ..	£16,000,000

"That is to say, before India can now import an ounce of silver, or a ton of iron, or a yard of piece goods, or a pound of copper,—all vital necessities to her,—she must ship year by year £16,000,000 of her produce to England to meet our present standing claim upon her. Until this annually recurring drain has been met she cannot import a sixpence worth of anything, let her necessities be what they may."

The paper setting forth this estimate of the drain upon India was read at a meeting of the East India Association with Sir Henry Rawlinson, one of the Members of the Home Council, in the chair. It was subjected to the severest scrutiny at the time, but was not substantially impugned either as to the figures, so far as the figures went, or as to the general principle of the reckoning. It was afterwards noticed with official commendation by Sir Stafford Northcote, then Secretary of State for India. (*Journal, Association, April 1868.*)

The second estimate which I shall cite is one framed in 1871, by Mr. Dadabhai Naoroji, a Parsi gentleman, who at that time was Secretary to the same Association. The gist of it is as follows:—

	£
1. Home Charges of the Secretary of State ...	7,000,000
2. Interest on Railway Stock ...	4,000,000
3. Private Remittances of English employes, say, 2,500 civilians covenanted and uncove- nanted, 5,000 military officers, 60,000 pri- vate soldiers in receipt of about £9,000,000, pay. Also some minor items ...	5,000,000

Total annual drain upon India ... £16,000,000

The paper setting forth this estimate was read and discussed in two meetings of which Sir Charles Trevelyan, formerly of the Bengal Civil Service, afterwards Secretary of the British Treasury, Governor of Madras and Finance Minister of India, was Chairman. The paper seems to have elicited some murmuring at the meetings, and a good deal of hostile criticism in the Anglo-Indian press. But the general principle of the figures, so far as they went, was not successfully impugned. It was suggested, indeed, that these views as coming from a native of India savoured of sedition and might be dangerous, the very same silly argument which we have all heard so often advocated for silence about absenteeism and about crushed out manufactures in Ireland, as if, forsooth, it were the discussions about hardships and not the hardships themselves that lead to political outrages.

The grand conclusion to which Mr. Knight and Mr. Naoroji led up their reasoning was this : that the Government ought to borrow more of London money for Indian public works, so as to enable India to recruit from a drain which otherwise must ultimately exhaust her. In other words what they urged is to pile further mortgage upon that existing debt which already burdens India so heavily. Mr. Knight and Mr. Naoroji alluded to the spectre of Indian famine; but those loans, which they were unwise enough to solicit in greater profusion, would certainly aggravate and not relieve the starvelings of India, for their ultimate and sole nett result would be to divert further field produce from consumption in India to consumption in England, in order to defray the new interest charges coming due in London. There is not one of our public works in India but costs more than it yields.

These, then, are instances of the direct method of estimating by a monetary standard, the actual cost in which English rule stands India. I proceed to describe another, an indirect, attempt to measure the annual drain upon India. The method in this case is to set all the aggregates of exports or sales from India for a long period of years against all the aggregates of imports into or purchases by India of the same period of time, and to deduce from these the approximate amount of the business which,



it is supposed, would not have occurred, but for the English rule of India.

Now, this process is certainly less faulty than those other processes which we have just been examining. For spread as it is over a longer period of time, it approaches more nearly to the only scientific process in such cases, that of sociology, or the method of enquiring according to the entirety as opposed to the process of political economy or the method of enquiry by the severalty.\*

The attempt to estimate the cost of English rule by this process of analysing the Custom House statistics of British India, although it also is defective, as I shall presently show, is yet suggestive even in its defects; and, in any case, it is instructive to those who have been accustomed to rely on political economy as a competent solution of such problems.

The process is as follows:—

When a series of Indian Customs' Returns is subjected to examination, it is discovered that there is ordinarily a large excess of exports over imports; or in other words, that India, unlike any other country, apparently sells more than she buys. In any other country the figures of imports exceed the figures of exports, and the difference may be taken to indicate, though not really to measure, the profit which that country secures upon its share of the world's business. Whence then the peculiar shortcoming in the case of India? The answer, a stereotyped answer, is as follows:—

"Such a hiatus is natural in a commerce between a primitive people and an advanced people. India is not only a country inhabited by people of primitive, simple habits, with comparatively few wants, but it is also destitute of silver-mines, and therefore, may reasonably be expected to require and to obtain bullion instead of manufactured goods in return for so much of its own exports as are not balanced by its imports of foreign wares. Now, this, in actual fact, is the precise condition of Indian commerce."

\* The distinction will be appreciated by every one who has any acquaintance with the elementary principles of sound biology. The biologist who has learnt from Bichat or Broussais the futility of such metaphysical entities as the vital principle and so forth (our professional dissertations about cholera and cat-disease in India are full of them), will readily understand how illusory are the similar metaphysics of political economy about prices, rent supply and demand, &c. As for those men

who have acquired no knowledge of the biological laws of the individual organism, they are no more competent to expound the sociological laws of the social organism, than would be that pretender who should attempt to expound astronomy without ever having learnt mathematics, and who should resort, like the Ptolemaic enquirers, to such metaphysical deductions as that of "the planets moving necessarily in a circle, because, forsooth, of a certain innate perfection in the circular figure."

Accordingly, it is often asserted deliberately, even by responsible officials, that the excess of merchandise exported from India over the merchandise imported into India is liquidated in silver. That is not really the case. Between the spring of 1834, at the termination of the Company's China monopoly, and the spring of 1871, the registered exports from India *inclusive of bullion* have amounted to 1057 millions sterling. (Commercial Statistics, page 191.) During the same period the registered imports into India *also inclusive of bullion* have amounted to 901 millions sterling. Thus even the official returns admit that India's business with the rest of the world, the most part of which has been transacted immediately with England, and all of which has been powerfully impelled by influence from England, has resulted in India's incomings falling short of her outgoings by 156 millions sterling. In other words, India trading with the world, and chiefly with England has for the last 36 years been making over by sales more than she has been able to recover by purchases to the amount of  $4\frac{1}{2}$  millions sterling a year. If this really represents a process of *voluntary* exchange as between India and England, in accordance with the description of our economists and officials, it may well remind us of another episode of commerce as between Asiatic and European, and like that also it calls for a good deal of theological interposition by way of explanation, and I therefore recommend the subject in both aspects, that of theology and that of political economy, to Mr. Gladstone's congenial mind.

“Ὡς ἄρα φωνήσαντε, καθ’ ἑπώνων αἰξάντε  
 χεῖρας τ’ ἀλλήλων λαβέτην καὶ πιστώσαντο.  
 “Ὡς αὖτε Γλαύκῃ Κρονίδῃς φρένας ἔξελετο Ζεὺς  
 ὅς πρότι Τυδείδην Διομήδεα τέχνε’ ἄμειβεν  
 χρύσεια χαλκείων, ἱκατόμβοι’ ἐννεαβοίων.

But putting aside all theology and in particular Mr. Gladstone's special postulate of England's divinely constituted trusteeship over India, ordinary men of plain understanding will remark that the annual exports from India show only what India has made over absolutely, whereas much of the imports represents debt forcibly imposed upon, not earnings freely acquired, by India. Nor is this all. Those who have attempted to gauge the drain on Indian resource by balancing the exports against the imports insist on adding as a surcharge to the exports the nett amount of enfaced rupee paper which, at the close of the period under review, has been outstanding on the London register of Indian debt. On the 31st March 1869,\* this amount was £16,000,000. According, then, to such

\* I am not aware of the figures on 31st March 1871.

estimates this outstanding amount, being debt, must have previously appeared in one shape or another among imports into the Indian harbours, but on their way out of India they must have escaped registration by the Customs Department, inasmuch as they were then only book debts or paper securities transferred inside of envelopes through the Post Office. The economists who compile these tables assure us that the accounts of exported outgoings and imported incomings, after being thus purged by adjustments of this sort, will show approximately a residuum of exchanges truly spontaneous and no longer compulsory, a residuum, therefore, available for treatment according to the assumptions of what they are pleased to call their science.

Estimates of this kind have, as I said, a certain degree of utility, but they are necessarily defective. The phenomena of English intercourse with India are moral as well as material; and whether moral or material they are too inextricably interwoven to be measurable by any enumeration of bales and hogsheads. Publicists who confine themselves to such incommensurate methods of treating social phenomena commit the same error as Mr. Bruce the explorer of the Nile would have committed, if he had tried to explain the phenomena of cow bleeding by balancing so many ounces and grains of fibrine, serum, &c., withdrawn against so many pounds of grass and water taken in by the cow. Writers like Mr. Knight, or Dr. Hunter, who follow up mere monetary arguments according to political economy about our Indian affairs, and who seek to remedy famine in India by more borrowing from London, commit the same error as Mr. Bruce would have done if he had also urged on the Abyssinians that there was nothing like a sharp lancet to staunch a bleeding.

For my own part I reject a mere monetary canon as being utterly incommensurate with the Indian question. Even if I accepted this as sufficient, I could not but remark on the extreme and hopeless complexity of a figured calculation with far-reaching deductions on this side and intricate surcharges on that. Moreover, when the economist has exhausted all his devices over both the sides of the equation, he never succeeds after all in resolving that unknown quantity which he seeks to attain. For the data which he needs, and which he therefore naïvely assumes, namely, the insularity of individual existence on the one hand, and on the other hand the freedom of exertion on the part of the millions of natives concerned, are actually negated in the very statement of his case. The hypotheses which he feigns, do not in reality cover the actual facts whether inclusively or exclusively, and his conclusions are therefore as visionary as his premises. These attempts to strike balances between England and India with figures gross here and sums nett there, dealing now with

mortgage capital imported and now with mortgage interest exported, are surely at variance with the sound logic of practical exigencies as set forth in the universal experience of ordinary life. Would a banker ever depart in this way from the method of the entirety and plunge into the method of severalty? Would he consent to recast the figures of transactions already finished? Would he consent to blot out gross entries here and substitute nett entries there? Would he recast a ledger and a journal long ago closed so as to make it accord with some retrospective hypothesis? Yes: there have been banks for which such operations have been necessary. But these banks were in liquidation, and their directors were on their trial.

By these several tentative estimates I have indicated the general nature, but I have not and could not have furnished an exact numerical measure, of the influence of English rule upon Indian commerce. I come now to examine the actual nature of the several staples of export from India. I take the latest year for which statistics are available, namely, 1870-71 (page 203, Trade and Navigation Blue Book):—

Article.	Value.
	£
Coffee ... ..	809,701
Cotton, raw ... ..	19,460,899
Cotton goods, including twist and yarn	1,410,013
Indigo ... ..	3,192,503
Grain, Rice ... ..	4,146,638
„ Wheat, &c. ... ..	322,356
Hides and Skins ... ..	2,020,857
Jute, raw ... ..	2,577,552
Opium ... ..	10,783,863
Seeds ... ..	3,522,305
Silk, raw ... ..	1,351,346
Sugar and Sugarcandy ... ..	295,076
Wool, raw ... ..	670,647
Other articles of merchandise ... ..	4,768,069
<b>TOTAL MERCHANDISE</b> ... ..	<b>55,331,825</b>
<b>TREASURE</b> ... ..	<b>2,220,765</b>
<i>Total Exports</i> ... ..	<i>57,552,590</i>

Now, upon glancing even cursorily over these details of the boasted 57½ millions sterling of exports, one cannot help noticing that opium alone figures for 10½ millions, nearly a fifth of the whole exports of the empire. This certainly represents a vast revenue for the alien governors of India. But it forms no proof

of welfare nor disproof of hardship secured by the governors for the governed of India, when the welfare or the hardship of the governed is the very question in issue. I heard Mr. Grant Duff in a recent budget-speech emphatically praise this opium revenue as a splendid estate for India, and I felt the degradation of my fellow-countrymen to be complete when I heard this high official (from whom, unlike to Sir Charles Wood, 'Heaven had not withheld the gift of articulate utterance') finally exult over the magnitude of British concerns in Asia as a consolation for British inaction during a supreme crisis of oppression in Europe. Magnitude of Indian concerns! Magnitude also of Indian deficits!

Here are some of the drawbacks to India's "splendid estate" in opium:

*First*, the two millions sterling that are devoted every year to opium in Behar are not private means adventured at private risk. They are partly the proceeds of the salt poll-tax, paid possibly by wretches whose deaths by starvation in the following year will be attributed, forsooth, to a casualty in the harvest; they are partly the proceeds of the enormous justice-taxes of stamps; partly the proceeds of other taxes; and all of them are wrung from scanty earnings. It is with these sums that an omnipotent Chancellor backed by 200,000 bayonets enters into competition with the petty chandlers and hucksters of the village booths in Behar in their struggles to earn a livelihood by their advances for the cultivation of other staples of agriculture than the poppy. Let the condition of Behar cultivators be imagined from the miserable fact that advances have to be made at all on such a scale at every seed time. This is not the only curious feature of the glorious gospel of English Free Trade for India as administered at the opium agencies of Behar and Benares. The opium agents of Government exercise a summary jurisdiction, and are not subordinate to the Civil Courts in their adjustments with the heavily indebted cultivators. Burke's description of the procedure over the poppy holds good to this day. "The inability of the cultivators to keep accounts places them at the discretion of the agents of the 'supreme power to make their balances what the agents please, and these agents can recover the balances not by legal process but by seizure of the cultivators' goods and imprisonment of their persons. One and the same dealer makes the advance, values the return, states the account, passes the judgment, and executes the process." True, the summary jurisdiction is said to be seldom enforced, but the power is carefully provided by statute. The attitude of Government to the cultivators of the poppy is liberality tempered by a discretionary prerogative of distress. The system may be unavoidable or it may be admirable, but at

least it should not be tinselled over with the mockery of Free Trade phraseology.

A *second* drawback to this "splendid estate of opium" consists in the application of taxes to displace food grain from the most fertile spots of the fertile territory of Behar and Malwa. These are provinces which have suffered most severely from dearth and famine in recent years. In the Parliamentary Blue-Book on the Moral and Material Progress (!) of India during the year 1868-69, prominent mention is made of the aggravation to the terrible famine of Rajputana caused by the extent of poppy cultivation in Malwa. I may as well anticipate any sophistical evasions on this subject by pointing out that the people of the feudatory territories, thus in fact brought under official review, are our subjects. We are responsible for them. We should certainly not hesitate to enforce obedience from them. We take care to secure the lion's share of the opium profits by our political and fiscal system of passes and pass duties on opium in Central and Western India.

A *third* mischief of the "splendid estate in opium" is the chronic disorder to which the finances of India are subjected through the spasmodic fluctuations of that branch of the revenue. The proceeds of a good year are spent to the full without any reserve being put aside; for the system of so called cash balances of revenue, consisting as they do, mainly of borrowed money, does not deserve the name of a reserve. The consequence is that in a bad year the exchequer is left to shift for ways and means as best it can, with a scale of expenditure and establishments already aggrandised by the profuse habits of previous plethora. The neglect to provide a reserve extends not only to each financial year by itself, but to the entire series of years. The opium revenue is doomed. It will succumb either to a gust of popular feeling among the cultivators as to remuneration for the poppy; or, more probably, it will crumble away before a pressure of popular feeling and of Government policy in China. No campaign in behalf of British commerce in China will then be able to retrieve the opium revenue of the English Government of India. No farther war of compulsory debauchery will add another to the oriental disgraces of the English Government. Never again will a Napoleon intrigue for the Jesuit vote at the rural *plébiscite*, nor reach out the hand of a corrupt dynasty in France to that of a corrupt plutocracy in England for a joint propaganda of Christianity and opium in China. The policy of "*commerce united with and made to flourish by war*" may continue to be blazoned on the Guildhall of London town, but it has been irrevocably condemned by the proletariates of France and England. It would be as much as crown, lords, and commons are worth to wage another opium campaign in China.

Of the moral damage inflicted by our opium policy, I shall not now speak. The subject is too momentous to be treated of as an episode in the enumeration of exports and imports.

As regards the other staples, besides opium, of the Indian export trade, I defer the examination of these until I come to the Dynamics. Meanwhile there are a few general considerations about Indian exports which deserve to be noticed under the present subject of the Statics of Indian Commerce.

The enumeration of two score and seventeen millions sterling of Indian exports,—a quarter of the exports of the United Kingdom, as recited in an Indian budget-speech—seems to suggest, and is meant to suggest, a sense of ample security for loans. For it is implied that India possesses a proportionate amount of invested capital, corresponding to that wonderful accumulation of the labour of past and present generations which England enjoys in the railways, the roads, the bridges, the pavements, the drains, the water-works, the lighthouses, the quays, in fact the entire social plant of England. But it is a fatal error to infer, as many do from the table of Indian exports as collated with the table of English exports, that the accumulated resource or the earning capacity of India corresponds in any such ratio to the accumulated resource, or the earning capacity of England. Consider for a moment how vast an amount of private personal income is comprised in English rent alone. But the fund which in India would more or less correspond to English rent has had to surrender to our exchequer at different times 90 per cent., 75 per cent., 66 per cent., 50 per cent. of the rent. Nor is it the actual rent that is thus subjected to assessment for Indian land revenue. The fiscal department determines, without appeal, what they choose to consider the potential rent, and this potential—not actual—rent is what is constituted the basis of the assessment.

Indian officials often ply a similar sleight-of-hand about the Indian debt as compared with other debts, similar to that which they ply about Indian exports and imports as compared with other exports and imports. They describe the Indian debt as only twice the annual income, or, including the railway liabilities four times the annual income; and they contrast this with the English debt as being eight times the annual income. This sophistry is as silly as it is profligate. The ratios are utterly incommensurate. For India has no such taxable residuum as that which England possesses in the rental of the landlords and the profits of the capitalists. As regards the debt itself, the difference in burden of interest charge between a debt held within and a debt held outside of the country is a feature of the comparison which ought not to be left out of view. Again, it has

never been heard that tax-payers in England, like tax-payers in India, are so poor as to starve to death sometimes by the million.

If an export trade of 57 millions sterling, including nearly 11 millions of the Government monopoly of opium, seem such a mighty thing as an index of monetary power in the world's market over the world's produce, then let it be considered how much of this is forestalled by pre-existing annual liabilities. The army alone with its subsidiary services costs some 20 millions sterling, and absorbs the whole of the land revenue yielded within the empire. Nor does this prodigious amount exhibit the whole actual cost of our Indian army. For in addition to the stupendous ransoms shown in the military budget, there is a farther taxation, most heavy and harassing, imposed on the peasantry who have the misfortune to dwell along the line of march from cantonment to cantonment. When a regiment moves on the most ordinary and regular relief (and the reliefs now-a-days with so many English troops going backwards and forwards are numerous and costly), the husbandmen on the line of march are requisitioned for carts, cattle, fodder and provisions as if for an enemy traversing a hostile country. Everyone knows the shifts to which ryots resort when a regiment is on the move, how they dismantle their carts, hide the axles, bury the wheels in water, and hurry off with their bullocks to the jungle. Such is English free trade in India, and such is the hold that we have on the hearts of the people ! And even the enormous budget of 20 millions sterling represents the cost of the army only on a peace footing. For on the slightest disturbance, and throughout all the period of actual warfare, this military budget, gigantic as it is already, mounts at a rate unknown in any other country's costly experience of the costliness of war.

So much for the export trade of India. I shall return to it when I come to the dynamics of my subject. Meanwhile I proceed to the import trade of India in its statical view. Here is a classified schedule of all the imports, merchandise as well as treasure, for 1870-71, the latest year for which returns are available (pp. 195,191, Trade and Navigation Returns) :—



## Imports, 1870-71.

CLASS.	GOODS.	VALUE.	TOTAL.
		£	£
Cotton	Cotton Twist and Yarn ...	3,400,002	19,044,869
	Cotton Piece Goods ...	15,644,867	
Metal	Machinery of all kinds ...	447,570	4,627,229
	Railway materials & stones ...	1,466,068	
	Metals manufactured, except railway materials ...	850,319	
	Metals, raw except ditto ...	1,863,272	
Liquor	Malt Liquors ...	346,389	1,185,818
	Spirits ...	405,381	
	Wines and liqueurs ...	434,048	
Silk and Wool	Silk, Raw ...	895,563	1,903,429
	Silk Goods ...	425,527	
	Woollen Goods ...	582,339	
Salt and Sugar	Salt ...	715,892	1,271,693
	Sugar, Sugarcandy & Loaf ...	555,801	
Other articles of Merchandise	... ..	.....	5,380,868
Total Merchandise...	... ..	.....	33,413,906
Treasure imported...	... ..	.....	5,444,823
	Grand Total of all Imports ...	.....	38,858,729

During the year 1870-71 the importation of silver was on a scale much lower than had prevailed during the previous 15 years when State mortgage and Railway mortgage were being piled on the country. The consequence was that in 1870-71, India presented the anomalous spectacle of a country having to sell 19 millions sterling of goods more than she was able to buy, whereas other countries expect to find their imports exceeding their exports in value, the difference representing to some extent the country's profit on the international business. I shall have occasion to recur to the depressed condition of Indian business in 1870-71 when I come to treat of the dynamics of the bullion trade.\* The imports *returned* as merchandise were on the usual scale in 1870-71, with the exception

\* Meanwhile I may extract from the figures of the treasure importation the official Trade Return (page 191) for the last 20 years :—

of liquor which in each of the two previous years had been imported to the amount of more than a million and a half sterling.

When finance ministers point to this great array of figures as demonstrating the prosperity of the people of India, I must demur. When I consider the multitudes of people among whom these 38 millions sterling of imports have to be distributed, I think each native or each native family succeeds in buying but a very little indeed. Again, I cannot but recollect that much of the 38 millions sterling does not represent purchases of the natives at all. I cannot but think of those grim figures of new and enormous mortgage over which a glib rhetorician "to whom Heaven has conceded the gift of articulate utterance" slurs with the easy elegance of an apostle of *geist*, as thus :—

	NEW DEBT ON ACCOUNT OF DEFICITS, ORDINARY AND EXTRAORDINARY.	NEW MORTGAGE BY CREATION OF FRESH RAILWAY STOCK.	TOTAL.
	£	£	£
1866-67 ...	2,517,489	9,862,190	12,379,679
1867-68 ...	1,610,157	7,088,027	8,698,184
1868-69 ...	4,141,644	3,287,155	7,431,799
1869-70 ...	2,480,945	6,225,971	8,706,916

To these stupendous amounts India has been made to import debt, and much of these burdensome goods never reach India at all, except as a book debt entry with order to pay the interest in each of the succeeding years. Those transactions which are settled in this way may accrue and be adjusted far out of the bounds of India, and yet they are paraded as a proof of the natives' prosperity. Concerning that portion of the imports of debt which do reach India at all, and obtain entry in the Customs returns, it is unnecessary and it would be difficult to trace, except merely in a general way, which is the new State mortgage, or which is the new Railway stock that has swollen the imports of each particular year.

					£
Annual average	1849-50 to 1853-54	...	...	...	4,792,802
"	" 1854-55 " 1858-59	...	...	...	11,275,150
"	" 1859-60 " 1863-64	...	...	...	17,091,515
"	" 1864-65 " 1868-69	...	...	...	17,617,777
Actual in	1869-70	...	...	...	3,954,807
"	" 1870-71	...	...	...	5,444,823

Thus, we find that much of these wonderful and boasted figures of Indian imports represent (a) mortgages imposed from abroad by foreign compulsion, (b) dead-weight of new debt which is irrevocably destined to entail immediate and absolute annual loss, (c) dead-weight of new stock on account of works euphemistically called reproductive which are not less certain to terminate in a similar drain upon Indian resource. These transactions do not represent annual purchases acquired by the natives of their own free choice out of discretionary earnings. The public works are called reproductive, and they are doubtless very profitable and very nice for the cotton and iron capitalists of the Mersey, the Tyne and the Clyde, all possessed of powerful Parliamentary interest, but they certainly impoverish the people of the Ganges, the Godavery, and the Nerbudda. Is it upon such factitious expansion of customs' figures of imports that India and England are to be congratulated on their mutual commerce? These deft optimists would have pronounced hosannas over the development of Anglo-Abyssinian commerce and wealth at Annesley Bay during the recent expedition to the Red Sea, or over the increase of Anglo-Crimean business shown at Balaklava during the war in the Euxine. When Aden and Gibraltar come to be given up, as they certainly\* will be when England comes to be better governed than now, then a set of similar sophists will be found to deprecate the surrender on the usual argument that a healthy and increasing trade, (to wit, at Gibraltar smuggling

\* Afin d'éviter la révolution démocratique par l'évolution sociocratique, le patriciat britannique doit autant régénérer sa politique au dehors qu'au dedans. Il faut d'abord éteindre les derniers symptômes d'une disposition oppressive envers les autres éléments d'occidentalité, surtout, en faisant cesser l'injurieuse anomalie que soumet à l'Angleterre une ville d'Andalousie.

\* \* \*

Alors ils [les hommes d'Etat britanniques] pourront pleinement développer, à leur éternel honneur, comme à l'immense profit de leur peuple, et même du monde entier, les principaux avantages de leur situation exceptionnelle, que neutralise jusqu'ici l'empirisme stationnaire. Mais si leur conversion tarde trop, ils se trouveront dévancés par l'élite du prolétariat britannique, que des étu-

des spontanées, bientôt systématisées par le positivisme, disposent à faire irrésistiblement surgir les dignes successeurs de Cromwell. Quoique la révolution démocratique ait averti faute d'une doctrine et d'une situation convenables, elle a laissé, chez les meilleures âmes britanniques, des germes imperissables, déjà voisins d'une pleine maturité. Ni la compression intérieure, ni la diversion extérieure, ne peuvent plus entraver des tendances qui, fondées sur l'ensemble du passé, prévaudraient finalement quand même l'évolution anglaise s'accomplirait isolément. Elles doivent bientôt devenir irrésistible lorsque l'avènement du prolétariat central [français] à la dictature systématique fera par tout un digne appel aux sympathies populaires. (*Politique Positive*, iv, 493.)

across the Spanish customs lines), is being transacted at the historic rocks of southern Spain and southern Arabia.

Again, when these sanguine gentlemen demand men's admiration over the 38 millions of Indian imports as being figured and *therefore* cogent proof of the prosperity of the native population, they are bound in common honesty to show separately how much of these represents goods destined for English residents, and how much represents commodities really destined for those native consumers whose condition is the very and the sole question in hand. A return of the claret imported for the mess, a return of the beer imported for the canteen of an English regiment, merely recapitulates so much taxes previously raised from natives as revenue, or so much mortgage previously charged to natives as debt, and now passing into consumption in the form of wine and malt liquor. Are such statements to be adduced as a demonstration that native taxpayers have either possessed the means or exercised the discretion of buying commodities to this amount?

One beholds dearth chronic and famine frequent, and one marvels what we are to appeal to when we come to be challenged by the starvelings to show cause to the world why this polity of ours should last one hour longer. Meanwhile the flippant optimist flaunts a schedule of 38 millions sterling of imports, a schedule which he has not even had the decorum to co-ordinate into some semblance of truthfulness.

Here is an enumeration, and only a partial enumeration of certain articles which figure in the 38 millions of imports, but notoriously do not enter at all in most cases, and in some cases enter only infinitesimally into consumption, on really native account.

	Declared value.	Remarks.
	£	
Agricultural implements	10,781	
Animals—Horses only	68,345	Chiefly from Australia, mostly for English residents and for Government cavalry.
Apparel	433,097	Chiefly from England, and imported for English residents.
Arms, ammunition, and military stores ...	74,297	
Art, works of ...	11,050	
Bottles ...	11,139	
Bricks ...	4,260	
Cabinet-ware ...	24,655	Most of this apparently destined for Govt. House at Bombay.

Candles	...	...	54,793
Carriages	...	...	21,736
Cement for building and engineering	...	...	9,002
Clay for ditto	...	...	2,654
Coal and Coke...	...	...	467,096
Corks	...	...	13,109
Earthen and Porcelain-ware	...	...	74,819
Glass-ware	...	...	194,065
Government Stores	...	...	65,659
Groceries	...	...	12,799
Ice	...	...	13,951
Instruments, scientific	...	...	18,872
Liquors	{	Ales	311,686
		Ciders	711
		Wines	433,336
		Spirits	385,900
Lucifer Matches	...	...	41,571
Machines and Machinery	...	...	447,543
Military and other official Uniforms	...	...	10,639
Musical Instruments for regimental bands	...	...	3,517
Musical Instruments of other kinds	...	...	25,762
Naval Stores	...	...	87,122
Paper	...	...	279,544
Photographic materials	...	...	6,509
Provisions and Oilman's stores	...	...	292,520
Railway materials	...	...	1,466,067
Soap	...	...	12,578
Tea	...	...	114,055
Telegraphic materials	...	...	4,559
Tobacco	...	...	75,432
Toys and Games	...	...	38,996
<b>Total " Merchandise "</b>			<b>£5,624,206</b>

Thus we find that of the vaunted 38 millions sterling of imports, 5 millions at least never find their way to those natives whose prosperity these figures are adduced to prove. If the original schedule were in such detail as to admit of fuller sifting, the deduction on this account would be found still greater. As it is, let us assume that the whole of the remainder of imports, namely, £33,234,523, does find its way to the 200

millions of natives in India, including of course the population of the Independent States, and we find that the figured demonstration of welfare represents a consumption of just 3s. 4d. per head. During the same year the consumption of foreign imports in the United Kingdom came to £9-16-9 per head (Statistical Abstract, U.K., Parliamentary Paper). In other words, measured by this test, (it is a favourite one among English economists), the people of India are 60 times poorer than those of the United Kingdom. How long is this system to last, of making these poverty-stricken millions entertain and pay for an army recruited from a population 60 times wealthier than they, a population whose boast it is to possess the highest standard of comfort in the world? What wonder that an Indian province should now-a-days be continually on the brink of famine?

If we could extricate, compile, and put aside the whole of those Indian imports which represent the private income, the public debt, and the railway mortgage held by aliens and absentees, and which become, all of them, more or less burdensome to Indian industry, we should find that the remainder of the goods represents for the natives, for those millions who plough and sow, not luxury, not wealth, hardly even the comforts, but only the mere barest necessities of life. That residuum of imports which really returns to the labourers in exchange for all their exports records not the welfare, but only the survival of the native population. It is well that our millions of subjects here should have succeeded in buying some metal wherewith to repair or replace their household utensils. It is well that in 1870-71, the year of our review, the ryot should have succeeded in buying some little of the costly fabrics of Manchester for himself and his family. But the scanty dividends of every Indian bank of discount or exchange, and the still scantier profits of every mercantile firm in this country for that same year, disclosed the gulf which separates English sellers from Indian buyers. The returns of metals and of piece goods imported for 200 millions of people may seem a large amount in the aggregate, but how will this warrant the farther profusion of loans from England?—how will this warrant the farther imposition of mortgages upon India? It is all very well that in the year under review the people of Bengal should have succeeded in importing 435,337 cwts. of foreign salt, mostly from Liverpool, valued in Calcutta at £688,265. It is all very well that the people of Bengal should have succeeded not only in buying this salt but in paying taxes thereon over and above to the unparalleled amount of several hundred per cent. on prime cost. These are among the “spirit-stirring facts” which, according to Sir Richard Temple, “recall the sentiment of “the historian [whatever that may mean], excite thankfulness

"in all hopeful minds, and hope in the breast of all patriots."\* To humbler men it cannot but be a subject of grief, that the inhabitants of the Bengal Presidency should not be allowed to partake more freely of the cheap salt of their own country which is cast up so bountifully along the shores of their own lakes and seas. Would it stir the patriotic soul of Sir Richard Temple to include in his enumeration of assessments a revenue from rainfall? Would his heart glow with sentiment over his budget if he could succeed in sealing up the clouds of the firmament over India, and compel the Hindu husbandman to purchase the rain and the dew from a Glasgow monopolist of the monsoon, and over and above pay a duty of several hundred per cent. *ad-valorem*?

Such a measure, if it were but practicable, would certainly obtain full justification in those extraordinary doctrines which have recently been propounded in the highest quarters about the water rights and the forest rights of an alien government. The Hindu and Muhammadan might almost adopt the very words of the Lamentation of Jeremiah.—"Our inheritance is turned to strangers, our houses to aliens. Our necks are under persecution, we labour and have no rest. Servants have ruled over us: there is none that doth deliver us out of their hand.

\* His financial exposition, 6th March 1869.

It is well to turn from bunkum of this sort to the words of a real Statesman, just to put the bad taste out of one's mouth. Mr. Bright once refuted a similar argument in these words; "Some people believe that it is a good thing to pay a great revenue to the State. Even so eminent a man as Lord John Russell is not without a delusion of this sort. \* \* \* Sometime ago he made a speech, in which there was a great deal to be admired, to a meeting composed, it was said, to a great extent of working men; and in it he stimulated them to a feeling of pride in the greatness of their country and in being citizens of a State which enjoyed a revenue of £100,000,000 a year which included revenues of the United Kingdom and of British India. But I think it would have been far more to the purpose if he could have congratulated the working

men of Liverpool on *this* vast empire being conducted in an orderly manner, on *its* laws being well administered and well obeyed; *its* shores sufficiently defended; *its* people prosperous and happy, on a revenue of £20,000,000. The State indeed, of which Lord John Russell is a part, may enjoy a revenue of £100,000,000, but I am afraid the working men can only be said to enjoy it in the sense, in which men, not very choice in their expressions, say that for a long time they have enjoyed very bad health."

Now turn to page 303, and contrast with Mr. Bright's dignified conception of veritable political greatness, the "boundless prairie" phillistinism of Mr. Grant Duff. "Sweetness and light," forsooth! Clammy sweetness and garish light, fit for the *Daily Telegraph*, or for the British House of Commons, or for the caucus of an American orator on the stump declaiming—

About our patriotic pas an' our star-spangled banner  
Our country's bird a lookin' on an' singin' out hosanner.

" Our skin was black like an oven because of the terrible famine.  
 " *We have drunken our water for money ; our wood is sold*  
 " *unto us.*"

In a recent number of this *Review* there was a translation from the Bengali of a few lines in which some village rhymester had described these same lofty prerogatives which have recently been incorporated with *la haute politique*.—

" The fruit of so much labour, the blood of the bodies of the  
 " people,

" Taking this to preserve their rule—*what sort of greatness*  
 " *is this ?*

" This is killing a cow to supply a Brahman with shoes.

" The cry of the ryots is like that of a frog in the mouth of a  
 " snake.

" The assessors are their grandfathers' fathers. † Instead of  
 " a handful they fill their arms ;

" Coming on the poor like the King of Death, they go from vil-  
 " lage to village.

" As a water melon, which may be held in the hand, contains  
 " seven handfuls of seeds,

" So these clever fellows get ten rupees, when the income-tax  
 " is one rupee only.

" *The tax used to be on the land ; then it fell on the water,*  
 " *and oh ! mother ! what will the end be ?*

" *Thus thinking, the Wind flew away in terror, saying, ' By*  
 " *and bye they will seize me too by the hair of the head.'*

" If this be so in time of peace, when war comes our very lives  
 " will be taken :

" If the water-courses are dry in the wet season, the dry season  
 " will bring death.

" When the word is given our fortunes flow to the treasury,

" As a child might to its nurse's arms when she calls.

" Lord Lawrence's reign being over, we thought that trouble was  
 " past :—

" Past is it ? or but coming ? Any one may see,

" The dark age is only beginning."

One of our own poets has described in similar but perhaps more cultivated language, a gulf like that which separates rulers up at Simla with their *taille*, and their *gabelle*, and their canal *corvée* from the peasants beneath on the plains.—

---

" In the hollow Lotos-land they live and lie reclined

" On the hills like Gods together, far above mankind :

" For they lie beside their nectar, and the bolts are hurl'd

" Far below them in the valleys, and the clouds are lightly curl'd

" Round their golden houses, girdled with the gleaming world :



"Where they smile in secret, looking over wasted lands,  
 "Blight and famine, plague and earthquake, roaring deeps and fiery sands:  
 "But they smile, they find a music centred in a doleful song  
 "Steaming up, a lamentation, and an ancient tale of wrong,  
 "Like a tale of little meaning though the words are strong;  
 "Chanted from an ill-used race of men that cleave the soil,  
 "Sow the seed, and reap the harvest with enduring toil,  
 "Storing yearly little dues of wheat, and wine and oil;  
 "Till they perish and they suffer—some, 'tis whispered,—down in hell  
 "Suffer endless anguish, others in Elysian valleys dwell,  
 "Resting weary limbs at last on beds of asphodel.

But as regards a comparison between the legislation from Simla and the legislation from Olympus, I do not remember having read anywhere in ancient mythology that the Homeric deities spent so much as £30,000 or £40,000 a year at the beginning and end of the hot season in lugging up and down their administrative apparatus, including the very founts and type for printing their decrees. This is another subject that deserves the attention of Mr. Gladstone.

The analysis of the items of imports brings into prominence one notable characteristic of Indian commerce. The optimists vaunt the 96 millions sterling of annual imports and exports, and would have people believe that these figures represent masses of wealth moving by nothing but free stipulation, and thus, and thus mainly or solely, equipoising or oscillating towards equipoise. But should some one analyse the schedules of imports, and confute the assurances of prosperity and wealth, these very same optimists (their tricks are a thousand, their bosoms are one), respond in antistrophic declamation over the indolence, the improvidence, the low standard of comfort, and all the innate depravities, which are then said to characterise the natives of India. The journalist and the official take up the same parable in defence of their common cause. "An ordinary native can live comfortably on twopence a day. He needs nothing more than a few rags of clothing, a handful of rice and pulse and a little curry stuff." [Everybody remembers the ducal receipt of a little curry recommended by His Grace of Norfolk against the pinching of insufficient food.] "Imports of only 3s. 4d. per head per annum! So little is the demand as yet in India for our English manufactures. After all these natives are but an ignorant and inert folk, *the slaves of a gross superstition.*" Their habits are primitive, they have little ambition and

\* "*The slaves of a gross superstition*,"—the easy aspersion of the population of Orissa by a former Lieutenant Governor in a gazetted minute on the re-settlement of the province. The famine was wound up by a proposition in this minute to increase the land assessment by 25 per cent as a stimulus to industry. In the same

way the present Lieutenant-Governor has recently (December 1871) gazetted the zemindars of Orissa as "*a specially unscrupulous and incorrigible set of men.*" Mr. Tennyson's Northern Farmer, who, however, knew himself to be but a sad heathen laid down a similarly broad proposition; "*The poor in a lump are bad.*"

"less progress. Laziness is inherent in the very nature of the mild Hindu, bigotry is essential to the very being of the sulky Muhammadan."

This invocation of metaphysical entities to apologise or explain away the proofs of misrule is an old, old story. We have heard it over and over again any day these hundred years about another people who even yet are only painfully struggling out of the pernicious effects of a conquest without incorporation, absenteeism, poverty, and crushed-out manufactures. "Is it not," said Mr. John Stuart Mill, therein more of the sociologist than of the economist, "is it not a bitter satire on the mode in which opinions are formed on the most important problems of human nature and life to find public instructors of the greatest pretension imputing the backwardness of Irish industry and the want of energy of the Irish people in improving their condition to a peculiar indolence and insouciance in the Celtic race? Of all modes of escaping from the consideration of the effect of social and moral influences on the human mind, the most vulgar is that of attributing the diversities of conduct and character to inherent natural differences. What race would not be indolent and insouciant when things are so arranged that they derive no advantage from forethought and exertion? If such are the arrangements in the midst of which they live and work, what wonder if the listlessness and indifference so engendered are not shaken off the first moment an opportunity offers when exertion would really be of use?"

Before I have done with the statics of Indian commerce, it remains for me to verify by one or two more tests, the compulsoriness of certain exports and the factitiousness of certain imports. If it is by uncoerced, spontaneous action alone, if it is solely by mere advance in prosperity that Indian exports and imports have reached these figures (which, however, cease to appear prodigious when considered in connection with the area and the population concerned) then let some of these optimists explain how it comes that the local maritime trade of India along its own coasts should be so disproportionate to the maritime trade with England. Here are the figures for 1870-71.—

The Indian trade with Great Britain by the Cape and by Suez is returned at £58,393,346, thus :—

Exports of Indian <i>Merchandise</i> (so called) to	
England	... £30,194,306

Imports of English <i>Merchandise</i> (so called) to	
India	... 28,199,040

Total...	58,393,346
----------	------------

The Indian trade within the Indian seas only, that is to say, at all the ports between Arabia and Siam, both those Indian ports which are British and those Indian ports also which are not British, is returned at £20,452,221, thus :—

Exports both of Foreign <i>Merchandise</i> (so called)	
and also of Indian Produce and Manufactures ... ..	£10,356,930
Imports both of Foreign <i>Merchandise</i> (so called)	
and of Indian Produce and Manufactures ...	10,095,291
Total ...	<hr/> 20,452,221

The disproportion between the two trades is really much greater than these figures of 58 millions sterling and 20 millions sterling indicate. For much of this so-called coasting trade of India consists really of re-entries of trade with the United Kingdom, that is to say, represents goods actually on their way to or from the United Kingdom *via* some Indian Port of primary entry or discharge. Moreover the figures of coasting trade include large amounts of railway material and other foreign-imposed mortgage, goods which have as little to do with genuine merchandise as a remainder of a loan when dubbed a revenue cash balance by a charlatan financier has to do with a veritable surplus. Now will some of those gushing patriots whose hearts, according to Sir Richard Temple, swell with sentiment, thankfulness, and hopefulness over such spirit-stirring figures as these, will they deign to explain this striking disproportion? How comes it that the maritime exchanges of over 200 millions of people among themselves amount to only £20,000,000 while the maritime exchanges of these same 200 millions, with a remote population on the other side of the globe, amount to £58,000,000? (In other years than 1870-71 the disproportion will be found to be much greater even than this). How comes it that the people of Madras should have so much more dealings with a cold island at the uttermost end of the planet, and so little with their next door neighbours in Bengal? It was not always so. The coasting trade of the Coromandel was not always so inconsiderable in proportion to its foreign trade. A share in the coasting trade of the Indies was thought a most lucrative and desirable business for the Honourable Company of merchant adventurers trading to the East in those days when they had not yet taken to government,—those happier days before the Company had come to be, in the words of Burke “that thing which was supposed by the Roman *“law irreconcilable to reason and propriety—eundem negotiatorem et dominum, the same power becoming the general*

"trader, the same power the supreme lord"? Where is now the pre-eminence of Ormuz, Surat, Calicut and Bencoleen, and the other places that figure in the early commercial annals of the East? The Madras coast, once populous with skilful manufacturers, has now to export grain from a scanty reserve of food, and to deport disemployed labourers to weed sugarcane in the West Indies. Dacca, once a great city, rich with wonderful muslins, is now a collection of squalid, jungly, and feverish hovels. Antiquarians and travellers tell us of the intimate and beneficial relations that must have existed between India on the one hand and Java and other tropical and sub-tropical regions on the other hand, in those ages when neither Java had been exploited by the Dutch, nor India, Ceylon and Burmah had come under commercial servitude to the English. But now we have to confess and deplore that the risk from vicissitudes of seasons in India is aggravated by the commercial isolation which cuts off India from her neighbours in times of scarcity, and by a plantation system which sometimes sacrifices and always embarrasses and jeopardises hosts of human lives for the sake of a few staples of European luxury and riches such as Coffee, Indigo, Sugar and Cotton.\* I shall return to this lamentable subject when I come to treat of the commercial dynamics, to which indeed it more properly belongs.

It will doubtless be urged as a reply to my statement, that the exchanges of the 200 millions of natives which I have taken into consideration are only the maritime exchanges, whereas there are other and important inland exchanges conducted by railway waggon, by bullock cart and by river boat which have been omitted in my reckoning. Be it noted however that my comparison between the Indian trade within the Indies and the Indian trade with the British islands professes to deal solely with the sea-borne goods. If I have omitted the inland transport of Indian goods within India, I have likewise omitted the inland transport of Indian goods within England. A moment's consideration will disclose why such a comparison must be confined to the sea-borne trade in both cases. There are no figures of the inland trade in England, and much less in India which can be relied on. (Yet, if tolerably accurate enumerations could be procured, they would certainly bear out my argument.) It is easy to scrutinise the loading and unloading of a cargo over a ship's side in a few harbours, but it would be impossible to enumerate the loads of bullock cart and river boat on every road and field and stream over  $1\frac{1}{2}$  millions of square miles. Above all there is an admirable test available for verifying the returns of the maritime exchanges, namely, the rate and amount of the

\* Compare Blue book on Orissa Famine, page 344.

customs' duties actually realised upon these transactions. No such verification can be attempted for the inland exchanges.

I know, indeed, that there are administration and other reports especially of the Central Provinces—that highly favoured region of optimist verbiage—reports that bristle with annual schedules of the inland trade of this territory and that district, all multiplied, added, divided, and averaged *ad infinitum*. In default of some such means of verification as I have just described, I reckon these official and optimist guesses to be even less valuable than the local officers' estimates of grain stock in Orissa on the eve of the famine, that is, I reckon them a good deal worse than worthless.

Turning now from the customs' returns of the Government, I shall appeal for a verification to the personal experience of the merchant. There is hardly a merchant who settles anywhere in India, especially beyond the permanently assessed lands of Lower Bengal, that does not at first experience bewilderment for a time over these official tables of millions upon millions sterling of exports. For a while he fails to realise the prodigious poverty of the country. Taught, however, by experience, he begins to appreciate the actual situation of Indian trade, the paucity of entrepreneurs, the scantiness of stocks of produce, and the enormous difficulty of extending business except by venturing upon numerous and precarious advances on security of the most hazardous character. At last he discovers that much of those Indian customs-house returns bear no analogy whatever to the port entries of other countries to whose statistics he is accustomed. For his purposes those Indian returns of exports and imports are utterly factitious, for they have nothing whatsoever to do with exchanges, or with merchandise, or with the like purport of the bulk of the customs' registers in other countries than India.

Our Indian statesmen are always seeking to vindicate the success of our rule in India by political economy. What has political economy to do with the case? The economist tells us that the exports and imports of a nation equate or oscillate towards equation by what he calls the action of international supply and demand, whereby according to him the aggregate of imports is exactly paid for by the aggregate of exports. But in India the so-called exports and imports do not equate nor oscillate towards equation at all. The year's exports from India almost invariably exceed the year's imports into India, a feature to be found in no other country over such a range of time and upon such a scale in amount. The economist tells us that if a country's exports or sales of merchandise be in excess of its imports, then the whole of the difference will be found to be imported in bullion. In India the balance between exports and im-

ports, a balance in favour of India, is not liquidated to the full in bullion, nor in any other commodity at all. The economist tells us that if the exports of one country A to another country B be in excess of A's imports from B, and if the difference be not liquidated in bullion, then the rate of exchange at B and A, respectively, are in favour of B and against A. He tells us that these features of premium and discount are only temporary, for that at last A will be induced to buy (import) more from B, or which is the same thing from C a debtor of A, or else that B will be obliged to economise and buy less from A, and that then those conditions of premium and discount will cease to characterise the exchanges. The economist tells that there will ensue retrenchment on the one side or profusion on the other, so that the aggregate of exports from either country will no longer be seriously exceeded by the aggregate of imports into that country. But what is it that actually occurs in Indian exchanges? The normal rate of exchange is and for years it continues to be against India, and for that matter is mostly but little in favour of and is often against England; the exports from India continue to be in excess of the imports; the balance to be made good to India is not liquidated to the full in silver; England does not retrench in her consumption of Indian produce. Let the shareholders of Indian banks consider how the very foundations of their business are thus undermined by those officials who profess the gospel of Free Trade. Such and so signal are the confutations of the so-called laws of political economy which Indian affairs present.

It is not the metaphysics of that pretended science that will measure or explain the relations between India and England. The following few words of an obscure paragraph in Mr. Mill's Political Economy are enough to show that his two volumes are void of jurisdiction in these questions of our Indian empire. They show also that the so-called laws of international have as many exceptions as the so-called laws of interpersonal exchange. I italicise some of the expressions.

"Before closing this discussion it is fitting to point out in what manner and degree the preceding conclusions are affected by the existence of international payments *not originating in commerce*, and for which no equivalent in either money or commodities is expected or received; such as, *a tribute or remittance of rent to absentee landlords or of interest to foreign creditors, or a Government expenditure abroad*, such as England incurs in the management of some of her colonial dependencies.

"To begin with the (assumed) case of barter. The supposed an-

" nual remittances being made in commodities, and being exports for  
 " which there is no return, it is no longer requisite that the imports  
 " and exports should pay for one another : on the contrary there  
 " must be an annual excess of exports over imports, equal to the  
 " value of the remittance. If, before the country became liable to  
 " the annual payment, foreign commerce was in its natural state of  
 " equilibrium, it will now be necessary for the sake of effecting  
 " the remittances, that foreign countries should be induced to take  
 " a greater quantity of goods than before : which can only be done  
 " by offering those exports on cheaper terms, or in other words, by  
 " paying dearer for foreign commodities. The international values  
 " will so adjust themselves that either, by greater exports or by  
 " smaller imports or both, the requisite excess on the side of ex-  
 " ports will be brought about ; and this excess will become the  
 " permanent state. The result is, that a country which makes  
 " regular [rather, regulated or obligatory] payment to foreign  
 " countries, besides losing what it pays, loses also something  
 " more by the less advantageous terms on which it is forced to  
 " exchange its productions for foreign commodities.

" The same results follow on the supposition of money. Com-  
 " merce being supposed to be in a state of equilibrium when the  
 " obligatory remittances begin, the first remittance is necessarily  
 " made in money. This lowers prices in the remitting country and  
 " raises them in the receiving. The natural effect is that more  
 " commodities are exported, &c. \* \* \* \* \*

" \* \* The result to the interests of the two countries will  
 " be as already pointed out : the paying country will give a  
 " higher price for all that it buys from the receiving country,  
 " while the latter besides receiving the tribute obtains the export-  
 " table produce of the tributary country at a lower price. (Book  
 " iii. Chapter xxi. Sec. 4. *International payments of a non-*  
 " *commercial character.*)

The extensive catalogue of exemptions set forth in this cautious proviso of Mr. Mill, shows that the Indian problem is not to be solved by political economy. That problem is not capable of being solved at all except by the veritable science of sociology. Mr. Mill himself who in his best days was the disciple of Comte but

Che fece per viltate il gran rifiuto ●

has made his political economy instructive only in so far as he has overstepped the limits assigned by his predecessors and has, more or less inconsistently with his own premises, extended the scope of his treatise towards a social instead of merely a monetary philosophy. As Mr. Mill formerly claimed a wider domain than Mr. Ricardo, so now his successors also the younger economists are resenting the bounds and definitions set by Mr. Mill, and thus the wordy

and metaphysical wrangles of these various exponents as to the actual extent of their jurisdiction demonstrate the instability of their anarchic interregnum.

The discredited idols of Political Economy will afford our Indian ministers but little protection in the impending crisis. The spontaneity postulated by the economist is negatived by the very statement of the relations between India and England. Other and more potent influences having been found to be at work, why do our Indian ministers not proceed to deal with these? Why do they persist in recurring to hypothetical assumptions which confessedly are displaced in the particular case? The Indian financier dons the ephod of the political economist in order to prophesy smooth things over a discredited and doomed régime. Presently he, like the poor usher De Breze, will be commanded by some Mirabeau to stand aside with his Urim and his Thummim as having no longer place nor utterance here.

It is not the first time that metaphysics, the invariable resource of retrograde politicians, have been resorted to for disproof of English failure in India. In 1788 the metaphysical laws of English evidence were invoked and with success to screen Indian oppression. In 1872 the not less metaphysical laws of political economy are invoked (is it so to be recorded,—with success?), to deny Indian impoverishment.

"I have too much confidence," said Edmund Burke addressing a tribunal which subsequently proved itself all unworthy of his confidence, "I have too much confidence in the learning with which you will be advised, and the liberality and nobleness of the sentiments with which you are born, to suspect that you would by any abuse of forms and by a technical course of proceeding, deny justice to so great a part of the world that claims it at your hands. Your Lordships always had an ample power, and almost unlimited jurisdiction; you have now a boundless object. It is not from this district, or from that parish, not from this city, or the other province, that relief is now applied for: exiled and undone princes, extensive tribes, suffering nations, infinite descriptions of men different in language, in manner and in rites, men separated by every barrier of nature from you by the providence of God, are blended in one common cause, and are now become suppliants at your bar. For the honour of this nation, in vindication of this mysterious providence, let it be known that no rule formed upon municipal maxims, (if any such rule exists), will prevent the course of that imperial justice which you owe to the people that call to you from all parts of a great disjointed world. \* \* \*

"\* \* \* \* \* God forbid that when you try the most serious of all causes, that when you try the cause of Asia



"in the presence of Europe, there should be the least suspicion that a narrow partiality utterly destructive of justice should so guide us, that a British subject in power should appear in substance to possess rights which are denied to the humble allies, to the attached dependents of this kingdom, who by their distance have a double demand upon your protection, and who by an implicit, I hope not a weak and useless, trust in you, have stripped themselves of every other resource under heaven.

JAMES GEDDES.

---

NOTE A (page 319)

In the present depression of our Indian banks, both those of discount and those of exchange—a depression from which there is no hope of early relief—the unfortunate shareholders may well take into serious consideration the portentous influence over their affairs exerted by the Government. How is it possible for their affairs to prosper when the really commercial business of genuine exchange is so completely dominated by one single authority, an authority utterly beyond competition as being far above loss, an authority whose nett drawings reach the unparalleled amount of £13,000,000 a year? What sort of field is left to the exchange banks in a commerce, if commerce it may be called, of some £50,000,000 a year either way? Nor is it only the business of exchange that is thus handicapped. This single autocrat, himself the master of 200,000 bayonets, influences the Indian business of inland discount as heavily as he does the Indian business of foreign exchange. The shareholders of all Indian banks will be fortunate if our leading official bank in India, in which unofficial banks are necessarily interested, succeed in extricating itself without a painful crisis from its present unsound condition of having the bulk of its capital, a capital but little reinforced by private deposits, locked up in Government securities. The excuse of the directors, a very natural excuse, for locking up so much of their means in this way, instead of keeping it employed within easy call in the regular discount bills of proper banking is this, that Indian trade is, and for a long time has been, very slack. The words "excessive and prolonged slackness of Indian business,"—what are they but a round about phrase for general Indian impoverishment? Meanwhile the directors trust that the scantiness of private deposits will continue to be supplemented by cash balances of Government revenue lent "to subserve the interests of commerce." Vain expectation! For the present it is pleasant to have a dividend eked out by the profits on Government money lying on deposit. But these so-called cash balances of Government revenue are in fact borrowings, and borrowings are

apt to become exhausted, and then comes the crisis as in 1855. Even if the sums lent on deposit by Government were genuine revenue balances it would be unwise to trust in them so much. For the deposit account of a solitary millionaire is not so reliable for banking purposes as the deposit accounts of a thousand men with each a thousand pounds. The millionaire may change his mind at any moment and suddenly draw on demand in full. Not so with the *average* of a multitude of customers. Again, the millionaire's means may fail *him*, and this is what is sure to happen sooner or later with the millionaire depositor of borrowed "cash balances" whose case we are now considering.

I shall take another example of the same argument from the case of exchanges. Let the shareholders, who have been smarting under the scanty dividends of Indian banks of exchange, consider what sort of "*business*" is the Secretary of State's drawing account of £13,000,000 a year. Little brokerage will the banks reap upon that set of drafts compared with what they might reasonably expect to secure from transactions to the same amount in aggregate, but spread over a multitude of private individuals.

When one notices the prominence of Indian Government Securities in the half-yearly investment statements of our banks and insurance companies in India and at home, one cannot but be shocked at the misery which is awaiting the numerous and helpless victims of the impending crisis in Indian commerce and finance.

## ART. IX.—THE HINDU CASTES.

- 1.—*Hindu Tribes and Castes as represented in Benares.* By the Rev. M. A. Sherring, M.A., LL.B. Calcutta. Thacker and Spink. 1872.
- 2.—*Memoirs of the History, Folk Lore and distribution of the Races of the North-Western Provinces of India.* By the late Sir H. M. Elliot, K.C.B. Edited by John Beames, M.R.A.S. Part I, castes and their sub-divisions. London. Trübner & Co. 1869.

THE subject of the two books before us is one which, although it bears upon every point connected with the daily life of every resident in India, has yet to be thoroughly investigated. Although we have now been masters of Hindustan for well-nigh a century, and intimately connected with its people for twice that period, we have as yet made no great steps in understanding the curious and artificial net-work of custom which forms the basis of their social and religious polity. Theories of ethnology we have had in abundance, all more or less useless, because framed merely from one point of view, either religion, language, or physical aspect being taken in each case as the hobby horse which was to be ridden to death.

Two main causes have been at work to prevent any inquiries, that may have been made on this subject, from standing on their own merits and being capable of being utilised by future enquirers in going into further details. The first is the extraordinary perversity shown by even those acquainted with the subject, in persisting in the belief that the four castes of Manu are still existing and that the so-called mixed castes arose out of them. This has all but rendered useless, the otherwise valuable information to be derived from the census of the North-West Provinces, which preceded that now under compilation; and it gravely disfigures the otherwise valuable book of Mr. Sherring now under our consideration. It should never be lost sight of that, whether the fourfold division of castes by Manu had ever a real existence, or was, as there seems some reason to think, a merely ideal state to which the Bráhmaṇs, if powerful enough, were to strive to attain, it has never been in force within the period of which we possess any trustworthy records. At the present day not only is no distinct Śūdra caste found anywhere, but it is impossible to separate those of the trading classes, who have a right to be called Vaisiṇyas from those who have not. Nay, more, the meaner classes of Rājputs have often so mixed with the other tribes around them that it is extremely difficult to say whether they should be called Rājputs or no; and even in the

case of the Bráhmans, there are divisions amongst them, which evidently were not contemplated by the great Hindu lawgiver.

The next obstacle is the ethnological one. Nothing has done more to frustrate the results of inquiries in this direction, than the practice of drawing a hard and fast line between Aryans and Non-Aryans. Whilst some classes have kept themselves almost free from intermixture with their surroundings, others seem to have freely mingled with the aborigines; some probably aboriginal tribes have adopted the language and religion of their conquerors, whilst others have retained one or other of these or merely modified them. It is this tendency to theorise ethnologically without sufficient data to go on that has led the author of Orissa to class as inferior Bráhmans, the Gadis of the Himalayas, the Bhuinhars of Behar, and others, who, though pretending to the title of Bráhmans, are not admitted to be so by any other caste. The Bhuinhars, in fact, in some places call themselves Rájputs. The same confusion arises with regard to the Rájputs, amongst whom the Jats and Gujars are frequently classed, though all their rites and customs tend to show that they are really tribes of Goallas.

It is greatly to be regretted that the Government of India has never called for returns of the castes and sub-divisions of castes in the different provinces. Some sort of attempt was made at the time of the compilation of the Glossary, but the information given was meagre, and Sir Henry Elliot at once showed how incomplete was the list. With the exception of the Glossary and Supplement, a few scattered works here and there such as Reades' *Inferior Castes of the North-West*, and Carnegie's *Races of Oudh*, are all the contributions we have to the subject, save Mr. Sherring's attempt to do for Benares what we should wish to see done for all India.

We noticed at first what we consider a grave defect in the arrangement of the book; that is, an attempt to reduce the arrangement in some sort to the fourfold division of Manu, a natural result of which is such grievous collocations as that of the Banjaras (a tribe with no more pretensions to caste than Nats or Kanjars), with Agarwalas and other classes, who have considerable claims to be considered as typical Vaisiyas.

We must also denounce in the strongest terms the introduction of notices of eminent inhabitants of Benares into the body of the book. These so-called historical sketches, though they would doubtless increase the sale of the volume amongst the friends and admirers of those whose lives are related, form no part of the subject matter which gives its name to the book, and would much more fittingly have been placed in a separate volume. In the case, at least, of the Bhuinhars, the introduction of the life of the Maharajah of Benares, has led the author to place that tribe amongst

the Sarwaria Bráhmans, a position which the Sarwaria Bráhmans indignantly repudiate, and which is not admitted by any other caste. No Bráhmanic honours are paid by any caste to the Babhans or Bhuinhars. They have some curious rules within which they and Rájputs may take food from one another, and in Chota Nagpur they claim to be Rájputs. They adopt surnames alike of Bráhmans and Rájputs, Singh, Tewari, Rai, Panre, and the like ; but the names of their clans are, almost without exception framed from the Rájputs. Their customs present a striking similarity to those of the warrior class, and in fact, except their own assertion, there seems to be not one single reason for believing the curious statement made by Mr. Campbell in his *Ethnology of India* that there is "no doubt that this class "is formed by an intermixture of Bráhmans with some inferior caste." Mr. Sherring admits this to be "untenable," but proposes no solution of his own. Another serious difficulty in digesting the contents of the book also arises from the continual cross-divisions we meet with. Thus, in one chapter, Parwal and Palliwal are classed with Khatri, in another they appear as a sub-division of Oswal. Muriyari and Savaiya, the two largest sub-divisions of Mallahs, are found both under Mallahs and Kahars. Bansphor are included under Dharkar and Mehtar ; and Pasi, though enumerated as a separate caste, is also included as a sub-division of Khatik. Further enquiry, and more careful revision will doubtless eliminate these blemishes.

The introduction is mainly occupied with extracts from Manu. It then embarks into the question as to whether the primitive castes were three or four in number, a speculation quite as profitable as whether Hengist and Horsa came over in three or more ships, and quite as easily determined. Our author proceeds, "The only castes that have for the most part preserved "their purity of blood are the Bráhmans, the Kshatriyas, and perhaps some of the Vaisiyas." Under which head would he rank the Kayasthas, who are perhaps the most clearly demarked of existing castes, both as a whole and in their sub-divisions? The first thing that strikes the reader, when he comes to the book itself, is the vastly disproportionate space allotted to the Bráhmans and Rájputs to that given to the rest of the tribes. The manners and customs of the Bráhmans, as regards their religious observances and ceremonial, have been so often treated of, that we may well pass over them here, nor do we see the object of their introduction in the volume before us. We come next to the divisions of the two typical branches of Bráhmans, Gaur and Dravira. These, excluding as they do at least thirty tribes of Bráhmans, and only including by a side wind the Bráhmans of Bengal, can be said to possess no more than an antiquarian interest. The whole of the

account of the Bráhmans is, in fact, encumbered to such a degree with the fanciful Gotras derived from the Vedas they are presumed to follow, that it would be extremely difficult to turn this part of the book to any practical use.

In section III., however, of Chapter IV., we come to a point of the greatest interest. The Bráhmans here enumerated are all employed in sacerdotal functions, and are all looked down upon by the non-priestly Bráhmans. Thus, we have the curious anomaly that in the priestly caste the performance of any priestly function is considered degrading. The duty of a Bráhman is not to perform the office of priest but to read the Vedas. We have the Mahábráhmau, who performs the funeral ceremonies, and whom his brother Bráhmans will not touch. The Gungaputra, commonly called the Ghát Bráhman, whose name is a by-word, Pandas or temple priests, Barna Bráhmans who conduct the worship of the lower castes, Gyawals and Prayagwals who rule over the ceremonies connected with pilgrimages to Gya and Allahabad, Ojhas (confounded by Dr. Hunter with Maithila Bráhmans of whom they are a degraded race) exercising the vocation of Wizards, Dayabagyas Ganaks and Jausi Bráhmans who cast horoscopes and predict events. All these are looked upon as a lower class by the orthodox Bráhman. The cause of this remains yet to be explained.

The Bhuinhars we have already noticed above. It is only needful to add that the necessity of making a Bráhman of the Maharajah of Benares has caused the invention of a tribe of Bhuinhar Rájputs. The two so-called tribes are one and the same. Of the remaining tribes of Gaur Bráhmans, the Jijhotiya and Saraswat claim no particular notice. The Taga Gaur Bráhmans seem in everything but name to be identical with the Bhuinhars; and there seems to be some ground for supposing that the Bengali Tagores (properly Thákur) are an offshoot from them. Like the Bhuinhars, the regular Bráhmans repudiate all connection with them; and as Mr. Beames says at the conclusion of Sir Henry Elliot's lengthy disquisition on them, there seems no reason for supposing them to be anything but low Aryans.—The Maithil and Utkala Bráhmans are very rapidly despatched by Mr. Sherring.

Amongst Dravira Bráhmans, the Koukan tribe amongst the Mahrattas seems to have of the greatest claim to distinction. With regard to these and other Mahratta Bráhmans, Mr. Campbell seems to have distinguished himself by travelling far into the realms of pure conjecture. Though Mr. Sherring states these suspicions, it is merely to dissent from them, and so far most people will go with him. The rest of the Dravira Bráhmans are not very remarkable, except the Nágárs, who were at one time renowned for their fighting qualities.

Amongst the so-called supplementary tribes of Bráhmans, the

Sakadwipi Bráhmans are chiefly remarkable for their great numbers, and for the fact that they will drink from a vessel from which another person has already drunk. The Kashmiri Pandits are said to be the only Hindu caste to be found in Kashmir. They are wonderfully fair and have no objection to flesh-eating. Numbers of them are now settled in India.

The Rájputs, though so widely spread and well-known a race, have had little done to elucidate their history since the publication of Tod's Rájasthán. Certainly not much is added by quoting from Campbell's *Ethnology* that "their wives are shut up in seclusion and lost for agricultural labour," a statement not only contradicted by Tod, who says "To attend and aid in the minutiae of husbandry is by no means uncommon with them, as to dress and carry the meals of their husbands to the fields is a general practice," but at variance with the commonly observed custom at the present day, where the husband is absent as a soldier, or in service, for the wife to carry on the farming of the patrimony.

It seems a pity that Tod's classification of 36 royal races should be accepted as anything but a purely ornamental arrangement, founded as it was on lists differing considerably both in the numbers and names of the tribes included in it, and containing at least two tribes, the Jats and Gujars, with whom the Rájputs do not even generally intermarry. There are, it appears, 99 distinct tribes of Rájputs in Benares, though Mr. Carnegie could only find 29, only so far off as Oudh. The first tribe we find mentioned is that of the Gahlots, the reason being that it is the tribe to which belongs the Maharajah of Vizianagram, of whom our author has subjoined a sketch. A division of the Rájputs into Surajbansi, Chandrabansi, and Agnibansi, with the subordinated Gotras Jadubansi and Nagbansi, plus the Thákur and other spurious or degenerate tribes, would have been much more useful than the scattered notices we have of the extant tribes. Not but that many of them are worthy of their separate notices. The Gautams, Bais and Chauháns are races whose history is the early history of Hindustan. The strife between the Chandels and Chauháns would furnish materials for a history in itself. The Powars and Solankhis are also tribes well known in the records of early Aryan strife. The Tuars (who claim Anand Pal as one of their Rajas) were kings of Delhi while the Gahawars were rulers of Benares. The Rathors are remarkable for having served the Musalman invaders as soldiers and greatly assisted them in their conquest. Some of them are now Musalmáns, but still call themselves by their gentile name. The Rajwars have little or no pretension to be considered Rájputs, and the Nikhamb, another of the so-called royal tribes, are merely a division of the

Chauháns on their own confession. A curious custom prevails amongst the Baghels that they never marry within their own tribe, an admission (possibly) of inferior descent. The Jats and Gujars are enumerated as Rájputs and have a chapter to themselves. We must disagree with the sentiment that it would have been out of place to discuss their origin, as on that pin hangs their position. It seems to be generally admitted that they do not intermarry with Rájputs; and although Mr. Sherring says there is good reason for the belief that such alliances have been formed, Tod distinctly denies it. Like the Gujars their habits are pastoral, and the practice of allowing second marriage points to some lower class than Rájputs as their forefathers. It seems very probable that the claim of the Gujars of Bijnaur to be Goallas is a true one.

We come now to what our author terms the Mixed Classes—Vaisiyas, Sudras and others. The title involves an error in the face of it, as Vaisiyas and Sudras are not mixed classes. The position assumed that the Vaisiyas were originally “chiefly engaged in rural pursuits” which is alleged to be incontestable, destitute as it is of one iota of proof, calls for but little remark. Roving as the Aryan immigrants were continually, they had little chance of becoming agriculturists, and it is hardly likely that the mere herdsmen of the cattle which like the Scythians, they probably carried along with them, would have formed a part of the twice born classes. The statement, too, that the Vaisiya and Sudra class have become “intimately blended” would be of some value if any Vaisiya or any Sudra caste could be shown ever to have existed. But we may safely pass over the preliminary chapter, which, assuming as it does, the existence of a Sudra caste and describing as common to the different tribes of this caste, ceremonies which vary in important points in every one of these tribes, can be but of very minor interest.

The next chapter contains an account of religious devotees; who, as having dispensed with caste altogether, are hardly well selected as typical Vaisiyas or Sudras. The first division commences with a gross error as to the term Gosain. Gosain is not used vaguely by Hindus at all, but is as invariably used as a distinctive generic title of devotees, who follow the worship of Vishnu as Baishtab or Baisnab, but is generally confined to the Gurus of that profession. The Dasnamis are well known as the Purohitis of many of the lower castes, but the list given of them is certainly incorrect. Several of these sects of devotees have much that is curious, and some of them somewhat that is admirable in their precepts and practice; but as they have but little bearing on the subject of caste, they call for no mention here, except that they afford a long standing proof of the irksomeness of the Bráhmánic



fetter, and of the readiness with which (on any religious pretext), it could be cast off.

The next chapter is almost ludicrous in the collocation. Here we have the sacred bard (the Bhat) and the herald (the Charan) castes, ranking almost with Bráhmans and Rájputs, and to this day claiming and receiving the courtesy title of Maháráj, placed side by side with pimps, procurers, prostitutes and dancers. The bulk of the classes mentioned, too, are Muhammadans.

At length we come to the Baniyas. An attempt is made to assign a remoter antiquity to the Khattris than the Rájputs can claim, chiefly on the authority of Mr. Campbell's *Ethnology*. It would seem that the Bráhmans, if they ever did eat food (not cooked but uncooked food) from the hands of the Kshatriyas, gave up the practice on account of their continued squabbles with them, whilst having no ground of enmity against the trading class of Khattris they still took this convenience, as a favour, from them. It seems highly improbable, that the Khattris if, as they claim to be, of the same lineage as the Kshatriyas, and in no way degenerate, should have made so little way in India as they have; their number, except in the Panjáb, where they co-exist with the Sikh Kshatriyas, being insignificant. The Agarwálas are on the whole the most powerful and wealthy of the Baniyas. It matters very little how they came by their name unless some historical fact can be connected with it. It would, however, have been well to have given some more detailed account of their customs. The Oswals, who should have been placed with Sarawaks (who are barely mentioned), are ruthlessly sacrificed; and make way for Babu Siva Pershad's history which is nothing to the point. A curious fact that some of these Jain Baniyas intermarry with Hindu Baniya castes is altogether passed over. Lastly, we have by some strange caprice included with the other Baniyas, the Banjaras, a tribe almost certainly aboriginal to a considerable extent, converted to Islamism, by profession originally robbers, by force of circumstances converted into carriers, especially of gram. No particulars are given of the divisions of them, which are said to be marked. In Bengal the Mukeris or Mukhiyar are the tribe most commonly found. As we pass on confusion becomes more confounded. After cautioning his reader that Halwais and Bhunas (as he calls Kandus) are often confounded, the author proceeds to enumerate Bunnawala, a mere misspelling for Bunawala (synonym of Kandu), as one of the castes of Halwai.

Sunri, the generic title, is included under Kalwar, which is also made to include Gurar, a Baniya and not a Sunri. It is curious that the Sunri, though necessarily impure from their occupation, frequently style themselves Sudras, especially those who have adopted agriculture as a pursuit.

The Kayasthas which as a class rank certainly far higher than the Baniyas are here introduced. The position of the twelve tribes of Kayasthas is variously given. Mathur Kaits, however, are allowed by all to be the chief class, and with them alone do other castes intermarry. Unai, the half-caste, is included on the authority of Elliot alone, but is not admitted by the Kayasthas as a Kayastha class at all. The Bráhmans allege that the Unai are Bráhmans, who by trade lost their caste; and our author himself has previously included them as Baniyas. The account of the Bengáli Kayasthas is meagre and incorrect. There are seventy-two and not eleven classes, but the title is only introduced to bring in Bábu Guru Das Mittra.

The divisions of the artisans is somewhat quaint. Next to the Sonars, a class of extreme respectability, come the Carpenters, impure in every part of India. Laheri who are said to be earthenware varnishers are really Lac-workers. Dabgar are Chamars; and Patua, also called Jugi Patua, merely an offshoot of the Tantis.

The agricultural castes are more carefully considered; though there are still, however, errors and omissions. It is strange that no other Kurmis are enumerated than those that could be culled from the supplemental glossary, as in one district alone twenty-eight sub-divisions have been found. No notice, too, is taken of the singular connection subsisting between the Kurmis and the Dhanuks. A Kurmi, who sells himself into slavery (not an uncommon thing even now) is said to become a Dhanuk. Mahtau (properly Mahto; said to be a class of Kurmis is a common name for a headman amongst Kurmis, Koiris, and Goallas in Behar, Gorakhpur, Hurrpur, and the neighbouring parts, and not a class of Kurmis at all.

Kachhis are enumerated separately from Kurmis, though only a sub-division of them. Our author persists in confounding them with the Malis, in the matter of the Maur or bridal crown; though under the head of Malis, he afterwards corrects himself. Dhailphora separately enumerated are Kurmis, and the Rasgars are Rájputs, now by conversion Musalmáns.

The Gowallas (calling themselves in the North-West, Ahirs) are certainly one of the largest of the castes. They have three great divisions and innumerable sub-divisions. Gaddis enumerated by Mr. Sherring as Gowallas are really Gaveis (a far inferior caste), though elevated by Dr. Hunter to the dignity of Bráhmans. The Gujars and Jats are almost certainly Gowallas by extraction, and Gowalla Rajas were formerly paramount in parts of Hindustan. Notwithstanding Mr. Campbell's view that Gowalla is not a tribal name, there seems to be but little doubt of the race connection between the Gowallas of the North-West and Bengal, even inclusive of those of Orissa. The Sadgops are

certainly a difficulty; but as they have no connection with the other Gowallas of Bengal, and neither intermarry with them, nor follow the same pursuits, it is perfectly possible they may be a different race. Their name certainly favours a contrary notion.

Under Kahars are enumerated one class of Dhanuks or Kurmis, four classes of Mallahs, one class of Kamdus, and several independent castes; whilst the best known class of Kahars, the Rawanis, are not mentioned.

The Dhobi allow seven castes to exist amongst them, Magadhiya, Ajudhiya, Kananjiya, Belwar, Gosar, Bathare, and Pagahiya. Of the other tribes mentioned, Shaikh and Bhaika are Musalmáns. No mention is made of the cultivating Dhobis, who do not intermarry with the washing Dhobis; nor of the class calling themselves Rajdhob, who are said generally to be engaged in the operation of rice cleaning.

Mallah is again a curious instance of the cross divisions in which Mr. Sherring delights, three of the classes given under the head of Kahar being again enumerated here.

Again Lodha, Bind and Musahar, all separate tribes, are enumerated as Nuniyas.

The chapter on the Bhars is extremely interesting. They seem to have been supplanted by the Rájputs, but they are not eradicated as our author would lead us to suppose. There seems very good reason to connect them with the Rajwars, and tradition also allies the Cherus with them. The connection of the tribes mentioned in the next chapter, Cherus, Tharus, Kharwars, &c., with the Kols will probably be one of the subjects of Colonel Dalton's ethnology; and so little is at present known of these tribes by the general student of the people of India, that we may be pardoned for passing over this part of the book. The Bawariya should, however, have called up the mention of the Bauris of Bengal, with whom there is little reason to doubt they are allied. Dharkars, merely a superior class of Dom, are made to include Dom under them. Bansphor another class of Doms are included both under Dharkar and Mehter. It is curious that the authority of Elliot should not have been followed here, as he is perfectly correct in separating Hela and Raut from the ordinary Bhangí or sweeper, from whom also the Hari is a separate caste.

The Pasis seem to be a tribe that have lost very little of their distinctive character. In no way do they assimilate to the people around them, and though it is probably going too far to class the Bhars under the Pasis, it seems very likely that they are connected. Oddly enough Mr. Sherring includes the Pasis under Khatitis, who though for some reason impure are still by no means as low in the social scale as he has placed them. Baris and Dhanuks too

instead of being placed on the lowest step of the social scale, should be mentioned as generally employed as personal servants by respectable castes. The Baris too are often soldiers, and make the leaf plates from which *all* castes eat.

We have entered thus minutely into the errors and omissions of the book before us, because we consider, that if with the pains he has evidently taken, the author had set to work differently, a very valuable collection of matter would have been the result. As it is, destitute of an index, and arranged with but little regard to system, the book, except to an expert, is deprived of its chief value—that of a book of reference. Had the old and often published information anent the Vedic division of the Bráhmans, and the thirty-six royal races of Rájputs been suppressed or with the lives of illustrious men relegated to another book; and had the castes and clans occurring in Benares been alphabetically treated; the book would have had a value second only to that of Sir H. Elliot.

And here we would call attention to the Supplemental Glossary, as the form in which any information with regard to castes had best be published, until something like a clear view can be obtained of the system in its entirety. The original work, so far as it went, (we are talking only of the caste part) was especially valuable as narrating generally only facts and seldom indulging in theory. We wish we could say that Mr. Beames had any way improved it in editing; but in fact the book as it now stands bears every trace of having been very hurriedly passed through the press. However that may be, it stands forward as the model which should be followed by future contributors to a knowledge of the subject we have treated, till such time as materials enough have been collected to admit of a scientific arrangement of any sort.

We trust that the Government of India will not lose sight of the opportunity afforded by the census returns to obtain complete lists of the castes of the different provinces of our Indian Empire.

---



## CRITICAL NOTICES.

### 1. VERNACULAR LITERATURE.

*A New Series of Persian and Hindustani School Books.* Published under the direction of Dr. S. W. Fallon, Inspector of Schools, Bihar, by Rái Sohan Lál, Head Master of the Patna Normal School.

THE object of this Series is to improve by means of cheap and well selected text books the teaching of Vernacular Schools, and to furnish native readers in general with a set of books written in simple and concise language on subjects of literature and science. The extracts from works on literature are free from everything peculiarly Islamitic or polemic, and have, to borrow an Eastern phrase, the light of morality shining through the window of the page. The moral tone of the publications is a distinguishing feature of the books. Those who are acquainted with the school books which have hitherto been used by native students, will see at a glance the value of Dr. Fallon's Series. Few people have formed a correct idea of the pruriency and questionable morality of what are called Eastern classical writers. The very first story in Sa'dí's *Gulistán* teaches the maxim that speaking the truth should be regulated by the result which may follow it, and that a lie is, in cases of expediency, better than truth. A little further on, the doctrine is inculcated that when a king by day time should say, "I think, it is night," you should look up to heaven and answer, "yes, the Pleiads have made their appearance." The last book of Sa'dí's *Gulistán*, which is rarely read in schools, is the best. Without saying a word on the filthiness of his fifth book, we may in general remark, that the whole poetical literature of the (modern) Arabians, the Persians, Hindústánis, and partially that of the Turks, selects "the pretty boy," and not pure woman, as the ideal, and extols unnatural lust as paradise on earth. Hence the necessity of schoolbooks that teach decency and morality.

Rái Sohan Lál's school books are got up in praiseworthy style. The letters are distinct, and the lines are well apart, so that reading becomes a pleasure rather than a work. We notice this as a special recommendation, as the numerous school books issued by the Lucknow, Cawnpore, Agra, and Delhi presses, are most deficient in this respect: their letters are often indistinct, and the lines are too closely packed. All languages which make use of the Arabic characters are difficult to read: in fact, no sentence can

be read off without mistake, until the meaning is understood ; hence it is absolutely necessary that no further obstacles be thrown in the way of beginners. We shall first notice a few of Rái Sohan Lál's text books of Literature.

1. *Fársí Amoz*, No. 1., 25pp. 8vo. This is a "First Persian Reader." It expects that the student is slightly acquainted with Hindústání, and gives the elements of Persian reading. There is careful gradation of lessons, and at the end are easy dialogues on various subjects.

2. *Intikhab i Fársí Nazm*. 21pp. 8vo. This is an easy Persian Poetical Primer, containing extracts from the didactic works of Ibn Yamin, an old Persian poet, Sa'lí's Bostán, and the Tuhfatul Ahrár by Jámí, the last of the classics.

3. *Ditto. Ditto*. No. 5. A more advanced Persian Reader, containing extracts from the Sháhnámah and the Garsháspnámah. The extracts from the last named work are a welcome addition to our printed series of Persian classics. MSS. of this work are so excessively rare, that even the Asiatic Society of Bengal possesses no MS. of this ancient Persian poem. Even in Europe only a few are known to exist, and we would strongly advise Rái Sohan Lál to publish the whole work. The Garsháspnámah was composed by Asad i Túsi, the great teacher of the greater Firdausí.

*Masnaví i Mihr i Haq*, the Poetical works by Rái Sohan Lál, Headmaster of the Patna Normal School. Lithographed, 62pp, 8vo., 1872. Printed by Munshí Súrjammal, Patna.

We have read with much pleasure portions of these Persian poems composed by the energetic Headmaster of the Patna Normal School, on the greatness of God's love, the excellencies of His works, and the happiness of the man whose breast is filled with the thought of God. The language is pure and has a touch of the quaint and archaic, which is so suitable for poems of the didactic class. The thoughts are simple and clearly expressed. In one point we do not agree with the poet. As he writes Persian, he must follow more strictly the technicalities of the *ars poetica* than he has done. This remark refers chiefly to the rhyme. Cases of rhymes, inadmissible as far as Persian Qáfiah is concerned, are for example found on p. 9, l. 3 ; p. 15, l. 8 ; p. 46, l. 1. ; p. 58, l. 9, &c. *Humesh* on p. 31, is Hindi, not Persian. A few verses are objectionable in phraseology and metre, as on p. 4, l. 10 and 11 ; p. 5, l. 6 ; p. 25, l. 3 from below ; p. 38 l. 4 from below ; p. 39, l. 6 ; p. 40, l. 3 from below ; p. 41, l. 6 ; p. 60, l. 1.

## 2. GENERAL LITERATURE.

*A Report on the Expedition to Western Yunan via Bhamo.*  
By John Anderson, M.,D. Medical Officer and Naturalist to the Expedition. Calcutta : Office of the Superintendent of Government Printing. 1871.

THIS expedition was organised in 1868, for the purpose of determining the possibility and the advantages of a trade-route from Bhamo to Western China by the valley of the Tapeng, which joins the Irawady at Bhamo. This route is probably the best and easiest that could be chosen between Burmah and China ; but it is impossible to be very sanguine about its ultimate success. In the first place the provinces of Yunan and Sechuen, which would be immediately opened up by the proposed route, have been for the last fifteen years in open revolt from China ; and it seems probable that the rebellion will end in the establishment of a Muhammadan monarchy including, besides those above-named, the northern provinces of Shensi and Kansu. The Panthays, as the Muhammadan rebels are termed by the Burmese, will in this case form an independent state lying between two hostile populations ; for the Burmese naturally look to China as an ally in the event of possible complications, and entertain towards the successful Panthays an extreme dislike. Such a termination to the present hostilities would be hardly favourable to the encouragement of trade operations between Burmah and China. Dr. Anderson does, indeed, express a hope that the possible re-establishment of peace might open a brighter prospect to the merchants of Rangoon. The population of Western Yunan would be reached, and through them the millions of China ; and therefrom Manchester and Sheffield might suck no small advantage. But the author is not over sanguine about such a result. Arrived at Yunan city, the route would have to compete with the three great river-highways ; the Yang-tse-kiang to Shanghai, the Canton river, and the Cambodia to Saigon. "In the event of either road or railway being opened up, even as far as has been indicated, it would have a severe struggle with those long-established water highways down which the riches of that immense empire of China have rolled to the sea, generation after generation ; and when it is remembered that the sole purpose, or nearly so, of a proposed land communication with China, is to divert a moiety of the trade that finds its way down these splendid rivers to the sea in an opposite direction, and to bring it by a land route to another river, the Irawady, in foreign territory, the immense difficulties that lie in the way of its successful accom-



plishment are easily understood. In plain language, the project is to divert from the Yang-tse-kiang, Canton river, and Cambodia that which naturally belongs to them, and to bring it to the Irawady by a land journey. I leave it to practical men to judge if such an end is likely to be attained." The land journey from Yunan to Momien, and thence by the Kakhyen hills down the Tapeng valley, involving a distance of some 350 miles and an ascent or descent of over 1,000 feet, puts an insuperable difficulty in the way of successful competition. Dr. Anderson accordingly looks to the Brahmaputra and its affluent, the Dihong, which breaks through the Himalayas from Tibet into Assam, as the only natural outlet for the productions of Tibet and China. Bathang in Sechuen, on the highway from the capital of that province to Tibet, is only 14 days from our frontier; and Hamilton Buchanan states that in his time there was a mart at a place called Chouna on the confines of Assam and Tibet, in which the products of Bengal were exchanged for silver bullion to the amount of £10,000. It is only the exclusive policy of the Chinese Government that cuts off Assam from its natural commercial relations, and diverts the enormous trade of Tibet from the Brahmaputra to the Yang-tse-kiang. But we fear this obstacle is just as fatal as the other; the Chinese hatred of foreigners is a difficulty quite as formidable (until the sun of enlightenment rises upon the Celestial Empire) as 350 miles of arduous country.

Perhaps the most valuable portion of Dr. Anderson's work is the result of his researches about the upper waters of the Irawady, that great stumbling block to geographers. The difficulty is, how to connect the great rivers of Tibet, from the Sanpo eastward to the Yang-tse-kiang, with the river-systems of India, Burmah and Chin<sup>a</sup>. A glance at any good map—Stanford's or Keith Johnston's—will elucidate the nature of the difficulty. North of the Himalayan range there are two great rivers: the Sanpo, flowing nearly due east at a mean latitude of 29°; and the Yang-tse-kiang, running nearly southwards, and separated from the Sanpo, at the extreme eastern point of the latter, by a distance of 200 miles. Between these two there are a number of lesser streams; one of which, the Sok, must have traversed a course of 600 miles before reaching the latitude of 29°, the Burung also being of considerable, though less magnitude. South of the Himalayas, there are the Brahmaputra; the Irawady and the Salween of Burmah; and the Cambodia. The Yang-tse-kiang may be neglected, as its course is well defined throughout. The question that geographers have to settle is, which rivers of the northern system are connected with which of the southern? A century ago D'Anville, perhaps the greatest geographer that ever lived, put forward the startling hypothesis that the Sanpo was identical

with the Irawady. He seems to have been led to this conclusion by the apparent continuity of the eastern Himalayas, and the consequent impossibility of the northern river breaking through the range into Assam. He attributed the enormous volume of water of the Brahmaputra—which on this hypothesis was restricted to a very short course—to a vast number of contributory streams rising in the mountains that inclose Assam to the north-east, and fed by their snows. The Sok and the other rivers eastward as far as the Yang-tse-kiang were attributed, in conformity with this theory, to the Salween and Cambodia; the former of which, at any rate, cannot from its size lay claim to any such distant source.

D'Anville's conjecture was supported by Klaproth, who brought the Sanpo by a circuitous course into the Irawady at Bhamo along the valley of the Tapeng. Consequently, throughout the first quarter of this century, the Irawady was credited with all the water of the Sanpo. But in 1825 Captain Wilcox saw reasons for believing the theory to be untenable. Going eastward from Assam, he encountered what he supposed to be the main stream of the Irawady, and found it a small river, not more than eighty yards wide, closed in to the north by a towering wall of mountains. He heard indeed of an eastern branch, but it was reported to be insignificant; and he felt convinced that the Irawady took its rise in the mountain range before him. He may be said to have refuted Klaproth's theory; but there can be no doubt that, in assigning to the Irawady so contracted a course, he unduly depreciated the importance of that river. A course of under 300 miles, with no streams of any magnitude to feed it, will not explain the size of the Irawady at Bhamo. From that time, however, the hypothesis of D'Anville and Klaproth has been discredited; and it may now be assumed, for it has been proved almost to demonstration, that the Sanpo flows in its natural course to the Brahmaputra, breaking through the mountains under the name of the Dihong. But there are two other rivers which unite with the Dihong to form the Brahmaputra, namely, the Debong and the Brahmakund. Accordingly, since the Irawady, the Salween and the Cambodia, owing to the impossibility of their breaking through Wilcox's "towering wall of mountains," have been confined to a district south of 28°, it has been found necessary to identify the Sok, and its two neighbours to the east, with these affluents of the Brahmaputra. Such is an outline of the river distribution as indicated in the ordinary maps.

The result of Dr. Anderson's inquiries is that Wilcox's account of the source of the Irawady cannot be reconciled with the size of a river "which, 200 miles further down, measures more than half a mile in breadth, with an average depth of from two to three

fathoms, without receiving any notable stream on the way that would account for the unprecedented difference between these two points." He cannot, therefore, avoid the conclusion that its eastern branch, which no European eye has ever seen, must have a much larger northerly distribution. All the accounts that he could get, concur in describing the eastern branch as the largest, and as being more like the upward prolongation of the main stream than a branch. Dr. Anderson looks upon the "towering wall" as no obstacle whatever. In the Dihong, Debong and Brahmakund, we have examples of large rivers piercing mountain chains. The Salween is comparatively a small river, and its origin may without any difficulty be assigned to a latitude of 28° or less. But the Cambodia is a much more important river; and though in the text Dr. Anderson is inclined to explain its large size by the immense reservoir which it has in the Tali lake in lat. 26°, yet in the map he takes it through the northern chain and, identifying it with one of the lesser Tibetan rivers, gives it an origin in lat. 30°. Hence the river system of Tibet, as explained by Dr. Anderson, is somewhat as follows. The Sanpo breaks through the Himalayas as the Dihong, and becomes, after receiving the other two affluent streams, the Brahmaputra. The Debong is identified with the Sok, which drains an immense tract of country to the east of the lake district of Tibet. To the Brahmakund, the last affluent of the Brahmaputra, a short course of 150 miles is assigned. Of the other two Tibetan rivers to the east of the Sok, the Irawady is identified with one, the Burung, which rises in the Gherghi range in lat. 34°, not far from the main stream of the Yang-tse-kiang. The remaining one may either join the former to swell the waters of the Irawady, or keep an eastward course and become known to geographers as the Cambodia. As Dr. Anderson says, however, all the information as yet obtained is little more than conjectural; and it says little for geographical enterprise in the East in recent times, that a river, equalling in magnitude the Ganges, should remain unexplored. The difficulties in the way of at least a partial exploration cannot be insuperable. Dr. Anderson went up in a boat from Bhamo as far as the first defile; and was only prevented from pursuing his voyage of discovery by the exigencies of the expedition, which was on the point of starting for Momien.

The progress of the expedition was at first delayed by the hostility of the Kakhyens, who occupy the western portion of the mountains that inclose the valley of the Tapeng as far as Momien. They are evidently an ill-conditioned set of ruffians; and present a curious mixture of brutality, avarice, insolence, dirt, and cowardice. The women contrast very favourably with the men; and throughout the expedition the party received many proofs of kindness from the gentler sex. Coquetry is

natural to the female character in even the most uncivilised regions ; witness the following incident :—

“ Half an hour before sunset I went out for a stroll below the city wall, keeping my eyes about me for land shells, which seem to be remarkably scarce here. While so engaged, I heard a female voice calling to me from the battlements, and looking up saw a pretty face peering down, and intent that I should give her something ; and not catching very distinctly what she said, I imagined that she was asking for cheroots, and indicated by signs that if she would unwind her long head-dress, and let down one end of it, I would give her some. She disappeared for a few minutes and returned with a long cloth, and on her letting it down, I tied a few cheroots into it, congratulating myself that I had satisfied her demands ; but no, no sooner had she drawn it back and examined the contents than she became as importunate as ever. At last catching the word *keenza* the mystery was explained ; she was begging for round mirrors, and I recognised her as one of the Shan ladies attached to the suite of the Tsawbwa-gadaw of Nantin. I tried to make her understand that I did not carry *keenzas* about with me, but as she would take no denial, I jokingly offered to catch her in my arms if she would jump down and come to the khyoung for them ; but although this highly amused her, she was not to be diverted from her desire to possess the coveted mirrors, and waved me off for them ; and I had to obey, and returning with one and a packet of needles, the cloth was again lowered, and great was her glee when she pulled it up, and found herself the happy possessor of the much-longed-for *keenza*.”

The hostility of the Chinese both in Bhamo and in Momien was another cause of vexatious delay. The trade between these places has always been in their hands ; and they were naturally jealous of foreign intrusion. But the Panthays, who are now in possession of the town of Momien, were very anxious to encourage the expedition. They would not allow the party to proceed until they had cleared the road of a formidable gang of Chinese marauders ; and they finally sent forward a guard to protect the party as far as Momien. Meanwhile, during the two months' delay at Ponsee, the surrounding villages became convinced of the pacific character of the expedition, and showed a more friendly disposition. Some Buddhist nuns, also, who had been to Rangoon, and had come back impressed with the greatness and goodness of the English, helped to make matters smooth. But what most of all contributed to the establishment of popular favour was the medical skill displayed by Dr. Anderson. Nothing came amiss to him. Demoniical possession and fever, barrenness and ophthalmia, congenital dumbness and broken bones—all were brought to him for treatment, with the fullest confidence in powers suspected to be supernatural. A magnetic battery, a telescope, and the prediction of an eclipse confirmed a simple people in the belief

of the stranger's exalted powers. Still, the avarice of those in authority interposed many difficulties in their way. The following ingenious device was resorted to in order to extract a sum of money from Major Sladen, as the price of allowing his party to proceed :—

“ The Tsawbwa intimated to Sladen that he was doubtful whether the nâts were favourable to our advance, and that he intended to consult them in the evening, and asked our presence. We went up after dinner to the ceremony, which was held in one end of the new house which he is building. His wife brought mats, and for some time we lay round a fire chatting with him and the other chiefs and their head men. When the Meetway or priest made his appearance, the ceremony began. He sat down on a footstool in one of the corners of the house which had been previously sprinkled with water, and no sooner was he seated than he blew through a small tube, and uttering a groan threw it from him, and began to shake from head to foot, making the whole floor vibrate. He then grasped the sides of his head, and quivering all over, uttered long-drawn yawns, shrieks, and groans, as if he were in great suffering. He also went through occasional chants, and the Tsawbwa and his Pawmines kept up short conversations with him in a coaxing tone, when he appeared to be suffering more than usual. The only way I can describe this remarkable scene is by comparing him to a maniac. After this had gone on for some time, Sladen was politely informed that the nâts required to be appeased by an offering of silver and cloth before it would be lucky for us to advance from Ponline; fifteen rupees and some pieces of cloth were offered. The rupees were placed in a small bamboo which had been previously sprinkled with water, but no sooner were they placed before the priest, along with the cloth, than he kicked them away, continuing his shrieks and groans even more vigorously than before. This was to indicate that the offering was not enough, and in the midst of shakings, groans, and yells, he signified through the Tsawbwa that nothing under Rs. 60 would suffice. Sladen added Rs. 5 to his offering, and told the man that no more would be forthcoming, but when it was laid before him, he again kicked it away, but this time no one took any notice of his rejection of it. He continued his unearthly sounds for another full quarter of an hour, when they began to be less frequent and violent. A dried leaf rolled into a cone and filled with rice was then handed to him by one of the Pawmines. He took it, and raised it to his forehead two or three times, uttering a low chant, and then threw it on the floor. He then took a dâh which had been carefully washed before the ceremony began, and treated it in the same way as the leaf-cone. This over, he gave expression to his feelings in gentler groans and sighs which gradually died away, and the ceremony was over. He left his seat laughing, and directed our attention by signs to his legs and arms which he gave us to understand were very tired. We were informed that the nâts had taken a favourable view of affairs, and that we were to be allowed to proceed.”

The nâts play a very important part in all public and domestic affairs. They are a difficult and cantankerous set of spirits, and generally manifest themselves as obstructives. If a journey is to be undertaken the nâts will not allow it; if a man goes out to shoot birds, it is intimated to him that the nâts will take offence. A Kakhyen discovers a woman seriously ill; he immediately draws his *dâh* and makes a series of cuts over the unfortunate woman's head, in order to drive off the nât who is attacking her. On another occasion our travellers were credited by the Kakhyens with the possession of influence over the nâts.

"We found a number of men, women, and children dancing round the common hall, each carrying a small stick, which was waved up and down in unison with their pedal movements which consisted of a rapid shuffling gait, first with one leg and then with the other, intermixed with the vigorous beating of two tom-toms by a man and girl; the dancers burst out occasionally into bounds and yells, and rushed round the apartment with renewed energy and excitement. We were beckoned to join them, which we at once did, but when we had made two rounds, the whole party suddenly rushed to the door with a fiendish shout, the foremost man clearing the way with his stick which some of our party mistook for a *dâh*. We all followed, and the house was left, as we thought, empty. On going in again to discover the object of the dance, we found, to our horror, a dead child lying in a corner carefully screened off, and the poor mother standing by its side weeping bitterly. The dance was to drive the spirit of the infant from the house, which it was supposed to leave when the rush was made for the door, and we were informed that our presence had contributed in no small degree to hasten its temporary departure. We were now presented by one of the women with *sheroo*, which was handed to us in primitive cups extemporized out of plantain leaves folded in such a way that not a drop of liquor escaped. On leaving, we discovered that the chickens were intended as an offering to the nâts. We had again occasion to pass the house, when we found the girls busily pounding rice, and laughing as if nothing had happened."

For the credit of the class, however, it should be added that there are good nâts who cause the sun and moon to rise, send abundant crops, and protect travellers. There are separate nâts of rain, wind, cold and fire. There is a superior nât called Shingrawah who created everything. He is not worshipped, but he is held in reverence on account, they say, of his bigness. The Kakhyens have some notions of a future state; and the worst penalties are reserved for those men who are killed by the *dâh*, and those women who die pregnant. The horse and the great earth-snake are also objects of reverence.

Nât-worship seems to be a relic of the old religion of the country, which, in other parts, has been engrafted on to Buddhism. But the prevalent form of Buddhism is of a somewhat impure

character. The Kakhyens are not Buddhists; but amongst the Shans, who profess it, there are no pagodas; the priests wear shoes, discard the yellow robe, and work as silversmiths (silver being a metal which their religion forbids them to touch); and they receive their daily alms at the monastery, instead of begging it from door to door. Dr. Anderson mentions an extraordinary perversion of the orthodox doctrine, which he even declares to be the opinion of the majority of the Buddhists that he has met. Gaudama is spoken of as distinct from and above Buddha: "so that whatever may be the abstract teaching of their religion, the belief of the common people is in a God and Buddha." Gaudama may rightly be spoken of as distinct from Buddha; since there are many possible Buddhas and only one Gaudama, who has destroyed his chance of ever becoming Buddha again, by the attainment of Nirvâna. According to the legend, Dipenkara was the previous Buddha, and Maitreya will be the next; and when, in another passage, Dr. Anderson speaks of Gaudama as identical with the preceding Buddha, Dipenkara, there is evidently a misconception. Though it is difficult to set limits to the vagaries of a popular creed, yet we think it quite possible that all that was meant by the Kakhyen expositor was this:—that Gaudama had now attained, in Nirvâna, a position far above that of any future Buddha, by whom Nirvâna had not yet been realised. But the conception of a God above Buddha is wholly unintelligible; gods there are below Buddha in thousands, and they inhabit their blessed abode Tushit. To them Gaudama, when a Bodhisattwa, or Buddha not yet perfected, had preached the law before becoming incarnate on earth; and to him they listened with reverent admiration. But the gods live in Heaven; and any form of life, even in Heaven, is far below the aspirations of the Buddhist sage.

*India : or, certain moral and social questions connected with our Indian Empire.* An Address by Richard Congreve, M.A., M.R.C.P.L.

IT has often been pointed out by adverse critics that if Positivists ever became possessed of power, they would establish a tyranny over the minds and bodies of men more terrible than any the world has ever witnessed. And the criticism is undoubtedly true. Positivism, while insisting *ad nauseam* on its relativity, is the most intensely dogmatic and uncompromising scheme that was ever propounded. It has its hard and fast lines drawn round every sphere of human activity, beyond which it is flat blasphemy to transgress. Poets are to write poetry only after a particular fashion,—the very length of their poems, and the structure of the verse having been given in detail by the illustrious Comte; Science

is hedged in by certain Hercules' pillars,—Comte having at some time or other peered into the unknown regions beyond, and come back with the information that nothing of practical utility was to be found there ; Metaphysics and Psychology are alike expelled ; while all those feelings, hopes, aspirations, joys and sorrows which have sought for satisfaction in something more enduring than this transient life, are labelled “delusions,” and sternly forbidden to the Faithful. Lastly no one is to emigrate from one country to another, or even apparently to leave his own home, unless he is prepared to identify himself absolutely with the new people among whom he goes, as such practices tend to disturb that Chinese uniformity, not to say, stagnation, which the Positivist looks forward to as the last result of all the ages, and which he dignifies by the imposing title of “the doctrine of persistence.” The world, in fact, according to the Positivist is a mistake altogether. There are benighted minds who may prefer the irregular luxuriance of nature to the artificial symmetry of a triangular yew tree ; the varied magnificence of a tropical forest, to the square cut parterres of a Dutch garden ; but not so the enlightened advocate of the Religion of Humanity. The triangular yew tree, the square cut Dutch garden, are in his eyes the very ideal after which impotent nature is unceasingly striving. When he has destroyed the last spark of “individualism” which lights up the monotony of human life ; when every soul upon the earth is so renewed after the likeness of Auguste Comte, that it is impossible to distinguish one from another, then “the world's great age begins anew ; the golden years return.” It is plain that to bring about this result, some means of coercion will have to be employed, and in the address we are criticising, some of these means are candidly explained to us. Mr. Congreve,—the leader of Positivism in England—maintains for certain reasons (most ludicrously inadequate as we shall show presently) that our retention of India is an act of gross wickedness, and proceeds to argue from this that no true Positivist ought to come to India, either as a Government servant, or even in a commercial capacity, as in this last character he acts contrary to the doctrine of persistence. If, he adds, after this plain warning, any ill-advised Positivist should seek a livelihood in India, “the sacrament of destination” will be withheld from him. (We must mention for the benefit of those unacquainted with the system of Positivism, that the Positivists though banishing God out of the region of human life, have provided themselves abundantly with every other religious equipment, and among them, with seven sacraments.) But Mr. Congreve has also a great horror of people—that is English people—marrying in this country. The necessity to send children home to England to be educated, is opposed to the Positivist notion of



what family life should be ; consequently any Positivist man and woman who presume to marry in England, with the intention of coming to India, will be deprived of the "sacrament of marriage." Here then we have an infallible Pope revealed to us *in propria persona*. Of course at present it sounds laughable enough, because so very few people care a rush for the Positivist "sacraments"—either for that of "marriage," or that of "destination,"—or can even dimly imagine any rational being ever doing so ; but we are attempting to trace out the *spirit* of Positivism, and its action upon conduct. Now here is a claim put forward, precisely similar in every respect to the power of the keys exercised by the Pope of Rome. In the Positivist church, any man who dares to think for himself, so much as to believe England is not guilty of gross wickedness in retaining India, and to act upon that belief is, *ipso facto*, excommunicated. For him there is no hope of that "subjective immortality" which the Positivist Church holds forth as the reward of the true believer ; he is to be cast out into the outer darkness together with "the parasites" or enemies of Humanity, where he will "without doubt perish everlastingly."

But this assumption of infallibility on the part of Mr. Congreve becomes doubly ludicrous when we come to the reasons on which he grounds his indignation against England's hold upon India. "In the present case," he says speaking of India and England, "what we wish, what we aim at, is to bring to a close peaceably, and in the best possible way, the, to us, acknowledged evil of our supremacy over another country, *equally with ourselves entitled to its national independence*. The italics are ours. We will pass over the blunder involved in speaking of India as inhabited by a single homogeneous people, and as therefore so much as capable of possessing "national independence." We will confine ourselves to the error involved in the expression "entitled." There are only two senses in which this word can be used in the present connection, and Mr. Congreve can use it in neither without a flat contradiction of some of the fundamental tenets of Positivism. A nation may be said to be "equally entitled" with ourselves to independence, on the hypothesis that all peoples as such, possess an *a priori* metaphysical "right" to freedom,—a meaning which Positivism would indignantly repudiate. We are then thrown back upon the other alternative,—the argument from experience—that only those nations are "entitled" to their freedom who have the courage and the patriotism to preserve it. Of course we all know that such freedom as India does enjoy is wholly dependent upon our presence here ; that were we to withdraw, Sikhs, Afghans and Mahrattas would convert it into a vast field for plunder and slaughter ; but it is not surprising that the writer,

who knows so little of India, as to suppose it to be inhabited by a single homogeneous people, should endow this creature of his imagination with a capacity for independence. This, however, is Mr. Congreve's main reason for calling upon England to release her cruel grasp upon Hindostan. "But," the reader may ask, "how are we to abandon India?" There certainly seem to be difficulties when we consider the vast network of commercial relations which exist between India and all other parts of the world, and which are the direct products of British rule—the innumerable hopes and prospects, the peace, order and security which depend entirely upon our presence here; but, here we regret to say Mr. Congreve almost entirely fails us,—“the means” he modestly declares, “of effecting that object are not within my province.” This our readers will see is not quite fair of Mr. Congreve. No man is justified in abusing another as an iniquitous profligate because he has a wen on his neck, and then when asked how he is to get rid of an inherited evil, to turn round and say, “that is no business of mine.” Mr. Congreve himself seems to have some conscientious compunctions on this score, and makes one notable suggestion which alone ought to immortalise his name. First, a general guarantee is to be given by all the European Powers that they are on no account to slip into our vacant places. With childlike hopefulness Mr. Congreve asserts that this guarantee we may easily secure. Then there is to be a mixed commission to settle the relations of Western Europe and India, consisting of representatives from France, Portugal, Denmark, and Italy,—Russia, Austria and Germany are, for reasons unknown, excluded—the Sultan of Turkey as the natural head of Islamism, and last, but not least, Mr. Congreve “would have some eminent Brahmin selected as the fitting complement to the mixed commission thus formed.” After that one really gasps for breath. But worse is to come. The “eminent Brahmin” and “the Sultan of Turkey” with their coadjutors might, Mr. Congreve believes, “fairly constitute the germ of a European protectorate, and in the meantime they might, on the strength of a policy of renunciation on the part of England, speak in persuasive language to the various Indian Governments on their own internal affairs.” This is truly delightful. But alas! we fear that our friends the Sikhs and the Afghans would be utterly unmoved by either the “policy of renunciation” or the most “persuasive” *duet* that could possibly be maintained by the Sultan and “the eminent Brahmin.” Besides there is Russia. But it is not worth while to seriously discuss proposals which are fit only for laughter. We have only noticed this address because the extraordinary absurdity of its statements, reasoning, and practical conclusions furnish such a striking commentary on the intellectual arrogance of Positivism.

According to this school, every mental product in the universe is perishing from its inherent foolishness, except that which proposes to regenerate India by the removal of British rule, and the substitution in its place of a mixed commission, the chief members of which are to be the Sultan of Turkey and an "eminent Brahmin." "The force of folly could no further go."

R. D. OSBORN.

1. *Mookerjee's Magazine (New Series), of Politics, Sociology, Literature, Art, and Science; including chiefly History and Antiquities, Geography and Travels, Bibliography and Oriental Literature, Jurisprudence and Commerce, &c.* Edited by Sambhu Chandra Mukhopādhyāya. Calcutta. 1872.
2. *The Bengal Magazine.* Edited by the Rev. Lal Behari Day. Calcutta. 1872.

**D**URING the past quarter two rival monthly Magazines have been started in Calcutta, written in English by native scholars. Between them they number amongst their contributors nearly all the best native scholars in Bengal; and their simultaneous appearance, though probably a somewhat unfortunate circumstance as far as regards their prospects as commercial ventures, is a striking manifestation of Bengali literary activity.

One of these is a resuscitation of the old *Mookerjee's Magazine*, under the same name and management; the other is called the *Bengal Magazine*, and is edited by the Rev. Lál Bihári Day. Of the former, the first number appeared in July; and a month later it was followed by its rival. In *Mookerjee's Magazine*, where the writers are discussing purely literary or scientific topics, they are generally very readable; and in one paper on *The Homer of India*, by Bábu Rajendralál Mitra, the language is particularly pure and idiomatic. But when we come to the discussion of social topics, we perceive an immediate falling off, not in the vigour of the thoughts or the excellence of the moral sentiments, but in the appropriateness of the language. Take, for example an earnest and sorrowful biographical notice, written by the Editor, of his late colleague in the management of the old series of the Magazine. Any one who will read it through carefully, without noticing its imperfections of *manner*, will be convinced that it is brimful of real, honest, manly feeling; yet few would think so from the style of the introduction, which was as follows: "Late on Sunday night, the 19th September, 1869, when we went to bed, little did we suspect . . . that a great Indian was *giving the slip* to all who and which were dear to him, and to whom and which he was dear, including his great country, and passing from Earth to Heaven! For, surely, the word has no meaning

if Heaven has no room, *in pit or gallery, if not reserved seats*, for such as Grish Chunder Ghose. Waking the next morning, we found he had gone—for good!—*in more senses than one, taking French leave of us.*" The amazing incongruity of such passages as those we have here italicised is undoubtedly the first thing that will strike every English reader; and it is such incongruities as these that sometimes engross the attention of the English critic, and make him blind to much that is good and sensible and even elegant, often obscured and marred by these flippant conceits. In the very instance before us, the article which begins thus ludicrously, contains much nervous manly writing in an easy simple style highly creditable to the author. Apart, however, from these defects of manner, there is a very serious defect in the matter also. Bábu Sambhu Chandra is never tired of grumbling at the British Government, because it did not make his lamented friend a "Settlement Commissioner or Commissioner on a Frontier," or give him some high preferment of some kind; he declares that "God made Grish for a tribune of the people, and England permitted him to be no more than a clerk"; he sets all this down to "British slavery"; and yet every word that he writes about the character of his gentle, reserved, inactive friend proves that the Government would have committed an egregious mistake if any post had been given him involving more responsibility than that which he had. Take one or two traits:—

He had no enterprise, no personal boldness, no ambition. No salutary discontent dogged him in his quiet, even path, or for a moment clouded his unvarying cheerfulness; no high tastes cherished in secret made him miserable, no worthy aspirations urged him day and night to deeds of high emprise." The Editor of *Mookerjee* would fain have had his friend emulate the Byronic medical students described by Macaulay, who, in their excessive admiration for *Lara* or the *Giaour*, "became things "of dark imaginings on whom the freshness of the heart ceased "to fall like dew, whose passions had consumed themselves to "dust, and to whom the relief of tears was denied"; but Bábu Giris, doubtless fortunately for his own comfort and peace of mind, was much too sensible for this sort of thing.

In strong contrast to such unreal and unreasonable complaints, the tone of two capital papers on *Practical Education*, contributed by Bábu Iswar Chandra Mitra to the August and September numbers of the *Bengal Magazine*. On the whole we are inclined to regard these essays as the most valuable outcome, so far, of this remarkable literary movement. In the first paper the Bábu confines himself to a statement of the present condition of affairs; showing that whilst yearly the supply of educated young men is being largely increased, the avenues of employment usually open

to them are becoming narrower and fewer. This part of his case is, we think, certainly overdrawn; but we can forgive much to the advocate of a good cause; and the advice given in the second paper is in every way admirable, even if the state of affairs be not so alarming as he would at first seem to have us believe.

The question now is, are we to be content with this state of things? If we are so content, and stand still, we are certain to fall back. We shall not be able to tread on other walks of life but such as we are already familiar with, and the number of competitors in the race will yearly increase, while our prospects will not, in all likelihood, be at all bettered. Need we not then give our young men a more practical education than we give them at present,—an education which will fit them to pursue occupations which are as honest and respectable as those they now pursue? What are those ‘occupations’, and what is the sort of education which would fit our young men for them? Being of gentle blood, they cannot be hewers of wood and drawers of water; neither are we going to ask them to be such. Even in progressive England, a man with gentle blood in his veins will not, I fear, easily consent to be a green-grocer. Handicrafts may be contemned, but we do not see why occupations requiring the exercise of educated intellect should be despised.

This is a fair statement of the point in question; without any cant about “honest sweat of the brow” and the many platitudes of that kind which reformers are so fond of thrusting down other peoples’ throats, and which are suggested rather by the enthusiasm of the platform than by the requirements of real life. Nor does the Bábú leave his questions unanswered:—

Our mineral resources are unbounded. Their development would add materially to our national wealth. Capital and enterprise are certainly wanted to secure this development, but an expensive skilled agency stands a great deal in the way. Will not a study of the sciences of Geology and Mineralogy fit men to assist in this development, either in the field of investigation under the control of Government, or in works undertaken by private enterprise? We have not, we fear, a single individual amongst us, competent by actual training to take an important part in their prosecution. Electricity is a very interesting branch of study. It has received extensive application in connection with telegraphic communications. We have native signallers who can manipulate the batteries; but whenever there is anything radically wrong in the working, whenever there is an interruption in the communications, European skill must be brought into play to set the matter right. Will not a practical study of this particular branch of science open out a large field for worthy employment? Our soil is one of the richest in the world; will not a proper study of agriculture enable us to improve our food-resources, and prevent the recurrence of devastating famines? Are not intellects devoted to the study likely to find ample scope for action? The subject of the conservation of our forests is now being attended to by Government. A department of service has actu-

ally been created. Can a mere general education fit us for employment in it? A special training is certainly required, and it behoves us, if we are to seek our interests, to secure this special training for our young men. The subject of sanitation is daily rising into importance. Diseases, in an endemic and epidemic form, often rage through the land, bringing misery and desolation into many a village and many a home. The nature of the soil on which habitations are built, that of the sub-soil, their humidity from want of drainage, the accumulation and disposal of filth and refuse, sewage, &c., are all matters which must have long, patient and careful investigation, before the laws of public health can be laid down, and before we can expect to remove the causes of the sufferings we daily witness. There cannot be a more noble and wider field for study, enquiry and usefulness. Just as an executive engineer is required in every district to take care of its roads and communications, a sanitary officer may soon be required to take care of its general health.

In the July number of *Mookerjee's Magazine* appeared an interesting little paper by the Rev. K. M. Banerjee, on *Infantine Marriages in India*. Its object is to show that these marriages were unknown in the early ages—at all events at the time of the Mahābhārata and the Rāmāyana; “in fact, we have no record of a “case of infantine marriage in literature that might really be called “classical.” It is, doubtless, in this way—by showing the people at large that the practice is not only pernicious and degrading, but also unauthorised by the example of their fathers—that this social evil may best be remedied, by the gradual withdrawal of social sanction. We believe that a petition to the Viceregal Council is now in course of circulation for signature, asking that an Act may be passed to forbid marriages between boys and girls under certain ages. A well-written and powerful protest against the principle of reckless Government interference in social matters is contained in a paper in the *Bengal Magazine* for September, entitled *Improvement under Legislative Pressure*.

In the second place, beyond the right that proceeds from might, what other possible right, may we ask, the Council of the Governor-General of India for the purpose of making laws and regulations has to legislate upon matters connected with the social usages and customs of the people of this country? Does the Council as a body, or any one of its members as individuals, represent in any shape or form whatever the feelings and ideas of either Hindus or Musalmans? Has it any means of being intimately and accurately acquainted with such feelings and ideas? There are, no doubt, the newspapers; but are we to be governed in accordance with the views and opinions of a handful of Editors, whose knowledge of the people below and above them is certainly very limited, to say the least of it, and who, though able and educated, deal more with general politics than with society? In countries where the legislative bodies are elective; where, the legislators come from and out of the people; where social opinion

is strong to the verge of tyranny; where proceedings of public bodies are held in the capital and published soon after they have taken place, by impartial journals, with all their incidents and all their details; where the people understand their temporary rulers; where there is no chance of any misunderstanding between the governed and the governors; where both speak the same language, both are actuated to a great extent by the same sympathies and antipathies and prejudices, both have a very great deal—if not every thing—in common, in such countries, legislative interference in matters social is held in jealous dread, and the representatives of the people are called to instant account if they travel by one hair's breadth out of their legitimate region: and, yet, in India, where the legislative bodies are not elective, where there is nothing in common between the rulers and the ruled, and where none of the circumstances which are to be found, for instance in England, exist, it is asked that the Legislature should put a stop to polygamy and early marriage! If it is legitimate for the Council to do away with these two abominations of our society, why should it not be asked to abolish caste? Why should it not make it penal for people to call themselves Brahmans or Sudras? Why should it not make it an offence on the part of a Brahman to invest his son with the *Jagmva pavita*—the holy thread? Why should it not, in short, compel every body to become Brahmans and be reformed for ever and a day?

The proper course to follow, in the present circumstances of the country, is to educate public opinion, and let public opinion do what the Legislature is going to be asked to do. All reforms which are thrust down from above are not reforms in the real sense of the word. Reforms to be reforms, to be permanent, that is, to be effective, must spring from the people, and must be enforced by the voice of the people. Let us in our different circles ignore the existence of the polygamist. Let us in our intercourse with society give the polygamist unmistakably to understand that no decent man would associate with him, no decent man would eat with him, no decent man would have anything to do with him either in sickness or in sorrow. Let us, in the same manner, bring our moral and social influence to bear upon the father, who gives his daughter away in marriage when she is only a child. Instead of its being a social disgrace, as it is at present, to have a daughter at home unmarried beyond a certain age, let us educate ourselves into the conviction, that it is an honour and a matter of credit to have her at home till she has attained her eighteenth or nineteenth year, or whatever other year may be considered most suitable. When this is done, then and then only, will polygamy and early marriage be knocked on the head. Till then you may ask the Legislature to assist you, you may do what you please, the answer you will receive would be that which Jove returned to the carter in answer to his application to get his cart out of the mud in which it had got imbedded.

The authors of the *Dutt Family Album* contribute several little poems of pleasing sentiment and melodious rhythm, to both

the journals under notice. One of Mr. O. C. Dutt's *Sonnets* in the August number of the *Bengal Magazine* will compare favourably with any productions of the same nature that we have seen from Anglo-Indian pens ; and the following elegant little *Charade*, which we copy from the September number of the same journal, is characterised by an ingenious simplicity which is entirely appropriate to its subject.

## CHARADE.

I mark'd my *First* across the lee,  
Run shouting loud in artless glee,  
No bird could ever be so gay,  
As he upon that holiday, —  
The carmine on his cheek that glows,  
Shamed the rich lustre of the rose, —  
And the deep violet of his eyes  
Outvied the color of the skies.  
—Deftly the knots had been untied,  
My silken *Second* thrown aside,  
And all his wealth of golden hair,  
Now flutter'd on the morning air,  
—A sweet babe-angel from above,  
—A Cupid from the bowers of love !

Run, laugh, and shout,—play on, play on,  
My *All*, alas !, will soon be gone.  
That rosy cheek will sure be dim,  
Those glistening eyes in tears will swim,  
And innocence, and joy and truth,  
Will fade ere long with fading youth.  
The peace that now reigns in thy heart,  
Will soon, too soon for aye depart,  
And canker grief and carking care  
Will cloud thy brow with dark despair.  
Thy morn is bright, but soon the shade  
Of evening will thy heaven pervade ;  
Run, laugh, and shout,—play on, play on,  
Use well my *All* ere it be gone.

Hardly, if at all, inferior to this, is a sprightly version of a Sanskrit epigram by Rájá Jotindra Mohun Tagore Bahádúr, entitled *Woman's Lips* ; showing how, when Gods and Asurs joined to churn the vasty sea, and Nectar and Woman were the products, the sly-fellow Vishnu magnanimously shared the ambrosial drink with his comrades, but "*Sri* was his alone."

A silly and impertinent attack by "a graduate of the university," on one of the ablest English writers in Bengal, was doubtless admitted into the first number of *Mookerjee* by an editorial inadvertence ; for we are convinced that no mere lack of "copy"



could have induced an experienced editor, like Bábu Sambhu Chandra, to publish an article which was obviously suited only to the waste-paper basket. It exhibits in a glaring manner all the worst faults—the inaccuracy, the conceit, and the presumption—with which the educated youth of Bengal have been charged by their most severe critics; and its publication is to be regretted, both on its own account, and because, *pro tanto*, it sadly weakens the hands of those who (like ourselves) have conscientiously maintained that the accusations to which it gives a colour are often prompted by ignorance of the real character and powers of our university scholars. We are glad to observe that the pages of the second number of the Magazine are unsullied by any paper of this kind.

The idea of giving monthly reports of the meetings of a "Chit-Chat Club" composed of educated Bengali gentlemen who represent various interests in the native community, is a most happy one; and we were disappointed to see that the report was missing in the second number of Mr. Day's Magazine. We hope to see the series resumed; if its design be carried out fearlessly and honestly—avoiding on the one side servility or partiality, on the other factiousness or personality—the *Club Papers* would be one of the most valuable features of the new Magazines.

In a short review like the present, we are obviously obliged to leave many good papers in the two large collections before us unnoticed. A most interesting account of Chaitanya, by Bábu Kissorsy Chand Mittra, worthily commences the September number of the *Bengal Magazine*; and two excellent descriptive papers, one on the *Antiquities of Jessore-Ishwaripur* by Bábu Rásvihári Bose, the other on *A Visit to Baidyanáth*, are to be found in the first number of *Mookerjee*. In conclusion we need hardly say we heartily wish each of these young and promising contemporaries a long and prosperous career of usefulness.

1. *Notes on Surveying. For the use of Schools.* By J. Middleton Scott, M.A., C.E., Professor of Civil Engineering, Presidency College. Calcutta, 1872.

2. *Notes on Practical Geometry and the Construction of Scales.* By J. Middleton Scott, M.A., C.E., Professor of Civil Engineering, Presidency College. Calcutta, 1872.

THE recent introduction of surveying into the schools of Bengal, and of surveying and civil engineering into our Colleges, has created an urgent demand for some elementary works on these subjects—a demand which it has hitherto been impossible to meet, owing to the fact that the simplest books of the kind, published in England, presuppose a more familiar acquaint-

tance with the English language than is possessed by many Bengali schoolboys; whilst the higher text-books, suitable for use in our colleges, were for most part costly or inaccessible. The two pamphlets whose titles we have noted above, represent the first instalment of an attempt to supply this *desideratum*; for which Mr. Scott deserves, and will doubtless receive, the hearty thanks of all those who are interested in the practical and scientific education of the people of Bengal. They have been prepared "specially to meet the requirements of the classes for surveying and engineering recently established throughout Bengal under the orders of the Lieutenant-Governor;" and their conciseness, simplicity, and clearness make them admirably adapted for this.

The *Notes on Surveying* are intended for young boys who know little of either English or Mathematics; and will, we think, be found not only intelligible but even interesting to many boys not so far advanced as the highest classes in our zillah and collegiate schools. Mathematical proofs have been wisely avoided; and the meaning of every term is carefully explained in the plainest language. The elementary rules of surveying—*first* by chain; *secondly*, by compass and chain; and *thirdly*, by the plane table are simply set forth; the plan followed being, first to describe the instruments to be used, and then to explain the mode of using them.

The second pamphlet is almost a reprint of selected portions of Colonel Williams' excellent compilation on the "Construction of Scales"; and is suited for the Civil Service classes at the various Colleges. We understand that it is Mr. Scott's intention to extend his series, until he has supplied cheap, simple, and convenient manuals for all the branches of surveying and engineering comprehended in the scheme of the Civil Service Examinations. Such a series would embrace:—(1), A Manual of Surveying, which would be an enlargement of the present *Notes*; (2), Mensuration; (3), Construction of Scales, a revised edition of the second pamphlet now under notice, to which some directions and hints about engineering-drawing might well be added; (4), A Manual of Engineering, comprising all the subjects prescribed under this head in the recent orders published in the *Calcutta Gazette*. It is obvious that a series of this kind is absolutely necessary for successfully carrying out the orders of the Government, and for establishing the new studies on a satisfactory footing; and Mr. Scott deserves high praise for the promptitude with which he has come forward to supply the need.

---

*Criticisms of the Indian Journals on a Review of Baroda Affairs; with an Introduction, Notes, Correspondence, &c., thereon.*  
By Dinshah Ardeshir Tale-Yarkhan. Bombay. 1872.

**M**R. DINSHAH ARDESHIR is again up in arms against the atrocities of the Baroda Durbar, and the supineness of the British Government in allowing them. The Introduction to the present pamphlet is, if anything, more outspoken and violent than the original *Review*; and if the Gaikwár be only half as bad as he is painted here, Baroda must be a somewhat unpleasant place to live in. The author seems determined, by the very boldness of his accusations, to force the Bombay Government into an investigation.

Our careful enquiries have satisfied us that illegal exactions on the people have been enhanced, to which the people refuse to submit, but are, however, forced to submit; that such foolish measures are imposed on them as would simply excite laughter and ridicule, if they only did not partake of an extremely oppressive character; that not the slightest check exists against the thoroughly demoralized propensities of the Guicowar's servants, and that Providence alone has the care of his administration. That Bhow Sindhia with several others at different times should have been foully murdered, as has been so widely reported, causes us not the least surprise. There are perfectly natural acts for Baroda, and entirely in keeping with its antecedents. . . . . This appalling piece of the Guicowar's degeneracy alone is sufficient to cause us disgust to know that an English Residency flourishes close by.

A letter to Sir Seymour Fitzgerald, who is rated roundly by the author, and a somewhat angry correspondence with the *Times of India*, form the most interesting portion of the present pamphlet. Of course it is impossible for us to attempt to form any opinion as to the accuracy of the charges made by Mr. Ardeshir; we must, however, do him the justice to say that they are boldly and fearlessly put forward; and he must have either a thorough conviction of the strength of his position, or else a singular contempt for the law of libel.

*The Constitution of the East India Company.* By Mancherjee M. Bhownaggee. Bombay. 1872.

**W**E recently congratulated our native fellow-subjects on the apparent growth of an historical taste among them—the taste which, of all literary tastes, has been least characteristic of the Hindu. Our words are more than confirmed by the appearance of an original work on the British rule in this country, from the pen of an educated native gentleman of Bombay. Mr. Bhownaggee's little volume is well and carefully written; and singularly original, considering the well-worn nature of the subject

which he has chosen. The home legislation on India and Indian subjects, is more fully set forth and more fairly criticised than we remember to have seen it within anything like the same compass. We have here an admirable little handybook of the political history of the connexion between England and India ; and though we, by no means, agree with all the author's opinions, we believe his book will be found very useful by a large number of readers.

*Life in India.* A series of sketches showing something of the Anglo-Indian—the land he lives in—and the people among whom he lives. By Edward Braddon. London. 1872.

THE series of sketches, of which this volume is a reprint, appeared in *Fraser's Magazine*, and were very favourably received by the English public. Reminding the reader of Mr. G. O. Trevelyan's *Competition Wallah*, they have neither the sparkle nor the audacity of that vivacious writer ; but *en revanche* they demonstrate a larger acquaintance with India and Indian matters than could possibly have been acquired by Mr. Trevelyan, during his short scamper through the country. The chapter on *Domestic Interiors* and that entitled *In the Mofussil* presents the English reader with a tolerably fair account of the home-life of Anglo-Indians masculine and feminine, and of their ordinary daily avocations ; and *India Eighty years ago* is a somewhat interesting retrospect, gathered from the old *Calcutta Gazettes* and from other sources, of their manners and customs and general way of life in the days when George the Third was King, and the Overland Route unknown. The other chapters are—*The natives of the Country*—*The Rulers, the Public, and the Press*—and *The Overland Route*. The book may be taken as a fair specimen of that kind of sketchy writing about India that finds most favour at home ; and in this light we propose to review it in an early number at somewhat greater length, in connexion with some other kindred topics. In the meantime we can recommend it to our readers, as a little light reading that will help kill an idle hour or two during the coming holidays.

---

## EDITORIAL NOTE.

---

It has been more than once suggested to the Editor that, as the *Calcutta Review* is the only *Quarterly* in India, and consequently the only periodical publication in which writers are able to support their opinions on important subjects by any prolonged argument or in any detail, it is hardly fair that its pages should be closed against every article (however opportunely conceived and carefully thought out) which may happen to express views not precisely in harmony with its traditional policy or avowed opinions. On the other hand, if such articles were to be admitted freely and on the same footing as others, the *Review* would obviously at once lose that consistency which it has long striven to maintain.

An attempt has been made, in the present number, to meet this difficulty. Following the example of some of the best Reviews in England, articles of the kind referred to will be admitted under the heading "Independent Section"; which should be regarded as indicating, not necessarily that the *Review* is actually hostile to the views enunciated, but that it is unwilling to pledge itself to the advocacy of those views.

October 1872.





